



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

**AN EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS OF THE PERCEIVED SKILLS AND
CHARACTERISTICS OF MANAGERIAL EFFECTIVENESS**

Carole Page

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
in the
Faculty of Commerce
University of Auckland

1997

UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND
-- NOV 1002
LIBRARY

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated with love to the memory of two very special people, my mother, the late Helen Doris Winn, and my stepfather, Richard Charles Winn. Without them, this thesis would not have been started. It was for them, posthumously, that the thesis was finished.

CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
Acknowledgements	i
List of tables	ii
List of figures	iv
List of appendices	vi
Abstract	vii
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background Context on the Concept of Managerial Effectiveness	1
1.2 Managerial Effectiveness Defined	14
1.3 Summary of Study Parameters	30
1.4 Dissertation Structure	33
1.5 References	34
2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	41
2.1 General Issues	41
2.2 Managerial Effectiveness Research	43
2.3 Managerial Effectiveness Research in New Zealand	47
2.4 Thesis Research Methods and Rationale	48
2.5 Limitations and Delimitations	62
2.6 References	65
3. PERCEPTIONS OF EFFECTIVE AND EXCEPTIONAL MANAGEMENT	71
3.1 Why Competencies?	71
3.2 Management Competencies: The International Experience	77
3.3 Concept Mapping Results and Commentary	99
3.4 Contextual Competencies	111
3.5 Comparing the International Literature and New Zealand Managers: Cause for Concern?	116
3.6 Management Competencies: Concerns and Caveats	132
3.7 Competency in New Zealand: Many Paths, No Short Cuts	137
3.8 References	144

	<u>PAGE</u>
4. GENDER ISSUES	149
4.1 Introduction	149
4.2 Literature on Sex and Gender Differences	152
4.3 Results and Discussion	165
4.4 References	178
5. TESTING THE EMERGENT CORE	186
5.1 Results and Discussion	186
5.2 References	210
6. SUMMARY AND INTEGRATION OF THE RESEARCH PROGRAMME	212
6.1 Objectives of the Research Programme	212
6.2 Phase One: Key Findings	214
6.3 Phase Two: Key Findings	214
6.4 Phase Three: Key Findings	216
6.5 Critical Issues Revealed in the Research Programme	218
6.6 A Proposed Model of Managerial Effectiveness	222
6.7 Future Research and Model Development	228
6.8 References	232
Appendices	235
Bibliography	296

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First acknowledgement must go to my supervisor, Associate Professor Marie Wilson, Graduate School of Business, University of Auckland, for her unfailing ability to guide and advise without directing thought or content. Her honest and direct feedback left no room for ambiguity about whether the thinking or work put before her was of an adequately high standard. Thanks are also due to Mike, Marie's husband, for his interest and comment on the research, and her two children, Nicole and Connor, for their patience when their house (and a bedroom) were taken over for a weekend by doctoral matters.

Sincere thanks to Penny de Valt of The New Zealand Institute of Management (Auckland), who has supported the research from beginning to end.

Deep thanks and appreciation of the support received over the doctoral research period must also go to my family and friends. My daughter Amanda, and son Justin, have never doubted that this would be the best doctoral thesis ever written. It is this blind faith in me that spurs greater effort to at least do the best that is possible. They have been patient and understanding when their mother has had limited time for them, and Amanda has performed many a boring chore to assist me. The support and encouragement given by my sister, Barbara, and brother-in-law Garry, has been a cornerstone of this thesis. To my family and friends, thanks are due for supporting me through the rigours of a doctoral research programme.

To the many friends and colleagues at Massey University, thank you so much for your support and advice. The thesis has got to be strengthened by your thoughtful comment on work in progress. In particular, acknowledgements are due to Dr Denny Meyer, who advised on statistical matters, and to Dr Robin McConnell, who suffered through the proof reading of the early draft of the thesis, finding every editing detail that was at fault.

List of Tables

	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>Section 1.</u>	
Table 1.1 A selection of management text definitions of technical skills, human skills, and conceptual skills traditionally required by managers.	3
 <u>Section 3.</u>	
Table 3.1 International citations of competences	81
Table 3.2 The MCI model	82
Table 3.3 The Dulewicz model	87
Table 3.4 The McBer model	88
Table 3.5 The Cadbury Schweppes model	90
Table 3.6 The BP model	91
Table 3.7 Competency hierarchy	120
Table 3.8 List of competencies reported as critical	121
Table 3.9 Osbaldeston and Barham's three approaches to management development	125
 <u>Section 4.</u>	
Table 4.1 Participant composition according to sex of manager, company size, management level, and years of managerial experience	164
 <u>Section 5.</u>	
Table 5.1 Respondent and assessee characteristics (n437)	188
Table 5.2 Canonical discriminant functions for both analyses	193
Table 5.3 Canonical discriminant functions evaluated at group centroids	
Table 5.4 Significant predictor variable loadings on the four functions	195
Table 5.5 Classification matrix for full sample	196
Table 5.6 Predictor variable loadings on function one using pooled within groups' correlations	198
Table 5.7 Significant function one predictor variables generated by phase one and two research	200
Table 5.8 Ratings of item importance	204

Table 5.7	Item loadings on function one using pooled within groups' correlations
Table 5.8	Comparison of discriminating variables in function one and independent ratings of item importance (full sample)

List of Figures

	<u>PAGE</u>	
<u>Section 1.</u>		
Figure 1.1	Schematic representation of the overall research construct showing the place of this research within the overall construct of managerial effectiveness	32
<u>Section 2.</u>		
Figure 2.1	Concept map prototype 1	50
Figure 2.2	Concept map prototype 2	51
Figure 2.3	A framework for categorising the skills and characteristics perceived to contribute to managerial effectiveness	55
Figure 2.4:	Schematic representation of the research process	64
<u>Section 3.</u>		
Figure 3.1	The Quinn model	84
Figure 3.2	The Personnel Decisions model	85
Figure 3.3	The MEF model	93
Figure 3.4	A comparative framework	94
Figure 3.5	The MCI model in the framework	95
Figure 3.6	The Quinn model in the framework	96
Figure 3.7	The Dulewicz model in the framework	96
Figure 3.8	The MCBer model in the framework	97
Figure 3.9	The PDI model in the framework	97
Figure 3.10	The MEF concept	98
Figure 3.11	NZIM focus group concept map	101
Figure 3.12	The NZIM focus group map in the framework	101
Figure 3.13	NZIM mail survey map	102
Figure 3.14	The NZIM mail survey map in the framework	103
Figure 3.15	Executive MBA managers concept map	103
Figure 3.16	The EMBA concept map in the framework	105
Figure 3.17	MMBA concept map	106
Figure 3.18	The MMBA concept map in the framework	107
Figure 3.19	Management educators' concept map	108
Figure 3.20	The management educators' concept map in the framework	109
Figure 3.21	'Exceptional' managers concept map	110
Figure 3.22	The exceptional manager concept map in the framework	110
<u>Section 4.</u>		
Figure 4.1	Female concept map	168
Figure 4.2	Male concept map	173

Section 5.

Figure 5.1:	Key predictive variables, and variables to emerge as most important, shown in the comparative framework	206
-------------	---	-----

Section 6.

Figure 6.1	A proposed model of effectiveness at organisation, management function, and individual/managerial levels	223
Figure 6.2	The human input underpinning managerial effectiveness	226

List of Appendices

		<u>PAGE</u>
<u>Section 2.</u>		
Appendix 2.1.	Concept Mapping instruments	235
Appendix 2.2.	New Zealand management effectiveness survey	248
<u>Section 3.</u>		
Appendix 3.1.	Concept map clusters and ratings	251
3.1.1.	NZIM focus group clusters and ratings	251
3.1.2.	NZIM survey clusters and ratings	254
3.1.3.	Executive MBA managers' clusters and ratings	257
3.1.4.	Management MBA managers' clusters and ratings	260
3.1.5.	Management educators' clusters and ratings	263
3.1.6.	Exceptional managers' clusters and ratings	266
<u>Section 4.</u>		
Appendix 4.1.	Female groups statement list and cluster ratings	268
Appendix 4.2.	Male group statement list and cluster ratings	270
<u>Section 6.</u>		
Appendix 6.1.	Innovation in management selection: The personal characteristics profile of an effective manager	272

AN EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS OF THE PERCEIVED SKILLS AND CHARACTERISTICS OF MANAGERIAL EFFECTIVENESS

ABSTRACT

The primary purpose of this research was to establish whether different perspectives on managerial effectiveness could be integrated to derive a common core of skills and characteristics. The different perspectives include management theory, strategic management and international business perspectives, and the competency-based approach to management effectiveness in the United Kingdom, the United States, and in New Zealand. The research programme used a blend of quantitative and qualitative techniques. Each phase of research is supported by a review of the international literature and empirical field work conducted in New Zealand. A research tool relatively new to management research, Concept Mapping (Trochim, 1989a, 1989b), was used to allow qualitative verbal statements to be described in terms of both quantitative and spatial relationships. A singular advantage of Concept Mapping is that collection and analysis of data is conducted without imposing research constructs at any stage, and a distillation of a core set of skills and characteristics can be derived through the reiterative process of Concept Mapping. In addition to Concept Mapping sessions with practicing managers and management educators and developers, two national surveys were conducted. In essence, the research builds a framework of the factors influencing managerial effectiveness through literature reviews and empirical work to generate a predictor variable list, then tests that list for predictive strength. The primary outcomes of the research were: 1) the identification of a set of skills and characteristics that discriminate classes of effectiveness and ineffectiveness; and 2) the provision of a conceptual framework for analysing the similarities and differences between models of managerial effectiveness.