



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

**PLACING THE LIVED EXPERIENCE(S) OF TB
IN A REFUGEE COMMUNITY IN AUCKLAND,
NEW ZEALAND**

Jody Lawrence

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree
of Doctor of Philosophy in
Geography

The University of Auckland

2007

ABSTRACT

Although rates of tuberculosis (TB) in much of the western world have steadily declined since the Second World War, this infectious disease remains a leading cause of death among those living in impoverished circumstances. Social science perspectives have argued that TB is as much a reflection of socio-economic inequality and the uneven distribution of power and resources as it is about biological processes. In this thesis I explore the lived experience of TB within the Somali refugee community in Auckland, New Zealand. While migrants and refugees are frequently blamed for the resurgence in TB in Western countries, very little is known about the determinants that underlie this manifestation of the disease. The present research addresses this gap in the literature by employing a transdisciplinary social science approach that considers the determinants of health and illness that range across the social, cultural economic and political domains of human experience. The geographical underpinnings of the work are borne out in the fundamental goal: to (literally and metaphorically) place the lived experience of health, disease (and particularly TB) within the Somali refugee community in the wider context of migration and resettlement. Employing qualitative methods I draw upon participants' narratives to highlight the different ways in which Somali health beliefs and experiences have been shaped by wider structural forces. I demonstrate that within Auckland, Somalis encounter multiple and overlapping layers of disadvantage. The combined impacts of this disadvantage have a profound influence on their health and illness experience, particularly in terms of the development and ongoing occurrence of TB. Respondents with TB recounted widespread stigma that exacerbated the harm incurred by the illness itself. Although Somalis are highly marginalised, the thesis acknowledges the agency and creativity exerted by people in fashioning the course of their life within the context of considerable structural constraints.

Keywords: tuberculosis, health, illness, migration, resettlement, Somalis, refugees, Auckland

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In many ways, this thesis is the product of collective kindness and generosity. I firstly want to acknowledge members of the Auckland Somali Community who have so graciously allowed me to be a part of their lives for the last four years. Recalling events from the past and sharing the challenges of the present is not something to be taken lightly and I am very grateful that people have taken time to share their experiences with me. I also wish to acknowledge the leadership of the Auckland Somali Community for assisting me throughout the research process and for their sage advice on the most appropriate ways to carry out research amongst their community. I would like to thank them for both their moral support and for their practical assistance with the organisation of interviews, meetings, interpreters and questionnaires. May the completion of this thesis herald the beginning of a new chapter in working together as much as it is the ending of another.

I am also deeply indebted to my supervisors Robin Kearns and Julie Park for their enduring support throughout the research process. Their guidance, patience and encouragement have been instrumental in the completion of this thesis. I have great respect for their intellectual insight and creativity, I have been most fortunate to have had such outstanding supervisors.

Talking about TB is a complex matter and I am particularly grateful for the assistance provided by Public Health Nurses and Dr. Craig Thornley of the Auckland Regional Public Health Service in terms of the recruitment of participants and access to epidemiological data. Without the assistance of these health professionals this research would not have been possible. I have profound respect for the work they do and the way in which they go above and beyond the call of duty to care for those in need.

Throughout the research process I have been greatly inspired by the passion, commitment and care shown by particular individuals working in the health and refugee sector. My thanks go to Annette Mortensen whose considerable wisdom and experience of working with refugees has proven to be most invaluable. I am very grateful for Annette's feedback and input throughout the research process and her assistance in the sourcing of relevant literature and data on a topic that is often on the margins of scholarly interest. I also wish to acknowledge the input of my research advisor Nikki Denholm whose vast experience of working with Somalis has assisted me greatly.

It is important to acknowledge the generous financial support I have received as part of the Bright Futures Top Doctoral Scholarship, the University of Auckland Doctoral Scholarship, the Political Ecology of TB Project and the Graduate Research Fund which assisted with conference travel. I also wish to acknowledge the institutional assistance given by the School of Geography and

Environmental Science of which I am part. Igor Drecki kindly assisted in creating the Somali clan diagram.

This thesis is not a stand-alone effort but is part of a wider research project titled 'The Political Ecology of TB'. Being part of an inter-disciplinary team has been enormously valuable and I am so thankful for the support, encouragement and intellectual stimulation offered by fellow students (Anneke Anderson, Debbie Dunsford, Alison Searle, Moana Oh and Roannie Ng Shiu) and staff (Julie Park, Robin Kearns, Judith Littleton and Linda Bryder). The TB project funded by the Health Research Council and University of Auckland Research Committee has also provided valuable assistance in terms of resources and financial support.

Throughout this thesis I have been particularly interested in people's everyday life experiences. I am eternally grateful to my friends and family for their contribution to this domain in my life. Many thanks in particular to Hilary, Dean, Daniel, Michael and Susan for their enduring support and encouragement. I am very grateful to Michael Lawrence and Margaret Stiles for assisting with proof-reading and to Hilary Grinter for her incredible help during the homeward straits. Special thanks go to my husband Peter for always believing in me and supporting me throughout this marathon journey. And last but not least, to my 'thesis baby' Sophie to whom this thesis is dedicated. Thank you for showing me what life is really all about.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
LIST OF TABLES	ix
LIST OF FIGURES	x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xi
Chapter 1: Introduction	13
Introduction	13
How I came to this topic.....	14
Objective	15
Aims	16
Conceptual coat-hooks	18
Space/Place.....	18
Structure/Agency	20
Community and Representation	20
Thesis Overview.....	22
Summary.....	23
Chapter 2: Globalisation, transnationalism and refugee experiences in New Zealand	25
Globalisation	25
Transnationalism and diaspora.....	26
Diaspora	26
Transnationalism	30
The contexts of New Zealand immigration	35
African Migration to NZ.....	37
Refugees	38
Refugee resettlement	42
Transnational Auckland	43
Summary.....	46
Chapter 3: Somalia and Somalis	48
Background	50
History.....	51
Somalia and its peoples.....	53
Somalia today	57

The Somali Diaspora.....	60
Introduction	60
Diaspora and resettlement.....	60
Somali refugees in New Zealand	73
Summary	75
Chapter 4: Medical/Health Geography and TB – from dots on maps to DOTS in neighbourhoods	76
Disciplinary evolution of health/medical geography.....	76
Medical/Health geography and infectious disease	78
The characteristics of TB	81
Biology of TB.....	82
Extent and incidence of TB worldwide	82
History and resurgence of TB	83
HIV	85
Multi Drug Resistant TB.....	86
Immigration	87
Socio-economic status.....	91
TB Control, treatment and compliance	93
Directly Observed Therapy Short-course (DOTS).....	93
Compliance	94
Culture studies	96
‘Culture studies’ critique.....	107
TB in NZ	109
Summary.....	116
Chapter 5: Methodology and the research context	118
Research Methods	119
Early encounters	119
Engaging with the Somali Community: first steps.....	120
Participant observation and fieldwork	122
Positionality and reflexivity.....	124
Sewing the seeds of friendship.....	125
Students.....	129
Adult literacy programme.....	131
Evaluations and reports	132
Weddings.....	135
Friendships	138
Participants and the recruitment process.....	140
Interviews	151
Focus groups	154
Interview analysis.....	155

Interpreting	156
Ethics	157
Rumours and suspicion	160
Stigma and the research process	162
Up close and personal – reflections on the realities of research	163
Summary.....	169
Chapter 6: Out of Africa – The establishment of a Somali presence in Auckland, New Zealand	172
Sizing up the community: estimating population size	172
Reconciling with the past and living with loss	175
Remembering home: war and the search for safety.....	177
Experiencing loss: Separation, isolation and identity.....	180
Isolation.....	182
Discrimination	184
Wealth and resources.....	185
Resettling in New Zealand: disappointment and shattered dreams.....	186
Being Somali in New Zealand: Culture, identity and resettlement.....	193
The Somali community in Auckland – community structures and dynamics	200
Somalis as a transnational community	204
Summary.....	210
Chapter 7: Somali health beliefs and experiences	212
Refugee health.....	212
Physical health.....	213
Mental health	215
Resettlement and health	217
Being healthy in New Zealand: Somali health concerns in Auckland, New Zealand	219
Mental health	226
Accessing health-care	232
Somali health beliefs and practices	233
Health and healing in Somalia.....	233
Interaction between health systems	235
Explaining disease.....	240
Islam and Western medicine	246
Summary	255
Chapter 8: Understanding TB – A dreaded disease or just like the ‘flu? ...	256
TB in Somalia.....	259
TB in NZ.....	264
The nature of the beast: Somali beliefs about the etiology of TB	269
Causes.....	270

Transmission	277
Symptoms.....	281
TBI	285
Summary.....	287
Chapter 9: TB journeys	288
Recognising illness	288
Responding to illness.....	292
An explanation at last!.....	296
Hospital.....	300
DOTS and home based care.....	303
Medication	309
Compliance.....	312
Clinic visits	316
The long road to wellness.....	320
Living with stigma.....	322
Summary.....	327
Chapter 10: Conclusion	329
Research reflections	330
Somali resettlement experiences.....	333
Health, illness and TB	337
Summary.....	342
Appendix 1	344
Appendix 2.....	346
Appendix 3.....	348
Appendix 4.....	352
Appendix 5.....	355
Appendix 6.....	358
Appendix 7.....	361
Appendix 8.....	362
Appendix 9.....	363
Appendix 10.....	364
References.....	365

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 Major Refugee Groups Resettled in New Zealand	39
Table 2 Growth in numbers of selected ethnic groups between the 1991, 1996 and 2001 censuses	46
Table 3 Selected indicators for Somalia.....	58
Table 4 Estimated size and remittance flows of diasporic Somali populations throughout the world.....	62
Table 5 Interval between arrival in NZ and notification of TB in foreign-born cases (2001)	112
Table 6 Parliamentary Debate Excerpt, 2nd September 2003	148
Table 7 ASCA programme history.....	203

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1 Map of Somalia	50
Figure 2. Main Somali Clans	54
Figure 3 Trends in TB incidence 1988-2001	110
Figure 4 Rates of TB by age group and deprivation	115
Figure 5 TB notifications within the Auckland Region (2002)	116
Figure 6 Three sewing group participants	127
Figure 7 Somali sewing group participants hard at work	128
Figure 8 Opening match of the Somali youth soccer programme in Mt Albert, Auckland	132
Figure 9 Attempt at goal	133
Figure 10 Participants in the Somali Women's Nutrition Train-the-trainer programme.....	133
Figure 11 Muslim women's swimming programme prizegiving.....	134
Figure 12 Preparing to go to a wedding. A photo of me wearing traditional Somali dress (<i>dirac</i>) pictured beside the Somali flag	137
Figure 13 A Somali wedding in progress	138
Figure 14 Somali TB notifications 2001-2005	142
Figure 15 Somali TBD notifications 2001-2005.....	142
Figure 16 Somali TBD notifications by gender	143
Figure 17 Somali TBD cases by age-group	143
Figure 18 TB type of Somali TBD cases 2001-2005.....	144
Figure 19 Interval between arrival in NZ and notification of TB - Somali TB notifications 2001-2005....	145
Figure 20 Somali TBD Notifications 2001-2005	145
Figure 21 Comparison of proportion of Somali TBD notifications able to be contacted and subsequently consenting to participate	146
Figure 22 Somali research participants by gender.....	149
Figure 23 Somali research participants by age-group	149
Figure 24 Research participants by TB type	150
Figure 25 Visual representation of my research interactions.....	164
Figure 26 Real estate advertisement	201

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACC	Auckland City Council
ADHB	Auckland District Health Board
AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
ARMS	Auckland Regional Migrant Service
ASCA	Auckland Somali Community Association
ARPHS	Auckland Regional Public Health Service
BBC	British Broadcasting Corporation
BCG	Bacille Calmette-Guerin Vaccination
CAU	Census Area Units
DOL	Department of Labour
DOTS	Directly Observed Therapy Short-course
ESOL	English as a Second Language
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
FGM	Female Genital Mutilation
FRST	Foundation for Research Science and Technology
GP	General Practitioner
HDI	Human Development Index
HIPPY	Home Interaction Programme for Parents and Youngsters
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
HoP	Hauora o Puketapapa
LTSA	Land Transport Safety Authority
MDRTB	Multi Drug Resistant TB
MRRC	Mangere Refugee Reception Centre
MSD	Ministry of Social Development
NFD	Northern Frontier District
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
NZIS	New Zealand Immigration Service
OEA	Office of Ethnic Affairs
ON TRACC	Transcultural Care Centre for Children
PHN	Public Health Nurse
PTSD	Post Traumatic Stress Disorder
RAS	Refugees as Survivors
RMS	Refugee and Migrant Service
SARS	Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome
SNM	Somali National Movement
TB	Tuberculosis

TBD	TB Disease
TBI	TB Infection
TEC	Tertiary Education Commission
TNC	Transnational Corporation
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission for Refugees
USC	United Somali Congress
WHO	World Health Organization