



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

### *ResearchSpace@Auckland*

#### **Copyright Statement**

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

#### **General copyright and disclaimer**

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

**In A Different Voice:  
A Case Study of Marianne and Jane Williams,  
Missionary Educators in Northern New Zealand,  
1823-1835.**

A Thesis  
submitted in fulfillment  
of the requirements for the Degree  
of  
Doctor of Philosophy  
at  
The University of Auckland

**TANYA G FITZGERALD**

The University of Auckland  
1995

**CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP**

I certify that the thesis entitled

**In A Different Voice:  
A Case Study of Marianne and Jane Williams, Missionary  
Educators in Northern New Zealand, 1823-1835.**

And submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy is the result of my own work, except where otherwise acknowledged. This thesis has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other University or learning institution.

Signed:

## ABSTRACT

This thesis is a case study that examines the educative activities of two Church Missionary Society (CMS) women, Marianne Coldham Williams and her sister-in-law Jane Nelson Williams, during the period 1823-1835.

This study examines the role and status of these two missionary women in the early CMS mission station at Paihia in northern New Zealand. Marianne and Jane Williams were missionary educators whose primary task was to establish schools for local Maori pupils and resident missionary pupils. These first mission schools were established according to a perceived hierarchy of "need." Consequently, the first schools, established in 1823 were for Nga Puhi women and girls followed by a school for the missionary daughters in 1826. A school for Nga Puhi men and boys was not established until 1827 and a school for the missionary sons was delayed until 1828.

Through the re-formation of Maori women as Christian women, Maori society was to replicate the "pleasantries" of (Pakeha) "Christian society." The schoolroom, not the pulpit became the central site to instigate changes in Maori society and the CMS initially charged Marianne and Jane Williams with the responsibility for this task.

One of the strategies developed by Marianne and Jane Williams to survive in a frontier society was to form a network based on their sister-

hood. Through the exchanging of letters between the two women in New Zealand and their “sisters” in England, a reciprocal friendship was created that provided Marianne and Jane with the support they sought. These letters and diaries provide valuable autobiographical accounts of the daily lives and missionary activities of Marianne and Jane.

This study, therefore, presents a challenge to prevailing historical narratives that position men at the centre of missionary activities. Missionary policy documents and manuscript material written by early nineteenth century missionary women and men reveal that in New Zealand women played a critical role in the “Christianising” and “civilising” policies and practices. In placing women at the centre of historical inquiry and as historical agents, this study re-presents the historical narrative **in a different voice.**

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The production of this study has been possible through the support and advice of a number of people.

First, I wholeheartedly thank Dr. Kay Morris Matthews at The University of Auckland who has supervised and supported the research and writing of this thesis. Kay has offered clear and constructive comments and her thoughtful and challenging questions, her thoroughness and efficiency have contributed to my motivation and perseverance. At times it has been difficult and lonely to sustain research and writing at this level and Kay's continued interest and high level of support has nurtured and encouraged me. For all your efforts, friendship and tireless support, my thanks.

Professor Ian McLaren at the University of Waikato, Professor Roger Dale and Dr Alison Jones at The University of Auckland willingly provided the comments and editorial assistance with the final draft. My thanks to you all for your helpfulness, concern and thoroughness of your reading.

In the beginning stages, Dr. Dianne Snow at the University of Technology (Sydney) provided me with the support and guidance to shape and define this study. My thanks to you for your assistance and willingness to support my work.

My thanks to the Librarians and Archivists at the various Libraries and Institutions visited who willingly answered numerous questions and aided me in my search for the necessary manuscript material. The patience and forbearance of the staff with whom I had contact is appreciated.

During this research, I have been absent from Auckland and a number of friends provided me with accommodation. To Sylvia and John Snow (Australia), Dr. Dianne Snow (Australia) and Jo and Maurice McLaren (Dunedin), my thanks for your hospitality.

My thanks to the Academic staff in the Departments of Education and History at The University of Auckland who were willing to answer questions and suggest possibilities for further work beyond this study. To the General Staff in these two Departments, my thanks for your help with various aspects of the word processing, layout and reproduction of this thesis. To my colleagues at CLEAR Communications, my thanks also for your support and friendship and your interest in the progress of this study.

To my friends and family members my thanks for your interest and continued support. In particular I wish to acknowledge the unfailing faith of my mother, Clare Holmes-Kinsella. To you I dedicate this work as my thanks for your efforts and your unique ability to always be there for me. Over the years you have instinctively known when I needed your support and guidance and for this I thank you.

Finally, to Ross - my thanks for your love and unqualified support, your gentle words of wisdom and your belief in me.

I hope that this thesis is a true reflection of the care, support, encouragement and guidance of you all.



**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**

The following Abbreviations have been used:

AIM	Auckland Institute and Museum Library
AJCP	Australian Joint Copying Project
APL	Auckland Public Library
ARANZ	Archives and Records Association of New Zealand
ATL	Alexander Turnbull Library
AU	The University of Auckland Library
CMS	Church Missionary Society
Coll.	Collection

DPhil	Doctor of Philosophy
DU	Hocken Library, University of Otago
F&J	Flotsam & Jetsam
KL	Kinder Library, The College of St John the Evangelist, Auckland
MA	Master of Arts
ML	Mitchell Library, State Library of New South Wales
MS/Mss	Manuscript
MSocSci	Master of Social Science
n.d	no date
No.	Number
NZ	New Zealand

NZJH	New Zealand Journal of History
P./pp.	Page(s)
Pam.	Pamphlet
PhD	Doctor of Philosophy
qMS	Typescript manuscript material
Var	Various
Vol.	Volume
WMS	Wesleyan Missionary Society

Note: All quotations are taken directly from the cited manuscript material. The syntax and spelling are as appears in the original.

## GLOSSARY OF TERMS

Note: This glossary has been compiled in accordance with the one supplied by Linda Tuhiwai Smith at the end of her chapter 'Maori Women: Discourses, Projects and Mana Wahine' in Middleton, Sue & Jones, (eds), Alison, *Women and Education in Aotearoa 2*, Bridget Williams Books, Wellington, 1992, p. 51.

Iwi	Tribe
Kainga	Village
Kawa	Protocol, custom
Mana	Power, prestige, reputation
Nga Puhi	Northern iwi
Noa	Unrestricted
Tangata Whenua	People of the land; people from that place
Tapu	Restricted

Tikanga	Customs, traditions
Tipuna	Ancestors, grandparents
Wahine	Women
Waiata	Songs
Whakapapa	Genealogical links
Whanau	Extended family

<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>
--------------------------

<i><b>TITLE PAGE</b></i>	
<i><b>CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP</b></i> _____	ii
<i><b>ABSTRACT</b></i> _____	iii
<i><b>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</b></i> _____	v
<i><b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b></i> _____	viii
<i><b>GLOSSARY OF TERMS</b></i> _____	xi
 Chapter One:	
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> _____	1
The CMS Mission Station at Paihia 1814-1835 _____	7
Literature - Missionary Women in New Zealand _____	24
Literature - Missionary Women in Hawaii _____	34
Framework of My Case Study _____	39
Conclusion _____	45
 Chapter Two:	
<b>IN SEARCH OF HER PAST</b> _____	47
Women's History _____	47
Feminist History _____	53
Gender History _____	61
Feminist Educational History _____	69
Conclusion _____	72

## Chapter Three:

<b>THE METHODOLOGICAL IMPLICATIONS OF RESEARCHING AND WRITING FEMINIST EDUCATIONAL HISTORY</b>	73
Is There a Distinctive Feminist Methodology?	73
Feminist Methodology	75
Chronologies and Methodologies	79
The Beginning Stages of the Research Process	85
Grounded Theory	86
Data Collection	88
Data Collection Process	96
The Writing Phase	100
Conclusion	100

## Chapter Four:

<b>UNFAMILIAR VOICES</b>	101
Initial Difficulties	101
The Storage and Retrieval of Archival Material	102
The Preservation of Women's Archival Material	109
Women's Letters and Diaries as Historical Sources	111
Women's Space/Women's Sphere: The Creation of Missionary Women's Networks	114
Conclusion	118

## Chapter Five:

<b>BONDS OF SISTER-HOOD</b>	120
The Nature of Women's Autobiography	120
Towards a Theory of Women's Letters and Diaries as Autobiography	123
Women's Autobiography as Cultural Authority	127
Towards a Definition of "women's culture"	129
Conclusion	139

## Chapter Six:

<b>A DUTY OF EQUAL IMPORTANCE</b>	140
CMS Policy	140
The Role of Marianne and Jane Williams as Missionary Women and Missionary Educators	148
Women as CMS Missionaries	151
Conclusion	156

## Chapter Seven:

<b>TO UNITE THEIR STRENGTH WITH OURS</b>	157
Missionary Women as Wives	158
The Mission Family	165
Conclusion	179



## Chapter Eight:

<b>THE EARLY PAIHIA MISSION SCHOOLS</b>	181
Missionary Women as Educators	181
The Nature of Schooling	188
The Schooling of Nga Puhi Women and Girls	192
The Schooling of Missionary Daughters	196
Conclusion	201

## Chapter Nine:

<b>MISSIONARY WOMEN AND NGA PUHI WOMEN</b>	202
The Relationship between Missionary Women and Nga Puhi Women	203
Nga Puhi Women's Resistance	212
The Relationship between Missionary Children and Nga Puhi Children	216
Conclusion	218
<b>CONCLUSION</b>	220
Suggestions for Further Research	227
Concluding Note	228

**APPENDICES****Appendix A** \_\_\_\_\_ 230

*Three Accounts of the Birth of Henry Williams junior*

**Appendix B** \_\_\_\_\_ 232

*Copy of two letters to show the difficulties presented in gaining accurate archival information. These letters have been edited by Algar Williams (descendant)*

**Appendix C** \_\_\_\_\_ 234

*Copy of two cards to show the development of the themes of this study*

**Appendix D** \_\_\_\_\_ 235

*Copy of card to show the development of data and theoretical frameworks for this study*

<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	236
---------------------	-----

**PRIMARY SOURCES**

**UNPUBLISHED MATERIAL**

**MANUSCRIPTS**

<i>Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington</i>	239
---	-----

<i>Auckland Institute and Museum Library</i>	242
--	-----

<i>Hocken Library, University of Otago</i>	245
--	-----

<i>Kinder Library, The College of St. John the Evangelist, Auckland</i>	248
---	-----

<i>The University of Auckland Library</i>	249
---	-----

<i>Mitchell Library/State Library of New South Wales</i>	252
--	-----

<b>CORRESPONDENCE</b>	255
-----------------------	-----

<b>INTERVIEWS</b>	255
-------------------	-----

**PUBLISHED MATERIAL**

**GOVERNMENT**

<i>Reports &amp; Legislation</i>	256
----------------------------------	-----

**NON-GOVERNMENT**

<i>Annual Reports</i>	256
-----------------------	-----

<i>Manuscript Inventories</i>	257
-------------------------------	-----

<i>Bibliographic &amp; Biographical Indexes</i>	258
---	-----

<i>Published Collections of Documents</i>	259
---	-----

<i>Contemporary Pamphlets &amp; Periodicals</i>	260
---	-----

**SECONDARY SOURCES****PUBLISHED MATERIAL**

<i>Theses &amp; Research Essays</i> _____	263
<i>Conference Papers &amp; Other Papers</i> _____	264

**PUBLISHED MATERIAL**

<i>Contemporary Books &amp; Articles 1800-1940</i> _____	265
<i>Recent Books 1941-1996</i> _____	266
<i>Articles 1941-1996</i> _____	276