



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

**AN EVALUATION OF PIANO SOUND AND
VIBRATION LEADING TO IMPROVEMENTS
THROUGH MODIFICATION OF THE
MATERIAL PROPERTIES OF THE
STRUCTURE**

Martin Keane

**A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
of Doctor of Philosophy in Engineering, The University of Auckland, 2006.**

ABSTRACT

A study of vibrations and sound radiation in upright and grand pianos has been made to determine whether the piano may be improved by altering the materials of the component parts which are traditionally fabricated in timber.

Modal analysis and sound level measurements of an upright piano has shown that the radiation from the case is at least 20 dB lower than the radiation from the soundboard, and therefore the case is not a significant determinant of piano tone.

A method was developed for separating piano sound and vibrations into broadband and tonal components and used to compare the performance of upright and grand pianos. Using this method it was found that the broadband vibration level was twice as high in the uprights as in the grands.

A finite element model of an upright piano was developed and used to demonstrate that replacing the keybed with a higher impedance material than conventionally used would reduce the key vibration level, and hence bring the uprights closer in performance to grand pianos, and improve the ‘feel’ of the instrument for the player. The keybed of one of a pair of identical pianos was replaced with high density fibreboard, and subsequent objective measurements showed that the broadband component of key vibrations was reduced by 3.2 dB while the radiated sound was unchanged. A controlled subjective comparison between the modified and unmodified pianos undertaken by experienced players showed that a statistically significant number preferred the modified piano, and that the upright piano had been improved.

Acknowledgements

The research presented in this thesis was carried out at the Acoustics Research Centre and the Department of Mechanical Engineering at the University of Auckland. The work was undertaken as part of a Technology for Industry Fellowship funded by the Foundation for Research Science and Technology (FRST) and Fletcher Wood Panels. The support, financial and otherwise, provided by FRST and Fletcher Wood Panels is gratefully acknowledged.

I would like to thank my supervisors, George Dodd and Debes Bhattacharyya, as well as my mentors from FWP, Paris Alexiou and Dean Smart.

I would also like to gratefully acknowledge the following people:

Keith Jones and Chris Huggins of Uniservices. The staff of the Acoustics Research Centre: Gian Schmid, Murray Hollis, and Cliff Wright; the School of Music: James Tibbles, Eric Hollis and Peter Kerr; and the Department of Mechanical Engineering: Ivan Bailey, Rex Halliwell, Jos Guerts, Barry Fullerton and especially Roger Halkyard. David Jenkin and Yuji Nakamura of Jenkin Piano Tuners. Jane Walkinton and Stephanie Callaghan of FWP, and Callum McKenzie of Dynea NZ. Martin Upsdell of AgResearch. My colleagues in both Acoustics and Engineering: Thomas Scelo, Miro Duhovic, Hyuck Chung, Fady Talab, Daniel Wadsworth, Arif Zaher, Ming (Michelle) Li, David Lee and Michael Buntain.

Thanks to my proofreaders: Jim and Sheryll Keane, Maria Vendetti, Sophie Meehan, Aimee James, Sam Marsh, Gareth Kayes, Carl Schnackenberg and Olivia Kember.

Thanks also to the pianists who participated in the subjective experiment.

Contents

Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	ii
List of Figures	xv
List of Tables	xvi
List of Symbols	xvii
Pitch notation	xviii
Coordinate system	xviii
Abbreviations	xix
Glossary	xx
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Objective principles of subjective assessment	3
2 LITERATURE REVIEW	4
2.1 The piano	4
2.1.1 Piano construction	4
2.1.2 Sound production in the piano	6
2.1.3 Differences between upright and grand pianos	8

2.1.4	The role of the case	9
2.1.5	Factors governing musician preference	11
2.2	Materials used in the case	13
2.3	Literature review	14
2.4	Literature review summary	20
3	STATISTICAL ANALYSIS OF PIANO MUSIC IN MIDI FORMAT	22
3.1	Introduction	22
3.2	The MIDI file format	22
3.3	Expectations based on tuning and consonance	24
3.4	MIDI data analysis	25
3.4.1	Choice of pieces	25
3.4.2	Statistical analysis	26
3.5	Results	27
3.5.1	Pitch distribution	27
3.5.2	Note duration	28
3.5.3	Harmonic and melodic intervals	28
3.6	Results for specific composers	29
3.7	Conclusions	31
4	MODAL ANALYSIS OF AN UPRIGHT PIANO	32

4.1	Introduction	32
4.2	Bending waves	32
4.3	Literature review	33
4.4	Method	36
4.5	Results	37
4.5.1	Component transfer functions	38
4.5.2	Soundboard modes	41
4.5.3	Modes of other components	43
4.5.4	Low amplitude soundboard modes	45
4.5.5	Consideration of the internal cavity of the upright	46
4.6	Conclusions	48
5	MODAL ANALYSIS OF A GRAND PIANO	49
5.1	Introduction	49
5.2	Method	49
5.3	Results	51
5.3.1	Component transfer functions	51
5.3.2	Soundboard modes	53
5.3.3	Interaction between the soundboard and case	55
5.3.4	Modes of other components	57

5.4	Comparison between upright and grand piano admittance	58
5.5	Conclusions	60
6	FINITE ELEMENT MODEL OF AN UPRIGHT PIANO SOUNDBOARD	61
6.1	Introduction	61
6.2	Modelling and material properties	61
6.3	Mesh details	63
6.4	Effect of soundboard boundary conditions	64
6.4.1	Mode shapes of soundboard with case supports	65
6.4.2	Mode shapes of soundboard with simple supports	67
6.4.3	Mode shapes of soundboard with clamped supports	68
6.5	Effect of soundboard ribs	69
6.5.1	Comparison with isotropic plate modes	70
6.6	Front panel vibrations	71
6.7	Effect of bridge height	73
6.8	Conclusions	75
7	SOUND RADIATION AND REFLECTION BY THE CASE	77
7.1	Introduction	77
7.2	Literature review	78

7.3	Radiation from a single panel	79
7.4	Reflection from the lid	82
7.4.1	Lid properties	82
7.4.2	Finite element model of lid reflection	82
7.5	Conclusions	85
8	SEPARATION OF NOTES INTO TONAL AND BROADBAND COMPONENTS	86
8.1	Introduction	86
8.1.1	Measures of the quality of piano tones	87
8.1.2	Piano keyed construction	89
8.1.3	Aural and tactile feedback	90
8.1.4	Vibration feedback paths	91
8.2	Recordings and separation algorithm	91
8.2.1	Basis of separation algorithm	92
8.2.2	Detection of harmonics	94
8.2.3	Removing harmonic content	95
8.3	Airborne sound results	98
8.3.1	Broadband sound spectra	100
8.4	Acceleration results	101
8.4.1	Broadband acceleration spectra	104

8.4.2	Trends across the compass	105
8.5	Discussion and comparison with the results of Galembo [2003]	107
8.6	Conclusions	109
9	FINITE ELEMENT MODEL OF AN UPRIGHT PIANO KEYBED	110
9.1	Introduction	110
9.2	Modelling	110
9.2.1	Materials used for the keybed	110
9.2.2	Excitation points	112
9.3	Human sensitivity to vibration	112
9.3.1	Vibrotactile difference limen	113
9.4	Results	113
9.4.1	Predicted mode shapes	113
9.4.2	Keybed admittance: BAC	115
9.4.3	Bridge to keybed transfer function: TAC	117
9.5	Discussion	118
9.6	The effects of using high density fibreboard	119
9.7	Conclusions	121
10	KEYBED REPLACEMENT IN AN UPRIGHT PIANO	122
10.1	Introduction	122

10.2	Original keybed	122
10.2.1	Measured properties	122
10.2.2	Modal analysis	123
10.3	Replacement keybed	124
10.3.1	Measured properties	124
10.3.2	Modal analysis	125
10.4	Predictions for vibrations and radiated sound	128
10.5	Radiated sound results	129
10.5.1	Broadband sound spectra	130
10.6	Vibration results	131
10.6.1	Broadband acceleration spectra	132
10.7	Conclusions	133

11 SUBJECTIVE ASSESSMENT OF KEYBED REPLACEMENT IN AN UPRIGHT PIANO **134**

11.1	Introduction	134
11.2	Experiment	134
11.2.1	Interpretation of verbal responses	135
11.2.2	Additional questions regarding BPC	135
11.2.3	Measurement of auditory and vibrotactile thresholds	136
11.2.4	Differences between test rooms	136

11.2.5	Differences between pianos	137
11.2.6	The wide range of subject preference	139
11.3	Results	139
11.3.1	Overall preference	139
11.3.2	Analysis of QS	140
11.3.3	Responses to individual questions	141
11.3.4	Responses to additional BPC questions	142
11.3.5	Vibrotactile thresholds	143
11.3.6	Auditory thresholds	143
11.3.7	Correlations between variables	144
11.3.8	Reconciliation of subjective and objective results	144
11.4	Conclusions	145
12	CONCLUSIONS	146
12.1	Summary	146
12.2	Future work	149
A	SUBJECT QUESTIONNAIRES	151
A.1	Experience and opinion questionnaire	151
A.2	Experiment questionnaire	153
B	MATLAB CODE	154

B.1	tonal_broadband.m	154
B.2	harmonics_find.m	155
B.3	envelope.m	157
B.4	peak_remover.m	158
References		166

List of Figures

2.1	Piano soundboard mechanical impedance	8
2.2	Vibration spectra of piano components	10
2.3	Sound directivity patterns of a grand piano	12
2.4	Properties of common materials	13
3.1	Frequency of occurrence of black and white notes	27
3.2	Histogram of pitch and note duration	28
3.3	Harmonic and melodic intervals	29
3.4	Comparison of pitch use by composers	30
4.1	Laser modal analysis experimental setup	37
4.2	Components of upright piano included in modal analysis	38
4.3	Soundboard, right side and front top transfer functions of an upright piano	39
4.4	Rear, left side and front bottom transfer functions of an upright piano .	40
4.5	Soundboard modes of an upright piano	41
4.6	Upright piano case deformation at eight soundboard modes	44
5.1	Grand piano components	50
5.2	Experimental setup for grand piano modal analysis	50
5.3	Surface average transfer functions of a grand piano	52
5.4	Lowest six soundboard modes of a grand piano	53

5.5	Grand piano case deformation at soundboard modes	55
5.6	Grand piano soundboard and rim deformation at soundboard modes . .	56
5.7	Grand piano mode shape at 434 Hz	57
5.8	Grand and upright piano input admittance	59
6.1	Upright piano soundboard and ribs	63
6.2	ANSYS predicted soundboard admittance under three edge conditions .	64
6.3	ANSYS predicted soundboard response under three edge conditions . .	65
6.4	ANSYS predicted soundboard modes with case supports	66
6.5	ANSYS predicted soundboard modes with simple supports	67
6.6	ANSYS predicted soundboard modes with clamped supports	68
6.7	ANSYS predicted 313 and 380 Hz soundboard mode shapes	69
6.8	ANSYS predicted isotropic soundboard modes	70
6.9	ANSYS predicted isotropic soundboard admittance under three edge conditions	71
6.10	ANSYS predicted and measured front top panel transfer function . . .	72
6.11	ANSYS predicted effect of bridge height on the lowest soundboard mode	74
7.1	Measurement of single panel radiation	80
7.2	Entire piano and single panel radiation	81
7.3	ANSYS predicted lid admittance	83
8.1	Grand piano keyframe and action, and upright piano keybed	89

8.2	Experimental setup for delayed aural and tactile feedback	91
8.3	Recording setup showing microphone and accelerometer location	92
8.4	Weights and foam used to make piano recordings	93
8.5	Spectra of C ₅ and C ₈ notes	93
8.6	Example of harmonic detection method	95
8.7	Example TAC and BAC separation	97
8.8	Pressure component levels in eight pianos	99
8.9	Mean BPC spectra in eight pianos	100
8.10	Acceleration levels in eight pianos	101
8.11	Levels of acceleration components in eight pianos	103
8.12	Mean BAC spectra in eight pianos	104
8.13	BAC levels of black and white notes	106
9.1	Effect of tactile vibration threshold at the fingertips	112
9.2	ANSYS predicted keybed modes	114
9.3	ANSYS predicted keybed admittance with nine materials	116
9.4	ANSYS predicted keybed response to bridge excitation with nine materials	117
9.5	ANSYS predicted admittance with plywood and HDF keybeds	120
9.6	ANSYS predicted response of plywood and HDF keybeds to bridge excitation	120

10.1	Average response of original keybed	123
10.2	Mode shapes of original keybed	124
10.3	Average response of original and replacement keybed with SSSS supports	125
10.4	Average response of original and replacement keybed in situ	126
10.5	Mode shapes of replacement keybed in situ	127
10.6	Radiated sound levels with the original and replacement keybeds	129
10.7	Mean BPC spectra with the original and replacement keybeds	130
10.8	Acceleration levels with the original and replacement keybeds	131
10.9	Mean BAC spectra with the original and replacement keybeds	132
11.1	Measured reverberation times in the piano test rooms	137
11.2	Comparison of radiated sound and acceleration levels of pianos A and B	138
11.3	Comparison of QS between control and experimental groups	140

List of Tables

3.1	Characteristics of minor keys	25
3.2	Intervals in diatonic music	26
4.1	Summary of piano modal analyses	35
4.2	Soundboard modes of an upright piano	42
4.3	Amplitudes of the lowest soundboard modes of four upright pianos	46
5.1	Soundboard modes of a grand piano	54
6.1	Material constants used in the ANSYS model	62
6.2	Element details from upright piano mesh	63
8.1	Grand and upright acceleration levels	102
9.1	Keybed material constants used in the ANSYS model	111
9.2	Keybed modes predicted with material c2.7z1.1	115
9.3	Keybed modes predicted with materials c2.7z1.1 and c2.7z3.5	119
10.1	Measured damping of the original and replacement keybeds	127
11.1	Properties of the piano test rooms	137
11.2	Individual evaluation question scores (QS)	141

List of Symbols

The following notation is used in this thesis:

Symbol	Description	Units
A	Admittance	s/kg
B	Flexural stiffness	Nm ²
E	Young's modulus	Pa
F	Force	N
G	Shear modulus	Pa
$H(s)$	Hilbert transform of $s(\tau)$	
I	Sound field intensity	W/m ²
L	String length	m
P	Probability	
R	Sound reduction index	
RT	Reverberation time	s
S	Area, cross sectional area of string	m ²
T	Contact time between hammer and string	s
V	Volume	m ³
W	Radiated sound power	W
X	Average soundboard displacement	m
$X(\omega)$	Fourier transform of $x(t)$	
Z	Characteristic impedance	kg/m ² s
a	Plate length	m
b	Plate width	m
c	Speed of sound	m/s
c_b	Bending wavespeed	m/s
d	String diameter	m
f	Frequency	Hz
h	Plate thickness	m
i	$\sqrt{-1}$	
m	Number of half-wavelengths in plate a direction	
m'	Mass per unit length	kg/m
m''	Mass per unit planar area	kg/m ²
n	Mode numbers: 1, 2, 3...	
p_0	Atmospheric pressure	Pa
v	Velocity of vibration	m/s
$x(t)$	Signal in time domain	
ζ	Damping, expressed as a fraction of critical damping	
λ	Wavelength	m
ν	Poisson's ratio	
ρ	Density	kg/m ³
σ	Radiation efficiency	
τ	String tension	N
ω	Angular frequency	rad/s

To avoid confusion, throughout this thesis admittance refers to the ratio of velocity to input force, while impedance refers to material characteristic impedance, given for solids by $Z = \sqrt{E\rho}$.

Pitch notation

The scientific or American system of pitch notation is used. In this system notes are named starting from the bass (left hand) end of the keyboard: $A_0, Bb_0, B_0, C_1 \dots$. Thus the note commonly known as ‘middle C’, or c^i in Helmholtz notation, is C_4 , and the note ‘concert A’, with pitch 440 Hz, is A_4 .

Coordinate system

The origin is taken as the point at the leftmost end of the keyboard from the perspective of the pianist, at the A_0 key. The x axis is directed along the keyboard, while the y axis is directed vertically up, normal to the keyboard. The z axis is normal to the upright soundboard, pointing forward from the perspective of the pianist. The same system is used for both upright and grand pianos, thus in the grand it is the y axis that is normal to the soundboard.

Abbreviations

The following abbreviations are used in this thesis:

BAC	Broadband acceleration component
BC	Broadband component
BPC	Broadband pressure component
C	Clamped support (no displacement or rotation)
CFD	Computational fluid dynamics
DAT	Digital Audio Tape
DL	Difference limen
F	Free support
FE	Finite element
HDF	High density fibreboard
MDF	Medium density fibreboard
MIDI	Musical Instrument Digital Interface
QS	Question score
RMS	Root mean square
S	Simple support (no displacement)
TAC	Tonal acceleration component
TC	Tonal component
TPC	Tonal pressure component

Glossary

action - the mechanical assembly that includes the piano keys, hammers and dampers.

admittance - a measure of the velocity with which a structure will vibrate when excited by a given input force.

ANSYS - a commercial software package for analysing problems via finite element methods.

antiresonance - a frequency between two modes of vibration where their contributions interfere destructively, giving a low response amplitude.

boundary conditions - in a finite element or modal analysis problem, the boundary conditions are the restraints imposed at the edge of a structure. Common types include simple (no displacement) and clamped (no displacement or rotation).

cancellation - see interference.

circle of fifths - a geometric representation of the relationships between musical keys. Keys that are adjacent on the circle of fifths differ from each other by only one sharp or flat.

coherence - a measure of the dependance of the input and output of a system. Coherence is 1 for perfect measurement of a linear system, and is lowered by nonlinearities and measurement noise.

compass - the entire range of notes available on a given piano.

critical frequency - the frequency at which the speed of a bending wave in a structure is equal to the speed of an incident wave in air. At this frequency, radiation from the structure is relatively large in magnitude.

damper - the component in the piano action which returns to the string after the key is released, quickly stopping the string vibration.

damping - a measure of the rate at which a free vibration will decay, for a given oscillating system. Where damping is low, vibrations will decay slowly.

degrees of freedom - the set of independent displacements that describe the motion (linear or rotational) of a system.

difference limen - in human perception, the smallest difference in a stimulus that is detectable. Also known as the just noticeable difference.

dissonance - in music, notes that do not sound well together are dissonant. Dissonance is the opposite of consonance.

eigenmode - see mode of vibration.

filter - a process or system that allows some regions of the frequency spectrum to pass unattenuated, while reducing the amplitude of others. Common filters include lowpass (attenuates high frequencies), highpass (attenuates low frequencies) and comb (a series of notches, removing harmonically related frequencies).

finite element method - method used for analysing the vibration of structures, by dividing the structure into many smaller parts known as elements. The elements and the relationships between them are described by a large number of equations, which are solved simultaneously.

fortissimo - a direction for playing musical instruments meaning ‘very loudly’.

Fourier transform - a transform that decomposes a signal or function into its frequency components (its spectrum). This is known as going from the time domain to the frequency domain. The inverse Fourier transform reverses the operation. The forward (continuous) transform is given by $X(\omega) = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} x(t)e^{-i\omega t} dt$, and the reverse transform by $x(t) = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} X(\omega)e^{i\omega t} d\omega$. Equivalent versions are used for discrete data.

fundamental - the lowest frequency in a harmonic series, the pitch of a note.

hammer - the component in the piano action which strikes the string. The head of the hammer is covered in felt.

harmonics - the frequency components of a complex tone. Harmonics are integer multiples of the fundamental for a periodic signal.

Hilbert transform - a transform that returns the complex envelope of a signal. It is given by $H(s) = \frac{1}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{s(\tau)}{t-\tau} d\tau$.

homogeneous - a material that has the same properties at every point, such as a metal.

hysteresis - in an integration of partial differential equations with respect to time, hysteretic terms are those that involve the state of a system at a previous timestep.

impedance - the characteristic impedance of a material describes the degree to which structures made of that material will resist vibration. For solids, the impedance is given by $Z = \sqrt{E\rho}$.

impedance hammer - a hammer used in modal analysis. The tip contains a force transducer to measure the force input during each blow.

interference - the addition of two or more waves, which results in patterns of vibration. Destructive interference refers to the addition of a positive and negative wave to give an output of zero at a point.

isotropic - isotropic materials exhibit the same properties in every direction, such as metals

key - the chord which is established as the final resolving point for a musical piece.

Matlab - a commercial software package designed for numerical computation, particularly suited to working with matrices.

modal analysis - the decomposition of the vibration of a structure into individual modes.

mode of vibration - the natural shapes and associated frequencies with which a structure will vibrate under free vibration.

modulus - a measure of the stiffness of a material. It is the ratio of the rate of change of stress with strain.

node - in a mode shape, nodes are the points at which displacement is zero.

note - a single playing of a sound of definite pitch, for example the sound made by striking the C4 key once.

orthotropic - orthotropic materials have properties that differ in orthogonal directions, such as wood.

overtones - see harmonics.

partials - see harmonics.

pianissimo - a direction for playing musical instruments meaning 'very quietly'.

pitch - the fundamental frequency of a sound.

Poisson's ratio - a measure of the tendency of a material to contract or expand in the directions normal to an applied load.

polyphonic - music that is polyphonic contains two or more independent notes played at the same time.

regulation - the process of softening the hammers of a piano, which tend to harden with use. Regulation is intended to maintain the timbre of the instrument.

spectral centroid - the frequency which divides the spectrum in two, with equal energy above and below it. A high centroid is strongly perceptually correlated with 'sharp' or 'bright' tone [Grey, 1977].

spectrogram - a graphical representation of the Fourier transform of a signal, divided into short time windows. A three dimensional plot of energy content with respect to time and frequency.

spectrum - a plot of the energy content of a signal with respect to frequency. It may

be obtained via the Fourier transform.

staccato - to play notes in a manner such that silence takes up the latter part of the time allocated to the note.

supports - see boundary conditions.

synthesis - the creation of musical notes by electronic or computational methods, as opposed to physical vibrations.

temperament - methods of slightly altering the tuning the musical notes to allow an instrument to be played in more than one key.

timbre - the perceived sound quality of a musical note.

transfer function - a measure of the relationship between the input and output of a system, such as the measured velocities of two connected components.

una corda - a pedal on the grand piano that shifts the entire action to the right, so that hammers that normally strike three strings only strike two, modifying the timbre of the note.

voicing - see regulation.

window - a function that is zero outside of a given interval. The window is stepped along the length of a signal, while other operations are performed such as the Fourier transform. Within the interval the window may take many shapes which are typically designed to reduce signal leakage. Commonly used windows include the rectangular (all uniformly equal to one), triangular (increases linearly from 0 to 1 then decreases to 0) and Hamming (raised cosine).