



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

**WORLDS IN COLLISION: THE GAY DEBATE IN
NEW ZEALAND 1960-86**

Laurence David Guy

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of
Philosophy in History, The University of Auckland, 2000

ABSTRACT

This thesis examines the public debate on homosexuality in New Zealand in the period 1960-86. Its focus is primarily on male homosexuality because the central issue was the continued criminalization of male same-sex sexual acts. The thesis notes irresolvable problems of definition of homosexuality involving discussions of behaviour, orientation and identity. Nevertheless, the debate proceeded on a binary basis, that homosexuals and heterosexuals were two clearly defined groups of people. The thesis begins by noting the repression and invisibility of homosexuals in the 1960s. It then explores the origins and significance of the New Zealand Homosexual Law Reform Society and the gay liberation movement. Because of the significance of religion in regard to the debate, a chapter is devoted to major change and cleavage that occurred within the churches relating to homosexuality in the period reviewed. Finally the intense fifteen months of debate that occurred prior to decriminalization of male homosexual activity in July 1986 is studied at depth. The thesis highlights the intensity of feeling that the debate engendered. This was the result of the clash of fundamentally different worldviews and value systems. Behind the particular issue lay the question of the moral and social status of homosexuals and homosexual acts. So fundamental was this division that from both sides the very future of society seemed to be at stake. Worlds were in collision.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My grateful thanks go first to the very professional and willing help of archivists and librarians without whose assistance this thesis would not be possible. These include Vern Keller (New Zealand AIDS Foundation Library), Marcia Baker (Methodist Church of New Zealand national archives), Yvonne Wilkie (Presbyterian Church of Aotearoa New Zealand national archives), Douglas Dean (New Zealand Baptist Historical Society national archives), Lesley Utting (Carey Baptist College Library), Helen Greenwood (Kinder Library, College of St John the Evangelist), Cyril Bradwell (Salvation Army national archives) and the interloans staff of the University of Auckland Library. My particular thanks go to Phil Parkinson, curator of the Lesbian and Gay Archives of New Zealand, for the huge amount of help he gave me during my many weeks of research at LAGANZ. His knowledge and helpfulness, not only in relation to the LAGANZ archival records, but also in relation to many of the events of my thesis study, leave me with deep gratitude for his support.

I am grateful to the many participants in the debate listed in the bibliography who agreed to be interviewed by me, and to others who corresponded with or made verbal comments to me. The level of co-operation from all quarters was remarkable, given the intense polarization that occurred within the debate, especially as that debate has since assumed new forms with a polarization that persists to the present.

My thanks also go to my two supervisors Linda Bryder and Judith Bassett who have been encouraging mentors in the thesis process. They have given me unfailing support and guidance along the way.

I am grateful to Carey Baptist College for its generous provision of study leave that has enabled me to tackle this project. My thanks to my colleagues at Carey for their encouragement and support, especially to Martin Sutherland for professional advice and to Tim Bulkeley for technological assistance.

I appreciate the efforts of those who have read and commented on sections of this thesis in its earlier drafts. These include Allan Davidson, Peter Lineham, Phil Parkinson, Fran Wilde and Gavin Young.

My thanks go also to my very supportive family for their encouragement and proof-reading: my wife Shona, daughters Sharon, Heather, Melody and Julie, and son-in-law, Brian Browning.

For the privilege of undertaking this research, and for the personal enrichment it has given to my life, I want finally to say, *Deo gratias*.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Abstract</i>	ii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	iii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	ix
INTRODUCTION	1
Problems of definition	3
The reasons for focusing on male homosexuality only	14
The significance of overseas influence on the New Zealand situation	19
The relationship of homosexual law reform to other reform issues	22
The central argument of this thesis	26
I 'POOR DEVILS': MALE HOMOSEXUALS IN NEW ZEALAND IN THE 1960s	34
The 1961 Crimes Act	34
Conformity in New Zealand society in the early 1960s	36
Collectivity in New Zealand society in the early 1960s	41
The continuing influence of Christian ethics in the early 1960s	47
Sexual values in New Zealand society in the early 1960s	56
Medical understandings of homosexuality in the early 1960s	73
Understandings of homosexuality in the 1960s	81
The 'cure' of homosexuals	89
II PROVIDING THE HOMOSEXUAL WITH 'DECENT OBSCURITY': NEW ZEALAND HOMOSEXUAL LAW REFORM SOCIETY ENDEAVOUR, 1967 – 1975	95
Factors for change in the early 1960s: the Kinsey report	95
Factors for change in the early 1960s: anthropological studies	100
Factors for change in the early 1960s: the Wolfenden report	102
Factors for change in the early 1960s: the Hart-Devlin debate	106
An academic platform for change	109
The formation of the New Zealand Homosexual Law Reform Society in 1967	110

Conservative support for NZHLRS	116
Conservative and radical streams within NZHLRS	119
Resignation of conservative vice-presidents	123
The climate in which NZHLRS initially operated	127
The caution of the NZHLRS petition in 1968	132
The beginnings of a shift in public opinion	137
The Venn Young private member's bill, 1974-5	138
The significance of the New Zealand Homosexual Law Reform Society	147
III 'GAY IS PROUD': THE ADVENT AND INFLUENCE OF GAY LIBERATION MOVEMENTS, 1972-84	150
The origins of gay liberation internationally	151
The advent of gay liberation in New Zealand	160
The radical and fragile nature of the early gay liberation movement	162
The establishment of the National Gay Rights Coalition to provide co-ordination	171
Tensions between gay liberation and homosexual law reform approaches	174
Gay liberation endeavours to change the direction of NZHLRS, 1975-7	176
Continuing tensions between gay liberation and NZHLRS	180
Fracas over the Freer initiatives, 1979-80	184
Equality endeavours 1980-3	189
Crunch time and change time for NZHLRS	190
IV BETWEEN GOD AND THE DEVIL: CLEAVAGE IN THE CHURCHES OVER HOMOSEXUAL LAW REFORM	200
Significance of the churches in the debate over male homosexuality	201
Factors for change in church perspectives in the 1960s	207
The issue of sexual ethics	218
Methodist shift in relation to sexuality and homosexuality	223
Presbyterian change and clash in relation to decriminalization	226
Issues of the authority and use of scripture	232
Clarifying the nature of fundamentalist and conservative Christianity	239

The fundamentalist Christian core of anti-reform opposition	242
Fundamentalist apocalyptic dualism	245
Internal difficulties of the Baptist denomination with regard to law reform	248
The dilemma of the Catholic Church	254
Conclusion	260
V FIGHTING ALL THE WAY: THE COURSE OF THE HOMOSEXUAL LAW REFORM LEGISLATION, 1985-6	262
Introduction	262
Preparing for the reform campaign	263
Organized conservative opposition to the reform bill	271
Mass mobilization	278
The presentation of the Hay-Tait petition to parliament	292
Further political progress of the reform bill	300
VI THE WAR OF WORDS: THE RHETORIC OF DEBATE, 1985-6	309
The <i>Truth Examiner</i> material	310
The CCC <i>Social Effects of Homosexuality</i> material	319
Rebuttal by the Gay Task Force	337
Submissions to the Justice and Law Reform Committee in 1985 with regard to the Homosexual Law Reform bill	349
The debate in parliament, 1985-6	359
CONCLUSION	375
BIBLIOGRAPHY	378
Archives	378
Private collections	379
Official documents	379
Unpublished sources	380
Manuscripts	380
Theses, dissertations and research essays	381

Audio tapes	384
Notes of telephone conversations with Laurie Guy	385
Written communications to Laurie Guy	386
Published sources	386
Newspapers	386
Electronic sources	387
Magazines, pamphlets and ephemera	387
Fathers of the church	393
Books and academic articles	393

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AJHR	Appendices to the Journals of the House of Representatives
APA	American Psychiatric Association
CCC	Coalition of Concerned Citizens
CHE	Campaign for Homosexual Equality
GTF	Gay Task Force
HLRB	Homosexual Law Reform Bill, 1985-6
HUG	Heterosexuals Unafraid of Gays
IGA	International Gay Association (later known as the International Lesbian and Gay Association)
ISIS	Institute for the Scientific Study of Sexuality
LAGANZ	Lesbian and Gay Archives of New Zealand
MP	Member of Parliament
NCC	National Council of Churches
NGRC	National Gay Rights Coalition
NZAF	New Zealand AIDS Foundation
NZHLRS	New Zealand Homosexual Law Reform Society
NZJH	New Zealand Journal of History
NZLJ	New Zealand Law Journal
NZMedJ	New Zealand Medical Journal
NZPD	New Zealand Parliamentary Debates
NZPL	New Zealand Parliamentary Library
NZUSA	New Zealand University Students' Association
SPCS	Society for Promotion of Community Standards
STD	Sexually Transmitted Disease(s)