

# RESEARCHSPACE@AUCKLAND

#### http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz

#### ResearchSpace@Auckland

#### **Copyright Statement**

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage. <a href="http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback">http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback</a>

#### General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

# MIGRATION AND SETTLEMENT IN INDIAN, KOREAN AND CHINESE IMMIGRANT COMMUNITIES IN AUCKLAND: A PERSPECTIVE FROM THE POLITICAL ECOLOGY OF HEALTH

Anneka Anderson

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Anthropology, The University of Auckland, 2007.

#### **ABSTRACT**

This research used tuberculosis (TB) as a lens to elucidate how migration, settlement, local agency and support networks influence migrants' health in New Zealand. The study also examined specific characteristics of TB such as delays in diagnosis and the stigma attached to the disease to gain a broader understanding of TB experience for migrants in New Zealand. The research addressed these aims through the analytical framework of political ecology and incorporation of interviews, participant observation and media analysis. Participants in the research included immigrants from Mainland China, South Korea, and India, and New Zealand health care professionals.

The study found that immigration policies, social discrimination and isolation have created structural inequalities between dominant host populations and Asian migrants in New Zealand. These inequalities compounded settlement problems such as language difficulties and limited employment opportunities, resulting in low income levels and perceived stress for Indian, Korean and Chinese people, which has affected their health and well being.

Transnational policies and experiences of health care systems in immigrants' countries of origin and in New Zealand strongly influenced health seeking behaviour of migrants, along with structural barriers such as lack of Asian health care professionals and interpreting services. Local cultural and biological factors including health cultures and physical symptoms also affected these practices. In relation to TB, structural processes along with clinic doctor-patient relationships and social stigmas created barriers to diagnosis and treatment. Factors that facilitated access to health care in general, and TB diagnosis and treatment in particular, included the use of support networks, particularly local General Practitioners from countries of origin, and Public Health Nurses, along with flexible TB treatment programmes.

This study shows that the incidence and experience of TB is shaped by migration and settlement processes. It also builds upon other medical anthropological studies that have employed political ecology by demonstrating its usefulness in application to developed as well as developing countries. In addition, the study contributes to the growing area of Asian migration research in New Zealand, illustrating that migration and settlement processes are complex and need to be understood as multidimensional, thus demonstrating advantages in approaching them from a political ecological framework.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First and foremost, I would like to thank all the people who participated in this research. Without you this thesis would not exist. In addition, I would like to acknowledge the courage of my TB participants in allowing me to interview them and share in many aspects of their domestic lives. Along with all the individuals who helped facilitate this study I would also like to thank several organisations involved including Auckland Regional Public Health Services and associated Public Health Nurses, The Asian Network Incorporated, The Auckland Institute of Studies, St Helens, and The Auckland Chinese Medical Association.

I also could not have completed this study without my two PhD supervisors, Dr Judith Littleton and Associate-Professor Julie Park. Judith has been a mentor, and inspiration to me throughout my graduate years and her guidance, sense of humour and ongoing support will always be greatly appreciated. Julie attempted the impossible by taking a girl who studied primates and guiding her with wisdom, experience and neverending patience into the world of ethnography and medical anthropology. For this I will always be grateful.

In addition to my supervisors, I also wish to thank my three cultural advisors: Janet Chen, Dr Catherine Hong and Dr Lingappa Kalburgi. Despite their busy schedules they all made time to help me in many areas of the research providing me with guidance, support and valued friendships.

To my proof readers, Lynne McDonald and Debbie Dunsford, thank you for your time and skills. I know it is a painful job, particularly when you are also busy students.

Many people from the Department of Anthropology, University of Auckland, aided this study. Dr Bruce Floyd and Bon Giu Koo donated their time and linguistic skills in translation work for me. I was also lucky enough to be part of a PhD writing group primarily facilitated by Dr Christine Dureau, where I was able to develop my writing skills and gain confidence in my abilities due to helpful feedback from all who participated (Christine D, Christine H, Sally, Tony, Bon Gui, Michelle, Sarah, Lynne, Marama, Micha, Hadas and Darcy). Thanks also to Peter Quin for his illustration skills. I

would also like to thank Alice Storey, Dr Lisa Matisoo-Smith and Janette Rameka for their ongoing support and valued friendships in every aspect of my graduate experience.

Along with members of the Anthropology Department, I also wish to thank members of the Political Ecology of TB Team (Julie, Judith, Robin, Linda, Heather, Deanna, Alison, Roannie, Moana, Catherine, Jody, Debbie, Ron, Craig and Jill) for providing a stimulating and supportive working environment.

I would also like to acknowledge and thank the Health Research Council and the University of Auckland for their financial contributions to this research.

On a more personal note, I also wish to thank my family and friends for their roles in this thesis. Mum and Dad (aka Gwen and Peter), I could not have done this without your emotional support, encouragement and financial contribution. Mum, thanks for letting me utilise your vast medical knowledge and experience. Dad, a big thanks for accompanying me in my fieldwork and for your photography skills.

To my husband Mike, thanks for your patience, support, photography skills and taking time out to listen to my various presentations and research gripes. In addition, thanks to my furry and feathered whanau (Speedy, Datsun, Brenna, Toby, Coby and Maisy) for your unconditional love and humorous antics.

Last but not least, to my friends: Alice, Dana, Janette, Katie, Katherine, Paul, Andrew, Paula and Tania. Thanks for being everything I needed whenever I needed it, whether it was a diagram to be edited or a shoulder to cry on.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
LIST OF TABLES.	ix
LIST OF FIGURES.	X
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.	xi
EIST OF TIDDICE VITTIONS	AI
CHAPTED ONE INTRODUCTION DACKED ON DANK THEODETICAL	
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION, BACKGROUND AND THEORETICAL	
OVERVIEW	1
Aims	1
Tuberculosis in global and local contexts	3
Using the term 'Asian'	7
Political ecology	8
Political ecology and globalisation	11
Habitus	14
Immigration and tuberculosis screening	15
Transnationalism	16
Asian migration to New Zealand and immigration policies	17
Settlement policies	21
Settlement experiences	23
Discrimination	23
Language difficulties	24
Employment	25
Migration, stress and tuberculosis	25
Health systems.	27
India, China and Korea.	27
New Zealand	29
Health cultures.	30
	31
Stigma	32
Social networks.	
Summary of thesis chapters	33
CHAPTER TWO: PARTICIPANTS AND METHODS	35
Setting the scene	35
Participants	37
Methods	39
Participant observation	39
Interviews	45
Data analysis of participant observation and interviews	48
Media analysis	49
Ethics	50

CHAPTER THREE: PARTICIPANTS AND SOCIAL CONTEXTS	
Participants	
Immigration history	
Socioeconomic status	
Residential dwellings	
June	
Meeta	
Vishal	
Drezan	
Beginning the migration journey: Why come to New Zealand?	
Migration process	
Settlement in New Zealand	
Language barriers	
Employment	
Racial discrimination: Othering of Indian, Korean and Chinese	
migrants	
Physical and cultural environments	
Isolation and social networks	
Conclusion	
•	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURSHealth and illness	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURSHealth and illnessFreedom from illness, function and normalityHolistic health	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS.  Health and illness.  Freedom from illness, function and normality.  Holistic health.  Healthy habits: Diet.  Exercise.  Body weight.	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS  Health and illness  Freedom from illness, function and normality  Holistic health  Healthy habits: Diet  Exercise  Body weight  Stress	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS  Health and illness Freedom from illness, function and normality Holistic health Healthy habits: Diet Exercise Body weight Stress Religion	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS.  Health and illness.  Freedom from illness, function and normality.  Holistic health.  Healthy habits: Diet.  Exercise.  Body weight.  Stress.  Religion.  Health seeking behaviour and practices.	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS  Health and illness  Freedom from illness, function and normality  Holistic health  Healthy habits: Diet  Exercise  Body weight  Stress  Religion  Health seeking behaviour and practices  Seeking local GPs from countries of origin	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS  Health and illness Freedom from illness, function and normality Holistic health Healthy habits: Diet Exercise Body weight Stress Religion Health seeking behaviour and practices Seeking local GPs from countries of origin Alternative healers	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS  Health and illness Freedom from illness, function and normality Holistic health Healthy habits: Diet Exercise Body weight Stress Religion Health seeking behaviour and practices Seeking local GPs from countries of origin Alternative healers New Zealand's primary health care sector	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS  Health and illness  Freedom from illness, function and normality  Holistic health  Healthy habits: Diet  Exercise  Body weight  Stress  Religion  Health seeking behaviour and practices  Seeking local GPs from countries of origin  Alternative healers  New Zealand's primary health care sector  Resting, waiting and taking medicine	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS  Health and illness Freedom from illness, function and normality Holistic health Healthy habits: Diet Exercise Body weight Stress Religion Health seeking behaviour and practices Seeking local GPs from countries of origin Alternative healers New Zealand's primary health care sector Resting, waiting and taking medicine Hospital experiences	
Freedom from illness, function and normality Holistic health Healthy habits: Diet Exercise Body weight Stress Religion Health seeking behaviour and practices Seeking local GPs from countries of origin Alternative healers New Zealand's primary health care sector. Resting, waiting and taking medicine Hospital experiences Alex	
Health and illness. Freedom from illness, function and normality. Holistic health. Healthy habits: Diet. Exercise. Body weight. Stress. Religion. Health seeking behaviour and practices. Seeking local GPs from countries of origin. Alternative healers. New Zealand's primary health care sector. Resting, waiting and taking medicine. Hospital experiences. Alex. May.	
SEEKING BEHAVIOURS  Health and illness Freedom from illness, function and normality Holistic health Healthy habits: Diet Exercise Body weight Stress Religion Health seeking behaviour and practices Seeking local GPs from countries of origin Alternative healers New Zealand's primary health care sector Resting, waiting and taking medicine Hospital experiences Alex	

CHAPTER FIVE: SOCIAL STIGMA AND TUBERCULOSIS	121
Stigma	121
Tuberculosis: A disease of others	123
Tuberculosis: A disease of contagion and death	128
Blemishes of individual character	132
Gendered stigma	134
Coping with stigma, information management	135
Social networks	138
Conclusion	140
CHAPTER SIX: THE TUBERCULOSIS JOURNEY, FROM SYMPTOMS TO	
CURE	141
Tuberculosis life stories	142
June	142
Meeta	143
Vishal	144
Drezan	145
Symptoms and health seeking behaviour	145
Diagnosis	148
Diagnosis in Korea	151
Reactions to diagnosis and understandings of tuberculosis	153
Contact tracing	155
Tuberculosis treatment	157
Discipline and surveillance	158
Barriers and facilitators of treatment	160
Public Health Nurses	163
Hospital experiences	167
Impacts of tuberculosis	173
Life after tuberculosis	175
Conclusion.	177
CHAPTER SEVEN: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION	179
Overview	179
Migration status and inequality	182
Policy	183
Discrimination and stigma	183
Access and barriers to health care	185
Tuberculosis screening	186
	187
Support networks	188
Conclusion	189
EDIL OCUE	102
Participants: Pros and cons of working with multiple groups	192 192
LALICIDANIS. LIUS ANG CONSTITUTE WOLKING WHILL HUHUDIG STOUDS	172

What would I have done differently?	193
Moving on, where to from here?	193
Peoples' lives after participation	194
Conclusion	195
APPENDICES	196
Appendix 1: Interview questions for participants with TB	196
Appendix 2: Interview questions for PHNs	198
Appendix 3: Interview questions for GPs	199
Appendix 4: Participation information sheet	200
Appendix 5: Participant consent form	203
LIST OF REFERENCES	205

.

## LIST OF TABLES

1.1	Age-standardised incidence of TB by ethnicity in New Zealand 2000-	
	2004	4
1.2	Incidence of TB by country of birth in New Zealand 2000-2004	5
1.3	Time between arrival in host country and diagnosis of TB	6
1.4	Seven largest Asian ethnic groups in New Zealand 2001-2006	21
2.1	Description of participants interviewed in the study (using pseudonyms)	38
3.1	Participants' paid and un-paid occupations in New Zealand	68
3.2	Percentage of unemployment by ethnicity in Auckland, New Zealand	70
3.3	Percentage of people aged 15 years and over with a declared personal income	
	of \$30,000 or more by ethnic group	71
5.1	TB and migration themes from <i>The New Zealand Herald</i> 1999-2006	124

## LIST OF FIGURES

1.1	Using TB as a lens to investigate how immigration, settlement and social	
	networks influence migrants' health in New Zealand	3
2.1	Community TB presentation to Manukau Indian Association, 2005	40
2.2	Evening meal provided after a TANI meeting, Auckland, 2007	42
2.3	Indian GP in North Shore clinic, 2007.	43
2.4	North Shore GP clinic, 2007	43
4.1	Chinese Medical Centre, Auckland, North Shore, 2007	104
4.2	Chinese Healing Centre, Auckland, North Shore, 2007	105
4.3	White Cross Accident and Medical Clinic, Central Auckland, 2007	109
4.4	Auckland PHO GP Clinic (operated out of a converted dwelling), 2007	110
7.1	Interrelationships between immigration, settlement, social networks and	
	health for Indian, Korean and Chinese migrants in Auckland, New	
	Zealand	181

#### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

A and E Clinic Accident and Emergency Clinic

ACMA Auckland Chinese Medical Association

AIS Auckland Institute of Studies

ARPHS Auckland Regional Public Health Services

BMI Body mass index
DHB District Health Board

DOTS Directly Observed Therapy-Short Course

EM Explanatory model GP General Practitioner

HPA Hypothalamic-anterior pituitary-adrenal cortex system

LTBI Latent tuberculosis infection
NZIS New Zealand Immigration Service
NZQA New Zealand Qualification Authority

PHN Public Health Nurse

PHO Primary Health Organisation

SAM Sympathetic-adrenal medullary system

SAT Self Administered Treatment TANI The Asian Network Incorporated

TB Tuberculosis

TBD Tuberculosis disease

TCM Traditional Chinese Medicine
TKM Traditional Korean Medicine
WHO The World Health Organisation