Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage. [http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback](http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback)

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.
WORLDS IN COLLISION: THE GAY DEBATE IN
NEW ZEALAND 1960-86

Laurence David Guy

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of
Philosophy in History, The University of Auckland, 2000
ABSTRACT

This thesis examines the public debate on homosexuality in New Zealand in the period 1960-86. Its focus is primarily on male homosexuality because the central issue was the continued criminalization of male same-sex sexual acts. The thesis notes irresolvable problems of definition of homosexuality involving discussions of behaviour, orientation and identity. Nevertheless, the debate proceeded on a binary basis, that homosexuals and heterosexuals were two clearly defined groups of people. The thesis begins by noting the repression and invisibility of homosexuals in the 1960s. It then explores the origins and significance of the New Zealand Homosexual Law Reform Society and the gay liberation movement. Because of the significance of religion in regard to the debate, a chapter is devoted to major change and cleavage that occurred within the churches relating to homosexuality in the period reviewed. Finally the intense fifteen months of debate that occurred prior to decriminalization of male homosexual activity in July 1986 is studied at depth. The thesis highlights the intensity of feeling that the debate engendered. This was the result of the clash of fundamentally different worldviews and value systems. Behind the particular issue lay the question of the moral and social status of homosexuals and homosexual acts. So fundamental was this division that from both sides the very future of society seemed to be at stake. Worlds were in collision.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My grateful thanks go first to the very professional and willing help of archivists and librarians without whose assistance this thesis would not be possible. These include Vern Keller (New Zealand AIDS Foundation Library), Marcia Baker (Methodist Church of New Zealand national archives), Yvonne Wilkie (Presbyterian Church of Aotearoa New Zealand national archives), Douglas Dean (New Zealand Baptist Historical Society national archives), Lesley Utting (Carey Baptist College Library), Helen Greenwood (Kinder Library, College of St John the Evangelist), Cyril Bradwell (Salvation Army national archives) and the interloans staff of the University of Auckland Library. My particular thanks go to Phil Parkinson, curator of the Lesbian and Gay Archives of New Zealand, for the huge amount of help he gave me during my many weeks of research at LAGANZ. His knowledge and helpfulness, not only in relation to the LAGANZ archival records, but also in relation to many of the events of my thesis study, leave me with deep gratitude for his support.

I am grateful to the many participants in the debate listed in the bibliography who agreed to be interviewed by me, and to others who corresponded with or made verbal comments to me. The level of co-operation from all quarters was remarkable, given the intense polarization that occurred within the debate, especially as that debate has since assumed new forms with a polarization that persists to the present.

My thanks also go to my two supervisors Linda Bryder and Judith Bassett who have been encouraging mentors in the thesis process. They have given me unfailing support and guidance along the way.
I am grateful to Carey Baptist College for its generous provision of study leave that has enabled me to tackle this project. My thanks to my colleagues at Carey for their encouragement and support, especially to Martin Sutherland for professional advice and to Tim Bulkeley for technological assistance.

I appreciate the efforts of those who have read and commented on sections of this thesis in its earlier drafts. These include Allan Davidson, Peter Lineham, Phil Parkinson, Fran Wilde and Gavin Young.

My thanks go also to my very supportive family for their encouragement and proof-reading: my wife Shona, daughters Sharon, Heather, Melody and Julie, and son-in-law, Brian Browning.

For the privilege of undertaking this research, and for the personal enrichment it has given to my life, I want finally to say, *Deo gratias.*
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Abstract**  
**Acknowledgements**  
**List of abbreviations**  

## INTRODUCTION
- Problems of definition  
- The reasons for focusing on male homosexuality only  
- The significance of overseas influence on the New Zealand situation  
- The relationship of homosexual law reform to other reform issues  
- The central argument of this thesis  

## I ‘POOR DEVILS’: MALE HOMOSEXUALS IN NEW ZEALAND IN THE 1960s
- The 1961 Crimes Act  
- Conformity in New Zealand society in the early 1960s  
- Collectivity in New Zealand society in the early 1960s  
- The continuing influence of Christian ethics in the early 1960s  
- Sexual values in New Zealand society in the early 1960s  
- Medical understandings of homosexuality in the early 1960s  
- Understandings of homosexuality in the 1960s  
- The ‘cure’ of homosexuals  

- Factors for change in the early 1960s: the Kinsey report  
- Factors for change in the early 1960s: anthropological studies  
- Factors for change in the early 1960s: the Wolfenden report  
- Factors for change in the early 1960s: the Hart-Devlin debate  
- An academic platform for change  
- The formation of the New Zealand Homosexual Law Reform Society in 1967
Conservative support for NZHLRS
Conservative and radical streams within NZHLRS
Resignation of conservative vice-presidents
The climate in which NZHLRS initially operated
The caution of the NZHLRS petition in 1968
The beginnings of a shift in public opinion
The Venn Young private member’s bill, 1974-5
The significance of the New Zealand Homosexual Law Reform Society

III ‘GAY IS PROUD’: THE ADVENT AND INFLUENCE OF GAY
LIBERATION MOVEMENTS, 1972-84
The origins of gay liberation internationally
The advent of gay liberation in New Zealand
The radical and fragile nature of the early gay liberation movement
The establishment of the National Gay Rights Coalition to provide co-
ordination
Tensions between gay liberation and homosexual law reform
approaches
Gay liberation endeavours to change the direction of NZHLRS, 1975-7
Continuing tensions between gay liberation and NZHLRS
Fracas over the Freer initiatives, 1979-80
Equality endeavours 1980-3
Crunch time and change time for NZHLRS

IV BETWEEN GOD AND THE DEVIL: CLEAVAGE IN THE
CHURCHES OVER HOMOSEXUAL LAW REFORM
Significance of the churches in the debate over male homosexuality
Factors for change in church perspectives in the 1960s
The issue of sexual ethics
Methodist shift in relation to sexuality and homosexuality
Presbyterian change and clash in relation to decriminalization
Issues of the authority and use of scripture
Clarifying the nature of fundamentalist and conservative Christianity
The fundamentalist Christian core of anti-reform opposition 242
Fundamentalist apocalyptic dualism 245
Internal difficulties of the Baptist denomination with regard to law reform 248
The dilemma of the Catholic Church 254
Conclusion 260

V FIGHTING ALL THE WAY: THE COURSE OF THE HOMOSEXUAL LAW REFORM LEGISLATION, 1985-6 262
Introduction 262
Preparing for the reform campaign 263
Organized conservative opposition to the reform bill 271
Mass mobilization 278
The presentation of the Hay-Tait petition to parliament 292
Further political progress of the reform bill 300

VI THE WAR OF WORDS: THE RHETORIC OF DEBATE, 1985-6 309
The Truth Examiner material 310
The CCC Social Effects of Homosexuality material 319
Rebuttal by the Gay Task Force 337
Submissions to the Justice and Law Reform Committee in 1985 with regard to the Homosexual Law Reform bill 349
The debate in parliament, 1985-6 359

CONCLUSION 375

BIBLIOGRAPHY 378
Archives 378
Private collections 379
Official documents 379
Unpublished sources 380
Manuscripts 380
Theses, dissertations and research essays 381
Audio tapes 384
Notes of telephone conversations with Laurie Guy 385
Written communications to Laurie Guy 386
Published sources 386
Newspapers 386
Electronic sources 387
Magazines, pamphlets and ephemera 387
Fathers of the church 393
Books and academic articles 393
# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AJHR</td>
<td>Appendices to the Journals of the House of Representatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APA</td>
<td>American Psychiatric Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCC</td>
<td>Coalition of Concerned Citizens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHE</td>
<td>Campaign for Homosexual Equality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GTF</td>
<td>Gay Task Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HLRB</td>
<td>Homosexual Law Reform Bill, 1985-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUG</td>
<td>Heterosexuals Unafraid of Gays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGA</td>
<td>International Gay Association (later known as the International Lesbian and Gay Association)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISIS</td>
<td>Institute for the Scientific Study of Sexuality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAGANZ</td>
<td>Lesbian and Gay Archives of New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MP</td>
<td>Member of Parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCC</td>
<td>National Council of Churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGRC</td>
<td>National Gay Rights Coalition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZAF</td>
<td>New Zealand AIDS Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZHLRS</td>
<td>New Zealand Homosexual Law Reform Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZJH</td>
<td>New Zealand Journal of History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZLJ</td>
<td>New Zealand Law Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZMedJ</td>
<td>New Zealand Medical Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZPD</td>
<td>New Zealand Parliamentary Debates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZPL</td>
<td>New Zealand Parliamentary Library</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZUSA</td>
<td>New Zealand University Students' Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPCS</td>
<td>Society for Promotion of Community Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STD</td>
<td>Sexually Transmitted Disease(s)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>