

RESEARCHSPACE@AUCKLAND

http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage. http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

FACTORS AFFECTING THE STRUCTURE AND DYNAMICS OF SUBTIDAL COMMUNITIES CHARACTERISED BY SPONGES

Christopher Noel Battershill

Department of Zoology, University of Auckland

NAMES OF STREET STREET

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY, MAY 1987.

UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND LIBRARY

THESIS 87-220 Cop. 2

FRONTISPIECE

The Sponge Garden

The Eastern Wall, Riko Riko Cave Poor Knights Islands





ABSTRACT

Two subtidal reef communities characterised by sponges were examined to assess two distinct aspects of marine benthic community ecology which have not previously received much attention. The first study focused on the role of settlement events in the origin and maintenance of community structure and involved investigation of factors affecting dispersion, settlement and recruitment of sponge propagules. The second examined how natural gradients in ambient physical conditions, in the absence of disturbance, affected size structure and species interactions within the community.

Settlement events were examined on a reef flat which was covered by a shallow sediment overlayer. The distribution and abundance of established sponges was found to be highly correlated with sediment regimes. The sponge community was shown to be stable over time and able to resist disturbance by storms because of the presence of turfing algae. Sponge settlement was inhibited by the sediment overlayer. Established sponges were found clumped into oblong groups orientated east-west and there were many instances where sponges were found closely associated.

Adjacent areas were characterised by deeper unstable sediments and fewer sponges. Storms contoured sediments into ripples and scoured oblong east-west orientated

patches of basal rock. Sediments were also sorted during storms such that particles of large grain size were left around the edges of ripples and over the scoured rock patches. The basal reef of both the stable and unstable areas was covered in a mosaic of encrusting algal and sponge species which tolerated the sediment overlayer. This assemblage was also exposed during storms.

Sponges reproduced in a number of ways, but asexual propagules were the most successful. Sponges from several orders produced buds which developed in a complex manner. Buds adhered to rock and shell fragments of large size which acted as anchors, or attached to other buds irrespective of genotype. The change in weight and shape increased the likelihood that buds would gravitate into the scoured patches of basal rock. Bud loss off the reef was minimal. Buds were able to settle onto the basal rock patches and did so almost exclusively onto bare rock. A high degree of 'selectivity' of settlement site by buds was imparted by altering developmental rate during the settlement process in response to the substrate type. Polymastia granulosa buds exhibited an additional developmental sequence not previously reported for any colonial organism. Buds either settled directly in suitable conditions, or developed further along a different pathway. Buds which did not come into contact with basal rock elongated and appeared to be capable of digging into sediments. The elongated bud then broke up along its length into smaller particles, termed 'beads', which were

capable of movement and invariably settled onto gravel fragments.

Sponges were shown to settle onto scoured rock patches during storms and were eventually covered by sediments.

Subsequent survivorship and recruitment depended species specifically on sediment depth and quality. Settlement patterns matched the observed dispersion patterns of established sponges and suggested a mechanism whereby the community had originated and how structure was maintained. These hypotheses were tested experimentally in situ and in the laboratory.

The importance of asexual modes of reproduction, and settlement mediated by physical disturbance appears to be a common formula for recruitment by colonial marine organisms. Recruitment events were found to explain the distributional patterns of the established population.

The structure of populations of thin encrusting species on vertical reef walls was examined in a novel manner whereby the mean size and density of individuals was quantified and related to gradients in the ambient physical environment. This was achieved by examining the benthic communities on a range of subtidal reef walls of uniform slope and aspect, but which were subject to natural gradients in physical conditions. The species composition of each of the six reefs studied was similar but the size structure of communities changed within each reef system in response to gradients in light intensity and water

movement. Fish and urchin disturbance was shown to be unimportant and there was no indication that storms disrupted communities. The implications of changes in size structure of populations on interactions between component species in different ambient conditions were examined.

The eastern wall of two cave, archway and open reef systems was surveyed according to a stratified sampling design where each reef was divided by depth and distance along the wall. Different taxonomic/morphological groups were found at particular positions on reef walls. encrusting algal species were found to be one of the most abundant groups. It was assumed that the individual size of encrusting species at each wall position reflected long term ambient environmental conditions as well as the ability of each species to maintain itself against overgrowth by neighbours. By relating the population size structure of different taxa with indices for light intensity and water movement recorded at each wall position within each reef, it was shown that community structure varied markedly on the same reef wall as a function of ambient physical conditions. Changes in proportional species composition, notably from thin encrusting algal dominated assemblages to sponge characterised assemblages, with decreasing light intensity were accompanied by changes in the individual size structure of populations. At each wall position all species exhibited similar individual size. Individual size decreased and density of individuals of all species increased with decreasing light intensity. In

conditions where light levels were not sufficient to support algae, individual size of encrusting fauna increased with increasing water movement. The implications of these observations on competitive interactions between encrusting species was examined. The outcome of competitive interactions between the same species was found to vary depending on wall position.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is hard to adequately express my gratitude to those who have generously given assistance and support during the course of this study.

I am indebted to my supervisor, Professor Pat Bergquist, for her encouragement and invaluable advice throughout the study. Discussions with her were always stimulating and informative.

I am very fortunate to have a partner who has always been encouraging and supportive in all aspects of this work. Kim Pritchard was tireless with her assistance in typing and criticising the manuscript and I thank her for

her help and interest.

I am grateful to Drs Howard Choat, Bob Creese and Dave Schiel for their interest in this project and for many useful discussions. My colleagues, Dr. Mike Kingsford and Alastair MacDiarmid, I thank for their active interest, friendship, irrepressible enthusiasm and help during this study. I am indebted to Laura Stocker for her assistance with many apsects of work at the Poor Knights Islands. Special thanks go to Barbara Hickey and Natalie Moltschaniwskyj for their enthusiastic assistance subtidally, often in atrocious conditions. Many thanks are due to George McIvor, Anne McCrone, Mark Meekan and Maria Milicich for their assistance and company in the field.

My thanks to Dr. Bill Ballantine for his interest and for extending the facilities of the University of Auckland Marine Laboratory. Thanks also to Marty Kampman, Jo Evans, Tom Wustenberg and Joop Kampman from the Laboratory for their help. Ian Starkey and Phil Bendle skippered trips to the Poor Knights Islands and I thank them for their efforts to produce smooth-running expeditions, even in hazardous conditions Thanks to Dr Brian M^CArdle for statistical advice. I am grateful to Georgina Anderson for her

I am grateful to Georgina Anderson for her histological expertise and to Jeff Burgett, Andy Davis and Bruce Mapstone for producing some very useful statistical packages. Drs Tony Underwood and Roger Green gave advice on aspects of experimental design and data manipulation. Thanks go to Drs John Blunt and Murray Munro for extending the facilities of the University of Canterbury Chemistry Department in the production of this thesis.

Finally, I thank my parents, Elvie and Noel, for their encouragement and constant support throughout this study -

my debt to them is great.

This study was supported by grants from the University of New Zealand Grants Committee, University of Auckland Research Committee, the Roche Research Institute of Marine Pharmacology and a grant from the Golden Kiwi Lottery Distribution Committee for Scientific Research.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	PAGE
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	хi
LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
LIST OF PLATES	xviii
Chapter 1 BACKGROUND REVIEW 1.1 Introduction 1.2 Competition 1.3 Disturbance 1.4 Community Diversity 1.5 Succession and Community Structure 1.6 Thesis Preface	1 4 10 13 14 16
PART A THE ROLES OF DISTURBANCE, REPRODUCTIVE MODE SETTLEMENT AND RECRUITMENT IN STRUCTURING SUBTIDAL REEF FLAT COMMUNITIES	
Chapter 2 GENERAL INTRODUCTION 2.2 Study Area 2.2.1 Location 2.2.2 The Sponge Garden habitat 2.2.3 General description	19 26 26 26 27
Chapter 3 SPATIAL AND TEMPORAL PATTERNS IN SPONGE DISTRIBUTION AND ABUNDANCE 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Methods	28
3.2.1 Large scale determination of the spatial distribution and abundance of sponges3.2.2 Small scale spatial	33
distribution and abundance of sponges	54
3.2.3 Sediment type and cover 3.2.4 Quadrat size and patterns of dispersion	35 36
3.2.5 Temporal aspects of sponge distribution and abundance	37
3.3 Results 3.3.1 Large scale spatial distribution and abundance	39
of sponges 3.3.2 Small scale distribution and	40
abundance of sponges 3.3.3 Sediments	42

				Temporal abundance		in spo	onge	43
			3.3.5 I	Patterns sediment	of disp		and	46
		3.4	Discuss		Teracro.	nsnrps		50
Chapter	4	4.1 1	Introdu Methods 4.2.1 W 4.2.2 F	s Weather p Physical	oatterns disturba		RBANCE	55 61 61 63
				Ripple dy Biologica B		rbance		64 64
			4.3.2 I	deather plange sca cipple fo	le patte	erns in	i	65 65
		4		ipple dy iologica ion		rbance		71 73 76
Chapter	5	5.1 I 5.2 M	Introdu Methods 5.2.1 R		ive Biol		orns of	84 90 90 92
		5 5 5	s 5.2.3 E 5.2.4 A	ponge pr ffects o spects o tatistic	opagules f storms f propag	5		94 94 95
		5	.3.1 R	eproduct emporal bundance	patterns	and	pagules	96 107
		5	.3.3 E	ffects o spects o	f storms	3		109 110 113
Chapter	6	6.1 I	EMENT ntrodu	AND RECR	UITMENT	OF SPO	NGES	118
			.2.1 E	ffects o ncrustin ecruitme	g biota		nd on	122
		6	.2.2 E	ffects oponges,	f site, encrusti	ng bio		125
		6	.2.3 E:	ffects of developments	f substr	ate typ		126
		6	.2.4 E	ffects o		moveme	nt on	127
		6	.2.5 St	urvivors n differ	hip of s	ettled ment re	buds egimes	128
		6.3 R	esults					129

	6.3.1 Effects of area, site, encrusting biota and sand on	129
	recruitment 6.3.2 Effect of site, established sponges, encrusting biota and	133
	sand on recruitment 6.3.3 Effect of substrate type on	136
	bud development and settlement 6.3.4 Effects of water movement on bud development	137
	6.3.5 Survivorship of settled buds in different sediment regimes	138
	6.4 Discussion	140
Chapter 7	POPULATION STRUCTURE	
	7.1 Introduction	147
	7.2 Methods	152 152
	7.2.1 Acceptance and rejection of grafts by Polymastia granulosa and Aaptos aaptos	132
	7.2.2 Control grafts	153
	7.2.3 Sponge population structure	153
	7.3 Results	155
	7.3.1 Acceptance and rejection of grafts by Polymastia granulosa and Aaptos aaptos	155
	7.3.2 Control grafts	157
	7.3.3 Sponge population structure	158
	7.4 Discussion	160
Chapter 8	GENERAL DISCUSSION	164
	TORS AFFECTING SPATIAL PATTERNS IN SIZE DENSITY OF BIOTA ON SUBTIDAL REEF WALLS	
Chapter 9	GENERAL INTRODUCTION	170
	9.2 Study area	175
	9.2.1 The Poor Knights Islands	175
	9.2.2 Study locations	175
	9.3 General Methods	177
Chapter 10	PATTERNS IN THE DISTRIBUTION AND ABUNDANCE OF TAXONOMIC AND MORPHOLOGICAL	
	GROUPS OF REEF WALL BIOTA	180
	10.1 Introduction	183
	10.2 Methods	183
	10.2.1 Patterns in distribution and	
	abundance of species groups 10.2.2 Temporal aspects of community structure	184
	10.3 Results	185
	10.3.1 Patterns in distribution and	185
	abundance of species groups 10.3.2 Temporal changes in	189
q:	community structure	190

Chapter 11*	DISTURBANCE AND THE AMBIENT PHYSICAL ENVIRONMENT	
	11.1 Introduction 11.2 Methods 11.2.1 Physical factors	193 195 195
	11.2.2 Biological factors 11.3 Results	197 198
	11.3.1 Physical factors 11.3.2 Biological factors 11.4 Discussion	198 199 202
Chapter 12	PATTERNS IN THE SIZE STRUCTURE OF ENCRUSTING POPULATIONS	
	12.1 Introduction 12.2 Methods 12.2.1 Statistical note 12.2.2 Note on graphical	206 209 209 209
	presentation 12.2.3 Competition 12.3 Results	209 211 211
	12.3.1 Patterns of population size structure within Riko Riko Cave	211
	12.3.2 Patterns in density of encrusting organisms within and between reefs	211
	12.3.3 Relationships between encrusting plant and animal	213
	density with physical factors 12.3.4 Relationships between encrusting organisms' individual size and	214
	physical factors 12.3.5 Competition	215 217
	12.4 Discussion	
Chapter 13	GENERAL DISCUSSION	220
Chapter 14	CONCLUSIONS	224
BIBLIOGRAPHY		
APPENDIX I	The influence of storms on asexual reproduction, recruitment and survivorship of sponges (in Press, Smithsonian Institue Special Publ.)	
APPENDIX II	A quantitative analysis of spatial patterns in encrusting fauna and flora of Riko Riko Cave, Poor Knights Islands (submitted m.s. N.Z.J.Mar.FW.Res)	

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	FOLLOWING	PAGE
1.1	Reviews of competition and disturbance	18
1.2	Competition references	18
1.3	Disturbance references	18
1.4	Community diversity references	18
3.1	Sponge size classes	38
3.2	Sampling design for analysis of sponge abundance	38
3.3	Sediment analysis	38
3.4	Sponge density	49
3.5	Sponge occurrence and morphology	49
3.6	Sponge cover	49
3.7	ANOVA results for sponge density at different sites	49
3.8	ANOVA results for sponge cover at different sites	49
3.9	ANOVA results for sponge density at different sites and habitats	49
3.10	ANOVA results for sponge cover at different sites and habitats	49
3.11	Summary of percent cover of benthic organisms	49
3.12	ANOVA results for sediment depths at different habitats	49
3.13	Density and cover of sponges 1982 and 1985	49
3.14	Patterns of dispersion of sponges	49
4.1	Sampling design for sediment disturbance analysis	64
4.2	Weather data	75
4.3	T-Test results for release of bare rock at different sites, habitats and years	75

4.4	Sediment structure of ripples	75
4.5	Fish count data	75
4.6	Mobile invertebrate abundance	75
5.1	Sampling design for examining propagule abundance	95
5.2	ANOVA results for P.granulosa bud density	112
5.3	ANOVA results for A. aaptos bud density	112
5.4	ANOVA results for Cinachyra n.sp. bud density	112
5.5	ANOVA results for sponge fragment density	112
5.6	Density of propagules after storms	112
5.7	% Propagules on basal rock before and after storms	112
6.1	Experimental design for examining recruitment patterns	128
6.2	Experimental design for examining recruitment patterns with Area, Site, Encrusting Biota and Sediment factors	128
6.3	Experimental design for examining bud development with Dish and Substrate factors	128
6.4	Experimental design for examining bud development with Dish, Substrate and Water Movement factors	128
6.5	Experimental design for examining bud survivorship with sediment depth and quality factors	128
6.6	ANOVA results from recruitment experiment with factors of area, site, encrusting biota	128
	and sediment cover	
6.7	ANOVA results from recruitment experiment with factors of site, adult, encrusting biota and sediment	139
6.8	ANOVA results for recruit densities in response to sediment treatments comparing sexual/asexual origin	139
5.9	ANOVA results of settled sponge mortality in response to sediment manipulations comparing sexual/asexual origin	139

6.10	Density of sexually and asexually derived recruits on different substrates	139
6.11	Summary of results from laboratory experiments on bud development	139
6.12	Summary of results from water movement experiments	139
6.13	ANOVA results from bud development experiments	139
6.14	ANOVA results from water movement experiments	139
6.15	ANOVA results from water movement experiments	139
6.16	ANOVA results from water movement experiments	139
7.1	Index of graft acceptance/rejection	159
7.2	Summary of control graft experiments	159
9.1	Sampling design for examining reef walls	179
10.1	Genera belonging to taxonomic/morphological groups	184
10.2	Species list of benthic organisms identified	189
10.3	Canonical Discriminant Analysis statistics for Figure 10.2	189
10.4	Canonical Discriminant Analysis statistics for Figure 10.3	189
11.1	Fish abundance data	201
12.1	ANOVA results on density of encrusting algal individuals	216
12.2	ANOVA results on density of encrusting sponge individuals	216
12.3	ANOVA results on density of encrusting bryozoan individuals	216
12.4	Competitive interactions of <u>Chelonaplysilla</u> violacea and <u>Darwinella</u> oxeata inside Riko Riko Cave	216

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE	FOLLOWING	PAGE
1.1	Thesis structure	18
2.1	Location map of the Sponge Garden Reef	27
2.2	Study site map	27
2.3	Study site	27
3.1	Study site profiles	38
3.2	Sampling grid	38
3.3	Quadrat sample size estimation- Raspailia topsenti and Axinella sp.A	38
3.4	Quadrat sample size estimation- Aaptos aaptos and Cinchyra n.sp.	38
3.5	Quadrat sample size estimation- Polymastia granulosa	38
3.6	Graph of sediment analysis	49
3.7	Sediment map of the Sponge Garden, 1982	49
3.8	Sediment map of the Sponge Garden, 1985	49
3.9	Sponge populated areas 1982, 1985	49
3.10	Size frequency histograms for P.granulosa	49
3.11	Size frequency histograms for $A.aaptos$	49
3.12	Size frequency histograms for Cinachyra n.sp.	49
3.13	Size frequency histograms for $R.topsenti$	49
3.14	Size frequency histograms for Axinella sp.A	49
3.15	Graphs of sponge density vs. sediment regime for \underline{P} .granulosa, \underline{A} .aaptos, Cinachyra n.sp. and \underline{R} .tospenti	49
3.16	Graph of sponge density versus sediment regime for Axinella sp.A	49
3.17	Map of sponge distribution patterns	49
3.18	Diagrammatic interpretation of patterns of dispersion	49

4.1	Location of sediment disturbance permanent quadrats	64
4.2	Graph of swell frequency	75
4.3	Map of unstable areas of ripple formation	75
4.4	Graph of area of basal rock exposed by storms	75
4.5	Graph of sediment depths at each site over the study period	7.5
4.6	Graph of isopod cover	75
4.7	Pie diagram of composition of exposed reef patches Stable Site I	75
4.8	Pie diagram of composition of exposed reef patches Stable site II	75
4.9	Pie diagram of composition of exposed reef patches Unstable site I	7.5
4.10	Pie diagram of composition of exposed reef patches Unstable site II	75
4.11	Histogram showing changes in exposed patch composition over time	75
4.12	Pie diagram of the biotic composition of the reef base	75
4.13	Permanent quadrats showing ripple formation in Unstable site I	75
4.14	Permanent quadrats showing ripple formation in Unstable site II	75
4.15	Graph of the decay of exposed rock patches	75
4.16	Graph of ripple life	75
5.1	Diagram of the aquarium system used	95
5.2	Reproduction in P.granulosa	112
5.3	Asexual reproduction or growth in P.granulosa	112
5.4	Reproductive sequences of Polymastia n.sp.	112
5.5	A.aaptos reproduction	112
5.6	Reproductive sequences of Cinachyra n.sp.	112
5.7	Reproduction of R.topsenti and Axinella sp.A	112

5.8	Graphs of <u>Polymastia</u> spp. bud density at each site	112
5.9	Graphs of A -aaptos bud density at each site	112
5.10	Graphs of <u>Cinachyra</u> n.sp. bud density at each site	112
5.11	Graphs of R.topsenti and Axinella sp.A fragment density at each site	112
5.12	Diagrammatic interpretation of bud movement during storms	112
5.13	Sponge propagule dispersion after storms Unstable site I	112
5.14	Sponge propagule dispersion after storms Unstable site II	112
5.15	Sponge propagule movement after a storm 19/2/85-22/2/85	112
5.16	Sponge propagule movement after a storm 21/3/85-24/3/85	112
5.17	Sponge propagule movement after a storm 30/3/85-2/4/85	112
5.18	Sponge propagule movement after a storm 6/4/85-14/4/85	112
6.1	Location map of experimental sites	128
6.2	Graph of recruitment densities of P.granulosa into experimental plots	139
6.3	Graph of recruitment densities of Polymastia n.sp. into experimental plots	139
6.4	Graph of recruitment densities of $\underline{A}.\underline{aaptos}$ into experimental plots	139
6.5	Graph of recruitment densities of Cinachyra n.sp. into experimental plots	139
6.6	Graph of recruitment densities of Eurypon hispida into experimental plots	139
6.7	Summary graph of recruitment patterns (-Adult treatments)	139
6.8	Summary graph of recruitment patterns (Stable area treatments)	139

6.9	Histogram of sexuality and mortality of settled sponges	139
6.10	Percent mortality of P.granulosa and A.aaptos buds following burial	139
7.1	Diagram of graft acceptance and rejection in P.granulosa	159
7.2	Diagram of graft acceptance and rejection in \underline{A} . \underline{aaptos}	159
7.3	Grafting programme	159
7.4	Graft acceptance scores for P.granulosa	159
7.5	Graft acceptance scores for A.aaptos	159
9.1	Reef types and their features	174
9.2	Location map of the Poor Knights Islands	176
9.3	Stratified sampling design used on reef walls	179
10.1	Graph of cover of taxonomic/morphological groups on reef walls	189
10.2	Graphical representation of CDA of species groups at each wall position	189
10.3	Graphical representation of CDA of species groups at each reef	189
11.1	Graphs of light intensity and indices of exposure for each reef position	201
11.2	Urchin densities within each reef	201
11.3	Urchin density as a factor of light intensity and exposure	201
11.4	The extent of urchin generated bare rock	201
12.1	Diagrammatic representation of two encrusting communities	208
12.2	Graph of density of encrusting faunal and floral individuals within each reef	216
12.3	Graph of density of encrusting organisms as a function of light intensity and relative exposure	216
12.4	Graph of individual size of encrusting organisms as a fucntion of light intensity	216

xviii.

LIST OF PLATES

PLATE		FOLLOWING	PAGE
Frontisp	iece		
3.1	A sponge assemblage		49
4.1	Sediment scour around a finger spor	ige	75
5.1	T.S. of larval recruit of P -granulo	osa	112
5.2	Asexual reproduction in P.granulosa	<u>1</u>	112
5.3	T.S. of <u>P.granulosa</u> buds		112
5.4	T.S. of old P.granulosa bud		112
5.5	Elongated and fused buds of P.granu	ılosa	112
5.6	L.S. of elongating \underline{P} .granulosa bud		112
5.7	L.S. of P.granulosa 'bead'		112
5.8	Settled buds and 'beads' of P.granu	llosa	112
5.9	T.S. of an asexual P.granulosa recr	uit	112
5.10	Polymastia n.sp. bud formation		112
5.11	T.S. of a Polymastia n.sp. recruit		112
5.12	T.S. of a new A.aaptos recruit		112
5.13	T.S. of an A.aaptos juvenile		112
12 1	Encrusting communities inside Riko	Riko Cave	208