



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

## ***ResearchSpace@Auckland***

### **Copyright Statement**

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

### **General copyright and disclaimer**

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the [Library Thesis Consent Form](#) and [Deposit Licence](#).

### **Note : Masters Theses**

The digital copy of a masters thesis is as submitted for examination and contains no corrections. The print copy, usually available in the University Library, may contain corrections made by hand, which have been requested by the supervisor.

Someone like us: Meanings and contexts informing  
the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary  
classrooms.

**Barbara Snook**

*A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of  
Philosophy, the University of Auckland, 2012.*

## **Abstract**

Since 2000, dance has been included within the New Zealand Arts Curriculum from years one to thirteen. This curriculum is one of the essential key learning areas offered in every school. Existing research suggests however, that dance is not present in the majority of primary classrooms in New Zealand schools. This study examines the multiple factors informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms.

Within a phenomenological paradigm, a constructivist methodology examined participants' meanings of dance in three separate schools. Emergent findings offered previously hidden keys to understanding that, unless addressed, will ensure that dance remains outside New Zealand primary classrooms.

A review of literature addressed the inherent complexities of teaching in schools. The literature revealed that a lack of experience is a reason teachers believe they don't have the confidence to teach dance. Findings within the present study supported this theory. Findings also indicated that if the generalist classroom teacher, rather than an 'Artist in School' teaches dance, there is more likelihood of a successful and on-going implementation. Emerging from the complexity of this research was information that recognized the importance of valuing teachers and allowing them a sense of autonomy if dance is to be successfully implemented.

## **Acknowledgements**

I would like to express my special thanks to ...

Associate Professor Ralph Buck for his unconditional support. Thank you Ralph for your belief in me. You have allowed me to find my voice and encouraged me throughout the process. You have facilitated a journey I would not have believed to be possible; you have done this through your ability to look beyond the superficial and draw out inner strengths that are unrecognisable to others, including myself. I am truly grateful. I believe that the right supervisor is the key to a successful PhD, but in this case you also provided a depth of personal understanding that supported my growth throughout the journey.

Thanks also to my family in Australia who were gracious in their encouragement of my relocation to undertake this study. Thanks to Tim, Christine, Claire, Julian, and my grandchildren, Keegan, Harry, Bella and Zen. I love you.

# Table of Contents

Chapter 1. Introduction.....	1
1.1. The Researcher and the Issues .....	2
1.2. The Research Question .....	6
1.2.1. Discussion Point One.....	6
1.2.2. Discussion Point Two .....	7
1.2.3. Discussion Point Three.....	8
1.3. Summary .....	9
Chapter 2. Literature Review .....	10
2.1. What is Dance? .....	10
2.2. Dance Education in New Zealand schools: History and meanings in primary schools.....	11
2.2.1. Historical Overview of Dance in the New Zealand Primary School Curriculum.....	11
2.2.2. Curriculum.....	18
2.2.2.1. The New Zealand curriculum and the place of dance. ....	19
2.2.3. School dance curriculums – An International view.....	23
2.3. So...New Zealand values multiple ways of knowing?.....	26
2.4. Implementation issues and Arts Curriculum critiques.....	28
2.5. Rationales.....	31
2.6. Teachers meanings of dance within the primary curriculum: what’s it all about? .....	33
2.7. Organisational structures.....	39
2.8. The decile system in New Zealand Primary Schools .....	43
2.9. Facilities and Environmental Structures .....	45
2.10. Gender inequities and student attitudes toward dance in New Zealand schools.....	48
2.11. The elements of dance.....	54
2.12. Genres.....	55
2.13. Creative dance in New Zealand Schools .....	56
2.13.1. Attitude to thinking body: Somatics .....	58

2.14. Discipline Based Arts Education.....	59
2.14.1. Dance as personal development.....	62
2.15. Influential Theorists .....	63
2.15.1. Laban.....	63
2.15.2. Gardner .....	65
2.15.3. Adshead-Lansdale .....	68
2.16. The Reality of what teachers teach: How and why?.....	70
2.17. Pre-service teacher training.....	75
2.18. A positioning of New Zealand and other OECD countries in relation to UNESCO’s aims for the arts .....	80
2.19. New Zealand Dance Education within an economic and sustainable society .....	87
2.20. Summary of Review of Literature .....	94
Chapter 3. Research Methodology .....	96
3.1. Phenomonology.....	98
3.2. Strategies of Inquiry – A Constructivist Approach .....	99
3.2.1. Constructivism verses Constructionism.....	104
3.3. Case Studies .....	107
3.4. Research Methods .....	109
3.4.1. Narrative Inquiry .....	110
3.4.2. Educational Connoisseurship.....	111
3.4.3. Empirical Discussion.....	115
3.5. Material (Data) Collection Methods .....	116
3.5.1. The selection of Case Studies.....	117
3.5.2. Qualitative Questioning and Interview Techniques.....	119
3.6. Material Analysis.....	123
3.6.1. Recording and analysing the material .....	124
3.6.2. Trustworthiness and Integrity.....	126
3.6.3. Summary .....	128

Chapter 4. Participants' Narratives .....	130
4.1 Marion Primary School .....	130
4.2 Stafford Primary School .....	133
4.3 Swan Road Primary School .....	136
4.4 The school environment and teaching. ....	137
4.4.1 Marion Primary School.....	137
4.4.2 Stafford Primary School .....	139
4.4.3 Swan Road Primary School.....	139
4.5 Meanings of dance in the school community.....	140
4.5.1 Marion Primary School.....	140
4.5.2 Stafford Primary School .....	141
4.5.3 Swan Road Primary School.....	143
4.5.4 What dance meant: Jump Jam .....	144
4.6 Perceived Problems: Why dance is not a focus .....	145
4.6.1 Marion Primary School.....	145
4.6.2 Stafford Primary School .....	147
4.6.3 Swan Road Primary School.....	148
4.7 Professional Development in dance .....	148
4.7.1 Marion Primary School.....	148
4.7.2 Stafford Primary School .....	150
4.7.3 Swan Road Primary School.....	152
4.8 A cross-curricular approach to teaching dance .....	152
4.8.1 Marion Primary School.....	153
4.8.2 Stafford Primary School .....	153
4.8.3 Swan Road Primary School.....	154
4.9 What the children said over all three schools .....	154
4.10 Summary.....	157
Chapter 5. Discussion .....	159

5.1	Professional Development.....	159
5.1.1	Someone like us: An examination of Artists in Schools .....	159
5.1.2	Other suggestions of professional development .....	168
5.2	From talk to action: A Cross-curricular approach to allow dance to be implemented in classrooms. ....	172
5.2.1	How to implement a cross-curricular approach?.....	176
5.3	Time for a change: attitudes of school communities toward dance .....	180
5.4	Insights.....	185
5.4.1	Addressing confidence in teaching dance.....	185
5.4.2	Acknowledging teacher biography in dance .....	188
5.4.3	Support for teachers .....	191
5.5	Within the school culture: the need to conform to societal expectations and norms .....	192
5.5.1	Recognising conventional values .....	193
5.5.2	Teaching dance in schools – where to from here? .....	195
5.5.3	Teachers as Creative Artists with the ability to teach creatively .....	200
5.6	Pre-service Teacher Education .....	201
5.7	Summary .....	203
5.8	Reflection on Methodology .....	204
Chapter 6.	Conclusion .....	208
6.1	Findings .....	209
6.2	Suggestions for further research .....	213
6.1.1.1.	Softly Softly .....	215
5.1	Summary .....	218



# Chapter 1. Introduction

This chapter introduces the research and the researcher and in doing so creates a context for addressing the issues relating to the research question, 'What are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms'? My own voice informs aspects of the research from the position of 'connoisseur', a term given to researchers working within their particular field of expertise. Eisner (1998a) states:

Connoisseurship is the art of education. It can be displayed in any realm in which the character, import or value of objects, situations, and performance is distributed and variable, including educational practice (p.68).

I come to this research as a teacher of twenty-three years' experience across all ages. Valuing this experience within this research, I empathise with the participants and their emotional engagement as educators. Stake (1978) values the importance of this ability to engage with the participants, "Intentionality and empathy are central to the comprehension of social problems"(p. 7). A conventional qualitative inquiry reveals meanings, but through an empathetic engagement with the material, multiple layers of meaning are made available through body language, emphasis, tone, nuance, and shared understandings. Constructivism was the chosen methodology and is particularly well suited to this study where individual meanings emerged to inform developing understandings. A constructivist methodology "requires the adoption of mutuality between researcher and participant in the research process" (J Mills, Bonner, & Francis, 2006, p. 1).

This research investigated individuals' understandings of the delivery of dance in primary classrooms within three school communities. Each school was a case study, with the interviewees revealing the issues, tensions, flavours and beliefs which shape and determine meanings within each case or school. Within each case study the interviewees included the Principal, Deputy Principal, teachers, students, parents and members of the Board of Trustees. The numbers of participants varied over the three schools. Case Study One included seventeen participants; Case Study Two, twenty-two participants, with eleven participants in Case Study Three. The interviews allowed a 360o view of the teacher in context, valuing all of the participants' meanings that emerged regarding their understanding of dance in the primary classroom and what this might mean for the implementation or continuation of dance.

Research identifies that primary school teachers lack the confidence to teach dance. Ralph Buck (2003a) addressed some of these concerns in his doctoral thesis; *Teachers and Dance in the Classroom*: “So, do I need my tutu?” Along with current international research, New Zealanders (Bolwell, 1998; Hong-Joe, 2002; Melchior, 2006; Sansom, 2008) have all acknowledged teacher confidence when writing about the place of dance in the primary classroom. In his thesis, Buck (2003a) stated that “there needs to be more stories (research) from the classroom that tell of teaching dance” (p.332), and so with these words this research began to form itself.

Dance has been in the New Zealand primary school arts curriculum for only ten years. Drawing upon current research, this study has identified whether teachers have a clear understanding of what it means to implement dance to meet curriculum expectations. This knowledge has been gained by interviewing a large number of primary teachers. Previous research undertaken in New Zealand has involved smaller numbers of participants, each study having a slightly different focus. The research material available in New Zealand is not extensive, yet all researchers concur that the “teachers’ sense of inability or lack of confidence to teach dance surfaced in most studies” Buck (2003a).

This research examines current trends within the context of current social and economic climates. The research tells the stories of teachers’ experiences and reveals the issues, policies, and practices that supported or inhibited the implementation of dance programs in the primary classroom. In speaking with teachers the research was directed in such a manner that it was possible for the participants to articulate opportunities, attitudes and insecurities that supported or suppressed their abilities and inspiration to teach dance. In learning about these experiences the research assisted in uncovering concerns situated within teaching and learning contexts.

### **1.1. The Researcher and the Issues**

The story of how I became a specialist dance teacher is relevant to my personal attitude toward the teaching of dance in schools. Green and Stinson (1999) state “that we construct reality according to how we are positioned in the world, and that how we see reality and truth is related to the perspective from which we are looking” (p. 93). I come from a non-dance background but have had twenty-three years of experience as a dance teacher within a school environment. I am able to relate to the fears and insecurities teachers may have about teaching dance through my own personal background experiences that also allow me to share a belief, ‘if you can walk you can dance’, a paper presented by Liz Melchoir, a fellow New Zealand teacher at the Oceania Congress in Wellington, 2005. The following story documents my background as related to my research topic.

During 1980 I moved with my family from Dunedin, New Zealand, to Brisbane, Australia. I gave birth to a son that year and remained home with him for the next five years until he was ready to go to school. It was then apparent that I would need to return to the workforce. I had been a performer in mainly amateur opera productions in Dunedin and so decided to audition for a place in a Secondary Drama teaching course at the Queensland University of Technology, then known as the Brisbane College of Advanced Education. I was fortunate in securing a place. During the first week, the drama and dance students went on a camp. Until this point I had been unaware that I needed to have a second teaching area and so upon this discovery, became quite concerned. During the period of the camp, I was informed that Dance was being offered as a second teaching area for the first time, and if I was interested I should speak with the coordinator. In my naivety, I made enquiries and was accepted into the course on the spot without an audition. I was unaware that the course would only run if the numbers were there.

I was in my fortieth year when I began my dance teacher training and it was one of the most difficult things I have ever done. My background was in singing and acting. I moved relatively freely in time to the beat, but had received no formal training in dance. The other students were all young flexible dancers with varying dance abilities. I felt overwhelmed and the harder I tried to connect my mind and my body, the more success eluded me. I would regularly speak with my supervisor regarding changing my course to English, but he would reassure me and very soon it became too late to make such a change.

The school dance curriculum in Queensland was then and still is divided into three distinct areas, Choreography, Performance and Appreciation. As trainee student teachers we were educated in these areas. I realised that my strengths were in choreography and appreciation and gradually as I relaxed, my performance improved. I had no bad habits to unlearn and as a mature age student I worked extremely hard to achieve good results.

I graduated and was placed in a large Brisbane High School as a drama and dance teacher. Unfortunately I was not given any dance to teach in my first year which affected my confidence. I felt I needed to get into dance teaching right away as my age and lack of a background in dance fed my insecurities very well. The emphasis of the school and wider community always appeared to me to focus upon technique and how well one danced. A lack of technical excellence along with what I perceived then as my advancing years, adding to the lack of confidence. The school administration were pleased with my work in drama and so to appease my constant requests for a dance class, they allowed me to co-teach dance the following year with a teacher whose background was in ballet. Her emphasis was most definitely on technique and would refer to contemporary dance as 'that

weird stuff'. We had a senior secondary dance class between us with eleven students and we also had a student teacher. There were not too many opportunities to teach but I did manage to choreograph and teach a contemporary dance that broke the boundaries of what had gone before. The students performed at a school assembly and thanks to the rave reviews of some key staff members, I became a respected dance teacher. This manner of judging the work of performing arts teachers was a constant concern to me and relates to some of the insecurities that primary teachers may face when they are asked to 'do the musical' or create an item for assembly.

A promotion to Dance Coordinator followed and the number of students studying dance increased dramatically over the following few years until we were one of the schools with the largest numbers of students studying dance in Queensland. During the following seventeen years as a High School teacher, I served on many sub-committees writing each respective new dance curriculum in Queensland. I began as a panel member for the moderation and verification of dance, and then became the District Panel Chair for Dance in Brisbane North. I came to understand the culture of dance in High Schools as one with demanding standards in all three areas of Choreography, Performing and Appreciating. This seemed necessary if dance was to be taken seriously as an academic subject worthy of inclusion as a subject counting toward a University Entrance score at the end of the final year of school. The emphasis on excellence was a dichotomy for me. I valued creative freedom which did not always equate with achieving the highly prized V.H.A. (Very High Achievement).

Wherever possible I employed creative methods to reach the inexperienced or non-studio dancers in the classroom and experiment in such a way that everyone was prepared to leave their old way of knowing dance and take a creative risk. I felt that I was able to reach and encourage students who came to the subject with little or no experience. I suspect that my enthusiasm to embrace the creative aspects of dance was fed as much by my insecurities in dance technique as my passion and ability in the creative area.

When I was approached to write a text-book for dance in schools by publishers McGraw-Hill Australia (2004), I took the opportunity to introduce some teaching strategies for the benefit of dance teachers and students in Australia and New Zealand. 'Dance...Count Me In' has been a most successful publication, and has been well received within the dance education communities in both countries. Jan Bolwell, one of New Zealand's leading dance educators advised a beginning teacher, that "if she purchased nothing else, this was the one resource she must have" (J. Bolwell, personal communication, July 4, 2010). The textbook was not designed to be prescriptive, but to provide assistance for teachers with little or no experience, and to provide a jumping off point for

experienced dance teachers. Most subjects in High Schools are resourced with text books. Dance teachers have always had to rely on their own creative energy to devise several lessons every day. It seemed that this text-book filled an important need for dance teachers. The text-book was designed for students aged between eleven and fifteen and as it appeared that it was being used by teachers of senior students, I wrote a second dance text-book *Dance For Senior Students* published by Thomson Social Science Press. These text books do not focus on technique as it is assumed that this is the area where specialist teachers of dance in High Schools already have the expertise. It is also difficult to communicate dance technique at a High School level with words, illustrations and diagrams. More importantly, it is the creative and experimental area of dance where High School teachers appear to require assistance, and is the specific area that primary teachers work in. It then occurred to me that if specialist trained High School dance teachers value text-books for some of their teaching, then it would seem that the generalist teacher in the primary classroom may possibly require some assistance.

During 2007 and 2009 I wrote two text-books for very young students in the first few years of school. These books *Dance Room Book 1* and *Dance Room Book 2* are published by Bushfire Press in Melbourne and focus on moving and having fun. There are simple and clear suggestions with colourful illustrations for the primary teacher along with a set of music C.D.s to accompany each exercise.

My experience in the primary school sector arose when I resigned from the state teaching system and established myself as an Independent Dance Education Consultant where I facilitated workshops for primary teachers on how to teach dance. In the main, the people who attended these sessions were there because they had chosen to come, and were therefore receptive to the ideas and strategies presented. People left with an enthusiasm to teach what they had learned on the very next day. It was interesting to observe that even when teachers were enthusiastic about dance, they still required the workshop to help them understand just how and what they could teach, despite the support material available on the Queensland Studies Authority website. They seemed to lack confidence even when they loved the idea of teaching dance. This observation proved to be pivotal in establishing the focus for this research.

While I was working as a dance education consultant, a teacher from a Brisbane primary school was successful in her funding application to employ me to teach dance to the entire staff once a week after school for eight weeks. This was quite a different group to work with. Some of the teachers were resentful of the fact they had to be there, from both a time and dance perspective. In order that the participants felt comfortable and less resentful, the sessions were created so that they were

fun, in a non-threatening environment. Southam and Schwartz(2004) confirm that it is a widely accepted fact that humour enhances learning stating, “humour and fun are two ingredients that produce a number of beneficial effects in the teacher and the learner” (p. 58). Once the teachers relaxed and realised that there were no technical expectations, they accessed dance for themselves and ultimately, for their students. I believe that every one of the teachers in that primary school completed those sessions with an ability to teach dance in their classrooms. Intuitively however, I doubted that they would. With a background in dance that allowed me to understand the feelings associated with a lack of confidence in teaching dance, and years of working with teachers in and through dance, I began to address the research question.

## **1.2. The Research Question**

My initial research and my experience, as outlined above, led me to consider three key discussion points. They are outlined here by way of providing a sense of my journey into the literature and also to reveal some of my assumptions, biases and expectations that invariably shaped the ensuing interviews.

Each of the discussion points shaped the semi-structured interviews and are discussed in this chapter, raising questions that were addressed within the research. The discussion points include:

### **1.2.1. Discussion Point One**

What, if any, resources or professional development are necessary for developing primary school teachers’ confidence to teach dance?

It appears from previous New Zealand based research, (Bolwell, 1998; Buck, 2003a; Hong-Joe, 2002; Melchoir, 2005; Sansom, 2008) that one of the main areas of concern in implementing the dance curriculum in New Zealand relates to teacher confidence. Welsh (1995) discussed the self-efficacy of primary teachers in art education and the belief that a teacher has a sense of whether he or she personally has the skills to enhance student learning. Welsh states:

Primary art teachers seldom are artists, as many people consider art to be intuitive rather than something that can be taught, it is possible that many primary art teachers exhibit low levels of confidence in art education (p. 73).

According to Welsh, teacher confidence is diminished when it comes to art, and where she is speaking of art generally, the word dance specifically, tends to create an even more negative response from those primary teachers who believe that they cannot teach dance. Does the problem lie within teacher response to the idea of creating art or is it the physicality of the subject that creates a barrier for some primary teachers? Although physical education has long been a part of

the primary school curriculum, Alison Kroon is a New Zealand primary teacher who hopes for rain so that she doesn't have to go outside and lead a physical education class (A. Kroon, personal communication, March 16, 2008). How do generalist teachers who struggle to teach physical education, manage when it comes to dance? Is there a co-relationship between physical factors, or is it as simple as some teachers being more inclined toward the arts while others lean toward the conventional subjects of literacy and numeracy, and if so, what can be done to equip all generalist primary teachers with the confidence and skills to teach dance?

From my experience it appears that professional development is crucial for the successful implementation of dance in the primary classroom. Even primary school teachers who feel enthusiastic about teaching dance are grateful for any assistance regarding what and how to teach dance. Is there a block between the reading, interpretation and implementation of curriculum documents? Does professional development need to be on-going and does it apply to all primary teachers, or to those who did not receive dance teacher training as a part of their undergraduate course? A further question was posed as to how much dance is enough for pre-service teachers and does the dance component of their pre-service teacher education equip teachers to teach dance in primary schools.

It was important to discover what teachers themselves want for their professional development in dance. All members of a school community need to be involved if an introduction of support is to be successful and on-going. Joyce and Calhoun (1991) agree that the focus must be on what the school community wants, otherwise norms of defensiveness tend to take over and subvert attempts to rebuild the culture of educators. What is the best way to introduce professional development if it is deemed necessary? Teachers are busy professionals working with an already 'crowded curriculum'.

### **1.2.2. Discussion Point Two**

How would a cross-curricular approach to dance teaching allow the subject to be implemented in more classrooms? How could this happen? What would be required in the development of the curriculum and would this benefit dance, and other subjects?

Many primary teachers use a theme-based approach to their teaching, and where they are confident to include dance, it may sometimes be incorporated to enhance and develop a theme. There are many possibilities to teach particular subjects through and alongside dance. It seemed unlikely however, that teachers who lack confidence in dance teaching would employ it as a medium with which to teach maths concepts, as an example. Much depends upon the manner in which such a concept has been introduced within a curriculum framework for dance and another subject. Would such an approach lessen the importance of dance as a separate art form, or could dance become an

important everyday activity with which to understand and make sense of the world? A cross-curricular approach was presented as an option to teachers in order to address the research question, what are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms?

### **1.2.3. Discussion Point Three**

Is it possible to change the attitudes and beliefs of a school community toward dance? If so, how can change be made?

Erickson (1987) suggests that “much of our cultural knowledge is implicit, consisting of over-learned ways of thinking and acting that, once mastered, are held outside conscious awareness” (p. 14). This created a problem for the researcher in that underlying attitudes were difficult to determine. The researcher’s experience however, attests to the phenomenon that the attitude and biases of a Principal generally filter down to the staff, creating a culture within a school. In my mind, it was therefore vital to determine the attitudes and biases of Principals and administrative staff toward the teaching of dance so that a clear idea of the school culture was able to be formed, allowing insights to emerge as the material was collated and analysed. As the holders of power within a hierarchical community, Principals lead the way with their thinking and attitudes. If a Principal demonstrates a negative or apathetic attitude toward the inclusion of dance in the curriculum, other teachers may take this as approval of their own similar attitudes. Teachers who believe in the importance of dance in the curriculum may see themselves swimming against the tide and could become tired of feeling unsupported. In undertaking the present research, my experience over twenty-three years as a teacher provided an advantage in having an insiders’ perspective of the culture of schools.

How is dance valued in the school community? Is there an understanding of the creative aspect of dance in the school curriculum or is dance perceived as a technical skill in one or many genres? Does a lack of understanding of what dance is, and can be, colour teachers’ thinking when choosing to include dance in curriculum offerings? Is there a belief that not all students can dance? When gathering this material, background statistical information on gender, dance experience, teaching experience and ethnicity assisted in informing the findings on teacher attitude.

An attitude toward dance in each of the primary schools involved in the study was investigated to ascertain whether cultural change was necessary in order to move forward. Barth (2002) states “To change the culture of a school the instructional leader must enable its residents to name,



acknowledge and address the non-discussables” (p. 7). While it was not the purpose of the research to change the culture of a school, understanding the school’s culture assisted in gaining an understanding of dance in the classroom. Whenever attempting to incorporate change within an institution, an appreciation of its culture, should inform such change. Deal and Paterson (2009) discuss the importance of such knowledge and state, “culture [school] was a key factor in the enhancement of a more effective practice” (p. 7). A discussion of this aspect of dance in primary classrooms informed the research findings.

### **1.3. Summary**

The listed discussion points are offered as a means of informally tracing the many questions, variables, hopes, and assumptions that informed this research journey. More than anything, the discussion points reveal the complexity implicit within my research. It was more than apparent that as I entered the three different schools and commenced the interviews and observations I had to be ever alert to the complexity of the school community and culture; the different weighting given to the different concerns in each school, and so on. Most importantly, given my already considerable insight into what issues teachers might raise, my job was to listen hard and keep assumptions at bay as I attended to the research question, ‘What are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms’?

# Chapter 2. Literature Review

The following literature review examines the meanings of dance issues, and more specifically, the meaning of dance education in New Zealand Primary Schools. A historical evolution of dance in New Zealand primary schools is examined, as is the New Zealand dance curriculum, its rationales, organisational structures, facilities, and environmental factors. The elements of dance and genres are discussed along with the attitudes toward the making and teaching of dance. A discussion of the theorists who have influenced the development of dance education in New Zealand Schools provides a context, and beyond that, the review of the literature examines a positioning of New Zealand and other OECD countries in relation to UNESCO's aim for the arts. This chapter is followed by a reflection on New Zealand dance education within an economic and sustainable society.

## 2.1. What is Dance?

A single definition of dance would limit its power to communicate beyond words. History would reveal that humans have employed the communicative power of dance throughout the ages. The important role of dance in society has been noted by Shapiro (1998) and Best (1978) but I relate to LaMothe (2006) who states, "Dance most often appears as an ability to think in a particular way about values, knowledge and truth" (p. 6). LaMothe writes in Nietzsche's 'Dancers', "Nietzsche urges readers to learn thinking as a kind of dancing – that is, as a species or sub-set of dancing" (p. 7). She suggests that while Nietzsche is speaking metaphorically, a person who wants to know how to think, must know how to dance, otherwise that person will not recognise thinking as a kind of dancing. If thinking is a subset of dancing then it would seem that movement that stems from the inner self or the unconscious would relate well to the world of dance education in primary classrooms where students are provided with opportunities to 'think' and express themselves creatively through movement. "If life is movement, then the art of that movement is dance" (Fowler, 1977, p. 8).

Dance has been utilised as a form of communication, a way of making meaning of the world. Dance is "an unself-conscious act without deliberate aesthetic concerns arriving from anonymous tribal influences over many generations and epitomising the group's fundamental value system" (Highwater, 1996, p. 14). Armitage (1978) cites Martha Graham who stated that "dance is an affirmation of life through movement" (p. 103). Highwater specifically relates to a way of making meaning of the world while Graham states that dance itself is what affirms meaning. While both definitions relate to dance through the human condition, their approaches to the definition are quite different. Within each philosophical viewpoint, the historical, cultural, and social context plays a

role. While some definitions are wide; many perceptions of dance can be quite narrow, yet all would attest to the difficulty of defining dance (Adshead, 1988). Here, I do not seek to create a definition of dance, rather, briefly reveal that the defining of dance operates within a broad spectrum and will possibly always remain as many things to many people. In respect of this study it is more useful to discuss the term 'dance education' as it relates to the research question 'what are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms'? For the purpose of this research, the term 'dance education' refers to dance conducted within educational institutions, most particularly in primary education.

## **2.2. Dance Education in New Zealand schools: History and meanings in primary schools.**

Historically New Zealand has been influenced by dance education trends of other countries, such as England and America (Bolwell, 2009; Hong-Joe, 2002). New Zealand's geographic isolation however, has meant that, while borrowing ideas from other countries, New Zealand dance education has developed in a unique manner.

Dance has existed under Physical Education in the New Zealand primary school curriculum since 1890, as a military drill, Dalcroze eurhythmics, expressive movement, Swedish gymnastics or folk dance. In 2000 the New Zealand Ministry of Education shifted the focus of dance from Physical Education and identified four arts disciplines, dance, drama, music and visual arts. The four strands are together defined as 'The Arts' creating one of the eight prescribed learning areas in the 2000 New Zealand curriculum. The following outlines a historical overview of dance education in New Zealand from 1876 to 2012.

### **2.2.1. Historical Overview of Dance in the New Zealand Primary School Curriculum**

The history and development of dance education in New Zealand schools has been well documented (Bolwell, 2009; Burrows, 2000; Hong-Joe, 2002; Pope, 2010; Stothart, 1974, 1996, 2000). As the following historical overview reveals, dance education in New Zealand primary schools has been shaped by diverse national and international ideologies and events. In the first part of the twentieth century Bolwell (2009) noted that dance education reflected society's focus on militarism, "English physical education syllabuses were used almost exclusively during the first part of the twentieth century when militarism was rife" (p. 74). Stothart (1974) quotes clause 85 of the 1877 Education Act:

in public schools provision shall be made for instruction in military drills for all boys, and in such schools as the Board may from time to time direct, provision shall be made for physical training and wherever practical there shall be attached to each school a playground of at least a quarter of an acre (p. 4).

In discussing the gender inequalities of the period, Burrows (2000) writes that the military drills were for the boys. Exercises for girls were “geared toward developing good posture and improving the capacity of young women to reproduce” (p. 32).

The articulation of dance in curricula evolved in response to the political climate of different periods in time. “The advent of the Boer War (1899-1902) stimulated a ferment of interest in Cadet Companies; during 1899, the government voted 400 pounds for the purchase of 2,000 wooden rifles” (Stothart, 1974, p. 9). Bolwell (2009) stated that exercises were mainly non-locomotive and contained such basic exercises “as bending, stretching, lunging, isolated head and neck exercises, leg raises and deep knee bends, all executed to precise commands” (p. 4).

Gymnastics was also taught during the late eighteen hundreds in New Zealand schools. Stothart (1974) discusses the work of Oscar David, a visionary educator who arrived in New Zealand in 1878. David was a Swiss who according to Stothart (1974) “was ahead of his time ... and brought with him the basic principles of Guts Muths, Jahn and Ling” [gymnastic forms] (p. 5). Stothart (1974) cites David (1889) who stated;

What is wanted in a gymnasium is an extensive system of light gymnastics, with music and singing, for boys and girls. The first aim of gymnastics is health and the second is strength. Practice the first and the other will follow...Music, in a gymnasium softens the tone of physical work, whilst singing in the gymnasium is a great help to develop the chest, to strengthen the lungs and to give the pupil an erect carriage (p. 1).

It would appear that David had some influence in the development of physical education, as in 1883, army trained Sgt. John Hanna was appointed by the Otago Education Board as Gymnastics Instructor for Dunedin schools. Stothart (1974) states however, “At the time David and Hanna were doing their pioneering work in Dunedin, the rest of New Zealand did little or no physical training, except within the cadet companies” (p. 7).

Many dance education pioneers were based in Dunedin. Stothart (1974) stated, “Dr James Renfrew White holds a unique place in the history of physical education in New Zealand. He was the first New Zealander to take charge of physical education here” (p. 22). White was an orthopedic surgeon in Dunedin who ran the Physical Education Department from 1927 - 1932 at the Dunedin Teachers’ Training College. Bolwell (2009) states, “Under White’s supervision the students studied anatomy, physiology, folk dance, creative dance, eurhythmics and corrective physical education” (p. 6).

The arrival of eurhythmic teachers in New Zealand during the 1920's and 1930's influenced the direction of dance in New Zealand schools. The New Zealand Educational Gazette (1926), announced, "There is the whole beautiful system of Eurhythmics, ranging from the simplest to the most complex association of music and movement. Teachers should never miss any opportunity of learning or seeing something of this" (p.140).

In 1920, James Shelley arrived in New Zealand "as inaugural professor of Education at Canterbury University College, Christchurch" (Pope, 2010, p. 64). Pope (2010), a renowned expert and Australian scholar of Dalcroze Eurhythmics discusses the Teachers' Holiday Summer Camps initiated by Shelley in 1922 where Shelley, "urged the adoption of Dalcroze Eurhythmics in the music lessons of New Zealand schools" (p. 65). Two Dalcroze qualified teachers arrived in New Zealand from England in 1923 and 1924 respectively. Jessie Benham settled in Christchurch and Eileen Russell in Wellington. Besides providing private lessons, instruction courses for teachers continued in school holidays. Pope (2010) discusses the support that was received from the Education Department and states, "For this course to be officially endorsed and partially administered by the local Education Board would have been of considerable assistance" (p. 69). Teachers who engaged in Eurhythmics sessions may have considered the lessons to be 'musical education', as Eurhythmics are designed to enhance musical appreciation and dance was not a curriculum subject in its own right. Englishman, Douglas Tayler was appointed Supervisor of Music Education in New Zealand in 1926 and was a strong supporter of eurhythmics. He is cited by Pope (2010) as stating in the monthly New Zealand Education Gazette (1926, p.109), "movement will accomplish more in a short time than hours spent lecturing a motionless class" (p.70). While music was a focus of eurhythmics, to engage in such activity, students certainly danced.

Dorothy Whistler was another English trained Dalcroze eurhythmics instructor who arrived in Auckland in 1927. Pope (2010) discusses the large numbers of attendees at the summer school classes for teachers and the support provided by the Education Department. She cites the New Zealand Educational Gazette (1929, p.186), "Her [Whistler's] work is right in line with the most modern developments in education" (p.73). Another influential eurhythmic exponent in New Zealand was Winifred Houghton. Houghton conducted teachers' college classes in both Dunedin and Christchurch and according to Pope (2010), "Houghton believed that a well-informed general elementary teacher could 'pass on the spirit' of the rhythmic experience, and that it acted on children 'like a central heating system' affecting all aspects of their learning" (p. 75). Back as far as the 1920s New Zealand educationalists could see the benefit of movement for children's development.

Australian born Jean Hay was educated in New Zealand and trained in Dalcroze eurhythmics in London. She moved into broadcasting and although Hay's on-line eurhythmic broadcasts were with the Australian Broadcasting Commission in Australia, Pope (2010) states, "A survey of Rhythm for Juniors was undertaken by New Zealand Education Broadcasts, in 1953" (p. 77), suggesting that eurhythmic classes were implemented in New Zealand schools right through until the 1960's. Pope (2010) cites Tingey (1978 p. 47), who states, "A teacher trained at the New York Dalcroze School, Ian Grey-Smith, conducted classes in Dunedin during the 1960s (p. 78).

Pope's (2010) research indicates that Folk dancing was conducted alongside eurhythmics during this period. She states that Whistler was joined in a teachers' holiday refresher course, "by Muriel Searl, a teacher of folk dance from the Chelsea Education Training College in London" (p. 73). Bolwell (2009) discusses the New Zealand syllabus of physical training for schools implemented in 1920 and states:

It was an adaptation of the 1909 and 1919 English syllabuses. The section 'School Dancing' closely mirrored the content of the English manuals with its emphasis on European and English Folk Dancing (p. 5).

Isadora Duncan was an influence in New Zealand even from a distance. She moved to London in 1900 and inspired a movement toward free and expressive dance. Isadora's brother Raymond attempted to codify the dance style. Bolwell (2009) states:

English modern dance pioneer Margaret Morris learned the 'Greek' positions from Raymond when he came to London in 1909, and included them in her dance training programme. The Margaret Morris School of Dance was formed in the 1930s, training many teachers, some of whom found their way to Australia and New Zealand (p. 7).

Hong (2002) discusses the early influences of American and European dance between the 1930s and the 1960s. The influences mainly came from European female dancers arriving in New Zealand and bringing with them their own dance styles. Lucie Mendl Stonnell arrived in New Plymouth in the late 1930s as an Austrian refugee. Schultz (2008) states, "She taught children and adults Mendl creative dance based on the principles of Laban, Dalcroze (eurhythmics) and Wigman" (p. 20). Schools were established throughout New Zealand and, as a young adult I attended a Mendl School of Creative Dance in Dunedin in the mid-1960s. The classes were studio based, yet knowledge of creative dance was infiltrating the community.

Shona Dunlop MacTavish is a New Zealander, who as a young woman danced with the Bodenweiser Ballet in Europe who, on returning home before World War II, brought with her, German expressionism. Hong (2002) states:

Individuals such as Shona Dunlop MacTavish perpetuated the movement work of their mentors, in this case the work of Gertrude Bodenweiser who visited New Zealand in 1947 with her company who were received with wide acclaim (p. 40).

Although Dunlop-MacTavish did not engage in teacher training directly, she established one of the first modern dance studios in New Zealand from which many of New Zealand's best known dancers and choreographers emerged. She also taught dance at Columba College, a private girls' school in Dunedin during the sixties and seventies where Jan Bolwell, a leading New Zealand dance educator had her first taste of contemporary dance (Radio New Zealand, 2011).

Shona Dunlop McTavish is unique in that she has continued to teach the same Bodenweiser expressionist technique through from the 1940s through until the present in 2012. Shona is 92 years old and is still teaching. She provides lectures on the work of Bodenweiser at the University of Otago and re-creates Bodenweiser repertoire. I attended Dunlop-MacTavish's community dance classes on Saturday mornings during 2008. Dunlop MacTavish has indirectly influenced those working in educational dance in Dunedin. Former students and artists including Carol Brown, Jan Bolwell, Suzanne Renner and Michael Parmenter continue to influence New Zealand dance today (Dunlop MacTavish, 2001; Potter, 1998).

Immigration to New Zealand was low during the depression of the 1930s but following World War II, the number of arrivals in New Zealand was boosted by the reintroduction of assisted and free passage schemes (New Zealand International Migration Statistics, 2010). With these immigrants came mainly European dance styles although American dance was also making its presence felt.

Strong American influences were present during the 1940s from Rona Bailey who studied modern dance in California before returning to New Zealand and Margaret Erlanger from the University of Illinois who was brought to New Zealand as a Fulbright scholar by Philip Smithells, the Superintendent of Physical Education within the Department of Education during the 1940s and 1950s (Bolwell, 2009; Hong-Joe, 2002). Smithells was an Englishman whose interests included,

both sports and the art...Smithells' focus on the aesthetics of education sat comfortably with a Director-General of Education who acknowledged these subjects as giving emotional depth to teaching (Bolwell, 2009, p. 10).

Bolwell (2009) acknowledges the influence of Clarence Beeby, the Director General of Education during the 1940s. She cites Renwick a former Director of Education who stated, "No previous government had brought about so comprehensive a transformation of public education" (p. 9). Hong (2002) concurs how the early decades of the 20th century were buoyed by the work and vision of three significant educators in New Zealand, all of whom appreciated the importance of dance in the curriculum. They were:

Clarence E. Beeby, Director of Education (1938-1960); Philip Smithell, Superintendent of Physical Education in the Department of Education (1939-1948) and then Director of the School of Physical Education, Otago University (1948-74); and Gordon Tovey, National Supervisor of Arts and Crafts, Department of Education (1946-1966) (p. 39).

Bolwell (2009) suggests that Philip Smithells be credited with the introduction of Maori dance into the New Zealand dance curriculum as he became conscious of “the potential contribution of Maori games and dances to physical education” (p. 11). Stothart (1996) adds, “the Maori work began with hand games, stick games and taiaha drills” (p. 17). The Maori stick games and folk dance seemed to be the continued focus of dance in schools for many decades and this was certainly the case during my own primary schooling in Dunedin between 1951 and 1959. “Smithells published a series of articles on Maori dances, hakas and games during the 1940’s and following those articles various cyclostyled notes were distributed to schools” (Stothart, 2000, p. 12). Smithells emerged in this research as a strong visionary. His ideas seemed radical when he first arrived in New Zealand, encountering opposition and a degree of scepticism for his motives, “not only due to his aversion of military drill, but since he advocated that physical education students should incorporate music, theatre and dance into their studies” (Schultz, 2008, p. 110). His legacy continues, with every physical education student at the University of Otago engaging in a compulsory dance paper [course of study].

Although dance educators such as Margaret Erlanger, Margaret Dunbar and Annette Golding incorporated improvisation and creative dance into their teaching during the forties and fifties, the focus remained on the teaching of Folk Dance in primary schools (Bolwell, 2009; Hong-Joe, 2002; Stothart, 1996). Hong (2002) states that, “Dunbar conducted demonstration lessons in many schools” (p. 42). It remains unclear, irrespective of demonstration lessons, whether or not generalist primary school teachers implemented dance in their classrooms.

There was an acceptance of Folk Dance as the main focus of dance in schools during the 1950s and as a primary school student in Dunedin from 1951-1959 my personal memory is of Fancy Dress Balls at Intermediate school (school children aged 11 and 12) as being the highlight of the school calendar. I also have memories of performing dances from other countries in my Std. 3 class, (school children aged 9) where we had a euphonium playing teacher, Allan Pine, who fostered a love of the arts and was also in love with another teacher on staff. Their constant flirting seemed to involve the whole class. This was a memorable year for everyone involved, as I discovered at a recent school reunion. It certainly seemed that way to me, as my interest in the arts was already a driving force in my life. It is interesting to reflect on the highlights of my schooling and acknowledge that my Std. 3



year stands out, not only because of the positive energy of young love, but because of the singing and dancing that we did every week, very often to the accompaniment of the euphonium.

During the 1950s, Robin Newick, a graduate of the School of Physical Education in Dunedin, gained a Master of Science degree in Modern Dance at the University of Utah. This heralded the beginning of New Zealanders' engagement with post-graduate dance qualifications. Newick studied with Joanne Woodbury, who together with Shirley Ririe formed the Ririe-Woodbury Dance Company in America. Ririe-Woodbury provided a blend of dance education that brought artists and educators together. This appealed to several New Zealand dancers/educators who studied in Utah and returned to New Zealand taking leadership positions; amongst them Gaylene Sciascia and Suzanne Renner (Bolwell, 2009, p. 19). Renner's on-going association with dance at the Teachers' Training College, University of Otago, ensured an American influence on the development of dance education in Dunedin. Suzanne Renner has taught dance education to pre-service teachers in Dunedin since 1986 up until the present, 2012.

In 1987, the Physical Education curriculum in New Zealand identified "dance and movement, folk dance and/or creative dance" (Petrie, 2008, p.3) and as Stothard (2000) states, "te reo kori became an integral and significant component of New Zealand Physical Education"(p.12). The acknowledgement of creative and cultural dance in the New Zealand Physical Education curriculum heralded a move toward dance in the Arts Curriculum.

The Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum was launched in 2000. It has since been revised with a new curriculum being implemented in 2007. The rationale for the inclusion of dance within the New Zealand school curriculum was well researched and accepted in New Zealand by educational policy makers and arts educators. Buck (2003a) stated, "For the first time in New Zealand the arts are unified through their commonalities and argued for as one of the seven essential learnings for all children" (p.3). Some pre-service dance teacher training exists and the New Zealand Dance Curriculum (2000) states:

The Arts develop the artistic and aesthetic dimensions of human experience. They contribute to our intellectual ability and to our social, cultural and spiritual understandings. They are an essential element of daily living and lifelong learning (p.9).

The move toward dance education as an art form is acknowledged as a significant step in the history of New Zealand education. Patrice O'Brien, a former national facilitator for dance education in New Zealand, communicated pride in New Zealand's position in dance education:

In 2006 dance was approved as a subject that counted toward entry into University. Dance is now a scholarship subject with assessment that provides recognition and monetary reward to

top students in their last year of schooling, and is one of the fastest growing subjects in High School. This places New Zealand in a unique and significant position. New Zealand can be viewed as a world leader in educational dance, as it is possible for any student to study dance at pre-school, primary school and High School stages, continuing on at University right through to a PhD level (P. O'Brien, personal communication, March 7, 2012).

Dance Education has a rich background in New Zealand schools and care must be taken to move forward with an understanding and appreciation for the past. Changes to the curriculum, however, required a new approach and without confidence and a clear understanding of the way forward, a full implementation of the dance curriculum may be inhibited (Ashley, 2010; Bolwell, 1998; Buck, 2003a; Hong-Joe, 2002; Melchior, 2006; Sansom, 2008).

This historical overview reveals shifting meanings and emphases from military drills to gymnastics, eurhythmics, folk dance cultural dance or creative movement. How a curriculum articulates dance matters, as evidenced by, for example, the place of dance for girls and not boys. Teachers' meanings of dance also matter as it is the teacher who translates the curriculum. The following outlines the literature that assists in informing teachers' meanings of dance as articulated within the curriculum.

### **2.2.2. Curriculum**

The organisation of a curriculum reflects the values of a society including current political and social issues. A curriculum is:

a set of national curriculum statements which define the learning principles and achievement aims... (to) ... enable students to achieve their potential ... to play their part in our democratic society and in a competitive world economy (Ministry of Education, 1993, pp. 4,6).

A curriculum "represents the expression of educational ideas in practice" (Prideaux, 2003, p. 268) that are developed in a form that can be transferred to those teaching from it in order to deliver to students.

Prideaux (2003) states, "The process of designing and organising these elements into a logical pattern is known as curriculum design" (p.268). Marsh (1994) defines curriculum design as having major conceptual categories such as: "subjects offered for study, educational activities, intended learning, students' experiences and learning outcomes" (p.7). Prideaux (2003) elaborates,

A curriculum is a result of human agency. It is underpinned by a set of values and beliefs about what students should know and how they come to know it (p.268).

The curriculum is a starting point, a reference, and ultimately a prescribed course of study for teachers to adhere to. The New Zealand dance curriculum is relatively new and currently holds a

place in both the Arts and P.E. curriculums. Marsh (1994) asserts that school subjects have changed little over the years and neither has the broad groupings of subjects,

Social Studies was a term coined in the United States of America in a report of the National Education Association in 1894 to describe predominantly History, but also Geography, Economics, Government, and Civics (p.7).

Although Government and Civics are not curricular offerings in New Zealand primary schools, the point is made that subjects are often grouped together under headings. Currently, dance, drama, music and visual arts form The Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum. The following discussion outlines the uniqueness of dance in the New Zealand Curriculum.

### **2.2.2.1. The New Zealand curriculum and the place of dance.**

Dance has had a place in the New Zealand primary curriculum, for the most part, in the Physical Education curriculum since the 1920s. Philip Smithell's historical legacy in the development of cultural dance and specifically, traditional Maori dance has been acknowledged with the continuation of the teaching of Maori dance, since its introduction in the early 1940's. With the introduction of Maori language into New Zealand school syllabus documents in the 1980's, young New Zealanders have grown up with an understanding and appreciation of Maori culture. Reyhner (1997) states that in 1987 the Maori Language Commission encouraged all New Zealanders to "celebrate the place of Maori language in New Zealand History and a modern society" (p.213). New Zealand teachers are asked to include a cultural perspective throughout all curriculum subjects. The place of dance falls well within this directive.

In 2000, when a huge shift was made, placing dance alongside drama, music, and visual art, which together created the key learning area of 'The Arts', the dance curriculum had a distinctly New Zealand flavour. New Zealand cultural dance was included as a component of the dance curriculum. The Commonwealth Secretariat Report (2004) acknowledged the uniqueness of the New Zealand Curriculum, "New Zealand has been one of the first countries in the world to establish an entire education field that formally recognises traditional indigenous knowledge" (p.59). The 2000 New Zealand Dance Curriculum states:

Dance in the New Zealand Curriculum promotes the dance heritages of different cultures of New Zealand within schools, communities and multi-cultural society. In particular, all students should have opportunities to learn about the sources and vocabularies of contemporary and traditional Maori dance forms (p.19).

Each aspect of the 2000 New Zealand Curriculum contains references to Aotearoa New Zealand in which the Treaty of Waitangi is recognized. All students have the opportunity to acquire knowledge

of te reo Maori me ona tikanga. Although the 2007 Curriculum is a more concise document the Vision remains the same, including the specific reference to, “Maori and Pakeha recognising each other as full Treaty partners” (Ministry of Education, 2007, p. 8). The 2007 curriculum is a single document that incorporates all eight learning areas. Although the 2007 curriculum has not moved away from the 2000 Curriculum, there is less detail. Cheesman (2009) was concerned with the effect that this would have on cultural dance,

The 2000 statement describes a richer experience using more discipline specific information. The clear indication that students should have the opportunity to learn contemporary and traditional Maori dance forms in the 2000 dance statement has been subsumed into the phrase, cultural identities, and in my opinion is far less specific (p.4).

‘The Arts’ section of the 2007 syllabus provides an overview of the arts, providing reasons why students should study the arts, how each learning area is structured, and provides brief overviews on each of the art forms. Dance is encompassed in one broad statement:

Dance is expressive movement that has intent, purpose and form. In dance education, students integrate thinking, moving and feeling. They explore and use dance elements, vocabularies, processes and technologies to express personal, group, and cultural identities, to convey and interpret artistic ideas, and to strengthen social interaction. Students develop literacy in dance as they learn about, and develop skills in, performing, choreographing and responding to a variety of genres from a range of historical and contemporary contexts (Ministry of Education New Zealand, 2007, p. 20).

Cheesman’s comments appear significant, as detail is particularly important in dance, where a lack of understanding may already exist (Buck, 2003). Without specific curriculum detail, teachers may not register the importance of traditional and contemporary Maori art forms in dance. This comment is based on the assumption that the Ministry of Education wishes to maintain the unique position of the New Zealand curriculum and its valuing of traditional cultural dance. The detail in the 2000 New Zealand curriculum document was as follows;

Dance in the New Zealand Curriculum promotes the dance heritages of the diverse cultures within New Zealand’s schools, communities, and multi-cultural society. In particular, all students should have opportunities to learn about the sources and vocabularies of contemporary and traditional Maori dance forms (Ministry of Education, 2000, p. 19).

The New Zealand Curriculum (2007) has an over-arching Vision Statement, under which the Values, Key Competencies and Learning Areas are given equal weight. A set of Principles are designed to be managed throughout every aspect of schooling. They are listed as, “High Expectations, Treaty of Waitangi, Cultural Diversity, Inclusion, Learning to Learn, Community Engagement, Coherence and Future Focus” (p.7).

The following five key competencies guide the realisation of the curriculum vision, “Thinking and Using language, symbols and text, Managing self, Relating to others, Participating and contributing (Ministry of Education, 2007, pp. 12-13). These key competencies encompass all curriculum areas and are designed as achievable goals to develop the cognitive capabilities of students.

The Arts Curriculum (2007) has a generic approach to Dance, Drama, Music and Visual Arts:

Each discipline is structured round four interrelated strands: Understanding the Arts in context; Developing practical knowledge in the arts; Developing ideas in the Arts and, Communicating and Interpreting in the Arts (p. 20).

The achievement objectives for each art form reflect the individual discipline. While it has been possible to create generic arts statements, not all teachers or art practitioners were happy with all four arts areas sharing the same umbrella.

The time spent in teaching each of the arts could vary considerably, and some art forms could be side-lined altogether. Each separate art form has its own distinct body of knowledge, and concepts. (Aotearoa New Zealand Association of Arts Educators, 2000; Education Forum, 1999).

Bolwell (1998) expresses a counter view,

now is the time for dance educators to put aside parochial concerns and turn our attention toward the more general issues affecting the development of the arts within the education system (p. 81).

The Ministry of Education Curriculum (2007) states, “Over the course of years 1-8, students will learn in all four disciplines” (p.20). The Achievement Objectives are broad and to a degree open to individual interpretation. The way in which objectives are achieved in dance is quite different from the way in which achievement objectives are reached for subjects such as literacy and numeracy. Hong (2000) elaborates,

The study of dance cultivates kinaesthetic sensibility and elicits a range of cognitive, artistic, aesthetic and emotional understandings in ways that are very different to other scientific or theoretical constructs (p. 3).

The teacher’s personal meaning of dance may affect their ability to make judgements about student achievement through dance. As Buck (2005) states, “There is little evidence in the literature of research into how primary teachers experience the teaching of dance in their classrooms”(p. 6). The Curriculum Implementation Exploratory Studies, Final Report (2009) uncovered many problems in the implementation of the dance curriculum, however, concluded that teachers are embracing,

the freedom, flexibility and permission they had been given to design a curriculum to best meet the needs of their own student community and to put each student at the heart of their own learning (p.11).

It would seem that dance has been swept up in the overall enthusiasm for the new 2007 curriculum with its freedom and flexibility. As an advocate for arts education, Bresler (1993) warned, "As desirable as such a curriculum seems to university-based arts educators, its implementation presents a dilemma and has to do with the role of the teacher in curriculum reform" (p. 7). Bresler argues that to teach the arts, teachers require aesthetically-based skills. She makes an important point that was to become pivotal in this research, "teachers cannot teach what they themselves have not learned" (p. 7).

The different dimensions of inquiry as identified by Eisner (1998a) are, intentional, structural, curriculum, pedagogical and evaluative dimensions and may not be accessible to every teacher when teaching dance. While every New Zealand primary school should follow the same curriculum documents, one can predict that the intention of the school body and the intention within each individual classroom will vary according to a range of beliefs, and the particular social constructions of the school. Lumpe, Haney and Czerniak (2000) state that, "people act upon what they believe". They cite Pajares (1992) "who explained that clusters of beliefs around a particular situation form attitudes, and attitudes become action agendas that guide decisions and behaviours" (p.276). "There are numerous ways to think of goals and intentions. One of these pertains to the degree to which they are achieved. Another is whether they are of value" (Eisner, 1998a, p. 74). While an arts curriculum indicates the valuing of dance, this study aims to examine the reality of dance in New Zealand primary classroom classrooms.

In the light of the different meanings that teachers attribute to dance, the curricular dimension is an important investigative area in dance education. Ashley (2010) revealed that many teachers in her study placed an emphasis on the arts curriculum strand, Developing Practical Knowledge and found that teachers "associated a theory/practice split with the UC [understanding dance in context] strand, the perception that theory made teaching dance from a contextual perspective too difficult" (p.122). Stinson (2007) discussed the difficulties in making sense of curriculum research in an arts curriculum and posed a question,

Looking historically at trends in both arts education curriculum and in research raises the question about the relationship between research and practice, questions that are not directly addressed by most authors. To what extent does practice in arts education drive research and to what extent does research inform practice? (p.145).

This study hoped to redress any imbalance by informing current research through an examination of the practices of teachers teaching dance in New Zealand primary schools.

Eisner (2002) sums up the importance of a curriculum in cognitive development when he states, “The curriculum is central to any educational enterprise. The curriculum constitutes an array of activities that give direction to and develop the cognitive capacities of individuals”(p. 148). Eisner’s (2002) reference to cognitive capacities refers not only to thinking and feeling, but also to perception and he states, “It is a conception that embraces the variety of ways in which humans represent what they have cognized”(p. 148). As a curriculum subject, dance is acknowledged as being important to the development of cognitive skills. Keinanen, Hetland and Winner (2000) stated,

While it is important to understand the value that dance can add to students cognitive skills, it is just as important, (if not more so) to know the how and why dance contributes to learning, as well as the organisational and instructional conditions that allow arts learning to help students become more successful students (p. 14).

The New Zealand Dance Curriculum offers access to a broad range of dance experiences. Woodfield and Gunby (2003) discuss the 1993 New Zealand Curriculum Framework, “Schools were required to teach a unified National curriculum which prescribed subjects to be taught and learning outcomes that were to be achieved, but left the content unspecified” (873). This appears to be the case with the 2007 dance curriculum. It is possible to include any dance where there is expertise and interest. Although the feedback from reports on the implementation of dance suggest there is much work to be done, the breadth and depth of the dance curriculum offers opportunities for students and teachers alike to access the diversity of dance and in doing so develop cognitive skills and abilities to achieve the curriculum vision for New Zealand students. In order to place the New Zealand dance curriculum in context, the following section reflects upon school dance curriculums in other countries.

### **2.2.3. School dance curricula – An International view**

Curricula have historically related to the values and political nuances of the era in which they were written.

Recent examples of national curriculum abound in the western world – their successes, impediments and deficiencies are well documented. For example the Education Reform Act 1989 and the ushering in of the National Curriculum in the United Kingdom represented a major policy shift in that country (Marsh, 1994, p. 1).

New Zealand, South Africa and Ireland have National Dance Curricula (National Council for Curriculum and Assessment, 2011). Ireland’s primary school dance however, is subsumed within the Physical Education curriculum, unlike the national arts curricula in South Africa and New Zealand. Bergmann (1995), offers a definition of the commonly ascribed differences between dance under an arts curriculum, and dance in the physical education curriculum,

Within the physical education curriculum, creative dance lessons typically focus on the development of the motor skills involved, with little concern for the experience's aesthetic potential. In arts education, the primary focus is creative dance's aesthetic potential. Advocates view creative dance as not only having the potential for developing motor skills or aesthetic sensibility, but as a means to improve students' self-concept and as a valuable component of an integrated curriculum (p. 156).

I would assert however, that dance is not always defined so clearly, as belonging in one camp or another, and is dependent upon the meaning ascribed by a teacher, practitioner, student or audience member. Bergmann (1995) proposed that, "One must consider how similar dance is to other art forms. Like other art forms, creative dance has aesthetic qualities" (p. 158). While dance, as it is presented in the New Zealand National Dance Curriculum (2007) fosters artistic ideas in dance, the dance curriculum promotes the study of cultural dance and the development of skills in performance. Creative dance is not the only area of study in the New Zealand dance curriculum.

A revised National Curriculum in South Africa includes the 'Arts and Culture' as one of eight learning areas (Kieinanen, Hetland, & Winner, 2002). Drama, dance, music and visual arts as components of South Africa's Arts and Culture curriculum, are initially encouraged to be taught holistically and not as discreet art forms. Koff and Warner (2001) describe the rationale behind curriculum integration,

With the proliferation of content in every subject area, educators began to look for ways to combine or integrate subject material, since there was insufficient time to fit everything into the regular school day (p. 142) .

Mans (2007), in reflecting on the introduction of dance to the South African curriculum, expresses concern that cultural dance will be frozen in time despite the fact that the curriculum statements do espouse the importance of African traditional dance. Mans (2007) states, "the field of dance curriculum research requires urgent attention if dance is to play out its role as fundamental embodiment of Africaness" (p.264). The Department of Education (2002) statement aims to cover equally,

a variety of African and other classical arts and culture practices. This will expose learners to the integrity of existing traditions and conventions, and: innovative emergent arts and culture practices. This will open avenues for learners to develop inclusive, original, contemporary, South African expression and to engage with trends for the rest of the world (p. 14).

Mans (2007) acknowledges that before the introduction of dance to the National Curriculum, African dance did not belong in a formal curriculum, thus limiting an on-going understanding and appreciation of traditional dance. Stinson (2007) reflects on this paradox,

Many of these authors identify tensions between teaching Western high art and teaching local culture. This brings us back to the questions identified earlier: what's worth knowing, who decides, and in whose interests are the decisions being made? (p.145).



Brennan (1996) expresses similar concerns regarding dance in the Northern Ireland Physical Education Curriculum. She stated,

The teaching of national dance as part of the dance programme of study could also pose some problems between the two distinct cultures in the province... both English and Irish Folk dances are presented and taught in schools from both traditions (1996).

An alternative view is that dance may be used as a tool in the breaking down of cultural boundaries in order to develop new understandings. Oehrle (1996) cites Teilhard (1962) who suggested that the world has entered a period of mass communication and that “humanity’s evolution at this stage will be determined by its own capacity to unite” (p.96). She proposed that by the education of the whole person through arts, students will be “edified, enlightened, illuminated and uplifted” (p.97).

Le Metais (2003) lists the following eighteen nations as including the teaching of arts in their curriculum documents, “Australia, Canada, England, France, Germany, Hungary, Ireland, Italy, Japan, Korea, Netherlands, New Zealand, Singapore Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, U.S.A., and Wales”(p. 57). Le Metais (2003) states,

The scope of activities embraced by ‘the arts’ varies. In Canada, France, Hungary, Ireland and Spain, art(s) education includes at least the disciplines of visual arts (drawing, painting, crafts etc), music and the study of drama; it may sometimes include dance and occasionally, media studies (p.58).

Canada operates separate education systems for each independent province and territory. Curriculum documents for each province and territory include dance as an area of study. Strate (2011) elaborates: “As education falls under provincial jurisdiction, dance studies within school systems vary a great deal from province to province...there is little coordination between the provinces” (p.1). Primary [elementary] dance in America operates under a similar system. Each state operates independently. Where dance is included in the primary curriculum, there is variation between the emphasis given and the placement of dance within an arts or physical education curriculum. The federal government however, appears to be addressing this problem. The President’s Committee in its Arts and the Humanities Plan (PCAH) (2011) has introduced a document titled ‘Reinvesting in Arts Education: Winning America’s Future through Creative Schools’. The first point made in this document relates to building collaborations among different approaches. Point one of the executive summary states;

The PCAH urges leaders of professional associations to work with federal and state agencies to build and demonstrate connections among different educators in the arts: arts specialists working on standards-based approaches, classroom teachers trained in arts integration; and project-based teaching artists (p.vii).

Within Australia, separate educational curriculums operate for each state and territory. South Australia, Northern Territory, West Australia, Queensland and Tasmania include dance as one of five arts strands under the heading of 'The Arts'. Victoria and New South Wales list dance, drama, music and visual arts as the four components of the arts curriculum. The Australian Capital Territories follow the curriculum framework for the Australian Draft Curriculum. The Australian Government is currently producing a draft for the Australian National Curriculum where all states and territories will work as one, where it is intended that the arts including dance will be nationally mandated for the first time in its history (Australian Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority, 2010). The draft shape of the Australian National Curriculum (2011) includes 'The Arts Forms' and states; "Students will experience and study the following five art forms to develop their arts practice and aesthetic knowledge: Dance, Drama, Media Arts, Music and Visual Arts"(p. 3).

It would appear that all nations discussed in this section have already implemented or are moving toward dance within a National Curriculum in schools. New Zealand is able to provide a model from which other nations may draw to inform their own direction.

### **2.3. So...New Zealand values multiple ways of knowing?**

New Zealand has a school dance curriculum that extends from a child's first day at school until their last. A National Certificate of Educational Achievement (NCEA) is the main qualification for secondary school students in New Zealand, and dance is recognised through NCEA for selection into University. Students may continue in dance through University Studies to a PhD level. These facts stand as a testament to an appreciation of dance as a particular way of knowing. The New Zealand Curriculum (Ministry of Education, 2000) acknowledged the ability of dance to stimulate the cognitive capabilities of students, "Learning through dance enables them [students] to appreciate that dance is a holistic experience that links the mind, body and emotions" (p.19). Leland, Harste and Helt (2000) supported the concept that; "If schools and society valued multiple ways of knowing, there would be much less labeling of children" (p.115). Hong (2002) elaborates,

Dance, drama, musical and the visual arts as different and distinct forms as sign and symbols systems are vital to the development of the whole person because they are each particular forms of experience and understanding (p. 2).

This premise is acknowledged and valued in education, yet dance, as a form of representation other than the written or spoken language may pose concerns regarding understanding for the teacher. Eisner (1996) explains; "forms of representation we encounter are related both to the limits and

possibilities of those forms and our ability to read them” (p.ix). Teachers therefore, need experience in being able to read the non-verbal language of dance. Eisner (1996) expands this point,

I believe that one of the major aims of education is the development of multiple forms of literacy. What we ought to develop in my view, is the students’ ability to access meaning within the variety of forms of representation that humans use to represent the contents of their consciousness (p.x).

The revised 2007 New Zealand curriculum has removed a statement regarding the development of cognitive capabilities of students when studying dance. Where no statement is available, teachers may not appreciate that dance may serve, “the interests of education in developing the critical, creative and intellectual capacities of young people as a literacy within developing conception of multi-literacies” (Hong, 2000, p. 3). Whether or not teachers understand the vocabulary of dance, it is likely that they will know of Howard Gardner’s theory of multiple intelligences.

Howard Gardner’s theory of Multiple Intelligences has informed educationalists since the late 1980’s. Checkley (1997) states,

Howard Gardner’s theory of Multiple Intelligences, described in *Frames of Mind* (1985), sparked a revolution of sorts in classrooms around the world, a mutiny against the notion that human beings have a single, fixed intelligence (p.8).

Brualdi (1996) states; “Gardner defines intelligence as the capacity to solve problems or to fashion products that are valued in one or more cultural setting” (p. 1). The development of the New Zealand curriculum incorporating multiple ways of knowing suggests an understanding of the value of what is important in a modern society. Checkley (1997) however, warns of misunderstandings arising around multiple intelligences. He interviewed Howard Gardner, who stated,

The theory of multiple intelligences, in and of itself, is not going to solve anything in our society, but linking the multiple intelligences with a curriculum focussed on understanding is an extremely powerful intellectual undertaking(p. 13).

Couldron and Smith (1999) state, “teachers need to become aware of the plurality of approaches and ways of doing things” (p. 722) and Eisner (1998b) poses the question,

If different forms of representation performed identical cognitive functions, then there would be no need to dance, compute or draw. Why would we want to write poetry, history, fiction, drama or factual accounts of what we have experienced? (p.44)

From my experience of teaching, I believe that many teachers are aware of the plurality of approaches and where they themselves are involved in making change, different approaches are possible. Richardson (1998) concurs, “Teachers often resist change mandated or suggested by

others, but they do engage in change that they initiate, what I will call voluntary change”(p. 1). Any changes that involve the implementation of dance in the classroom must be teacher driven.

## **2.4. Implementation issues and Arts Curriculum critiques**

As stated, a major change took place in 2000 when dance took its place within the arts curriculum in New Zealand. A curriculum revision process resulted in the 2007 curriculum.

Lee, O’Neill and McKenzie (2004) argue, “The New Zealand curriculum framework (2000) borrowed heavily from the United Kingdom’s 1988 National Curriculum Model” (p.48). Crooks (2002) concurs, “In 1991, a new government and Minister of Education introduced sweeping changes modeled on the curriculum and assessment changes made in the late 1980s in England and Wales” (p.4). With the United Kingdom primary school curriculum currently in a state of flux, Elley (2004), criticised the New Zealand curriculum and the way in which it was introduced, stating, “the curriculum was copied too uncritically from the United Kingdom’s model” (p. 105). Despite some similarities, the English education model of delivering education is not the same as it is in New Zealand where schools are managed with a degree of autonomy that is due to the introduction of Tomorrow’s Schools in the early 1990s, “It is well documented that “Tomorrow’s Schools” was about the administration of education” (Epell, 2009).

Davis’ (2007) criticism of the curriculum is that it is not neutral and that, the ‘New Right’ has driven the economic, social and cultural reconstruction of New Zealand since the 1990s and that teachers should be concerned that the policies of the New Right are the driving force behind the new curriculum. Davis (2007) cites Peters and Marshall (2004) who proposed that the “curriculum control has been removed from the educators and those responsible for its implementation...turning teachers into technical functionaries” (p. 34). Epell (2009) discussed the attitude toward the engagement of teachers in curriculum development. She states,

There were many good teachers on the curriculum advisory and writing panels; yet the curriculum stocktake review undertaken in 2000-2003, recalled the lingering feelings of teachers that the 1990s curriculum documents were not theirs. The process was seen as being too exclusive and non-consultative (p. 54).

Mutch (2000), questions the inclusion of values in the 2000 National Curriculum when discussing the tendency of the curriculum to lean toward values and poses the question “which values and whose values” (p. 4). She cites Hood (1998, p. 129) who states,

Values cannot be taught, they are learned by being internalised. Values are more likely to be internalised and therefore enduring when two things happen. First, the schooling system practices the values it espouses and second, the students have the opportunity to think about the application of values in solving real life problems i.e. through contextual learning experiences (p.5).

Mutch (2000) qualifies her position, "In 1904 the moral instruction section of the syllabus for schools highlighted such values as modesty, prudence, patriotism, zeal and integrity of purpose" (p.1). As any values espoused are those valued politically by a particular country at a point in time, it is possible to recognise a political climate in which education exists. The New Zealand Curriculum (2007) incorporates values similar to those of Turkey, Ireland and Finland. A vision statement outlines the values of the New Zealand Curriculum (2007) as, "excellence, innovation, inquiry and curiosity, diversity, equity, community and participation, ecological sustainability, integrity and respect" (p.10).

If New Zealand Primary schools provide an environment where the values of the New Zealand curriculum are respected, then it is possible that the values might be realised, yet I concur with Hood (1998) in questioning the ability to teach values. I propose that for values to be realised, they must be recognised as lived values. While the New Zealand curriculum highlights values, the current focus on literacy and numeracy testing would appear to be the driving aim of education in this country. Unless values can be seen as an integral part of classroom teaching, they are mere words.

Confidence to teach dance and understand the new curriculum was examined when the new primary curriculum was introduced and some dance in-service training was offered during the implementation period. Findings of a curriculum stocktake suggested that the need was for more guidance and detail, rather than less. Cheesman (2009) questioned the timing of the Curriculum Stock-take Review, "Curiously while the arts documentation and implementation were very new (nine months old) a curriculum stock-take was already taking place"(p.2). Since the initial in-service support offered to teachers through school subject advisors attached to Universities, changes to the system have made access to professional development more difficult. Although a number of consultants remain attached to Universities, private consultants contactable through the Ministry of Education, or by schools directly, provide professional development. The focus is no longer subject specific and is targeted toward raising student achievement. Crooks (2002) comments, "Paradoxically while curriculum expectations had been tightened, teachers were initially offered few resources to supplement the implementation of the new curricula" (p. 5).

The University of Waikato's curriculum stock-take (2002) posed a question: How much further professional development do you think you need in the arts curriculum? 91.8% of primary teachers

responded that they needed 'a lot' or 'some'. 38% of primary teachers felt that the curriculum statements in the Arts were easy to teach from. It is not possible to separate the findings to ascertain which of the arts subjects related to the curriculum statements above. The percentages of schools unlikely to implement each arts discipline of the curriculum by term 2, 2003 however, concluded that 30% of primary schools would not implement dance at all, followed by drama, 25%, music, 11% and Visual Arts, 9%. (Review-office Of Education, 2003, p. 7). Of concern was the fact that 30% of schools would not have implemented dance at all by term 2, 2003.

The majority of teachers who responded to the draft of the arts curriculum conducted by the Aotearoa New Zealand Association of Art Educators, (2000) did not support the arts subjects chosen for inclusion in the arts curriculum. The main recommendation of the findings stated that,

the inclusion of art [visual art] within a generic arts curriculum statement is completely abandoned and an entirely new art curriculum statement is developed that is structured from the bodies of knowledge and sets of practices of the discipline of art education (p.4).

The membership of the New Zealand Association of Arts Educators is predominantly drawn from visual arts practitioners and teachers. Visual art had a presence in schools before the introduction of the new curriculum. It is not surprising that they did not wish to share the 'Arts' platform. A submission on the draft by the Education Forum (1999) argued for each art form to have its distinctive forms of rationality respected and the generic approach removed from the draft,

each discipline, dance, drama, music and the visual arts, has its own distinct forms of intelligibility, networks of concepts, and tests for validity, different sources of its cultural and artistic traditions, the different backgrounds and intellectual equipment of its protagonists, different interests and intention in both creators/performers and audiences (p.6).

The argument for distinctive forms of rationality was not acknowledged in the 2007 curriculum and the Arts remain as four separate strands under the heading of 'The Arts'.

The stock-take of the Implementation of the National Curriculum conducted by The Ministry of Education (2004) indicated that teachers "would have preferred more uniformity in the way the content documents were set out and the contents categorised" (p. 213). It would appear that these comments have been considered in the development of the 2007 curriculum. In order to provide uniformity across the documents, detail has been omitted. This may leave teachers concerned about the how and what to teach in dance. The National Curriculum stock-take chapters, 'Support for teachers and teaching' and 'Professional Development' do not mention the arts in formal discussions.

Despite on-going issues around implementation, the introduction of dance within the 2000 and 2007 curricula has been viewed positively by educationalists. Keown, Parker and Tiakiwai (2005) cite Steers (2004), “Indeed arts education may, it is suggested, be thought of as exploration of what it is to be human” (p. 127).

## 2.5. Rationales

Educational Rationales are designed as statements that justify a subject’s place in the curriculum. Uncovering teachers’ understandings of rationales for dance education is a necessary aspect of this research, with a body of evidence arguing the benefits of dance education for all students. Hillary Rodhan Clinton (2007) encouraged readers to “Take a look at the recent study which found that the students who study the arts are more likely to outperform their peers academically” (p. 37). Stinson (2005b) reiterates, “Arts educators have also advocated value in improving test scores and abilities in every other academic discipline through a mysterious process known as transfer of learning” (p. 82). If arts education, and more specifically, dance education, is capable of improving academic performance, along with a range of affective outcomes including enhanced self-esteem, then it is necessary to discover what is informing the delivery of dance education in New Zealand primary classrooms.

The rationale emphasises the significance and importance of a subject in relationship to educational goals within a particular social and political climate. Brennan (1996) outlines the changes in dance rationales over time in the Northern Ireland Physical Education Curriculum.

The initial motives for the inclusion of dance surrounded the potential of folk dance to provide health and fitness benefits to the participants. A rationale for dance as an artistic and aesthetic element came later after the 1944 education act, which embodied a new philosophy of “educating the whole child” (p.494).

Ross (2000) attributes Dewey as being the first to describe a rationale for dance education. She states,

Dewey was the first to describe the “forest” of art in terms clear and universal enough, so that others, particularly those outside philosophy, could go in and describe “the trees” of specific art forms in relationship to educational goals” (p. 141).

In order to describe the importance of dance, the Baltimore Public Schools program (2011) states in their rationale,

The dance education curriculum recognises that all students have the right to an arts education as a fundamental part of basic education. Dance has been recognised as one of the four fine arts, a core subject in Maryland public schools. Dance education enables students to

discover their own innate capacity for the communication of ideas, thoughts and feelings through the medium of dance (p.1).

The Ministry of Education in British Columbia, Canada (2010) however, has a different focus with their curriculum, defining dance,

Dance is the art of gesture and movement. It transforms images, ideas and feelings into sequences that are personally and socially significant. Dance organises physical energy within time and space, and may draw from the power of music, literature, drama and the visual arts. It is a natural means of communication and expression that integrates movement feeling and intellect (p. 7).

The following section of the New Zealand curriculum (Ministry of Education, 2000) articulated a clear rationale for dance's inclusion in the curriculum.

Education in dance is fundamental to the education of all students. Dance is a significant way of knowing, with a distinctive body of knowledge to be experienced, investigated, valued and shared.....Education in dance promotes personal and social well-being by developing students' self-esteem, social interactions, and confidence in physical expression. It aims to foster their enthusiasm as participants, creators, viewers and critical inquirers and to develop their lifelong interest in and appreciation of dance. (p.19).

Each of the example rationales contains a slightly different focus, from a definition of what dance is, to why it is important, yet each definition outlines the benefits for dance students. Hong (2002) asserts that in regard to New Zealand schools,

a rationale, as a set of underlying principals or reasons on which beliefs or actions are based, is imperative in helping teachers to comprehend, describe and explain what they do (p.87).

The current New Zealand Dance curriculum however, subsumes the rationale within the vision, values, key competencies and learning areas. A statement in the Foreword clarifies this position,

The New Zealand Curriculum is a clear statement of what we deem important in education. It takes as its starting point a vision of our young people as lifelong learners who are confident and creative, connected and actively involved. It includes a clear set of principles on which to base curriculum decision making. It sets out values that are to be encouraged, modelled and explored. It defines five key competencies that are critical to sustaining learning and effective participation in society and that underline the emphasis on lifelong learning. (Ministry of Education, 2007, p. 4).

Many positive outcomes regarding dance have already been addressed in the New Zealand curriculum, such as cognitive learning, the building of self-confidence, self-expression and social well-being. It is interesting to reflect on the relationship between these curriculum documents and Laban's belief, that in dance, "we gain insight into the nature of our being, our condition, relationship with others and our place in the Universe" (Hodgson & Preston-Dunlop, 2001, p. 178). While the curriculum for dance in New Zealand schools reflects such a belief, this research



investigates teachers' understandings of dance in the curriculum, and its practical application in primary classrooms.

## **2.6. Teachers meanings of dance within the primary curriculum: what's it all about?**

Dance in schools, as articulated by a curriculum, may offer numerous meanings for teachers. Stinson (1988) elaborates, "the word dance brings to mind many images – ballerinas on a stage, the scene at a teenage disco, do-si-dos in a country barn, a chorus line" (p. 2). Dance in a New Zealand classroom may mean Jump Jam, the school musical, folk dance, cultural dance or creative movement. For some teachers, meeting the dance curriculum requirements may demand that set steps are taught by the teacher with students copying the movements. Despite the open nature of the New Zealand dance curriculum which allows the generalist classroom teacher to facilitate learning without the necessity of being a trained dancer, it is possible that the lack of specific boundaries may cause problems in gaining an understanding of expectations for dance in a primary classroom. Teachers work within an institution with clearly defined curricula and set expectations in most subject areas. Dance Education in New Zealand schools broadly encompasses; developing practical knowledge in the arts, developing ideas in the arts and communicating and interpreting in the arts, [performing, choreographing and responding] (Ministry of Education, 2007).

Where a perceived lack of expertise inhibits the inclusion of dance in classrooms, an assurance that dance education could be about the facilitation of creative movement, may assist some teachers in making a connection with the requirements of the specific dance statement for the arts:

In dance education, students integrate thinking, moving and feeling. They explore and use dance elements, vocabularies, processes and technologies to express personal, group and cultural identities, to convey and interpret artistic ideas, and to strengthen social interaction. Students develop literacy in dance as they learn about, and develop skills in, performing, choreographing and responding to a range of genres from a range of historical and contemporary contexts (Ministry of Education, 2007, p. 13).

For some teachers, the concept of creative movement as dance education may conjure up images of students 'being trees' or imitating an object or character. Imitation or identification may shape aspects of creative dance, yet within a broader context, creative dance allows students to discover individual creative expression, opening up channels of communication. Creative dance is an art form that enhances brain development and self-awareness. Kaufmann & Ellis (2007) describe the process of a creative dance class,

Rather than learning sequences and steps taught by the teacher, in a creative movement class the child is encouraged to enhance his natural movements through teacher suggestions from the dance elements of body, motion, time, space and energy (p.8).

Stinson (2002) discusses the natural movements of children and believes that “the aesthetic experience of dancing can only come when we move with concentration and awareness; it is this which transforms everyday movement into dance” (p. 158). Dance Education in New Zealand primary schools can be about developing an awareness of what the body is doing kinesthetically. Anna Halprin (2002) explains the benefits of students understanding their own bodies;

If their technical training is grounded in a kinaesthetic awareness of movement, it will be a pleasurable experience. If, in the presentation of a movement idea, the teacher permits the students to take an active role in its development, and they are given the freedom to try for themselves until the movement “feels right”, they will be able to find meaning in what they are doing (pp. 105-108).

While many teachers, with or without expertise in teaching dance, may have an understanding of the relevant, and distinguishing features of leading a dance class through instruction and training as opposed to student centred dance education, they may still find the entry points and processes difficult, and lack the confidence or understanding of how to teach dance in their classrooms. Teachers need a starting point so that experience may develop. Levinthal and March (1993) discuss the way in which individuals within an organisation, “engage in activities at which they are more competent with greater frequency than they engage in activities at which they are less competent” (p. 102). With a focus on literacy and numeracy in schools, it could be assumed that primary teachers are most competent teaching these subjects. Shulman and Shulman (2004) remind readers, “All teaching makes extraordinary performance demands on teachers”(p.263). Besides introducing an extra subject in an already crowded curriculum, teachers may find themselves as the learners when planning a dance session. “An accomplished teacher must understand what could be taught, as well as how to teach it” (Shulman and Shulman 2004, p. 262). Shulman and Shulman (2004) discuss a situation where teachers may develop an appreciation for a new vision of teaching after in-service training or encountering role models yet,

he or she can be unwilling to change in that direction, insufficiently motivated to change, inadequately supported by his or her context or peers, to take risks of forgoing extant practices, or exert the efforts needed to change, and the like (p.261).

Levinthal and March (1993) warn that even those teachers with some experience might encounter difficulties; “Experience is often a poor teacher, being typically quite meager relative to the complex and changing nature of the world in which learning is taking place” (p. 96). Professional development would seem important for all teachers. Kaufman (2003) poses the question;

How many times have we as teachers been confronted with situations in which we really were not sure what to do? We “flew by the seat of our pants, usually doing with our learners what had been done with us (p. 213).

Teachers may find it difficult to ‘fly by the seat of their pants’ with little or no experience of dance. One might surmise that, ‘they don’t have any pants’ to start with. The need for teachers to engage physically may cause anxiety. The New Zealand Dance Curriculum is based in the Arts and does not have a focus on technique and bodily competency, yet this does not stop teachers becoming nervous about their own ability to dance, especially as some aspects of the curriculum are focused on performance. It is easy to fall back into long-standing ways of identifying dance. Hanna (1999) states,

In difficult times out-dated conceptions about dance and the relevance of dance education are especially harmful. Impediments to successfully building dance education programs are its image, belief about dance, and reality. Dance has a non-essential image that educators reinforce (p. 186).

The vision of the ideal dancer being of a certain shape and size and having significant dance skills may be one held by some teachers. Fear of dance is not new (Ashley, 2010; Buck, 2003a; J. Hanna, 1999; Stinson, 1988). The readiness of teachers to embrace the psychological factors involved in moving the body in space may be of concern. Boas (1942) elaborates,

The subjective conception of our body is fantasy, partly based on reality and partly based on the emotional and intellectual make-up of the individual, and is called body image (p.4).

For a teacher holding a negative body image, the prospect of ‘performing’ in front of a class may add to a developed myopia regarding the understanding of teaching dance in the classroom. Kaufman (2003) suggests, “Both teachers and learners need to re-interpret their anxiety or nervousness in difficult situations as excitement or anticipation, rather than an ominous sign of vulnerability” (p.214). Many teachers may find such a creative approach difficult. Within the literature, a lack of confidence would appear to be the prime motivator in preventing and inhibiting an understanding of what dance is in the primary curriculum and how to teach it (Ashley, 2010; Buck, 2003a; Carney & Chedzoy, 1998; J. Hanna, 1999; Hong-Joe, 2002; Oreck, 2004; Stinson, 1988; E. Warburton, 2008) Ashley (2010) discussed the concerns of the teachers’ involved in her study and found that, “findings from all three sets of data also showed that some teachers perceived themselves as insufficiently skilled across diverse dance forms” (p.165). Hong (2002) writes of attempting to convey to a group of educators some meanings of dance,

A few are experienced teachers, fresh out of the classroom, others are subject-specialist advisors, some are lecturers in teacher education from tertiary institutions...All are curious and more than a few, verbally, if not through their body language, express some anxiety about their lack of knowledge about dance into schools (p.242).

The term 'dance' can stimulate many different emotions in a primary teacher. Where dance is something outside a teacher's realm of experience, then the idea of teaching it can create anxiety and fear. One way to manage dance is to ignore it altogether. It is realistic to suggest that teachers may view dance as something unreachable, as something that 'others' do, beyond their capabilities, awarding themselves a low status within dance teaching. Within the dance community a hierarchy exists. There is a possibility that teachers either consciously or unconsciously absorb their place within the hierarchy of dance. Stinson, Blumenfield-Jones and van Dyke (1990) investigating the voices of young women in dance and their meanings of dance concluded that, "these young women see performance as the only possible way of being involved with dance" (p.20). The meaning of dance for these young women was specific and linked to their place in the hierarchy of dance. Stinson, Blumenfield-Jones and van Dyke (1990) stated,

As the study developed, our subjects made clear to us how deeply embedded hierarchy was within our dance culture" (p.14)... At the top of the hierarchy are real dancers – professional performers – and the top of these are in the best companies (pp.14 -19).

With teaching on a lower rung than performing, this places primary school teachers at the bottom of the dance hierarchy, with dance trained high school teachers above them, moving up to studio teachers, university teachers and dance company teachers. These placements are debatable, dependent on individual experience and understandings of dance, however, regardless of the ranking of other teachers of dance, primary school generalist teachers are likely to remain at the bottom of the ladder. This is likely to impact on generalist primary teachers with little or no knowledge of teaching dance.

The New Zealand Education Review Office (2003) reported that,

teachers at some schools had poor knowledge and skills in the arts disciplines. Several reports identified that teachers lacked confidence in the individual disciplines. Areas such as creativity and expression in dance, which were not a part of the previous curriculum were particularly singled out (p.6).

Dance is the only example provided in this statement, suggesting that this is the area where teachers had the least knowledge and confidence. The conclusions of the study found that Drama and Dance were the two disciplines that teachers were having the most difficulty in implementing. This lack of confidence in the teaching of dance is not confined to New Zealand teachers. Alter, Hays and O'Hara (2009) conducted a study "that explored nineteen Australian primary [elementary] schoolteachers' perspectives of Creative Arts education" (p.1). Although the research did not analyse teachers' meanings of dance specifically, the evidence demonstrated that, "the teachers felt very uncomfortable teaching these specific areas" (p.13). Dance and drama scored lowest in teacher

confidence with visual arts and music scoring more highly. Most teachers had a perception that they did not have the required artistic abilities to teach any of the arts syllabus areas.

Carney and Chedzoy (1998) conducted research to identify the relationship of primary pre-service teacher educators between prior experience and their ability to teach the primary Physical Education curriculum in the United Kingdom. Most had little or no prior experience in dance or gymnastics and rated the University program highly as providing them with the necessary knowledge and skills yet,

It was noted that teachers were most apprehensive about the teaching of dance and gymnastics. These lessons were less successful than others, usually because the progression in the work was not clearly defined (Carney & Chedzoy, 1998, p.14).

Research conducted by Rolf (1997) examined how much dance was being taught in English and Welsh primary schools at a time when dance was a well-established part of the curriculum. "What emerged...was a low level of perceived teacher confidence and subject knowledge in teaching dance" (p.226).

Similar results emerged concerning teachers' attitudes toward the use of arts in teaching in an American study. Oreck (2004) discovered that, despite teachers' belief in the benefits of the arts to their students, they lacked "confidence and /or the autonomy to include the arts in their teaching" (p.65). Oreck (2004) went on to recommend,

that teachers need on-going support for their own creative and artistic development. The predominance of self and personal issues throughout the study strongly supports a concentration on teachers' own creative and artistic skills, attitudes and behaviours (p.66).

Research has already established that a lack of confidence in teaching dance in primary schools leads to little or no dance being taught in some classrooms (Buck, 2003a; Hong-Joe, 2002; Welsh, 1995). Oreck's study reinforces the need for on-going support. Hanna (1999) discussed the introduction of discipline based arts education into all American primary schools but advised, "A Minnesota state-wide survey indicated many teachers believed dance and movement should be more widely included in student learning, but few felt qualified to teach it" (78). Dance in America, as in many other western countries, has been recognised as an important curriculum development, but where the generalist primary [elementary] teacher is given the task of teaching it, problems of understanding arise. Hanna (1999) states,

Because there are several models of dance education, competencies for teaching it may vary. Focuses differ for the educational model and the professional model (Smith-Autard 1994), for example, the emphasis on the process in the former versus product in the latter; development of creativity, imagination and individuality verses knowledge of dance

technique; feelings and subjective experience versus serious professional training; a set of principles versus stylistically defined dance technique and student problem solving versus directed teaching (p.70).

Stinson (2002) places the foregoing discussion in context,

What we teach is who we are. Who we are incorporates how we see the world (including those parts of it we call the curriculum), what we know of children, what we think about teaching and learning (p.157).

Primary teachers are generalist teachers who have received little pre-service education in dance or have been offered little in the way of professional development in dance. Primary school teachers as a group, view the current New Zealand dance curriculum through a blurry lens. Warburton (2008) reflects on the lack of curriculum knowledge, pedagogical knowledge and access to resources by primary school teachers,

The concern is not the lack of good resources, but a lack of informed readers. In contrast to the population of general education teachers, the few dance teachers in public and private schools with training in pedagogy are far outnumbered by those without any exposure to a formal or informal course of study in educational methods and materials. For years dance educators have been making the argument that more, not less, attention be paid to pedagogical knowledge for prospective dancers and teachers (p.8).

Hennesy, Rolf and Chedzoy (2010) concur with previous research that relates to teachers' lack of confidence in teaching dance and the lack of in-service opportunities. They state,

Our belief is that the more experience they [teachers] have of engaging with the arts and of being involved in teaching children at the earliest stages of their professional development, the more likely they will be to see arts teaching as a normal part of their role (p.54)

Ashley (2010) states, "feelings of inadequacy are common amongst teachers as they face the challenges and responsibilities inherent within dance education" (p.110). The feelings of inadequacy stem from many sources, such as a lack of experience, a lack of understanding of outcome expectations, what to teach and how to teach dance (Ashley, 2010; Buck, 2003a; Hong-Joe, 2002; Stinson, 1988). The language used to describe dance may be new to some teachers. Dance in the primary curriculum is about developing literacy and skills in performing, choreographing and responding in a range of genres. For teachers with a background in dance, research indicates that even these teachers may not know where to start (Buck, 2003). The idea that dance is movement and creatively developed may seem a concept to be grasped on one level, yet may not correspond with long-held ideas of dance that are deeply ingrained within one's psyche.

The link between confidence and understanding is acknowledged when investigating teachers' understandings of dance in the primary curriculum. Each New Zealand teacher is likely to hold a different understanding of dance depending on who they are and their individual experiences.

## 2.7. Organisational structures

Since 1989 schools in New Zealand have been governed by Boards of Trustees and managed by School Principals.

In 1989 New Zealand embarked on what is arguably the most thorough and dramatic transformation of a State system of compulsory education ever undertaken by an industrialised country. Under a plan known as Tomorrow's Schools this island nation of 3.8 million people abolished its National Department of Education, which had overseen state schools for decades and turned control of its nearly 2,700 primary and secondary schools over to locally elected boards of trustees (Fiske & Ladd, 2000).

Robertson and Dale (2002) cite Nagel (1998) who stated,

Between 1984 and 1993 New Zealand underwent radical economic reform, moving from what had been...the most protected, regulated and state-dominated system of any capitalist democracy to an extreme position at the open, competitive, free-market end of the spectrum (p.465).

A Principal, a teacher representative, and approximately five to seven parents elected by the parent body, sit on the Board of Trustees committee. This board oversees the functioning and running of a school. The Ministry of Education's (1990) charter framework for the board of trustees focuses on equity:

The Board of Trustees will ensure that the school's policies and practices seek to achieve equitable outcomes for students of both sexes, for rural and urban students, for all students irrespective of their religious, ethnic, cultural, social, family class and backgrounds, and irrespective of their ability and disability (p.5).

Logan (1995) makes the point that the focus on equity goes back as far as the Treaty of Waitangi. He states, "the government of our nation has the responsibility to ensure that all citizens, both Maori and Pakeha, enjoy the benefit of living in a just society" (p.5). While such a focus may be a worthy ideal, Nash (2000) elucidates the obvious differences found in any primary or intermediate school, "the real existence of socially differentiated access to education is manifest in every classroom" (p.55). Nash (2000) argues that, "in New Zealand, the achievements of Pacific students, for example, are generally poor despite their high aspirations" (p.69). A discussion on inequalities will be continued under the heading of, 'The decile system in New Zealand Schools'.

The Wyndham Primary School website (2009) stated the generic code of conduct for all Boards of Trustees,

effective governance is a successful blend of professional expertise and community involvement. This cooperation should lead to effective and positive relationships between the trustees and the staff and ensure that the education and well-being of students is maintained (p.13).

The school culture is influenced by the composition of the Board of Trustees. Obvious differences will occur depending on the rural or urban setting and the socio-economic circumstances of the school community. Wylie (1999) comments on the operations of Boards of Trustees,

Much of the advice and information used by people in schools comes free and informally, from the central government agencies, from the government-funded advisory services and NZSTA services, and from teacher and principal representative organisations. (p.xvi).

Wylie (1999) also discusses that most Principals found “government funding inadequate to meet their school’s needs...funding and property remain the two main issues that boards of trustees spend their time on” (p.xv). Twenty-one years have passed since the introduction of ‘Tomorrow’s Schools’ yet the repercussions of such a dramatic change in the delivery of education continue to be felt.

The move toward self-governance of schools has been viewed as a commercialism of schools where, according to Codd (2005), teachers are managed professionals. He stated,

The radical transformation of New Zealand’s education system that has taken place over the past 15 years has had profound effects upon the teaching profession. By placing the emphasis firmly on the economic purposes of public education, neo-liberal policies have eroded fundamental democratic values of collective responsibility, cooperation, social justice and trust (p.204).

Harvey McQueen (2009) who was the education aide to the Rt. Hon. David Lange at the time of the change to ‘Tomorrow’s Schools’ agrees with the proposition that “politicians and teachers have to establish a working relationship”(p. 19). He discussed the consultation that took place with school communities where he accompanied the Prime Minister up and down the country. McQueen (2009) asserted that,

one important Picot [report] recommendation was not implemented. That was for an overarching Council, with the heads of the Ministry of Education, the New Zealand Qualifications Authority and the Education Review Office plus three other prominent New Zealanders appointed by the government (p.20).

According to McQueen (2009), this omission has resulted in a lack of “on-going coordination between the agencies, and outright competition in some instances” (p.21). One might question why an overarching Council was omitted in the educational reform of ‘Tomorrow’s Schools’. Fisk and Ladd (2000) asserted that, “The restructuring...was at least partly driven by a neo-liberal perspective, which is grounded in a conviction that competition will improve the delivery of most services” (p.42). Olssen (1996) subscribed to the neo-liberal theory and stated that, “contradictions within this theory make its demise likely” (p.338).



Gainsford (2009) stated, “there appears to be little backup when the school is deeply divided or the board struggles to find the knowledge and experience to make the system work” (p.1). Creech (2009) who was the Minister of Education in the early days of Tomorrow’s Schools stated, “Tomorrow’s schools was built upon a good base, but it was never going to solve all the problems” (p. 32). Creech (2009) asserted that,

in some respect, aspects of the reform went too far, and the Boards of Trustees became, not surprisingly, advocates for their community school ... It would have been better if common communities, (small districts, say) had a Board, rather than each school (p. 34).

Along with the organisational changes that were introduced with “Tomorrow’s Schools, school zoning schemes were removed, to allow parental choice. “Pupils were permitted to enrol in the school of their choice” (Woodfield & Gunby, 2003, p. 864). This resulted in mixed results with some schools being oversubscribed. Woodfield and Gunby (2003) cited Fisk and Ladd (2000) who claimed that “Pakeha [European New Zealanders] families have been more aggressive in the pupil relocation stakes” (p.866). This may have resulted in a widening of the gap between the low and high socio-economic schools. Currently, schools have the choice whether or not to accept students from outside their zone. An Education Forum Briefing Paper (2005) states,

Students in New Zealand have the right to attend the local school for which they are zoned. However, students are also free to attend out-of-zone schools if those schools have the capacity to accept them (p.2).

Fisk and Ladd (2000) asserted that of the three strands of ‘Tomorrow’s Schools’, self-governance and schools as agents of the state,

the third strand is a competitive environment. The new educational order in New Zealand relies on competitive market pressures, including parental choice, to increase academic quality and to foster accountability in both the individual schools and the system as a whole (p. 6).

Not all schools had the capacity to rise to the challenges of marketing, particularly those in low decile areas. Fiske and Ladd (2000) discuss how some schools closed down while others needed rescuing by the Ministry of Education. They state, “Many schools in South Auckland have been struggling for a long time, ‘Tomorrow’s Schools’ merely compounded their problems” (p.257). According to Carpenter (2009), “In brief, from decades of being a welfare state which prided itself on its care for citizens, New Zealand moved almost overnight to a user pays, market driven economic system” (p.2). The way in which teachers operated within schools required adjustments to accommodate the changes.

The impact of organisational change on subjects like dance may be viewed in respect to curriculum; timetabling policy, and organisational structures within the school. Within some large primary and intermediate school structures, teachers operate within systems known as teaching syndicates. These syndicates consist of a leader and a combination of experienced senior teachers, junior teachers, and specialist teachers, one or more of whom may have expertise in an area such as dance. Syndicate leaders are skilled senior teachers and in the case of Nelson Central School, (2011) the Deputy Principal is a syndicate leader. His job description states:

It is the Deputy Principal's responsibility to teach a class and provide quality learning opportunities in his syndicate, thus ensure students learn the content and processes intended for them in the school curriculum (p.1).

The rhythm of New Zealand schools is generally established by three main teaching periods in a day; before morning tea, before lunch and then the afternoon session before the end of school. Within each session, it is typical that two subject areas provide the focus. Each session runs for approximately one to two hours. Dance, if included, will typically be held in an afternoon session, providing a clear message of hierarchy. Prashnig (2006) states, "school timetables follow a similar pattern worldwide: academic subjects are scheduled mainly in the morning and non-academic subjects in the afternoon" (p.57).

Under the Planning, Implementation and Reporting Framework, each teacher is required to complete documentation for the teaching in their classroom. Hipkins, Joyce and Wiley (2007) state that, "literacy and numeracy are the most common focus for planning and reporting" (p.96). Literacy and numeracy are seen as the basics, and therefore the compulsory planning may be centered round these subjects. Although the New Zealand Curriculum states that there are seven essential learning areas, busy school days and the constant need for reporting may result in some subjects being marginalised due to time constraints. The Irish National Council (National Council for Curriculum and Assessment, 2010) documented similar problems with time constraints:

Teachers reported that they had insufficient time to fully implement curriculum subjects or to address all of the objectives within each of these subjects...teachers also reported that they had insufficient time to meet the needs of all learners (p.5).

Besides the teaching of the curriculum, interruptions can happen at any time, these may be for assemblies, fire drills, visiting guests, sporting activities, event rehearsals and excursions. All of the extra-curricular activities require detailed planning which adds an extra burden on, already busy, teachers. A report commissioned by the English National Union of Teachers (2002) compared teachers' working conditions over three decades. The main findings revealed that,

art drama, music and ICT are being squeezed and only partially covered by lunch-time and after school clubs ... The decline in the curriculum time available for these creative subjects is matched by a decline in teachers' own sense of creativity (p.5).

This section of a chapter has provided a broad overview of the organisational structure of New Zealand schools under the system of self-governance. As stated, Tomorrow's Schools was a dramatic transformation of the New Zealand Education system. Along with the change of structure and the introduction of market-place competition, schools in New Zealand were rated under a decile system which affects all school communities.

## **2.8. The decile system in New Zealand Primary Schools**

While many factors influence the development of culture within individual schools, New Zealand schools are set apart by the socio-economic rating of the parent population. A measurement of the socio-economic circumstances of the parent body form what is known as a 'decile rating'. This decile [group rating] system differentiates schools from each other in an official manner.

The main purpose of a decile system is to ensure adequate resourcing for every school, "Schools are differentially funded depending on the overall school socio-economic index" (Hattie, 2000, p. 2). While it is desirable that low decile schools gain financial assistance from the government, the decile label determines whether or not parents want to send their children there, provided that they have a choice. An Inquiry into Decile Funding (2003) states, "A school's decile ranking is an indicator of the number of students to face socio-economic obstacles to educational achievement. It is not a measure of whether the school in question is providing a high quality of education"(p.14). Hattie (2000) recalled that the decile system was,

devised to assist in differential funding to schools...For this usage, deciles may be beneficial, but it is the common use of deciles as an indicator of school performance that is at issue here (p.3).

Research suggests that the decile ranking does make a difference to the educational experience in a low decile school. Articles such as 'Making a difference in the classroom, effective teaching practices in low decile schools' (Hill & Hawk, 2000), 'Low decile schools and teacher professional development' (Carpenter, 2009), 'Improving schools in Mangere and Otara' [low decile areas] (Education Review Office, 1996), suggest that low deciles schools need help. Carpenter (2009) states, "New Zealand, like most western and non-western countries, has an abysmal record when it comes to achieving successful outcomes for the children of the poor" (p.1). Codd's (2005) comments support Carpenter's suggestion that the introduction of self-governance and decile ratings has done little to improve the situation in low decile schools,

the radical transformation of New Zealand's education system that has taken place in the past 15 years has had profound effects upon the teaching profession. By placing the emphasis firmly on the economic purposes of public education, neo-liberal policies have eroded fundamental democratic values of collective responsibility, cooperation, social justice and trust (p. 204).

Teaching challenges differ between high and low decile schools. A school will, in many respects, be affected by the decile rating and how this affects the teaching and learning, depends on a variety of other factors that combine to respond to a situation and create a culture. Nash (2000) discussed Bourdieu's 'theory of reproduction' who argued that students "internalise the odds" of their social group and thus reproduce these "objective chances" imposed by the social structure" (p. 69). In response to Bourdieu's theories, Nash stated,

Bourdieu's position is attractive to sociologists of education for some very good reasons. He offers a structural theory of reproduction, in which the dominant classes maintain their position through the control of material and symbolic resources. They are able to manipulate these in an educational system that gains legitimation from its apparent commitment to the principles of democratic equality, while acting all the time as a particularly effective conservative force (p. 57).

Nash's argument can be used to relate to the current situation in New Zealand schools where students are labeled according to their socio-economic circumstances. Schools have moved away from the streaming of students and yet, in some ways the decile system works as a streaming of schools. Hattie (2000) proposed that,

the use of deciles can lead to a stereotype that students in lower decile schools are less academically able, lower decile schools are less academically effective, and/or that teachers in low decile schools are less proficient (p.5).

South Auckland, including Manukau City, is home not only to the largest groupings of Maori, Pacific Island and Asian people, but is also home to many low decile schools. Robertson and Dale (2002) cited Hills (1995) who suggested, "It has been estimated that New Zealand has had the largest increase in income inequity among OECD countries" (p.470). Stephens (2000) added, "the group who experience this disparity most profoundly are the Maori and Pacific Island ethnic communities" (p.83).

It would seem that the problem of inequity will continue to grow as Statistics New Zealand (2010) project that:

By 2026 New Zealand's European or 'Other' population is projected to reach 3.47 million, New Zealand's Maori population is projected to reach 810,000, New Zealand's Asian population is projected to reach 790,000 and New Zealand's Pacific population is projected to reach 480,000.

The total growth of New Zealand's Ethnic population in the next fifteen years is projected as 7.4%. According to a study undertaken by the (Tertiary Education Commission, 2006),

At present a third of all young people (younger than 15 years) in New Zealand live in the Auckland region...At the time of the 2006 census, people living in Manukau city [greater Auckland] were mainly of Pacific and Asian ethnicity (pp.11-12).

The problems do not only lie within the decile rating and unequal distribution of resources. Hattie (2000) cited Fisk and Ladd (2000, p. 205) who propose that teachers may use the decile rating system to select schools at which to teach,

Because it is often easier and for some, more satisfying, to teach students who are motivated and ready to learn, it would not be surprising to find that high-quality teachers gravitate to high-decile schools in which the teaching environment is less-harsh than low-decile schools (p.4).

In periods of high unemployment for teachers, however, choices will be more limited, providing a possible advantage to low-decile schools in teacher selection. The situation will fluctuate depending on the current economic climate, and it is important to acknowledge that many 'good teachers' will gravitate toward low decile schools where they feel they may make a difference.

Primary schools in New Zealand continue to be ruled by a marketplace metaphor where different schools compete for students. The decile rating system and self-governance provided a starting point for such a system and in some cases, parents will travel out of their way so that their child may attend the school of their choice. The geographic locations and relative size of the country generally limit choices in rural or low socio-economic areas and zoning has been introduced in schools where large enrolments of students have pushed the school facilities to the limit. Alongside a human element, school cultures are created from a range of factors; including decile rating, location, size, and the facilities and environmental structures.

## **2.9. Facilities and Environmental Structures**

A school environment can affect the emotional wellbeing of its population which in turn may affect teaching and learning within a New Zealand primary school. Modern facilities in a school may assist in creating a positive climate, just as a lack of facilities combined with other negative factors may cause feelings of discontent (Woolner, Hall, Higgins, McCaughey, & Wall, 2007). Sellstrom & Bremberg (2006) proposed that, "the school environment has an impact on child health and wellbeing" (p.149), and Buckley, Schneider and Shang (2004) suggested that,

Teaching takes place in a specific physical location (a school building) and the quality of that location can affect the ability of teachers to teach, teacher morale, and the very health and safety of teachers (p. 4).

The physical environment of a school in New Zealand is easily recognisable in the community and reflects a historical era. It is possible to imagine the past experiences of the teachers and students in schools that were designed to accommodate the population explosion after the Second World War from the 1940's to the 1960's. These schools have classrooms laid out in a line. Schools are built for the purpose of providing a space wherein teaching and learning may take place and the rooms will generally emphasise functionality.

Some primary schools will have designated spaces where dance may take place, while others may have to shift desks in the classroom in order to conduct a dance lesson. In New Zealand schools, the space for dance in the school is dependent on a variety of factors. A large high decile school in an urban area may have a school hall or even a performing arts studio. During the nineties, however, some schools became over-subscribed and ran out of room (Woodfield and Gunby, 2003). It was not until 2000, when a Labour government reintroduced school admissions according to residential zoning, that schools were able to choose to refuse admission to students from outside of their zone. The repercussions of the Tomorrow's Schools enrolment policies may still be impacting on some schools. Some smaller low decile schools may not have the resources with which to build a school hall, while other schools may access the local community hall for special events and practical classes.

Earthman (2002) conducted a study that concluded, "school building design features and components have been proven to have a measureable influence on learning"(p.1). Matar's (2010) research corroborated existing evidence about "the importance of the school environment for academic achievement"(p.4). As Sellstrom and Bremberg (2006) stated, "Children and adolescents spend a considerable amount of their time in school, and the school environment is therefore of importance for child outcomes" (p.149). Fisher (2005) cited the New Zealand Ministry of Education (2004) who conducted a study that investigated,

the spaciousness of the classroom, it's adaptability, the ability to control the layout, natural and artificial lighting and temperature control...each of the factors were viewed as being of very high importance - indeed vital – to the efficacy of the learning environment for teaching purposes (p.163).

The physical appearance of a building, the amount of light, ventilation, temperature, colour, and noise may affect the mood and attitude of the teachers and students within an institution. Jensen (2005) discusses the importance of natural light in a classroom and provides statistics revealing that, "students in the brightest rooms progressed 20% faster in standardised maths tests and 26% faster

in reading tests” (p.87). The thermal quality of a classroom may influence student learning. (Duke, 1998; Dyck, 2002; Lanham III, 1999). Earthman (2002) stated, “the importance of a controlled thermal environment was stressed as necessary for satisfactory student performance”(p.3). Primary teachers tend to decorate their classrooms to suit their own style of teaching in an effort to stimulate learning and Jensen (2005) affirmed that,

walls and ceilings ought to be full, rich and interesting, but not distractingly cluttered. Use the walls for affirmations, information, inspiration, or sneak previews of upcoming learning and reviews of prior learning (p.90).

Human factors impact upon a school environment. The relationships that teachers form with colleagues and administrative staff create an environmental element within a cultural context. In order to gain an understanding of the meanings that people make regarding the school environment, it is important to understand each participant’s individual frame of reference within the school context where they spend time interacting with others. Tschannen-Moran, Hoy and Hoy (1998) discussed the creation of teacher efficacy and posed the question, “The inter-relationships between self-efficacy and collective-efficacy should be examined. To what extent are they functions of each other?” (p.241). An understanding of the attitudes of authority figures and colleagues provides relevant contextual information assisting in creating a frame of reference, through which attitudes toward the teaching of dance may be determined.

The school Principal is often looked to as the person who sets the tone of the school, who ultimately is responsible for creating a school culture (Deal & Paterson, 2009; Hallinger & Heck, 1988; Leithwood & Jantzi, 1990; Moolenaar, Daly, & Slegers, 2010). Sellstrom and Bremburg (2006) cited Rutter et al, (1980), who stated that, “pupils demonstrate greater school achievement and social adaptation in schools characterised by strong educational leadership” (p. 149). A ‘good school’ may be one where the leader has a developed emotional intelligence and interpersonal skills, but a complex myriad of factors can affect a Principal’s ability to lead effectively (Weinstein, 1979; Woolner, et al., 2007). Ackerman and Maslin-Ostrowski (2004) stated, “A good school must learn to bend itself around the strengths and vulnerabilities of its leader” (p.1). School settings vary, as do the hierarchical structures within each of the case studies. Each participant may be affected in different ways through the environment in which they work. Truman, Mertens and Humphries (2000) commented on educational goals,

The participants may all know the world differently but they are bound together by a common context, and that is the school they work in. Different schools will have different influences, but most teachers within the institution will be working toward the same goals (p.5).

Each individual school creates its own unique environment through environmental design, facilities, and a school culture. Participation in dance, if it were to be offered in the classroom, may add another layer to teacher's understandings of goals within their school culture. It is important to the success of the school that the whole school community work together, yet within a school environment, each teacher will hold a perception of personal control over their ability to teach dance. Attitudes toward dance education stem from the school environment and also the community which in turn affects student attitudes. Student attitudes toward dance and its associated gender issues can also affect the way in which dance is taught in the primary classroom.

## **2.10. Gender inequities and student attitudes toward dance in New Zealand schools.**

Sanderson's (2001) statement regarding gender attitudes toward dance provides the essence of this section of chapter two,

If positive attitudes have not been formed in the early years when attitudes are being formed, the adolescent stage may be too late, in which case efforts may be more profitably directed toward young children (p.128).

If children's attitudes toward dance are positively established in the early years of schooling, then there may be hope for the attitudes of a general community to begin a process of change where dance is included as an essential element of education. Sanderson's (2001) research into adolescent and gender issues evidenced little change in attitude between boys and girls regarding attitudes to dance. She states, "The virtual absence of change in age-related scale scores highlights the need for both increased dance provision in schools and more focused teaching" (p.117).

Little research exists in the area of student attitudes toward dance in the curriculum. Sanderson (2001) affirmed, "given the overall level of published research in any area of dance education, it is unsurprising that little information is available on pupil's attitudes to this subject" (p.120). While students may choose to undertake studies of dance outside of school, whole class participation in dance within the classroom offers a different experience. Research has been conducted in curriculum areas where gender issues exist and Sanderson (2001) declared, "Virtually all curriculum subjects are better served than dance, including the visual arts, and especially music" (p. 122).

Wieschialek (2003) reminds the reader that, "to understand the nature of the connection between dance and society one has to be aware of the fact that dance, and even single movements are shaped by culture" (p.115). "While many cultures have viewed and continue to view dance as an



appropriate male activity, the Western European cultural paradigm situates dance as primarily a female art form” (Risner, 2008, p. 94). Ferdun (1994) concurred that the dominant culture labels dance as an activity associated with females. She stated, “Labeling dance as female, prevents dance from functioning fully as an educational medium” (p.46). I concur with Ferdun’s observation and believe that a problem lies in the myth that dance is for girls and not boys. “This is a myth perpetuated by the majority including parents, teachers and school system leaders” (N.S.W. Department of Education and Training, 2001, p.1). Gender has historically played a role in the teaching of dance and continues to do so. Buck (2011) addresses the concept of a male dance teacher and the need for the boys in the class to establish societal meanings of male dancers and male teachers,

Obviously the scarcity of male dance teachers in their own experience played some part in raising their uncertainty, along with the stereotypes that have been imprinted on them relating to the notion of the male dance teacher (p. 2).

Young boys in primary schools are quick to catch on to any existing attitudes and prejudices that inform their developing masculinity. Sanderson (2001) cited Pollard (1988) who argued that “the male adolescent is insecure and unwilling to be associated with any activity which may be interpreted as feminine” (p.128).

As an experienced dance teacher, I believe that dance can be gender neutral. The prejudices around dance are more likely to inform young boys than the dance itself. Gender roles develop at a young age from the time when the child recognises that they are male or female and are different from ‘the other’. In a gender role development study, McHale, Crouter and Tucker (1999) stated,

Our findings revealed striking differences between boys and girls during the middle childhood years...sex differences were more systematic in children’s activities and interests than their personality qualities and attitudes. To the extent that children’s activity patterns and preferences mean that they practice different kinds of skills (e.g. sewing versus soccer) and that they become exposed to different opportunities, sex-typing around everyday activities may have long-term and pervasive developmental consequences (p.1001).

Blume (2003) discussed Bourdieu’s (1978) theory that,

the sociology of the body is based on the idea of gendered cultural capital in which the different social spaces occupied by men and women determine their interaction and experiences (p.97).

The point is made that boys can gain self-worth by performing averagely in sport, yet “the male dancer, however physically gifted is seen as a contradiction to the social norms of the average school” (Blume, 2003, p. 97). Martin (1993) argued however, that “gender stereotype knowledge has not been adequately conceptualised, and so has not been adequately measured” (p.185). Martin

(1993) discussed the fact that research in gender roles and stereotypes has stemmed from Piaget's ideas regarding cognitive development, and while it is important not to abandon "a cognitive-developmental approach in which children play an active role in their own gender socialisation" (p.185), she proposed an investigation of gender stereotype knowledge. Martin (1993) suggests that not all "avenues for assessing gender knowledge have been explored" (p.193). She proposed that the development of gender stereotype knowledge is reconsidered, stating,

The component model is useful for providing a means to reconsider developmental changes in children's acquisition of gender stereotype knowledge...researchers need to develop more sophisticated methods of assessing gender stereotype knowledge. To determine a child's level of understanding, it is necessary to assess more than label-component links (p.195).

The same can be said of research into gender in relation to dance education curricula. As Risner (2009a) stated, "it is important... to note the dearth of research and scholarly attention applied to this burgeoning area of dance education" (p.41).

Sanderson (2001) stated that, "attention should be paid to the curriculum content which appeals to both boys and girls" (p.130). Boys appear to need little encouragement to join in any cultural dancing in the primary school; therefore the inclusion of cultural dance in the New Zealand Curriculum should meet that need. Expressive and creative dance, is beneficial for both boys and girls where each child may express him/herself in their own way. Gender issues are complex and there are arguments for and against catering for the specific needs of boys in dance. Kerr-Berry (1994) proposed that the use of West African dance is a way to combat gender issues (p.44), while Crawford (1994) suggested that vigorous athletic movement may be a method of appealing to the males in a classroom. Bond (1994) discussed her project with young dance students where the students developed individual movement sequences wearing costumes made from boxes that partly obscured the dancer. The dance was based on Sendak's book 'Where the Wild Things are' (1988). In drawing the implications of the success of the project Bond (1994) suggested that theme based dances may provide a way forward in combating gender issues. "These include; performance as process, the power of masking, the value placed on individual learners and the presence of multisensory ritual" (p.31). McSwain's (1994) research highlighted the fact that "students of all cultures are highly motivated to involve themselves in the popular dance of their own culture" (p.257). Conversely, and in line with my own thinking and experience, there are always opportunities to find common ground that break down gender stereotypes. Catering to the masculine image specifically, may be viewed as an acceptance of gender stereotypes in dance by the teacher. Risner (2009a) discussed Deborah Williams' doctoral dissertation which offered that, catering to boys:

illuminated the boys' social isolation and their frustrations with misguided efforts by teachers parents and directors to justify dance for males in traditionally masculine ways...as one boy chided, I'm an artist, not a football player (p. 53).

Where dance is introduced for the first time into a primary classroom there can sometimes be resistance from the boys. This will be exacerbated in the case of a teacher lacking confidence and expecting such a reaction from the boys. The teacher's expectations will play a major role. Sherlock (1987) discussed the experience of a male student teacher attempting to teach dance in a physical education class.

He found he spent most of the time persuading the boys and neglecting the girls. A young pupil who had boxed for England was not to be persuaded that dance would help his footwork. Thus Alistair had no qualms that dance would threaten his masculine image (p.446).

Physical Education in schools endorses masculine roles for males, therefore the fact that dance has, until the most recent curriculum, been associated with physical education suggests that dance might be an acceptable masculine pursuit. Sherlock (1987) discussed the issues of masculinity and femininity in physical education and commented that "Dance is not associated with power in the same way as physical education as a generic term is" (p. 449). A study undertaken by Waddington, Malcolm and Cobb (1998) examined gender stereotyping and physical education in Nottinghamshire, England. Teachers generally felt that they lacked confidence to teach dance, with 67% of men rating their personal competence to teach dance at the lowest level of the scale. 54% of male teachers also rated dance as the least important subject in the Physical Education curriculum compared with 20% of female teachers. "Dance is taught by only one in three male P.E. teachers compared with four in five women"(p.41) revealing that traditional gender stereotypes exist.

The traditional views that dance is more of a female-appropriate activity was also expressed by some male teachers who said either that they had felt inhibited teaching dance, or that they felt boys were inhibited in dance lessons (Waddington, et al., 1998, p. 42).

Stereotypical views and attitudes of the community filter through to boys and assist in forming beliefs about dance in the school. Sanderson (2001) cited Coleman and Hendry (1999) who stated that, "It is generally recognised that the family has a major influence on a child's attitudes, and so increasingly in adolescence has peer pressure" (p.130). As dance educators, teachers need to be aware of the messages being passed on to students and parents. Stinson's (1988) point relates to unconscious gender biases that a teacher may carry;

What messages do we send when we rush to assure concerned parents that all men in dance are not gay, implying that being gay is the worst possible fate that could befall their sons? (p.56).

Although peer pressure is not as invasive in the lower primary school situation, once boys reach years 6, 7 and 8, (ages 9, 10 and 11), they are becoming increasingly aware of what they need to do in order to be accepted, and generally, studying dance doesn't fit the criteria. Stinson (2005a) advocated that teachers ask themselves difficult questions that cannot be readily answered,

Sharing our discomfort and uncertainty with our students – is clearly not one likely to be popular in an age when control and certainty of educational outcomes are the major concerns (p.56).

Stereotypes and labels exist regardless of the arguments around catering for boys, or teachers' expectations. Blume (2003) stated, "In order to deconstruct body, sex and gender in schools, physical educators must go beyond existing frameworks for the dance curriculum" (p.99). Risner (2009b) discussed the importance of primary teachers ensuring that "they identify teaching methods and in-class language that reinforce narrow definitions of masculinity and femininity" (p.72). Risner (2008) stated,

While efforts to bring dance to young boys and to a wider audience in general have been admirable, these efforts and their rhetoric have often obfuscated larger social issues of gender stereotypes and homophobia (p.97).

As stated, scant research exists on pupils' attitudes to dance education (Blume, 2003; Burrows, 2000; Sanderson, 2008; Stinson, 1995). "On the other hand, the fundamental importance of positive pupil attitudes in acquiring relevant knowledge and understanding is recognised" (Sanderson, 2001, p. 120). Blume (2003) suggested that critical reflection is a necessary tool in dance pedagogy in order to view the body as a site for critical reflection of one's life. His suggestion for critical pedagogy involves;

Asking students to describe what happens in their body when they are moving. (b) Engaging in critical dialogue about images of gender and culture. Reflecting on the connection between being and thinking, or embodied knowing. Thus, critical pedagogy is self-reflexive, explicitly responding to the students' lived, perceived and imagined realities (p.99).

Establishing class discussions from the early years of schooling when children are developing their own reflective skills and values could be important in understanding attitudes toward dance. In the early years of schooling students may enjoy dance as a natural expression and an extension of their rapidly expanding communication skills. Parents are proud and encouraging of their children, especially when they perform at the annual concert. Parental involvement in a child's education results in the growth of self-esteem in the learner. Houlenville and Conway (2008) stated that "Parental effort is consistently associated with higher levels of achievement and the magnitude of the effect of parental effort is substantial" (p. 453). As a performing art, dance is a medium that offers many opportunities for parents to encourage and praise their children. While the process is a

main focus of dance in primary school, opportunities for performance of student work can enhance the learning and promote positive reinforcement. As parents become more involved in appreciating classroom dance, opportunities may present for re-educating stereotypical perceptions.

Although this chapter has focused on boys in the dance classroom, the issue of gender in dance relates also to girls. Young girls may extend their dance experience by learning dance through a studio system and this may in turn create problems and enhance the learning of dance in primary classrooms. In my experience of twenty-three years of teaching educational dance, the division between the students who learn dance outside of the classroom and those who don't can create difficulties. Young girls, and it is mainly girls, who learn in a studio, will quickly become technically competent and stand out. Where students lack confidence, displays of technical expertise by the 'experts' can create anxiety, and result in withdrawal.

Girls in primary classrooms begin to develop an awareness of their bodies as they move toward pre-puberty. If they are carrying extra weight, they can be conscious of not wanting to display their bodies in a dance class. The difference between girls who learn dance outside of the classroom and those who don't becomes more obvious during this period. A study by Pigeon, Oliver and Rochiccioli (1997) examined a group of 97 young female dancers to determine the effect of intensive dance practice on growth and puberty,

16% of the dancers who started dance training had noticeably decreased growth velocity during the pre-puberty stage after the beginning of ballet practice compared with the control group. ... These dancers were the slimmest and had the most inadequate nutritional intake. Puberty in dancers was delayed compared with the controls" (p.243).

Studio trained dancers are generally slim and their technical expertise is highly developed in comparison with other students. Rather than compete, some girls who lack confidence in a dance class, may feel it is easier not to make an effort.

Where dance is well established in a primary school classroom, the stereotypes for both boys and girls may start to break down. Where dance is being taught confidently in primary schools, boys can be equally as enthusiastic and creative as the girls and less emphasis may be placed on technical excellence. A Curriculum Support Article for the N.S.W. Dance Curriculum (2001) discussed the fact that while dance is viewed as a female activity,

the boys' attitudes to the experience of a practical dance program did not support this hypothesis...This demonstrated a disparity between boys' perceptions about dance as observers and as participants...Given that it is well-documented that many boys prefer to learn kinaesthetically, dance provides a unique opportunity for them to develop the other intelligences through a preferred mode of learning (pp.7,8).

This comment is in line with my own experience of teaching boys. It falls to the teacher to provide dance experiences that are relevant to both boys and girls, generic in nature and held within a supportive and comfortable environment. The community attitude can be very pervasive however, and once boys reach a stage where to continue learning dance is an option or a choice, it is unlikely in this decade that many boys will make such a choice. Girls will be influenced by different factors as they move toward puberty and providing that dance continues to be a positive experience for them, they will generally continue to enjoy the benefits that dance has to offer. As dance becomes more established in primary schools as an accepted and valued activity for all students, a way forward may emerge. Research would suggest that more research is conducted in the area of gender role development, and specifically in the area of dance curriculum research in relation to students' attitudes toward dance.

### **2.11. The elements of dance.**

The elements of dance are commonly known in New Zealand as body awareness, space, time, energy and relationships. The labelling of the elements draws directly upon Laban's theories of dance analysis and in more recent times, Adshear's model for dance and analysis.

The New Zealand dance curriculum makes an assumption that the elements of dance are fundamental without any clarification or definition. The elements of dance, as outlined in the New Zealand Curriculum (2007) are referred to under the following dance statement:

They explore and use *dance elements*, vocabularies, processes and technologies to express personal, group, and cultural identities, to convey and interpret artistic ideas, and to strengthen social interaction (p.20).

The elements of dance in the New Zealand Curriculum (2007) are not listed. Teachers are required to access this information from the Ministry of Education's website under Achievement Objectives by Learning Area. Use of websites for detailed information would appear to be a trend in the development of concise curriculum documents in many countries, especially where dance is included in an Arts Curriculum as one of a range of arts subjects.

As New Zealand teachers appear to be accustomed to accessing the Ministry of Education's website for information and detail regarding subject matter, it would seem that they could discover the elements of dance in the more detailed achievement objectives. The New Zealand Curriculum (2007) provides a set of achievement objectives for dance. Dance in Level One and Level Two states, "Explore movement with a developing awareness of the dance elements of body, space, time, energy and relationships" (p.2). Throughout the other levels of the dance curriculum (Three to

Eight), the dance elements are referred to without detail. An example of this comes under Level Four, Developing Ideas, “Combine and contrast the dance elements to express images, ideas and feelings using a variety of choreographic processes” (p.3). What dance elements and what choreographic processes? Primary teachers often specialise in teaching a particular year level and therefore detail on dance elements could be unavailable to some teachers. Where it is that teachers are able to discover body, space, time, energy and relationships as elements of dance, specific detail and instructions on how to develop these elements, is not apparent in the document.

Time is an element that might seem self-explanatory to many teachers, and yet to teach it as an element of dance may be complicated for teachers lacking in confidence or dance teaching experience. Tempo is an element of time and is the speed at which a movement is performed. Tempo can be fast, slow, increasing or decreasing. However, to consciously manipulate time, requires more thought and planning than simply choosing the music. When students dance to music, the beat is usually regular, setting a constant tempo which is followed by the dancers. There is nothing complicated about using other methods to speed up or slow down the movement, but when the process is unknown to a teacher, it can seem daunting. To understand accent, rhythm and beat is one thing, but to teach a dance lesson that consciously addresses these elements, is another.

Each of the elements of dance can be broken down into many component parts. There may be some confusion for teachers regarding their understandings of the elements of dance due to a lack of specificity in the New Zealand Dance Curriculum. Where teachers are familiar with a studio dance situation, their knowledge of dance elements may be understood as the specific movements related to a genre of dance. The focus and interpretation of elements in this context may differ from elements in school dance education. If teachers’ understandings of dance elements are unsupported in a dance curriculum, how do teachers understand genres?

## **2.12. Genres.**

There is a common misconception that all dance is ‘ballet’ which may flow on into schools and hinder the teaching of dance in the primary classroom. Buck’s 2003 thesis is titled, *Teachers and Dance in the Classroom: “So, do I need my tutu?”*, and refers to a joking comment made by one of the participants in his research. Such a quip illustrates, as Buck did in his study, the dominant power that specific genres, especially ballet, have over people’s readings and meanings of dance, and most problematically, dance education.

The inclusion of cultural dance within the New Zealand Curriculum provides the opportunity for teachers to work with students to develop a pride and understanding of their cultural heritage.

Cultural dance has been an inclusion in previous syllabuses where dance was under the umbrella of Physical Education. This does appear to be an established and understood genre of dance. The New Zealand Curriculum (2007) references genres within a broad statement:

Students develop literacy in dance as they learn about, and develop skills in, performing, choreographing and responding to a variety of genres from a range of historical and contemporary contexts (p.20).

This opens possibilities to study dance from any culture or era, or in any genre with which the teacher is familiar. Where a school community can draw on the expertise of parents, family or friends, an opportunity is provided to work collaboratively and forge partnerships with the wider school community. Although a study of genres and particularly cultural dance is encouraged, the focus in the primary dance curriculum is on natural and creative movement.

### **2.13. Creative dance in New Zealand Schools**

When discussing dance education Stinson (1990) stated, "It is an art form based on natural movement rather than movement of a particular style such as one might see in tap dance or ballet" (p.2). Some teachers may struggle to understand that natural movement provides a possibility for every generalist primary teacher to teach dance. MacDonald (1991) discusses the fact that elementary teachers in Canada do not teach creative movement because of a perceived belief that they lack support from administrators and policymakers, however, and possibly more importantly, they also believe that a lack of training and confidence in their own abilities inhibits the implementation of creative dance. It is not necessary to be a dancer to facilitate a creative movement class, and yet research conducted by Hennessy, Rolfe and Chedzoy (2001) revealed that pre-service teachers lacked confidence and support to implement dance in their teaching despite being offered a clear understanding of the nature of creative movement.

It may be that the terms, natural movement, movement, or creative movement are less threatening to teachers than the word 'dance'. Creative movement is sometimes the label attached to dance in primary schools, but more particularly in early childhood. Accepted texts exist for Early Childhood educators, such as *Creative Movement for the Developing Child*, (Cherry, 1971). As dance educators have historically struggled to find a place within the hierarchy of arts education, the term 'creative dance' has not been generally adopted in the primary school. Kerr-Berry (2007) struggles with the term; "I even start to question the term dance education. Is it a different kind of dance? Why is there dance at the end of one spectrum and dance education, creative dance and educational dance at the other?"(p.5). Whatever term is used to describe dance in primary schools, and wherever it



rates in the hierarchy of dance, there is a necessity for dance education to be creative in the development of children. Kaufmann & Ellis (2007) stated that,

Creative movement is defined as movements generated from the child's own inner expressions ...creativity is the key to maintaining the art form of dance...As soon as the teacher insists on uniformity instead of individuality, the art form of creative movement is lost"(pp. 8-12).

Kaufmann & Ellis (2007) elaborate, "Creative movement uses the same movement that children use naturally and children are naturally creative in their play" (p.9). While creativity is an important aspect of primary school dance education, the term dance education indicates that creative movement is taken a step further, in that teachers assist the students in giving their movement form. They guide and facilitate students so that they have an awareness of the movement. An awareness of movement is at the heart of dance education.

Active learning is important if students are to receive and retain information and concepts and this is where creative dance performs an important role. Minton (2003) discussed the fact that studies show that, where students are involved in experiential learning, they are more likely to remember the information. Active learning is about engaging the students in the learning, rather than have them passively accepting ideas from the teacher. He stated, "One way to actively learn is by moving and dancing" (p.1). Children want to move and yet we continue to train them to sit still behind desks so that learning can take place. Dewey (1920) stated; "Learning is active. It involves reaching out of the mind; it involves organic assimilation starting from within" (p.13). Minton (2003) reiterates, "When students perform movements related to concepts and ideas, learning becomes more personal and concrete" (p.ix). Minton went on to suggest that active learning fits the tendency of children to want to move and play. Koff (2000) concurred; "Dance and motion can help resolve the problem of satisfying a child's innate desire for action during at least one period of the day" (p.1).

Natural movement captured in dance allows creative expression and problem solving. Zakkai (1997) stated, "Students enjoy solving very specific, challenging movement problems that require the utmost concentration and inspire a high level of personal expression"(p.8). Zakkai (1997) also discussed the myth about movement and dance being an unstructured experience, encouraging teachers to channel the natural energy of a child by using natural movements to explore concepts, solve creative problems and communicate ideas across the curriculum (p.8). H'Doubler (1998) believed that dance was a "means of giving free opportunity to every child for experiencing the contributions it can make to his developing personality and his growing artistic nature"(p.59), and also discussed how the body should be considered as the outer aspect of personality and how all aspects of nature are combined in expression, stating,

The place of dance in developing such individual growth is understood if personality is defined as the expressive total of all our physical, emotional, intellectual and spiritual energies...of all the arts, dance is particularly suited to such a fulfilment of the personality (p.64).

H'Doubler (1998) discussed the importance of the power of expression, rather than a concern with training professional dancers. Such arguments supporting the benefits of creative expression reflect Piaget's educational theories that particularly relate to education and creative movement. His discovery techniques involve a structural concept called the schema which is a manner of ordering experiences in response to the environment. Piaget's theories are aligned with dance education, in that students are able to discover possibilities through creative movement and as Piaget, cited by Sullivan (1967), proposed, "The goal in education is not to increase the amount of knowledge but to create the possibilities for the child to invent and discover" (p. 18). Creative movement offers such possibilities. Pulaski (1971) elaborated "This is why Piaget insists that children must be allowed to do their own learning. Thoughts, or "mental operations", to use his term, arise out of motor actions and sensory experiences which are "interiorized" (p.10).

As students become older, more emphasis is made on transforming the creative movement into a conscious aesthetic experience through a manipulation of the elements of dance to create meaning, while still allowing the focus to remain on the students making their own choices to create dance. Dance Education offers students a physical expression and also an opportunity to express their emotional, intellectual and spiritual energies. Through interviews with primary teachers, this research endeavours to discover teachers' understandings of dance in the primary classroom and this may reveal whether these teachers have an appreciation of somatic education.

### **2.13.1. Attitude to thinking body: Somatics**

While the term 'somatic' is not used in the New Zealand curriculum, even in the glossary, it would seem that much of the creative movement performed in the primary classroom, is based on somatic practice. Somatic practice is moving with an awareness of one's body, of moving from the inside, out. The focus on natural movement in a primary dance class, combined with a developing awareness of movement, would seem to be the very place to start with a basic somatic practice particularly in light of the importance of reflective discussion about embodied knowledge in relation to gender.

Stinson (2002) discussed the fact that she could find ways of having students go beyond just doing the movement, "This has involved "teaching to the inside", helping students become aware of what movement and stillness feels like on the inside" (p.158). Eisner (2002) discussed the importance of

“somatic knowledge or embodied knowledge being experienced through different parts of our body” (p.19) and how arts refine our senses to provide opportunities to experience the world in different ways. Art is a manner of knowing and dance is a form of expressing knowledge with an intelligence not always recognised by educators. Jensen (1998) outlined the fact that “the cerebellum takes up only one tenth of the brain by volume but contains over half of all its neurons” (p.83). While in the past it was believed that the cerebellum was concerned only with the motor cortex, recent discoveries have linked the cerebellum with cognitive function and the fact that this part of the brain regulates incoming sensory data. Somatic practitioners understand that the body has its own way of knowing. Such knowledge is known as proprioception,

the unconscious perception of movement and spatial orientation arising from stimuli within the body itself. In humans these stimuli are detected by nerves within the body itself (Jensen, 1998, p. 84).

Jensen (1998) discusses the work of Peter Strick whose research in neuroscience discovered a pathway from the cerebellum back to parts of the brain involved in memory, attention, and spatial perception. “Amazingly, the part of the brain that processes movement is the same part of the brain that is processing learning” (p.84). Somatic movement is an area of study in some New Zealand University dance courses and appears to be increasingly a part of pre-service teachers’ programmes. Teachers could be assisted in their understandings of teaching discipline based dance education in New Zealand Schools through education to develop an awareness of somatic movement.

## **2.14. Discipline Based Arts Education**

Discipline based Dance Education has a specific purpose, sometimes misunderstood by teachers or communities. Discipline is related to the subject or field under study and Foley, Hong and Thwaites (1999) described the discipline based arts education approach to arts education in New Zealand schools as one in which “children develop the ability to grasp the various cultural and historical contexts of art and examine the powerful ideas communicated through art” (p.6). According to Alexander and Day (1991), “the original DBAE model was sponsored by the Getty Foundation in America and based upon visual arts education practice” (p.7). Discipline based dance education was deemed necessary in schools in the mid-sixties if the arts were to be taken seriously as an academic subject. However, Buck (2003a) argued that,

to legitimise the arts, and dance in academic terms, it has unintentionally distanced the teacher from implementing the dance curriculum. There is a gap between the experts’ vision, rationale, terminology and standards for dance, and the teachers’ practice and experience of dance, a gap that maybe quite vast in teachers’ minds and bodies (p.26).

New Zealand primary schools are engaged in the type of discipline based dance education where, as Eisner (2002) states, “Students will grasp the relationship between the social context in which the arts are created, and their content and form” (p.27). A discipline based arts education provides an ideal where students may develop sophisticated forms of thinking and the ability to create and perceive art. Eisner (2002), advanced this idea. “One of the potentially large lessons of work in the arts is the contribution good arts teaching makes to the child’s ability to perceive subtleties and to recognise complexities among the qualitative relationships encountered in the phenomenal world” (p.21).

An advanced discipline based education program may consider the development of technical skills in dance a necessary aim, and while this is not a main goal of primary dance education, developing practical knowledge in dance is one of four strands of the dance curriculum. The technical aspect of discipline based education is not a focus in primary schools however. Instead, during the primary years of a child’s education, students enjoy building on their own experiences to create and develop meaning. As Green Gilbert (2006) stated, “students who construct and re-create their own learning experiences are more engaged” (p.13). The idea of developing physical skills is however one aspect of discipline based dance education. ‘Developing Practical Knowledge in Dance’ and ‘Communicating and Interpreting in Dance’ require students to perform. Students are provided with opportunities to perform the cultural, social and artistic dances that they may be taught by their teacher along with their own choreographies. The focus is not on becoming skilled performers, but rather on the process of learning or creating a dance and the experience of performing it. The breadth of the curriculum may present a dichotomy for teachers. Is the focus on creative movement, or on teaching dances? Does the idea of teaching dance worry primary teachers, or is it a lack of understanding of the creative possibilities that teachers struggle with?

The achievement objectives in the New Zealand Curriculum outlines expected progress through each of the achievement levels. Within each strand the achievement objectives have been left open to a teacher’s interpretation, allowing for all students to achieve within a band. The curriculum does not provide levels within the criteria to differentiate between a High Achievement and a Low Achievement. The following example clarifies that all students may achieve the objective in ‘Communicating and Interpreting Dance – Level 1’. “Students will share movement through informal presentation and respond personally to their own and others’ dance” (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007). Discipline based dance education provides a structure allowing students to examine dance within social and cultural contexts as Eisner (1998c) stated,

For discipline-based art education, this means that we do not wait for children to learn simply by providing art materials that they can manipulate, but that we provide supportive and encouraging instructions that guide learning (p.15).

Dewey (1920) wrote of the educational situation in his era and discussed the fact that subject matter must not be something fixed and outside of a child's experience and proposed that a child's experience is embryonic and vital, a continuous reconstruction. Dewey wrote of teachers needing to guide children with some connection to their own experiences so that achievements are fluid and moving. Dance education would seem to meet the Dewey' ideal, for the making of dance in primary classrooms can be about the child drawing on his/her own experience to create meaning and interpret symbols. "Through art, the child can discover the visual richness of the qualitative world we inhabit. In the process of seeing, freshly, consciousness itself is born" (Eisner, 1998c, p. 7). New Zealand teachers however, generally don't have dance experience with which to connect in order to guide their students.

Eisner (2002) stated that "Jung and Freud both thought that the artistic impulse resided in the unconscious and that it was up to the teachers to nurture a child's creative nature" (p.33). Once again it is up to teachers who have little experience of nurturing creativity in dance. This statement can be viewed in the light of Dewey's (1920) assertion that,

the cause of the difficulty lies in the isolation and restriction of the work of the teacher which practically forbids his considering the significance of art, music and nature study in the light of continuity and completeness of growth" (p.27).

While Dewey's observations must be viewed from a historical perspective, the basic premise relating to the attitude of the individual teacher remains relevant eight decades later. The teacher is not forbidden to teach the arts, in fact quite the contrary, but the residue of this attitude remains, along with a fear of the unknown and a lack of experience.

So much of student development is up to the teacher and the teacher-student interaction. It is therefore important to discover teacher understandings of dance and whether teacher support is necessary for the teaching of dance. If teachers understand the benefits of dance education and are provided with the tools necessary to assist in their teaching, then students will benefit.

If the teacher has no standard of value in relation to them, no intimate personal response of feeling to them, no conception of the method of art which alone brings the child to a corresponding intellectual and emotional attitude, these studies will remain precisely what they are – passing recreations, modes of showing off, or exercises in technique (Dewey, 1920, p. 35).

### **2.14.1. Dance as personal development**

The discipline of dance education is expressed through a curriculum where self-confidence, self-expression and communication skills are often valued. Newitt and Wauchop (2005) assert, "Dance helps with creative thinking, originality, elaboration and flexibility; improves expressive skills, social tolerance, self-confidence and persistence"(p.14). It would seem a natural conclusion that when self-confidence, self-expression and communication are developed, that students would become better all-round scholars. The concentration and awareness that children develop through engaging in dance education is believed to have a flow-on effect to other subjects where children are able to apply the ability to concentrate. Sensory motor activities assist in the development of cognitive function. An Australian study conducted by Newitt and Wauchop (2005) affirmed this belief, "research suggests that learning in one domain supports and stimulates learning in others, which in turn supports learning in a complex web of influence described as a 'constellation'" (p.13). Jenson (2001) stated that schools such as the Waldorf schools of North America that focus on teaching all subjects through the arts, outperform national averages in scholastic tests,

Graduates commonly get into the best Universities. They often pass achievement tests at double or triple the rate for public school students. College Professors remark about the humility, sense of wonder, concentration and intellectual resourcefulness of Waldorf graduates (p. 11).

An Australian study, 'Learning in and through the Arts' conducted by Nevitt and Wauchop (2005) presented an argument suggesting that the teachers actively involved in their research identified a change in their teaching. They cite a teacher-participant who stated,

My belief in myself as an O-K teacher has been reinforced. I have always felt that a truly great teacher is a facilitator. I like to get students to the stage of being independent learners and I feel that has happened this year...This year has been one of the best years of my life. At the start of the year I wasn't thrilled, but now as I write this, I feel great (p.14).

Green-Gilbert (2006) reinforced the importance of independent learning, "Allow students to take charge of their own learning through choices, peer coaching and problem solving. This will increase motivation, responsibility, and emotional engagement"(p.13). As McKenna (2010) asserted, "We've long known the physical, psychological and learning benefits that come from the multi-layered activity required in performing arts programs (p.42). Eisner (2002) articulates that the study of dance requires, "complex cognitive modes of thought. Examined analytically, work in the arts provides an agenda rich in such opportunities"(p.35).

## **2.15. Influential Theorists**

To place discipline based dance education within a context in New Zealand primary schools, it is necessary to examine the work of the theorists who have influenced the development of dance education. Laban's contribution to dance has been influential in developing a language of dance, while Gardner's theories of multiple intelligences have assisted in recognising the importance of dance in the development of children. A discussion of Adshead/Lansdale's contribution to dance education has been included as her work has been influential in curriculum development in New Zealand schools.

### **2.15.1. Laban**

Rudolf Laban (1879-1958) was a movement theorist whose influence on dance education in western countries throughout the world is acknowledged (Bradley, 2002; J. Brooks & Brooks, 1993; Foster, 1977; Maletic, 1987). Laban's work explored many aspects of movement and applied his theories to the body, the voice, education, lovemaking and sex, and dance (Hodgson & Preston-Dunlop, 2001). This discussion examines Laban's key theories that have influenced global dance education and how these theories have impacted on the New Zealand curriculum. Simon (2003) stated that,

At the heart of his philosophy was his understanding of movement as the primary aspect of life. He assumed that there is natural movement in all humans which needed to be brought to the surface (p.12).

Laban's philosophy relating to human nature is reflected in the vision statement of The New Zealand Curriculum, (2007) "Our vision is for young people who will be creative, energetic and enterprising" (p. 8). Foster (1977) acknowledges that, "Rudolf Laban has influenced the introduction and development of modern educational dance as well as general education" (p.1).

Laban studied the work of psychoanalysts Carl Jung and Karl Abraham who had discerned that the four functions of the psyche were intuition, sensing, thinking and feeling (Preston-Dunlop, 2008). Laban's theories were deeply influenced by this philosophy. Preston-Dunlop (2008) discusses Laban's proposal that "there existed a direct relationship between psychic function and the four motion factors that he was by now certain were the crucial framework of movement: time, weight, space and flow" (p.51). Preston-Dunlop (Potter, 1998) discussed another Laban belief that the best training for children would be to base the movements on the instinctive natural movements that a baby might use,

At first the child does not imitate, but reacts to stimuli, so the teacher should not ask children to copy at the beginning, but guide them through suggestion. They should be encouraged to use their own ideas and efforts, without being corrected to comply with adult standards of movement, which are conditioned by convention, and therefore un-natural (p.21).

Hodgson and Preston-Dunlop (2001) summarised Laban's principles in regard to education, "The educator, he maintains, is a kind of gardener nurturing and finding the best conditions for growth and development of each individual and what is good for one is not necessarily good for another" (p.48). Laban's theories are prolific and detailed. Above all he believed that it was through movement that we made sense of the world. Hodgson (2001) summarised Laban's theory,

Since the living body is movement, knowing how it works and why it is a basic means of understanding: through the body we experience size, time and texture. By analysing the purposes, processes and levels conveyed through movement, we have a greater comprehension of both what is within and around us. Through movement, we can come to terms with ourselves, as well as gaining insight into the nature of our being, our condition, relationships with others and our place in the universe (p.178).

Laban's theories have been adopted in dance education curriculums throughout countries in the western world including Australia, U.K. and New Zealand (Australian Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority, 2010; Ministry of Education, 2007; The Department for Education, 2011). Brooks (1993) stated,

Creating a systematic way of looking at the body as it moves through space gave to the field of dance/movement a tremendous resource, one that the art of music for example, developed centuries ago (p.40).

With such understanding, dance education is well placed to influence children in New Zealand schools. Dance in the New Zealand Curriculum (2007) refers to time, body awareness, space, and energy. Laban's labels of weight and flow have been subsumed under the more generic term, energy.

Brooks (1993), an American dance academic, discussed the fact that through an adoption of Laban's movement theories, a common vocabulary may emerge in dance education. She stated,

I suspect that the system that evolved from his theories might offer a means of going beyond the scattered state of theory and vocabulary in dance and dance education, that it might indeed provide the unified field theory of movement for which I had long felt a need (p.30).

Laban's theories have had considerable influence in the development of dance education both globally and in New Zealand. A more recent arts theorist is Howard Gardner whose influence on the development of dance in the New Zealand curriculum also requires acknowledgement.



### 2.15.2. Gardner

Gardner is an American developmental psychologist whose postdoctoral work in neurology and neuropsychology proposed the existence of seven different intelligences in his book 'Frames of Mind'. Gardner (1983) stated,

I was amazed at the virtual absence of consideration of artistic development and artistic cognition. And so I determined to give as much attention to artistic considerations as most psychologists direct toward the scientific terrain (p.2).

The two intelligences that have historically been valued by schools are the linguistic and logical-mathematical intelligences. Warburton (2003b) elaborated,

Generally speaking, western epistemology has viewed the mind as the locus of universal, rational, non-corporeal forms of knowing, where linguistic facility and logical mathematical reason are considered the ultimate expression of intelligence (p.8).

Gardner (1991) proposed that all students have varying degrees of linguistic and logical-mathematical intelligence, but where the other five intelligences are not catered for, school becomes a boring and difficult place to be, especially for those students whose strengths lie in other areas. He states, "It is difficult, first, because much of the material presented in school strikes many students as alien, if not pointless" (p.148). His proposed intelligences are; linguistic, logical-mathematic, musical, spatial, bodily-kinesthetic, interpersonal and intrapersonal. Since the publication of 'Frames of Mind', Gardner has suggested the existence of other intelligences, the naturalist intelligence and the possibility of the existence of an existential intelligence and a spiritual intelligence (Gardner, 2004, p. 40). "If dance is the embodiment of 'intelligence possible' then dance educators must take seriously the call to cultivate thinking in dance"(E. C. Warburton, 2003a, p. 13).

Gardner's theory of multiple intelligences provided evidence for arts educators to lobby for a place within schools' curriculums. Strong rationales for dance education already existed but Gardner was able to add strong support. Most importantly he came from a cognitive science and pedagogical perspective. This view resonated with teachers, especially arts educators. Educational curriculum writers adopted the theory of the existence of multiple intelligences and as Green-Gilbert (2006) proposed, "Perhaps no publication has so affected the world of arts education as that of Howard Gardner's 'Frames of Mind' written in 1983" (p.267). While some argue that the content of Gardner's theories must not be accepted at face value (S. Koff, 2003; R. Root-Bernstein, 2001; Sevilla, 2003), I propose that by awakening educators to the possibilities of the existence of multiple intelligences Gardner has assisted in the promotion of arts education.

Gardner's intention however, was not that his publications be used as 'bibles' or texts for Arts Educators (Sevilla, 2003). Koff (2003) suggested that "educators refer to multiple intelligences without a comprehensive understanding and use it as a buzz word perhaps" (p.3). If arts educators are going to hold up Gardner's theories as justification for the place of dance within the school curriculum, then it is therefore important to understand just what bodily-kinesthetic, musical, spatial, interpersonal, and intrapersonal intelligences mean in a full and comprehensive sense. It would seem that some advocates of the arts have jumped on a bandwagon for the inclusion of the arts in a program based on Gardner's multiple intelligence theories without a complete understanding of the fullness of meaning. Warburton (2003a) argued that, "at its best M.I. theory redefines what it means to express intelligence, to be "smart". At its worst however, M.I. theory is employed as a kind of fashion statement in schools"(p.8). Blumenthal-Jones (2004) discussed Gardner's Bodily-Kinesthetic intelligence and identifies Gardner's focus on great dance artists as limiting for dance education as it is difficult to teach to genius levels. He acknowledged that it is the way in which Gardner wrote that creates the problem, and that Gardner may not have sought to exclude multiple voices which occur when the examples of dance artists provided are world famous performers. Blumenthal-Jones' discussion makes the point that Gardner's Multiple Intelligences need to be reconsidered, something that can only benefit dance education and education generally.

In Sevilla's (2003) article, 'One School's application of the theory of multiple intelligences', Sevilla discussed the fact that Gardner's writing was never intended to be a guideline to curriculum development or an educational prescription, but rather that he "articulated sweeping propositions, such as a curriculum based on the pursuit of understanding of truth beauty and morality" (p.35). Sevilla proposed that Gardner's idea was to find multiple entry points to rich topics. Koff (2003) agreed that Gardner's Multiple Intelligence theory allows multiple points of entry into dance. However she also stated that from her experience as an American dance educator, the curriculum "does not allow a full explanation of the Multiple Intelligence theory" (p.5). According to Root-Bernstein, (2003) "Gardner defines bodily-kinaesthetic intelligence as the ability to use one's own body in highly differentiated and skilled ways, for expressive as well as goal directed purposes" (p.23). Gardner would appear to be separating the intellectual competencies with physical skills, yet I would argue that from a somatic perspective, the physicality of the body's own intelligence has a communicative capacity and a therefore a cognitive function, a view supported by Hanna (1991) who stated,

The proprioceptive centres communicate and continually feedback a rich display of somatic information which is immediately self-observed as a process that is both unified and on-going (p.31).

Since Gardner's revolutionary theories first emerged, academics such as (R. Root-Bernstein, 2001), have discussed and debated aspects of his ideas, leading to variations, but always coming back to the basic premise; the existence of multiple intelligences, although not always under the same labels. In 'Music, Creativity and Scientific Thinking', Root-Bernstein (2001) discussed that music and science employ a common set of tools for thinking. His article listed twenty-six of the world's greatest musicians, revealing that each of them had a career in a scientific discipline such as medicine, as an example. He argued that Gardner's theories support domain specific functions, rather than creative thinking, being trans-disciplinary and transferable from one field to another. Root-Bernstein goes on to provide examples that support his theory that the phenomenon of synosia (to know and feel simultaneously) is at work "when a person experiences a sensation in one of the five senses when another of the senses is stimulated" (p. 65). Root-Bernstein, (2003) while arguing for Gardner's theory, proposed that "dancers are universal thinkers and will express themselves in many ways" (p.23). In 'Sparks of Genius: The 13 Thinking Tools of the World's Most Creative People' (R. Root-Bernstein, 2001), used the analogy of baking to discredit Gardner's theory of individual intelligences being attributed to students,

No single ingredient determines the outcome of a recipe, either in cooking or thinking. Characterising individuals by a single element in their mental processes is as misleading as describing Einstein as – primarily a logio-mathematical thinker (p.6).

Some schools have taken on Gardner's theories as a basis for teaching which may not have been Gardner's intention. However, Adkins and Gunzenhauser (1999) wrote of a school in America where an A+ program operates incorporating Gardner's theories. The arts are integrated in thematic units across all subject areas, shared across grades and sometimes even school-wide. The A+ stands for arts enhanced learning and in this instance has turned the school around,

beyond the constraints of geographic isolation and limited financial resources to explore a future with the assistance of outside funding sources that still allow the community to retain control of its own destiny (p.65).

Regardless of how Gardner saw his theories being used, the effect of incorporating the arts into everyday classroom teaching in this school has had a positive effect that many arts educators understand.

In 'Intelligence Reframed', Gardner (1999) has answered many of his critics and addressed many misconceptions that have developed since 'Frames of Mind' was written. He stated, "Indeed, in education, the challenge of the next millennium consists precisely of this: Now that we know about the enormous differences in how people acquire and represent knowledge, we can make these differences central to teaching and learning" (p.92). Despite the arguments surrounding the

application of the multiple intelligence theory, one thing is certain from Warburton's (2003a) perspective, the Multiple Intelligence theory, "is a method for designing learning activities to serve a larger percentage of children"(p.12). Warburton discussed the implications for dance and acknowledged that Gardner's theory validates dance as a domain of knowledge and "posits the absolute potential or possibility of actualising one's multiple intelligences through dance" (p.13). Whether or not Gardner's theories are acceptable in every respect, Gardner has certainly brought the idea of different methods of learning and knowing to the forefront of educational theory and this has arguably benefitted dance education, a view supported by Green-Gilbert (2003) who questioned,

We are still fighting the battle to make dance a part of every child's education. Why is this when we have so much research pointing to the essentialness of movement to basic learning? (p.2).

The introduction of Gardner's Multiple Intelligences has opened the door for new ways of developing and recognising cognitive function and it would seem important for dance that discussions in this area continue.

### **2.15.3. Adshead-Lansdale**

Another dance theorist who has had an effect on the development of dance in the U.K., Australia and New Zealand is Janet Adshead-Lansdale. Her work relates to disciplinary inquiry into dance and it is through academic investigation that ideas regarding dance and curriculum are formed. It is important to acknowledge Adshead-Lansdale's contribution to dance education.

Lansdale's writings have informed many dance educators since the eighties (Giersdorf, 2009; Queensland Studies Authority, 2004). Her publication 'Dance Analysis: Theory and Practice' was essential reading for students studying dance at the Queensland University of Technology in Brisbane in 1995 where I undertook my Masters studies. Lansdale was an academic at the University of Surrey and has influenced several of the leading dance educators in New Zealand and Australia who completed Masters qualifications at the University of Surrey, amongst them Ralph Buck and Sue Cheesman, who have both gone on to have a considerable influence on the development of New Zealand dance education. Lansdale's theories of dance analysis have developed since her first publication in the eighties but her influence on how dances are analysed by students, remains. Giersdorf (2009) stated,

It is the 1988 *Dance Analysis: Theory and Practice*, co-authored and edited by Lansdale, that determined the theoretical focus of dance studies at the University of Surrey and the United Kingdom (p. 33).

Buck acknowledges Adshead’s construction of a conceptual framework, around which much dance education is based. Buck (2003a) stated,

Adshead developed a conceptual framework around the notions of choreography, (making dance), performance (showing dance) and appreciation (reading and analysing dance). These concepts became the centrepiece for her framework that provided the focus for studying all dances within historical, cultural and geographical contexts (p. 22).

Most schools who offer dance in Australia and New Zealand continue to use the organisers of Choreography, Performance and Appreciation as the framework for the study of dance. The labels change over time, but the concepts remain the same. The primary dance curriculum in New Zealand (2000) identified a fourth dance strand, ‘Understanding Dance in Context’. This extra strand allows reflection in each area, as in some Australian curriculums. The following chart sets out the headings under which dance is studied in the different states of Australia and in New Zealand outlining how the three organisers of Choreography, Performance and Appreciation influence each curriculum.

<b>Location</b>	<b>Choreography</b>	<b>Performance</b>	<b>Appreciation</b>
New Zealand	Developing ideas in dance Understanding dance in context	Developing Practical knowledge in dance Understanding dance in context	Communicating and Interpreting in dance Understanding dance in context
Queensland Australia	Creating  Knowledge and Understanding  Reflecting	Presenting  Knowledge and Understanding  Reflecting	Responding  Knowledge and Understanding  Reflecting
Northern Territory Australia	Creating Arts Ideas  Arts in Context	Arts Skills and Processes Arts in Context	Arts Responses and Ideas Arts in Context
Victoria Australia	Creating and making	Creating and making Exploring and responding	Exploring and Responding
New South Wales Australia	Respond to stimuli Explore	Perform	Watch Recognise and discuss

It is clear that, despite the different terms used, that New Zealand and the states and territories of Australia continue to follow the same patterns of choreography, performing and appreciation.

The work of Laban influenced early English syllabus development and also influenced Adshead-Lansdale whose writing on “spatial and dynamic qualities were derivatives of Laban’s initial analysis” (Buck, 2003a, p. 22). It is not surprising therefore, that Janet Adshead-Lansdale’s work has been influential in curriculum development in both New Zealand and Australia.

## **2.16. The Reality of what teachers teach: How and why?**

Although research has identified a lack of confidence as being the main reason why little or no dance is being taught in the primary classroom, this chapter section seeks to examine why teachers are identifying a lack of confidence as the reason they don’t teach dance. This will assist in addressing the research discussion point, ‘Someone like us: Meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms’ A lack of confidence to teach dance has been identified as inhibiting the teaching of dance (Ashley, 2010; Buck, 2003a; Hong-Joe, 2002; C. MacDonald, 1991; Stinson, 1988). Rather than simply examining the current research relating to confidence in teaching dance, this research also seeks to examine any underlying issues, as not every teacher lacks confidence or enthusiasm to teach dance, and yet where there is a will, it seems that there is not always a way.

There is a generally held assumption that teachers are not dancers and therefore the idea of teaching something so foreign to their own experience fills them with fear. I believe that there are teachers who feel this way and there are also educators who understand that they don’t need to be dancers in order to teach dance. Teachers exist who have the skills and knowledge with which to teach dance and yet it seems that many of these teachers don’t include dance in their programs. In my experience, when support is provided and teachers become inspired, they recognise the benefits of dance and how much the children would enjoy participating. They understand the importance of dance in the development of children’s intelligence. Following a professional development workshop, teachers can be inspired to teach a dance lesson but then fall back to old ways of teaching and forget about dance. I have witnessed such behaviour and these experiences remain in my mind, prompting an investigation of primary school teacher biographies.

Rolfe (2001) discusses factors which influence primary pre-service teachers in the teaching of dance. Her findings support my proposal that experience and knowledge alone will not necessarily result in dance being taught in the primary classroom. In a study of twelve second-year primary student teachers, half had had considerable dance experience before they entered pre-service teacher

education and all pre-service teachers had experienced ten hours of teacher training in dance. (pp. 157-175). Rolfe (2001) stated,

Although the course was variously described by students as interesting, useful and enjoyable, this did not automatically translate into confidence to teach dance in schools. For some, the abstract nature of the subject proved difficult to understand” (p.162).

Only six of the students actually taught dance during their placement and three of those taught “traditional dance or a set step dance where the steps and figures were prescribed” (p. 162). Rolfe (2001) elaborates,

Occasionally it would seem that students opted out of teaching dance when given the choice, the reasons for this varied but when questioned more deeply a lack of confidence generally emerged as a key factor (p.162).

This example poses questions regarding the reasons for a lack of confidence if six of the twelve subjects were dancers before they entered teacher training and all twelve had experienced an enjoyable ten hour module on how to teach dance? Rolfe’s study highlights the incongruity evident where student-teachers experienced in dance avoided teaching it and cited a lack of confidence as the reason.

It seemed important to look beyond a lack of confidence and ask why do teachers teach the way they do, what do they teach and why? It would appear that prior beliefs about teaching inform the behaviours of all teachers, whether entering the profession for the first time or with many years’ experience in the field. Carter (1990) made an important point, “investigators in this area argue further that conventional research on teaching is based on technical rationality and ignores the practical knowledge and intentions of teachers” (p.300). Objective, scientific research into the nature of teaching appears to result in generalisations that have little to do with the reality of the classroom.

Research supports the view that teachers’ beliefs of pre-service play a pivotal role in the acquisition and interpretation of knowledge and subsequent teacher behaviour and how unexplored entry beliefs may be responsible for the perpetuation of antiquated and ineffectual teaching practices (Polkinghorne, 2005, p. 6).

Cole and Knowles’ (1993) investigation in this area supported Polkinghorne’s theory,

Now it is widely accepted that formal teacher education has an important, but secondary influence on teachers’ thinking and practice; the latter being indelibly imprinted by life, school and career experiences prior to entry into formal programs of teacher preparation (p. 459).

Green (1999) stated, “We tend to follow the teaching styles of our own former teachers. In dance, as well as in other areas, we may have learned to habitually repeat the power relationships of those

who have come before us”(p. 92). While the focus of Green’s writing is related to teaching dance in a tertiary dance institution, the concept of teaching in the manner in which you were taught is relevant to all teaching. When classroom demands place pressure on teachers, it appears that they fall back to methods of teaching that they know, on a subconscious level, will work for them. The knowledge that teachers gain about how to teach has, in the main been gathered from their own classroom experiences as students (Kagan, 1992).

Noddings (2004) wrote, “A teacher sets an example with her whole self, her intellect, her responsiveness, her curiosity...her care (p.162). It is not the scientific and measurable skills that teachers use to teach. Carr (2004) stated “strategies of literacy, promotion, or learning support, depend more on glorified common sense judgment than on technical practice” (p.113). It is the teacher herself or himself who inspires learning, not the strategies employed to teach.

Teachers’ patterns of behaviour are, according to Thompson (1984), “a function of their views, beliefs and preferences about the subject matter and its teaching”(p. 106). Teachers operate within their own classrooms as individuals, finding their own way based on how their own personal experience in life has shaped their beliefs. Teachers are often unaware of their own beliefs; they find explanations difficult and generally would prefer not to discuss their beliefs (Cooney, 1985; Kagan, 1992; Thompson, 1984). Kagan (1992) proposed that teacher belief is influenced more by supervising teachers than University courses or teacher training, but once established in a school, “teachers continue to solve instructional problems largely relying on their own beliefs and experiences” (p.75). Kagan (1992) went on to suggest,

When teachers do accept information from outside sources (e.g. colleagues or university or in-service courses), they filter it through their own belief systems, translating and absorbing it into their unique pedagogies (p. 75).

Harris and Sass (2006) reiterated, and possibly controversially added,

At the Elementary and Middle School levels, it appears that teachers learn from experience, and there is no evidence that any formal training, either pre-service or in-service, contributes to teacher effectiveness (p. 27).

Teachers are connoisseurs in their own classrooms, and very often, that is where the connoisseurship ends. They find a method that works for them and apply that method without examining the strengths or otherwise of their teaching practice. Zahorik (1987) conducted a study of collegial interaction in schools and discovered that teachers felt that what they did in their classrooms is “much too personal to share with another” (p.391). This would support the theory that personal experience has shaped teacher beliefs and that most of the time teachers are not even aware what these beliefs are. Kagan (1992) elaborates,



So much of teachers' professional lives is beyond their control and so many elements of school life occur unexpectedly that, to teachers the classroom seems the only environment over which they can assume control (p.79).

Kagan discussed the isolation of the classroom and how this becomes a safe predictable environment for teachers. Clandinin and Connolly (1996) concurred, "Classrooms are for the most part safe places, generally free from scrutiny, where teachers are free to live stories of practice. These lived stories are essentially secret ones"(p.25). Negative attitudes, including defensiveness, can exist however and the tendency to distrust any form of external advice or information (Kagan, 1992; Rosenholtz, (1989).

Professional isolation occurs partly because, as teachers act to protect their self-esteem and cast themselves in the best possible light, they shy away from ambiguous situations where conclusions about a lack of professional adequacy may either be publicly or privately drawn (Rosenholtz, 1989, p. 430).

Zahrick reinforced the fact that teacher behaviour is personal, private and idiosyncratic,

Teachers (40%) said that asking for help about teaching is threatening and fearful, while giving it may be interpreted as boasting or the information will be ignored...All teachers have their own way of teaching, teachers (37%) said. They have established their methods and do not wish to alter them (p.390).

Feiman-Nemser (2003) concurred, suggesting that individual classrooms,

keep teachers separated from one another, reinforcing their isolation and sense of autonomy. Without easy access to one another, teachers may feel reluctant to share problems or even ask for help, believing that good teachers figure things out on their own (p.4).

Zahorik (1987), in summarising his study on teacher collegiality, stated, "teachers need to become less private about their classroom behaviours as a way to increase collegiality, improve instruction, and make teaching more rewarding" (p.385). In this way, teachers will learn from others and possibly break down barriers of defensiveness and distrust.

Primary teachers have had the benefit of learning how to teach, although according to research, they will still fall back on what works for them according to their own individual beliefs. The benefits of using dance as a method of unlocking cognitive function is understood and has been for some time. While some policy makers and teachers understand the concept, knowing is not enough in itself.

Every teacher is different. Just as one size doesn't fit all in the case of individualised learning for the student, the same must be said of teachers. As a teacher, I have always felt that I was different, and worked intuitively rather than to a set of strategies that were held up as good teaching models.

Upon reflection, personal beliefs would have been developed through experience at school as a student, particularly through the formative primary years, where the teacher was able to develop a personal rapport with students. During my first year of teaching, my Deputy Principal spoke to beginning teachers stressing that we shouldn't let them [the students] see us smile before Easter. This may have worked for him, but it most certainly would not have worked for me. I needed to find my own way which was intensely personal and in opposition with his view.

Teachers have diverse strengths and weaknesses. Most teachers would have varying combinations of attributes such as self-control, patience, fairness, trustworthiness, humility, sense of humour, an ability not to take oneself too seriously, knowledge, passion, enthusiasm, intellectual integrity, sensitivity, the desire to stimulate and engage children's curiosity and be an interesting attractive person who presents lessons in lively and interesting ways. When a teacher's own unique personality combines with their background, experience and teaching attributes, difficulties emerge regarding the delivery of lessons in exactly the same way. It could be suggested that rarely will lessons be delivered in the same manner.

Research suggests that teachers are reluctant to use research findings to inform their teaching practice even when they believe that the message being conveyed is important (Cooney, 1985; Gonzalez Thompson, 1984; Kagan, 1992; Rosenholtz, 1989; Zahorik, 1987). This appears to be the case with the teaching of dance. No matter how inspired, or how firmly a belief is held, conceptual changes are unlikely to take place without a struggle. Professional development has been cited as a vital component in the successful implementation of dance (Buck, 2005; Oreck, 2004; Rolfe, 2001) and yet it would seem, that without an understanding of teacher beliefs about teaching, generally, and about teaching dance specifically, it may be of little value to offer professional development in dance. Kagan (1992) stated "To teach an individual something new means to effect conceptual change in his or her personal beliefs...pre-existing beliefs are tenacious, even in the face of contradictory evidence" (p.76). This may be a factor explaining why teachers do not generally include dance in their classroom practice. Research has been available for some time indicating that teachers teach in the same manner as they themselves were taught (Cooney,1985; Kagan, 1992; Rosenholtz, 1989; Thomson, 1984; Zahorick, 1987). While this information is not new to educational researchers, when applied to a specialist subject such as dance, such knowledge takes on a greater significance. If dance is not something that was within a teacher's realm of experience, research suggests that it is unlikely to be taught in that teacher's classroom. Hennessy, Rolf and Chedzoy (2001) discussed the fact that the training of arts teachers has never been a priority at teacher education institutes and stated,

Our belief is that the more experience they have of engaging with the arts and being involved in teaching children at the earliest stages of their professional development, the more likely they are to see arts teaching as a normal part of their role (p.54).

If it is simply the case of more engagement with the arts, and dance in particular, then Hennessy, Rolf and Chedzoy have made a good point. If however, change is unlikely to take place until all pre-service teachers come to teacher education with an experience of dance education in their own lives, then engagement in the arts may be wasted at teacher education institutions. It would seem that teacher education institutions need to acknowledge the importance of teacher biography, and address the current concerns regarding this significant factor in the education of teachers.

## **2.17. Pre-service teacher training**

This research discusses pre-service teacher training as a context for further understanding of teachers in New Zealand classrooms. "Today's teachers work in exhausting times. Curriculum and assessment change [in New Zealand] has been unrelenting and even the most conscientious teachers are feeling overwhelmed" (Lovett, 2002, p. 1). If teachers in classrooms are feeling this way, how can pre-service teachers prepare for the reality of what awaits them in schools, and as previously questioned, does teacher education make a worthwhile difference? Evertson, Hawley and Zlotnik (1985) stated, "There is an assumption that teacher preparation is basically a waste of time, though such an assessment is based to some extent on the frailties of teacher education programs" (p.3). Larabee (2000) proposed that, "a large body of research on the history of teacher education reform is a tale of persistent mediocrity and resistance to change" (p.228). Darling-Hammond (2000) stated,

Many people believe that anyone can teach, or, at least, knowing a subject is enough to allow one to teach it well. Others believe that teaching is best learned, to the extent that it can be learned at all, by trial and error on the job. The evidence strongly suggests otherwise (p.167).

Larabee (2000) outlined the problems that "block the path to a truly professional education for teachers" (p.228). His re-occurring research message is that 'teaching is a difficult practice that looks easy'. Korthanagen and Kessels (1999) commented, "Teachers pass through quite a distinct attitude shift during the first year of teaching, in general creating an adjustment to current practices in schools (p.5). "The story of beginning teaching usually revolves around several themes, reality shock, the lonely struggle to survive, and a loss of idealism" (Feiman-Nemser, 2003, p. 3). "Another characteristic of teaching that makes it difficult, is the way that teachers are required to establish and actively manage an emotional relationship with students" (Larabee, 2000, p. 229). How can teachers be prepared for this profoundly difficult engagement? Larabee (2000), in discussing this

relationship added, “and in emotional matters, students have a sensitive antennae for detecting a fake” (p.230).

Darling-Hammond (2000) proposed that research suggested,

that the extent and quality of teacher education matter for teacher effectiveness perhaps now even more than before. The expectations that schools teach a much more diverse group of students to much higher standards create much greater demands on teachers (p.166).

Darling-Hammond’s statement draws attention to what is needed in teacher education. Korthagen and Kessels (1999) consider that teacher education is in trouble in many countries. They proposed Great Britain as an example, where,

A major part of pre-service training has now become the responsibility of schools, creating a situation, in which, to a large degree, teacher education takes the form of training on the job (p.4).

The in-school training taking place in Great Britain has seen a reduction in the attention given to the arts, particularly in the areas of drama and dance. Davies (2010) stated, “Surveys of primary pre-service teachers in England found few opportunities for respondents to either observe or teach the arts in primary schools” (p.630). U.K. school based teacher training during 2004-2008 was increased to 90 days within a 38 week, one year postgraduate teacher education program. It was believed that pre-service teachers would gain their knowledge of the arts through observation and practice in schools (L. Green et al., 1998). Naughton, Rolfe & Stanton (1998) discussed the teachers’ responsibility for preparing pre-service teachers to teach the arts in schools. “The findings raised concerns about the quality of experience currently being offered to students by teachers”(p.95). The paper discussed the significant lack of expertise in arts subjects by the classroom teachers.

Collins (2004) questions what teacher education is about and how the teaching of subject specific content knowledge is viewed? Gore (2001), suggests that reflexive teaching, teacher empowerment, and concern for equity and diversity are the current developments in teacher education. “Reflexive practice is probably the most commonly used phrase of the last decade in teacher education” (Collins, 2004, p. 231). Stanley (1998) stated,

Although John Dewey first outlined his understanding of the notion of reflection in 1933, not till the past 15 years or so have the concept and practice of reflective teaching gained credence and undergone wide-spread discussion in Western education systems (p. 584).

Does such discussion actually reach the classroom? Reflection on teaching practice is not new. “This is an approach to knowledge production like the one that Dewey (1929) sought, one that aims to empower teachers with greater understanding of complex situations” (Darling-Hammond, 2000, p. 170). Calderhead (1989) viewed reflection as,

A process of becoming aware of one's content, of the influence of societal and ideological constraints on previously taken-for-granted practices, and gaining control over the direction of these influences (p.44).

If pre-service teachers develop a reflexive practice throughout their pre-service teacher education, there may be some hope of a continuation throughout their teaching. There seems little space in the classroom however, for curriculum subjects, let alone research and reflection. As Gore (2001) stated, "unless these commitments are actualised in the curricula and practices of teacher educators and their students, few gains will be made" ( p.125). Teachers have little time to implement models of reflective teaching, and even less time to examine such strategies.

Whether any of the proposed models of reflective teaching however, offer very adequate conceptions of professional learning as it occurs in classrooms, or how it might occur, is largely un-assessed (Calderhead, 1989, p. 45).

Calderhead's (1989) comments may be dated, yet remain relevant today,

Student-teachers often have a high level of "ego-involvement" in their conceptions of themselves as teachers. They are reluctant to be self-critical and dwell upon their weaknesses at a time when their confidence may well be under threat (p.46).

The teacher practicum is a period of high stress where pre-service teachers engage with a room full of students who can sense fear. Students identify with their classroom teacher in the first instance, so the pre-service teacher must pull out all stops to make the lesson enjoyable, cover the content of the lesson with a degree of perceived confidence, all the time being aware that they are being judged. It is not something that the average person would wish to subject themselves to, and in my experience over twenty years as a teacher-supervisor, most pre-service teachers become ill at some stage during their teacher practicum. "Personal, professional and contextual factors may limit and even inhibit a teacher's ability to engage with reflection" (Stanley, 1998, p. 586). Collins (2004) reminded the pre-service teacher,

It is crucial to acknowledge that reflective practice is simply a technique, it can be grafted onto any view of teacher education and used in relation to any teacher knowledge base (p.231).

Earlier commentary relating to personal beliefs applies to pre-service teachers in the same way as it does to classroom teachers. "Research on learning and teaching shows that prior knowledge plays a powerful role in comprehension and learning" (Korthagen & Kessels, 1999, p. 5). If experienced teachers bring 'self' to teaching then it can be argued that it is likely that pre-service teachers are influenced by their own unconscious views on what makes a good teacher. (Hassart, 1999; Lortie, 1975; Stofflett & Stoddart, 1994; Wahl, Weinert, & Huber, 1984; Wubbels, 1992), concur with Korthagen and Kessels (1999) who stated,

These [pre-service teachers'] notions often do not agree with the theories taught in teacher education programs. Pre-conceptions show a remarkable resistance to traditional attempts to change them, which can in part be explained by their firm roots in the many years of experience that student teachers themselves have had within the educational system (p.5).

Wubbels (1992) furthered the discussion,

The quick 'washing out' of progressive attitudes after student teachers have left teacher education colleges can be caused in part by too little awareness by teacher educators of the conceptions that student-teachers have when they enter the program (p.2).

While this aspect of the discussion may inform some of the reasoning behind the move toward on the job training, there seems no reason why an understanding of the pre-conception theory might inform pre-service teacher education, and be combined with high quality induction programs within the schools.

Currently initial teacher education in New Zealand provides curriculum knowledge, subject matter knowledge, pedagogical content knowledge and knowledge of child development alongside professional practice experience (Connor, Lancaster, & McGrath, 2008, p. 5).

Gore (2001) argued that teacher education should be based on pedagogy and placed at the core of teacher education. Gore's proposed framework identified "intellectual quality, relevance, supportive class room environment and recognition of difference, as four dimensions of classroom practice" (p.124). She argued that, "without such a framework, existing differences amongst teacher educators will continue to seriously compromise not only efforts at reform, but also the very quality and coherence of our programs" (p.124). Gore (2001) also discussed the paradigmatic differences that can lead to "compromise, coherence and consistency of programs" (p.126). The point that Gore made regarding paradigmatic differences is important when relating teacher education to dance. Arguing for the place of dance in primary classroom programs requires a focus on the discipline of dance and may sometimes be difficult for dance educators, let alone pre-service teachers. Stinson (2010) stated,

It is more comfortable to reflect privately than to engage in discourse with others who hold different values and try to convince us we are wrong; this is especially true for many of us as women who have cultivated our politeness and dislike for conflict to such an extent that we often avoid the kind of rigorous debate that would help the field grow (p.137).

Pre-service teachers need, not only a strong pedagogical framework within their Universities and Colleges of Education, but they also require schools that are modeling strong dance education practices so that the teacher practicum is an influence on their teaching and learning. Darling-Hammond (2000) proposed that while knowledge of subject matter is often deemed to be important, "it appears that its relationship to teacher performance is curvilinear" (p.167). Darling-Hammond's theory does not discount the importance of subject-matter knowledge, qualifying her

statement with reference to teacher preparation, “even very intelligent people who are enthusiastic about teaching find that they cannot easily succeed without preparation” (p.168). Feiman-Nemser (2003) argued for “a high-quality induction program [that] should increase the probability that new teachers learn desirable lessons from their early teaching experiences” (p.3). Having established that teachers within a school are already overloaded, could such a program be implemented by pre-service teacher educators, establishing a strong connection between pre-service education and schools?

Davies (2009) explored the strengthening of pre-service teachers’ self-image as artistic individuals by including a performing arts week within a one year postgraduate teacher education program. He stated that, “within a climate of compliance, this study suggests that pre-service teachers require such experiences to overcome their fear of curriculum innovation” (p.630).

Delandshere and Petrosky (2004) discussed the implications on pre-service teacher education with the introduction of a National Standard which they believe is detrimental to teaching and learning, as “It takes away the intellectual autonomy necessary to engage in open and free inquiry” (p.11). National Standards will be addressed later in this thesis, however the introduction of these reforms does appear to call for alignment and control in a teaching content.

Very little time is given to preparing pre-service teachers to teach dance in New Zealand primary schools. Although not specified in terms of hours, currently New Zealand teacher education institutions deliver approximately five hours of dance over three to four years of teacher training (Faculty of Education, Victoria University, 2011; University of Canterbury, 2011; University of Otago, 2011). Students completing a one year post-graduate diploma in teaching may miss out altogether. The University of Canterbury’s (2011) website mentions dance under primary teaching curriculum areas but dance does not appear on the course code finder. The amount of study in dance has been reduced from what already appeared to be an inadequate time allocation. This is reflected in schools, where dance is not often taught, and teachers appear to lack confidence according to Buck (2003a) who stated, “Teachers had some experience and knowledge of dance; however they had little confidence to translate their experiences of dance into dance education experiences for the children” (p.273). Clark (2005) expressed concern that, in regard to pre-service teacher education, a partitioned curriculum rests on very insecure philosophical foundations and questions, “how to address the tensions surrounding the inclusion of the excluded and the exclusion of the included”(p.2). As dance is included in the curriculum, it could be assumed that there is an expectation that it be taught in the classroom. The amount of teacher training and professional development in schools would suggest otherwise. Clark (2005) suggested that pre-service teachers

themselves address the inconsistencies rather than unquestioningly accepting them and stated, “also it is vital that academic staff in teacher education programs likewise do so in the interests of teacher education worthy of the name” (p.2). Do pre-service teacher educators have the power to address inconsistencies and why would academic staff make changes to a program that works for them? Shields (2004) made an astute observation,

For several decades, educators seeking to introduce meaningful change have ignored much of the wisdom of educational philosophers and focussed more on programs than on people, more on reforms than relationships (p.114).

Researchers would be well served to investigate how meaningful changes could be made. As Evertson, Hawley and Zlotnik (1985) stated, “Many of the proposals for improving teacher education derive from the same logic that inspires the notion that we could have better prisons if we had better prisoners”( p.4).

Lovett (2002) proposed that it is time for teachers to make their own decisions about what teacher learning is important and how professional development might be presented to them, “It is of concern that teachers are cast as ‘victims of change’ and decisions about their learning largely determined by others” (p.i). Lovett (2002) stated, “It is argued that the future effectiveness of schools will determine their own learning needs and then find ways of addressing them” (p.ii). Codd (2005), in discussing teachers as managed professionals, stated,

If there is to be a ‘third way’ for educational policy that truly represents a change of direction and a new vision, it will be one that recognises the role of teachers in the reconstruction of a democratic citizenship (p.204).

The recognition of the importance of teachers is at the heart of any change that could see dance included in New Zealand Primary Schools, and within such change, to acknowledge, and meet the expectations of UNESCO’s aims for the arts.

## **2.18. A positioning of New Zealand and other OECD countries in relation to UNESCO’s aims for the arts**

In order to place New Zealand primary school arts education within a broad contextual framework, the situations of several OECD countries have been examined in relation to UNESCO’s aims for the arts. Bamford’s (2007) study for UNESCO regarding of the impact of arts rich programmes stated that,



the arts make a valuable contribution to the total education of children especially in relation to academic performance, well-being, attitudes to school and perceptions of learning, but that the character of arts education varies considerably from country to country (p. 1).

O'Farrell (2010), cited Guingane (2010) in his final report on UNESCO's Second World Conference on Arts who asserted in his keynote address that,

Arts education is a means to develop one's sensibility, emotional intelligence, perception about others, capacity for comparative analysis and understanding toward diversity... arts education has the potential to counter the negative impact of globalisation, with its cultural homogenization, by nurturing creative individuals with their own sense of identity (p.4).

At the 1st UNESCO World Conference for Arts Education in 2006, UNESCO proposed a Road Map for Arts Education. In 2010 the Seoul Agenda took the road map a step further by creating a concrete plan of action. Goals for the development of arts education are specified in Appendix 2 of the Programme of the Second World Conference on Arts Education (UNESCO, 2010) and are summarized as follows:

GOAL 1: To ensure that arts education is accessible as a fundamental and sustainable component of a high quality renewal of education.

GOAL 2: To assure that arts education activities and programmes are of a high quality in conception and delivery.

GOAL 3: To apply arts education principles and practices to contribute to resolving the social and cultural challenges facing today's world.

In order to benefit all learners, the Seoul Agenda (2010) called upon,

UNESCO Member States, civil society, professional organisations and communities to recognise it's governing goals, to employ the proposed strategies, and to implement the action items in a concerted effort to realise the full potential of high quality arts education (p.2).

'Implementing the action items' would appear to be a stumbling point for many UNESCO Member States. For a start, each member country within UNESCO has its own unique way of 'being' in the world and has assumptions and attitudes that challenge the notion of the use of the arts in education. Root-Bernstein, R & M (2010) reflect on their participation as keynote speakers at the second UNESCO World Conference on Arts Education and outline concerns regarding the intellectual gaps between,

developing and developed nations, between traditional and global cultures, between art of the one hand, and science and technology on the other. Participants addressed one of three points, the use of arts education to preserve traditional and ethnic cultures and foster global appreciation of their global diversity; the use of arts education to heal communities in crisis and promote socio-political multi-culturalism; and the use of arts education to foster

creativity for 21st century needs. Very few people or panels attempted to grapple with all of these issues or probe their intersections (p. 1).

During a panel discussion on the implementation of the 'Road Map', O'Farrell (2010) cited Hong who spoke as a representative of the Asia-Pacific region. Hong (2010) addressed the need to,

Emphasise a new approach to arts education in which arts education is to be conceptualised both for its intrinsic value as well as for its value as a tool for fostering creativity in young people in order to seize the opportunities of the 21st century (p.5).

As a developed nation, it could be expected that the focus of New Zealand education would be the use of the arts to foster creativity for 21st century needs and this is where some of the emphasis lies. The New Zealand dance curriculum (2007) also addresses the use of arts education to preserve traditional cultures, leaving room to foster an appreciation of global and ethnic diversity. Despite the ideals of the curriculum, a practical implementation of dance is missing in New Zealand schools. (Ashley, 2010; Buck, 2003a; Hong-Joe, 2002). Classroom dance is taught only sporadically by a few, if at all, often being relegated to a school musical, Jump Jam or extra-curricular offerings.

In order to place New Zealand primary school dance education within a broad global framework, the situations of several OECD countries with similar policies and values have been examined in relation to UNESCO's Aims for The Arts. Problems have been uncovered in the U.K. The National Curriculum online (2011) website stated that,

The DfE is conducting a review of the primary and secondary National Curriculum. This site contains the statutory programmes for study for National Curriculum subjects which maintained schools must follow until a new curriculum is in place (p.1).

An International Review of Curriculum and Assessment Frameworks (2000) conducted on behalf of the U.K. Qualifications and Curriculum Authority discussed the disadvantages of placing dance within a physical education framework due to the possible focus on the physical rather than the expressive and communicative qualities of dance. Reference was made to the New Zealand Curriculum where dance is placed within the Arts. The report stated,

There are widespread concerns about the status and value of the arts in practice. All the representatives attending the seminar agreed that the arts appeared to be undervalued within their education systems (p.5).

There appeared to be a glimmer of hope for the arts if not for dance specifically in the UK curriculum when Duncan's (2009) report responded to the Rose Report's recommendations for the UK Primary English Curriculum. Duncan (2009) stated,

Secondly, and even more encouragingly, is the Review's emphasis on drama, role play, visual and performing arts to help enrich and enliven children's spoken language development (p.2).

Duncan's report related to the English Curriculum, and although the importance of the arts was highlighted, the recommendations were just 'hanging by a thread' within a broad framework where dance specifically was not even mentioned. Sanderson's (2008) research proposed that,

Dance and the arts should be more widely available in schools so that all children and young people can have access to aesthetic experiences that have the potential to improve the quality of life (p.2).

Although Sanderson's research regarding dance in U.K. schools made positive suggestions, it appears that four years on, her recommendations have not been acted upon.

Currently, in 2012, a music and dance scheme operates in the U.K. that aims to benefit children with exceptional potential in either music or dance. Four schools are involved in the dance scheme where children compete for the few available places (Department for Education, 2012). It appears that there is much work to be done in the U.K. to bring every school to a point where dance not only exists in a curriculum, but is implemented in classrooms across the country.

Dance is featured in the Australian primary schools' curriculums throughout each State and Territory. Individual curriculums are moving into line with a Draft National Curriculum which is currently under development (Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority Australia, 2011). Fox (2010), a former Queensland State Panel Chair of Dance in Education and currently Acting Manager of the Assessment Bank, for the Queensland Studies Authority, discussed the implementation of dance in primary schools,

Not every week, or term, or even year, but definitely not as missing as it was [dance]. Unfortunately it is still random, often included in lessons but usually working toward a bigger arts event for the school (Fox, 2010).

Dance in Australian schools appears to be following a similar pattern to New Zealand. Australia is about to implement a national curriculum with specific reference to dance and yet, at the stage of implementation, most teachers avoid teaching dance in the classroom. Instead they defer to arts events such as a musical or rock eisteddfod or major school event. Australian arts academic, Russell-Bowie (2011) states,

Despite continued changes in arts policies, practices, and governments, the same problems remain in classrooms all over Australia. In general the arts are marginalised and not valued as part of the core curriculum (p.169).

Dance in elementary schools in the United States operates in a similar manner to Australia where each State is responsible for their own curriculum. Classroom implementation varies from state to state and from school to school. Although America has introduced arts as a basic right for all children through the 2000 Educate America Act, the inclusion of arts alongside national standards has

created similar problems to those experienced in New Zealand and Australia. Gelineau (2011) reflected,

Implementation of all national standards has placed a major burden, not only on administrators, but even more heavily on classroom teachers, “we’re teaching to the test. No time for Arts” (p.vii).

President Obama’s committee on the Arts and the Humanities has released a paper ‘Reinvesting in Arts Education: Winning America’s Future through Creative Schools’. Obama (2011) stated,

Now more than ever we need solutions that keep students excited, motivated and in school, and we must provide them with the tools to succeed in the workforce after they graduate (p.47).

America’s size and population may present difficulties in a uniformity of implementation of dance across all states, although an organisation has been set up to empower teachers to teach the arts. The Arts Impact website states,

Arts Impact brings high quality arts education experiences to students by training classroom teachers to use the arts in their day to day teaching. Through a two year program, Arts Impact offers classes, workshops and mentorships, training teachers to bring dance, theater and visual arts into their classrooms and their core curriculum. All Arts Impact programs align with the Washington State Essential Academic Learning Requirements in the Arts (Impact, 2011, p. 1).

While there appears to be a move toward arts education generally in American schools, little information is available about the implementation of dance specifically, and it may be assumed that similar implementation problems exist as in Australia and New Zealand. Parsad & Coopersmith, (2012) state that, “In the 2009-2010 school year, 3 percent of elementary schools offered instruction that was designated specifically for dance during regular school hours” (p.40). Of the 3 percent of American schools who offered dance, the characteristics of instruction varied between the “frequency of instruction, the primary space used for instruction, the availability of arts specialists to teach the subject, and whether there were district curriculum guides” (Parsad & Coopersmith, 2012). The language used to describe the teaching of dance, such as instruction, rather than facilitation, and the images chosen to illustrate the report, suggest that creative dance has a limited presence in American elementary schools, and that the focus is on the learning and performing of dances. Parsad & Coopersmith’s, (2012) examination of dance education in American elementary schools, indicated that where dance was taught it generally took its place within a physical education, music or in other curriculum area programmes.

The Singapore Ministry of Education has recently overhauled old educational methods with a focus on the development of creativity. The desired ‘Outcomes of Education’ are listed on the Ministry of

Education website (2011) as follows; a confident person; a self-directed learner; an active contributor and a concerned citizen. Keun and Hunt (2006) state, "Singapore's Ministry of Education (MOE) aims to help students to discover their own talents, recognise their full potential and develop a passion for learning that lasts through life" (p.35). Such aims are similar those of the New Zealand Ministry of Education. The addition of dance into the primary curriculum is designed to foster creativity in Singapore, as in New Zealand. Singapore's 'Thinking Schools, Learning Nation' vision was launched in 1997 and in 2000, dance took its place in the New Zealand arts curriculum. Similar implementation problems exist in both countries (Ashley, 2010; Buck, 2003a; Burrige, 2010; Hong-Joe, 2002).

Keun and Hunt (2006) outline Singapore's Ministry of Education's attempts to create a flexible and creative education system,

'Thinking Schools, Learning Nation' (TSLN) vision was launched in 1997 and aimed at setting new directions for Singapore Education and preparing the young for the challenges of the twenty-first century. It encouraged the younger generation to think critically, and in the process, to contribute ideas and suggestions toward nation building (p.36).

As in New Zealand, Australia, the U.K. and America, the focus in Singapore is on literacy and numeracy within the school system and recent research of what is actually occurring in classrooms suggests,

many dichotomies and misnomers about the concept of 'creativity' in dance education... Pedagogy, teaching methodology, curriculum, exam/performance frameworks and parent/teacher/student expectations all impinge on opportunities for creative dance in Singapore (Burrige, 2010, p. 94).

Keun and Hunt (2006) concur, "Although dance is included as a curricular subject in the physical education syllabus, little attempt has been made to teach it in schools" (p.36). Singapore's education system has been historically structured along the lines of rote learning and examinations within a competitive environment. According to world measurements, (OECD, 2010) Singapore has been successful in educating students to a high standard. While Singapore proposes the inclusion of creative practices in schools, their past educational successes were achieved without dance, adding to the difficulties of change.

The development in Finnish education points toward success in education generally, (Darling-Hammond, 2009; Hargreaves, 2010; Hargreaves, Halasz, & Pont, 2007; Sahlberg, 2007), and although writers examining the reasons for this success do not necessarily highlight the importance of the arts in the curriculum, they do acknowledge its existence. Hargreaves (2010) states,

there are more composers and orchestral conductors per capita in Finland than in any other developed country, and all young people engage in creative and performing arts until the end of their secondary education (p.109).

While the importance of the de-centralised system that operates in Finland is acknowledged, along with the human face of education, the inclusion of arts education throughout the life of a student in Finland has provided positive opportunities for the development of creative thinking. A fully implemented arts curriculum appeared to be a key component within Finland's successful education system. Dance was offered in Finnish schools in 1999 when Niemi (1999) stated, "younger children in the lower grades are usually taught by regular classroom teachers who have little dance in their studies" (p.129). Anttila (2010) highlights inconsistencies however: "As part of a basic education in the arts, dance education has developed qualitatively and quantitatively, but not all children have equal access to dance education" (p.61). Dance is offered to a small percentage of children who display special talents. Anttila (2010) writes of a steady decline of the status of arts within education over the past 30 years and makes the point that dance has become an exclusive programme for talented students. She states, "Dance, which never had a place in the national curriculum to begin with, has become more of an exclusive, rather than an inclusive activity" (p.63). Anttila, (2010) also makes the point that:

This kind of development conflicts with the Nordic ideals of equality, democracy and accessibility of culture, education and the arts, and it also conflicts with the UN declaration of children's rights (p.2).

Although the nations discussed are all working toward the values and goals espoused in the UNESCO Road map for Arts Education and the Seoul Agenda, there still remains some distance between the vision and the reality. New Zealand is viewed globally as a leader in education with Shepherd (2010) quoting PISA rankings, which place New Zealand fourth on the world education stage (p.1). In respect to dance education the New Zealand Ministry of Education has an opportunity to lead the way, as to a certain extent, much of the infrastructure in terms of curriculum is already in place. The next stop arguably is to take rhetoric forward into action and implement specific steps to meet the goals as outlined by the UNESCO Road Map for Arts Education. During 2011, national seminars on Innovation and Education were held in Finland and Hungary where the CERI (2011) announced,

The Centre for Educational Research and Development co-led the human capital pillar of the OECD Innovation Strategy, a major policy initiative offering a cross-government approach to help countries capture the social benefits of innovation in a new era (p.1).

The CERI's Innovation Strategy newsletter (2011) poses the question, "Does your country have a plan to develop a national innovation strategy for education?" (p.1). Now would be a good time for New Zealand Education to capitalise on this offer and dance their way to change, so that the first goal of

UNESCO's Road Map may be met, ensuring that "arts education is accessible as a fundamental and sustainable component of a high quality renewal of education" (UNESCO, 2010). With dance implemented in New Zealand classrooms, success in meeting UNESCO's second and third goals would follow. It is necessary to look more closely at teachers and teaching, rhetoric and reality, and make the changes necessary in primary classrooms for dance to take its place in a creative community.

## **2.19. New Zealand Dance Education within an economic and sustainable society**

As a relatively small country of approximately four million people, New Zealand tends to develop its identity as a reflection of how it is viewed by other countries, especially by its immediate neighbour, Australia. It is generally accepted that New Zealand is a country with beautiful geographic features, a moderate climate and is sparsely populated with many open spaces.

New Zealand is considered a peaceful country by people of other nations. Maxwell (2009) tables a Global Peace Index Ranking, placing New Zealand fourth below Iceland, Denmark and Norway. There are documented occasions when New Zealand has adhered to its principles in the face of larger global influences. In 1984 New Zealand became nuclear free and caused a rift with the United States because of the New Zealand Government's stand against nuclear armed, or nuclear-powered, vessels entering New Zealand ports. Governments change, life's pressures increase, and it seems possible that New Zealanders may have lost sight of values that are of importance in a sustainable society. When individuals and communities become goal focussed, wider issues of importance are lost or blurred. The OECD (2010) states,

One of the ultimate goals of policy makers is to enable citizens to take advantage of a global world economy. This is leading them to focus on the improvement of educational policies (p.3).

A global world economy appears to be affecting educational policies, leading to conformity and conservatism. Contradictions exist when the New Zealand Government acknowledges the importance of creativity in education, yet focuses on measurements around literacy and numeracy. Gorur (2009) reflects on the statistical pursuit of certainty that leads away from quality art education and focuses more upon measureable certainties, such as a country's G.D.P. in a global world economy. He states, "In this era of uncertainty, education policy makers appear to rely increasingly on quantitative evidence to provide certainties, both for policy direction and policy evaluation" (p.1).

Gorur's comments draw attention to the introduction of National Standards as a measurement tool in New Zealand Schools. This would seem consistent with the use of Gross Domestic Product as an accepted and dominant measure of a country's success.

G.D.P. is a given measure from which economic growth and development may be discussed. (Lucas, 1988; Mankiw, Romer, & Weil, 1992) highlight the fact that a production function is the focus when measuring productivity and per capita growth rates, although Benhabib and Spiegel (1994) introduce the idea of human capital and an educational attainment of a labour force as factors that affect the output and growth of the economy. Despite an acknowledgement of human capital factors that impinge upon productivity, G.D.P. is limited as a tool for measuring a country's success. The European Environmental Bureau agrees with this assertion. They commissioned a report in 2007 that questioned G.D.P. acknowledging that it is not an acceptable measure of progress or well-being and state,

G.D.P. was never intended to measure well-being. Its key flaw is that it fails to distinguish between costs and benefits, productive activities and destructive ones, or sustainable and unsustainable practices (p.5).

G.D.P. misses the holistic view that includes education and the arts. The social well-being of a country cannot be measured by G.D.P. Globally, measures exist such as a Human Development Indicator (United Nations Development Program, 2011) and a Genuine Progress Indicator, (GPI) (Auckland Council, 2011). The G.P.I. is a measure of economic progress similar to that of G.D.P., the difference being that measurements include social and environmental factors. Such measures are not widely used however, and G.D.P. is the dominant measure used to rate the success or otherwise of a country. This fact in itself would appear to be a problem when examining the importance of education, and dance education in particular.

A testing system known as PISA (The Programme for International Student Assessment) is used to measure education success in OECD countries to "assess how far students near the end of compulsory education have acquired some sense of the knowledge and skills that are essential for full participation in society" (OECD, 2009,p.3).

PISA provides five key benchmarks for the quality of education systems in the following five categories; Overall performance of education systems; equity in the distribution of learning opportunities; consistency of performance standards across schools; Gender differences; Foundations for lifelong learners and learning strategies, motivation and attitudes (H. Niemi, 2009, p. 3).

If PISA results are reflective of a country's success then New Zealand should look toward Finland where Neimi (2009) reflecting on Finland's success states, "The Finish education system has received



attention from all over the world because it came out on top in the PISA surveys” (p.1). Finland employs enhancement led evaluation at all levels of education, unlike New Zealand’s National Standards scheme that promotes competition between schools and measureable outcomes. Historically, Finland has been forward thinking, making decisions that were not reflective of education systems in similar countries. In 1963 a proposal was mandated that had at its heart, “the proposition that anyone could learn – if given adequate opportunities and support” (Sahlberg, 2007, p. 5). Sahlberg cites the OECD (2007) who state,

What PISA surveys, in general, have revealed is that education policies based on the idea of equal opportunities that have brought teachers to the core of educational change, positively impact on the quality of education systems (p.9).

One key to Finland’s success may be in its teacher education system, where all teachers are respected and well educated, reaching a Masters level before their employment in schools (Niemi, 2009).

Teaching as a profession is closely tied to the Finnish national culture. It is no wonder then that teachers and teaching are highly regarded in Finland... the core values of Finns, social justice, caring for others and happiness (Sahlberg, 2007, p. 13).

Finland’s successful education system could be reflected in their low crime levels in comparison with other European Countries, (von Hofer, 2003), as, according to The (Prince's Trust Research, 2006), there are links between youth crime, unemployment and educational underachievement. Finnish children are all provided with opportunities and support and according to Sahlberg (2007), “the level of student performance has continually increased and student performance variance has decreased, while Finnish society has become more culturally diverse and socially complex” (p.13). By way of contrast and with a definite drive for action, Maxwell (2009) discusses the imprisonment rates in New Zealand,

New Zealand has one of the highest rates of imprisonment per head of population among all O.E.C.D. countries – second only to the United States and ahead of all the countries we most commonly compare ourselves with such as Australia, the U.K. and Canada (p.10).

It may therefore be valuable to reflect upon some of the more obvious social issues that are faced in New Zealand and how they may relate to education, arts education and dance.

Of particular interest is the high level of crime and imprisonment rates amongst disadvantaged youth in New Zealand. How can a culture of punitive justice sit comfortably alongside an education system that espouses the development of creativity? Dr. Baragwanath, a leading New Zealand educationalist (2009) discusses prisoners in the 15-19 year age group who are of school age, yet not receiving their educational entitlement. She stated,

Those who lack education are disadvantaged by comparison with those who have it and find themselves at risk of unemployment and recidivist offending. The prison service, whose function is to promote the rule of law, should be an educational model. The conclusion of my recent research is that they are not (p.1).

Baragwanath (2009) discussed how she established He Taurahi Tamariki, a school for disadvantaged youth,

where young mothers and some young fathers, almost all with disadvantages equivalent to those faced by young prisoners, found untapped talents and have gone on to find security and success in the workforce. Over 30 schools have been established on that model, most being fully funded (p.6).

Such an establishment and funding demonstrates a concern for the disadvantaged in this country, but rather than wait until students fall through the cracks created by social ills; by placing value on aspects of learning that address the problems encountered in New Zealand, could attention to a different model of teaching assist in the retention and success of more students?

Although not alone in connecting educational and social development, Finland is presented in this research for comparison with New Zealand as both countries have similar populations. Finland's population on January 27th, 2012 was 5,363,624 and New Zealand's population was 4,367,800 ([www.google.co.nz/publicdata](http://www.google.co.nz/publicdata)). Coughlan (2004) discusses education as a key to Finland's economic survival. He cites Finland's Education Minister Tuula Haatainen who stated,

How can a small affluent country such as Finland maintain a high-wage, high-skill economy? It can't compete with the low-cost economies of Asia, so it must, as a matter of economic survival, invest heavily in education and training (p.1).

Darling-Hammond (2009) discussed Finland's intensive investments in teacher education and the development of a 'thinking curriculum' for all students. "Finnish education policies have created a culture of diversity, trust and respect within Finnish society in general, and within its education system in particular"(p.3). Darling-Hammond (2009) a Professor of Education at Stanford University, wrote,

One wonders what we might accomplish as a nation if we could finally set aside what appears to be our de-facto commitment to equality, so profoundly at odds with our rhetoric of equity, and put the millions of dollars spent continually arguing and litigating into building a high quality education system for all children (p.1).

While New Zealand is not beset with litigation problems in the same way as The United States, funding is currently being appropriated for the implementation of National Standards. This is in direct contrast with the way in which the Finnish Education system has been developed.

Finland has shifted from a highly centralised system emphasizing external testing to a more localised system in which highly trained teachers design curriculum around very lean national standards ...The logic of the system is that investments of the capacity of local teachers and schools to meet the needs of all students, coupled with thoughtful guidance about goals, can unleash the benefits of local creativity in the cause of common equitable outcomes (Darling-Hammond, 2009, p. 3).

The decentralised system is viewed as a force in driving change and through its development, Hargreaves (2010) explained, "Finland consciously connected economic transformation toward being a creative and flexible knowledge economy" (p.109). The decentralised system provides the teachers with considerable autonomy. Their profession is respected and at the entry point, quality teachers are sought; "Teaching in Finland is highly competitive with only a one in ten chance of being accepted into teacher education programs in primary education" (Hargreaves, 2010, p. 109). Class sizes in Finland are small compared with New Zealand and the time spent in teaching is shorter. Standards and assessment are used more as a diagnostic tool than a measure of success or failure with external accountability remaining confidential (Darling-Hammond, 2009; Hargreaves, 2010; Sahlberg; (2007). Principals, teachers and community work collaboratively. Hargreaves, Halasz and Pont (2007) stated in an OECD report on improving school leadership in Finland,

The limitations of top-down large scale reform in education, are now calling for school administrators to act as leaders who can develop and inspire their teachers' commitment to and capacity for producing higher-level learning – for all students" (p.7).

Hargreaves, Halasz and Pont (2007) made another salient point in discussing the Finnish educational system, "At the heart of the human relationships that comprise Finland's educational system and society is a strong and positive culture of trust, cooperation and responsibility" (p.16).

Finland's affective outcomes of schooling are related to the motivational components of achievement. Williams and Roey (1996), in discussing the quality of school life in American schools, acknowledged that, "Despite a general acceptance that affective outcomes are important, they tend to be seen more as an (affective) means to a (cognitive) end rather than an end in themselves"(p. 193). Such a position would seem to reflect stand-alone statements in the New Zealand Arts curriculum (2007) such as,

The arts develop the artistic and aesthetic dimensions of human experience. They contribute to our intellectual ability and to our social, cultural and spiritual understandings. They are an essential element of daily living and lifelong learning (p.9).

While affective outcomes are acknowledged in the New Zealand curriculum, the difference is that, in a Finnish model, the affective objectives are consciously built into a values based curriculum where arts are consciously implemented, and unless a curriculum is followed through to implementation, there is little point in its existence.

While it may seem wise for New Zealand educationalists to follow the lead of successful nations in implementing educational reform, this has not been the case in the past. Sahlberg (2007) discussed some globally common features of educational reform since the 1980s,

Outcomes based reform became popular in the 1980s, followed by standards based education policies in the 1990s...Consequently, a widely accepted – and generally unquestioned belief among policy-makers and education reformers is that setting clear and sufficiently high performance standards for schools, teachers and students will necessarily improve the quality of desired outcomes (p.330).

Such a belief was strong and at the time when I was teaching in the 1990's I was given instructions to document what plans I had to improve the performance of all students in my classes. I felt that, like other teachers, I was already teaching to improve student performance. Sahlberg (2007) discusses other common features of global education reform such as the focus on core subjects in the curriculum, the reduction of alternative pedagogical approaches and stated,

The process where educational policies and ideas are lent and borrowed is often facilitated by international development organisations and motivated by national hegemony and economic profit, rather than by moral goals of human development (p.331).

By focussing more on the human aspect of education, Finland has not adopted any of these educational reforms. While it has not discounted the importance of literacy and numeracy, the focus on teachers and principals as professionals sets a clear message about the importance of respect, both of staff, students and of quality teaching. To the Finns, the human aspect of education is important, as is creativity and flexibility. Sahlberg (2010) stated, "Teachers and students are encouraged to try new ideas and innovations. Finally, teaching and learning aims to cultivate creativity in schools while respecting pedagogic legacies"(p.331).

Schwartz's (1999) research examined 49 nations against which different values were applied and compared. His study identified values along three polar dimensions: "Conservatism versus intellectual and affective autonomy; Hierarchy versus Egalitarianism; and Mastery versus harmony" (p.31). In a chart highlighting the differences, New Zealand is placed just left of centre toward an affective autonomy, intellectual autonomy, egalitarianism and harmony. Finland and western European neighbours are hard to the left hand side. Australia is placed in the centre of the chart and to the right of centre are many Asian countries including Singapore, a close neighbour of New Zealand. Singapore leans toward mastery, hierarchy and conservatism (Schwartz, 1999). Singapore appears on Schwartz's polar dimensions chart as being slightly further toward mastery hierarchy and conservatism as New Zealand is toward intellectual autonomy, egalitarianism and harmony, both nations being closer toward the centre than the extreme edges of the chart. Finland, Australia, New Zealand and Singapore are listed amongst the top ten performing school systems in the OECD

countries according to a report carried out by McKinsey and Company between May 2006 and March 2007. While New Zealand and Australia operate under similar educational systems, Finland and Singapore's educational systems are measured as polar opposites and yet both achieve highly on PISA ratings. The similarities between Finland and Singapore are that they emphasise the importance of attracting 'good teachers'. Just as a single definition of dance education is difficult, so the term, 'good teacher' is difficult to define. Mourshed & Barber in the McKinsey and Company report (2006) state however that, "Singapore selects their teachers according to academic achievements, communication skills and motivation for teaching" (p. 20). Singapore and Finland both accord their teachers with a great deal of respect, fostering the notion that with support and autonomy, teachers can achieve anything.

Values in educational curriculums tend to correspond with the wider political and social values of a country. Codd (2005) discussed New Zealand teachers as being managed professionals in the global education industry. He argued that, "economic rationalism and managerialism, combined with commercialism and globalisation, has produced an erosion of trust and a degradation of teaching as a profession" (p.193). Codd (2005) stated,

The long-held social democratic values of collective responsibility and egalitarianism had been subjugated to values of commercial enterprise and entrepreneurial individualism and the central focus of education policy had shifted from citizenship to the national economy and the role of schools in fostering an enterprise culture (p.198).

Since the introduction of Tomorrow's Schools, New Zealand's education system has been subject to examination and debate. Fisk & Ladd (2000), in relation to theories of school improvement, stated,

If they are to be implemented however, they must be done in specific social, political, cultural and economic contexts that not only provide a reality check on their validity but also have the effect of shaping the ideas themselves (p.5).

The limits of this thesis do not allow a full discussion on the educational effects of Tomorrow's Schools' but I concur with Codd (2005) whose study concluded,

To date there has been little research on the educational effects of international commercialisation on teaching methods, curriculum, learning styles, school culture, language needs or ethnic relationships (p. 199).

The correlation between dance education in New Zealand and wider national issues appears obvious when comparisons are made with other countries, particularly Finland where education is highly valued. Smith (2010) stated, "That sense of Finnish culture pervades all of Finnish education" (p.3). It is pleasing to note that New Zealand arts education is already addressing its cultural heritage with a strong emphasis on cultural dance in the dance curriculum. While New Zealand education rates

highly on the PISA measurement scale, the introduction of National Standards may have a detrimental effect on dance as the teaching focus must turn to literacy and numeracy. New Zealand education could learn from the Finnish system where, "the teaching profession is on a par with other professional workers" [such as doctors] (Darling-Hammond, 2009). Singapore is another country leading the PISA scale and it would appear that the value and respect shown to teachers in both Singapore and Finland is reflected in the high achievement of students. While their salaries are above the OECD average, they are comparable with Australia and several other OECD countries (Vasagar & Sheperd, 2012). It would appear that respect and value are the dominant themes relating to success in these countries.

New Zealand education appears to be moving backwards with the introduction of National Standards, successfully widening the gap in student achievement levels. Darling-Hammond (2009) stated, "there are no external standardised tests used to rank students or schools in Finland, and most teacher feedback to students is in narrative form" (p.4). Educational leaders in Finland have taken an opposite approach to "create a culture of diversity, trust and respect within Finnish society, in general and within its education system in particular" (Darling-Hammond, 2009, p.100).

In the event of New Zealand education adopting a similar system to the Finnish model where teachers are valued and supported, UNESCO's aim for the arts may be realised in New Zealand schools. In seeking to appreciate teachers' understandings of dance and its place within the New Zealand curriculum, this study has sought to understand teachers' identification with, and appreciation of, their educational context.

## **2.20. Summary of Review of Literature**

Schools are complex institutions as are the teachers working within them. This is reflected in the need to cover a wide range of topics in this review of literature in order to address the research discussion, 'Someone like us: Meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance within New Zealand primary classrooms'.

A historical overview of dance education in New Zealand provided a rich background, against which the place of dance within the current New Zealand curriculum and rationale was examined. The New Zealand Arts Curriculum was originally implemented in 2000. It was deemed important to examine implementation in respect to dance, as the issues raised may continue to remain as obstructions to the teaching of dance in New Zealand primary schools. Theorists who influenced the development of the New Zealand dance curriculum were acknowledged and discussed in order to strengthen the contextual framework. It was deemed important to include a discussion of the elements of dance,

dance genres, creative movement, discipline based dance education and dance as personal development to provide a full understanding of the teaching of dance within New Zealand primary classrooms.

A contextual examination of New Zealand primary schools addressed organisational structures, facilities and environmental factors which may influence classroom teaching of dance. New Zealand schools are individually managed by a Board of Trustees and rated by a decile system according to the socio-economic circumstances of the parent population. While this research does not seek to compare the teaching of dance in schools according to decile ratings, it is important to place New Zealand classrooms in context. A generally held assumption of dance being more interesting to girls than boys meant that a chapter on Gender was included in the review of literature. All teachers in this study all graduated through a teacher education course and for this reason it was necessary to examine pre-service teacher training.

The chapters on the positioning of New Zealand and other OECD countries in relation to UNESCO's aims for the arts and New Zealand dance education within an economic and sustainable society developed the discussion so that the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms could be examined against this knowledge.

# Chapter 3. Research

## Methodology

It is the intention of this researcher to go beneath the superficial answers to a complex question and examine the deeper questions and issues that relate to teaching dance. This requires an examination of teachers' understandings of dance and its place in the New Zealand curriculum in order to address the research examination of, 'Someone like us: Meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms'. A phenomenological approach has been adopted as the teaching of dance in the classroom is a qualitative experience and as Barbour (2005) stated, "phenomenological description of lived experience has become increasingly popular with dance researchers" (p.35). As an active construction of knowledge, dance can inform both the 'knowing, and knowing about'. Van Manen (1990) stated, "human science research...helps those who partake in it to produce action sensitive knowledge" (p.21).

It is because of the very nature of the questions being posed in this research that qualitative research was the preferred methodology. Through qualitative research, complex biases, knowledge, prejudices and stereotypical beliefs are uncovered and examined. Qualitative research provides a framework for intuitive wisdom that humans have always relied upon. Such wisdom may also be referred to as 'ways of knowing', or 'beliefs' and it is the beliefs of the participants that will form the outcomes of the research. Bresler and Stake (2006) elaborated,

For ages we have operated on hunches and emotions, increasingly using those that brought us safety and satisfaction...Gradually we formed rules for study and names for our sciences...increasingly drawing from philosophers and social scientists to codify research procedures (272).

Qualitative methodology can be traced back to Kantian thinking. In discussing the intellectual roots of qualitative methodology, Bresler and Stake (2006) cited Kant who stated "All we can ever know are phenomena. Rather than knowing the world directly, we sense, interpret and explain it to ourselves"(p. 272).

In interpreting and explaining research phenomena, the rational approach of constructivism has been adopted in this research. Constructivism is aligned with Dewey's critical pragmatism, that could be argued, when applied to teaching and learning, allows a researcher to go to the heart of the matter in order to determine meaning. According to Kadlec (2007) critical pragmatism improves "our



individual and shared capacity to tap into the crucial potential of lived experience in a world that is unalterably characterised by flux and change” (p.12). Dewey was described in Kadlec (2007) as believing in a meaningful democracy that is “inextricably linked to the critical components of his pragmatism as an anti-foundational model of inquiry and action” (p.5).

Participants in the present study were interviewed, allowing personal beliefs and understandings to emerge in response to the research questioning. Richardson (1990) discussed the idea that it is the participants themselves who come up with the sociological meanings. They provide the information on how they experience their lives and they do this inductively, rather than deductively. People ascribe meaning to things that happen in their lives and this research has examined meanings of what does or doesn't happen in teachers' dance classrooms. Fosnot (2005) conveyed this message, “Books, like trees, may appear on the surface to be discreet entities, but their roots go deep, and the growth pattern and eventual form taken are affected by many sources” (p.xi). Watzlawick (1984) wrote of stepping outside the mind and observing for,

if what we know depends on how we come to know it then our view of reality is no longer a true image of what is the case outside ourselves but is inevitably determined by the processes through which we arrive at that view (p.9).

Generally people don't consider how they came to know what they know, or that other people may have a different way of knowing. Constructivism is an approach that compliments a phenomenological understanding of people knowing what they know, offering opportunities to develop and build upon the known. Constructivism stems from the theories of Jean Piaget (1896-1980) who believed that “knowledge is experience that is acquired through interaction with the world, people and things” (Ackermann, 2001).

In the present study interviews were conducted at three different schools, each school being described as a Case Study. Case Studies allowed a 360 degree view of the teacher in context. Simons (1996) drew attention to the fact that Case Studies “give more space to participants' perceptions and judgments in the description and construction of understanding” (p.229). The material collected in Case Studies provides both individual and multiple perspectives through interviews, reflection, observation, journal entries and an empirical examination. According to Hanstein (1999), “The goal is to describe multiple realities, develop understanding and generate theory, rather than test theory or predict behaviour or outcomes” (p.45).

As an 'expert' in the field of dance education, my values and assumptions assisted in directing the way in which the participants addressed a discussion point. Truman (2000) in discussing objectivity, stated, “The aim of this is to make my reader aware of any biases I may have by showing how

(relevant) past events of my life have shaped my research and continue to do so” (p.43). I did not disguise my empathy with the research participants and the material, as an empathetic understanding is central to the comprehension of meaning. Helen Wildy (2003) proposed that “the researcher can be intimately involved in the process, asking questions and interacting with the participants and bringing self to the data analysis” (p.115). My twenty-three years of experience in education equipped me well to place myself alongside the participants, engendering a shared understanding of the teaching context.

Self-reflection was an important consideration within this phenomenological research. Harris (2010) discussed the social construction of meaning in interpretative constructivist research, “inequalities (like all social problems) are reflexively constituted by those who think and talk about them” (p.128). In my role as principal investigator I declare my bias; my experience that informs my seeing and critiquing. In acknowledging bias, it is important to state that my years of experience in the field of dance education inform the outcome of the study and I believe have assisted in the strengthening of the research. Each participant was encouraged to find their own voice during the interview process while I held an awareness of the personal bias in responding to participants’ voices. Truman, Mertens and Humphries (2000) remind the researcher that it is important to “locate the ‘self’ in the research process in terms of personal, social and institutional influences on research and analysis” (p.5). The epistemological framework was one of collaborating and sharing while remaining critically reflective to the participants’ realities.

Once interviews were conducted, transcribed coded and described, the information was analysed. A constructivist methodology provided an opportunity to examine specific constructed realities, as according to Guba and Lincoln (1994), “it is a way of looking at all the historical factors that shaped the reality of the multiple truths over time, such as social, political, cultural, ethnic, economic and gender factors and then crystallised (refined) into a series of structures that are now taken as real” (p.110).

### **3.1. Phenomonology**

A phenomenological approach assisted in the understanding of the subjective realities of participants’ understandings of dance in primary classrooms. As Willig (2001) stated, “Phenomenology is interested in the world as it is experienced by human beings within particular contexts and at particular times”(p.51). Stewart (1998) reiterated, “Phenomenology suggests methods for intuiting phenomena (or objects as we perceive them) within the sensible sphere of lived experience” (p.42). It is assumed that the participants’ meanings vary according to each lived

experience. Bresler and Stake (2006) stated, “The understanding reached by each individual, will of course be of some degree unique to the beholder, but much will be in common” (p.273). Crotty (1998b) discussed the way in which a researcher can obtain meaning through phenomenology,

Phenomenology is about saying ‘No!’ to the meaning system bequeathed to us. It is about setting that meaning system aside. Far from inviting us to explore our everyday meanings as they stand, it calls upon us to put them in abeyance and open ourselves to the phenomena in their stark immediacy to see what emerges for us (p.82).

According to Spivey (1997), “knowledge is made – constructed – through synthesis, which is performed by applying the categories of pure understanding to what is perceived” (p.6). The phenomenological interest in the subjective realities of the participants fits well with the ontological focus of the research. Willig (2001) stated, “Phenomenological analysis produced by the researcher is always an interpretation of the participant’s experience” (p.53).

Phenomenology supports the constructivist methodology in this research where the participants and researcher constructed a shared understanding through multiple meanings that emerged. Giorgi (1997) summarised the impact of phenomenology on 20th century thinking, “not only for its rigorous descriptive approach, but also because it offers a method for accessing the difficult phenomena of human experience” (p.238). A phenomenological approach has allowed an examination of the participants’ many, varied, and complex, experiences.

Cresswell (1998) discussed the multiple meanings constructed by individuals involved in research situations, “Thus multiple realities exist, such as the realities of the researcher, those of individuals being investigated, and those of the reader or audience interpreting a study” (p.76). From the multiple meanings collected in this study, some rich material has provided common themes and ideas.

### **3.2. Strategies of Inquiry – A Constructivist Approach**

Constructivism offers a philosophical view and methodology that enables an examination of people’s meanings of experience. As the title suggests, meaning is ‘constructed’ through an emergent discourse. According to Fosnot (2005),

the theory describes knowledge, not as truths to be transmitted or discovered, but as emergent, developmental, non-objective, viable constructed explanations by humans engaged in meaning making in cultural and social communities of discourse (p.ix).

Savery and Duffy (1996) summarised, “constructivism is a philosophical view on how we come to understand or know” (p.135). Truths exist outside of the knower that can be constructed through an examination of multiple realities based on sets of individual meanings. People create meaning by their interaction with others and yet each person brings to the meaning-making an innate intelligence that is specific to the individual. Therefore, even within the institution of a school where people would appear to be experiencing similar conditions, the meaning for each individual will vary to greater or lesser degrees. Fosnot and Ackerman place the theory within a social context as does Crotty (1998b) who, in his definition of constructivism, stated,

It is the view that all human knowledge, and therefore all meaningful reality as such is contingent upon human practices, being constructed in and out of interaction between human beings and their world, and developed and transmitted within an essentially social context (p.42).

Willig (2001) wrote that a concern or research question requires answers, therefore, “Qualitative researchers tend to be concerned with meaning” (p.9). Qualitative researchers however, are also looking for questions according to Kidder and Fine (1987) “they continually discover new questions relevant to the people under study” (p.60). The foregoing required a reflexive approach on the part of the researcher who constantly sought to uncover hidden meanings in the material. As eminent dance educators, Bond and Stinson (2000/1) stated, “we know that words cannot always express meanings, even by those with large vocabularies and a desire to talk”(p.53). It was necessary to search for hidden meanings, through observations, follow up questioning of self as connoisseur and through a thorough analysis of the material. A constructivist methodology supports the concept of learning through interactive dialogue. This methodological approach suits me as the researcher, and the transformative nature of learning, particularly of dance. The relationship between constructivism and dance highlights the action in the study. This constructivist research emphasises the connection between the on-going and mercurial nature of dance, the teaching of dance and the teachers themselves. Larochelle, Bednarz and Garrison (1998) emphasised the pragmatic action involved in social constructivism,

Embodied action, rather than abstract reason lies at the core of pragmatic social constructivism. For the pragmatist “I can do” rather than “I think” constitutes the (relatively) stable core of personal identity (p.44).

Eisner, a leading advocate of constructivism (1998a) discussed the way in which, “qualitative thought is employed in teaching; that it occurs in the relationships we construct and the environment we create for our children”(p.23). A constructivist methodology allows reflection on the learning experience and through engagement with the participants, a body of knowledge has been developed that could be used to assist teachers in their implementation of dance in the classroom.

It has been necessary to engage in the world of the participants, to place one-self alongside them to gain an understanding of the individual and collective meanings of the participants. “The meaning that people give to their experience and their process of interpretation are essential and constitutive, not accidental or secondary to what the experience is” (Bogdan & Biklen, (2007, p. 27). Rawls (1980) stated,

In a Kantian view the conception of the person, the procedure, and the first principles must be related in a certain manner – which of course, admits of a number of variations (p.517).

As ‘researcher as connoisseur’ I have constructed meaning from the many complex ideas and situations that were presented. Eisner (1998a) provided guidance for the research,

The first is the need for a cultivation of perception. The second is to understand the variety of ways in which the world can be described. The third is to acquire the ability to use theory so that it can explain what perception has provided (p.239).

Blumer (1969) wrote of the symbolic interaction which is at the heart of constructivist theory. He reminded the researcher that,

it is necessary to see the objects as they [participants] see them. Failure to see their objects as they see them, or a substitution of his meanings of the objects for their meanings is the gravest kind of error that the social scientist can commit (p.51).

The constructivist methodology echoes a Kantian philosophy. In an edited edition of the Critique of Pure Reason (2007), it is stated that the undetermined object of an empirical intuition is termed appearance and “philosophical knowledge is knowledge which reason gains from concepts” (p. 577). Spivey (1997) explained Kant’s argument further, “humans impose order on their sensory experience of the outside world, rather than discern order from the world, and that they create knowledge rather than discover it” (p.6). The knowledge that the participants have about their situation regarding the teaching of dance has a different appearance according to each individual. As Kant (2007) stated, “We understand the world by the sum total of all appearances” (p.387). Eisner (1998a) summarised, “Qualitative studies typically employ multiple forms of evidence, and they persuade by reason” (p. 39).

The philosophy of John Dewey resonates with constructivism. Dewey’s pragmatic ideas were influential in educational reform in the first half of the 20th century. He was influenced by Hegel (1770-1831) whose theory encouraged the collection of data to give experience to the philosophical. In turn McDermott (1994) wrote of Dewey’s theory, “It is the changes generated by our inquiry which should occupy our attention” (p. 208). McDermott cited Dewey who described the mediating ground of pragmatic epistemology as follows,

Transformation, readjustment, reconstruction, all imply prior existences, existences which have behaviour and character of their own which must be accepted, consulted, humoured, manipulated, or made light of in all kinds of differing ways in the different contexts of different problems (p.208).

Dewey's philosophy supports this constructivist research where the examination of the participants' realities uncovered prior experience and knowledge. Dewey's writings suggest that experience and writing are ever changing as is the nature of constructivist methodology. In this instance it would seem that a constructivist methodology is the ideal manner in which to examine what is an on-going and shifting problem; as to what it is that currently informs the place of dance in New Zealand Primary schools and how teachers can be supported in their implementation of dance in the primary classroom. An investigation of teachers' meanings of dance and their perceived lack of confidence to teach it created a focus for this research.

Hegel's philosophical convictions also support the constructivist model and are summed up in his well-known statement. "What is real is reasonable and what is reasonable, real" (Spivey, 1997). Hegel's philosophies relate to the present research, in that he places a value on the individual, yet considers the collective community in which the individual is developed. Spivey (1997) states; "A major Hegelian theme that I see as critical for construction... is the tension between different ways of seeing, looking at the general or looking at the particular" (p.9). Hegel's philosophy aligns directly with constructivism and the empirical underpinnings that informed this research.

Constructivism is related to learning and is the theory and practice that I, as a teacher of dance, have been engaged in for twenty-three years. I believe that when people learn by constructing their own knowledge, they are most likely to retain the information. Derry (1996) discusses the difference between a constructivist approach and a transmission based instruction and how this is "much less likely to produce the in-depth understandings that can be built up from activity and discussion that engages and challenges prior knowledge" (166). Dykstra (2005) reiterates, "When you have an idea for yourself, it is much more a part of you than when you memorise a description of it from someone else" (p.242). By utilising a methodology and subsequent methods the participants were engaged in a dialogue, where scope was provided for them to draw upon their meanings; and through the conversations and reflections, there was an honesty in the recognition that this research, by its very action, possibly informs the remaking of individual meanings. To a certain extent each interview was a two-way gift, both to the researcher and participant. New meanings emerged and insights developed that provided opportunities for change and growth.

Duffy and Cunningham (1996) discuss individual and socio-cultural trends where "individuals literally construct themselves and their world by accommodating experiences" (p.10). Teachers are

continually reconstructing themselves in a practical manner in an ever-changing world. Syllabus documents come and go, as do students, teachers and administrative staff. To keep abreast of current trends in teaching, a teacher could never be complacent. Dance is a relatively new subject in the arts and, as stated by Buck (2003a),

Dance in respect to social constructivism may be seen as a socially constructed human activity. It has histories, traditions and cultural contexts within which each individual creates and recreates his or her dance (p.70).

Ideas and theories are continually changing as our own memories and experiences change and, in the case of memories, they can become increasingly vague and distorted. A climbing companion recalls my climbing Mt Taranaki in the 1970's and not going right to the top. My own memory of this experience is of climbing right to the top and viewing the snow in the crater. It would seem that there is no fixed point in time when any idea is 'truth'. Von Glaserfeld (1984) stated,

Any cognitive structure that serves its purpose in our time, therefore, proves no more or no less than just that – namely given the circumstances we have experienced (and determined by experiencing them), it has done what is expected of it (p.24).

It is also important to acknowledge that all knowledge is subjective and that we don't know how much our senses create articles as we know them, when in fact there may be more factors or properties that the object possesses that we have not yet perceived or may never perceive. Von Glaserfeld (1984) cited Kant "We cannot be sure that there really exists an object such as we experience it" (p.27). Humans are in a constant state of meaning-making and in a modern society where people cram more and more into busy lives, intentions are misread and misunderstood. Assumptions are often made based on previous experiences when communicating. This can be related to teachers who attempt to teach a crowded curriculum with existing views of the place of dance in the primary classroom. The constructivist approach to this research was not just a manner in which meaning was uncovered but a process that allowed participants to reflect on their own view of what dance means to them in their classrooms.

Within a constructivist methodology, the nature of each individual participant was examined within the context of their background and culture. There was no passive acceptance of knowledge existing as truth. Past constructions of knowledge were assimilated and accommodated through an interactive engagement with the participants. Multiple perspectives were constructed and respected to make connections and to construct a body of knowledge that reflected a point in time. Von Glaserfeld (1984), stated that "the operations by which we explore our experiential world can be explored... and that it [constructivism] can possibly help us do it differently, and perhaps better" (p.18).

Constructivism has provided opportunities for the research participants to develop new ways of knowing about the place of dance in the primary classroom. New Zealand teachers have developed beliefs about dance in the classroom that have been based on societal expectations and experience. The beliefs that people hold determine outcomes and beliefs. Historically, beliefs around dance education have not always been positive. Buck (2003b) stated that several teachers who were involved in his study of the place of dance in the primary classroom,

learned to see and then look beyond their own assumptions...This shifted the emphasis from teachers teaching dance as though it was a fixed entity bound in unchanging, unquestioned traditions, to teachers generating interaction and exploring what dance is and could be for those children (p.326).

Buck's constructivist methodology allowed for new ways of knowing about dance for those involved in his study. Any belief that is held by an individual or group of people will become a self-fulfilling prophecy as Watzlawick (1984) stated, "It will become an actual reality if the invention is believed" (p.113). This research will explore the many different influences on the creating of meaning for the participants in the study and it is hoped that the outcomes of the research will prompt new meanings of dance in the primary classroom.

Dance and teaching are about creating meaning by constructing knowledge and therefore I contend that a constructivist theory has provided a solid theoretical framework for interrogating teachers' meanings of the support that they need to enable them to teach dance in their classrooms.

To further support the choice of a constructivist methodology, the following chapter discusses the differences between a constructivist and constructionist methodology and why this particular study has adopted a constructivist approach. There is very little difference between the two philosophies, and as either one could have been employed and it is necessary to outline why constructivism has been chosen.

### **3.2.1. Constructivism verses Constructionism**

The methodological paradigms of constructivism and constructionism are closely related and there are valid reasons why either of these phenomenological methodologies could have been used as the approach taken in this research. Both approaches are concerned with Herbert Blumer's (1969) argument that meanings are created, learned, used and revised in social interaction. In discussing constructivism in the previous chapter, there is reference to constructivism resulting in a construction, and Engle (2008) stated that,

both constructivism and constructionism have in common the idea of building knowledge structures through progressive internalisation, but to this Constructionism adds that this



happens most effectively when the learner is actively engaged in building a social object, i.e. a material real world construction as part of a group interaction (p.4).

The difference between constructionism and constructivism in this research context is subtle. Crotty (1998b) stated that,

According to constructionism, we do not create meaning, we construct meaning. We have something to work with. What we have to work with is the world and the objects in the world (p.45).

The actual words themselves, constructivism and constructionism reflect subtle differences. Constructionism is a slightly stronger word in both sound and meaning. Crotty (1998b) in discussing constructionism cited Merleau-Ponty's argument that "the world and objects in the world are indeterminate. They may be pregnant with potential meaning, but actual meaning emerges only when consciousness engages them"(p.43). The constructionist engages more with objects and how the meanings attributed to them are constructed in a social situation. This research leans more toward the constructivist model where meanings regarding social situations are drawn from the interaction of human beings within a social context. The creative flexibility required to recognise and create meaning fits more easily within a constructivist methodology than a constructionist methodology.

The similarities continue, as Harris (2010) stated, "A constructionist highlights important work that people do" (p. 14). As an experienced teacher, I value the work of teachers and apply my experience to developing an understanding of meaning. Davies (2004) stated,

Researchers are not separate from their data, nor should they be. The complexity of the movement and intersections amongst knowledge, power, and subjectivity require the researcher to survey life from within itself. Researchers come to know the lines of force that make up the social apparatus through being located in and on them, as those lines pull now in one direction and now in another as they sediment or break (p.5).

Davies (2004) however, also pointed out that,

the author is not the final arbiter of meanings, nor can she/he necessarily control meanings. Poststructuralist theory should not be taken to a rigid discipline in which the words of the authors have biblical weight, rather it is the task of those who work with poststructuralist theory to use and develop the ideas as a set of creative possibilities (p.6).

It was important to understand the nature of the social institution that the participants were drawn from, which could have been achieved through a constructionist methodology. As the researcher, I believe that understanding how the social institutions of schools are created and maintained has been vital in gaining an understanding of the realities of the participants. The participants' realities however, align more closely with a constructivist methodology. Which comes first? is a question one

might ask, but in social interactions within institutions, meanings are constantly being created, used and revised. One meaning affects the other and, in the case of teachers within the context of a school, effort is constantly being applied and revised. O'Brien (2006) cited by Harris (2010) stated,

Social institutions are created and maintained through the active participation of individuals. To the extent that we are aware of our reasons for participating in various cultural productions, we can be said to be mindfully engaged in the construction of reality (p.8).

Blumer (1969) stated that symbolic interaction rests on three premises,

The first premise is that human beings act toward things on the basis of the meanings that things have for them. The second premise is that the meaning of such things is derived from or arises out of the social interaction that one has with one's fellows. The third premise is that these meanings are handled in and modified by an interpretative process used by the person dealing with the things he encounters (p.2).

Blumer's basic premises regarding symbolic interaction form the basic underlying tenet of Constructionism. The point of analysis as stated by Davies (2004), "is not to expose the hidden truth in all its simplicity, but to disrupt that which is taken as a stable/unquestionable truth" (p.7). Meaning is not inherent. Harris (2010) stated that, "interpretive constructionists study what people claim to be the reasons for behaviour as well as how these claims are advanced, confirmed or contested" (p.11). They highlight recurring processes through which people actively generate, maintain, and transform, reality. Within a data analysis small concerns may be examined within a context of a particular institution. The analysis can then move toward larger issues which have been informed by earlier findings.

The analysis of how meanings have been constructed certainly implies the use of a post-structuralist approach. All the beliefs emerging in this study have been influenced by external factors and social interaction, and when examining such beliefs it has been necessary to not take anything for granted. Human beings construct their individual realities around their own experiences and, even in close relationships, different meanings are constructed and maintained. This can be achieved equally well through a constructivist or a constructionist methodology. An important difference is that constructivism allows a structured reflective approach resulting in a set of findings and suggestions, whereas, constructionism focuses more on how the meanings are arrived at. There will always be a tension between looking at the general and looking at the particular.

The constructionist likes to be involved in situations and to feel at one with the participants. In this particular study, the researcher was quite relational with the participants, having spent many years in the teaching profession. However, this relational understanding equally supported a constructivist approach. Both theories are pragmatic and focus upon the process and, in particular, on how

meaning is created and the various influences that shape meaning. Engel (2008) stated that, "Constructionism seems to be a sub-set of Constructivism" (p.4). Whether all theorists would agree with this assertion, it would seem that the two methodologies seem to overlap in most areas. In this research a constructivist approach allowed the meanings of the participants to emerge through a social interaction that facilitated the making of meaning. The researcher, as connoisseur (Eisner, 1998a) examined the meanings within the context of the school situation, allowing further meaning to be uncovered. A constructionist approach examines more directly how the meaning was constructed and less so on the meanings that emerge. It would appear that this is where the main difference between the two methods of study lies.

Constructivism was my driving theoretical paradigm because I was, in essence conversing with, and researching with individuals and their own lived reality of dance. By drawing upon constructivism, provision was made for a dialogic interaction that happened between the researcher and interviewees.

### **3.3. Case Studies**

The use of Case Studies allows for holistic in-depth investigation. Case Studies are intensive studies about a person, a group, or a situation. "All evaluation studies are case studies, the program, person or agency being evaluated is the case" (Stake, 1995, p. 95). In this research, three different schools are each regarded as a case. Simons (1996) states, "By studying the uniqueness of the particular, we come to understand the universal" (p.231). She discusses the fact that, through engagement with participants, a tension is created, "holding it open to disbelief and re-examination, that we eventually come to realise the significance of the event, instance or circumstance and the universal understanding it evokes" (p.231). This study was situated within a phenomenological constructivist narrative where multiple realities co-exist, therefore a Case Study design was appropriate for this research.

Schell (1992) stated, "The Case Study is unparalleled for its ability to consider a single or complex research question within an environment rich with contextual variables" (p.2). Yin (2010) adds, "The Case Study method is pertinent when your research addresses a descriptive question (What happened?) or an explanatory question (How or why did something happen?)" (Yin, 2010, p. 2). This research posed descriptive questions and as Schell (1992) stated, "One of the most time honoured forms of communication and knowledge transfer is the narrative" (p.2), best captured within a case study method. The participants are able to engage with the researcher in a manner that is natural to all parties within a flexible framework. The flexibility of design is one of the strengths of a Case Study

along with an ability to allow multiple meanings to emerge. Schell (1992) reminds the researcher that,

Justification of a Case Study as a valid form of research design therefore relies on methodological soundness and a systematic approach to case study design, execution, analysis and evaluation (p.11)

Stake (1995) discussed the complexity of case studies. He could just as easily have been discussing the school situation and the school population, the basis for each case study in this research. He stated, "Issues are complex, situated, problematic relationships. They pull attention both to ordinary experience and also to the disciplines of knowledge"(p.488). Schools are complex institutions where the relationships within the situation create an ever shifting culture. My role as a researcher is also that of the connoisseur, and as Benbasat, Goldstein and Mead (1987) stated, "the researchers have a priori knowledge of what the variables of interest may be and how they will be measured" (p.370). Stake (1978) reiterated,

The bulk of case study work, however, is done by people who have an intrinsic interest in the case. Their intrinsic case study designs draw these researchers toward understandings of what is important in that case within its own world, which is not the same as the world of researchers and theorists (p.450).

Experts come to a study with preconceptions and this expertise may serve as a vehicle through which to develop rich complex descriptions rather than a more generalised theory. Eisenhardt (1989) stated,

Although a myth surrounding theory building from case studies is that the process is limited by investigators' preconceptions, in fact just the opposite is true. This constant juxtaposition of conflicting realities tends to "unfreeze" thinking, and so the process has the potential to generate theory with less researcher bias (p.546).

A disadvantage of Case Study design is the fact that it is labour intensive. Miles (1979) stated, "Collecting and analysing data is a highly labour intensive operation" (p.590), however I concur with Yin (2010) who proposed that multiple cases may strengthen the outcomes of the study. The Case Studies have been drawn in three different schools from different geographic locations. I re-state the Cases as:

School One, Marion Primary School, a semi-rural school in North Canterbury where the Principal, Deputy Principal, six teachers, five parents, two members of the Board of Trustees, the school librarian/teacher aide and the members of two classes of students were interviewed, a total of eighteen interviews.

School Two, Stafford Primary School, an urban school in Otago where twenty-two interviews were conducted that included the Principal, Deputy Principal, eleven teachers, every student and the Chairperson of the Board of Trustees.

School Three, Swan Road Primary School, a small rural school in Manawatu with 53 students and three teaching staff. All staff and students were interviewed along with two Board of Trustee members and three parents.

Each of the Case Studies differed in the numbers of participants involved according to the size of each school, but in each study the focus was on interviewing teachers, “because the population defines the set of entities from which the research sample is to be drawn” (Eisenhardt, 1989, p.537). The teachers, Principals and Deputy Principals were the participants who had the most to offer the study, as they were directly concerned with the research focus. The material collected from parents, children, and Board of Trustees members from each case study assisted in creating an empirical context.

This research is a collective case study, addressing the research topic and, as Cresswell (2007) stated, “the inquirer seeks multiple case studies to illustrate the issue” (p.74). While some small differences were identified in each of the Case Studies, each school was operating under the same broad aims and objectives. Stake (1995), as cited by Tellis (1997) stated “the cases that are selected should be easy and willing subjects (p.4). In each of the case studies, there was full cooperation from every participant.

Eisenhardt (1989) stated, “Case studies typically combine data collection methods such as archives, interviews, questionnaires and observations”(p.534). The main method of material collection in this research was the gathering of information through individual interviews with each of the participants in each case study. Field notes were also examined alongside the interviews placing each of the case studies in context. The importance of valuing each of the interviews equally has provided a rich stream of information from each source.

Once the information within each case study had been analysed, cross study comparisons were made that assisted in building a body of literature. The case study report addressed themes or issues as they arose from the research. The focus was on the participants’ perspectives and the emergent material. The analysed material shaped the study. None the schools involved in the case studies, nor the participants were identified and thus their anonymity was protected. Pseudonyms were allocated to each of the schools and for each of the individual participants.

### **3.4. Research Methods**

The research methods of narrative inquiry and educational connoisseurship, employed in this research allow for a socially interactive investigation. According to Clandinin and Connelly (1989),

Narrative method involves participant observation, shared work in a practical setting. The process is one of joint living out of two person's narratives, researcher and practitioner, so that both participants are continuing to tell their own stories but the stories are now being lived out in a collaborative setting (p.11).

As an 'expert' in the field of dance education, I approached the study with a particular dance focus, but additionally as an educator who values the role of the primary classroom teacher. The expertise of the participants as specialists in primary education allowed for a sharing to take place. The researcher and the participants shared the role of connoisseur.

The key method of obtaining information from the participants was through interviews. It was important to examine this procedure in the light of the participants' attitude toward the interviews and the researcher. In this interview situation, the shared assumptions and contextual understandings were present within structured, yet informal, interviews that placed the researcher alongside the participants as co-researchers.

### **3.4.1. Narrative Inquiry**

As a teacher shared stories have always appealed as a means for learning and for developing understanding. I relate strongly to Clandinin, Pushor and Orr (2007) who stated,

Narrative inquiry is a methodology that frequently appeals to teachers and teacher educators. Part of the appeal is, no doubt, the comfort that comes from thinking about telling and listening to stories (p. 21).

As a human approach, narrative research appeals to diverse disciplines and interdisciplinary fields of research, including elements of literary, historical, anthropological, sociological, physiological and cultural studies. "The professions have also discovered narrative.... what links together all of these lines of inquiry is an interest in the ways that human beings make meaning out of language" (Casey, 1995, p. 212). Connelly and Clandinin were the first to use the term 'narrative inquiry' and their main focus has been concerned with narrative inquiry within an educational setting. "Narrative inquiry is concerned with the personal histories of participants embedded within a social history of schools and schooling" (Clandinin, et al., 2007, p. 1). In 1990, Connelly and Clandinin published an article in *The Educational Researcher* upon which Clandinin, Pushor and Orr (2007) commented, "Their conceptualisation of narrative inquiry arose from a Deweyan's (1938) notion that life is education" (p.22). It was therefore appropriate to utilise a narrative inquiry in my research in dealing with school communities.

This research has been concerned with the stories of the participants, as the subject to be addressed is related directly to how the school community feels and thinks about the place of dance in their

classrooms and how they can be supported in its implementation. It is only through addressing the participants' concerns directly, that findings have become relevant. An effective way of hearing those concerns is through narrative enquiry. According to Clandinin and Connelly (1989),

Narrative inquirers tend not to begin with a pre-specified problem and set of hypotheses. Instead they are inclined to begin with an interest in a particular phenomenon which could be understood narratively (p.14).

The research question being addressed was open to individual emergent meanings. Conle (2000) stated,

Open-endedness pervades all data. But this does not lead to arbitrariness of procedure. An inquirer/writer is driven by a 'sense of the whole' and is led by 'tensions with a history' and 'subconscious question marks' (p.52).

In my role as connoisseur, Conle's quotation relates directly to my research. "During the action phase observation, interviewing and document review are primary means used to uncover significant concerns and issues" (Rubin, 1982, p. 57).

Human experience is complex, always changing and informed by historical and social situations. As a researcher I have sought to uncover the deeper meanings that often lie beneath the surface while reflecting on personal understandings of the narrative upon which an analysis of the material was produced. This place for reflection and analysis has provided opportunities for rich material to emerge. Clandinin and Connelly (1989) stated, "Reflection and deliberation are terms which refer to methods of practical inquiry and are springboards for thinking of narrative and story as method" (p.8). Having a considerable background experience in dance education may seem to be a necessary pre-requisite for a researcher embarking on a narrative enquiry in this area. It may also be seen as a disadvantage in that particular 'truths' may be present that create a bias toward a certain area of discovery. While acknowledging that my life experiences have contributed to a particular way of seeing, my role as the expert or connoisseur was necessary to allow a full development of the constructivist epistemology. The advantages of being the researcher as connoisseur have assisted in the provision of a contextual understanding of school situations. An acknowledgement of bias through a rigorous approach to critical investigation has allowed personal meanings to emerge. Eisner (1998a) stated "that there can be no evaluation without value judgements" (p.115).

### **3.4.2. Educational Connoisseurship**

Connoisseurship is the art of appreciation, as Eisner (2002) stated, "Connoisseurs notice in the field of their expertise what others may miss seeing" (p.187). As an experienced dance educator, I believe that my perceptions of the discoveries made through research are suited to the process of

Educational Connoisseurship. Cochran-Smith and Lytle (1993) presented their belief that it should be teachers themselves who conduct research about, and for, teachers as they understand the culture of education and stated,

They often bring many years of knowledge about the culture of the community, school and classroom...This set of lenses sets the perspectives of teachers apart from those of others who look into classrooms (p.15).

Within each primary classroom, the teacher is the expert, and expert teachers from three different schools in this research study were offered opportunities within a constructivist framework to share their knowledge of their classroom and of teaching dance. In this way the researcher and the participants became co-researchers. My role in the schools was that of an 'expert dance education researcher' and not as a colleague, nonetheless, I worked alongside teachers with shared understandings. As Woods (1986) stated, "It is difficult not to have an effect on the situation under observation, particularly in sensitive areas such as classrooms" (p.39). My teaching experience assists in my acceptance within a school, but it is necessary to have a role and reason to be there, as school staffrooms are not places for outsiders.

As stated, educational connoisseurship is most appropriate to research in education and as Eisner (2002) affirmed, "Indeed, it may be the only way in which subtleties in teaching can be revealed" (p.57). Eisner (1998a) also maintained,

Our understanding of the theories of teaching and learning, our views of what is important in the educational process and our image of acceptable teacher pupil relationships all come to bear on what we are likely to notice and how we interpret it" (p. 66).

I came to this study with a set of assumptions and ways of knowing that have been developed over many years of experience. It was with this knowledge in mind that I related my own learning of dance as a social activity, to understanding the participants' view of teaching dance in the primary classroom.

Schwandt (1994), when discussing a constructivist viewpoint, "characterises this position as one where we cannot know such a thing as an independent objective world that stands apart from our experience of it" (p. 126). Such a position fits well with connoisseurship and has strengthened the researcher's position. It has assisted in creating collegiality with the co-researchers and in providing trustworthiness and integrity through an open acknowledgment of conclusions drawn from experience.

Questions, observations and stories were shaped around the five dimensions of connoisseurship as defined by Eisner (1998a), "the intentional dimension, the structural dimension, the curricular



dimension, the pedagogical dimension and the evaluative dimension” (pp.63-84). Within this research, the intentional dimension deals with the research question, what are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms? In order to address the broad topic, questions were posed that investigated teachers’ meanings of dance. This intentional dimension dealt not only with the research questions, but with the necessity to pose such questions as revealed in the research. There have been occasions when the inquiry process has appeared to move away from the main point of the research. According to Marshall (2001), “there may be relevant reasons for this which creates material to be worked with within their own right” (p.336). Through the process of connoisseurship, subtleties were identified that have led to the emergence of new understandings.

When examining a structural dimension within a school, the researcher as connoisseur was privy to inside information regarding organisational aspects of schools.

Institutional forces are ubiquitous in public life, and especially in the American educational system. Here institutionalization is conceptualised as a process that serves, over time, to structure or organise macro-level systems of social interaction and conduct: the rules, regulations and, implicit norms and taken for granted definitions that shape activities in organised environments (Ball & Wells, 2006, p. 188).

An examination of what is being taught through the curricular dimension was not only examining what was expected to be taught, but what was actually being taught, and what teachers thought about what they were teaching. It was important to pose questions that caused teachers to stop and think about their own beliefs. Teachers generally accept without question that they are employed to implement curricula developed by others. While they may initiate their own method of teaching the content, they will operate within institutional forces and goals. Schools are institutions where participants operate according to rules and shared assumptions, and as such, accept the status quo. All New Zealand schools are democratic institutions that accept control through the Ministry of Education, Boards of Trustees and administrative staff. This fact is generally accepted without question. While schools and teachers are not necessarily blamed for all of the ills in society, they are however, often attributed the responsibility for educating in order to alleviate social problems and are consistently expected to raise children’s achievement levels. As a connoisseur, an understanding of the expectations placed upon teachers has assisted the development of the research.

Education takes place within an institution and under the control of democratic rules, (relatively speaking), of that institution. The school environment is complex, adhering to rules and structures of the past while attempting to deal with change in a constantly developing society. Chubb and Moe (1988) argued “that the organisation of schools is largely endogenous to the system of institutional

control in which the school is embedded” (p. 1066). This goes some way in explaining the need to revert to the past, with the introduction of National Standards as an example. In such a system it seems impossible to raise achievement levels in literacy and numeracy without revisiting old methods of teaching at the expense of new and innovative teaching strategies and subjects that are relevant to a modern society. Bentley (2000) stated,

There is a serious and growing problem, as illustrated by the tension between our two sets of institutions. The old infrastructure attempts to deliver education to a specified set of rules and processes – the standardised rhythms and routines of the school day – with a framework of knowledge and standards set by society (p. 357).

While this chapter has not sought to examine the educational system in any depth, it is relevant to the study and the understanding that the researcher holds regarding a teacher’s place within an educational institution. Within the complex structure of a school, the intricacies of human interaction take place, each school offering its own internal hierarchical system. Each staffroom offers its own unique set of politics and very often a new teacher will learn intuitively or by making mistakes, like using the wrong cup or sitting in the wrong chair, a situation of which an outsider may have no awareness. As stated, research on teacher behaviors is most commonly carried out by university-based researchers who are outside of the classroom. Svinicki and McKeachnie (2010) suggested that “teachers who devise better ways to help students learn, or who do research on methods of teaching, are also scholars” (p.5). Despite this perspective, the work of teachers rarely results in published research. Cochran-Smith and Lytle (1993) pleaded for more teachers to be involved researching teacher behaviour. They discuss the contents of a Handbook of Research on Teaching and pointed out that none of the articles were written by teachers. They stated,

What is missing from the handbook are the voices of teachers themselves, the questions that teachers ask, and the interpretive frames that teachers use to understand and improve their own classroom practice (p.7).

Pajares (1992) questioned how research into teaching can be of use to teachers of teacher education. He stated, “another perspective is required from which to better understand teacher behaviours, a perspective focusing on the things and ways that teachers believe” (p.2). While this study is university-based, the researcher’s twenty-three years of teaching experience has brought an insider’s perspective to the research. As connoisseur, my privileged understanding has assisted in directing the research. The pedagogical dimension relates strongly to the role of connoisseur when examining what informs the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms. It has been established that there may be many different interpretations of the curriculum and within each interpretation every teacher will have a unique and personal approach to the teaching of dance. Woods (1986) suggested that,

Teachers often act intuitively, but it is an intuition that rests firmly on a base of learned knowledge, and which exists in an open certainty (p.3).

The role of connoisseur has provided an advantage when examining the aims and understandings of the teachers. The research has addressed the idiosyncratic messages conveyed by individual teachers and it was these messages that proved to be so valuable in the directing of this research.

### **3.4.3. Empirical Discussion**

An empirical investigation according to Colapinto (1979), recognises a level of complexity of the site, the persons involved and the diversity of meanings at play. Through observation, evidence was gained that allowed the findings to be placed in context. This accounted for the variables at play within the context of the situation in which each individual was placed. The specific context in which each case (each school) resided has informed the individual meanings that emerged. Teachers operated within the institutional bounds of a school, and the situation of the school has informed the research. It was not only the myriad of complex interactions that took place in the schools that created a context, but the buildings, grounds, and environmental issues have also played a role. Erickson (1987) suggested that,

When you walk into a school you may get a global impression of the school's distinctive tone or character. What clues led to that impression? The walls and their decorations, the floors and the way they are polished (p.11)?

Erickson stresses the importance of the physical surroundings of a school and how physical surroundings help to form the culture of a school. The physical surroundings played a determining role, which in turn influenced the attitudes of the school community who spent their days there. The key issues arising from the responses to the questioning were addressed within an empirical framework. In examining the empirical framework around the school community's attitude to dance in each of the case studies, the researchers' perceptions informed the issues, contexts and interpretations. The researcher as connoisseur, developed meaning from observation and note taking regarding the overall context of the school.

The symbiotic relationships within any culture were outlined by Eisner (2002), "We develop, in part, by responding to the contributions of others, and in turn we provide others with material to which they respond"(p.7). It was necessary to identify all the conditions influencing the interview collection. The social relationships, space, body language, tone of voice, researcher's thoughts and feelings during the interview, status of the participant within the school, and structural descriptions have all played a part in creating meaning.

The researcher has the opportunity to see things that are taken for-granted by participants and would be less likely to come to the surface using interviewing or other data collection techniques (Hatch, 2002, p. 72).

An examination of environmental factors has assisted in determining the influence on the teachers' ability to teach dance. It was not simply the space or lack of space to teach dance that affects the teaching and learning of dance, but the subtle messages that are conveyed through the buildings and grounds of the institution. Generally when a school has a range of the latest facilities, teachers and students may have feelings of being valued and supported. Such feelings are important to healthy emotional states and feelings of well-being. Jensen (2005) discussed the emotional state being linked to cognitive function and a passion for learning or teaching. "The old way of thinking about the brain envisions a separateness of mind, body and emotions. This idea is history"(p.69). The emotional state of a teacher may affect how the application of a new and possibly, challenging, subject may be applied in the classroom.

Primary teachers have historically been the one teacher for their class in any given year. While this was the case with each school involved in this study, there is a move toward more specialist teachers being brought in to teach specific subjects, allowing the general classroom teacher preparation time. Questions arose around the idea of specialist teachers in dance. How does the introduction of a specialist dance teacher impact on the generalist teacher's confidence to introduce dance in the classroom? What is the difference between student learning in a specialist led dance class and a generalist teacher led dance class? Is this important? These questions arose through reflection as a connoisseur. Borko, Liston and Whitcomb (2007) highlighted that,

Consistent and distinguishing features of interpretive research include the privileging of "insider's" perspectives and a focus on understanding sociocultural processes in natural settings in which individuals learn and teach (p.5).

Different schools in different contexts develop different teaching and learning cultures, but the teachers, students, Board of Trustees and parents within each institution are usually working toward the same goal, that of educating children. The individual perceptions and realities in each of the Case Studies have been analysed in order to arrive at some understanding of how empirical information informed the participants' attitudes in each of the case studies.

### **3.5. Material (Data) Collection Methods**

The research was conducted in three different locations, each location serving as a separate case study. The material was collected through audio recorded interviews, notes, reflections on the

interviews and from note taking during observations. From this initial material, codes and categories were generated.

### **3.5.1. The selection of Case Studies**

The design involved the selection of the cases, collection of material through interviews, observations and archival sources, the coding of the material and analysis of the outcomes. The emergent patterns across each of the case studies were reviewed and analysed, thus determining similarities, differences and outcomes.

In order to identify schools who wished to participate in the research process, several schools in the Auckland area were contacted by email or telephone. Despite already having some loose connections with some of the schools, none of those approached agreed to participate. Inner city schools felt they were already hosting enough University researchers. I initiated a different approach where letters outlining the study and the benefits to all teachers were sent to a range of schools in Auckland's western and northern suburbs. This was followed up by a telephone call once it was felt that the Principal had had time to read the letter. This approach was equally unsuccessful. One school Principal said that they were not interested because their focus for the coming year was on spelling, but the main reason given was that they were just too busy to fit anything more into their day.

It seemed that the approach regarding the process of attracting participants to the study needed to be reconsidered. A friend of the researcher rang a friend who was a Principal at a rural school in the Manuwatu. This Principal agreed to being involved. The researcher then approached a school in North Canterbury where her step-grand-daughter attends. Because of the connection, the Principal agreed to become involved. Finally, the researcher approached a school in Dunedin where she had once provided a free workshop for teachers on how to teach dance. This Principal was also agreeable to the school being involved in the study. The Principals of two of the schools and the Deputy Principal of the third school were provided with Ethics forms and information to distribute to the school community.

It appeared that personal relationships and trust were necessary components with which to open doors into schools. Shared meanings existed regarding an appreciation of arts in each of the schools which suggested that the participants in each case study may have been slanted toward a positive approach to dance. This information was acknowledged in relation to the research findings.

The initial idea was to select three different schools ranging in decile ratings and locations. The three schools involved in the study have decile ratings of 9, 8 and 7, respectively, all toward the top end of the decile range. At first it seemed important that there was a wider range within the decile ratings of the schools, but upon reflection it seemed unnecessary to make this a focus of the study. The teachers in the schools are all drawn from similar training institutions and their attitudes are shaped by their experiences in teaching. The focus of the study is upon what informs the place of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms, and not how dance is being implemented across schools with different decile ratings. It did remain important however, to select different contexts for each of the case studies so that comparisons might be made. The differences are the three contrasting geographic locations. The locations of each school range widely over geographic areas of New Zealand. They include an urban school in a city of 120,000, a semi-rural school, on the outskirts of a town of 11,871 residents, and a rural school serving a country population with no town nearby. The geographic and population differences, along with school roll sizes, provide enough diversity between each of the case studies. Case Study One, Marion Primary School has a roll of 170 students and is rated at decile 9. Stafford Primary School with a roll of 224 students, has a decile 8 rating and Swan Road Primary School is a decile 7 school with a roll of 53 students.

Approval was sought and gained from the University of Auckland's Ethics Approval Committee and forms were sent out to the participants ahead of my arrival. The individual participants in each of the case studies received an 'Information for Participants' sheet and a 'Consent Form' to be signed before the research could proceed. Such action allowed the participants to absorb the information ahead of the researcher's arrival at their school. Principals, Board of Trustee members, Deputy Principals, teachers, parents and students each received specific forms relating to their individual situation. Pseudonyms were selected for each school and only the researcher knows the true identity of each case.

Although each school is considered a case study, Stake (2005) described the ability of a case to be singular but with sub-sections, such as Principals, Deputy Principals, teachers, Board of Trustee members, parents and students within the school context. He states, "The case to be studied is a complex entity located in a milieu or situation embedded in a number of contexts or backgrounds" (p.449). Within each case study the school institution was examined under an empirical framework, so that a structure was established around the attitudes of the school community toward dance.

### **3.5.2. Qualitative Questioning and Interview Techniques**

A questioning of, 'meaning and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand Primary classrooms', directed the interviews. The main information collection methods were through semi-structured interviews along with personal reflections and observations. Narrative questioning techniques varied from person to person, but each participant was afforded the same opportunities to discuss their reality of teaching dance from a personal perspective. Invariably, relationships were developed between the researcher and the participants with a sense of 'us' being research partners being encouraged. In a similar manner to Buck (2003a), "Space was allowed for spontaneity, chance, personality, ambiguity and emotions, in other words the things that imbue partnerships with life and make them unique and cherishable" (p.77).

While parents, students and Board of Trustee members were interviewed in each of the case studies, it soon became apparent that it was the teachers, Principals and Deputy Principals who provided knowledge that was most relevant to this research. Children were interviewed in class groups and their answers to questions were recorded. Children drew pictures, wrote about their dance experiences and danced for each other. While all of the children's responses were positive, the material gained at this level lacked the depth required for this research. It is acknowledged that a future study that better accounted for children's perspectives concerning the place, meanings and delivery of dance in New Zealand classrooms would be very informative. The Board of Trustee members and parents helped provide a contextual framework for the research, but it was the teachers, Principals and deputy Principals who provided rich material for analysis, so it is for this reason that much of the research discussion is focused on teachers.

Dance is, in the main, a creative and intuitive process and people are generally creative and intuitive beings. This research employed a creative, intuitive and flexible process. Questions were designed more as discussion points that encouraged the participant to speak freely on a topic and around the point, rather than posing the type of questions that resulted in limiting the response, or led to a particular response being offered. Within a constructivist research participants' personal viewpoints emerged.

Just as people develop their own meanings of their own social experiences, they are also influenced by the meanings created by other people. Bowman (2006) reiterated an earlier point, how narrative lends itself especially well to conveying the shape and character of human experience, and "should therefore be regarded as one of the basic ways humans create and share meanings" (p7). Teachers' personal experiences and their interactions with others within the educational context may have transferred meaning about the place of dance in the primary classroom. This in turn, may have

influenced the participants' beliefs regarding how they may be supported in the implementation of dance.

Each session began with an informal discussion between the researcher and the participant, allowing the participant to feel comfortable with the researcher's understanding of the school situation. This was followed by the introduction of discussion points with the questions having been designed to assist the participant to relax, by discussing personal interests, stage in life, teaching experience, goals, life experience, and attitudes to teaching generally. What teachers teach is very much who they are and a great deal of information may be gained by identifying this important aspect of their teaching practice. Participants appeared relaxed in the interview process when discussing the aspects of their lives with which they felt most comfortable.

The following is an example of the interview questions posed to teachers in the study:

- How long have you been at this school?
- What year level are you teaching? Is this your preferred grade to teach? Why?
- What drew you to teaching?
- What are you favourite subjects to teach? Why?
- Can you talk about a positive experience you've had in teaching?
- What training or professional development have you had to assist you in the teaching of dance?
- Why do you believe that dance is included in the primary curriculum?
- What is dance for you in your classroom?
- Where do you/would you teach dance? What space would you use?
- Can you talk about any difficulties you have experienced in the teaching of dance?
- Can you discuss any perceived problems in the future implementation of dance in your classroom?
- Can you discuss the attitude of the school community toward dance?
- Can you discuss the attitude of your Principal toward teaching dance?
- What does teaching at this particular school mean to you?
- What would have to happen to change the spirit that currently exists at this school?
- Have you taught at schools where this spirit didn't exist? Can you talk about the difficulties/advantages/differences?
- How do you see the implications for dance with the introduction of National Standards?
- What do you need to feel supported in the implementation of dance in your classroom?
- Can you talk generally about dance in schools, anything that you feel you would like to talk about that we haven't covered so far?

It was important that the researcher's pre-conceived assumptions were acknowledged, so that each individual voice was able to be heard through an honest exchange. My personal ideas and values as connoisseur sometimes emerged during the questioning. A reflexive response through memo and journal-writing assisted the researcher in taking an objective, yet informed, stance and to allow



material to be created for interpretation. As a researcher, however, I do not know all there is to know and self-reflexivity has not only assisted in interpreting the data but also brought enlightenment toward aspects of self. Fontana & Frey (2005) made the point that, "Some researchers are becoming keenly attuned to the fact that in knowing others we come to know ourselves" (p. 697). Grumet (1990) stated,

If it is as a teacher that I engage in inquiry into teaching, then I do not deny or disguise my relation to the object of that inquiry but make that relation the object of the inquiry itself (p.105).

Having an understanding of teachers within a school context assisted in narrowing the shaping of the questioning and guiding the conversations. As Grumet (1990) stated,

If teaching is about our relations to the world, then we must let the world into our method. If the world we have comes to us through our relations with other people, then those relations as they appear in the transference, ideologies, and systems of thought that shape our culture must be there too (p.107).

While this researcher's personal ideas and values have been an integral aspect of the research findings, and have shaped the analysis of material, the construction of meaning values all participants in the study. The importance of establishing a rapport was acknowledged and established between the interviewer and the interviewee allowing reliable data to be collected. There was a need to "relate to others on their own terms" (Taylor & Bogdan, 1998, p. 99). Feedman and Combs (1996) stressed the importance of valuing each individual story,

We want to develop an understanding of the influence on particular people of the dominant stories of their culture while cherishing the knowledge that each person's stories are different from anyone else's (p.33).

Taking the time to establish a rapport with the participants supported the intent that they may be more forthcoming with their own beliefs and attitudes when they feel that they are supported in what they are saying. Taylor and Bogdan (1998) reminded the researcher, "qualitative researchers empathise and identify with the people they study in order to understand how those people see things" (p.7). I attempted to find a balance between remaining objective to the meanings of others and bringing empathy and identification to the process. Participants in the study placed different meanings on the same situation depending on their position, personal bias and experience. Eisner (1998a) adopted the belief that students have genetically determined proclivities or aptitudes (p.102). Should this be the case, then the same might be said for the teachers. It was important to ascertain each teacher's attitude toward the teaching of dance, which may not have been successfully achieved by direct questioning. Chase (2005) stated,

As narrators, then, researchers develop meaning out of, and some sense of order in, the material they studied; they develop their own voice as they construct others' voices and realities; they narrate results in ways that are both enabled and constrained by the social resources and circumstances embedded in their disciplines (p.657).

The interviews were conducted face to face and were on a one to one basis. Questioning was structured so that relevant information and attitudes could be drawn from the participants. Taylor and Bogdan (1998) stated that, "information and attitudes exist inside people's heads and can be elicited by asking the right questions in the right way" (p.98). This required a flexible approach on the part of the researcher who looked beneath the face value of what was being said by probing for deeper meanings and insights. Maykut and Morehouse (1994) suggested that, "it is the qualitative interviewer's job to be alert and responsive, to sense an opportune time to ask a question and to know when a question has been answered out of sequence" (p.94). Eisner (1998a) advised "how to say, what to say, and how to say it requires a consideration of its effect on the audience to whom one speaks or writes" (p.117). I concur with that assertion and align my position with Wolcott (1990). He discussed the importance of listening, not only as a way of hearing the information in order to follow up the discussion, but also of knowing when the participant requires some input from the researcher to reassure, clarify, prompt further discussion or take a moment to paraphrase the participant's words. There were occasions when a participant realised that what they said, was not necessarily what they meant, and would seek to clarify meaning. The complexity of verbal communication is acknowledged and as Hobson (1985) stated,

In any interview or, indeed in any conversation, each person is always saying something relevant to: (i) himself and his life situation (ii) another person (iii) the nature and setting of the interview, (its structure, its purpose, the non-human environment)" (p.179).

It was the researcher's responsibility to uncover what it was that had been said.

Open ended interview questioning drove the interview with non-directive and open discussion, yet the interviewer attempted to steer interviewees and keep the content relevant to the research. The researcher responded to the content of the interview by intuitively knowing when to ask the descriptive question, the 'how' questions, or the structural, comparative, or evaluative questions. A reflexive process allowed the researcher to determine whether the discussion points or questioning needed to be changed or adapted during the interview period. Charmaz (2003) reminded the researcher that, "The interview is a directed conversation and requires a certain amount of flexibility so that ideas and issues can emerge" (p.311). As part of the reflexive process, observational notes were taken regarding the interviewee's physical presence and behaviour during the process of the interview.

Participants were asked to speak of their attitude to teaching generally, as the pressures that individual teachers find themselves under within their day to day professional lives inform their attitudes toward dance. Eisner (1998a) discussed the teacher's day as a packed schedule with little time or space for reflection on their teaching practice. "All too often teachers suffer from secondary ignorance, that state of being in which we do not know what we do not know" (p.115). To uncover such information was a difficult challenge for the researcher, but by guiding the participant to reflect on various issues, information emerged that may otherwise have remained undiscovered.

Analysis of what was missing from the collected material was as important as what emerged from the interviews. Often in communication, there are shared unstated assumptions and unarticulated meanings that could have a similar significance to the stated material. As Charmaz (2005) stated, "the most important issues to study may be hidden, tacit or elusive" (p.90). Charmaz went on to discuss the importance of nuances of meaning and process and how "the meanings emerge from a particular viewpoint and the vocabulary we invoke to make sense of them" (p.90).

In many instances, it is important to select participants to interview, as the process is time consuming and often participants who are not involved or interested in the topic may not provide any useful information. In this instance however, it was just as important to interview those with little interest or understanding of dance in schools as those with a passion for dance. Both points of view were relevant to the study. In order to understand the school climate or culture of the school, all members of the school community were offered the opportunity to be interviewed. This included, Principals, Deputy Principals, members of the Boards of Trustees, parents, teachers and students. Within a constructivist methodology it was the participants, each interviewed on one occasion, who brought forth material and the quality of that information was dependent upon the depth of sharing that took place.

The stories that unfolded from each participant's individual reality formed a broad narrative that, when analysed, addressed the research question. The smaller streams of information that flowed beneath the surface, informed what was seen above ground and when the data was analysed new meanings emerged that may not have otherwise been visible.

### **3.6. Material Analysis**

In this chapter I discuss how material was obtained, coded and prepared for analysis over three case studies and how through a constant comparative method, material was systematically developed, resulting in units of meaning. Trustworthiness and Integrity is addressed in order to document the integrity of this research.

### 3.6.1. Recording and analysing the material

All interviews were recorded on a digital recording device. A journal of personal observations was kept of thoughts, feelings and any 'gut' reactions that emerged during the course of the interviews. Empirical discussions were recorded and reflected upon throughout the research process. Photographs of the facilities and environmental factors that informed each case study supported the analysis. Taylor and Bogdan (1998) concurred,

The pictures people take lend insight into what is important to them and how they view themselves and others. Photographs can be analysed the same way as any other kind of personal document or archival material (p.127).

While photography is often limited to social ethnographic research, the school grounds and buildings were important to the study in gaining understanding of some of the contextual issues that affected the participants.

Although social research is typically in the service of complex theoretical and abstract questions, it can be used as primary data, visual information that needs not be in the form of written words or numbers (Loizos, 2000, p. 93).

In this study, visual images were not relied upon as primary evidence, but instead, the photographs supported the note-taking and empirical discussion. The camera caught only an aspect of the content matter under observation.

All recorded interviews were typed verbatim so that printed pages could be coded. Initially, chunks of meaning were identified according to the questions posed, and answers summarised for each case study before the coding of the typewritten pages commenced. These summaries were designed to assist in clarifying areas of importance and to identify where meanings overlapped. Codes were then recorded on each page alongside the sections referencing particular units of meaning. The coding determined the particular case study and the meaning. Codes identified the following participant meanings:

Favourite subjects; The way in which dance is currently taught in the classroom; Comments on National Standards; Greatest achievements or special moments in teaching; School culture positive comments; School culture negative comments; Understanding the importance of dance to children's development; Teaching across the curriculum; Time problems; Physical environment; Perceptions of what dance is in the classroom; Suggested Professional Development – what do teachers need to implement dance?; Attitude to teaching generally; Attitude toward teaching dance; Participants' backgrounds; Suggested improvements on how dance could be taught; Professional Development – what has been offered or completed in the past; Space problems; Concerns about teaching, and, Insightful comments.

Each unit of meaning emerging from the research was awarded a code, copied and transferred onto a card system. Codes initially identified responses to the interview questions, however, within main

categories, sub-categories emerged that required coding. While it was not possible to allocate a code to every emergent category, the researcher examined the research question in relation to what was being included as much as to what was left out. Edwards and Lampert (1993) stated,

coding is not just a matter of deciding what to classify and how to represent it. In fact, when more than a single variable is involved, coding frequently requires the development of a highly structured and hierarchically arranged system that can be used not only to relate variables to one another, but also to generate and test hypotheses (p.170).

Mishler (1986) outlined his hallmark for a quality coding manual.

It must be sufficiently detailed for coders to distinguish categories and sub-categories from each other in terms of their intended core definitions and their respected range of reference. At the same time it must be sufficiently abstract for codes to be applied to new responses that vary in specific features from the manual's exemplars (p.4).

The material that emerged from each case study was not necessarily straightforward and therefore emergent sub-sections were often identified with a larger theme. Maykut and Morehouse (1994) suggested that, "The search for meaning is accomplished by first identifying the smaller units of meaning in the data, which will later serve as the basis for defining larger categories of meaning" (p.128). The categories were then further refined as the researcher examined the material for relationships and patterns across the different coded categories. Once categories had been identified and coded they were refined and the researcher determined a hierarchy for inclusion in an analysis and discussion. The material was then analysed and discussed.

"Richie and Spencer (2002) stated, "Qualitative data analysis is essentially about detection, and the tasks of defining, categorising, theorising, explaining, exploring and mapping are fundamental to an analyst's role" (p. 309). When complex material emerged from each of the case studies it was then analysed alongside literature leading to conclusions related to the research question. Schofield (1990) outlined an analysis employing a case study method,

First, the literature relevant to one's interest is located. Then these studies are subjected to close scrutiny, so that those failing to meet certain crucial methodological requirements can be removed from the set to be analysed. Then the coders go through each of the remaining case studies with the goal of using the information contained therein to complete a set of closed-ended questions (p.222).

While the research question formed a positioning focus when generating codes and categories, there was no pre-determined hypotheses and the meaning that emerged from the collection was respected. A constant comparative analysis was employed as according to Glasser (1965), "The purpose of the constant comparative method of joint coding and analysis is to generate theory more systematically" (p.437). A systematic development was essential as each of the three case studies

contained between fifteen and thirty interviews. The large number of interviews provided a breadth and depth to the research, increasing the study's opportunity to gain rich material that speaks to the complexity of teaching. The range of different attitudes toward the teaching of dance that emerged from each of the participants was equally valued and included in the analysis. Emergent informal statements of value were coded and analysed alongside the formal interview material. In this research it was important to discover associations between experiences and attitudes, between attitudes and behaviours and between circumstances and motivations (Ritchie & Spencer, 2002).

Having established a superficial summary, the material was re-examined in order to identify important areas for discussion. The findings were then written and summarised applying the constant comparative analysis method, this being compatible with a constructivist methodology.

### **3.6.2. Trustworthiness and Integrity**

All research gains credibility when there are rigorous and trustworthy processes in place. Remaining true to a phenomenological paradigm with a focus on lived human experience has preserved the integrity of this research.

Lincoln and Guba (1986) discussed the concept of fairness in inquiry, "Fairness may be defined as a balanced view that presents all constructions and the values that undergird them" (p.20). The term 'fairness,' is generally related to game playing, however within academic inquiry, rules of research may constitute the game, as a set of rules combined with honesty and integrity were vital components in this research.

A term adopted by Arminio and Hultgren (2002) is goodness, which in the context of academic research relates to rigour (Arminio & Hultgren, 2002; Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 1993; Denzin & Lincoln, 2000; Tobin & Begley, 2003). The concept of goodness relates to the way in which this entire study has been conducted. To the researcher, goodness is not a separate methodological construct, but an overarching component of the research process. Arminio and Hultgren (2002) listed six elements in an interpretative study that identify goodness and these elements relate closely to this research.

1. Foundation (epistemology and theory) – this provides the philosophical stance and gives context to and informs the study.
2. Approach (methodology) – specific grounding of the study's logic and criteria.
3. Collection of data (method) – explicitness about data collection and management.
4. Representation of voice (researcher and participant as multicultural subjects) – researchers reflect on their relationship with participants and the phenomena under exploration.
5. The art of meaning making (interpretation and presentation) – the process of presenting new insights through the data and chosen methodology.
6. Implication for professional practice (recommendations) (p.460).

Arminio and Hultgren's (2002) elements of goodness as listed above, are appropriate to this study, and are addressed in turn and thus outlining the care and professionalism with which this study has been conducted.

The foundations of this research are grounded in the philosophical theories of Kant, Hegel, Dewey, Piaget and Eisner. Overlapping theoretical principles from each philosophy inform and develop this research. Eisner is the most recent philosopher whose theories have been included in this research. His connoisseurship theory was adopted to allow informed discriminations in the material selection and value.

Each of these philosophies aligns with a constructivist methodology that is central to this research. Piaget's theory of constructivism allowed this research to develop and evolve as conceptual changes took place during the course of the study. The conceptual changes were the result of the action and experience central to this educational research (Carey, 1987).

Study design considerations have formed an important function in this research. Each case study was set in a geographically different location with school populations that ranged in size.

As stated, material was collected through a series of interviews at each school, recorded on a digital audio device and then transcribed verbatim. Tobin and Begley (2003) stated, "Dependability can then be demonstrated through an audit trail, where others can examine the inquirer's documentation of data, methods, decisions and end product" (p.392). The art of meaning making in this research involved the coding of the transcribed interviews, the creation of cards with chunks of material on each being ready for analysis, according to their code. The various codes were then examined and rated in importance. The categories informed the discussion and assisted in allowing implications to emerge from the data.

In addressing a representation of voice, it is clear that this research involved real people and a researcher with the interest and experience of a connoisseur. As a researcher, I acknowledge my specific perspective informed by my life experience and twenty-three years of dance teaching. In this instance, the role of connoisseurship was significant. An examination of meaning was open to interpretation by the researcher. Lincoln & Guba (1986) stated,

The interactive nature of the relationship is prized, since it is only because of this feature that inquirers and respondents may fruitfully learn together. The relationship between researcher and respondent, when properly established, is one of respectful negotiation, joint control, and reciprocal learning (p.17).

Arminio and Hultgren (2002) discussed the dilemma of a researcher when examining evidence,

Researchers and participants are partners in the generation of meaning. Subjectivism, on the other hand, does not come about from an interplay between researcher and participants but rather is imposed by the researcher in light of critical examination of meaning (p. 2).

An important aspect to consider in this research has been the consideration of whether the interpretations made from the data are credible and truthful. The interpretations have been justified by evidence emerging from the material. Schwandt (2007) stated, “evidence does matter, the very act of generating evidence or identifying something as evidence is itself an interpretation” (p.11). The language used throughout the research remains as true as possible to the language used by the participants themselves. Although it is not possible to record nuances when transcribing interviews, where possible, comments were written alongside the transcriptions. It was also important to question participants to elicit deeper meanings, for as Polkinghorne (2005) stated, “participants vary in their facility to explore experience and express their experience in language” (p.3). It was important to outline all the evidence relating to a specific question, so that decisions were made and justified regarding one interpretation as being better than another. Cresswell and Miller (2000) discussed the particular lens of the researcher,

Researchers determine how long to remain in the field, whether the data are saturated to establish good themes or categories and how the analysis of the data evolves into a persuasive narrative. Patton (2002) describes this process as one where qualitative analysts return to their data “over and over again to see if the constructs, categories, explanations and interpretations make sense” (p. 339). Altheide and Johnson (1994) refer to it as “validity-as-reflexive-accounting” (p.489) where the researchers, the topic and the sense-making interact (p. 125).

New insights have emerged from the material collected and Chapter 6.2 addresses the implications for professional practice. Arminio and Hultgren’s (2002) elements of goodness have provided an overarching framework with which to identify the trustworthiness and integrity of my interactive research process. Care and professionalism have been applied throughout the research process from its philosophical stance through to its implications for professional practice.

### **3.6.3. Summary**

The research question, ‘What are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms?’ was addressed through qualitative research within a constructivist methodology allowing an examination of an emergent discourse where individual meanings emerged through a series of interviews. Forty-eight interviews were conducted including Principals, Deputy Principals, teachers, students, parents and Board of Trustee members over three case studies. Material that emerged from the interviews was recorded, coded, and analysed. Supporting material included personal journal reflections and photographs. A constant comparative analysis



was employed to identify and summarise the emergent material for discussion. In establishing trustworthiness and integrity Arminio and Hultgren's (2002) elements of goodness were adopted with which to address discussion points. Chapter Four shares the dominant findings emerging from the research.

# Chapter 4. Participants’ Narratives

This chapter presents the participants’ narratives. With forty-eight participants in this study, and with a research intent that allows for multiple voices, I have chosen to summarise the results of the interviews by placing participants’ narratives within their empirical contexts under the following headings: Introduction, including School Context, Teacher Background and Experience and Attitude to Teaching; Meanings of Dance in the School Community; Perceived Problems: Why Dance is Not a Focus; Professional Development; A Cross-Curricular Approach to Teaching Dance; and What the Children said. These headings allow a clear presentation of the narratives and are deliberately broad and inclusive. By documenting the narratives in this manner, all voices are included equally.

As stated, each of the three schools, and all persons interviewed involved in the research were allocated a pseudonym. Marion Primary School is in North Canterbury, (mid-east coast, South Island, New Zealand), Stafford Primary School, is an urban school in Otago, (lower east coast of the South Island) and Swan Road primary School is in the Manawatu region, (mid North Island) in a rural setting. Each school is introduced, followed by the narratives gained within each case study (school).

## 4.1 Marion Primary School

The following photos provide visual images to accompany the written descriptions included in this chapter. Pic.1 reveals a school hall on the right with three classrooms facing a tree-lined courtyard. Pic. 2 extends the view from the classroom to the left of pic.1 to the administration building and staff-room.



(Pic.1)



(pic.2)

The first case study interviews were conducted during February of 2010 at Marion Primary School in North Canterbury. The male Principal, Adam McCarthy and the female Deputy Principal, Pam Bradley, were relaxed and welcoming. A dance trophy sat in pride of place in the foyer of the administration building. Adam, the Principal, had won it in 'Dancing with the Staff', a Latin American dance competition involving staff from three other schools in the area. Another school had entered their entire staff plus their Board of Trustees and P.T.A. members. Adam jokingly commented that it was probably his shirt that had won him the award. He and his Deputy and most other staff members were happy to give up release time to come and be interviewed. In total, seventeen interviews were conducted at Marion School.

When interviewing students, the format was to record students' answers in response to the questioning, then to involve students in a writing exercise, after which they were asked to draw themselves dancing. The student sessions finished with students performing their favourite moves to the rest of the class.

The Principal appeared enthusiastic about the study being conducted. He appreciated the value of the arts in education. Adam stated,

Coming from a musical theatrical family, it's a great way to learn. I don't know if you noticed but last night while we were waiting for things to kick off, there were a group of young ladies and men doing their best Madonna impersonations? They felt that was their way of expressing themselves and I thought it was great.

His comfortable body language and expression conveyed a confidence in talking about dance. This enthusiasm was also evident in the other teachers who were interviewed. They were happy to share their opinions.

Marion Primary School provided a pleasant research environment. A space was provided in the photocopy/resource room in which to conduct interviews. I was given access to a photocopier and participants were sent to me according to the time allocations that they were given. This worked very well. The outlook was onto a landscaped garden area with classrooms beyond. The dance resources were easily accessed on a shelf in this room and were able to be pointed out to the participants. Most teachers were not aware that they were there.

The February days were sunny, large established trees provided shade. Classrooms and a school hall formed a 'U' shape around a paved playing area with a large grassed oval beyond. Other classrooms were behind the hall but designed to face in toward the paved playground space. It appeared from the colour and design, that the Hall had been a more recent addition to the school, and like many New Zealand schools, more rooms had been added as the school expanded. The size of the school ensured that class sizes contained less than 30 students. One class had as few as 12 students, while in the senior school, the numbers had crept up to 28. The school had grown through the 'good name' it had in the area.

The staff-room and administration offices, as evidenced in a photograph, were easily accessible from all classrooms. The staff-room had two white boards, one showing official messages for all staff and the other showing more informal notes from one member of staff to another. Some teachers were going on an excursion to 'Busting Out' and other outings were advertised. All staff paid \$25 per year that went into a fund to finance presents for birthdays, the arrival of new babies, funerals and similar events. There were many cups in the staffroom and it seemed that visitors could use

whichever cup they liked, unlike some staffrooms I have worked in where individuals were very precious about using their own cups. Jokes were made at David's expense as he had been known to have twenty-five cups in his room at one time, being too lazy to bring them back to the staffroom to put in the dishwasher. A friendly and relaxed atmosphere prevailed. Alison, a teacher, spent her time in the staffroom knitting socks.

On the first night after arriving at Marion School, I attended a Meet the Parents Evening/Barbeque. An expert was brought in to speak to the parents about a new move toward home learning, rather than homework. Instead of setting meaningless homework for students, like title pages, spelling lists that are proven not to work, or work sheets that don't address individual learning, it was suggested that extra-curricular activities such as dance and sport were seen as home learning and credited accordingly. Other activities such as cooking a meal or the making of a craft object are examples of the many ways in which students can design their own program of home learning. All but two of the parents were in favour of the change. The information evening was the school's method of educating the parents about the new strategies being implemented. The barbeque provided parents with the opportunity to talk informally amongst themselves and with the teachers. Following the formal presentation, parents went to their children's classrooms where individual teachers spoke about their programs and the year ahead.

Two parents who were against the change were quite outspoken in their views. Bill felt that the change had been sprung upon him without consultation and was a great believer in what worked for him would work for his daughter. The other opponent, Michelle who was heavily involved in the education of her children believed that the time she spent with them doing homework was very valuable and could not be replaced. Although these two parents were not holding the majority view, they dominated the discussions.

During the period when people were eating and talking informally, a group of students, five girls and one boy, danced in the centre of the space to the background music that was playing. They all moved together with set steps that I later learned were Jump Jam moves that had been put together by the students themselves.

## **4.2 Stafford Primary School**

Pic.3 provides an image of an original classroom block, built in 1964 while pic.4 shows the space problems within the school. This storage room held uniforms, computer equipment, cooking gear and miscellaneous items, and was used as an office in which I conducted interviews.



Pic.3



Pic.4

Stafford Primary School is situated in a city suburb. A booking schedule on a white board in the staffroom awaited my arrival. I had liaised with the Deputy Principal, Sylvia, regarding my visit which she had organised. I interviewed every member of staff and approximately two hundred students. Twenty-two interviews were conducted which included the Principal and the teaching Deputy Principal. The Chairperson of the Board of Trustees was also interviewed. I visited each of the ten classrooms, interviewing students in their classroom groups, repeating the same format as documented for the Marion School students.

The morning of my arrival was also the morning that eighteen student teachers arrived at the school for the first time. They were made to feel welcome and were included in informal staffroom discussions among staff members. The foyer of the school had a screen rolling over in a continuous loop cycle showing pictures of the students involved in various activities. There were also stories up on the wall that had been written by students about the school cat, whose name was Gracie. Gracie,

a grumpy cat, lay across the front entrance of the school. Her food was on the floor of the staffroom and the caretaker took care of her during weekends.

Class sizes were around an average of 30 at Stafford School. I was known at this school as I had conducted a free workshop for teachers in 2008 on how to teach dance. The friendly staff were happy to be interviewed, if not, in some instances, a little nervous. The school administration fund had paid for relief teachers to be employed so that classes could be covered during the interviews. Each interview was timetabled to run for forty-five minutes. The whole process ran very smoothly as the teachers had all read the Ethics Forms and had been issued with timetables in advance of my arrival.

Stafford Primary School sits in a valley, surrounded by hilly suburbs and is set in 5 acres of open space, divided into grassed areas, an adventure playground, and sealed all weather games areas. The room I had been allocated in which to conduct interviews was a converted veranda area, currently being used for storage, as shown in pic.4. I considered myself fortunate to have been provided with an area when space was at such a premium. There would have been little privacy anywhere else in the school.

The staff members were well established and some teachers commented that they are not threatened by new ideas, that they embrace new members of staff, and that this has ensured a continual flow of good relations and trust throughout the school community. The rooms were colourful and displayed student work. One classroom had drawings of each student strung up across the room with comments from the students regarding what they wanted to be when they grow up. Two students had written that they wanted to be teachers and one girl had written that she wanted to be the Principal because she liked to be in charge.

The staff seemed to have a never-ending supply of cakes that were brought in by staff members or in some instances, parents. Joy explained that there were a group of three or four parents who had named themselves 'Mums in Touch' and "bake something and bring it in with a wee card with it. It's probably the character of the school. That's probably the best thing about being here".

There was interaction between staff and student teachers in the group seating arrangements that formed in the staffroom and although some of the conversation was personal, the teachers also discussed student concerns and school organisational matters. There was not a lot of space in the staffroom which didn't appear to bother anyone.



### 4.3 Swan Road Primary School

Pic.5 provides a view of Swan Road Primary School from the front. The Principal's office is to the right, administration office in the centre with a staffroom to the left side of the main building. Classrooms can be seen to the far left. Pic.6 provides a rural aspect from the back of the school.



Pic.5



Pic.6

Swan Road Primary School is situated in the middle of the countryside, a forty minute drive from the nearest town. The school has 53 students, three teaching staff, one of whom is the Principal, and a teaching assistant. Two of the classes have 19 students and one has 16. Swan Road Primary School's relative isolation means that their neighbours are sheep and a few families from houses situated on the other side of the road. A church hall across the road is used by the school for Religious Education



lessons. A large hall is situated in the school grounds, having been moved to the school from a position further up the road. The classrooms are well decorated and one room has a wood-burning stove in the middle of it. Farming is the main occupation of the families whose children attend the school and some parents drive many kilometres to bring their children to school every day.

The Principal's office is decorated with laminated articles about her sons who have distinguished themselves flying, and an article about her daughter who had also been interviewed by the local newspaper. During the morning tea and lunch breaks, students either rode their bikes in the basketball court area or in a paddock where an obstacle course had been set up for them. There was no opportunity for me to sit and observe the staffroom fellowship as the interviews were squeezed into non-teaching time. With only three teachers in the school, usually one or two were outside on playground duty during the non-teaching periods.

The interviews were conducted in the Principal's office as she had a full teaching load. The phone rang quite often and if the part-time receptionist was not at her desk, it would continue to ring until such time as someone would answer it from their classroom.

I was accommodated at the Principal's house on a farm, a ten minute drive from the school. Several parents and Board of Trustee members had been approached and came to speak with me during the day I spent at the school. The teaching staff made themselves available for interviews as they were able. The Principal was interviewed after school, when the staff meeting had finished. Each of the three classrooms were visited and interviews and activities were conducted with the students.

The foyer of the school had wall hangings on the back wall that had been created by students in 1994 and 2003. A chart on the side wall stated 'We can, we will, we are – confident connected actively involved life-long learners'.

#### **4.4 The school environment and teaching.**

Interview material provided information that created a context in which to place the participants. The following chapter provides the reader with an overview of teachers' years of experience and an insight into thoughts and feelings regarding participants' beliefs around their school culture and the subjects taught.

##### **4.4.1 Marion Primary School**

Of the six teachers interviewed, five had been teaching at Marion School for an average of 7.8 years. Julie was not included in this statistic. She had been at the school for just four weeks. She had re-

trained in New Zealand as a teacher after gaining qualifications and experience running her own nanny agency, and working in the U.K. as a P.A., followed by thirteen years as a charity worker in Bulgaria working with street children. Julie had completed her practicum at Marion School and applied for the position that was created when Lara took leave. Julie was enthusiastic and said,

So yeah, it's taken me 40 odd years to... I love coming to work. I know it's a bit of a honeymoon period at the moment in week four, but I love it, I just love it.

While participants outlined specific problems that exist in the education system, they all seemed to enjoy coming to school each day and interacting with the children. David stated,

I think it's just fun. The kids have got to have fun and they've got to be happy. That's a big one and that's why I kind of like children.

Amanda reiterated, "Oh I love it, I love it yes, it's a really positive environment, the kids are fantastic".

Deb summarised the opinion of everyone who was interviewed regarding the school spirit:

A really positive family spirit exists here because of the teachers, the community, and the Principal. We foster that the whole time. We're one big family and we work together, we're a team.

Adam discussed his pride in putting a team and scheme program in place which leads the staff on to promotion and in the growth of the school. Four extra classrooms had been added over a period of time. He stated,

People want to come to this school and I think it's the general way that kids get on with each other, and like leading their learning, and also I like getting out there and running stuff for them. That sort of thing makes you feel good.

Teachers were asked what their favourite subjects were to teach, and although reading, poetry, visual arts and maths were offered, Deb's statement tended to sum up the overall position of the non-specialist roles of the primary school teacher.

My favourite subjects to teach are mainly visual art, art, um I probably like them all which is crazy, but I love language and I love English and the arts, I love the arts. I enjoy teaching maths, I just enjoy teaching. You know I love seeing that growth and the little spark from the kids and what have you, but I do love the arts. I don't do much dance. (laughs).

Pam explained that a former Marion School teacher who had moved to Auckland "had always been responsible for music and choir". Adam discussed this same 'lovely' teacher who had been on staff who could play the flute to orchestral level, who loved dance and drama and ran some productions. He stated,

she was hemmed in by the constraints of check boxes, numeracy and literacy. She went off and did her own thing. I felt sorry for the fact that we have to force this on our staff when they probably want to express themselves in other ways.

#### **4.4.2 Stafford Primary School**

The average length of time that the thirteen teachers had been at the school was eleven years. Some teachers had not taught anywhere else. A positive attitude toward the school community existed. Margie said that the school was “very good and supportive, cordial and helpful. All the relievers that come here say it’s nice to feel welcome”. I spoke informally to a reliever myself who offered the same sentiments. Joy concurred, “Nobody has their own seat in the staffroom. I’ve relieved in schools where that used to happen, wouldn’t share things and kept to themselves”. There were no negative comments about the school spirit. Melanie’s enthusiasm summed up all of the comments that participants made about the school community:

I love it. It’s just such a happy, safe staff. Everyone gets on and everyone cares about each other. I’ve often thought that I’d like to work my way up to school management, but you know, at the moment I wouldn’t want to even think about it. I just love where I am and the people I’m with.

Literacy and numeracy seemed to dominate the favourite subjects for these teachers and there was considerable discussion about the excellent programs that the school ran in these areas. The teachers were confident with all the in-service training that had been provided and took pride in being in a ‘literacy and numeracy’ school. Melanie stated,

I like the literacy, especially the literacy program that we use because I feel confident with it too and I’ve gone out and trained other teachers in other schools with it, so it’s something that I feel quite passionate about, and numeracy because I’m in charge of junior numeracy and again I feel quite passionate about that.

During the first term, Claire Alexander, a music specialist had been employed at the school for two full days each week. Claire received glowing comments from every member of staff. From what I observed, movement was an important component in her music sessions.

#### **4.4.3 Swan Road Primary School**

The Principal had been at Swan Road Primary School for twenty-five years. Of the other staff members, Kim had been there three years and Dean, just one year. The research participants conveyed a belief regarding a positive school spirit, the school spirit reflecting a sense of country community. Nicky, one of the parents commented.

The school is very welcoming and deliberately involves the families and the wider community and they make use of the skills around. I think that's one of the big things and it's got that nice smaller school feel about it really.

The country community was emphasised as something unique where everyone is involved in the children's education. Kim cited instances where people in the community who do not have children at the school are involved with the students at Swan Road School.

We have writers in our community, so the children write to those people, and get letters back. ... when you've got a science fair project you can mentor the children through someone in the community. Using our community well creates a positive feel for more than just the school community.

At Swan Road School the number of parents and Board of Trustees members who were interviewed was greater than the number of teachers interviewed. Parents were from farms and two of the parents had a real appreciation of the importance of dance in the development of children's intelligence. One of the parents was studying for a Theology degree and had done a paper at the University of Otago, titled *Worship and Performing Arts*, involving dance.

## **4.5 Meanings of dance in the school community**

Questions were posed that allowed the participants to reflect upon their own personal meanings of dance within the school community.

### **4.5.1 Marion Primary School**

It emerged through the course of the interviews that dance and drama are often considered one and the same by many teachers. The majority of participants who felt that what they were doing was drama and not dance, tended to be confused by the creative aspect of dance. Deb decided to turn the questioning round and interview the researcher asking, "How do you see dance?" When I suggested that it could be creative movement stemming from the child, the response was "Oh, like drama?" Pam qualified her merging of drama and dance into one because she teaches the new entrants and she felt that "the dramatic side of turning yourself into a kangaroo and then dancing around like a kangaroo merges into movement".

While some parents and Board of Trustee members considered that dance was what you did as an extra-curricular activity or in a school production, the teachers tended to understand that dance was more than Jump Jam. Most people knew that dance offered more than physical exercise. Adam, the Principal, was a strong advocate for dance stating,

it's a great way to learn, it's a great way to express yourself. There are children who may not be able to express themselves with pen and paper but they can do it in dance.

Lara highlighted the sense of ownership stemming from students working together to create dance:

I just got them moving and in groups, hear the rhythm, count the beats, make up some steps to it, let's share it, let's put it all together, we've just made a dance. It's simpler, more simple than them all doing it together and doing it as a group made it less focussed and so we included all of their work and put it together. They made it up and put it together, it was theirs.

Despite Adam's appreciation of the benefits of dance, he acknowledged that dance was not taught often or generally incorporated into lessons. He spoke at length about productions that the school had staged, focussing particularly on the opportunities for the development of self-confidence for the children. The previous year, Adam had employed an old friend to come in and work with each of the classes in dance to create a whole school production. The production was an amazing success and drew a crowd of five to six hundred people when there are only a hundred and five families in the school. Adam spoke honestly when he summed up the school's reality of what dance was at Marion:

parents who've had children from dramatic backgrounds know that every second year their kid's going to get a chance to shine, but it may be too far. I mean we look at our curriculum that we have to check off and we say, well every second year we'll have a production and that covers drama and dance and so on, total discharge.

Besides the school productions the other main focus on dance at Marion School was Jump Jam. The whole school community is aware of Jump Jam. When asked what dance meant to her at Marion school, Deb questioned, "Have you heard of Jump Jam?" Jill wasn't sure about her answer and stated, "We do lots of Jump Jam that involves dance but we don't consider that dance; ... now that I'm sitting talking about it, that's another component. It's movement to music, routines...". Bill, a parent, discusses what dance means to him at his daughter's school:

Oh, fun I suppose – fun – fun that's what, the kids seem to enjoy their dance, like they've got Jump Jam down there and the kids actually seem to be quite competitive when it comes to that, so if they are being competitive about it, they've got to be enjoying it, haven't they?

#### **4.5.2 Stafford Primary School**

Caroline was the only teacher at the school who consciously set about including dance in her program. Her comments reflected her passion for dance. "I think it's a form of expression... to me I think it's a part of life in general, it's not as isolated as some people think". Although the other teachers did not consciously plan for dance in their programs, they all had an appreciation of the

importance of dance. Margaret's comments conveyed an understanding of the power of dance as a means of expression:

expression, creativity, problem solving, a different medium for children who need that medium or love that medium. For some kids it would be the best way of expressing themselves. You always get the kids who don't like art or don't like something else, but through dance they can actually express what they feel. I do actually believe that.

Some teachers were incorporating dance without any conscious planning. Melanie was aware that she was incorporating simple movement activities throughout the day such as:

we had the ants go marching two by two and actually getting them to join into groups and having them stand up on their tippy toes and then get down low, movement of high and low and in-between to miming.

Melanie referred to teaching a sequence of dance as being more difficult for the students to remember which suggested that despite having a clear understanding of the value of dance, she still saw dance as the teacher demonstrating movements for students to copy. Despite this thinking, Melanie also understood:

It's a great way for kids to express themselves...and there's those things that go with it, coordination and confidence and balance and all those skills as well. It's to help self-esteem, even like your fine motor skills and just having the confidence to get up in front of a group, and it's not always presenting, but it can be a part of it; and for some kids, dance can be a way of dealing with bad behaviour and things like that.

Joy liked to teach folk dancing because she knew how. Bridie also spoke of doing folk dance in the winter. Joy discussed some dance that the students were performing for news and when I suggested that some dance was being done in her room, Joy responded "well the children are doing it, yes, not led by me but I'm giving them the opportunity to". Bridie's discussed how her class just,

dance around to songs, that you would do with just songs... I'd like to do more probably because what I do is pretty basic, just dancing around with... but I wouldn't call it real dance, probably.

Suzanne reflected on her students performing the Waiata and Korero. She indicated that she would like to get back into folk dancing because at a school she had relieved at years ago, they did it once a week and the kids enjoyed it. "It's a change from sitting at a desk". Despite the references to folk dance by several teachers, it hadn't been included at Stafford School for at least two years because of space problems.

Jump Jam was the main method of including dance in the school program. John is the lead teacher of P.E. and felt that Jump Jam fulfilled several roles, integrating elements that are normally left out because of time constraints. Acknowledging his professional development as a pre-service teacher,

John explained how students could take the steps from Jump Jam and create their own dances. In that way the aerobic activity that Jump Jam offers was able to include a creative dimension to fulfil both the requirements of the Physical Education and Dance Curriculums.

The previous year, Kapa Haka had been introduced into the school for the first time. It offered students who chose to be involved a different means of expression. Melanie explains,

a wee Tokelauan boy and a wee Maori boy and they joined up with it and they just loved it and they go from being in class, quite unconfident, to doing something like this and it's sort of like they've found their wee niche and they were able to teach other children and it was giving them the control and it was showing them. Everyone's got different strengths.

School productions had been part of the school culture at Stafford Primary School in the past, but currently the school is without a Hall or any place in which the students can come together, even for assemblies. If the school is provided with the space, there are several teachers including the Principal who believe they would be keen to be involved in a production.

#### **4.5.3 Swan Road Primary School**

Each of the three teachers at Swan Road School had similar ideas about what dance meant to them at their school. Dean discussed a production that he had been involved in when he taught at the same school at an earlier time. The process was important to him and he stated, "I like them working together as a group to create something. I think that's fantastic. You see them sharing ideas; that's really cool". However Dean was concerned about the senior boys in his class stressing, "They don't like Jump Jam, they really don't like Jump Jam". The Haka had worked well for this group of boys as they were able to identify with the strong movements that it contained. Nicky, a parent reflected on the benefits of dance,

We had a prize giving here not long after Bella had started and probably 90% of the children who went up to get some sort of award were dance pupils. It's absolutely fascinating, just the discipline, the focus and the confidence that flow out of the dance.

Kim discussed the fact that she only used dance at a time when there was a focus on the arts. She emphasised the fact that dance wasn't one of her favourite subjects and yet when asked to speak about her most memorable moment in teaching, she chose a production that she had directed last year where dance was featured. "When I see it working I can make it better, but I'm not good at thinking of the ideas". She had some music advisors assist her with the choreography along with the children themselves. After further discussion she realised that perhaps she was including dance in her program after all, and thinking of it as drama, because of the creative aspect of the exercises.

The children were “moving like little creatures under the water and they were doing it if they were plants growing up, so, some free dance”.

Susan, the Principal, appreciated the freedom to be creative that dance offered students. “It frees their minds as well as their bodies...a chance to be creative...learning doesn’t always have to be sitting at a desk”. She explained that the focus is on the basics of literacy and numeracy and throughout the year a subject is chosen from the remainder of the curriculum “like it’s social sciences or science for one term and then we have an arts term”. In the arts term, all arts subjects will be included. There is no specific focus on any particular art form. Susan mentioned that the teachers assist each other and draw on individual strengths.

While parents saw dance as an outside activity, two parents spoke of the correlation between dance students and academic achievement. Jump Jam had been implemented at Swan Road Primary School and yet this was not a focus of the conversations.

#### **4.5.4 What dance meant: Jump Jam**

This paragraph discusses what was revealed in each of the case studies. It was more than apparent that a dominant meaning of dance in the schools involved in this study was Jump Jam. As Jump Jam emerged in each Case Study as the main dance activity in each school, it seemed necessary to provide an explanation of the program and how it is used in schools. Jump Jam was created by New Zealander Brett Fairweather who has twice been a World Aerobics Champion. The activity is aerobic and their website states that, “Jump Jam provides students with a valuable exercise habit early in life along with skills and attitudes to meet their on-going health and physical activity needs” (Jump Jam, 2010). Under ‘Links to the Curriculum’, mention is made of the connections with dance and drama as a means of creative self-expression. Teachers buy a kit that includes popular music on C.D., a DVD that contains the fitness/dance routines to follow, choreography notes and certificates for the students. Schools have their own screens onto which the DVD is projected and students and teachers alike follow the instructional routines. It is possible to perform these routines without moving the desks, although I believe that a clear space would be suggested and preferable. Rose Lewis, Administrator for Kidz Aerobix, the trading name for the distribution of Jump Jam packages, stated in an email on August 30th, 2010, that “Jump Jam is now in 1,900 primary and intermediate schools in New Zealand”.



## 4.6 Perceived Problems: Why dance is not a focus

Problems that arose during the course of the interviews were identified as time, space, teaching pressures in literacy and numeracy, the introduction of National Standards, a perceived emphasis on 'more important areas of the curriculum', confidence and a lack of knowledge and resources around the teaching of dance.

### 4.6.1 Marion Primary School

Though many referred to time and space, they were not particular problems for teachers at Marion School. While Julie felt that she might have problems fitting it into her timetable, it was more that she had only been teaching for four weeks and was attempting to incorporate all of her amazing ideas and finding that it simply wasn't possible. Dance was included as one of those wonderful ideas and she stated,

you try something and give it a go and if it works, it works, and then you try something else. You see, I can see it working with this class.

David believed that time was not too much of a constraint, "not in primary school. I don't think we are under that much pressure". Deb's opinion differed, "No, no, NO, no, no way, because I just don't have the time and I don't know what to do". Lara identified the problems in teaching dance as "Confidence, confidence to know your way forward".

Marion School has a large hall and library area for dancing inside and a large outdoor area that could be used during fine weather. Most people didn't see space as a problem that stopped them teaching dance. Despite the existing space Pam suggested that there was "limited space in the library because everyone wants to be there". She discussed the fact that she didn't go outside to dance because of a belief that she may not be able to control the students outside:

I can control them within four walls and maybe it's because we don't do enough dance that I'm still at the stage that I want to control what they're doing and yet dance should be free and they should be able to do what they want.

Despite David stating that time was not generally a problem in the implementation of dance, other teachers responded to a question regarding their attitude to teaching in a way that contradicted that opinion. Adam spoke passionately about the pressure teachers are under:

They told us we had to do healthy eating and then they told us we have to do Kiwi Sport and you've got to do an extra half hour on sport alone. I looked around and I thought we're doing that. I mean you don't walk out into the playground and see too many overweight kids. A lot of kids we have here, they do stuff after school, they're flat out. Once again we're being hit with that one size... they're telling us to individualise our teaching but one size fits all from

the Ministry. I think that the dance thing, because of where we're at with the Ministry, once again and it's become a law one of those administrative things, you know the guidelines, literacy and numeracy, its force fed; we get it rammed down our throats.

The main concern was the focus on literacy and numeracy. Adam discussed the lack of professional development following the implementation of the Arts Curriculum and what message that is giving to schools:

The thing is going back to the Arts Curriculum, and it was developed and it was beautiful and that, but there was no huge focus for schools to opt into professional development. There were options but at the same time we were told we had to focus on literacy and numeracy.... Look at the way in which we were bombarded with the numeracy project, the literacy project, the Assess to Learn. There was so much money and time and effort thrown into them and we had to pick up on it, we had to learn the document. I guarantee, if you're lucky, how many people have actually opened and had a look at the arts curriculum?

Adam's comments were borne out by the fact that most teachers interviewed had only a vague idea of what the arts curriculum was about. Deb stated that she was not aware if any resources for dance and knew she could go onto the T.K.I. website, but qualified her reasons for not doing so, "Yes but sometimes with those sort of things too, they might be too advanced for me and I'll go – oh I'm not happy about teaching that".

This research study comes at a time when schools are in the initial stages of implementing National Standards. Deb's comments regarding the lack of support for courses in dance overlapped into a comment on the National Standards. "You don't get very many courses these days and it's getting even worse now because it's mainly literacy and numeracy with the National Standards the Government is offering". All adult participants in the study were asked their opinion on the introduction of National Standards. All but one person agreed that the introduction of National Standards was a backward step for education and that more time will be given to literacy and numeracy and therefore other subjects, including dance, will suffer. Adam expressed concern about the lack of a trial period and questioned the way in which the Ministry produced their data:

After twelve months instructional reading my children now have to be at green level fourteen. OK where do they get that data? Why green level 14? No-one can answer that question for me.

He spoke at length about the implications for all other subjects with the introduction of standards. "I'm stressing out about the arts because they will not get a mention, and we'll become so old school, so old fashioned in our thinking that there'll be no time for dance in our schools".

Bill, the parent who didn't agree with the newly introduced idea of home learning instead of homework, stated "I like it, I completely like it". However he did comment that he,

wouldn't like to see it used as a battering ram for teachers because I think that teachers are poorly resourced now and if it's not being used as a constructive thing then it's not doing what I want it to.

#### **4.6.2 Stafford Primary School**

Space is the main problem at Stafford Primary School. In recent years parents were able to go out of zone to send their children to schools of their choice. This meant that the enrolment of Stafford Primary School increased dramatically but the buildings remained the same. The government will not provide buildings despite the school having acres of ground on which to build. All but one of the classrooms are too small to dance in, although Jump Jam is held in classrooms with children standing beside their desks. Most teachers felt that they couldn't do any more than that because even when they moved the desks back, as Sylvia commented, "You've got 31 children in that tiny classroom and any dance, looking at the Jump Jam or anything you do, well half the time it's too big an effort". Caroline's passion for dance shone through, although she was on her own in her thinking. "Space isn't really a problem, because you can move the desks out. That's a bit of a cop out". Caroline wished for equipment that the school doesn't have such as cameras to film the students so they can see how they look when they dance.

The Board of Trustees are planning to fund the building of a new classroom and then two existing adjoining classrooms will be opened up to create a small hall. This could assist in the teaching of dance to some extent although the hall will be required by all teachers involved in any physical activity and times will be limited. Naomi expressed her concerns about how long the hall will be available to the school. "It's a growing school. How long is it going to be before Annie or Sylvia say, let's create another satellite classroom, because we're at term three and the school's looking a bit full in the juniors, and we've lost our hall again".

The crowded curriculum was mentioned by some teachers. John commented that technology and science have been separated and now there is yet another subject area to teach. He explained,

I just think generally that the whole curriculum's been crowded in with health and so on, every social woe has been pushed back to education and made it very crowded.

Monique expressed her concerns regarding the inclusion of dance:

I can understand why the three R type subjects dominate but... I think that kids would miss out on something enriching in their lives if they didn't get some dance and the other arts.

Most participants were vehement in their opposition to the move toward National Standards by the Government. They believed that the focus on literacy and numeracy will have a huge impact on other subject areas in an already crowded curriculum. Margie expressed concerns she had about

purely assessing and then labeling the children. “I don’t see that there’s enough funding to address the problem. It’s like weighing the pig doesn’t make it fatter”. Tim explained how it will be necessary to dumb down the students at Stafford so that they will look good in the test results. Currently the school sets their probes a year above the chronological age and the students struggle to achieve good results. Tim elaborated,

We’re going to drop them down and make it easier and not push them on and give them extra work. I think the big thing is we are not going to see the help for the tail. They’re not saying we’re going to identify it and we’re going to put money in to help these children. It’s just, ‘we’re going to identify it’.

Melanie had experienced working with National Standards in England and reinforced the fact that non-core subjects will be placed on the back burner. She stated “I think back to what it was like in England and I find it hard to be positive about it”.

#### **4.6.3 Swan Road Primary School**

There were no space or time problems at the school that related specifically to dance. Kim discussed the fact that she had a small class and the space where she can go outside or to the hall, but she was concerned about teachers in other schools who have upward or twenty-nine students and no space. She explained,

There’s going to be at least one special needs kid in your class and at least three or four who have major behavioural functional issues. Is it practical to do some of those things even if you love to do them? Not very often.

National Standards did not seem a huge issue for this school. The parents didn’t know much about it and the three teachers’ opinions ranged from a ‘wait and see’ attitude to thinking that dance will become an even smaller part of the curriculum because of the focus on literacy and numeracy.

### **4.7 Professional Development in dance**

This chapter investigates what professional development the teachers had had in the past and what, if any, professional development they felt would prepare them to confidently teach dance in their classrooms.

#### **4.7.1 Marion Primary School**

At Marion Primary School most teachers questioned had not had any professional development in dance. Deb answered, “Me personally? No”. Alison’s answer was equally short, “no, no” and she didn’t know of any having been offered. However she did know that there was a little orange book

on the shelf and a video, resources which she could use, but at this stage hadn't accessed. Amanda was not aware of any professional development in dance. Julie however, had only recently graduated and as part of her teacher training in Christchurch, had studied dance and drama in the first semester of her first year:

We all got to know each other. I think they did that in that first semester so that it helped with all that stuff... but we didn't really do any more dance or drama pretty much throughout the rest of the three years really.

Adam spoke of his concern about the radical cuts at the University of Canterbury and how a resulting lack of advisors for dance sends out a clear message of how the emphasis is on arts is reflected, both within the University and teaching circles. When the arts advisor position was operational, that person had been responsible for both secondary and primary schools, whereas "they might have had five secondary advisors for maths and five primary advisors for maths".

Amongst the many suggestions offered for professional development in dance was Lara's comment,

I guess it would come down to the same way that you would meet a child at five, and you would expose...teachers need to see dance, they need to do dance. It's like being read to, they need to watch and feel it and do it and become a little bit part of it, little step by little step and you've got a starting point.

Julie reiterated Lara's comment,

I think it's about exposure, like having some exposure to it. I think with any of those things there's the push, there needs to be some sort of exposure to get it into people's minds.

Lara also stated that a Dance Coordinator could work positively toward the introduction of dance in the school. Pam too was drawn toward the idea of somebody on staff being responsible for dance, and Kari stated, "I think it comes down to what you are good at and it's what I noted as a student [teacher], that one particular teacher will take over". These comments reflected a situation at Marion school where as Adam, the principal explained, "One of our girls [teachers] who has recently moved to Auckland was responsible for choir and music".

Alison expressed a concern around the word dance when suggesting professional development, "I need a course, and instead of calling it dance, call it fitness or something else. I mustn't be frightened by the word dance". Many teachers suggested workshops as the best manner of upskilling in dance. David stated, "A workshop would be great even if you just did the fundamentals and the basics and you left giving us directions to do creative things". Julie added, "A good workshop always inspires people". Amanda said that, she would like a workshop with a range of strategies and ideas that I could use...someone to come and show us how it's done". Teachers, Sue,

Jody, Graham and parent, Kim all agreed that a workshop would be the best way of introducing professional development in dance. Adam, the Principal went one step further and suggested that,

You need to do what the government have done with literacy and numeracy and that's saturate it...the teacher needs to feel supported. Teachers need someone to come in and say, right, I'm going to work alongside you the first time and I'll work behind you the second time...we need to make it valuable. You've got to get out there and sell your message higher and louder than the plonkers who are selling the three 'R's as the greatest gift to mankind. It's an archaic message from an Industrial Revolution a long time ago.

#### **4.7.2 Stafford Primary School**

Nine of the teachers had attended the local teacher training college institution and as a result had participated in dance modules during their training. They were all enthusiastic about the dance they had done and remembered clearly aspects of the program which had inspired them at the time. Joy reminisced, "It just seemed so easy, and it was, it wasn't even moving in time necessarily, it wasn't". I had conducted a dance professional development session with all of the teachers at Stafford Primary School in 2008 and most teachers mentioned this session in their interviews and the positive learning that had taken place. However most had not included any dance in their programs since that time. Joy spoke of a course she'd done two years ago,

...and it made me think, oh I could do that in my class and I did come back and I did virtually what she did with the class and I've never done it since, but I did that time and I really enjoyed it.

Although a few teachers knew of the existence of a dance resource 'Dancing the Long White Cloud', only Caroline had used it.

When questioned as to professional development in dance that may be helpful, most teachers suggested an outside expert coming in like a music specialist who was working in their school at the time. Bridie summed up the feeling of many teachers,

I think probably some specialists coming out, like we've done with this music person and I think we've done this with art in the past, and I've certainly seen that in other schools where somebody comes along and in a block of time you have a whole school focus maybe, for a certain amount of time, maybe a month, whatever, and leading up to a performance or something like this. Well an expert that works with you. You're in the class as well and you're watching them. By an expert I mean it's somebody showing the way for me to follow, something I could do myself. It would need to be easy to start with; something that I could actually take on board.

Naomi suggested:

An on-going block, we have a music specialist Claire Alexander, who we have been fortunate enough to pay to come in and do two days a week. She goes between classes and does

anything between half an hour and forty-five minutes music teaching with us and there's no reason why we couldn't do that with someone in dance.

Monique agreed, "Coming into class and actually showing us how it's done and following on and keeping on going". Melanie discussed her experience with a literacy program and suggested that it might work in dance,

because it was a professional actually coming in and doing it and demonstrating how to do it, so actually going into each of the classrooms, demonstrating to the teachers what it would look like.

Tim also felt that, "having someone come in and incorporate it" would work well, although he also discussed in some detail how the provision of a bank of ideas could link in with topics that were being taught. Tim suggested,

For example, if you were doing insects or bugs, you could...incorporate it. You might do flight of the bumblebee and you might do high, low, fast, slow and have explanations as well.

Margaret felt she would like to go into other classrooms to watch and see how others were implementing dance. When I suggested that it might be someone like the music specialist who was currently in their school, she responded,

Yes, but Claire teaches at such a high degree of competency that...What's good is seeing another one like us. I mean I love watching the experts, but I know, that's the expert, that's a different class. It's a colleague, a peer, once it becomes an 'expert' then you start thinking "I'm not good enough, I could never do that", but if it's someone actually like us in the classroom situation, who could show us how it could work, then it becomes more powerful to us.

This thinking was reinforced by Sylvia, the Deputy Principal with years of music teaching experience. Sylvia's comments supported the theory that 'the expert' is considered a cut above the general classroom teacher by the teachers themselves. She reflected,

Claire can offer something that teachers probably can't, well definitely they can't, because you know I teach music but I couldn't offer what she does. I can offer certain things but she can offer that step above because she is an expert.

Margaret explained,

She came through as Sylvia's third year student and it was obvious that her strength was music and she'd just gone with her strength, a specialist music teacher, which is kind of different isn't it? It's very different actually, from being the classroom teacher all the time.

Naomi suggested an alternative to artists in schools,

An outside expert I think, like that time when you came in and did a bit of dance and you've got teachers doing it, so it's not someone coming in and doing it with the children, its coming and doing it with the teachers.

### **4.7.3 Swan Road Primary School**

Dean discussed an inspirational artist, Robert McFerrin, who used to come to the school and the students also went to his studio in the city. Dean stated, “Yes, I got heaps of ideas from him, he was quite inspiring really”. Dean had participated in dance twice a week for one semester at teacher’s college. He remembered what he had done:

We did different styles, but we looked at creative ways where we had to come up with our own dance performance to music, we did a mixture of ballet and beastie boys and it was quite fun.

Dean was happy to teach dance when the school focused on the arts for a term but didn’t consciously include it in his program otherwise. Kim had been to a drama professional development day where she says “there were some choreographed type things that we looked at”. She admitted that there hadn’t been much offered and she didn’t choose to participate when they were offered. Dean’s comment related to the benefits of learning by doing, “I hear, I forget, I see, I remember, I do, I understand”.

Kim wanted, “experts, or people with more skills than me”. Gordon from the Board of Trustees felt,

a workshop situation could be great and the follow up would be important, we had quite a few sessions with music and that was a huge benefit, the kids just get so enthusiastic about it and started learning instruments...so it shows what a huge effect someone can have. We are happy to bring someone in, we don’t expect the teachers to do it all by themselves.

Parents, Paula and Tom both could see the introduction of specialist teachers as beneficial, while another parent, Nicky, emphasised that dance needn’t be set moves to be taught and stated,

Maybe one idea would be to give it to some of those kids, like the girls I had over here today who are passionate about it and love it, give them a role.

Nicky could recognize a passion for dance in the group of girls she had been working with, yet when I interviewed children in the classroom, it seemed that all students loved dance.

## **4.8 A cross-curricular approach to teaching dance**

All participants in this study responded enthusiastically to the idea of implementing dance alongside other curriculum subjects. Teachers felt that it was a good idea and that it would meet a curriculum focus on integration, but they would need guidance on what to do.



#### **4.8.1 Marion Primary School**

Some teachers recognised that they were already using movement to teach in other areas or theme based activities although they hadn't viewed what they were doing as dance. Alison stated,

If we see things in books, then we might get up and move, but I wouldn't have called that dance. I guess it's the whole movement thing, but when I hear the word, dance...

David was enthusiastic about using dance in his classroom and spoke of integration being a big push in the curriculum. He warned,

It's going to be quite hard to do but I'd like to see a lot of professional development in the arts curriculum, that's an area we all want. Oh you have to have fun.

Kari, a parent and student-teacher conveyed her understanding of the importance of an integrated curriculum,

When you've got reluctant writers they can express their body awareness in space and bring it back and write and talk about what they've been doing. There's so much that could be done.

Lara spoke of making dance an everyday thing that was incorporated into lessons,

You may find it begins by being one teacher's department and you take several classes through the same thing, but that is only going to develop. Hopefully it will spread throughout the school.

#### **4.8.2 Stafford Primary School**

The response to the cross-curricular question was equally positive at Stafford School, and as the Principal Annie stated, "I would be delighted, yes, an integrated curriculum I think, and make it exciting and fun". Melanie had taught a science unit on the water cycle at a school in England. She used dance as the medium with which to teach and stated,

It was brilliant and they found it easier to understand it than any other way, they retained it. It was fun, and just before I left one of those kids said "I'll never forget what you did with us in science and we did that performance", and that's one thing they'll remember.

Joy responded, "Yes, that would be one way round it wouldn't it. I wouldn't be so hung up on dance if there's a mathematical concept in there somewhere". Margaret could see a cross-curricular approach working, "if I knew how to, yes, possibly if I had some time". Alys from the Board of Trustees stated, "A fabulous idea. It would really appeal to the kinaesthetic learners, yes it would be great". Naomi's enthusiasm was echoed by most participants,

I think it's a great idea. It would be so much easier for the kids to pick up on and probably creates more interest for the children as well. It makes it easier for us because it's not so

regimented, (like we're going to learn some dance and it's this movement we are focussing on). When it's based round a theme or something it can be related and then at the end you can revisit it and say, do you actually realise that this is what you are doing? They're going to learn more.

Bridie's comments summed up the general feeling at Stafford School,

I think that particularly now that the curriculum has got so crowded that maybe it's a good way of the centre of interest sort of thing. You can – if you've got a topic, you can bring in some dance, you can bring in some maths.

#### **4.8.3 Swan Road Primary School**

The Principal, Susan from Swan Road School didn't see the introduction of dance into other curriculum areas as a problem and stated,

Tru and I are doing it all the time, acting out stories and making numbers and stepping out the numbers...Some children further up the school would benefit from it. It just might be the spot for some children.

All three teachers agreed with the concept and Kim, the middle school teacher recognised that she may be using cross curricular dance already under the banner of drama. Dean recited a well-known reference to make his position clear on the introduction of dance across the curriculum, "I hear, I forget; I see, I remember; I do, I understand".

### **4.9 What the children said over all three schools**

The main discussion regarding the research question focuses on the teachers. My intention to go into classrooms and to involve students in the discussions aimed to capture another perspective that would enrich the dominant meanings offered by teachers. The reality was that in every school little time was available to adequately gather and understand the children's perspectives.

Most students in all three schools put their hand up to the opening question "Who likes to dance?" Once they were asked what sort of dance they liked to do, every hand up went with everyone wanting a say. Student quotes have been listed to draw attention to their words. Students provided similar reasons for enjoying dance such as:

It makes me feel good.

I do it because I like it.

It makes me feel like I'm having a good time.

I can't sit still.

Because it's fun.

It makes me feel like sort of free, like I can do anything.

Popular types of dance were Break Dance, Jump Jam, and Hip Hop but students had experienced a wide variety of styles. Among these were Morris Dance, the Caterpillar, Ballet, Disco, Jazz, Can Can, American Jazz, Bollywood, Rock and Pop, Haka, Rodeo Dance, Shuffle, Moon Walking, Rock Star Dancing, Tap Dancing, Gym Dancing, Hokey Pokey, Highland Dancing, Rap Dancing, Boogie, Ballroom dancing, Crazy Frog, Cha Cha, Country Dancing, Rock 'n Roll, Modeling, Rasa Dance, Who Let the Dogs out (Jump Jam), and the Chicken Dance. Many students said "any dance", "random" or "all dancing", and whenever I responded favourably to these responses, other students would raise their hands to say the same thing.

The students danced with their friends, their family, by themselves or with a group. They danced in their bedrooms, in the lounge, the school playground, at weddings, birthdays, at the rugby, the classroom and on the stage. They danced anywhere and everywhere. Some students at Swan Road School had performed the Haka in the bottom of the empty swimming pool. One boy said that he performed on stage with one thousand people watching. The teacher knew nothing of this particular student's involvement in dance.

All students were given the opportunity to write about their most memorable dance experience and also to draw pictures of them dancing. The drawings featured happy children. Big smiles lined the faces of the dancers. This was particularly evident in the drawings of younger students. Many students were dancing with a C.D. player or dancing and playing guitar at the same time. Dancing on stage or in a performance space appeared more popular than dancing in a bedroom or with family members.

When the students wrote about their most memorable dance experience however, there were many stories about moving more informally at a friend's house and even at the rugby. The following excerpts provide examples of student work,

Dancing how the music made me feel, not the proper moves.

Made it up with my brother and we showed it to Mum and Dad.

In my room dancing a couple of days ago. I like rhythms and patterns.

Jigging around in Dad's arms" and "I made up a dance to a song called Stan Walker.

At Stafford School there had been a 'boys versus girls' dance competition a few years previously and the older students remembered this, several writing about it as their most memorable dance experience. The boys had won. While some of the pictures showed students doing Jump Jam, not many students wrote about it as their most memorable dance experience. One student wrote about being awarded a Highly Commended at a concert and how her mother had thought that she should have got second.

While each of the case studies came from high decile schools, 9, 8 and 7 respectively, it was interesting to note that students from Swan Road School (decile 7) had had a similar amount of studio dance experience as the students at the other two schools. The isolation of the farming families didn't appear to limit the opportunities for students to participate in extra-curricular activities. The parents make sacrifices and drive many kilometres to ensure that their children have the same opportunities as city children. Anika, from Swan Road School spoke of her most memorable performance being her first School of Dance production.

Why? Because I had done lots of work for the whole year and when I got into the Regent Theatre I didn't freak out like normal four year olds would do, I just smiled and made the most of my time.

Simon from the same school wrote of his experience:

I was trying to do ballet when I was five and kept getting distracted by swords in the corner.

All of the students were asked to focus on some driving issues of the research. Students were asked to imagine that they were the teacher and that they wanted to teach a dance lesson. What would they need to help them teach it? Music and musical instruments were the main answers and there were many suggestions about setting up the space, especially from students at Stafford School where there is no space. A seven year old from Stafford School suggested that, "there should be no hitting when teaching dance". There were similar helpful suggestions such as a need of oxygen and patience. A new entrant from Stafford School suggested looking at a book to learn how to teach dance, but there was a chorus of no's and when I questioned this response, the students chorused, "we need books to sing". I suggested that maybe we could read about dance, but the students were quite firm and stuck to their opinion. Some creative ideas emerged such as using a poem to interpret in dance and to accompany the dance with song or percussion.

There were suggestions of needing students to listen well and getting the students to sit in a circle. One class of older children aged between 9 and 12 at Swan Road School agreed with each other that you need to know how to dance to be able to teach dance and suggested that it might be a good idea to get an expert in. This was a theme that came through from the older students in each school.

The older students at Marion School felt that videos or books might be helpful and while they thought it would be good for the teacher to be up the front teaching set steps, they also acknowledged that for certain types of dances, “the teacher or the students could just sort of make it up”.

One class at Stafford School had a teacher who did use dance as in a cross-curricular approach to teaching and also taught dance as an art form. During the session with these students, they broke into a spontaneous and enthusiastic song and dance in answer to a question, “what is a Witch Doctor Dance”? They had a different manner of relating and were comfortable with communicating physically.

Three boys from Swan Road responded defensively to questioning about dance. The discussion moved on and later the Haka came up in conversation, the same boys admitted that they enjoyed it, but hadn’t considered it a dance. One of the boys said, “It was representing a country and the main part of the Haka is the sound. There’s some movement”.

At the end of each class interview and after the writing and drawing had been completed, the students were given the opportunity to come forward individually and demonstrate any moves that they would like to show. This was a highly successful strategy. Everyone was keen to perform and in many cases, the children wanted to perform several times. They generally copied each other but whenever I suggested that they try and find something that was original and different to other people, they would follow this instruction and some really unusual moves would follow, like really fast kicking, perhaps representing tap dancing. Many students demonstrated rap dancing. One little boy with severe learning difficulties and an unfortunate home situation, according to his class teacher, came out in front of the class and performed a sophisticated rap sequence. He was given the opportunity to perform several times as it was apparent he was gaining a great deal from this display of his talents. The admiration of his peers boosted his self-esteem. In the staffroom a few days later, Joy mentioned, “Wee Joseph the other day nearly made me cry”.

#### **4.10 Summary**

The teachers in each of the case studies were positive about the culture of their school. Most teachers were experienced and had remained at their school for many years. This provided a context with which to examine meanings of dance.

A key finding of the research in this chapter indicates that the meanings of dance varied, with dance and drama often being considered one and the same by many teachers. The School Musical met the

curriculum requirements in dance at Marion School, but they also focussed heavily on Jump Jam. All three schools included Jump Jam to some degree in their programmes. Stafford School teachers spoke of folk dance, despite it not being a reality because of space problems. Simple movement activities were happening in the junior classrooms and Kapa-Haka had recently been introduced. Swan Road School discussed previous productions where students danced. The boys had performed a Haka and some creative movement was happening in the junior room. Dance was also included when there was a whole school focus on the arts.

Professional development in dance that teachers had received ranged from very little at Marion and Swan Road schools, to most teachers at Stafford Primary School. Ideas for further professional development reflected the type of professional development that teachers had received in the past in other subject areas. The main suggestions were the introduction of the expert, or workshops for teachers.

Participants were most enthusiastic about the idea of a cross-curricular approach in dance. They could see the benefits to students and how this would meet the need for an integrated curriculum. The perceived problems related to the introduction of dance, were seen as time, space, teaching pressures and the introduction of National Standards. The children involved in this study loved to dance.

# Chapter 5. Discussion

The research question, 'What are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms?' has been addressed through interview questions and discussions. After conducting 49 interviews over approximately forty hours, hearing multiple views, stories and ideas, a process of material analysis revealed the following dominant themes: the need for professional development; interest in a cross-curricular approach to teaching; insights into why teachers teach the way that they do; the issue of teacher confidence in teaching dance; and suggestions for changes in pre-service teacher education in the area of dance. The following discussion examines these themes against the literature, the writer's personal experience and the participants' comments.

## 5.1 Professional Development

This chapter reflects on the dominant modes of professional development believed by teachers to be the most effective in the imparting of knowledge. Teachers from Stafford Primary School were enthusiastic about an 'Artist in School Programme'. Their experience was with a music expert who was working in their school during the research period. Ironically, the findings in this research would suggest that while the students were having a valuable musical experience, the teachers were not being empowered as confident teachers of music; in fact the contrary was the case. The following outlines the professional development related to artists in schools, and other ideas that have emerged from this study.

### 5.1.1 Someone like us: An examination of Artists in Schools

It was interesting to observe that when the participants in the study were asked what type of professional development they would prefer in dance, they generally proposed that they would like to access the type of professional development they had engaged with in the past in other subject areas. Most typically this involved workshops, although the Stafford Primary School case study revealed that teachers would also like to see a dance artist in school in the way that they were currently experiencing the expert music artist programme. This finding connects with the research regarding teachers teaching in the manner in which they themselves were taught (Aitken & Mildon, 1991; Carter, 1990; Chong, Wong, & Choon Lang, 2003; Cole & Knowles, 1993; Rolfe, 2001). The personal experiences of the Stafford Primary School teachers meant that they valued the introduction of an expert as a means of professional development.

All but one teacher at Stafford, who was already implementing dance in the classroom, agreed with the idea of an outside expert coming in and working with the students. They suggested that the expert would provide modeling for the teacher and then work alongside the teacher so that the teacher could follow on once the expert had left. Their music specialist, Claire Alexander, was providing stimulating and exciting workshops for the students. The degree of technical difficulty was such that some classroom teachers stated that they felt confident in their own abilities to continue once she had left.

When the teachers discussed Claire they used terms such as 'brilliant', 'great', and described her as having a high degree of competency. They were obviously impressed by the work that Claire was doing and could see the benefits for the children. Bridie and Naomi were quite enthusiastic about someone coming in and doing the same thing with the students in dance, however, their focus was on a whole school performance after a block of time. Some teachers felt that they would not continue Claire's work once she had left. Margaret discussed the idea of watching someone teach dance so that she could see what works. That person needed to be 'someone like us', a generalist classroom teacher rather than an expert.

Margaret's point is very much in line with my personal concerns regarding dance artists in the class as 'the expert'. I believe that Margaret was self-aware enough to know that music wasn't going to happen at Stafford School once Claire had left, and that 'the expert' may inadvertently make the teacher feel less able to implement the specialist subject than they might have been before the expert had conducted the sessions. Where the artist brings specialist expertise into a classroom, teachers tend to defer to the expert. Stein's (2004) discussion supports this statement as she reflects on the case of visiting artists in the classroom, "usually these classroom teachers are nervous about stepping out of their comfort zone and using art forms with which they have little or no experience" (p.14).

Sylvia, Stafford School's Deputy Principal supported the theory that 'the expert' is considered a cut above the ordinary classroom teacher by the teachers themselves. Sylvia is a Deputy Principal with years of experience in teaching music. She leads the choir, but even she believes that the music artist is someone to be held up as more capable, more competent and more important in her subject area. Reflecting upon Margaret's suggestion that she and her colleagues watch "someone like us" if professional development was to be successful appears to be a key in understanding why artists in schools do not generally provide satisfactory professional development for teachers. Claire, the visiting music expert at Stafford School is a trained teacher, yet it was apparent that her role in the school was that of the expert. While she was in the school, the students would benefit from the



lessons with Claire, but once she was gone, there would be no on-going teaching of music and what the students had learned may be lost. Margaret elaborated on her idea of having 'someone like us' to provide professional development,

They've actually had the same experiences as us of putting things into a program and being responsible for the kids' learning, so it's more of a level playing field.

Margaret spoke about someone at Pre-service Teachers' College who teaches dance and yet has never taught in a classroom. Margaret stated, "I don't think that I can respect what she is saying if she hasn't actually been at grass roots, it is different". This comment provides an insight into understanding the way in which teachers think when presented with professional development opportunities. Margaret reflected on the fact that when I provided a workshop for the teachers in 2008 I didn't present as an expert, despite the fact that my own personal background is that of a High School dance specialist. I questioned this observation asking, "Was this because I am not a very good dancer and I'm older, do you think?" Margaret answered "It's a personality thing too". This comment is insightful and important to the discussion.

It would seem that the person conducting a workshop needs to be tuned to the individual personalities of the group working alongside the participants with genuine enthusiasm and integrity. This research does not propose however to attempt to define particular attributes which can be ascribed good teachers or workshop facilitators. Nias (1987) reflected,

No matter how pervasive particular aspects of a shared social or occupational culture may be or how well individuals are socialised into it, the attitudes and actions of each teacher are rooted in his/her own ways of perceiving the world (p.179).

Research indicates that successful teaching stems from the individual and not a set of techniques (Horng, Hong, Lih-Juan, Shih-Hui, & Hui-Chuan, 2005; Nias, 1987; Tyler, 1960). As Palmer (1998) stated, "Good teaching cannot be reduced to technique, good teaching comes from the identity and integrity of the teacher"(p.10). The limit of this research does not provide answers as to the personality and skills required by artists in schools, if indeed they exist. Research would suggest however, that artists in schools would be more successful in providing professional development for teachers if artists were teachers themselves, and that the personality of the workshop leader was compatible with the group.

Swan Road Primary teacher, Dean, discussed his experience of a dance artist in the school program. Expert, Robert McFerrin had worked with students at Swan Road in previous years and had stimulated teachers' interest in dance at the time. Dean stated, "Yes, I got heaps of ideas from him. He was quite inspiring really". This did not however, result in Dean continuing his work in the

classroom. This was because dance was perceived as a subject to be offered occasionally when a school musical was underway or when there was a term focus on the arts.

Marion Primary School had employed a performing arts expert when they staged their bi-annual production. Adam stated,

I got an old friend of mine to come along and take dance for the kids, and what happened was that each class put on an item to do with a Disney story.

Marion primary school participants did not consider that the artist's role was to provide professional development. In this instance, the artist was seen quite openly as the expert with special abilities and skills in dance.

It seems appropriate to discuss 'Artists in Schools' in more depth at this juncture, as not only does it relate to what was happening at all three schools in this study, but also that, to date, little research exists that investigates the advantages and disadvantages of dance artists in New Zealand primary schools. In my experience over twenty-five years of teaching, I would argue that bringing dance artists into schools is an ineffective method of professional development, and one that compounds the problem of dance being viewed as an optional extra.

Unfortunately for the students, once the expert has completed the workshop/s, dance experiences for students are not likely to continue. A teacher's pre-existing lack of confidence in teaching dance may be compounded by the visit of the expert. If experts conduct dance classes in schools, then teachers must be empowered to continue their work when the experts leave. This statement raises several issues regarding artists in schools programs in New Zealand. Margaret's comment regarding dance artists, "they need to be like us" requires serious consideration. Hillary Easton outlines the benefits and shortcomings of the teacher/artist partnerships. Easton (2003) stated,

Almost every teaching artist has worked with teachers who did not feel much like partners at all. In conversations with both teaching artists and teachers, each represents that their partner does not always understand the needs of the other.

The collaborative aspect of artists in schools is not a new problem, nor is it isolated to areas teachers perceive as difficult, such as dance (L. Martin, 2007; Stein, 2004; Wolf, 2008). David Betts investigated teacher professional development through an arts experience where teachers worked alongside artists. In this instance, teaching appeared to have been influenced by the experience. Betts (2005) stated,

I talked with teachers who had participated for three years or more with a dance/movement residency program who said that the school culture had changed, and that many aspects of their teaching had been influenced by the experience (p.17).

The core of this statement is that the teachers participated for more than three years. The time and teacher participation dedicated to the program would appear to be the defining factors in its perceived success.

Laura Martin, a dance coordinator for Creative Partnerships in Cornwall, U.K. discusses a Creative Partnerships Program which she believes contributed to significant and creative change in many schools across the country. Martin's dance artists worked with children in a similar manner to Claire, the music specialist at Stafford school, although on a much larger scale. Martin was enthusiastic and positive about the scheme in which she was involved. Martin (2007) stated,

[we]work with young people and teachers in schools to challenge their approaches to teaching and learning, and work within the dance sector to raise skills and experience in individual practice and working within the educational sector (p.2).

Raising skills and experience in individual practice for artists is an aim that relates to the development of the artists themselves. While this may be a worthy outcome, it is unlikely that teachers in schools would have considered it when establishing their educational aims for the project.

Martin wanted to improve approaches to teaching and learning and felt confident that the Creative Partnerships Program had been successful in meeting that aim. Hall and Thomson's (2007) reflections on the project were in opposition to Martin's beliefs. They stated,

Teachers however, were at the margins of this project...there was no structural way in which their own teaching could have benefitted from the pedagogic approaches adopted by the artist (p.324).

As a teacher and a researcher I propose that the artist in schools programs must emphasise inclusion with teachers as well as students if dance in the classroom is to benefit from the experience. The artist's perspective to teaching in schools is often quite different to the teacher perspective of artists in schools. I argue that artists themselves are often teaching in schools as something secondary to their often prioritised focus on being an artist. As Stein (2004) states, "Artist educators in the past have not usually chosen arts in education as a career path". Martin discusses the fact that the work of the dancers in her project challenged young people and teachers in schools. Martin (2007) stated,

We hope we've left a legacy of confidence in creativity and skills, inspiring teachers to be braver and to take more risks after they have seen how simple ideas can be so effective in practice (p.2).

Research would suggest however, that teachers see themselves as lacking the confidence and skills to teach dance and that the expert, especially one who sets herself/himself above the teacher,

succeeds only in making the situation worse (Buck, 2003a; Burnaford, 2009; Wolf, 2008). Burnaford (2009) stated,

And then they leave. Who are teachers through the eyes of artists? Artists often view teachers as intermediaries or bridges to some artists...One artist describes herself as 'the intuitive one' while her teacher partners are usually linear or sequential thinkers. Another described it this way: artists draw out and teachers put in.

While artist in school programs will inevitably elicit an enthusiastic response from the students, it is important for artists to recognise and acknowledge the role of a teacher. Macdonald (1981) makes an important point about partnerships:

Thinking that one is superior to another is a recipe for disaster...beneficial partnerships require teachers who are secure in their professionalism and artists and art personnel who both respect the work of teachers and seek to compliment it (p.98).

Hall, Thomson and Russell (2007) reiterate this point:

[The relationship] relies on teachers and artists being willing to work together as partners, to respect one another's expertise and to give time to exploring theoretical standpoints and analysing pupils' work (p.617).

It is important to also recognise that it may be the teacher who sets set up the hierarchy of the artist as expert, and a teacher as someone less important. Teachers may retire to the staffroom while the expert takes their class or simply feel a sense of relief that they do not need to attend each lesson. Margaret sums it up when discussing the music specialist at Stafford School, "I'm excited that she's doing it, and it lets me off the hook, but for dance...".

While the relationship between the artist and teachers at Stafford Primary School was a positive one, where it is not, the results may be less than satisfactory. This statement is informed by my twenty-three years of teaching experience. Macdonald (1981) states, "Communication between teachers and artists in schools offers opportunities for misunderstandings where multiple parties are engaged in programs" (p.617). In my experience, and in response to the research material, positive results emerged when the artist and teacher were co-collaborators, with demonstrated mutual respect and understanding. Teachers gain experience where the artist is an equal and where the sessions are on-going.

For the artist, teaching provides an income for a period of time, but during that period they must be planning for the next contract, which may detract from the job at hand. "Often times when artists enter into school settings, they work briefly with children and teachers and then leave just as quickly" (Wolf, 2008, p. 90). I concur with Wolf who proposes that artists have little time to learn from teachers and in fact may not realise that they have anything to learn. While this would not

apply to all artists in schools, Wolf (2008) cites Vygotsky (1978) who argued “wouldn’t they [artists] achieve more if guided and encouraged by those who are more experienced?”(p.90). Stein (2004) observes that artists are, “intrinsically motivated to change the entire school’s climate into one in which arts integration is an integral part of the school curriculum” (p.14). This may not be received well by teachers in schools who have their own understandings of the curriculum and may feel threatened by an outsider’s perceived criticisms.

Dance Artists who work in schools without a background in school teaching, may struggle to understand a school’s hidden curriculum and politics that are usually quite different in each school. Teaching in itself is a complex art but it is conducted in an institution with complex formal and informal structures that can take some time to understand. Ball and Wells (2006) discussed the complexities of teaching and stated,

Institutions include (a) *formal structures*, explicit and enforced regulatory mandates or rules; (b) *normative structures*, publicly shared ideological commitments that serve to qualify an sense of what is obligatory; and (c) *cultural cognitive structures* “taken for granted” expectations, assumptions, shared meanings or internalised cognitive frameworks that support communication and goal-oriented joint activity (p.189).

While dance artists in schools may believe that they share an understanding of the structures that operate within schools, as they themselves have been students, their reality may be quite different from that of those working within the institution. The structures and agendas operating within schools can be very difficult for outsiders to grasp.

Where University students engage as artists in schools, the experience may be different. Graham & Stevens (2007) reflect on a partnership program where University dance students within the Education and Creative Industries degrees at the Queensland University of Technology, taught a series of sessions of dance at the junior and middle school levels of an Australian primary school. They began with a clear expectation for student success and the provision for professional development opportunities for the teachers. They stated,

The nature of teaching is often isolated, with few professional development opportunities, and the collaborative nature of this project meant support and the opportunity to gain arts knowledge was present both for the trainee artists-in-schools and the schoolteachers (p.12).

Graham & Stevens’ (2007) discussion however, did highlight behaviour management issues and a lack of space in the school to successfully implement dance lessons. There was considerable negotiation and communication between all parties to ensure that the outcomes of the project were satisfactorily realised. Both the Junior School and the Middle school teachers were hoping to meet

task descriptors that required a performance by the students, while the University facilitators were process driven.

Kaye (2010) discusses a similar program in a New Zealand school where university students were engaged as dance artists in schools. Behaviour management, group teaching, and planning were some of the difficulties encountered, but there was also confusion around the actual role of a dance artist in school. Kaye (2010) stated, "One dance artist felt that she did not want to be seen as a 'teacher', but primarily as an artist who can take some of the teaching skills and use them in this situation" (p.52). Some of the university dance artists were uncomfortable with the role of teacher and had imagined that they might be more like friends to the students. Kaye (2010) cited one of the dance artists, who stated,

Oh no, we are not going to be their friends, we're going to be their teachers, so just disconnecting myself from that was a bit hard at first...I didn't step up to the role of...I'm the boss, as much as I wanted to (p.50).

The Graham & Stevens project (2007), the Creative Partnerships in Cornwall (2007) and the Kaye artists in schools project (2010) all required considerable planning and communication with the schools involved. Wyse and Spendlove (2007) discussed the Creative Partnerships project and propose that:

Research was enhanced when a management environment was provided which valued the necessity of time to plan projects, time to organise the deployment of creative professionals and disseminate good practice locally and beyond (p.189).

The Creative Partnerships program worked over four years with community, professional and educational partners with the project receiving government, council and private funding. This program was an exciting initiative that had a great deal of support and a high profile within the community. Despite the program being valuable, the demands on teacher time would have been considerable. Time for planning and managing meanings and expectations is equally as important as face to face time in a classroom. This is a fact that many artists do not appreciate and many teachers do not have any time to give.

The funding of Artists in Schools projects presents another layer of issues. New Zealand schools are not always in a position where they can afford to spend money on an artist in schools program. If a school has funding available for allocation, there may be other priorities for spending. Artists in Schools programs more often than not will be spent on the more traditional arts such as visual art and music. Dance remains the poor cousin. Eisner (1974) adds to the discussion regarding funding by stating,

When federal agencies using public funds provide such funds to support various programs or projects, they have an obligation to determine in the most competent way possible whether the programs that have been supported are effective (p.21).

In 2008 the New Zealand Ministry of Education offered an 'Artists in Schools Programme', designed to, "provide challenging and engaging learning experiences that deepen student knowledge and understanding of different art forms and arts practice" (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2008). Information was sent to all New Zealand schools. Where schools were interested in taking part, they were required to complete an application form at the start of the year when primary schools complete their planning for the year ahead. There was no guarantee that an application would be successful. Each school was asked to select a group of students to be involved in the project. This suggests that the Artists in Schools Programme being offered was not inclusive in that it did not cater for all students at a particular school and was not allocated to all schools who applied. The focus was on the artist as providing the expertise. According to the Manawatu Standard newspaper (2009) the Artists in Schools Programme was cut in the New Zealand Government's May budget in 2009. This cut emphasises the transient nature of artists in schools. Without any continuation of dance in the classroom, dance will always remain an optional extra or an extra-curricular subject for those with a particular interest. The programme, while providing a rich experience for some students, could not be seen as professional development in the arts for teachers. The following metaphor illustrates a problem with small numbers of artists in schools programs. A plant in time of drought may steadfastly hold on to life. A tiny amount of rain could make matters worse, not enough to quench the thirst, upsetting the equilibrium and resulting in the death of the plant altogether.

Swan Road Primary School had experienced a dance artist in their school at an earlier time, someone they believed was a great artist, and yet there was little evidence of the continuation of dance once the artist had completed his project. Participants at Marion Primary had commissioned experts in to assist with productions, but as these productions were a one off, the focus for the teachers was supporting what the experts were doing rather than absorbing the teaching methods for themselves.

Bridie's spoke of specialist coming out for a whole school focus for perhaps a month and leading up to a performance. Her comments reflect a deeper issue and common attitude held by research participants and dance practitioners alike, and that is that dance may continue to be viewed as an optional extra rather than a curriculum subject in its own right. In my experience, teachers are often looking for a performance outcome from a dance program rather than dance as a creative process and experience. This was a dilemma Graham and Stevens (2007) faced when placing their students

into classrooms as artists in schools. While Adam, the Principal at Marion School, was aware of what dance in schools could be, he admitted that the focus needed to be elsewhere in his school for the moment:

I mean we look at our curriculum that we have to check off and we say, well every second year we'll have a production and that covers dance, drama and so on...total discharge.

Artists in schools come and go, infrequently in most cases. As the chapter on decile ratings emphasises, all schools are not equal, and the lower decile schools may not be able to afford artists in schools at all. To meet the needs of the students and the New Zealand dance curriculum, dance needs to be a sustainable subject with an on-going place in the classroom. The work of dance artists in schools can be a valuable addition to the school curriculum, but more research needs to be conducted to ascertain their role. Dance will continue to be a 'hit or miss' situation unless teachers themselves are empowered to teach dance.

It is my conclusion, that although dance artists in schools may offer a rich experience of dance, it is more important to develop an on-going experience of dance in the primary classroom. It may mean that funding is applied to teacher professional development in dance rather than artist in schools programs. Dance artists could be employed in schools in a complementary manner as performing artists who may work alongside teachers instead of the current trend of entering the classroom as the itinerant curriculum expert who is charged with the often unstated responsibility of delivering the dance curriculum for the year. Evidence suggests that success in any Artists in Schools Project rests upon an inclusive and respectful partnership between teachers, artists and children. The artist must not be viewed as someone with a higher or more important role in the classroom. While a dance expert need to be 'someone like us' that person would also require the expertise to confidently lead the way in dance education.

### **5.1.2 Other suggestions of professional development**

The main suggestion from the participants at Marion School was the idea of a workshop. David stated, "I like it being modeled...It's like any learning you have to be shown. You can't interact with a computer, no you couldn't".

David had participated in a dance workshop at Teachers' College and stated that he gained a great deal from it and had a lot of fun. The memory of that particular dance workshop wasn't the only workshop experience that had informed David on how to up-skill in any subject area. Work-shopping is the main method of up-skilling teachers in literacy and numeracy in New Zealand schools. As Adam stated, "we do reading to death, we do maths to death so we've already got plans, we know in



our heads what it is". Adam discussed the saturation of the curriculum in literacy and numeracy and suggested that there is no reason why this could not be done in the arts. Adam believed that the only way for significant change to take place would be to make the arts more important than literacy and numeracy. I concur with Adam's comments:

To get that across you need to do what the government has done with literacy and numeracy, and that's saturate it. You need to get people into schools and say, look, you can learn maths and writing through dance and movement. ...Make dance a way to learn writing, make dance a way to learn maths, a way to learn reading and in that way you can get to the so-called important curriculum areas and it becomes a part of it.

Professional development in dance was offered during the implementation stages of the 2000 New Zealand arts curriculum, although none of the participants in the case studies had availed themselves of these opportunities. Birman, Desimone, Porter and Garet (2000) stated,

research indicates that activities of longer duration, have more subject-area content focus, more opportunities for active learning and more coherence with teachers' other experiences than do shorter activities (p.30).

The professional development for numeracy and literacy has been on-going, subject specific and generally enthusiastically received by teachers. As Adam stated, "you need to do what the government has done with literacy and numeracy, and that's saturate it".

Lara suggested creating a folio of written exercises the same as the one she had been given when asked to be the Maori language co-ordinator at her school. This had worked for her and she had become familiar with Maori using exercises through practical application. Once again, the principle of a teacher using what works for him or her is based on the experience that she or he has had. It was necessary for Lara to up-skill in this area if she was to take on the role of Maori language co-ordinator and this was the method offered to her. Clandinin and Connelly (1996) offer an explanation for Lara's ability to adapt to change. They state,

What teachers know depends on the school stories and stories of school that constitute their landscape. As this landscape shifts, what they know shifts, as indeed do the values attached to that knowledge (p.29).

Lara had been offered the folio as a way of supporting her interest in being the Maori language co-ordinator. She had made a commitment to this role and made use of the available resources. She stated,

they nabbed me and said, don't worry, you'll learn along the way. This is a fantastic resource and I've told our teachers here, we'll just use parts of it and it works really well.

The fact that the folio directly related to what she needed to know provided an immediate benefit to Lara. Birman, Desimone, Porter and Garet (2000) support an approach that highlights content knowledge. They elaborated, “the degree to which professional development focuses on content knowledge is directly related to teachers’ reported increases in knowledge and skills” (p.30).

Most of the teachers in the three case studies immediately suggested workshops as being the most important resource for teaching dance. As stated, Stafford School teachers had been provided with a workshop in 2008 by the researcher. At the time everyone appeared to be stimulated by the simple ideas offered as ways into dance and expressed an interest in implementing dance in their classrooms. One or two people had followed up with a lesson or two, but, in the main, nothing happened. These teachers appeared to see and understand the benefits of dance to the students. My session was just a one-off for teachers and the lack of continuation may have been a factor. Margaret commented, “When I knew you were coming I thought, awww gawd, I’ll be embarrassed. It’s like little things pop up, like... do this, do this”. Sylvia explained that she believed the workshop would have had more impact if there had been some follow up. She stated,

I think it would have worked better with follow-up, and if we’d known there was going to be a follow up that’s a little bit of incentive to – a little bit of the carrot and the stick, you know, I’m coming back in six weeks and I’d love to know what you’ve done, so that’s that gentle push...because your session was great, we did enjoy it despite some people being very nervous.

Monique’s view was supported by many teachers:

Workshops with teachers would be fine, but coming into the class and actually showing us how it’s done and following on and keeping it going.

David suggested that subject advisors may be beneficial, pointing out that they had worked in other subject areas,

like we had advisors for science, we’ve had advisors for reading – um – probably they’ve been there, but because dance and drama has always been a sort of add-on, well I see it as an add-on that floats around the periphery, we could draw on those people. Once again here we are left holding a baby we can’t do anything with.

It is the on-going nature of the support that David refers to in this comment. Teachers can see that this is what works in other subject areas. Support isn’t something that can be floated past, never to be seen again. Not only is it of little help, but it sends a clear message related to the relative unimportance of the subject. Adam emphasised the need for on-going support:

I can’t stand one-offs. With the literacy and numeracy program, we had people coming out to the school into classrooms observing and then we would go into town and get some more teaching done, and then they’d come out again. They’d look around and just reflect on what

the teachers had learned and what had moved. There needs to be a saturation; an on-going thing. The teacher feels supported; the teacher has ideas given to them and then bounces them off the person they're working with. When you run out of ideas you can pick up the phone and then the person who's advising you can say, look I want you to try this and this and this.

There were some teachers already working with dance in their classrooms. Those teachers wanted written documentation, instructional DVD's and music. Caroline suggested, "If each school can have packs there with a big variety of resources". All teachers agreed however, that while they wanted on-going workshops and follow up sessions, they would like the written documentation, music and DVD's as a back-up. That was the way it had worked in the past for other subject areas. The emphasis was on what has worked in the past. Obviously teachers are not going to suggest a strategy they know nothing about. Within the premise that teachers like staying within the tried and true, there needs to be consideration of the other factors that play a role in the implementation of successful professional development. It would appear that successful professional development has, in the past, been related to areas of government focus. For dance to gain a position in the classroom there would need to be support from the New Zealand Ministry of Education and the whole school community. Teachers will follow Ministry of Education directives, as is the case with National Standards. As Clandinin and Connolly (1996) stated, "effective teaching was more defined by values and norms established by the Principal and others committed to the reform than it was by any form of outside knowledge"(p.29).

As stated, what teachers want in the way of resources and professional development appears to be what they are used to, what has worked for them in the past and what they grew up with; and in most cases this involves working with others. Birman, Desimone, Porter and Garet (2000) stated,

Professional development activities that include collective participation – that is, the participation of teachers from the same department, subject or grade – are more likely to afford opportunities for active learning and are more likely to be coherent with teachers' other experiences (p.30).

It would also appear that most people interviewed have learned what they know by doing, supporting an important aspect of dance education, the idea of children learning by doing. As Minton (2003) discussed, active learning is important if students and teachers are to receive and retain information and concepts. This is why teachers prefer to participate in a workshop as a way of retaining information, directly relating the professional development experience to the way that dance would work for the students in the classroom. Adam could see potential problems in simply providing a few workshops. He was passionate about making a change and could see that simply providing in-service in itself would not be enough. Unless dance is seen to be as valuable as literacy

and numeracy, then it will always be side-lined, used occasionally for concerts or to promote the school. The expert, 'someone like us', has a role and that is to assist in implementing a programme where dance is viewed as important and necessary. Dance practitioners could assist by leading the way and working alongside the teachers in exactly the manner that Adam suggests. Margaret's reflections on the importance of dance in the primary classroom seemed to be shared by many teachers:

Dance is an expression, creativity, problem solving, a different medium for children who need that medium or love that medium, for some kids that would be the best way of expressing themselves. You always get the kids who 'don't like art' or 'don't like something else', but through dance they can actually express what they feel. I do actually believe that. It sounds awful doesn't it? I realise its importance but I'm not....

## **5.2 From talk to action: A Cross-curricular approach to allow dance to be implemented in classrooms.**

Research suggests that teachers understand the importance of physical milestones in children's development. Margaret stated, "I understand the power of movement to develop a child's intelligence". Why then, do educators encourage children to sit still for most of the day once they start school? "Throughout history, educational philosophers from Aristotle through Dewey, Whitehead and Montessori have all encouraged the use of movement to promote learning" (Skoning, 2008, p. 3). Government policy makers and curriculum writers have listened, understood, and included dance into the primary school curriculum. The teachers in this study understand the benefits of dance. As Griss (1994) elaborated,

Children react to the world in physical ways. By the time they get to elementary school, they still feel comfortable in that non-verbal language: creative movement. To ignore this natural resource is a waste, a barrier to the process of education (p.78).

Listening, reading and understanding in dance seems to stop at the point of implementation in primary classrooms, and so the question was posed to the participants, "How would you feel about a cross-curricular approach to dance in your classroom?"

There was an enthusiastic response from all research participants to the idea of using dance to teach across the curriculum. Annie stated, "I would be delighted, yes, an integrated curriculum I think and it makes it exciting and fun". Joy could see this as a way round the problem of being hung up on teaching dance, "If there was a mathematical concept in there somewhere... "

Melanie provided an example of using dance to teach a science unit on the water cycle when she had been teaching in England and despite opposition from other teaching staff, she made it into a

huge production and presented it in front of the whole school. Melanie's experience was that the students remembered what they had learned because it was taught through movement and the students were able to retain the knowledge. Melanie's beliefs are borne out by research. Minton (2003) stated, "Active learning can be used as a hook to help students remember concepts and ideas. In fact, research shows that students learn best when they are actively participating" (p.1).

Pica's (2010) research also supports Melanie's statement, "Children need to physically participate in the learning process, using as many senses as possible, to truly understand concepts" (p.72). Griss, (1994) relates dance to a cross-curricular approach to learning,

The arts and education are truly inseparable: You cannot study the arts without learning concepts of math, science, history, and problem solving, nor can you be truly educated if you are ignorant of the role of the arts in culture and history (Griss, 1994, p. 79)p.79) .

Hong (2000) proposed that the way forward in education in 'postmodern' times is through engagement in a full range of literacies and representation:

Dance literacy serves two essential and complementary purposes: (a) the development of literacy in and about dance, and (b) the development of learning through dance, where dance may be a vehicle to enhance learning in other curriculum areas, including traditional literacy (p.3).

New Zealand educator, Bolwell (2011) in support of the suggestion of a cross-disciplinary approach to the dance curriculum stated,

By embracing the concept of literacy we can re-think the content and teaching of disciplinary dance...such a re-visioning need not be an arduous and soul-destroying journey, but instead one that is filled with new challenges and new possibilities (p.13).

Teachers in the study saw the cross curricular approach as a way round the crowded curriculum and the problem of time which had been identified by most teachers. David had been reading about students with special needs who had not achieved in maths, and how this had been turned around by introducing movement and clapping as a method of learning counting and patterns. In acknowledging the fact that we train students to sit behind desks and to sit still, David discussed some research he had read about where a school, "is getting kids to stand quite a bit of the day and saying that it produces good results, especially boys".

David couldn't remember the name of the school successfully employing movement in their teaching, but believed that it was in South Dunedin. Research identified Caversham School and an informal discussion was held between the researcher and the Principal, Mike Darracott, with a view to conducting further research in the future. Darracott expressed an interest in using dance as a method of teaching across the curriculum. Currently Caversham School run a perceptual motor

program to develop students' motor skills. According to Darracott (2010), a focus on movement has lifted the achievement rates of the students. "They are better able to concentrate and therefore apply themselves to other tasks" (Darracott, 2010). Briggs (2011) wrote of a 'Dancing like The Stars' program currently operating in four Dunedin schools. She highlighted Caversham School in particular:

Caversham School has been particularly enthusiastic and will be running their own program for the entire school that will run alongside 'Dancing like the Stars'. Principal of Caversham School, Mike Darracott says that the program is a fantastic opportunity to practice an active lifestyle (p.1).

Caversham School is rated as a decile 3. It is interesting to observe that, "where students are considered to have learning difficulties, movement is recognised as a successful teaching process to raise achievement levels of students" (Stone, 1992, p. 34). Movement based instruction however, can be beneficial to all children and, particularly to gifted students. In an interview with Rita Dunn regarding learning styles, Shaughnessy (1998) documented Dunn's responses, "Although gifted students prefer kinesthetic (experiential/active) and tactual (hands-on) instruction, many are able to learn auditorially and/or visually, although not as enjoyably" (p.144). If gifted learners continue to provide results through traditional learning methods, then the necessity to introduce kinesthetic learning into the classroom may not appear as a priority to educators. Dunn (1988) discussed past research,

Most early studies also restricted their examination of modalities to the auditory or visual, neither of which tends to be the strength of young children, who are more likely to learn tactually (through manipulatives or a hands-on approach) or kinaesthetically (through a whole body, activity oriented experience). Indeed, even older students who do not achieve well learn better through a tactual/kinaesthetic rather than an auditory or visual approach (p.305).

The early childhood teachers in this study tended to understand the value of movement in the development of fine motor skills. Many of the junior teachers incorporated some movement activities throughout the day without acknowledging such activities as dance, reinforcing the findings regarding meanings of dance. Suzanne discussed the way in which her year one students had made shapes with their bodies, "They can make letters, we did that the other day, made our bodies into a letter shape. I think that's a very viable idea. I'm aware of that now". Susan from Swan Road School had spoken about acting out stories and stepping out numbers without acknowledging the activities as dance. It appeared that the word 'dance' had connotations of skilled performances rather than a creative process of making dance. Although performance is one aspect of dance in the New Zealand Curriculum, it seems that more emphasis could be directed toward educating teachers to view the making of dance as 'dance'.

A study undertaken on physical activity patterns of pre-school children by Poest, Williams' Witt and Atwood (1989) attested that, "teachers in this study with a two year degree in early childhood education spent significantly more instructional time on movement activities than those trained in elementary education" (p.368). Movement is acknowledged as important in the first year or two of education, but teaching methods appear to move away from kinaesthetic learning as the children progress through the school system (R. Coleman, Piek, & Livesey, 2001). Their studies indicate that "children could improve significantly with a single exposure to a task that precludes visual input and requires predominantly the use of kinesthetic input triggers" (p.97). While the greatest improvement in kinesthetic ability occurs up until the age of seven, Visser and Geuze (2000) examined kinesthetic ability in young boys, and their results suggested that "kinesthetic ability continues to develop throughout adolescence" (p.93). This reinforces the importance of dance throughout primary education.

Caroline from Stafford School incorporates movement into her everyday teaching in a range of subject areas. Her students displayed confidence when questioned by the researcher as to the type of dance they do by spontaneously singing and dancing in answer to a question. Hanna (2008) discussed the power of dance to allow new ways of knowing in all areas of the curriculum. She stated, "Recent interdisciplinary research reaches beyond the insularity of the dance and arts worlds to reveal complex cognitive skills in dance making and perceiving" (p.495). "Movement literacy refers to the process of using human movement as a form of communication" (Minton, 2003, p. 1). Skoning (2008) proposes that, "Dance is beneficial for students who have difficulty expressing themselves orally or in writing" (p.5). This may be so, but I concur with Hanna (2008) who stated, "All youngsters may benefit from the creative process of dance-making and dance-viewing and learn to "write" and read the non-verbal which is critical to human survival" (p.495).

Employing dance as a cross-curricular approach to teaching may solve problems fitting dance into a crowded curriculum but unless on-going workshops were provided, it is unlikely that teachers would adjust their teaching methods to incorporate dance. Early childhood and junior teachers in this study have included some dance in the classroom, but there is room for more dance and for a conscious awareness of how dance is being used to promote learning. Currently the focus is upon well behaved and quiet children in these case studies which equates with sitting behind desks writing and reading.

There are many examples of the ways in which teachers have successfully implemented dance into their teaching (Griss, 1994; J. Hanna, 2008; Minton, 2003; Pica, 2010; Skoning, 2008). Griss (1994) provided a word of advice to teachers:

For teachers who may feel intimidated or overwhelmed by the idea of using movement and creative improvisation as a teaching tool, remember that you do not have to do the movement yourselves. The children will supply all the physicality needed for a successful lesson (p.80).

There is also the problem of finding the time to teach in this manner, as teaching a concept through dance may take longer than explicit learning, despite the fact that the learning is more likely to be retained when active learning is involved. As Pica (2010) stated, “Explicit learning may be quicker than learning through physical experience, but the latter has greater meaning for children and stays with them longer” (p.73).

Margaret’s comment, “I understand the power of movement to develop a child’s intelligence, but at the moment I’m too busy and what I’m doing works” is a powerful and enlightening statement. This research uncovered the fact that many teachers did understand the power of dance to communicate, yet didn’t take their thinking beyond that, as dance was something that ‘others’ did. Most of the teachers appeared to agree with Margaret’s comment. If they felt that they couldn’t teach dance without huge adjustments, then the complexity of changing their teaching methods to incorporate dance would be beyond them. Teachers may struggle to access creative methods of teaching through dance and will require assistance. Any dance exercises that were introduced would need to be easily understood by the teacher, interesting and varied to support the learning taking place, and beyond that, the teachers would need to know that the students were benefitting from the extra effort that they were expending by implementing dance activities. It is my belief that a considerable amount of support for teachers would be necessary to get the teachers started, enthusiastic and confident. Beyond that, as reinforced by the teachers in this study, the support would need to continue so that dance could be on-going in primary classrooms.

### **5.2.1 How to implement a cross-curricular approach?**

The key competencies, as listed in the New Zealand Curriculum (2007) of, “thinking, using language symbols and text, managing self, relating to others, participating and contributing” (p.12) would be well served by the introduction of dance alongside other curriculum subjects. Mathematics explores the use of patterns and relationships in quantities, space and time, as does dance. The presenting module of the English curriculum has an obvious connection to dance, however, all aspects of the English curriculum, would benefit from an engagement with movement. If teachers generally understand the value of dance, as did the participants in the study, is it any more likely that they will implement dance as a cross-curricular approach to teaching? I reiterate that an understanding and even enthusiasm from the participants to such an approach already exist. The time has come to make dance a practical reality in classrooms.



Learning in dance is different to learning through dance. Placing dance alongside another subject area is to bridge epistemologies between knowledge and knowing. A good example of learning through dance is where Melanie from Marion School used movement to convey the processes of the water cycle.

Some arts educators may claim that dance is selling itself short, by not arguing for a place in the primary school curriculum in its own right, and that there is a blurring of legitimate boundaries between disciplines. I would argue however, that dance already has a place in the curriculum and by implementing a process of teaching through dance, teachers will recognise the benefits to their students and become more confident teachers of dance generally. The effect of increased confidence in teaching dance is, I believe, likely to have a flow on effect to all learning. Catterall (2002) discussed a situation in America where,

Arts educators and artists found themselves in a dilemma as interest in learning through the arts escalated. They feared that the talk of learning mathematics through music or producing increased standardized test scores through the visual arts would demean the place of art in society, further shielding the intrinsic worth of the arts from the public eye (p.151).

Eisner's (1999) concern is acknowledged regarding the possibility of losing the value for the arts "in someone's version of the basics, when those basics have little or nothing to do with the arts" (p.146). It would be important to ensure that dance and the 'other' subject area were equally valued through the cross-curricular approach, rather than viewing dance as a method with which to improve children's achievement levels in other subject areas. As Eisner (1999) stated, "Arts education should refine the student's awareness of the aesthetic qualities in art and life" (p.148).

Despite an interest in learning through the arts, such a program has not significantly materialised in American or New Zealand schools. Now, as the topic is revisited, would seem a good time to begin in New Zealand. Research has indicated that students increase their cognitive skills through movement and dance, (Catterall, 1998; Dewey, 1920; Eisner, 1996; Gardner, 1983; H'Doubler, 1998; Kaufmann & Ellis, 2007; Minton, 2003; Stinson, et al., 1990; Sullivan, 1967; Tucker, 2011; Zakkai, 1997). Evidence regarding the transfer of learning through dance is scarce however, and this could be remedied through academic research in dance education. "We know less about transfer from learning in the visual arts and dance than we do in drama and music "(Catterall, 1998, p. 156).

A recent study investigated the impact on first grade students' basic reading skills through the intervention of dance activities. The results were overwhelmingly positive. McMahon, Rose and Parks (2003) stated,

The program was so successful in the area of consonants, vowels and overall phoneme segmentation that BRD students started out lower than the control students and then actually performed better than the control students in the post-test (p.119).

Although other studies have investigated the impact of arts education on academic achievement, (Catterall, 1998; J. Hanna, 1992; Little, 1978; Rauscher et al., 1997; Stinson, 1982) the 'Whirlwind' program as researched by McMahon, Rose and Parks (2003) examined "non-dance, cognitive outcomes, ...with control groups and quantified outcomes" (Keinanen, Hetland and Winner, 2000, p.296). I concur with Keinanen, Hetland and Winner's (2000) assertion that, "More research, more rigorously designed and driven by theory about possible transfer mechanisms, is required" (p.304). Tucker, (2011) writes of current research being undertaken by Lovatt, that has found that improvised dance assists students with divergent thinking, "whereas when they engage in structured dance it helps with their convergent thinking" (p.1). It is not only the dance educators who understand the benefits of transfer mechanisms, the participants in the study understand, as do the policy makers and curriculum writers in New Zealand and elsewhere. The UNESCO Arts Education Advisory Committee understands. It is not the understanding that is the drawback to the implementation of dance but a practical application of this knowledge that needs to be the focus of further academic study. It is time to apply the shared knowledge, as Purcell (1994) stated, "Students experience dance as an exhilarating and challenging physical activity that simultaneously utilizes the cognitive, motor and affective domains" (p.21).

If more teachers read the research, then the myths around dance education could be broken down and teachers could follow the path they believe in with more studies documenting the process. Catterall (1998) stated, "transfer [of learning] could materialise if researchers would reformulate their theories about transfer and exercise patience in seeking manifestations" (p.156). Cross curriculum teaching through dance in each of the three case studies was limited to a few teachers who were utilising the benefits but such benefits were not known to all teachers. Teachers do not have the power to implement widespread changes and therefore studies could be undertaken that examine cognitive outcomes with control groups of a significant size over a significant period of time. Where educational policy makers are involved in the process support may be offered to the implementation of dance as an equal partner alongside other subjects.

This study does not suggest that dance should push other subjects aside, rather that dance becomes a focus in teaching, so that a wider range of students' minds can be stimulated so that learning becomes easier and more enjoyable for them. The outcomes would be designed to benefit both dance and the 'other subject'. Once teachers had experienced the teaching of dance themselves to a point where they were comfortable, they could carry on with less assistance. As stated, teachers'

patterns of behaviour are, according to Thompson (1984) “a function of their views beliefs and preferences about the subject matter and its teaching” (p. 106). According to this research, teachers already appear to understand the value of teaching dance, but because it is not something within their experience or history of teaching, it simply doesn’t happen. Margaret’s comments appear to confirm this theory:

Any dance I’ve ever done was Scottish Country Dance at Macandrew, that’s it probably, folk dancing. I would teach folk dancing, but that’s very limited in the field of dance, not what I’d call creative dance at all.

The teaching of folk dance may be a starting point for Margaret. Folk dancing can be a valuable addition to dance in the classroom. Where teachers understood the value of making dance through a creative process, they seemed to discount other forms of dance. While diverse meanings of dance emerged in this research, personal meanings of dance appeared to be fixed. It appeared that established meanings of dance are resistant to change and the participants’ experiences of teaching dance had assisted in forming individual meanings. It was interesting to note that teachers who had some background experience in dance, like the teachers at Stafford School one of whom was a Go-Go dancer and the other a ballroom dance champion, saw no connection between that experience and dance in their classrooms. According to this research, prior experience would appear to be a key to developing confidence to teach dance but where misconceptions exist regarding dance in schools, no amount of experience will make a difference.

One way to implement a cross-curricular approach in dance might be to take a Principal’s advice. Adam suggested that dance be made as important as literacy and numeracy and that dance should saturate the curriculum in a cross-curricular approach. Care would need to be taken however to ensure that saturation did not cause similar problems to those associated with the introduction of National Standards. Where teachers were empowered collaborators a way forward in dance seems possible.

It would seem important to provide all the resources teachers have requested and have supportive colleagues in schools working with the teachers to ensure that they become confident with cross-curricular teaching in dance. Each subject curriculum would remain unchanged. The key competencies would be well served with a movement based approach to teaching concepts. It is suggested that the way forward would be to start with a focus school, drawing attention to the project through journal articles, formal discussions with teachers in schools and reports to the New Zealand Ministry of Education. Perhaps an initial aim could be to start shifting thinking regarding the

perceived subject hierarchy. Eisner (1999) stated, "Have they ever thought about asking how reading and math courses contribute to higher performance in the arts?" (p.143).

### **5.3 Time for a change: attitudes of school communities toward dance**

The attitudes and culture of a school community toward dance could be difficult to change where attitudinal patterns are fixed and where participants resist change, particularly where Principals and Boards of Trustees oppose change. National Standards have been implemented against the will of the majority of teachers, but, as the Principal of Marion School explained, "National Standards are mandatory", teachers will follow the imposed requirements. As teachers are used to operating within institutional rules, adjustments will be made and they will become used to the teaching requirements for National Standards. Caroline was philosophical about the change to National Standards and likened it to wearing seatbelts or smoking in public places. She stated,

There was a big uproar but down the track nobody thinks twice about it. It's going to be another of those changes where we don't want the change. In other countries that have it, it's failed.

Margaret's concern was similar to Caroline's and she could see that even the teachers who feel they can handle the change without too much disruption to the way they are currently teaching will start to panic and fall into line. She stated,

We've got to do this and it doesn't look good if we're not and that will certainly make it worse than it is now, and it's bad enough now. So it's not a positive move at all. The fact that it's not considered important in any of the arts is pretty soul destroying.

National Standards are a good example of changes being forced upon unwilling teachers. Most of the teachers interviewed in the three case studies had negative views about the Introduction of National Standards. It would be important that an introduction to dance across the curriculum was introduced carefully.

Teachers are generally considered conservative. Researchers discuss the need that teachers have for stability in their job and the state of vulnerability they may enter when subjected to perceived judgments from the school community. Day, Kington, Stobart and Sammons (2006) elaborated, "As vulnerability increased so they tended toward passivity and conservatism in teaching" (p.605). Despite a general inclination toward passivity, some schools in New Zealand have been protesting about National Standards. A national New Zealand news website ran a news article with the heading 'Schools protest National Standards' (2011, p. 1).

The need to conform will drive the changes in New Zealand and after a period of time teachers will settle into new patterns and forget a time when they didn't have to deal with National Standards. An important point to raise in this discussion is that, despite the need to conform in this instance, teachers will fight for what they believe in and if teachers can see children benefitting from dance in the classroom, there are distinct possibilities for change.

Changes will not be made however, without considerable discomfort and resistance. Not every teacher will wish to absorb new ideas into their teaching; in fact care must be taken to ensure that teachers feel supported through change. Some members of the school community will hold to old methods of teaching, testing and measuring as it can provide security for both students and teachers alike.

It is possible for attitudes and school cultures to undergo changes over time, and through the process of change, discover new understandings of dance in the primary classroom. Feldman and Pentland (2003) discussed reconceptualising organisational routines as a source of flexibility and change and argued that,

The relationship between ostensive and performative aspects of routines creates an on-going opportunity for variation, selection and retention of new practices and patterns of action within routines and allows routines to generate a wide range of outcomes from apparent stability to considerable change (p.94).

Where schools embrace a continuous approach to improvement in all aspects of teaching and learning, and where the management is strong and positive, there is an inherent possibility for those schools to generate change. Routines are not only a source of stability but also may serve as a vehicle to support change in the classroom.

Teachers have had to adapt to changes as different foci have come and gone according to current political policies. Teachers have modified and reconstructed prior beliefs and understandings about teaching, as was the case when 'Tomorrow's Schools' was introduced into New Zealand education. As previously stated by Kagan (1992), when outside information is accepted it is filtered through existing belief systems, "translating it into their own unique pedagogies"(p.75). Teachers are not likely to make changes without good reason. If changes were to be successfully implemented, the school climate would need to be strong with all administrative staff supporting the changes. Strong support would need to be available for every teacher in the school and the participants would need to feel supported in the wider educational community. As Huberman and Miles (1984) state, "Large-scale change bearing innovations lived or died by the amount of assistance that their users received once the change process was underway" (p.273).

When conducting interviews in the context of this study, a specific question was posed regarding the overall social climate of each school, as a supportive administrative body would be essential in supporting teachers through change. Teachers from both Marion and Stafford schools provided glowing reports of the school culture at each of their schools. Margaret expressed how the teaching staff at Stafford felt about coming to school, “It’s like a nice place to come each morning and meet friends...it’s like another family isn’t it”? The fact that teachers rarely move from this school suggests contentment in their workplace. A Board of Trustees member and parent from Marion school summed up the general feeling of that school’s semi-rural community:

Oh the school’s got a great community feel about it. We brought our kids out from town because we wanted to be out in the country and have that country school feeling. It’s just got a really caring sort of feel about it. The older kids really look after the younger kids.

It is important to acknowledge that the Principals of each of the schools involved in this study were supportive of the research. This would suggest that they were confident of their positions within their school communities and supportive of dance education.

Some teachers from Marion school were able to discuss cultures at different schools where they had taught previously as being negative environments. In each of these cases it was the Principal who in their opinion had caused the negativity, from being someone who made bad appointments to using dictatorial methods with staff. Some teachers may create opportunities to move on but those who can’t are often those who find it difficult to get new appointments and so stay on at the school and compound the problem of negativity by feeling trapped. Paula, a parent from Swan Road School discussed the fact that she had brought her children to the school due to a negative culture at the country school they had previously attended. It was the Headmaster who she believed had caused the problems. She stated,

It was basically a headmaster that the Board dissolved. He came out for the lifestyle rather than the teaching and it really tore the community apart...If a Board dissolves, something’s happening and we weren’t willing to sit and wait and see...A forty minute drive twice a day is just one of those things you just have to do.

While the school culture in each of the case studies were positive, such comments from teachers and a parent, suggest that cross-curricular dance may not be a welcome addition at all schools.

The attitude toward dance generally over the three case studies established that parents and teaching staff alike were aware of the importance of movement in the development of children’s cognitive skills. The teachers felt that parents expected a focus on literacy and numeracy but were generally happy to see dance as part of the end of year concert. Nicky and Tom, parents at Swan

Road School, spoke of the benefits of discipline, focus and confidence that flow from dance lessons to enhance academic achievement. Nicky stated,

I guess I can see huge benefits in it and I watch...we had a prize-giving here not long after Bella had started and probably 90% of the children who went up to get some sort of award or prize were dance students.

Tom is a member of the Board of Trustees and spoke of a dance teacher in a nearby town who was an amazing teacher and a stickler for discipline:

Well, Miss Cochrane was saying that good dance pupils, she's seen it in maths, good dance pupils seem to have a good sense of rhythm and whether rhythm is tied in directly to dance or not, I don't know, but she said it is and said that dancers are normally high achievers, particularly in maths, but academically overall.

Tom's respect for Miss Cochrane's theories combined with evidence he had noted himself, convinced him of a link between dance and high achievement. Nicky was clear in her understanding of what dance could be in the classroom:

Maybe at some level people are nervous of dance because like I said it's expected to be done in particular ways. If you relate it to drama or something like that so that you have something that you're interpreting and working with so that it takes the focus off having to do the dance properly.

Nicky's point introduces the idea of changing attitudes toward perceptions of dance. Some parents in the study felt that dance was something extra-curricular and for some teachers; dance was, for the moment, Jump Jam. Each of the participants in the study however, was interested in reflecting on their beliefs of what dance is in the primary classroom and were open to the expansion of their thinking.

The fact that Adam was able to promote the abolition of homework and introduce home learning instead, is a strong indicator that change is possible in a supportive and positive environment. As previously mentioned, there were only two parents who didn't like the idea of home learning. Everyone else seemed enthusiastic and understood the reasoning and concepts behind the change. The change had been made by educating the parents. Homework had been an important part of the parents' own education and something that was firmly established in the school system. I reiterate that the indications are that change is possible within a school culture if it is handled well and within a supportive environment. The supportive environment would appear to be a crucial point, when discussing changing attitudes toward the teaching of dance in the school.

In my experience over twenty years of teaching, when a Principal wanted to stick firmly to a decision that went against the opinion of the staff, he would say 'This is what the parents want'. That

comment would close the discussion. As a teacher, I believed that parents generally concurred with the decisions of the Principal. Had he decided to educate them and convince them that they didn't need four lots of reporting a year, as an example, then I believe that parents would have supported his decision.

The findings in this study indicate that despite the introduction of National Standards, or even because of it, there are enough participants who understand the need for different thinking regarding dance education. Some of the teachers in this study would have been teaching in the eighties and nineties when the call was for 'Back to the Basics'. Teachers have always taught the three 'R's, in fact they have always been a focus, so how do teachers go back to something they have never left? As National Standards cause literacy and numeracy to dominate the curriculum in a more intense manner, measurement gains more importance. Measuring and reporting has long been a factor in schools, so how will this political reiteration of standard measurements improve student results? It will be important when implementing a process of change through dance to acknowledge government requirements for reporting. I propose that the introduction of dance in primary classrooms will improve students' results in all areas of the curriculum in a way that talking about it, or pushing harder, simply cannot achieve. By continuing to apply the same old methods of teaching, New Zealand education will get what it's always got.

This research did not set out to suggest curriculum changes, but rather to examine the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms. The indications are that the time is right to change attitudes and culture around the application of dance in the classroom, especially when introduced as being complementary to literacy and numeracy.

Where movement is introduced in a cross-curricular approach, particularly when implemented alongside literacy and numeracy, it would be important for the whole school community to be educated about the development of the whole child through movement. Eisner (1982) discusses misunderstandings about cognitive development in the affective domain. He states a commonly held belief, "Affect is supposed to deal with feeling and not knowing, while cognition supposedly deals with knowing and not feeling" (p.27). Eisner goes on to state what many teachers already know, "In short, affect and cognition are not independent processes, nor are they processes that can be separated. They interpenetrate just as mass and weight do" (p. 28). Teachers have always struggled with measuring student performance in the affective domain, but where the measurements are already in place for literacy and numeracy, results will indicate the advantages of introducing affective dance activities to improve student performance. I believe that teachers will become familiar with and value affective assessment as it is closely related to the aims of the New Zealand



dance curriculum. Once school communities and government agencies are provided with evidence regarding the benefits of dance through a successful cross-curricular dance approach, then I believe that dance will become appreciated as an art form in its own right in classrooms throughout New Zealand.

Teachers may intuitively know and understand the need to introduce dance into their teaching but feel powerless to make changes. Time is against them and therefore strong and on-going support is essential if change is to be made. Members of the wider school community are interested in what is best for the students, and if the Principal can educate the Board of Trustees and parents of the benefits of dance for their children's development, then I believe that support will be given. If for example, change can be made regarding the deeply rooted habit of homework, then I believe that change can take place regarding the place of dance in the primary classroom.

## **5.4 Insights**

There are many reasons why teachers do not teach dance. This research discovered, however, that there are deeper philosophical or foundational issues that have had a greater impact on the delivery of the curriculum. It is my belief that, if all the obvious issues are dealt with, the underlying concerns will remain and successfully inhibit the implementation of dance in the primary classroom. An obvious issue may seem to be that of a lack of confidence. This research identified that while there may be some confidence issues, it was more a lack of experience in teaching dance that inhibited its implementation in the classroom. Beyond that, experiences of teaching dance in classrooms will remain scarce unless the hidden significance of teacher biography is addressed.

### **5.4.1 Addressing confidence in teaching dance**

Research supports the belief that a lack of confidence causes a lack of dance teaching in primary schools (S. Hennessy, 2000; Kagan, 1992; J. Mills, 1989; Rolfe, 2001). Along with such beliefs, a commonly held assumption is that male teachers would find teaching dance more difficult than would female teachers. When interviewed individually, few teachers cited a lack of confidence as the main reason for an absence of dance in their classrooms, and the teachers who were most informed about dance were Adam and David from Marion Primary School, John from Stafford Primary School and Dean from Swan Road Primary School. David spoke of wanting more dance in his classroom, stating, "whether you're a natural or not...drama more too, but definitely dance. That's the area I'd like to spend more time in". There were many female teachers who understood the benefits of dance, particularly Caroline who was implementing dance in her classroom, but the

males stood out as having a depth of understanding regarding dance education. Five male teachers were interviewed and four of the five were amongst the strongest advocates of dance.

Most teachers were involved in Jump Jam, some teachers participating along with the students. David made what appeared to be a contradictory comment stating, "I like physical movement, but to be up in front of the kids dancing....The Jump Jam made me feel good because we get up and do it". David 'gets up in front of the kids' when performing Jump Jam, but felt that this might be difficult when teaching dance. It is interesting to reflect that each of the participants in the case studies had experience of Jump Jam and were all involved in a practical manner in the classroom. It seemed that teachers did not lack confidence to physically involve themselves in Jump Jam, but they didn't see it as dance. David was dancing in the classroom, but didn't see it as dance, and there was a difference in that he wasn't teaching it himself. All participants in Jump Jam follow the movements on a screen. Once the teachers experienced Jump Jam, they developed a confidence to continue. Amanda explained what she perceived to be the difference between Jump Jam and dance, "dance is a means, is a language, is a way of communicating". Bill, a parent, stated, "I suppose I look at dance a bit like a language". The implicit meanings that participants in this study associated with the word, dance, appeared to be a stumbling block in allowing dance a recognized place in school programmes. Meanings associated with femininity, elitism and skill appeared to inhibit an understanding of dance education in schools. Students were dancing when performing Jump Jam as were some students in the early years of education. Participants in this study generally viewed the study of dance as leading up to a public performance.

In many respects, the lack of confidence to teach dance emerged as more of a generally held assumption, than a reality for the participants. Teachers understood what dance could be in the classroom and that they needn't be a dancer in order to teach dance. Deb expressed her understanding,

It's part of a whole person and what makes up a whole person is dance...I don't think you need to be a dancer [to teach dance]. No, look at me (laughs). I also think you don't have to be a musician to teach music, but it's the same with music, music isn't taught very well in schools.

Melanie's understanding of dance education is restated,

It's a great way for kids to express themselves. ...and there's all those things that go with it, coordination and confidence and balance...it's to help self-esteem and just having the confidence to get up in front of a group and it's not always presenting, but it can be part of it. For some kids it can be dealing with bad behaviour and things like that.

When discussing professional development, teachers spoke about dance in a manner that suggested they were already aware of the expectations for a successful dance lesson. Some teachers, especially those in the junior classes were including movement in their daily activities. They were not consciously seeking to include dance but when they thought about it, dance was being incorporated in many classroom activities and rituals such as counting, *Waiata*, or singing activities. Monique explains how she combines music and song, “some of us sing the song while others move to part of it, that’s dance”. The school production gave Lara a reason to teach dance. She states,

I just got them moving and in groups, hear the rhythm, count the beats, make some steps up to it, let’s share it, let’s put it all together. We just made a dance.

While some dance and movement was happening in classrooms of teachers involved in this study, most teachers were not consciously seeking to include dance in their daily programs. Breaking the cycle of established classroom rituals where dance is not a conscious inclusion would require energy when many teachers in this study felt they were already under pressure.

This research provided examples of teachers who had participated in dance teacher education, and yet chose not to teach dance in the primary classroom. Although Monique had received very little dance teacher education, she made the point, “It was enough to get you passionate about it to see what you could achieve and how much fun it can be”. Sylvia thought back to the dance teacher education she had received over twenty years ago and stated, “I can remember Jane’s classes very clearly now. That’s interesting, she was probably really good...I quite liked it, I enjoyed it”. Tim had been taught by Ralph Buck and felt that it equipped him well to come out and teach dance, stating, “It did, it did. I must admit I felt fairly confident”. These teachers were not consciously including dance in their own classrooms. Reasons varied and yet it seemed to me that teachers created answers to the ‘why not?’ question when they themselves didn’t really know why they chose not to teach dance. The obvious answers like space and time may provide satisfactory explanations to the teachers, and yet they understand the importance of dance and care about offering their students dynamic opportunities for development. It appears easy to find reasons to avoid teaching dance when the curriculum is ‘crowded’ and the focus is on literacy and numeracy. Teachers in this research appeared interested in teaching dance but stopped short of actually teaching it. Dance seemed so close and yet so far away.

What emerged from this research was that the teachers in this study avoided teaching dance because of a lack of experience, not a lack of confidence. The lack of experience began with never having been taught dance in school themselves and this was followed by not teaching dance to their

students. Hennessy, Rolf and Chedzoy, (2001), cite a participant in their study whose comments support my belief:

She firmly believed that doing it (teaching) rather than thinking about it developed confidence “that’s the main thing for building your confidence, it’s having a good lesson. I can actually teach that subject”(p.60).

This particular student teacher had a background in music, but because she was not afforded the opportunity to teach music, it became the subject with which she was least confident, whereas art and dance where she had been provided with teaching experience, became the subjects with which she was most confident. Another participant in Hennessy, Rolf and Chedzoy’s research supports the view that it is teaching experience that is lacking, rather than confidence. Hennessy, Rolf and Chedzoy (2001) state,

Kate felt she had gained confidence in teaching dance largely due to her practical work with the children: ‘I was able to improve my confidence by experience...I’ve had a go’. She was not sure where her confidence had come from: ‘I’ve never done anything like this before, it’s more instinct than anything else...I’m learning with them but able to give them ideas that they wouldn’t think of’ (p.62).

Teachers in this study were participating in Jump Jam because it had been introduced as a whole school initiative in each of the case studies. Once teachers had experienced Jump Jam they became confident about participating with their students.

Teachers will only become confident teachers of dance when provided with the experience of teaching it. It would not matter how much evidence is presented to teachers or policy makers on the importance of dance, or how wonderful a dance curriculum document might be; unless teachers are given opportunities to experience dance teaching, there will be very little dance taking place in New Zealand primary classrooms. To reiterate, most teachers lack the vital experience of teaching dance, therefore inhibiting a successful implementation in the classroom. The key is in teaching experience which may only be realised once the important underlying issue of teacher biography is addressed.

#### **5.4.2 Acknowledging teacher biography in dance**

Teachers in this study understood the benefits of including dance in their programs. Most participants understood the importance of the creative aspect of dance and that dance could improve a student’s overall performance in many areas. Monique stated, “I think that kids would miss out on something enriching in their lives if they didn’t get some dance”. Dean’s statement covered a general understanding, “I hear, I forget; I see, I remember; I do, I understand”. Most teachers even knew what was expected of them, despite being nervous to take that step and actually include dance in their everyday activities. The obvious factors of time, space, professional

development, resources, and a perceived lack of importance, certainly impinged upon a successful implementation of dance, but there seemed to be something more locked underneath the interviewees' words in this research. I felt that, even if all the obvious factors were addressed, dance would still be an occasional occurrence, if it took place at all. This belief is based on my previous experience where teachers were provided with resources and professional development, where they had the space and the time, where they were provided with strategies and practical experiences to implement dance in a cross-curricular manner. The teachers were all enthusiastic and could recognise the benefits, but despite that, they reverted back to teaching conventional subjects in a conventional manner. A lack of experience of teaching dance emerged as an important finding in this research, yet the question remained, 'why don't teachers take the initiative and actually teach dance?' A possible answer to this question provides an insight into the underlying and unconscious reasons why teachers avoid teaching dance in their classrooms. Brown (2003) explains, "Teaching behaviours reflect the beliefs and values that teachers hold about the learner's role in the exchange" (p.1). One might assume that teachers hold values and beliefs congruent with modern educational tenets and the learning experienced through teacher education. It would seem however that while such influences have a role in developing and constructing teachers' beliefs and values, the strongest influence is a result of their own experience as a student in the classroom. Crews, Stitt-Gohdes, and McCannon(2000) stated that, "Historically, literature has supported the belief that most teachers teach the way they learn" (p.3). Stitt-Gohdes (2001) reiterated, "Educators do prefer to teach as they learn" (p.3). Teachers will unconsciously develop beliefs and values around teaching that are consistent with their own learning experience, their own personality and their own life experiences. Raymond's (1997) research suggests that this is particularly evident with pre-service teachers, "beginning teachers reveal much about their beliefs as they struggle to develop their teaching practice" (p.550). Teachers have become successful through an education system that worked for them, so surely it must surely work for others. This may not necessarily be a conscious thought; in fact none of the teachers interviewed in the present study made such a statement. Obvious reasons, such as a lack of professional development and resources, a lack of space, a lack of time and messages from government agencies about the relative un-importance of dance compared to the more 'important subjects' were the reasons provided. While I acknowledge the participants' beliefs, and can empathise with their situation, evidence from the study suggests that teachers appreciate the value of dance in the classroom and its absence is due to a lack of dance teaching experience.

Many studies have been undertaken regarding the socialisation of teachers (Maddox, 1968; Mardle & Walker, 1980; Petty & Hogben, 1980; Silvernail & Costello, 1983; Zeichner & Grant, 1981). Tabachnick and Zeichner (1984) cited Lortie (1975) who argued that "the socialisation of teachers

occurs largely through the internalisation of teaching models through the thousands of hours spent as a pupil in close contact with teachers” (p.29). As such, socialisation appears to be the main determining factor in how teachers teach and what they teach; this raises concerns for the future of teaching, and particularly the future of teaching dance where teachers have had little or no experience as students. Unless current students are exposed to change, the cycle will continue and teaching will continue in much the same way as it always has. Hodas (1996) discussed a similar resistance to the introduction of dance into schools, in this case, with technology:

After proclaiming the potential of the new tools to rescue the classroom from the dark ages and usher in an age of efficiency and enlightenment, technologists find to their dismay that that teachers can often be persuaded to use the new tools only slightly, if at all (p. 197).

In examining the present research, there are some statements from the interviews that stand out. These reinforced the belief that teachers will always teach the way they always had unless something rather major happens to shake up their belief systems. Naomi spoke about dance as being, “a wee bit scary, because I think it’s from my past experiences coming from school and I don’t ever remember doing any dance at primary school”. Naomi’s insightful comment reinforces the literature regarding teaching as you were taught.

Margaret’s statement was a turning point in the direction of the research, “I understand the power of dance, the power of movement in developing a child’s intelligence, but at the moment, what I’m using works”. Margaret was referring to developing a child’s intelligence through conventional teaching methods, similar to the way in which she herself was taught. She seemed so close and so enthusiastic, so why was dance not happening in her classroom? Margaret’s is an experienced teacher whose students are achieving good results. The introduction of dance could offer an opportunity for her students to raise their achievement levels further. Duvivier (2010) proposes,

If success breeds success in learning, then why do we set kids up for failure every day? If we want them to succeed, we need to stop asking them to fit into a mould that doesn’t suit them and allow them the freedom to learn in ways that they learn best (p.1).

Margaret is not setting her students up for failure; in fact she appears to have found ways of adapting her teaching strategies to cater for individual students. It is possible however, that by introducing dance into her teaching, students may become even more engaged in the learning process and require less individual time with their teacher. The students could become even more successful and Margaret may find the teaching to be more student-centered. It is interesting to reflect on the fact that generally teachers in schools settle into a ‘comfort zone’ in order to stay safe, using methods that work for them. In staying safe teachers may eliminate creativity and imagination, resulting in bored teachers and bored students. “Young people’s creative abilities are most likely to

be developed in an atmosphere in which the teacher's creative abilities are properly engaged" (Jeffrey & Craft, 2004, p. 2).

As stated, Margaret herself loves to dance in an informal manner:

Dance is an expression. It's like Olly [student] said, it's a joyous thing, something like that; and it is like that. I know when I'm at home, I'm really, especially with my kids, if I'm doing something and I feel really joyous, I'll do a wee dance, really crazy and really unco, but my kids laugh and I laugh, just that expression of joy and harmony I think.

Perhaps the step toward dance would not seem too great for Margaret.

According to the findings of this research, pre-service teacher education may benefit from modification so that it can serve education and particularly dance education with more positive results. Currently, according to the results of this study, pre-service teacher education could capitalise on the available knowledge regarding "that what teachers know about teaching is largely constructed out of the experiences and classrooms from which teachers have come" (Freeman & Johnson, 1998, p. 400). Borg (2004) discusses research where a pre-service teacher stated,

I don't want to be this kind of teacher, but I don't have any other experiences. It's just like I fall into the trap of teaching like I was taught and I don't know how to get myself out of that model.

Britzman (1986) concurred,

the dominant model of teacher education as vocational training does not address the hidden significant of biography in the making of a teacher particularly as it is lived during student teaching (p.442).

Change proceeds slowly in education systems. Schools are complicated institutions and the idea of social collectives as the sums of individual capacities are complex and vary from school to school. If teachers have not experienced dance as learners, then they will not include dance in their teaching. This current research suggests that by offering teachers on-going and in-depth support they may begin to experience dance in their classrooms. While this statement appears to contradict the research that teachers will continue to teach the way in which they themselves were taught, if teachers were provided with ongoing dance teaching experiences and this was combined with an understanding of the influence of teacher biography, then change may be possible.

### **5.4.3 Support for teachers**

Teachers need support to teach dance. This finding emerged clearly in the research and has already been discussed. It is important to stress, however, that teachers spoke of the need to be immersed in professional development and to have access a wide range of resources. Dance teaching

experience will only come with the provision of professional development and resources. Without such support, dance will decline and disappear in New Zealand primary classrooms. Professional development is provided for literacy and numeracy and if the teaching of dance is to be considered as an important option, all schools must be saturated with dance resources and workshops. Comments from the Marion Primary School Principal, Adam, certainly reflect the findings of the research. "To get that across you need to do what the government have done with numeracy and literacy and that's saturate it". A range of professional development opportunities and resources could be made available to all schools, so that the teachers themselves are able to make decisions about matters that affect them directly.

Recognition of other factors that can impact on the socialisation of teachers could be taken into account when developing strategies and support for teachers. There are those who argue that the ecological aspects of a classroom (Copeland, 1979), the co-operating teacher (Yee, 1969) and the bureaucratic characteristics of a school (Hoy & Rees, 1977) affect the way in which a teacher teaches and reverses the impact of teacher education. I concur that all of these factors impinge on a teacher's ability to teach dance in the classroom, however, research into New Zealand dance education within an economic and sustainable society would, however, suggest that the nations rated as most successful on the PISA scale treat their teachers with a great deal of respect. The status of a teacher in Finland rates alongside that of a doctor. Teachers teach less, are given a certain amount of autonomy, are provided with on-going professional development and are given time to work collaboratively with their peers. If New Zealand teachers felt valued and supported then they might find the emotional energy to step forward and try new teaching approaches such as the implementation of dance in a cross-curricular context. The teachers in this study generally felt under pressure to comply with the recently introduced National Standards.

Within the three case studies related to this research, the school culture varied according to a myriad of factors. Within each of the schools however, there was an overarching expectation that schools conform to societal expectations and norms, and this in itself causes teaching to stay within conventional boundaries.

### **5.5 Within the school culture: the need to conform to societal expectations and norms**

Teachers work within systems that require a degree of conformity. Teachers begin as students, often moving directly to teacher education then back to school. An adjustment to the reality of the



workplace can be harsh for many first year teachers, schools are not the places they experienced as students and they either adjust, or leave:

Teachers enter their careers with idealistic expectations, but political changes in teachers stem from their acquired sense of vulnerability to criticism and attack from others. They work to manufacture a political self (to greater or lesser degrees) based on protectionist (reactive) and power (proactive) considerations (Blase, 1988, p. 113).

According to Dowling and Pfeffer (1975):

Organisations seek to establish congruence between the social values associated with or implied by their activities and the norms of social behaviour in the larger social system of which they are a part (p. 122).

How then do teachers find their place within a school, and how do they view themselves within that institution?

### **5.5.1 Recognising conventional values**

In my twenty-three years of experience as a teacher I believe that teachers do not view themselves as conventional thinkers, generally regarding themselves as socially aware, informed, educated and able to discuss and debate issues of importance. Blase (1988) however, citing Lortie (1969) stated, "In effect, teaching attracts individuals who accept the status quo and who identify with conventional values" (p. 127). Teachers' functioning within the institution of a school allows little space for individual freedom. Blase (1988) explained, "Through experience, teachers became aware of typical political considerations important to, in the teachers words, to 'play the game' and survival at work" (p.130). Institutions create social norms. Oliver (1992) concurred:

From an institutional perspective, the force of habit, history and tradition within the organisation creates value congruence among organisational members around the propriety of re-enacted activities to acquire a rule-like status that renders them highly resistant to change (p.563).

Schools are institutions that date back to ancient civilisations and in some respects the tradition of teaching remains the same. Windschitl (2002) states, "Consistent with historical precedent, educators are struggling to develop new and sophisticated repertoires of practice to realise the vision of children 'constructing their own knowledge'" (p.131). Adam from Marion Primary School made a comment referring to education moving backwards through the introduction of National Standards:

While they are focussing on that, dramatically and heavily, what happens to everything else?...and I'm really stressing out about science, and I'm stressing out about physical education and I'm stressing out about (in that order) and I'm stressing out about the arts

because they will not get a mention and we'll become so old school, so old fashioned in our thinking that there will be no time for dance in our schools.

While 'teaching for individual student centered learning' is a focus in New Zealand Schools, the recent introduction of National Standards with the focus on literacy and numeracy presents a contradiction of intent. Ball and Wells (2006) reflected on what an institutional environment means for the students:

It is our view that one consequential impact of these institutional norms on education is the cultivation of good students rather than good learners, in other words, obedient, conforming students, rather than ones who are independent, original, critical, questioning or reflective (p.189)

Teachers have many demands upon them in terms of conforming to the expectations of Principals, Boards of Trustees, parents and the wider community. In primary schools, parents are encouraged to enter the children's classrooms and discuss matters of concern with the teacher. This can be confronting for some teachers especially where the Principal is perceived as supporting the parent as they themselves are answerable to the parents, the Board of Trustees and the Ministry of Education. Deb discussed a Principal at a school she had previously taught at stating,

you need backup from your Principal and we never got that. She would side with the parents, not the teachers and it would be "oh you know, just do a little chart with a checklist on this child" and I'd be tearing my hair out, she just wasn't supportive and I thought, I don't need this.

A context shaping teachers' attitudes to dance is influenced in some part by parents accessibility to classrooms. The freedom with which parents are now able to access the classroom is positive in that parents are more involved in their child's education, but such intrusions can also create pressure for individual teachers. Pam explained how she overheard a parent speaking to a teacher in the next room:

I heard her asking the teacher in the next room, have you tested my daughter yet? and we're only three weeks down the track and she's got nineteen children to work through. The mum's quite upset because she was supposed to be tested. The teacher last year said that she'd be done at the start of the year.

Where teachers' meanings of dance are limited, they may hold beliefs regarding parents' understandings of dance as having value. Where such conditions exist, teachers are unlikely to teach dance at times when parents are around. The conditions of the school can be attributed to conditioning the teacher to conform to conservative values and foster a feeling of vulnerability in teachers. Blase's data revealed,

as one teacher put it, 'there isn't any time to be actively involved, to promote your ideas...to seek input...to get the information you needed to understand problems. So you play the game, do what's expected...you survive (p.137).

There were some parents in this study who were critical of what the school was able to offer their children. Ann stated,

We sent our son to Grammar last year – suddenly he was coming home saying “I hate school” I think the smaller schools don't have the resources for students and Nicholas was a bit restless.

Although Ann seemed generally supportive of the school, by removing her son and sending him to boarding school, the teacher and Principal may have felt that they failed that particular student. “Where parents are less involved and less critical or where schools are more supportive and participatory in their approach, the political orientations of teachers undoubtedly would vary” (Blase, 1988, p. 130). Teachers cannot meet all community expectations. They may come up against difficulties when parents exercise their right to speak out. A teacher or Principal does not have that same right. As professionals they must serve and support their community, at times remaining silent when being criticised. Ruth, a parent was forthcoming in her criticisms of a teacher and stated, “It's on-going. It's a personality thing and I don't wave the banner for the Fan Club”. An underlying lack of support for staff can undermine teacher confidence and cause stress.

Schools run on hierarchical structural controls that have not lessened with the introduction of self-governing schools with a Board of Trustees. Teachers with complaints are more likely to turn to each other to complain than risk being misunderstood by the Principal. Posner (2000) discussed the way in which people internalise social norms under certain conditions:

When mutually beneficial, cooperative patterns of behaviour arise among people acting in their own self-interest, participants eventually come to approve those who engage in the value-maximising behaviour and condemn those who do not (p.1817).

When considering the teaching of dance within schools the introduction of professional development needs to demonstrate an understanding of the complexity of the school culture and an understanding of individual teachers within individual schools.

### **5.5.2 Teaching dance in schools – where to from here?**

Care needs to be taken to invest in the teachers and what they need around the implementation of dance. This study has revealed that 'Artist in Schools' programs are unlikely to succeed in the long term because of the costs involved for schools and the fact that once the artists leave, the teachers

are even less likely to implement the arts than they were previously. Just as teachers continue to teach in a manner 'that works for them', so have the beliefs around implementing the arts curriculum remained static. If change is to be made, then as Ball and Wells (2006) suggested:

Knowledge is built on prior beliefs, commitments and attitudes that learners bring to a new situation and therefore both the direction and assessment of learning must account for and utilize the different resources individual learners employ to make sense of new information (p.189).

Teachers are the learners when it comes to dance education and if education is to move forward, teachers need assistance in developing different attitudes toward dance.

Teachers interviewed in this study agreed that more is expected of them now than when they first started teaching. Tim's comment was generally supported by others:

Ah, I think I'm finding it harder and harder to get more work done. There's just more and more every subject has because they're all important, but you're constantly bombarded with this is really important, you must do it,...literacy and numeracy is the main focus so that means that a lot of your day ends up going there and it makes it harder to get other things fitted in.

This research asserts that dance is important in developing creative thinking and cognitive development, and therefore essential for inclusion in every year level in primary school. While it would seem that policy makers have taken a forward step with the inclusion of dance in an arts curriculum, there are many contradictory messages that may result in dance being marginalised to such a degree that it all but disappears. If the curriculum allows an avoidance of dance in the early years of education, teachers are unlikely to consider teaching dance to older children.

As literacy and numeracy dominate the primary curriculum, other subjects are becoming seen as more specialist areas and left behind. It is no longer possible for primary teachers to be the experts in every subject area the way that they once were. In the past when this did happen, teachers had less pressure on them to be accountable or to teach specific content. The nature of teaching has changed and student progress is measured against sophisticated curriculum documents in each subject area. Teachers must balance the expectations of the curriculum with their personal teaching pedagogy, adapting along the way to accommodate changes and extra subjects. Teachers are placed under pressure to conform to curriculum requirements in all subject areas, and some will suffer. Adam was concerned about the Ministry expecting teachers to "teach more of this and that" according to the particular political focus of the moment. He spoke about the importance of individualised teaching and drew attention to the new curriculum. Lara agreed and commented,

My gosh, this curriculum is everything that I believe in about teaching and it just opened all the doors.

Adam concurred that the arts curriculum is a beautiful document but the hidden message that came through with its implementation was that it wasn't important. He stated,

It was developed and it was beautiful but there was no focus for schools to opt into professional development. There were options but at the same time we were told that you needed to focus on literacy and numeracy.

Even before the radical cuts to subject advisors from Universities, the number of advisors for say, Maths, for example, would be in complete contrast to the number of subject advisors in the arts. Adam believed that in Canterbury, "primary maths had five advisors and secondary maths had five advisors and they had one for dance who was also responsible for the other arts areas". This speaks clearly about the Ministry's messages to teachers about the value of dance.

This research identified strong opposition to National standards and the talk of identifying teachers who didn't measure up. Such a goal appears in complete opposition with according teachers respect so they may feel valued and motivated in the classroom. During the interview process over three case studies, I was struck by the fact that every primary teacher interviewed appeared passionate about teaching children, regardless of the length of time in the teaching profession. Dean summed up the attitude of the teachers, "I'm still enthusiastic. My attitude's still the same. I'm probably a lot more professional now".

For the participants in this research, Jump Jam or the school musical fills the space for dance. At this point in time the majority of teachers involved in the study are not consciously including dance in their classroom teaching. I pondered, is Jump Jam meeting the needs of the curriculum? Could the bi-annual school musical fulfill the requirements of the curriculum? This research would suggest that the answer to the question is, no.

Jump Jam and the school musical both hold an important place in the life of the school and in the life of dance in the school. They are however, both extra-curricular and therefore outside and apart from dance as a curriculum offering. It could be argued that at least dance is being given a place, when in a crowded curriculum it would otherwise not exist at all. Adam made this message quite clear. It is what is happening at Marion School in order to discharge the requirements of the curriculum and also at Stafford Primary School where the students stand behind their desks to perform Jump Jam. All three schools involved in the study were ensuring that all students engaged in Jump Jam. In this way, all students were experiencing dance, however it seems more suited to a Physical Education curriculum than the Arts Curriculum. The Arts Curriculum statement calls for

creativity. Students may seem to be meeting the achievement objectives of the learning strands in dance as they are deliberately broad. In reality they are focusing more on a narrow field of communicating in dance as they develop performance skills.

Students engaged in Jump Jam may be offered opportunities to choreograph movement, based on set examples that Jump Jam offers. When students are developing ideas in dance according to the Jump Jam examples, they are limited to using given narrow stimuli. This may meet the requirements of the curriculum providing that students are given other different opportunities to choreograph where they can initiate, develop, conceptualise and refine ideas in dance. Jump Jam is limiting students' experiences in dance. If some of the students in this study go on to become teachers, they are either likely to teach Jump Jam, or, to teach no dance at all, due to their own personal experience as learners.

The school musical is generally something where students are taught movement and music by the expert up the front. In some instances, students are given the opportunity to choreograph movement, but this does not always apply to every child in the school. Like Jump Jam, the school musical touches on aspects of the achievement objectives in dance, but does not develop the learning in any depth. The performance opportunities that a musical offers will foster personal growth, confidence and pride for many students.

The school musical is extra-curricular; it may not involve all students and operates in a hierarchical system where the most talented students gain the lead roles and the majority of time 'on stage'. The students are cast according to their talent or lack of it, those considered to have none, or a lack of interest, may be brought in to make props or assist backstage. Such a system leads students to believe that dance is about being 'good at performing'. For those on stage, especially if they are up front or in lead roles, there are considerable benefits regarding confidence. Unfortunately though, this is where beliefs may be formed by students who were relegated to the back row. It would be hard to believe that a teacher in a modern society would ask a student not to dance, because they cannot, as Margaret, Joy and Annie from Stafford School were told about their singing during their school days, resulting in a total lack of confidence in their singing abilities throughout their lives. Joy was explaining her lack of confidence in dance and when I asked if it would help to think that she didn't need to be in time when dancing, she stated, "Oh that would help, yes, but I've just got hang-ups in my head. I was never allowed in the choir because I couldn't sing". Comments and subtle cues are easily picked up by students who live in a competitive society where people doubt themselves and will quickly develop the idea that they are not as good as someone else.

Marion Primary students auditioned to become Jump Jam leaders and help teach others. This had resulted in some bad feeling throughout the school community because of the belief that one of the successful students was chosen due to perceived favouritism. This research is not seeking to argue the case of competition, but rather to identify competitive elements in Jump Jam and the school musical. Dance in the school curriculum is about working individually and cooperatively with others to express personal, social and cultural understanding. According to the New Zealand Arts Curriculum (2000) "They [the arts] are unique "ways of knowing" that enable individuals and groups to create ideas and images that reflect, communicate, and change their views of the world" (p.9).

The extra-curricular dimension of both Jump Jam and the school musical reflect an attitude that is well established in New Zealand schools. Dance is often viewed as 'extra-curricular'. Some parents interviewed were not aware that dance was a curriculum offering. Deb, a teacher at Marion School believed that many parents felt that students could learn dance outside of school, stating, "I know that a lot of children learn ballet and jazz and gymnastics". If dance is to be viewed as a subject in its own right, then there must be a shift in thinking about the idea of dance being extra-curricular. We need to question how far have we come when we consider that it was over a decade ago that Charles Fowler (1996) , an American Arts Educator wrote,

naive attitudes continue to prevail, for example, the belief that the arts are extracurricular, that they are vocational education rather than a mainline area in a general education program, that they are strictly for the talented (vii).

Creativity is acknowledged as important at all levels of the community. A main goal of UNESCO's aims for the arts within education is to ensure that arts education is accessible as a fundamental and sustainable component of a high quality renewal of education. The English National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education produced a report in 1999 recommending government action at various levels to meet the challenges in education through creative pathways. The Rt. Hon. David Blunkett M.P., Secretary of State for Education and Employment stated, "We cannot rely on a small elite, no matter how highly educated or highly paid. Instead we need the creativity, enterprise and scholarship of all our people"(p.5). President Obama's committee on the Arts and the Humanities has released a paper 'Reinvesting in Arts Education: Winning America's Future through Creative Schools'. Obama (2011) stated,

Now more than ever we need solutions that keep students excited, motivated and in school, and we must provide them with the tools to succeed in the workforce after they graduate (p.47).

If America is to succeed by investing in Arts Education, then care must be taken to provide their elementary school teachers with experience in teaching the arts. It is one thing to recognise and

acknowledge the need for the development of creativity, but to follow it through and fully implement the arts curriculum is another thing entirely. This research has exposed the fact that recognising the importance of an arts education is not enough, no matter how much understanding exists, or how perfect the curriculum. Arts Impact in America is an organisation set up to empower teachers to teach the arts. The website states,

Arts Impact brings high quality arts education experiences to students by training classroom teachers to use the arts in their day to day teaching. Through a two year program, Arts Impact offers classes, workshops and mentorships, training teachers to bring dance, theater and visual arts into their classrooms and their core curriculum. All Arts Impact programs align with the Washington State Essential Academic Learning Requirements in the Arts (Impact, 2011, p. 1).

This would appear to be a huge step in the right direction, but unless all teachers in America are empowered to teach in the arts, then very little will change. It is vitally important that this valuable program is not wasted. All states in America need to follow the same plan, with all teachers in each state receiving the benefits. Currently, different states are using different methods to introduce the arts into classrooms.

### **5.5.3 Teachers as Creative Artists with the ability to teach creatively**

This research suggests that a teacher needs a creative approach to the delivery of content, combined with the ability to foster creativity in children which will in turn allow children to construct their own meanings. Jeffrey and Craft (2010) stated “the relationship between teaching creatively and teaching for creativity is an integral one. The former is inherent in the latter and the former often leads directly to the latter” (p.84).

Teachers have the capacity to teach creatively and many have an understanding of the importance of movement in children’s overall development. It will not, however, be a simple matter of re-presenting the research regarding the benefits of dance and of having teachers grasp the suggested strategies and work with them. Teachers are complex individuals and some may have no interest in the arts or creative ways of knowing. Educational change proceeds slowly. Sir Ken Robinson pointed out in his address at the TED (Technology, Entertainment, Design) Conference in 2006, that schools are still following the same model of teaching as they were at the time of the Enlightenment and the Industrial Revolution. An 11.41 minute video clip of this event has been posted on You-tube had been accessed 8,006,583 times as of June 6<sup>th</sup>, 2012, suggesting Robinson’s ideas resonate with the community. His address presents the view that schools are actually killing creativity. He proposes that divergent thinking is an essential capacity for creativity; that students should think laterally and see multiple answers, not just one. As it stands, according to Robinson (2006),



educational institutions continue to teach to a standardised model where schools are run along factory lines according to age groups, batches and bells. The intellectual model of the mind calls for deductive reasoning, and sorts students according to academic and non-academic ability.

Although it is not the intention of this research to examine Robinson's assertions in any depth, the introduction of National Standards, however, would certainly support Robinson's claims that students are still being sorted according to their academic ability. One could reason that National Standards have been introduced for precisely that reason.

A creative approach would ensure that our students do not miss out on dance as a subject vital to their overall development. By placing dance alongside National Standards, opportunities may be provided for the development of creativity in the classroom.

I reiterate that despite the lack of dance in primary classrooms, many teachers had an understanding of the importance of dance in the development of children. Many teachers had studied dance in their teacher training, admittedly a small amount, no more than one module, but they all remembered the lecturers and the lessons they had learned. Dance was not something within teachers' personal experiences in the classroom however, therefore teaching will continue in the same way it always has. Those who had experienced dance in classrooms were familiar with set dancing such as folk dance, Jump Jam, or dance as an element of the school musical. Now that the underlying issues and philosophical concerns regarding dance in primary classrooms have been addressed, it is important not to discount other important factors that impinge on teachers' ability to teach dance.

## **5.6 Pre-service Teacher Education**

Dance stood out as a memorable experience for all participants in this study who had undergone dance teaching in their pre-service teacher education. Nine teachers at Stafford Primary School had gone through their teacher education in a city where dance was an established teacher training module. They had no problems in recalling what they did in the sessions regardless of the length of time that had transpired. Joy stated,

What we did was absolutely brilliant. It was a really good session, but the going into it... I thought that this is going to be terrible and others felt the same way, but it was amazing in the group, we got into it, those who said that.

Melanie agreed, "I enjoyed a lot of that that we did with Jane Richards. She was great. I enjoyed a lot of that". Naomi could see, however, that the small number of lessons that dance was allocated was sending a clear message about the importance of dance:

You got sent to do five or six sessions with Jane Richards. Once you did that the box got ticked and that was another thing that was passing... If it had more importance placed upon it within the teaching program, then of course people are going to value it more, and they're going to feel more confident.

Despite their enjoyable and memorable experiences in dance in pre-service teacher education, Stafford teachers were not consciously including dance in their teaching, with the exception of Caroline who explained her experience,

when my kids were little they were going to a music and movement class, and then the teacher left and there was no-one to take it, so I spent hours setting up music and putting it on tapes and things and I've been able to use that in school as well.

If pre-service teacher education institutions acknowledged the fact that teachers will teach the way that they themselves were taught, regardless of subject offerings within pre-service teacher education, then changes could be introduced that allow meaningful education to take place. Students could be advised that they are wasting their time in their teacher education studies unless they consciously seek to become the teacher they want to be and not unconsciously become a clone of their own favourite, or even, least favourite, teacher. Developing awareness of this fact would be a starting point for change in teacher education. Ashton (1984) stated that a teacher education program can be developed on the basis of teacher efficacy, "designed to help teachers clarify their efficacy beliefs and develop a well organised conception of how these beliefs would be represented in behaviour" (p. 29). I propose that studies are undertaken to ensure that pre-service teacher trainees understand *how* to make changes.

The very fact of understanding how a teacher might fall back into old patterns of teaching based on the past could allow pre-service teachers to make conscious efforts to reflect on positive aspects their own experience brings to their teaching, and how less positive patterns might be changed. Pre-service teachers also need to understand and prepare for the stresses that accompany teaching as stress causes teachers to fall back to old ways of knowing, revisiting their own teachers behaviours. Howard & Johnson (2004) list the ten main stressors for teachers as:

Teaching students who lack motivation, maintaining time pressures and workload, coping with change, being evaluated by others, dealings with colleagues, self-esteem and status issues, problems dealing with administration/management, role conflict and ambiguity and poor working conditions(p.400).

Any of these stressors, either individually, or in combination can lead to feelings of hopelessness. Wood and McCarthy (2002) cited Bullough & Baughman (1997), who stated, "Teachers at risk for burnout came to see their work as futile and inconsistent with the ideals and goals they had set as beginning teachers" (p.2). Student teachers need to go forward with an idealistic view and a passion

for teaching, but they should also be prepared for the stresses that may accompany their journey. Bullough & Baughman (1997) stated, "Virtually every problem from the silly to the significant – economic, political, social, moral, person, finds its way to the school's threshold, and not surprisingly, disappointment often follows close behind" (p.930). When teaching methods are extremely personal, and they are unsuccessful, they may engender feelings of failure in the teacher. Teaching leans heavily toward aspects of personality. Adler (1991) discussed the work of Schon (1987) who defined a reflexive practitioner, "as one who can think while acting and thus can respond to the uncertainty, uniqueness and conflict involved in the situations in which professionals practice" (p.140). Teachers will develop confidence by becoming reflexive practitioners:

Theories of curriculum and of teaching and learning cannot, alone, tell us what and how to teach, because questions of what and how to teach arise in concrete situations loaded with concrete particulars of time, place, person and circumstance (Schwab, 1971, p. 494).

Cervero (1992) concurred, "knowledge they acquire from practice is far more useful than what they acquire from the formal forms of education" (p.91).

An implementation of dance in a cross-curricular approach would require highlighting as vital to the development of children. It is important that teacher-education institutions provide opportunities to teach dance, both at the pre-service teacher institution and in schools. If student-teachers and teachers are provided with intensive training in the teaching of dance, then they are less likely to fall back into teaching what they themselves were taught, or at least in the same manner. Success with new and modern strategies may assist the classroom teacher in moving forward toward greater self-efficacy. The provision of teaching through dance would need to accompany all areas of the curriculum. Unless student-teachers are fully immersed in a cross-curricular approach to teaching dance, then they will continue to fall back into well-known and conventional teaching.

Teachers lack time to reflect on their personal teaching patterns or realise that stressful situations may cause them not only to revert into old patterns of teaching, and rely on a teaching method that works for them. If teachers are provided with strategies to reflect upon and recognise old patterns of behaviour with which they are unhappy, they can also be provided with methods for change.

## **5.7 Summary**

In examining the material that emerged in this research, it is necessary to acknowledge both the complexity of schools and the individuals working within them. This was managed by focussing the discussion on dominant themes. Professional development in dance was a necessary discussion to have when addressing the research question, 'what are the meanings and contexts informing the

delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms?’ Teachers in this study suggested professional development similar to what was consistent with their personal experience in other subject areas. This resulted in a discussion of ‘Artists in Schools’ and concluded that it was an ineffective method of providing professional development in dance for teachers. It emerged that the person offering professional development in dance must be ‘someone like us’, a classroom teacher with similar experiences and an understanding of classrooms. A cross-curricular approach to teaching dance could be a way forward providing that teachers received considerable implementation support, therefore implementation issues were discussed along with changing attitudes toward dance within a school community. The issue of confidence to teach dance emerged as a generally accepted belief, when in fact it appeared that a lack of experience was the contributing factor in the absence of dance teaching in schools. A lack of experience stemmed from the fact that teachers had not experienced dance when they were students in schools, which initiated a discussion on the significance of teacher biography in teaching. The chapter concluded with a discussion of pre-service teacher education where it was suggested that the effect of teacher biography is addressed to ensure that teaching is able to move forward and address the needs of a modern society. Hopefully this would include more dance education in a more comprehensive and meaningful manner.

## **5.8 Reflection on Methodology**

Having completed the discussion of this thesis I find myself in a moment of reflection. As I stare at the birds in the trees outside of the window, I reflect on how well a constructivist methodology has supported this research. I question whether I would employ the same methodology should I embark upon further study. If I used a constructivist approach again, would the findings be similar? The three schools involved in this research provided considerable material and I believe that the amount of material was a factor in successfully revealing important insights that informed the findings. I illustrate this point with reference to photography. A prize-winning photo may be selected from hundreds of photos a photographer may take, with a small percentage standing out from the rest. In this study, it seemed necessary to listen to many voices in order to glean the perceptive insights that provided essential information regarding the participants’ understandings of dance in the primary classroom.

As the researcher, I worked collaboratively with the participants in this study. It is my belief that connoisseurship, supported by a constructivist methodology, allowed deeper underlying findings to emerge that may have otherwise remained hidden. Each participant related to me as a colleague

and took the time to consider what dance meant to them as a curriculum subject. In many cases, the participants' awareness of dance as an important method of developing the whole child emerged, and the process stimulated thinking about individual meanings of dance for participants and researcher alike. My ability to work alongside educators with an understanding of their contextual situation allowed an acceptance and collegiality to develop on a level that may not otherwise have been possible. School teachers rarely have time for academic research and I value the fact that I was able to provide a teacher's voice through my own experience in education.

The three schools involved in the research were chosen because of personal connections that were made. They were not random choices. It is my belief however, that a similar study with three random schools would offer similar engagements and results. The schools were from different regions and populations throughout New Zealand and the number of participants involved in the research provided a level of academic rigour. This provides me with a certain strength of conviction to stand by this study's findings. In initiating a new study I would again seek a diverse population and, in another instance this may be in respect to the decile ratings. While primary school staff are all drawn from the same training institutions, it is possible that teachers develop different attitudes toward teaching according to the decile rating of their schools. While the focus of this research was not on lower decile schools, the limited amount of research conducted in this study suggested that lower decile schools have a positive attitude toward the introduction of dance into New Zealand primary classrooms (Stone, 1992). Movement classes with children were being facilitated at decile three rated Caversham School during the course of this study. As Porter (1964) stated, "motor therapy programmes are shown to contribute to the academic success of children who are low achievers in school" (p.87). I believe that similar findings would emerge from an engagement with different decile schools, but findings may be arrived at differently with different insights emerging along the course of the research.

As a connoisseur there were aspects of this research about which I felt I knew the answers while remaining open to new evidence indicating something different. There were also unanswered questions for which the research provided meanings. Crotty (1998a) reminded the researcher that:

All knowledge, and therefore all meaningful reality as such, is contingent upon human practices, being constructed in and out of interaction between human beings and their world, and developed and transmitted within an essentially social context (p.42).

The most important findings of the research did not emerge directly as answers to questions. This information emerged through a constant comparative analysis and provided information that I, as a connoisseur, didn't know I didn't know. By allowing data to emerge and by constantly examining the

research to discover how we know what we know, or as in this case, how we as teachers know what we know, the research took a new direction. Larochelle and Bednarz (1998) stated,

Constructivism anticipates thoroughgoing questioning of basic principles and epistemological breaks of a kind that are much more disquieting than those that make do with simply affirming that 'If there is more than one way to get to Rome, all roads do eventually lead to Rome'(p.4).

A constructivist approach is not a linear process but a spiral act of reflexive questioning wherein deeper meanings in this research have emerged and been recognised. The introduction of researcher as connoisseur has complimented the constructivist method, as without experience and an understanding of teaching dance classroom dance, it may have meant that the 'why' questions were not asked and a lack of confidence identified as the only reason that teachers do not choose to teach dance. I also restate that the 'flavour' of the research has been coloured by my own personal experience in life and dance.

It has been possible to recognise inconsistencies in what was being said and what was actually happening in the classroom. As the research developed the question was posed: Why is it that teachers who are positive about teaching dance, recognise the importance of dance to develop cognitive and expressive functions, understand how to teach dance and have all the tools they need, simply don't teach dance? This did not present as the most important question at the start, but as the constructivist methodology uncovered why teachers teach the way they do, simple and yet previously hidden messages emerged that became the focus of the research.

The initial findings in themselves lacked answers, despite the participants providing clear answers to the questions. There appeared to be something deeper that was inhibiting the teaching of dance. This was despite the many obvious reasons that can all be acknowledged as real. During this research new ways of thinking and knowing emerged through the coming together of experience and multiple meanings and understandings that were always in a continuous state of movement and growth. Crotty (1998a), summed up the strength of the constructivist methodology employed in this research:

Research in a constructivist vein, research in the mode of bricoleur, requires that we not remain straight-jacketed by the conventional meanings we have been taught to associate with the object. Instead, such research invites us to approach the object in a radical spirit of openness to its potential for new or richer meaning. It is an invitation to reinterpretation (p. 51).

I believe that the constructivist methodology supported the research question and was the most direct manner in which to reveal participants' meanings. It suited the fact that, as a teacher, I was able to situate myself alongside the participants and have them relate to me as a colleague with an

understanding of the organisational and relational nature of schools. As a teacher I related to constructivism as a method used in teaching which provided a certain familiarity of approach. Constructivism also allowed the research to proceed within the time frame of the research. By conducting all the interviews in specific time blocks, the research was able to proceed and develop in a structured manner.

It is possible that there are some other teachers for whom the research has triggered some dance ideas, but I would suggest that generally speaking this will not be the case despite the interviews triggering ideas for some of the participants. Suzanne stated, "I know where it is now [Dancing the Long White Cloud teacher resource]. So yes, I do. I do plan to [teach dance] now. I'm aware that is something that children enjoy". Previous research however, has indicated that regardless of the initial burst of enthusiasm, teachers revert to the way they've always taught and they will teach the subjects that are considered 'important'.

This study aimed to take account of children's and parents' perspectives along with the teachers' views. As the study progressed, a methodological issue of time and resources reared its head. I found that I had little time to afford the luxury of working with parents and children in a more meaningful manner. On reflection I would consciously plan to better manage this aspect of my research to include other perspectives. I was mindful of the importance of Principals in shaping a context in which teachers meanings of dance were constructed. A further study might concentrate upon the influence of leadership in shaping meanings of dance in primary classrooms.

# Chapter 6. Conclusion

This study was driven by the research question, 'What are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms'? Research found that dance was valued by the participants in this study; teachers, administrative staff and some parents could see the importance of dance in children's development. Meanings of dance education in schools varied with contradictions existing between an understanding of the capacity of dance to be a creative process in classrooms and the reality of dance generally being employed as an extra-curricular performance. Jump Jam was present in all three case studies, yet Jump Jam wasn't considered dance by most teachers. Meanings attributed to dance being a feminine activity were discredited in this study with the male teachers emerging as the most informed and interested in dance education. The children in this study all loved to dance. All three Principals in this study recognized the benefits to children through participation in dance and all participants were enthusiastic about a cross-curricular approach to teaching dance. Many participants spoke of the importance of an integrated curriculum. Kari, a parent and student-teacher echoed others' beliefs,

When you've got reluctant writers they can express their body awareness in space and bring it back and write and talk about what they've been doing. There's so much that could be done.

The theoretical aspects of the dance curriculum may have created a barrier for teachers who are unsure what to teach or how to teach dance, although most teachers interviewed had not accessed the dance curriculum. Dance has historically found a place as an extra-curricular offering in schools and very little has changed since the introduction of the Arts Curriculum. Pre-service teacher training has not assisted teachers in becoming classroom teachers of dance as the significance of teacher biography indicated that teachers teach in the way in which they themselves were taught. To some extent, a lack of teacher confidence can be attributed to why dance is not a focus in primary classrooms, but the underlying finding emerging from this research was that a lack of experience, not confidence was the dominant factor driving dance from primary classrooms. If teachers did not experience dance as learners when they were themselves students, it is unlikely that they would choose to teach dance. Teachers considered that time and space constraints affected the delivery of dance and were unaware that they may be teaching as they themselves were taught.



## 6.1 Findings

While dance has a place within the New Zealand Curriculum, the practical implementation of dance in many primary classrooms has yet to become a reality. The dance curriculum cannot inform teachers on how to teach dance when it has not been a part of their experience, either as a student or a teacher. To date, most research in dance education is designed to inform practice, whether based on artists in schools, or on dance activities in the classroom (Buck, 2003a; Eisner, 1998b; Halprin, 2002; J. Hanna, 1999; Highwater, 1996; Hong-Joe, 2002; Stinson, 2005b, 2002). Dance research writing is by its nature, academic. Primary school teachers have little access to academic articles and even less time to read them. The expectation of being the expert in all curriculum areas causes primary school teachers to read what is necessary and spend the majority of their time in the practical act of teaching.

The teachers in this study understood the importance of movement and dance in a child's development and understood that dance is something that any teacher can teach and that it is not necessary to be a dancer in order to teach dance to primary school students. The children in this study love to dance, and yet dance remained as something extra-curricular, with a strong focus on performance. The teacher participants appeared to lack confidence to teach dance. As the literature revealed, the issue of teacher confidence arose again and again. A constructivist methodology within the present study allowed meanings to emerge that suggested that it is the experience of dance teaching that is absent in primary classrooms simply because teachers cannot teach what they themselves have not learned. Teachers' confidence would be increased through the practical experience of teaching dance. This lack of practical experience, I argue, is the barrier to a successful implementation of dance in the primary New Zealand classroom and, as stated, the lack of experience can be traced to teachers having little or no experience of dance when they were the learners.

This study has found that unless this underlying concern of providing teachers with the experience of teaching dance is addressed, no amount of attention to creativity or curriculum will make any difference to the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms. This is the main issue that has emerged as a reason for the relative non-implementation of dance.

Problems of time are real for primary teachers. Teachers in this study suggested that the New Zealand curriculum employs a cross-curricular approach that draws attention to a variety of concepts and issues and can be applied while consciously teaching the elements and concepts related to dance. The teachers in this study welcomed the idea of a cross-curricular approach as it

would not be replacing one subject with another, but would incorporate dance to enhance learning in the curriculum and address the issue of integrated learning.

This research recommends that dance be introduced alongside literacy and numeracy. To date, the teaching of literacy and numeracy in a conventional manner has not improved statistics that show a declining rate of achievement in these areas. Teachers in this study focused on teaching literacy and numeracy. Dance was not a priority despite the fact that teachers could see the scope for development in children's learning. Children love dance so the question was asked, could there be another way to advance literacy and numeracy through dance? By implementing dance alongside literacy and numeracy, students could be given opportunities to learn in a dynamic and fruitful manner, valuing multiple ways of knowing. Once dance becomes an everyday activity in the classroom, old attitudes concerning dance should begin a process of change, while also serving the Ministry's aching desire to improve literacy and numeracy in schools. All participants in this research, agreed that the introduction of dance in a cross-curricular manner would be a welcome and effective addition to classroom teaching.

Professional development that accompanied the introduction of the 2000 arts curriculum into New Zealand schools has not been ongoing and has sent a clear message as to the relative unimportance of the arts compared with literacy and numeracy. The 'not so hidden' message that suggests that dance is not as important as literacy and numeracy has been powerful. It was accepted without question by school communities.

Accepted knowledge and beliefs are difficult to shift. They do not exist in isolation; they are acquired. To re-educate is to implement a cultural change. A long-held belief is that dance is a practical and performance related as opposed to an 'academic' subject and therefore less important. While research indicates that thinking has changed with educators and policy makers valuing diverse ways of knowing and creativity in learning, beliefs around dance would appear to be resistant to change. The results of this research indicated that where teachers were provided with the experience of teaching dance, a process of change around attitudes toward dance existed.

This research suggested the provision of experience in dance teaching through professional development, a suggestion that may seem contradictory as it has not worked in the past according to the findings of this research. Many teachers had experienced dance in their pre-service teacher training that had not translated into the teaching of dance in their classrooms. When professional development was offered alongside the introduction of the New Zealand arts curriculum in 2000, the teachers in this study had not availed themselves of opportunities to learn to teach dance at that

point, and it may be argued that such experience may have created a different outcome. This research would assert however that isolated amounts of professional development in dance does little to promote dance in primary classrooms. From the results of this research it is suggested that professional development in dance would need to be intense and ongoing for change to take place.

The findings of this study indicated that professional development in dance be provided by people who are teaching colleagues, people to whom the teachers can relate. An 'Artist in School' program tends to cause teachers to feel in awe of the expert and teachers are disempowered as teachers of dance. As Margaret stated, "it needs to be someone like us". The findings also indicated that professional development not be isolated, but provided on an on-going basis. If dance saturates the curriculum, attention may be drawn to its importance in child development and the aims of the New Zealand curriculum may be realised. While professional development has been offered in the past with little success, the difference would be in the amount of professional development and the manner in which it is offered. The word 'saturate' was introduced by Adam, Principal at Marion School in relation to professional development in dance. The Principal at Marion School could clearly see that the way forward for dance would be to saturate schools with professional development and resources as the government has done with literacy and numeracy. Adam spoke passionately about his idea:

You need to get people into schools and say, look, you can learn maths and writing through dance and movement... in that way you can get to the so-called important curriculum areas and it becomes a part of it. It's about being a collaborative learner, it's all about future focus, it's all about a lifetime learner, working with other people, besides yourself, to solve a problem.

Adam's suggestion appears to be at the heart of changes that are necessary to shift set patterns of teaching that it appears every teacher takes with them to the classroom. If dance assumed an important role in the classroom and full support was available at all times during implementation, then this study would suggest that teachers' beliefs and understandings could adapt to change and incorporate the teaching of dance as an ongoing class activity.

There may be resistance to a saturation of the curriculum in dance in the same way as teachers have resisted the introduction of National Standards. While the three schools involved in this study were enthusiastic about a cross-curricular approach to the teaching of dance, it could be assumed from what participants said about other schools they had taught at, that not everyone would welcome such an idea. If cross-curricular dance was introduced to schools who requested such an implementation, then these schools could be provided with ongoing professional development

through 'someone like us', dance experts who are primary classroom teachers. Where positive outcomes are evident, other schools may choose to follow.

This research has revealed a variety of professional development and resource development ideas and the teachers in this study were clear about what they believed would be necessary for a successful implementation of dance. Teachers were at the heart of this research and where teachers' voices are heard then there is more likelihood of an engagement with the support offered.

An introduction of cross-curricular dance would require support, not only through professional development, but from parents and colleagues. If an understanding and appreciation of dance existed within school communities and teacher education institutions, teachers would feel supported and there may be less likelihood of old meanings of dance resurfacing. Where classrooms are saturated with dance in the same way as literacy and numeracy it is suggested that all members of a community be educated as to the benefits of dance for all children so that teachers may feel positive about a way forward through dance. This study revealed that where a Principal wants to educate the community, it is possible to make major changes. This was evident when Adam educated his school community on the abolition of homework in his school.

If teacher education programs were to focus on understanding teacher efficacy in regard to teaching the way in which one was taught, new teachers may emerge who initiate new approaches to teaching that includes the teaching of dance. With an understanding of the stresses that accompany teaching and the realisation that, in times of stress, teachers will fall back into old 'known' patterns of teaching drawn from their own experience as a learner, pre-service teachers may be enabled to initiate change in their teaching practice. Such knowledge will allow the pre-service teachers to move forward in a teacher education program that could incorporate a strong emphasis on dance in a cross-curricular approach to teaching.

A striking finding in this study is that nobody disagreed with the place of dance in the curriculum. While participants were not asked directly whether they wanted dance in the curriculum, an underlying finding was that the place of dance in the curriculum was accepted and discussion centered on implementation. The New Zealand Arts Curriculum has been in schools for over a decade and teachers in this study appreciated the importance of dance in the development of the whole child and many participants in this study spoke glowingly of the arts curriculum. Lara spoke of the arts curriculum being everything she hoped it would be. Over three schools and 49 interviews, nobody questioned the place of dance in the curriculum. This important finding requires acknowledgement.

## 6.2 Suggestions for further research

While this research has clearly documented current research regarding the power of dance to foster creativity, cognitive development and the affective areas of children's development, an on-going need for measurements and proof is likely to continue. It remains that parents, politicians and policy makers seek quantitative research evidence that would enhance qualitative research evidence. It is suggested that a 'pilot dance immersion school' be identified where a longitudinal study may be conducted, measuring children's academic, social and emotional development alongside students of a control group school.

This study identified an awareness and appreciation of dance in the curriculum. It would seem that an introduction of dance across the curriculum would be an opportune time to put a school under the microscope and allow a multiple evidence base to highlight the benefits of a practical implementation of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms. Alongside the qualitative evidence, now would seem a good time to measure the psychological profile of a child with instruments similar to The Academic Motivation Scale, (Vallerand, Pellitier, Blais, & Vallieres, 1992) and create evidence that speaks to parents, policy makers and politicians. Currently, measurements such as the PISA scale and GPD provide politicians with evidence. If New Zealand educators value multiple ways of knowing and values creativity evidenced by an arts curriculum and the statements therein, then it may be time to introduce psychological measurement methods to close the gap between evidence and implementation. The New Zealand Arts Curriculum (2007) makes the following statements,

An Artistic expression of self, community and culture...stimulates creative action and response by engaging and connecting thinking, imagination, sensing and feeling...students well-being is enhanced...confidence to take risks...work both independently and collaboratively to construct meanings...able to view their world from new perspectives (p.20).

New Zealand education could lead the way in developing specific measurement in the affective domain so that communities may be provided with more and different evidence that examines how problem solving, team work, and creative action affect students' ability to take risks, enhance their confidence and view the world from new perspectives. Such measurements could document the level to which these skills and functions have been developed. Precise evidence based affective research may unlock the doors to a way forward in education. The New Zealand Ministry of Education appears to be going up and down on the one spot, re-stating the importance of improving student performance in specific areas with a current proposal being an introduction of League Tables. Such tables will inform parents of school performance levels in National Standards, yet as this study has shown, schools are complex institutions and those within them are complex

individuals, with many variables informing student progress. National Standards are a narrow measurement of a school's effectiveness. Alison Gilmour (Gilmour, 2012) speaking on New Zealand Radio National against the introduction of League Tables questioned why would they work in New Zealand when they clearly had not worked in Australia.

This research has provided an opportunity to leave old ways of viewing educational change. Quality psychological measurement tools designed specifically to document student growth through dance could be accessed or developed for specific educational populations by leading scientists in this field in collaboration with dance education experts and teachers. Such measurements could examine whether the introduction of cross curricular dance assists in developing the whole person and how this in turn may affect motivational change which in turn may affect student attendance. Where student interest is stimulated, improved performance is a likely outcome. All this is valuable, even the obvious eventuality that New Zealand students might make better art.

Specialist arts schools exist internationally, "Performing Arts schools are found in most major cities in the United States and their number is growing" (Daniel, 2000, p.43). This proposed school would be different in that children would learn through the making of dance, rather than placing a focus on dance performance skills. The school would also be different in that it would be a dance school rather than an arts school. While all subjects and methods of teaching would be valued, including the arts, the making of dance would dominate the school day. The school would be set up with a clear purpose of leading the way for other public schools to follow creating creative opportunities for development for New Zealand children.

For full acceptance of dance as an important curriculum subject, some major changes would need to be introduced to the way in which dance is delivered in the classroom. As the research has indicated, teachers understand the importance of dance on the one hand, and discount this knowledge on the other. This would appear to be due to long-held knowledge and beliefs conflicting with new knowledge and research around dance. I re-state that, for change to take place, teachers would need to be immersed in professional development in dance at a level that sends a clear message regarding the importance of dance in the New Zealand primary classroom. The emphasis needs to be on 'doing', rather than talking, researching, thinking and reflecting on the importance of dance in the primary classroom. Below are recommended actions for the future of dance in the New Zealand primary curriculum.

It is proposed that a research project is established in a primary school that introduces dance across the curriculum. The project could initially involve one school whose community agrees to the

immersion of dance in their school during the research period, with a view to offering it to other schools once established.

It is proposed that resources are designed and developed alongside and in cooperation with individual teachers involved in the undertaking. Dance activities could be created for each unit of work or theme due for implementation alongside professional development for staff. As the research suggests, teachers will gain greater benefit from the support of teaching colleagues with dance expertise than they would from introducing the dance expert. Such colleagues could model the use of dance to teach concepts and content with the teacher gradually becoming involved and eventually teaching dance with support from their dance colleague. It is suggested that dance teaching colleagues are based in the school and available to all staff throughout every week of the year. Teachers working cooperatively could indicate where specific support is required and assist in the improvement of professional development in dance.

It is recommended that a systematic measurement program document students' learning and development. This could involve the engagement of neuroscientists as members of a committee engaged to facilitate the project, along with educational researchers, classroom teachers and dance education experts. Student achievements and challenges as revealed by qualitative and quantitative research could be compared with measurements from a control school of the same decile rating. Existing qualitative evidence of the benefits to children gained via a dance focus could be placed alongside quantitative results and data. National Standards results in literacy and numeracy for both the trial school the control school, would inform the research. Specifically developed psychological testing instruments would provide a specific and different manner of measuring children's progress, leading the way for other countries to follow. Dance would take its place in primary classrooms, leading to an exploration of other ways of knowing and making meaning.

### **6.3 Softly Softly: Community and teachers as co-researchers**

Change takes place in education very slowly unless something such as National Standards is introduced and mandated as law. It is important that teachers and administrators embrace change as a positive and exciting aspect of teaching that can easily be incorporated into their own personal way of knowing so that they may form new beliefs and understandings and beyond that, raise student achievement levels. Evidence suggests the importance of valuing the teachers' involvement in the introduction and implementation of a dance programme. This research study has identified the importance of respecting the value of teachers and providing them with a sense of autonomy in their classrooms. A successful factor of the Finnish education model rests with the quality of the

teachers employed in their schools. The New Zealand Ministry of Education (2012) recently suggested that the number of teachers in schools be reduced and class sizes be increased in order to improve the quality of teachers. While the objective is worthy, it is suggested that to improve the quality of teachers is to value the quality that already exists and support teachers' contribution to teaching and the community. It is not within the scope of this thesis to discuss the problem of less able teachers in New Zealand primary schools, except to state that in the light of this study, teachers must become and be seen as valued co-researchers if the implementation of cross-curricular dance is to be successful in New Zealand primary classrooms.

In order to establish cross-curricular dance in classrooms, participants will require time to become attached to a new method of teaching. It is suggested that during the first year, a committee be formed to liaise with Government agencies, teachers, administrators, Board of Trustees, and parents at a selected pilot school. The establishment of a scientific process for the precise measuring required in establishing a psychological profile would need to be a priority in the early stages of the research project.

At the commencement of any project, it would seem important to take time to establish trust between the research committee and the participants, through meetings, discussions and seminars. The next stage could be to meet with individual teachers regarding planning for each unit of work for the following year. During the initial year of the project, a literature review could be undertaken that examined all aspects of the study including 'The benefits to education offered by dance'. By the end of the first year, when trust had been built between the participants and the researchers, the students could have their achievement levels and psychological profiles measured to provide the base line for the research study. A second school, not involved in the project could be identified as the control school with which comparisons could be made. It would be necessary for these students to have the same levels measured as a starting point.

Before the commencement of school in the following year, researchers could meet with teachers to ensure that they shared a common understanding of how the strategies would be introduced. Classrooms may need modification to incorporate new teaching. Teachers could be offered weekly dance workshops during the first year of the project. The teacher and student responses could be monitored with a view to ensuring that the implementation was being introduced at the right speed for each particular group. I believe that it will be important to introduce dance gradually and allow it to build, rather than expecting an immediate full immersion which would possibly have the effect of dropping off throughout the year. Journal writing could form an important aspect of the study, reflecting on how, what and why a particular exercise was introduced with a reflection on its success



or otherwise. If teachers were provided with non-contact time in which to write their reflective journals, they may feel valued as co-researchers in the process. As stated, valuing teachers would be an important aspect of the programme with teachers at the heart of educational change. By including teachers as co-researchers and emphasizing their value throughout the study, incremental changes may flow on to other New Zealand primary school teachers.

Meetings could be held with the participants to identify any problems or encouraging signs during the implementation process. It is suggested that the program develop in a similar manner in the following year with the dance colleagues assisting the participants in the development of their teaching programs. It would seem important that teachers continue to receive assistance throughout each year of the project, as would the progress tracking through measurements and reflective journals. In the second year of implementation, there could be an added emphasis on dance as an art form where students may require extension work in dance. It would seem important for dance to receive full saturation and value, or old ways of thinking may be allowed to creep back and sabotage the programme.

Throughout the years of the project's implementation, papers could be written that document the journey and examine the value of the project. Resources could be developed alongside each subject, each module and each year level, which would require close co-operation with classroom teachers. Although it may seem an insurmountable task to create activities to fit every specific area through a variety of different approaches, the on-going nature of such development would allow for a many varied activities to be developed over time. Teachers create new lessons every day, and I believe that they would appreciate having lessons documented, especially where content teaching strategies were new. It would be possible to offer activities electronically, so that other teachers could monitor the progress of the project. Resources could be made available in book form, DVD's, posters and music to support the activities. A complete package for each subject focus is proposed. Over a period of ten years there would be a substantial body of work available for teachers to access and, where a very specific area of teaching was found to have nothing to match it, it is expected that there would be many exercises which could be adapted to fit. Resources and professional development ideas could be made available for all teachers in New Zealand primary schools drawing attention to any benefits gained by students in the project. New Zealand education could be leading the way, taking the creative learning through dance beyond the curriculum and into the classroom.

## 6.4 Summary

This study investigated the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms. The thesis began with a discussion of the historical evolution of dance in New Zealand schools, offering a rich and unique background with which to contextualise the current state of dance in schools. Through a review of literature, dance education was examined alongside the New Zealand and international dance curriculums. Data was gathered through a series of questions under the following broad headings: meanings of dance in the school community; perceived problems, why dance is not a focus; professional development in dance; and, a cross-curricular approach to teaching dance. This research found that teachers, principals, parents and Board of Trustee members did not question the place of dance in the curriculum. Teachers in this study understood the benefits of including dance in the curriculum, yet stopped short of actually implementing dance in their classrooms.

Upon reflection of this study's theoretical underpinnings, my attraction to and use of Eisner's theories in relation to meaning making, dialogue and connoisseurship served this research well. Eisner provided the theoretical through-line for this research and as a leading advocate for constructivism, his theories, as valued in this thesis, allowed teachers voices to be heard. Eisner's theory of connoisseurship and his constructivist theory of meaning making were valued in this study as they allowed teachers and me to foreground our embodied practice, our 'in the classroom experience'. The researcher and teachers in this study were all deemed to be educational connoisseurs in respect that they were experienced classroom teachers. The study also recognized that meanings of dance education are constructed, being shaped by teachers' classroom practices and past dance experiences. As Eisner (1998) discussed, educational connoisseurs examine everything that relates to an educational aim, and in this study an examination of the school environment was necessary to place the teacher's meanings within a context in order to examine their meanings of dance. Connoisseurship within social constructivism theory enabled the researcher to value the participants' voices through a narrative inquiry and in having their stories valued, the participants developed a trust with the researcher which allowed an honesty of communication. This was important to this particular study, as was the fact that social constructivism valued teachers' constructions of dance.

Phenomenology recognizes that dance is a way of knowing. While it was the beliefs of the participants that formed the outcomes of the research, the phenomenological approach allowed myself as the researcher to construct new personal beliefs and knowledge. With an awareness of a strong personal bias, I made a conscious effort to remain relatively passive during interviews,

ensuring that my enthusiasm for dance didn't silence or exaggerate participants' ideas. A more personal finding leading from this study was the realisation that enthusiastic advocacy requires the strength of evidence based research findings. I became aware that evidence based research such as this study could be of greater benefit to dance education than a strident and passionate call for action.

By engaging in a phenomenological critical self-reflection I examined individual meanings of dance. When participants were asked, 'what method of professional development do you believe would be helpful in order to implement dance in classrooms?' they all gave very similar responses. Participants ongoingly referred to professional development that they had received in the past and that they had experienced in other subject areas. This finding was reinforced by the literature within phenomenology that theorises the relevance of lived experience and the epistemological position that participants' meanings are on-goingly re-shaping new meanings.

Qualitative problem solving was well served by the adoption of connoisseurship. As a teacher I entered into this research with a whole set of assumptions and meanings as a strong advocate for dance. Dance education needs people like me, but teachers like me need to find strategies in order to assist generalist primary teachers in their implementation of dance. This research helped uncover approaches with which to allow dance to be taught in primary classrooms. As a teacher of 30 years' experience, what I had to offer in my role as connoisseur was the benefit of that experience. What was uncovered in this study was that teachers with experience have a lot to offer in terms of 'classroom-hardened' wisdom, and where that experience is combined with experience in dance education, benefits to dance education may follow.

As a teacher, I related to the research from Singapore and Finland that identifies the valuing of teachers. Currently in New Zealand, political and economic pressures are shaping the nature and role of education in classrooms and as such, I believe, depriving teachers of much of their autonomy. I recognised these constraints throughout the research and could empathise with the teachers in the study. If teachers feel that they are not valued, they may cut corners and let other people do the thinking. While it must be acknowledged that the teachers in each of the three schools involved in this study had principals who were supportive, they were still operating under a system requiring conformity and pressure. Currently, teachers in New Zealand are able to purposefully avoid teaching dance. Within a system where teachers were respected and provided with autonomy, I argue that a move toward teaching dance in primary classrooms could follow.

This study highlighted the importance of the leadership role school principals have in implementing change in primary classrooms. As agents of change, principals need to know more about the type of professional development that teachers might need. This study provided evidence that shared meanings of dance education between teachers and principals would support the implementation of dance in New Zealand primary-school classrooms. It is suggested that further study be initiated regarding the leadership role of principals in implementing change with regard to dance education. The constraints of this study while drawing attention to the important role of the principal in initiating change did not allow a full investigation of this area.

A discussion of the findings allowed for the emergence of a range of different professional development ideas. Participants from one school proposed the employment of a dance artist in school in the same way that they were currently experiencing a music specialist. Research and further examination of the material revealed however, that artists in schools' programmes can inadvertently disempower teachers. Artists in school programmes tend to be occasional occurrences when schools have available funding. This study found teachers observing that once the artist left the school the teachers lacked the confidence to continue the work. The result is that teachers would prefer 'someone like us' to provide professional development in dance, a teacher, a colleague who they can work alongside, someone who understands teachers and the context in which they operate. As Margaret stated,

what's good is seeing another one like us. I mean, I love watching the experts, but I know, that's the expert, that's a different class.

It would appear that teachers are ready to take the next step, with provision of the appropriate support. This research clearly found that teachers would prefer support from dance literate, classroom experienced teachers more akin to their own experience, than an artist or 'expert' that they could not relate to. The importance of building relationships between professional development support and teachers was emphasised. Teachers described the support they needed if they were to 'seriously' implement the dance curriculum. They were apprehensive about the role of visiting experts and/or artists. On the one hand they could see the short term benefits, but by their own admission, they had more concerns about the long term benefits or lack thereof from artists in residence as they currently exist. They wanted more accessible and relatable help. To a teacher, the statement 'someone like us' means someone who has had that same embodied experience of teaching. The research findings suggest that the role of artists in schools be re-examined in relation to teachers' perspectives. It is suggested that professional development be considered where a dance expert with an appreciation of classroom teaching, provides professional development in a school alongside teaching colleagues.

To state that the strength of a curriculum document is best realised through its practical application may seem obvious, and yet this study drew attention to the fact that this is the situation for dance within New Zealand schools. The key dichotomy being that New Zealand values multiple ways of knowing, as per curriculum documents, yet these ways of knowing often remain beyond the reality of many classrooms. This study found that a 'cross-curricular' approach to implementing dance could better see dance, as a 'way of knowing', being included within the classroom curriculum more meaningfully.

The current place of dance in the primary classroom is limited to extra-curricular offerings; Jump Jam, occasional artists in schools' experiences and a few enthusiastic teachers in some classrooms. The teachers in this study revealed that dance could be successfully implemented in the primary classroom through a cross curricular approach. With the provision of professional development support for cross-curricular delivery in light of the evidence in this study, I believe that the delivery of dance programmes in schools would improve considerably. Some of the teachers in the study inferred that this kind of support is all 'pie in the sky' dreaming. Some of the teachers also thought that not all teachers would willingly engage in intensive ongoing dance professional development. The suggestions for intensive professional development may seem idealist, however, given the global awareness of the value of the arts and the ability of New Zealand educators to lead the way through change, I propose that a realisation of these goals is possible. More importantly, the majority of teachers and principals in this study, stated that dance is worthwhile and that they did want to do it. If research suggests that dance has the power to engage students' creative and cognitive growth, then where resources and support are provided to schools, teachers and students could lead the way in the strengthening of the New Zealand Education system. As Bolwell (2011) stated, "If teachers have the will and acquire the knowledge, dance can take its place in the midst of, rather than the fringes of, the New Zealand Curriculum" (p.13). Again, it is noted that all of the participants in this study were supportive of dance in the curriculum and nobody was opposed to it.

Findings in this study indicated teachers' appreciation of educating the whole child and the potential role of dance. It was interesting to note that not one teacher doubted the place of dance within the curriculum, and these teachers' key rationale for including dance was the holistic educational experience dance offered. To be blunt, in this study it appeared that the teachers just couldn't practically apply or connect the current curriculum with the reality within their classroom, nor deal with wider society 'standards' driven expectations of schooling that often left no space or time for dance.

This study has concluded that for children to develop their own emotional, intellectual and spiritual energies as stated in the curriculum, dance has a central role in allowing such development. If the New Zealand Ministry of Education values multiple ways of knowing, as evidenced in the Arts Curriculum (2007) and the literature, it would appear timely that children in New Zealand schools be provided with research evidenced opportunities to improve their achievement levels.

Should the New Zealand government take curriculum gains forward into action, it may be recognized as a world leader where creativity is not an elusive and abstract concept, but as the research would suggest, a driving force in children's development. The New Zealand government in short, may need to be reminded of the research (international and New Zealand) that indicates that arts education, inclusive of dance, has the scope to improve educational achievement for all New Zealand children.

A conclusion to the research question, 'What are the meanings and contexts informing the delivery of dance in New Zealand primary classrooms?' is highly complex. I believe that it has been addressed by a seemingly spiraling answer. A lack of experience, rather than a lack of confidence, in teaching dance in the primary classroom is why very little dance is being taught in New Zealand primary schools, as dance was not a part of teachers' learning when they were at school. Research suggests that the life experiences of teachers, including their own learning, shape their approach to teaching and what they teach.

This research suggests that, unless teachers are comprehensively immersed within professional development and provided with resources, very little will change. As Shulman and Shulman (2004) highlight, it is unlikely that teachers will make change and teach dance, despite being stimulated by 'some' in-service training. For dance to take place in New Zealand primary classrooms, professional development will need to be much greater than ever before. This research proposes that the type of professional development offered needs to be reconsidered in ensuring a sustainable educational outcome. In suggesting that 'someone like us' provide professional development in dance, the teachers in this study are requesting to work with someone they feel that they can trust, someone that they can work alongside, and someone who has experience in classroom teaching. It is suggested that more research about teachers and principals meanings of dance education in school contexts be initiated in schools where teachers with dance experience work alongside their colleagues in schools to implement dance. In short, establishing pilot studies that examine and evaluate the professional development models suggested is recommended.

In closing this research, I would like to make the point that relationships and trust is what matters in a school. It was the time in the staffroom and unofficial communications that built personal

relationships and led to trust on which to position the interviews. Building relationships was a key to success in this study. It was through relationships and trust that teachers' voices were heard. Relationships in dance now need to be forged between government agencies, teachers and most importantly students, that is, if we are genuine in our desire to see the full potential of dance education be realized by teachers in New Zealand primary school classrooms.

## References

- Ackerman, R. H., & Maslin-Ostrowski, P. (2004). The Wounded Leader. *Educational Leadership*, 61.
- Ackermann, E. (2001). Piaget's Constructivism, Papert's Constructionism: What's the difference? *MT Media Lab*. Retrieved from <http://learningmedia.mit.edu/publicatins.html>
- Adkins, A., & Gunzenhauser, M. G. (1999). Knowledge Construction in Critical Ethnography. *Educational Foundations*, 13(1), 61-76.
- Adler, S. (1991). The Reflexive Practitioner and the Curriculum of Teacher Education. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 17(2), 139-150.
- Adshead, J. (1988). *Dance Analysis Theory and Practice*. London: Dance Books.
- Aitken, J., & Mildon, B. (1991). The Dynamics of Personal Knowledge and Teacher Education. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 21(2), 141-162.
- Alexander, K., & Day, M. (1991). *Discipline Based Education: A Curriculum Sampler*: J. Paul Getty Museum.
- Alter, F., Hays, T., & O'Hara, R. (2009). Creative Arts Teaching and Practice: Critical Reflections of Primary School Teachers in Australia. *International Journal of Education and the Arts*, 10(9), 1-22.
- Altheide, D. L., & Johnson, J. M. (1994). *Criteria for assessing interpretive validity in qualitative research*. Sage Publishing, CA pp. 485-499
- Anttila, E. (2010). Children's Right To Dance. *Rights of the child to the arts, culture and creativity*. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/10138/23775>
- Aotearoa New Zealand Association of Arts Educators. (2000). *Response to the Arts Draft*. Christchurch.
- Arminio, J., & Hultgren, F. (2002). Breaking out from the shadow: The question of criteria in qualitative research. *Journal of College Student Development*, 43(4), 446-461.
- Armitage, M. (1978). *Martha Graham: The Early Years*. New York: Daccapo Press.
- Ashley, L. (2010). Teaching Dance from contextual perspectives, PhD Thesis, University of Auckland
- Ashton, P. (1984). Teacher Efficacy: A Motivational Paradigm for Effective Teacher Education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 35(28), 28-32. doi: 10.1177/002248718403500507
- Auckland Council. (2011). Population and Statistics, from <http://www.arc.govt.nz/auckland/population-and-statistics/>
- Australian Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority. (2010). *Draft Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts*. Canberra.
- Ball, T., & Wells, G. (2006). Walking the Talk: The Complexities of Teaching about Teaching. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education*, 18(3), 188-203.
- Bamford, A. (2007). *Building participation and relevance in arts and cultural education*. Paper presented at the Conferencia Nacional de Educaao Artstica, Casa da Musica, Porto.
- Baragwanath, S. (2009). *Boys in Prison: What about their education?* Paper presented at the IPS Criminal Justice Forum, Wellington.
- Barbour, K. (2005). Beyond "Somatophobia": Phenomenology and Movement Research in Dance. *Junctures*, 4.
- Barth, R. (2002). Beyond Instructional Leadership: The Culture Builder. *Educational Leadership*, 59(8), 6-11.
- Benbasat, I., Goldstein, D. K., & Mead, M. (1987). The Case Research Strategy in Studies of Information Systems. *MIS Quarterly*, 11(3), 369-386.
- Benhabib, J., & Spiegel, M. (1994). The role of human capital in economic development Evidence from aggregate cross-country data. *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 34, 143-173.
- Bentley, T. (2000). Learning Beyond the Classroom. *Educational Management Administration and Leadership*, 28, 353-360. Retrieved from <http://ema.sagepub.com/content/28/3/353> doi:10.1177/0263211X000283008



## References

- Bergmann, S. (1995). Creative Dance in the Education Curriculum: Justifying the Unambiguous. *Canadian Journal of Education*, 20(2), 156-165. doi: 10.1080/15290824.2001.10387195
- Best, D. (1978). *Philosophy and Human Movement*. London: George Allen & Unwin.
- Betts, D. (2005). Theatre Arts Integration at a Middle School: Teacher Professional Development and Drama Experience. *Youth Theatre Journal*, 19(1), 17-33. doi: 10.1080/08929092.200510012574
- Birman, B., Desimone, L., Porter, A., & Garet, M. (2000). Designing professional development that works: Educational Leadership. *Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development*.
- Blase, J. (Ed.). (1988). *The teachers' political orientation vis-a-vis the Principal: The micropolitics of the school*. London: Falmer Press.
- Blume, L. (2003). Embodied [by] Dance: Adolescent de/constructions of body, sex and gender in physical education. *Sex Education*, 3(2), 95-103. doi: 10.1080/14681810309035
- Blumenthal-Jones, D. (Ed.). (2004). *Bodily-Kinesthetic Intelligence and the Democratic Ideal* (Vol. 278). New York: Peter Lang Publishing Inc.
- Blumer, H. (1969). *Symbolic Interactionism: Perspective and Method*. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.
- Boas, F. (1942). Psychological Aspects in the Practice and teaching of Creative Dance. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 2(7).
- Bogdan R C, & Biklen S K. (2007). *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to theories and models* (5th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education Inc.
- Bolwell, J. (2009). Tirairaka: Dance in New Zealand. *Tirairaka*, 24.
- Bolwell, J. (2011). Embedding literacy and numeracy in the Dance Curriculum. *DANZ Quarterly*, 25(3), 12-13.
- Bolwell, J. (Ed.). (1998). *Into the light: An expanding vision of dance education* (Vol. 1): Human Kinetics Publishers.
- Bond, K. (1994). How 'wild things' tamed gender distinctions. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation and Dance*, 65(2), 28-33.
- Bond, K., & Stinson, S. (2000/1). "I feel like I'm going to take off!" : Young People's Experiences of the Superordinary in Dance. *Dance Research Journal*, 32(2), 52-68.
- Borg, M. (2004). The apprenticeship of observation. *ELT Journal*, 58(3), 274-276.
- Borko, H., Liston, D., & Whitcomb, J. A. (2007). Genres of empirical research in teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 58(1), 3-11.
- Bourdieu, P. (1978). Sport and social class. *Social Science Information*, 18, 6.
- Bowman, W. D. (2006). Why Narrative? Why Now? *Research Studies in Music Education*(27), 5-20.
- Bradley, K. (2002). Review. *Dance Research Journal*, 34(2), 106-110.
- Brennan, D. (1996). Dance in the Northern Ireland Physical Education Curriculum: A far-sighted Policy or an Unrealistic Innovation? *Women's Studies International Forum*, 19(5), 493-503.
- Bresler, L. (1993). Three Orientations to Arts in the Primary Grades: Implications for Curriculum Reform. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 94, 1-10.
- Bresler, L., & Stake, R. (Eds.). (2006). *Qualitative Research Methodology in Music Education*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Briggs, H. (Producer). (2011, 16/06/11). Media Release.
- Britzman, D. (1986). Cultural myths in the making of a teacher: biography and social structure in teacher education. *Harvard Educational Review*, 56(4), 442-457.
- Brooks, J., & Brooks, M. (1993). *In Search of Understanding: The Case for Constructivist Classrooms*. Alexandria: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Brooks, L. (1993). Harmony in Space: A Perspective on the Work of Rudolf Laban. *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 27(2), 29-41.
- Brown, B. (2003). Teaching Style vs Learning Style: Myths and Realities Retrieved 1/12/10, from Educational Resources Information Centre <http://www.calpro-online.org/ERIC/textonly/docgen.asp?tbl=mr&ID=117>

## References

- Brualdi, A. (1996). Multiple Intelligences: Gardner's Theory. *Eric Clearinghouse on Assessment and Evaluation*.
- Buck, R. (2003a). *Teachers and Dance in the classroom: "So do I need my tutu?"*. PhD, Otago, Dunedin.
- Buck, R. (2005). *Booting the tutu: Teachers and dance in the classroom*. Paper presented at the Dance rebooted: Initialising the Grid.
- Buck, R. (2011). Men Teaching Dance. *Intersections: Dance, Gender and the Moving Body in Oceania*.
- Buck, R. (Ed.). (2003b). *The Language of Dance*. Canberra: National Affiliation of Arts Educators Australia.
- Buckley, J., Schneider, M., & Shang, Y. (2004). Building Educational Success Together. [Research]. *National Clearinghouse for Educational Facilities*.
- Bullough, R., & Baughman, K. (1997). *"First Year Teacher" Eight years later: An inquiry into teacher development*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Burnaford, G. (2009). Language matters: Clarifying Partnerships between Teachers and Artists. *Teaching Artist Journal*, 1(3), 168-171. doi: 10.1207/S1541180XTAJ0103\_07
- Burridge, S. (2010). Flying Fish and Dancing Dragons: A Case for Dance Education in Singapore. *The International Journal of Arts Education*, 94-107.
- Burrows, L. (2000). Old Games in New Rompers? Gender issues in New Zealand Physical Education. *Journal of Physical Education New Zealand*, 33(2), 30-41.
- Calderhead, J. (1989). Reflective Teaching and Teacher Education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 5(1), 43-51.
- Carey, S. (Ed.). (1987). *Cognitive Development: The descriptive problem*. New Jersey: Lawrence and Erlbaum.
- Carney, C., & Chedzoy, S. (1998). Primary student teacher experiences and their relationship to estimated competence to teach the National Curriculum for Physical Education. *Sport, Education and Society*. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/1357332980030102>  
doi:10.1080/1357332980030102
- Carpenter, V. (2009). *Low decile schools and teacher professional development*. Paper presented at the University of Otago School of Education, Researching Professionals Symposium, Dunedin.
- Carr, D. (Ed.). (2004). *Rival Conceptions of Practice in Education and Teaching*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Carter, C. (1990). Teacher Knowledge and Learning to Teach. *Handbook of Research on Teacher Education*, 3(1).
- Casey, K. (1995). The New Narrative Research in Education. *Review of Research in Education*, 21, 211-229. Retrieved from <http://rre.sagepub.com> doi:10.3102/0091732X021001211
- Catterall, J. (1998). Does experience in the arts boost academic achievement? A response to Eisner. *Art Education*, 51(4), 6-11.
- Catterall, J. (2002). The Arts and the Transfer of learning. Retrieved from [www.CE-credit.com](http://www.CE-credit.com)
- Cervero, R. (1992). Professional practice, learning, and continuing education: an integrated perspective. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 11(2), 91-101.
- Charmaz, K. (2003). *Grounded Theory Analysis*: Sage Publications.
- Charmaz, K. (Ed.). (2005). *Grounded Theory in the 21st century* (2 ed.): Sage Publications Inc.
- Chase, S. E. (Ed.). (2005). *Narrative Inquiry: Multiple lenses, approaches, voices* (3 ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.
- Checkley, K. (1997). The first seven ... and the eighth: A conversation with Howard Gardner. *Educational Leadership*, 55(1), 8-13.
- Cheesman, S. (2009). Sustaining Dance education in New Zealand: Some issues facing pre-service, primary teacher educators. *Dance Dialogues: Conversations across cultures, artsforms and practices*, 10.

## References

- Cherry, C. (1971). *Creative Movement and the Developing Child: A Nursery School Handbook for non-musicians*. Belmont: Lear Siegler Inc.
- Chong, S., Wong, I., & Choon Lang, Q. (2003). *Pre-service Teachers' Beliefs, Attitudes and Expectations: A Review of the Literature*. Singapore.
- Chubb, J., & Moe, T. (1988). Politics, Markets and the Organisation of Schools. *American Political Science Review*, 82(4), 1065-1087.
- Clandinin, J., & Connelly, M. (1989). Narrative and Story in Practice and Research. *On Narrative Method, Biography and narrative Unities in the study of teaching*, 24.
- Clandinin, J., & Connelly, M. (1996). Teachers' Professional Knowledge Landscapes: Teacher Stories. Stories of teachers. School stories. Stories of schools. *American Educational Research Association*, 25(3), 24-30. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1176665>
- Clandinin, J., Pushor, D., & Orr, A. (2007). Navigating sites for Narrative Inquiry. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 58(1), 21-35. Retrieved from <http://www.sagepub.com/cgi/content/abstract/58/1/21> doi:10.1177/0022487106296218
- Clark, J. (2005). Curriculum Studies in initial teacher education: The importance of holism and Project 2061. *The Curriculum Journal*, 16(4), 509-521.
- Clinton, H. R. (2007). Hillary Rodhan Clinton. *Journal of Dance Education*, 7(2).
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Lytle, S. (Eds.). (1993). *Inside Outside: Teacher Research and Knowledge*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Codd, J. (2005). Teachers as 'managed professionals' in the global education industry: the New Zealand experience. *Educational Review*, 57(2), 193-206. doi: 10.1080/0013191042000308369
- Colapinto, J. (1979). The Relative Value of Empirical Evidence. *Family Process*, 18(4), 427-441. doi: 10.1111/j.1545-5300.1979.00427.x
- Cole, A., & Knowles, G. (1993). Shattered Images: Understanding Expectations and Realities of Field Experiences. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 9(5/6), 457-471.
- Coleman, J. C., & Hendry, L. B. (1999). *The nature of adolescence*: Psychology Press.
- Coleman, R., Piek, J., & Livesey, D. (2001). A longitudinal study of motor ability and kinaesthetic acuity in young children at risk of developmental coordination disorder. *Human Movement Science*, 20, 95-110.
- Collins, C. (2004). Envisaging a new education studies major: what are the core educational knowledges to be addressed in pre-service teacher education? *Asia Pacific Journal of teacher Education*, 32(3), 227-240. doi: 10.1080/1359866042000295398
- Columbia, M. o. E. B. (2010). *Dance K-7 Curriculum 2010*. Ministry of Education Canada Retrieved from [http://www.bced.gov.bc.ca/irp/pdfs/arts\\_education/](http://www.bced.gov.bc.ca/irp/pdfs/arts_education/).
- Conle, C. (2000). Narrative Inquiry: research tool and medium for professional development. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 23(1).
- Connor, L., Lancaster, N., & McGrath, A. (2008). *How could initial teacher education programs in New Zealand accomodate and assist educational change?* Paper presented at the 32nd Annual Pacific Circle Consortium Conference Faculty of Education, Samoa.
- Cooney, T. J. (1985). A beginning teacher's view of problem solving. *Journal for Research in Mathematics Education*, 324-336.
- Copeland, W. D. (1979). Student teachers and cooperating teachers: An ecological relationship. *Theory into Practice*, 18(3), 194-199.
- Couldron, R., & Smith, R. (1999). Active location in teachers' construction of their professional identities. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 31(6), 711-726. doi: 10.1080/002202799182954
- Cowie, B., & Hipkins, R. (2009). *Curriculum implementation exploratory studies: Final report*: Ministry of Education.
- Crawford, J. (1994). Encouraging male participation in dance. *Journal of Physical Education Recreation and Dance*, 65(February), 40-43.
- Creech, W. (Ed.). (2009). *Twenty years on*. Wellington: Cognition Institute.

## References

- Cresswell, J. (1998). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research*: Sage Publishing Inc.
- Cresswell, J. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among five approaches*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Cresswell, J., & Miller, D. (2000). Determining Validity. *Theory Into Practice*, 39(3), 124-130.
- Crews, T., & Stitt-Gohdes, W. (2000). *A comparison of Secondary Business Education Students' Learning Styles with their Teachers' Instructional Styles*. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, New Orleans.
- Crooks, T. (2002). Educational Assessment in New Zealand Schools. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy and Practice*, 9(2), 237-253. doi: 10.1080/096959402200001959
- Crotty, M. (1998a). *The Foundations of Social Research* (2nd ed.). London: Sage Publications.
- Crotty, M. (1998b). *The Foundations of Social Research: Meaning and perspective in the research process* (1 ed.). St Leonards NSW: Sage Publications.
- Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority Australia. (2011). *Diverse Needs*. Canberra.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2000). How Teacher Education Matters. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 51(166). doi: 10.1177/0022487100051003002
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2009). Steady Work: How Finland is Building a Strong Teaching and Learning System. *Voices in Urban Education*, 24, 1-11.
- Darracott, M. (2010). [Perceptual Motor Program]. Personal Communication.
- David, O. (1889). *Physical Education* Otago Educational Institute Normal School Dunedin.
- Davies, B. (2004). Introduction: poststructuralist lines of flight in Australia. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 17(1), 1-9. doi: 10.1080/0951839032000150194
- Davies, D. (2010). Enhancing the role of arts in primary pre-service teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 26, 630-638.
- Davis, R. (2007). Whose Education is it anyway?: Why it is important that teachers understand the Question and Broader Contexts Shaping the Curriculum. *New Zealand Journal of Teachers' Work*, 4(1), 32-38.
- Day, C., Kington, A., Stobart, G., & Sammons, P. (2006). The personal and professional selves of teachers: Stable and unstable identities. 32, 601-616. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30032695>
- Deal, E., & Paterson, K. (2009). *Shaping School Culture: Pitfalls, Paradoxes and Promises* (2 ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Delandshere, G., & Petrosky, A. (2004). Political Rationales and Ideological Stances of the Standards-based Reform of Teacher Education in the US. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 20, 1-15.
- Denzin, N., & Lincoln, Y. (2000). The discipline and practice of qualitative research. In Y. S. Lincoln (Ed.), *The Handbook of qualitative Research* Sage Publications.
- Department for Education. (2012). Music and Dance Scheme Retrieved 20.01.12, 2012, from <http://www.education.gov.uk/schools/tools and initiatives/d.b0068711/mds/outreach>
- Derry, S. (1996). Cognitive Schema Theory in the Constructivist Debate. *Educational Psychologist*, 31(3/4), 163-174.
- Dewey, J. (1920). *Child and the Curriculum*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Dewey, J. (1929). *Experience and nature*: Dover Publications.
- Donnelly, B. (2003). *Inquiry into decile funding in New Zealand State and integrated schools. Report of the Education and Science Committee* (pp. 16). Wellington: House of Representatives.
- Dowling, J., & Pfeffer, J. (1975). Organizational Legitimacy: Social values and Organizational Behaviour. *The Pacific Sociological Review*, 18(1), 122-136.
- Duff, M. (2009). Artists in Schools cut short, *Manawatu Standard*.
- Duffy, T., & Cunningham, D. (1996). Constructivism: Implications for the Design and Delivery of Instruction. from Indiana University <http://iris.nyit.edu/~kkhoo/spring2008/Tpoics/Cons/ConstructivismImplications.pdf>
- Duke, D. (1998). Does it matter where our children learn? Washington D C: Thomas Jefferson Centre for Educational Design.

## References

- Duncan, D. (2009). Rose and primary English: Are the shackles really off? *Education 3-13*, 38(4), 353-367. doi: 10.1080/03004270903519204
- Dunlop MacTavish, S. (2001). *Leap of Faith: My dance through life*: Longacre Press.
- Dunn, R. (1988). Teaching students through their Perceptual Strengths or Preferences. *Journal of Reading*, 31(4), 304-309.
- Duvivier, C. (2010). To Boost your Teen's Brain, try Success. *Education With Intention*. Retrieved from [www.EducationWithIntention.com](http://www.EducationWithIntention.com)
- Dyck, J. (2002). The Built Environment's effect on learning: Applying current research. *Montessori Life*.
- Dykstra, D. (Ed.). (2005). *Teaching Introductory Physics to college students* (2 ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.
- Earthman, G. (2002). School Facility Conditions and Student Academic Achievement. *UCLA's Institute for Democracy, Education and Access*. Retrieved from <http://escholarship.org/uc/item/5sw56439>
- Easton, H. (2003). The Purpose of Partnerships: An outline of Benefits and Shortcomings. *Teaching Artist Journal*, 1(1), 19-21. doi: 10.1207/s1541180xtaj1,1-04
- Education Forum. (1999). The Arts in The New Zealand Curriculum: A submission on the draft. 96.
- Education Review Office. (1996). *Improving schooling in Mangere and Otara*. Wellington.
- Eisenhardt, K. M. (1989). Building theories from case Study Research. *The Academy of Management Review*, 14(4), 532-550.
- Eisner, E. (1974). Is the Artist in the School Program Effective? *Art Education*, 27(2), 19-23.
- Eisner, E. (1982). *Cognition and Curriculum: A Basis for Deciding what to Teach*. New York: Longman.
- Eisner, E. (1996). *Cognition and Curriculum Revisited* (2 ed.). New York: Paul Chapman Publishing.
- Eisner, E. (1998a). *The Enlightened Eye: Qualitative Inquiry and the Enhancement of Educational Practice*. Upper Saddle River: Prentice-Hall Inc.
- Eisner, E. (1998b). *The Kind of Schools We Need: Personal Essays*. Portsmouth: Heinemann.
- Eisner, E. (1998c). *The Role of Discipline-Based Art Education in America's Schools*. Los Angeles: The Getty Centre for Education in the Arts.
- Eisner, E. (1999). Does experience in the arts boost academic achievement? *The Clearing House*, 72(3), 143-149.
- Eisner, E. (2002). *The Arts and the Creation of Mind*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Elley, W. (Ed.). (2004). *Curriculum reform in retrospect: Was it forward or backward?* Palmerston North: Dunmore Press Ltd.
- Engle, E. (2008). Constructivism Versus Constructionism: A Curious Yet Critical Regard in the CRT.
- Eppell, E. (Ed.). (2009). *Curriculum, teaching and learning: A celebratory review of a very complex and evolving landscape*: Cognition Institute.
- Erickson, F. (1987). Conceptions of School Culture: An Overview. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 23(4), 11-24.
- Evertson, C., Hawley, W., & Zlotnik, M. (1985). Making a difference in Educational Quality Through Teacher Education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 36(2), 2-12. doi: 10.1177/002248718503600302
- Feiman-Nemser, S. (2003). What New teachers need to Learn. *Education Leadership*, 60(8), 25-29.
- Feldman, M., & Pentland, B. (2003). Reconceptualising Organizational Routines as a source of Flexibility and Change. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 48(1), 94-118.
- Ferdun, E. (1994). Facing Gender Issues Across the Curriculum. *Journal of Physical Education Recreation and Dance*, 65(February), 46-48.
- Fisher, K. (2005). Research into Identifying Effective Learning Environments. *OECD/PEB Evaluating Quality in Educational Facilities*, 159-167.
- Fiske, E., & Ladd, H. (2000). *When schools compete: A cautionary tale*. Washington: The Brookings Institution Press.

## References

- Foley, S., Hong, T., & Thwaites, T. (1999). The Arts in The New Zealand Curriculum: A Background Paper. In M. O. Education (Ed.).
- Fontana, A., & Frey, J. (Eds.). (2005). *The Interview: From Neutral Stance to Political Involvement*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publishing Inc.
- Foster, J. (1977). *The influences of Rudolf Laban*. London: Lepus Books Henry Kimpton Ltd.
- Fowler, C. (1977). Dance As Education. *American Alliance for Health, Physical Education and Recreation*, 1. Retrieved from doi:SO 010 489
- Fowler, C. (1996). *Strong Arts, Strong Schools: the Promising Potential and Shortsighted Disregard of the Arts in American Schools*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Fox, S. (2010). [Acting Manager, Assessment Bank, Queensland Studies Authority]. Personal Communication.
- Freedman, J., & Combs, G. (1996). *Narrative Therapy* (Vol. 1). Evanstown: W.W. Norton & Company.
- Freeman, D., & Johnson, K. (1998). Reconceptualising the Knowledge-Base of Language Teacher Education. *TESOL Quarterly*, 32(3), 397-417.
- Gainsford, K. (2009). PPTA urges government not to play 'blame game', from <http://ppta.org.nz/>
- Galton, M., MacBeath, J., Page, C., & Steward, S. (2002). *A Report commissioned by the National Union of Teachers concerning the workloads in Primary Schools*
- Gardner, H. (1983). *Frames of Mind: The Theory of Multiple Intelligences*. New York: Basic Books Inc.
- Gardner, H. (1991). *The Unschooled Mind: How Children Think and How Schools Should Teach*. New York: Basic Books.
- Gardner, H. (1999). *Intelligence Reframed: Multiple Intelligences for the 21st Century*. New York: Basic Books.
- Gardner, H. (2004). *Changing Minds*. Boston: Harvard Business School Press.
- Gelineau, P. (2011). *Integrating the arts across the elementary school curriculum* (2 ed.). Belmont USA: Cengage.
- Georgi, A. (1997). The Theory, Practice and Evaluation of the Phenomenological Method as a Qualitative Research Proceedure. *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, 28(2), 235-260.
- Giersdorf, J. (2009). Dance Studies in the International Academy: Genealogy of a Disciplinary Formation. *Dance Research Journal*, 41(1).
- Gilmour, A. (Writer) & K. Ryan (Director). (2012). *League Tables, Nine to Noon with Kathryn Ryan*. New Zealand: New Zealand radio National.
- Glasser, B. (1965). Constant Comparative Method of Qualitative Analysis *Social Problems* (Vol. 12, pp. 436-445). California: University of California Press.
- Gonzalez Thompson, A. (1984). The relationship of teachers' conceptions of mathematics and mathematics teaching to instructional practice. *Educational studies in mathematics*, 15(2), 105-127.
- Gore, J. (2001). Beyond our differences: A reassembling of what matters in Teacher Education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 52(124). doi: 10.1177/0022487101052002004
- Gorur, R. (2009). ANT on the PISA trail: Following the statistical pursuit of certainty. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*. doi: 10.1111/j.1469-5812.2009.00612.x
- Graham, L., & Stevens, K. (2007). *Dance in Education: A Working Partnership Preparing Dance Artists for Work in Schools*. Paper presented at the World Dance Alliance: Asia Pacific Dance Bridge - Exploring Partnerships, Singapore.
- Green Gilbert, A. (2006). *Brain-Compatible Dance Education*. Reston: National Dance Association.
- Green, J., & Stinson, S. (Eds.). (1999). *Research in Dance*. Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press.
- Green, L., Chedzoy, S., Harris, W., Mitchell, R., Naughton, C., Rolfe, L., & Stanton, W. (1998). A study of Student teachers' Perceptions of teaching the Arts in Primary Schools. *British Educational Research Journal*, 24(1), 95-107.
- Griss, S. (1994). Creative Movement: A Language for Learning. *Educational Leadership*, 51(5), 78-80.
- Grumet, M. (Ed.). (1990). *On Daffodils That Come Before the Swallow Dares*. New York: Teachers College Press.

## References

- Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (Eds.). (1994). *Competing paradigms in Qualitative Research. Major paradigms and perspectives*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.
- Guingane, J. (2010). *keynote speech*. Paper presented at the UNESCO Second World Conference on Arts Education Seoul.
- H'Doubler, M. N. (1998). *Dance: A creative art experience*. Madison: Univ of Wisconsin Press.
- Hall, C., & Thomson, P. (2007). Creative Partnerships? Cultural Policy and Inclusive Arts Practice in One Primary School. *British Educational Research Journal*, 33(3), 315-329.
- Hall, C., Thomson, P., & Russell, L. (2007). Teaching Like an Artist: The Pedagogic Identities and Practices of Artists in Schools. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 28(5), 605-619.
- Hallinger, P., & Heck, R. (1988). Exploring the Principal's Contribution to School Effectiveness 1980-1995. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement: An International Journal of Research Policy and Practice*, 9(2), 157-191. doi: 10.1080/0924345980090203
- Halprin, A. (Ed.). (2002). *Teaching Dance to Children*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press.
- Hanna, J. (1992). Connections: Arts, Academics and Productive Citizens. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 73(8), 601-607.
- Hanna, J. (1999). *Partnering dance and education: Intelligent moves for changing times*. Champaign: Human Kinetics.
- Hanna, J. (2008). A non-verbal language for Imagining and Learning. *Educational Researcher*, 37(8), 491-506. doi: 10.3102/0013189X08326032
- Hanna, T. (1991). What is Somatics? *Journal of behavioural Optometry*, 2(2), 31-35.
- Hanstein, P. (Ed.). (1999). *From Idea to Proposal* (1 ed. Vol. 1). Chicago: University of Pittsburg Press.
- Hargreaves, A. (Ed.). (2010). *Change from Without: Lessons from other countries, systems and sectors*. London: Springer.
- Hargreaves, A., Halasz, G., & Pont, B. (2007). School Leadership for systemic improvement in Finland: A case study report for the OECD activity Improving school leadership. In OECD (Ed.): Ministry of Education Finland.
- Harris, D., & Sass, T. (2006). *The Effects of Teacher-Training on Teacher Value-Added*. Tallahassee: Florida Department of Education.
- Harris, S. R. (2010). *What is Constructionism? Navigating its use in Sociology* (1 ed.). Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc.
- Hassart, J. (1999). *Students' experience in constructivist learning environments: An Inquiry into TEEMS - A Science teacher Education Program*. Paper presented at the 6th Nordic Research Conference on Science Education, Finland.
- Hatch, J. A. (2002). *Doing Qualitative Research in Educational Settings*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Hattie, J. (2000). Schools like mine: Cluster analysis of New Zealand Schools. *New Zealand Journal of Educational Studies*.
- Hennessy, S. (2000). Overcoming the red-feeling: The development of confidence to teach music in primary school amongst student teachers. *British Journal of Music Education*, 17(2), 183-196.
- Hennessy, S., Rolfe, L., & Chedzoy, S. (2001). The factors which influence student teachers' confidence to teach the arts in the primary classroom. *Research in Dance Education*, 2(1), 53-71.
- Hennessy, S., Rolfe, L., & Chedzoy, S. (2010). *The factors which influence student teachers' confidence to teach the arts in the primary classroom*. London: Routledge.
- Highwater, J. (1996). *Dance: Rituals of Experience*: Oxford University Press.
- Hill, J., & Hawk, K. (2000). *Four Conceptual Clues to Motivating Students: Learning from the practice of effective teachers in low decile, multi-cultural schools*. Paper presented at the NZARE Conference, Waikato.
- Hills, J. (1995). *Inquiry into low income and Wealth* (Vol. 2). London: Joseph Rountree Foundation.
- Hipkins, R., Wylie, C., & Joyce, C. (2007). *School planning and reporting in action: The early years of the new framework*: New Zealand Council for Educational Research.

## References

- Hobson, R. (1985). *Forms of Feeling: The Heart of Psychotherapy* (Vol. 5). London: Routledge Publishing.
- Hodas, S. (Ed.). (1996). *Technology Refusal and the Organisational Culture of Schools* (Vol. 2). San Diego: Academic Press.
- Hodgson, J., & Preston-Dunlop, V. (2001). *Rudolf Laban: An Introduction to his work and influence*. Plymouth: Northcote House Publishers Ltd.
- Hong-Joe, C. M. (2002). *Developing Dance Literacy in the Postmodern: An Approach to Curriculum*. Faculty of Education. Griffith University. Brisbane.
- Hong, T. (2000). Developing Dance Literacy in the Postmodern: An Approach to Curriculum. *Dance Professional Readings*. Retrieved from <http://artsonline2.tki.org.nz/TeacherLearning/readings/danceliteracy.php>
- Hong, T. (2010). *Second World Conference on Arts Education*. Paper presented at the UNESCO Programme for the second world conference on arts education, Seoul.
- Hood, D. (1998). *Our secondary schools don't work anymore*: Auckland: Profile Books.
- Hornig, J., Hong, J., Lih-Juan, L., Shih-Hui, C., & Hui-Chuan, C. (2005). Creative teachers and creative teaching strategies. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 29(4), 352-358.
- Houlenville, A. J., & Smith-Conway, K. (2008). Parental Effort, School Resources and Student Achievement. *Journal of Human Resources*, 2, 437-453.
- Howard, S., & Johnson, B. (2004). Resilient teachers: resisting stress and burnout. *Social Psychology of Education*, 7, 399-420.
- Hoy, W. K., & Rees, R. (1977). The bureaucratic socialization of student teachers. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 28(1), 23-26.
- Huberman, M., & Miles, M. (1984). *Innovation up close: How school improvement works*. New York: Plenum Press.
- Impact, A. (2011). About Arts Impact. Retrieved from <http://www.arts-impact.org/>
- Jeffrey, B., & Craft, A. (2004). Teaching creatively and teaching for creativity: Distinctions and relationships. *Educational Studies*, 30(1), 77-87.
- Jeffrey, B., & Craft, A. (2010). Teaching Creatively and teaching for creativity: distinctions and relationships. *Educational Studies* 30(1), 77-87. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0305569032000159750> doi:10.1080/0305569032000159750
- Jensen, E. (1998). *Teaching with the Brain In Mind*. Alexandria: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Jensen, E. (2001). *Arts with the brain in mind*: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Jensen, E. (2005). *Teaching with the brain in mind*. Alexandria: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Joyce, B., & Calhoun, E. (1991). School Effectiveness and School Improvement The New Meaning of Educational Change. 2(4), 336-343. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0924345910020406> doi:10.1080/0924345910020406
- Jump Jam. (2010). Kidz Aerobics, 2010, from [www.jumpjam.co.nz](http://www.jumpjam.co.nz)
- Kadlec, A. (2007). *Dewey's Critical Pragmatism*. Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Kagan, D. (1992). Implications of Research on Teacher Belief. *Educational Psychologist*, 27(1), 65-90. doi: 10.1207/s15326985ep2701\_6
- Kant, E. (2007). *Immanuel Kant: Critique of Pure Reason*. London: Penguin Books.
- Kaufman, D. (2003). Applying educational theory in practice. *BMJ Clinical Review*, 326.
- Kaufmann, K., & Ellis, B. (2007). Preparing pre-service generalist teachers to use creative movement in K-6. *Journal of Dance Education*, 7(1).
- Kaye, H. (2010). *From artist to teacher: Challenges faced by students training to be dance artists in schools*. Master of Creative and Performing Arts (Dance Studies), University of Auckland, Auckland.



## References

- Keinanen, M., Hetland, L., & Winner, E. (2000). Teaching Cognitive Skill through Dance: Evidence for near but not far transfer. *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 34(3/4), 295-306.
- Keown, P., Parker, L., & Tiakiwai, S. (2005). Values in the New Zealand Curriculum: A Literature Review on Values in the Curriculum. In New Zealand Ministry of Education (Ed.). Hamilton: University of Waikato.
- Kerr-Berry, J. A. (1994). Using the power of West African dance to combat gender issues. *Journal of physical education recreation and dance*, 65, 44-44.
- Kerr-Berry, J. A. (2007). Dance educator as dancer and artist. *Journal of Dance Education*, 7(1).
- Keun, L., & Hunt, P. (2006). Creative Dance: Singapore children's creative thinking and problem solving responses. *Research in Dance Education*, 7(1), 35-65. doi: 10.1080/14617890600610661
- Kidder, L., & Fine, M. (Eds.). (1987). *Qualitative and Quantitative Methods: When Stories Converge*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- Kieinanen, M., Hetland, L., & Winner, E. (Eds.). (2002). *Teaching Cognitive Skill Through Dance: Evidence for near but not far transfer*. Washington: Department of Education Washington D.C.
- Koff, S. (2000). Towards a definition of dance education. *Childhood Education*, 77(Fall), 27-31.
- Koff, S. (2003). Introduction to Gardner's Multiple Intelligence Theories. *Journal of Dance Education*, 3(1), 3-7.
- Koff, S., & Warner, M.-J. (2001). Curriculum Integration: Teaching In, Through, and about Dance in Primary and Secondary Education. *Journal of Dance Education*, 1(4), 142-147.
- Korthagen, F., & Kessels, J. (1999). Linking Theory and Practice: Changing the Pedagogy of Teacher Education. *Educational Researcher*, 28(4). doi: 10.3102/0013189X028004004
- Koster, E. A. (2003). Multi-scale cartographic systems and morphology. *Urban Morphology*, 7(1), 38-39.
- LaMothe, K. L. (2006). *Nietzsche's Dancers*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Lampert, M. D., & Ervin-Tripp, S. M. (Eds.). (1993). *Structured Coding for the study of language and social interaction*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers.
- Lanham III, J. (1999). *Relating Building and classroom conditions to student achievement in Virginia's Elementary Schools*. Dr of Education, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University.
- Larabee, D. (2000). On the nature of Teaching and Teacher Education: Difficult Practices that Look Easy. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 51. doi: 10.1177/0022487100051003011
- Larochelle, M., Bednarz, N., & Garrison, J. (Eds.). (1998). *Constructivism and Education*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- LaRocque, N. (2005). School Choice: Lessons from New Zealand. In Briefing papers (Ed.), (Vol. 12).
- Le Metais, J. (2003). International Trends in Primary Education. In International Review of Curriculum and Assessment Framework Archive (Ed.), (pp. 1-128). London: Qualifications and Curriculum Authority.
- Lee, H., O'Neill, A., & McKenzie, D. (Eds.). (2004). "To Market, To Market"... "The Mirage of Certainty: An Outcomes Based Curriculum". Palmerston North: Dunmore Press Ltd.
- Leithwood, K., & Jantzi, D. (1990). Transformational Leadership: How Principals can help reform school cultures. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement: An International Journal of Research Policy and Practice*, 1(4), 249-280. doi: 10.1080/092435900010402
- Leland, H., Harste, C., & Helt, C. (2000). Multiple ways of knowing. In M. A. Gallego & S. Hollingsworth (Eds.), *What counts as literacy?: challenging the school standard*: Teachers College Press.
- Levinthal, D., & March, J. (1993). The Myopia of Learning. *Strategic Management Journal*, 14(Special Issue), 95-112.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1986). But is it Rigorous? Trustworthiness and Authenticity in Naturalistic Evaluation. *Naturalistic Evaluation New Directions for program Evaluation*, (30). Retrieved from doi:10.1002/ev

## References

- Little, A. (Ed.). (1978). *The Meaning of Dance for Young Children*. Washington, D.C.: American Alliance for Health, Physical Education, Recreation and Dance.
- Logan, B. (1995). *A Level Playing Field: Equity in the funding of primary and secondary education*: New Zealand Education Development Foundation.
- Loizos, P. (Ed.). (2000). *Video, film and Photographs as Research Documents*. London: Sage Publications.
- Lortie, D. (1975). *Schoolteacher: A sociological Study*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Lortie, D. (Ed.). (1969). *The balance of control and autonomy in elementary school teaching*. New York: Free Press.
- Lovett, S. (2002). *Teacher Learning and Development in Primary Schools: A View Gained Through the national Education Monitoring Project*. Doctor of Philosophy, University of Canterbury, Christchurch.
- Lucas, R. (1988). On the mechanics of Economic Development. *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 22, 3-42.
- Lumpe, A. T., Haney, J. J., & Czerniak, C. M. (2000). Assessing teachers' Beliefs about Their Science Teaching Context. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 37(3), 275-292.
- MacDonald, C. (1991). Elementary teachers explain why they do not use creative dance in their classrooms. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 37(2).
- Macdonald, I. (1981). The Role of Artists and Arts Organisations in Education. *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 15(3), 93-99.
- Maddox, H. (1968). A descriptive study of teaching practice. *Educational Review*, 20(3), 177-190.
- Maletic, V. (1987). *Body, Space, Expression: The development of Rudolf Laban's Movement and dance concepts*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter & Co.
- Mankiw, N. G., Romer, D., & Weil, D. N. (1992). A contribution to the empirics of economic growth. *The quarterly journal of economics*, 107(2), 407-437.
- Mans, M. (2007). Dance Curriculum Research in Africa. In L. Bresler (Ed.), *International Handbook of Research in Arts Education*: Springer.
- Mardle, G., & Walker, M. (1980). Strategies and structure: Critical notes on teacher socialization. *Teacher strategies*, 98-124.
- Marsh, C. (1994). *Producing a National Curriculum: Plans and Paranoia*: Allen & Unwin St Leonards,, NSW.
- Marshall, J. (Ed.). (2001). *Self-reflective Inquiry Practices*. London: Sage Publications
- Martin, C. (1993). New Directions for Investigating Children's Gender Knowledge. *Developmental Review*, 13, 184-204.
- Martin, L. (2007). Dance as a Creative Catalyst: Creative Partnerships Cornwall. *Animated Making Dance Matter*.
- Matar, M. (2010). The impact of school design on academic achievement in the Palestinian territories: an empirical study. *OECD 2010*.
- Maughan, B., Mortimore, P., Ouston, J., & Rutter, M. (1980). Fifteen thousand hours: A reply to Heath & Clifford. *Oxford Review of Education*, 6(3), 289-303.
- Maxwell, G. (2009). *Changing Crime Rates 1998-2007*. Paper presented at the IPS Criminal Justice Forum, Wellington.
- Maykut, P., & Morehouse, R. (1994). *Beginning Qualitative Research: A Philosophic and Practical Guide*. London: The Falmer Press.
- McDermott, J. J. (1994). *The Philosophy of John Dewey* (Vol. 1): University of Chicago Press.
- McGee, C., Jones, A., Bishop, R., Cowie, B., Hill, M., Miller, T., . . . MacKenzie, K. (2002). Curriculum Stocktake: National School Sampling Study (pp. 300). Hamilton: University of Waikato.
- McHale, S., Crouter, A., & Tucker, C. (1999). Family Context and Gender Role Socialisation in Middle Childhood. Comparing Girls to Boys and Sisters to Brothers. *Child Development*, 70(4), 990-1004.
- McKenna, J. (2010). Serious Benefits: Song and Dance. *Teacher*, 212, 40-44.

## References

- McMahon, D., Rose, D., & Parks, M. (2003). Basic Reading Through Dance: The impact on first grade students' basic reading skills. *Evaluation Review*. doi: 10.1177/0193841X02239021
- McQueen, H. (Ed.). (2009). *Towards a covenant*. Wellington: Cognition Institute.
- McSwain, L. (1994). *An investigation of attitudes toward dance among Sydney High School students*. Paper presented at the Dance and the Child International: Kindle the Fire, Sydney.
- Melchior, E. (2006). *If you can walk you can dance: How generalist teachers develop confidence and competence to teach dance*. Paper presented at the Dance and the child International Conference The Hague
- Melchoir, E. (2005). *If you can walk you can dance: How generalist teachers develop confidence and competence to teach dance*. Paper presented at the Oceania Congress, Wellington.
- Miles, M. (1979). Qualitative data as an attractive nuisance. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 24(4), 590-601.
- Mills, J. (1989). The generalist primary teacher of music: A problem of confidence. *British Journal of Music Education*, 6(2), 125-138.
- Mills, J., Bonner, A., & Francis, K. (2006). Adopting a constructivist approach to grounded theory: Implications for research design. *International Journal of Nursing Practice*, 12(1).
- Ministry of Education. (1993). *The New Zealand Curriculum Framework*. Wellington: Learning Media Ltd Retrieved from <http://nzcurriculum.tki.org.nz>.
- Ministry of Education. (2000). *The New Zealand Curriculum*. Wellington: Learning Media Ltd.
- Ministry of Education. (2007). *The New Zealand Curriculum*. Wellington: Learning Media Ltd.
- Ministry of Education New Zealand. (2007). *The New Zealand Curriculum: The Arts*. New Zealand Government.
- Ministry of Education, N. Z. (2004). *Best Practice in Classroom Design*: AC Neilsen.
- Minton, S. (2003). *Using movement to teach academics The Mind and Body as one Entity*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Education.
- Mishler, E. G. (1986). *Research Interviewing: Context and Narrative*: Harvard University Press.
- Moolenaar, N., Daly, A., & Slegers, P. (2010). Occupying the Principal's Position: Examining relationships between Transformational Leadership, Social Network Position and Schools Innovative Climate. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 46(5), 623-670. doi: 10.1177/0013161X10378689
- Mourshed, M & Barber, M (2006) McKinsey and Company Report, [mailto:social\\_sector\\_office@mckinsey.com](mailto:social_sector_office@mckinsey.com)
- Mutch, C. (2000). Values Education in New Zealand: Old ideas in new garb. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, 4(1), 1-10.
- Nagel, J. H. (1998). Social choice in a pluralitarian democracy: the politics of market liberalization in New Zealand. *British Journal of Political Science*, 28(02), 223-267.
- Nash, R. (2000). Educational Inequality: The Special Case of Pacific Students. *Social Policy Journal of New Zealand*, 15, 69-86.
- National Council for Curriculum and Assessment. (2010), from <http://www.curriculumonline.ie/en/>
- National Council for Curriculum and Assessment. (2011), from <http://www.curriculumonline.ie/en/>
- National Curriculum. (2011). *National Curriculum online*. London.
- New Zealand International Migration Statistics. (2010). *International Travel and Migration Articles 1922 - 2009*. Wellington.
- New Zealand Ministry of Education. (2008). Community Artists for Education (CAFE). Retrieved from <http://artsonline.tki.org.nz/>
- Newitt, R., & Wauchop, D. (2005). The Arts Matter. *Teacher The National Education Magazine*, 13(5). Retrieved from <http://search.informit.com.au/documentSummary;dn+919803086127423;res=IELHSS:1449-9274>
- News, B. B. C. (Writer) & S. Coughlan (Director). (2004). Education key to economic survival. U.K.: B.B.C.

## References

- Nias, J. (1987). Teaching and the self. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 17(3), 178-185.
- Niemi, H. (1999). Dance Education and Dance Research in Finland. *Dance Research Journal*, 31(2), 127-130.
- Niemi, H. (2009). *Why Finland on the top? Reflections on the reasons for the Pisa success*. Paper presented at the 3rd Redesigning Pedagogy International Conference, Singapore.
- Noddings, N. (Ed.). (2004). *Is Teaching a Practice?* Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- O'Farrell, L. (2010, 28 May 2010). *Final Report Closing Session of the Second World Conference on Arts Education*. Paper presented at the The Second World Conference of Arts Education, Seoul.
- Obama, B. (2011). *Reinvesting in Arts Education: Winning America's future through creative schools*. Washington D C: President's Committee on the Arts and Humanity.
- OECD. (2007). Education at a Glance. *OECD indicators* Retrieved from <http://www.oecd.org/bookshop?pub=96200705UEI>
- OECD. (2010). *PISA 2009 Results: Volume 3: Learning to Learn: Student Engagement*. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264083943-en>.
- OECD. (2011). *National seminars on Innovation and Education in Finland and Hungary*. Paper presented at the CERI's Innovation Strategy Newsletter, Paris.
- Oehrle, E. (1996). Intercultural education through music: towards a culture of tolerance. *British Journal of Music Education*, 13(02), 95-100. doi: doi:10.1017/S0265051700003077
- Oliver, C. (1992). The Antecedents of Deinstitutionalization. *Organisation Studies*, 13(4), 563-588. Retrieved from <http://oss.sagepub.com/content/13/4/563> doi:10.1177/017084069201300403
- Olssen, M. (1996). In defence of the welfare state and publicly provided education: a New Zealand perspective. *Journal of Education Policy*, 11(3), 337-362.
- Oreck, B. (2004). The Artistic and Professional Development of Teachers: A study of teachers' attitudes toward the use of arts in teaching. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 55(1). doi: 10.1177/0022487103260072
- Pajares, F. (1992). Teachers' Beliefs and Educational Research: Cleaning up a Messy Construct. *Review of Educational Research*, 62(307). doi: 10.3102/00346543062003307
- Palmer, P. J. (1998). *The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a teacher's life*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Parsad, B., & Coopersmith, J. (2012). Arts Education in Public and Elementary Schools 1999-2000 and 2009-10. In IES National Center for Education Statistics Institute of Education Sciences (Ed.). Washington D.C.: U.S. Department of Education,.
- Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.
- Peters, M., & Marshall, J. (2004). The politics of curriculum: autonomous choosers and enterprise culture. In AM O'Neill, J. Clark & R. Openshaw (Eds.), *Reshaping Culture, Knowledge and Learning* (pp. 109-126). Palmerston North: Dunmore Press.
- Petty, M. F., & Hogben, D. (1980). Explorations of semantic space with beginning teachers: a study of socialization into teaching. *British Journal of Teacher Education*, 6(1), 51-61.
- Pica, R. (2010). Linking Literacy and Movement. *National Association for the education of Young Children*. Retrieved from [www.naeyc.org/yc/columns](http://www.naeyc.org/yc/columns)
- Pigeon, P., Oliver, C., & Rochiccioli. (1997). Intensive Dance Practice: Repercussions on Growth and Puberty. *American Journal of Sports medicine*, 25(2), 5. doi: 10.1177/036354659702500219
- Poest, C., Williams, J., Witt, D., & Atwood, M. (1989). Physical Activity Patterns of Preschool children. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 4, 367-376.
- Polkinghorne, D. (2005). Language and meaning: Data collection in Qualitative Research. *Journal of Counselling Psychology*, 52(2), 137-145.
- Pollard, A. (1988). Physical Education, competition and control in Primary Education. *Teachers, teaching and control in Physical Education*, 109-124.

## References

- Pope, J. (2010). The History of Dalcroze Eurhythmics in New Zealand. *e-journal of Studies in Music Education*, 8(2), 61-80.
- Posner, E. A. (2000). Law and social norms: The case of tax compliance. *Virginia Law Review*, 1781-1819.
- Potter, M. (Writer) & National Library of Australia (Director). (1998). Interview with Shona Dunlop McTavish, *Oral Histories*. Australia.
- Prashnig, B. (2006). *Learning styles and personalised teaching*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group Ltd.
- President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities. (2011). *Reinvesting in Arts Education: Winning America's Future through Creative Schools* (pp. 76). Washington D C: President's Committee on the Arts and Humanities.
- Preston-Dunlop, V. (2008). *Rudolf Laban: An Extraordinary Life* (2 ed.). Plymouth: Dance Books Ltd.
- Prideaux, D. (2003). Curriculum design. *BMJ Publishing Group Ltd*, 326(7383), 268-270.
- Prince's Trust Research. (2006). *The Cost of Exclusion: Counting the cost of youth disadvantage in the U.K.* Retrieved from [princes-trust.org.uk](http://princes-trust.org.uk)
- Pulaski, M. (1971). *Understanding Piaget: An Introduction to Children's Cognitive Development*. New York: Harper & Row Publishers.
- Purcell, T. (1994). Learning through the language of dance: A Cross-Curricular Experience. *NASSP Bulletin*, 78(20). doi: 10.1177/019263659407856104
- Queensland Studies Authority. (2004). *Queensland Studies Authority*. Brisbane: Queensland State Government.
- Radio New Zealand (Writer). (2011). *Arts on Sunday*. New Zealand.
- Rauscher, F., Shaw, G., Levine, L., Wright, E., Dennis, W., & R, N. (1997). Music training causes long-term enhancement of pre-school children's spatial-temporal reasoning. *Neurological Research*, 19, 2-8.
- Rawls, J. (1980). Kantian Constructivism in Moral Philosophy. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 77(9), 515-572.
- Raymond, A. (1997). Inconsistency between a beginning Elementary School Teacher's Mathematics Beliefs and teaching Practice. *National Council of Teachers in Mathematics*, 28(5), 550-576.
- Review-office Of Education. (2003). *Readiness of Schools to implement The Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum*. Wellington.
- Reyhner, J. (1997). Teaching Indigenous Languages. *Flagstaff*, 206-213.
- Richardson, V. (1998). How Teachers Change: What will lead to change that most benefits student learning? *NCSALL*. Retrieved from <http://www.ncsall.net/?id=395>
- Risner, D. (2009a). *Stigma and Perseverance in the lives of boys who dance: An empirical study of male identities in western theatrical dance training*.
- Risner, D. (2009b). *What we know about boys who dance: The limitations of contemporary masculinity and dance education*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Risner, D. (Ed.). (2008). *When Boys Dance: Cultural Resistance and Male Privilege in Dance Education*. Raleigh: Human Kinetics.
- Ritchie, J., & Spencer, L. (2002). Qualitative data analysis for applied policy research. In M. Huberman & M. Miles (Eds.), *The qualitative researcher's companion* (pp. 305-329). Thousand oaks: Sage Publications.
- Robertson, S., & Dale, R. (2002). Local States of Emergency: The contradictions of neo-liberal governance in education in New Zealand. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 23(3), 463-482. doi: 10.1080/0142569022000015472
- Robinson, K. (Producer). (2006, 03/11/10). *Changing Education Paradigms: Schools kill creativity*.
- Rolf, L. (1997). Student teachers perceptions of teaching dance in primary schools. *Physical Education and sport pedagogy*, 2(2), 218-277. doi: 10.1080/1740898970020207
- Rolfe, L. (2001). The Factors which Influence Primary Teachers' Confidence to Teach Dance. *European Physical Education Review*, 7(2), 157-175. doi: 10.1177/1356336X010072004

## References

- Root-Bernstein, M., & Root-Bernstein, R. (2010). Reflections on UNESCO'S 2nd World Conference on Arts Education, Seoul, Korea. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved from <http://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/imagine/201006/reflections-unesco-s-2nd-world...>
- Root-Bernstein, R. (2001). Music, Creativity and Scientific Thinking. *Leonardo*, 34(1), 63-68.
- Rosenholtz, S. (1989). Workplace Conditions that Affect Teacher Quality and Commitment: Implications for Teach Induction Programs. *The Elementary School Journal*, 89(4), 420-439.
- Ross, J. (2000). *Moving Lesson Margaret H'Doubler and the beginning of dance in American Education*. Madison: The University of Wisconsin Press.
- Rubin, B. (1982). Naturalistic Evaluation: Its Tenents and Application. *Studies in Art Education*, 24(1), 57-62. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1319804>
- Russell-Bowie, D. (2011). An Ode to Joy... or the Sounds of Silence? An exploration of Arts Education Policy in Australian Primary Schools. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 112(4), 163-173. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10632913.2011.566099>
- Sahlberg, P. (Ed.). (2007). *Educational Change in Finland*. London: Springer.
- Sanderson, P. (2001). Age and gender Issues in Adolescent Attitudes to Dance. *European Physical Education Review*, 7(2), 117-136.
- Sanderson, P. (2008). The Arts, social inclusion and social class: The case of dance. *British Educational Research Journal*, 34(4), 467-490. doi: 10.1080/01411920701609349
- Sansom, A. (2008). *Dance and Play: Paradox or Partnership* Peer Reviewed Paper presented at the He Kupu The Wod.
- Savery, J., & Duffy, T. (Eds.). (1996). *In Constructivist Learning Environments: Case*. New Jersey: Englewood Cliffs.
- Schell, C. (1992). *The Value of the Case Study as a research strategy*. Manchester Business School.
- Schofield, J. (Ed.). (1990). *Increasing the Generalizability of Qualitative Research*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Schön, D. A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner*: Jossey-Bass San Francisco.
- Schultz, M. (2008). *From the Haka to dancing with the Stars*. M.A., University of Auckland, Auckland.
- Schwab, J. (1971). The Practical: Arts of Eclectic. *The School Review*, 79(4), 493-542.
- Schwandt, T. A. (2007). Judging Interpretations. *New Directions for Evaluation*, 114. Retrieved from doi:10.1002/ev223
- Schwandt, T. A. (Ed.). (1994). *Constructivist interpretivist approaches to human inquiry*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Schwartz, S. (1999). A Theory of Cultural Values and some implications for Work. *Applied Psychology: An International Review*, 48(1), 23-47.
- Sellstrom, E., & Bremburg, S. (2006). Is there a "school effect" on pupil outcomes? A review of multilevel studies. *Journal of Epidemiol Community Health*, 60, 149-155. doi: 10.1136/jech.2005.036707
- Sendak, M. (1988). *Where the wild things are*. United States: HarperCollins.
- Seoul Agenda. (2010). *The Second UNESCO World Conference on Arts Education*. Paper presented at the The Second UNESCO World Conference on Arts Education, Seoul.
- Sevilla, J. (2003). One School's Application of the Theory of Multiple Intelligences: When one flower blooms. *Journal of Dance Education*, 3(1), 34-38.
- Shapiro, S. (1998). *Dance, power, and difference: critical and feminist perspectives on dance education*: Human Kinetics.
- Shaughnessy, M. (1998). An Interview with Rita Dunn about Learning Styles. *The Clearing House*, 71(3), 141-145.
- Sherlock, J. (1987). Issues of Masculinity and Femininity in British Physical Education. *Womens Studies International Forum*, 10(4), 443-451.
- Shields, C. (2004). Dialogic Leadership for Social Justice. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 40. doi: 10.1177/0013161X03258963

## References

- Shulman, L., & Shulman, J. (2004). How and what teachers learn: a shifting perspective. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 36(2), 257-271. doi: 10.1080/0022027032000148298
- Silvernail, D. L., & Costello, M. H. (1983). The Impact of Student Teaching and Internship Programs on Preservice Teachers. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 34(4), 32-36.
- Simons, H. (1996). The Paradox of Case Study. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 26(2), 225-240. doi: 10.1080/0305764960206
- Skoning, S. (2008). Movement and Dance in the Inclusive Classroom. *Teaching: Exceptional Children Plus*, 4(6).
- Smith, G. (2010). Lessons in Education and Music from Finland. Retrieved from [www.thefms.org/.../lessons-on-music-and-education](http://www.thefms.org/.../lessons-on-music-and-education)
- Southam, M., & Schwartz, K. (2004). Laugh and Learn: Humour as a teaching strategy in Occupational Therapy Education. Retrieved from <http://www.haworthpress.com/web/OTHC>
- Spivey, N. (1997). *The Constructivist Metaphor: Reading, Writing and the Making of Meaning*. San Deigo: Academic Press.
- Stake, R. (1978). The Case Study Method in Social Inquiry. *Educational Researcher*, 7(2), 5-8. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable.1174340>
- Stake, R. (1995). *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Stake, R. (2005). Thousand Oaks. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research* (pp. 443-466): Sage Publications, Inc.
- Stanley, C. (1998). A Framework for Teacher Reflexivity. *English Language Teacher Education*, 32(3), 584-591.
- Steers, J. (2004). Art and Design. *Rethinking the School Curriculum*, ed. J. White (London and New York: Routledge Falmer, 2004), 31.
- Stein, D. (2004). Wearing Two Hats: The Case of Visiting Artists in the Classroom. In J. Solomon (Ed.), *Good Work Project* (Vol. 29, pp. 13-22): Harvard University.
- Stephens, R. (2000). The social impact of reform: Poverty in Aotearoa New Zealand *Social Policy and Administration*, 34(1), 64-86.
- Stewart, N. (1998). Re-Languaging the Body: Phenomenological Description and the Dance Image. *Performance Research*, 3(2), 42-53.
- Stinson, S. (1982). Aesthetic experience in children's dance. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation, and Dance*, 52, 72-74.
- Stinson, S. (1988). *Dance for young children: Finding the magic in movement* (2 ed.). Reston: The American Alliance fo Health Physical Education Recreation and Dance.
- Stinson, S. (1995). Body of knowledge. *Educational theory*, 45(1), 43-54.
- Stinson, S. (2005a). The Hidden Curriculum in Gender Education. *Journal of Dance Education*, 5(2), 51-57. doi: 10.1080/15290824.2005.10387285
- Stinson, S. (2005b). Why Are we Doing This? *Journal of Dance Education*, 5(3), 82-89.
- Stinson, S. (2010). Questioning our Past and Building a Future:Teacher Education in Dance for the 21st Century. *Journal of Dance Education*, 10(4), 136-144. doi: 10.1080/15290824.2010.529764
- Stinson, S. (Ed.). (2002). *What we teach is who we are: The Stories of our Lives*: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Stinson, S. (Ed.). (2007). *Making sense of curriculum research in arts education*: Springer.
- Stinson, S., Blumenfield-Jones, D., & van Dyke, J. (1990). Voices of young women dance students: An interpretive study of meaning in dance. *Dance Research Journal*, 22(2), 13-22.
- Stitt-Gohdes. (2001). Business Education students preferred learning styles. *Journal of Career and Technical Education*, 18(1).
- Stofflett, R., & Stoddart, T. (1994). The ability to understand and use conceptual change pedagogy as a function of prior content learning experience. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 31(1), 31-51.
- Stone, P. (1992). How we turned around a problem school. *The Principal*, 72(2), 34-36.

## References

- Stothart, R. (1974). *The Development of Physical Education in New Zealand*. Auckland: Heinemann Educational Books.
- Stothart, R. (1996). *A Brief History of The Physical Education Advisory Service*. Wellington: Stothart, R.
- Stothart, R. (2000). Pegs in the Ground: Landmarks in the History of New Zealand Physical Education. *Journal of Physical Education New Zealand*, 33(2), 5-15.
- Strate, G. (2011). Music in Canada *The Canadian Encyclopedia of Music in Canada: Historical-Dominion*.
- Sullivan, E. (1967). Piaget and the School Curriculum - A Critical Appraisal. *The Ontario Institute for Studies in Education*, 2.
- Svinicki, M., & McKeachie, W. (Eds.). (2010). *McKeachie's teaching Tips: Strategies, research and theory for college and University teachers* (13th ed.). Belmont, USA: Cengage Learning.
- Tabacnick, B., & Zeichner, K. (1984). The Impact of Student Teaching Experience on the Development of teacher perspectives. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 35(28). doi: 10.1177/002248718403500608
- Taylor, S. J., & Bogdan, R. (1998). *Introduction to Qualitative Research Methods: A guidebook and resource* (3 ed.): Wiley.
- Tellis, W. (1997). Introduction to Case Study. *The Qualitative Report*, 3(2), 1-11.
- Tertiary Education Commission. (2006). The Auckland Study: An assessment of the tertiary education needs of school leavers in the Auckland region.
- The Baltimore County Public Schools. (2011). Program Rationale: Office of Dance, from <http://www.bcps.org/offices/dance/curriculum-programs.html>
- The Commonwealth Secretariat. (2004). Commonwealth Education Partnerships (pp. 374). Edinburgh: Commonwealth Conference of Education Ministers.
- The Department for Education. (2011). The School Curriculum, from [www.education.gov.uk](http://www.education.gov.uk)
- Thompson, A. G. (1984). The relationship of teachers' conceptions of mathematics and mathematics teaching to instructional practice. *Educational Studies in Mathematics*, 15, 105-127.
- Tingey, N. (1978 ). *A Record of the London School of Dalcroze Eurhythmics and its graduates at home and overseas: 1913-1973* Open Library, Dalcroze Teachers Union.
- Tobin, G. A., & Begley, C. M. (2003). Methodological rigour within a qualitative framework. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 48(4), 388 - 396.
- Truman, C., Mertens, D., & Humphries, B. (Eds.). (2000). *Arguments for an emancipatory research paradigm*. London: UCL Press.
- Truman, C., Mertens, D., & Humphries, B. (Eds.). (2000). *Research and Inequality*. London: UCL Press.
- Tschannen-Moran, M., Woolfolk-Hoy, A., & Hoy, W. (1998). Teacher Efficacy: Its Meaning and Measure. *American Educational Research Association*, 68(2), 202-248.
- Tucker, I. (2011). Peter Lovatt: Dancing can change the way you think. *The Observer*. Retrieved from <http://www.guardian.co.uk/technology/2011/jul/31/peter-lovatt-dance-problem-solving>
- Tyler, F. (1960). Teachers' personalities and teaching competencies. *The School Review*, 68(4), 429-449.
- UNESCO. (2010). *Programme of the Second World Conference on Arts Education*. Paper presented at the Programme for the Second World Conference on Arts Education, Seoul.
- United Nations Development Program. (2011). International Human Development Indicators, from <http://hdr.undp.org/en/statistics/2011>
- University of Canterbury. (2011). Courses Subjects and Qualifications. Retrieved from [www.canterbury.ac.nz](http://www.canterbury.ac.nz)
- Vallerand, R., Pellitier, L., Blais, N., & Vallieres, E. (1992). The Academic Motivation Scale: A measure of Intrinsic, Extrinsic and Amotivation in Education. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*. Retrieved from <http://epm.sagepub.com/content/52/4/1003>  
doi:10.1177/00131644920520040125
- van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching the lived experience: Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy*. The University of Western Ontario, Ontario, Canada.



## References

- Vasagar, J., & Sheperd, J. (2012). Education 2011: spending, class sizes, teachers pay and statistics compared by country, *The Guardian Datablog 2012 Guardian News and Media Limited*.
- Visser, J., & Geuze, R. (2000). Kinaesthetic acuity in adolescent boys: a longitudinal study. *Developmental Medicine & Child Neurology*, 42(02), 93-96.
- von Glaserfeld, E. (1984). Introduction to Radical Constructivism. In P. Watzlawick, I. Frese & H. H. Henschen (Eds.), *Die erfundene Wirklichkeit: Wie wissen wir, was wir zu wissen glauben?: Beiträge zum Konstruktivismus*.
- von Hofer, H. (2003). *Crime and Punishment in Denmark, Finland, Norway and Sweden: A summary*. Norway: Norway Government Statistics.
- Vygotskiĭ, L. S. (1978). *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological processes*: Harvard University Press.
- Waddington, I., Malcolm, D., & Cobb, J. (1998). Gender Stereotyping and Physical Education. *European Physical Education Review*, 4(1), 12. doi: 10.1177/1356336X9800400104
- Wahl, D., Weinert, F., & Huber, G. (1984). *Psychology for Teaching Practice*. Munich: Kosel Verlag.
- Warburton, E. (2008). Beyond Steps: The need for pedagogical knowledge in dance. *Journal of Dance Education*, 8(1), 7-12.
- Warburton, E. C. (2003a). Intelligence Past, Present and Possible. *Journal of Dance Education*, 3(1), 8-14.
- Warburton, E. C. (2003b). Intelligence past, present, and possible: The theory of multiple intelligences in dance education. *Journal of Dance Education*, 3(1), 7-15.
- Watzlawick, P. (Ed.). (1984). *The Invented Reality: How do we know what we believe we know? (Contributions to Constructivism)* (1 ed.). New York: W W Norton & Company Inc. .
- Weinstein, C. (1979). The Physical Environment of the School: A review of the research. *Review of Educational Research*, 49(4), 577-610. doi: 10.3102/0034543049004577
- Welsh, A. (Ed.). (1995). *Issues in Educational Research* (Vol. 3). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Whitehand, J. W. R. (2009). The structure of urban landscapes: Strengthening research and practice. *Urban Morphology*, 13(1), 5-27.
- Wieschiolek, H. (Ed.). (2003). *Ladies, Just Follow His Lead: Salsa, Gender and Identity*. Oxford: Berg.
- Wildy, H. (Ed.). (2003). *Meaning and Method*. London: Routledge.
- Williams, T., & Roey, S. (1996). Consistencies in the Quality of School Life. In National Centre for Education Statistics (Ed.), *Reading Literacy in an International Perspective*. Washington: U.S. Department of Education.
- Willig, C. (2001). *Introducing qualitative research in psychology: Adventures in theory and Method*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Windschitl, M. (2002). Framing constructivism in practice as the negotiation of dilemmas: An analysis of the conceptual, pedagogical and political challenges facing teachers. *Review of Educational Research*, 72(2), 131-175.
- Wolcott, H. (Ed.). (1990). *On Seeking-and Rejecting-Vailidity in Qualitative Research*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Wolf, S. (2008). The Mysteries of Creative Partnerships. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 59(89), 89-102. doi: 10.1177/0022487107310750
- Wood, T., & McCarthy, C. (2002). Understanding and preventing teacher burnout. *Eric Digest*. Retrieved from <http://www.ericdigests.org/2004-1/burnout.htm>
- Woodfield, A., & Gunby, P. (2003). The Marketization of New Zealand Schools: Assessing Fiske and Ladd. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 41(3), 863-884.
- Woods, P. (1986). *Inside Schools: Ethnography in Educational Research*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Woolner, P., Hall, E., Higgins, S., McCaughey, C., & Wall, K. (2007). A sound foundation? What we know about the impact of environments on learning and implications for building schools for the future. *Oxford Review of Education*, 33(1), 47-70.

## References

- Wubbels, T. (1992). Taking account of student teacher preconceptions. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 8*(2), 137-149.
- www.stuff.co.nz. (2011). Schools Protest National Standards 1/7/11. Retrieved 19/7/11, 2011, from www.stuff.co.nz
- Wylie, C. (1999). Ten years on: How schools view educational reform (Vol. 8). Wellington: New Zealand Council for Educational Research.
- Wyndham Primary School. (2009, 14.12.2009). Wyndham Primary School Website, from <http://www.wyndham.school.nz/>
- Wyse, D., & Spendlove, D. (2007). Partners in Creativity: Action Research and Creative Partnerships. *Education 3-13, 35*(2), 181-191. doi: 10.1080/03004270701312034
- Yee, A. H. (1969). Do cooperating teachers influence the attitudes of student teachers? *Journal of Educational Psychology, 60*(4p1), 327.
- Yin, R. (2010). Case Study Research: Design and Methods. *Complimentary Methods for Research in Education, 3*.
- Zahorik, J. A. (1987). Teachers' Collegial Interaction: An Exploratory Study. *The Elementary School Journal, 87*(4), 385-396.
- Zakkai, J. D. (1997). *Dance as a way of knowing*. New York: Stenhouse Publishers.
- Zeichner, K. M., & Grant, C. A. (1981). Biography and social structure in the socialization of student teachers: a re-examination of the pupil control ideologies of student teachers. *British Journal of Teacher Education, 7*(3), 298-314.