Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognize the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form and Deposit Licence.
The Cultural Representation of
Taiwaneseness and Taiwanese Nationalism in
Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*

Yu-Wen Chih

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Asian Studies,
School of Cultures, Languages, and Linguistics
The University of Auckland
January 18, 2017
Acknowledgements

I would like first to express my sincere gratitude to my main supervisor Associate Professor Mark Amsler for his continuing support throughout my Ph.D studies. His guidance and insightful comments have inspired me and widened my perspectives in constructing the research frame of this study, as well as steering me in the right direction at key moments. His passion and scholarly input have been a great source of encouragement and this has empowered me to maintain a clear mind. In particular, his wisdom has enabled me to come to the gradual appreciation of what Roland Barthes believes to be true, “language is never innocent”.

In addition, I would like to thank both my co-supervisors, Dr. Hilary Chung and Professor Paul Clark, for their valuable guidance, insightful comments and encouragement which have led to the completion of this research and thesis, and in particular, Hilary’s generous and timely editorial assistance and her guidance through my oral examination.

My sincere thanks also go to the two examiners, Dr. Mark Harrison and Professor Fan Ming-Ju. Their valuable comments and encouraging suggests have made my thesis more complete and also, broadened my vision with respect to research on Taiwan literature. I would also like to thank Dr. Richard Phillips, Dr. Lawrence Marceau, Dr. Edward McDonald and Dr. Rumi Sakamoto, for their constructive criticism and comments during the early stages of my Ph.D study.
My heartfelt appreciation also goes to Professor Lin Ruiming of Cheng Kung University in Taiwan for his sound ideas and generous offers of material which have provided my project with considerable insight. My grateful thanks also go to the staff of the Inter-library loan service of Auckland University and to those responsible for the integrated collection of the National Library of Taiwan in Taipei; these valuable resources have helped me to retain my initial enthusiasm throughout this academic journey.

A very special thank you goes to Li Qiao, the author of the *Wintry Night Trilogy*. His acceptance of my approach to interview him at his residence in September 2013 and the subsequent stimulating discussions I have had with him have encouraged me to strive for ever greater levels of achievement in the research process. I still remember the painting hanging on the wall of his living room, which depicts a scene from Fanzai Wood painted by Li Qiao himself; it was also the place where he grew up. The painting reflects the weight on his mind of the *Wintry Night Trilogy* and has been a constant reminder to me to handle the novel carefully.

Special gratitude is also extended to my family. Without their patience and understanding, this academic journey could not have been so smoothly accomplished.
Abstract

This thesis offers a response to the existing controversy over how Taiwanese national discourse emerged, and the role of the arts in the formation of this consciousness. It does this via a cultural, historical and narrative analysis of Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, systematically revealing, for the first time, the way in which this work is pivotal in the development of Taiwanese national consciousness, and showing that this process began as early as the 1970s, rather than 1980s period that existing scholarship focuses on.

By employing an integrated narratological approach which includes the theoretical concepts of intertextuality, post-colonial theory, Bakhtin’s dialogic discourse, multilingualism, and reader response, this thesis shows both how the cultural aspect of the discourse of Taiwanese nationalism was developed in Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, and how this discourse was conveyed and understood.

*Wintry Night Trilogy* is shown to have played a key role in the establishment of a discourse in which both Taiwan’s past and an imaginary Taiwan nation are simultaneously sought. Under the conditions of martial law it represents key elements of Taiwanese nationalist consciousness, including the construction of a common identity of being Taiwanese, and the recovery and narration of the hidden history of Taiwan in the context of neo-colonial rule.

A multidimensional narrative of Taiwan’s past is shown to be represented through Li Qiao’s appropriation of historical source material and via his deployment of post-colonial, intertextual, and multilingual textual strategies.
A note on Romanisation

With regard to the romanisation of Chinese names and terms, the Hanyu Pinyin (漢語拼音) system is used throughout this thesis, with some exceptions. First, proper names, including the names of people, historical events, places and institutions in Taiwan, that are internationally acknowledged in an alternative form, will be used. Second, if the Tonyong Pinyin (通用拼音) rendering of an author’s name has been internationally acknowledged, accepted, or used in an English publication, it will be retained. Third, if the Chinese title of a book, journal or newspaper has its own romanised or English translation, this will be used.
Table of Contents

Acknowledgements ........................................................................... i
Abstract ........................................................................................... iii
A note on Romanisation ................................................................. iv

Chapter 1
Introduction ....................................................................................... 1
1. Research motive & research question ........................................ 2
2. Historical background ............................................................... 9
3. The instability of “Taiwan” as a category ................................. 16
4. Methodological approach .......................................................... 20
5. Overview ..................................................................................... 29

Chapter 2
Constructing a Sign as National Discourse – Genesis and Intertextuality in
Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy ....................................................... 31
1. The genesis of a signifying system ............................................. 36
2. Historical material and intertextuality ..................................... 41
3. The intertextual use of “The Sound of Weeping” in The Lone Lamp ............ 55
4. The Voices of the vulnerable ..................................................... 63
5. Constructing land consciousness through the presentation of polyphonic voices ......................................................... 73
Chapter 3
A Post-Colonial Perspective into Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy

1. “Headhunting” as a signifier

2. The signification of “headhunting”

3. Representing the third space

4. The development of a critical discourse

Chapter 4
Representing multilingualism

1. Code-switching

2. Glossing

Chapter 5
Reception history of Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy

1. Literary canon vs. a minor literature

2. The Interpretive communities

3. Li Qiao’s response as a reader

4. Canon formation

Chapter 6
Epilogue

Bibliography
Chapter One
Introduction

This thesis is an investigation of the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism articulated by Li Qiao (李喬, 1934–) in his three-volume saga Wintry Night Trilogy (寒夜三部曲). In the trilogy, Li Qiao provides readers with three stories entitled, Wintry Night (寒夜), The Deserted Village (荒村) and The Lone Lamp (孤燈), respectively. These feature the lives of three generations of a Hakka family in the mountainous village of Fanzai Wood, near Miaoli (苗栗) in Taiwan. The stories range over a period of fifty-five years from the late nineteenth century to the end of the Japanese occupation in 1945. Li Qiao started serializing the first volume, Wintry Night, in Taiwan Wenyi (台灣文藝) in 1977, and finished writing the third volume, The Lone Lamp, in 1979 before finishing the second volume, The Deserted Village, in 1981. It was also during this period that the Taiwanese people witnessed the Nativist Literature Debate (1977-78) as well as the lead-up to the Formosa Incident (1979) that resulted in a substantial awakening in the consciousness of many people living in Taiwan.

By employing an integrated narratological approach combining the theoretical concepts of intertextuality, post-colonialism, Bakhtin’s dialogic discourse, multilingualism, and reader response, this thesis seeks to explain how the cultural aspects of the discourse of Taiwanese nationalism was developed in Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy, and how the discourse was conveyed and understood. It also explores the range of ideological variations within the discourse and seeks to show how that variation contributed to the development of a conceptual framework, while explaining
how the discourse and text interacted and changed in relation to sociopolitical change.

The focus is the period from 1975 to the early years of the 21st century. 1975 was the year when Li Qiao set about drafting the first novel, *Wintry Night*; it was also a time when Li Qiao gradually shifted his writing approach from short story to novelistic writing. The turn of the 20th to the 21st century marked the vigorous advance of Taiwanese democratic appeal. The year 2,000 saw the realization of the Taiwanization campaign when the Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) won the presidential election and assumed executive power.¹ This was also the time when the establishment of departments of Taiwan literature in higher education institutions was officially encouraged. In addition, the year 2001 marked a new milestone in the reception history of the *Wintry Night Trilogy* as it was when both the abridged version of the trilogy, *Mother of the Earth* (大地之母), was published by Yuanjing Publishing (遠景), and an English translation of *Wintry Night* was published by Columbia University.

This period is significant with respect to a comprehensive analysis of the *Wintry Night Trilogy* because it offers both opportunities for theoretical insight into the fields of cultural and nationalism studies and for historical insight into a new understanding of Taiwan’s past. It also provides the opportunity for cultural insight into identity transformation in Taiwan through the representation of cultural works.

1. **Research motive & research question**

Three key factors underpin this research. They are: firstly, Li Qiao’s multiple identities as a novelist, cultural critic and literary critic; secondly, *Wintry Night Trilogy*’s dualistic characteristics of simultaneously presenting literary aesthetics and narrating

¹ This was limited, as the DPP did not control the legislature during its period in power between 2000 and 2008, as the Nationalist (KMT/GMD) continued its majority status in the Legislative Yuan (立法院).
Taiwan’s history; and thirdly, the controversy over the emergence of Taiwanese cultural nationalism.

Li Qiao was born in 1934 and spent most of his childhood in the mountainous village Fanzai Wood in the Great Lake Town of Miaoli. He received primary education during the latter years of Japanese rule and the first few years of the postwar period. He later graduated from Xinzhu (Hsinchu, 新竹) Teacher’s Normal College in 1954 and then worked as a school teacher until 1982. Li Qiao began publishing his short stories in literary journals and newspapers in the early 1960s, and gained success as a novelist. His saga works *Wintry Night Trilogy* (1980, 1981) and *Injustice in 1947* (1995, 《埋冤 1947》) are generally considered novels in which Taiwan’s suppressed history was revealed through literary means. The former work also won the Literary Award of the Wu Sanlian Foundation in 1981. In the 1980s, he became involved in writing cultural commentaries and started serializing a series of articles under the heading “The Ugly Side of the Taiwanese” (台灣人的醜陋面) in the magazine *Taiwanese New Culture* (台灣新文化) in 1986. Consequent developments in the post-martial law period (from 1987 onwards) showed that Li Qiao’s role as a Taiwanese cultural critic carried the same weight as his role as a novelist, thus provoking the question as to the roles Li Qiao and *Wintry Night Trilogy* played in the process of this transition.

As to *Wintry Night Trilogy*’s dualistic characteristics, there has been considerable discussion in regard to its genre category since it was published as a three-volume saga in 1981. The consensus view among the critics was that the trilogy offered an historical narration of the Japanese colonial period, in the form of literature. Some consider *Wintry Night Trilogy* to be a historical novel, while others identified it as a
“roman-fleuve” or “Saga Novel” (大河小說).²

As Chen Jianzhong (陳建忠) argued, as a literary genre, the roman-fleuve was favoured because it was used to relate to the development of Taiwanese nationalism. He further asserted that the significance of classifying certain novelistic saga works as “romans-fleuves” reflects the way that Taiwan’s history had been excluded from the official discourse under Nationalist rule, and hence was also absent from the collective memory of the general public. According to Chen Jianzhong, such a phenomenon enabled the anti-Japanese sentiment that was originally depicted in the Japanese context, to be re-directed as a resistant force against another neo-colonial regime; according to Chen Jianzhong, this paradoxically refers to Nationalist rule in the postwar period.³, Chen further points out that under the conditions of the authoritative rule of the KMT the “roman-fleuve” narrative became the dominant post-colonial practice from which Taiwan’s historical memories were retrieved.⁴

Although most critics agreed with this classification, others, such as, Yang Zhao (楊照), argued that Saga novels such as Zhong Zhaozheng’s The Trilogy of the Taiwanese and Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy have the specific significance of expressing a resistant consciousness in the historical context of Taiwan literature.⁵ However, regardless of this debate, Li Qiao’s attitude toward the genre of Wintry Night Trilogy has been consistent. He consistently described the work as “a novel based on historical material”. As he defined it, in a novel based on historical materials, the writer

³ Ibid., p. 17.
⁴ Ibid., p. 17.
draws on the credibility of historical material even while focusing on fictional operations, while interpreting historical people and events at the same time. Although it is a novel based on history, the purity of literature is also pursued. 6

The above account shows the significance of historical narrative in Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy, regardless of whether it is classified as a roman-fleuve, a historical novel, or a novel based on historical materials. In this regard, the following questions come to the fore: how has Li Qiao represented the untold history of Taiwan in the trilogy and what stories does the trilogy reveal? How does it differ from other works with a similar approach? What is the aesthetic representation referred to by Li Qiao in Wintry Night Trilogy?

Lastly, the trilogy offers significant insight into the timing of the emergence of cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism. In the last two decades, there have been many studies relating to the development of Taiwanese nationalism. However, most of them are from the perspective of political studies or are political commentaries promoting some kind of national ideology. Among those with cultural approaches, the two volumes of Hsiau A-chin’s (蕭阿勤) research on Taiwanese cultural nationalism merit discussion. They are: Contemporary Taiwanese Cultural Nationalism 7, and Return to Reality: Political and Cultural Change in 1970s ‘Taiwan and the Postwar Generation. (回歸現實：台灣 1970 年代的戰後世代與文化政治變遷) 8. An earlier study carried out by Yu Shengguan (游勝冠) on the rise and development of the Taiwan nativist (本土/ bentu) literary discourse, also deserves to be reviewed: The Rise and Development of

---

6 Li Qiao. “My experience of writing novels based on historical resources” (「歷史素材小說」寫作經驗談) in Wenhsun (文訊), No. 246, pp.54-56.
Both Hsiau and Yu agree that the development of Taiwanese cultural nationalism in the 1980s resulted in the establishment of Taiwanese subjectivity. However, controversy remains with respect to the 1970s. Yu divided the development of Taiwanese nativist literary discourse into three stages: a rising stage in the Japanese colonial period; a declining stage during the 1950s and 1960s; and, the resurgent stage of the 1970s and 1980s. He delineated Taiwanese identity consciousness as consisting of Taiwanese consciousness and Han consciousness, these two elements having co-existed in the minds of Taiwanese intellectuals since the Japanese colonial era.

Both Yu and Hsiau stress the influence of the forces of political opposition on the cultural aspects of development. In most of his discussions, Yu argues that a political nativist discourse at each stage was immediately followed by a corresponding literary approach. In particular, Yu believes that, since the 1980s, literary intellectuals have responded without hesitation to the call from those engaged in campaigns of political and social reform, which were aimed at establishing Taiwanese subjectivity. As a result, this vigorous interaction led to the development of a theoretical discursive frame regarding the Taiwanese nation and a Taiwanese national literature, from which Chineseness became excluded.

Hsiau holds a slightly different view from Yu. He argues that the cultural articulation of the concept of a “Taiwanese nation”, only occurred in the years following the Formosa Incident. As he noted: “it was primarily Taiwanese political oppositionists’ (dang-wa/黨外) nationalist challenge to the Nationalist government in

---

10 Ibid., p.11.
11 Ibid., p.180.
the first half of the 1980s that inspired cultural nationalism in writers, literary critics, historians, and language revival activities.”

Hsiau’s view on the re-emergence of Taiwanese cultural nationalism was further elaborated in his 2008 volume, in which he carried out a comprehensive survey of the role of postwar generation intellectuals in the 1970s. He argued that, in the course of the 1970s, in terms of national identity, authors from the native literary magazines *Taiwan Wenyi* (台灣文藝) and *Li Poetry* (笠詩刊) were making sense of the cultural and politico-historical significance of the literary activities of the Japanese colonial period and the postwar era from the perspective of Chinese nationalism. In other words, the collective memory was constructed under the referencing structure of Chinese nationalism.

In *Return to Reality*, Hsiau A-chin re-stated his argument that it was not until the early 1980s that politically-significant Taiwanese cultural nationalism emerged. In my opinion, Hsiau’s argument is based on the larger scale public recognition of Taiwanese consciousness as well as the explicit expression of a Taiwanese-centred literary approach in the native literary arena, and hence, the individual development in which subtle and hidden characteristics were embedded during the second half of the 1970s, has been overlooked.

For instance, in his research into the post-war generation of Taiwanese intellectuals, Hsiau used Lin Ruiming’s diary, written between 1977 and 1979, as an example and argued that Lin Ruiming’s commentary on the political and social situation of the time, generally stemmed from ideas falling within the scope of institutional reform. In Hsiau’s opinion, the national and cultural perspectives revealed in the diary possessed a hybrid

---

13 Ibid., p.17.
15 Ibid., p. 240.
nature, in which anti-Nationalist opinions, Chinese national identity, Taiwanese consciousness and Lin Ruiming’s support for the idea of Taiwan’s independence co-exist. Hsiau concluded that Li Ruiming’s writing fitted roughly within the scope of a lower level, or under-developed, Taiwanese national identity. In other words, it is a “hybridized hidden transcript” or the seedling of Taiwanese nationalism.\(^{17}\) Hence, in Hsiau’s viewpoint, there were seeds of various kinds of identity, not merely those that resulted in the development of Taiwanese nationalism, and the diary had been written at an early stage in Lin Ruiming’s thinking in regard to the development of Taiwanese nationalism.

If history had not developed as it did later on in the 1980s, Hsiau reasoned that Lin Ruiming’s brewing Taiwanese nationalism might not have grown; that is to say, the hidden transcript may, or may not, have been revealed and, it could have been Chinese nationalism that had in fact developed.\(^ {18}\) In addition, in his examination of the two native literary magazines *Taiwan Wenyi* and *Li Poetry*, in which both Zhong Zhaozheng and Li Qiao were involved, Hsiau argued that both of them were operating within the Chinese ideology, and hence, basically, during the course of the 1970s, no sign of Taiwanese identity was presented in those literary works.

In my view, the later development of Taiwaneseness ought not to be considered as a criterion with which to judge the value of its earlier appearance. In other words, I argue that what was presented in the 1970s should not be neglected even though there was further development later, in the 1980s. Hence, it would be more appropriate to explain the phenomena which emerged in the 1970s by employing Bhabha’s concept of hybridity because all cultural statements and systems are constructed in a space that he

---

18 Ibid., pp. 378-381.
called the “third space of enunciation”\textsuperscript{19}. Besides, cultural identity always emerges in a contradictory space, which renders as untenable the claim to a hierarchical “purity” of cultures.\textsuperscript{20} From this perspective, Hsiau’s explanation for the hidden transcript would become meaningful due to its hybrid nature.

As the above account makes clear, the issue of whether a discourse relating to the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism arrived in the late 1970s, as suggested by Yu, or as Hsiau argued, that it was in the post Formosa Incident era that a nativist literary discourse came into being, needs comprehensive investigation. I argue that an integrated theoretical approach on Li Qiao’s \textit{Wintry Night Trilogy} written between 1977 and 1979 sheds significant light on the issue.

2. \textbf{Historical background}

This thesis seeks to show that the narrative of \textit{Wintry Night Trilogy} played a role in establishing a literary/cultural discourse relating to the development of cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism. The analysis seeks to identify the factors that contributed to the formation of the discourse, and to explain what the discourse is and its social effects on the growth of Taiwanese nationalism. Since the “temporality” of the analysis in this thesis inevitably includes both “narrational time” (the time of writing and that of reading) and “story-time”, the introduction of the two historical contexts is essential.

In retrospect, Chinese culture was imported to Taiwan on a large-scale after Koxinga’s (Zheng Chenggong, 鄭成功) troops successfully defeated the thirty-eight years of Dutch rule in 1661 and established a Ming-style government (1661-1683). Han settlers subsequently migrated to Taiwan under Qing rule (1683-1895). Throughout

\textsuperscript{19} Ashcroft, Bill. et al., \textit{Key Concepts in Post-Colonial Studies}. p. 118.
\textsuperscript{20} Ibid., p. 118.
most of the Qing period, the island was part of Fujian (Fukien, 福建) Province and was only listed as a separate province in 1885. However, only nine years after this recognition, Taiwan became a trophy of the Sino-Japanese War (甲午戰爭). As part of the settlement of the Treaty of Shimonoseki, Taiwan and Penghu (the Pescadores) were ceded to Japan by the Qing administration in 1895, and thus became the first colony of Japan’s imperialism.

Japanese colonization in Taiwan can be divided into three stages. Although it began with an oppressive era led by military Governors (1895-1919), armed resistance occurred repeatedly. The second stage (1919-1936) started when a civilian Governor was appointed and the policy of Assimilation (doka, 同化) was implemented. During this period, armed resistance was mainly replaced by non-violent methods, the only exception being the anti-Japanese uprising; this was the Wushe Incident of 1930, conducted by the aboriginal tribes.

It was also during this period that Japanese colonial rule imported industrial modernity and Western-style modern thought into Taiwan. Although modernization created exploitative relationships between the ruling class and the colonized, it also brought a series of benefits to Taiwanese people, for example, the implantation of Western systems and thought processes, as well as concepts of national consciousness and nationhood.

In addition, during the period of the 1920s and 1930s, various enlightenment activities emerged under the influence of colonial modernity. Examples include lobbying for the establishment of an independent Taiwanese parliament (1921) and the establishment of civic organizations such as the Taiwanese Cultural Association (1921,
台灣文化協會，台湾农民合作（1921, 台湾农民组合）, and the Mass Party (1927, 民眾黨). In the meantime, a new strand of modern literature, that had initially been inspired by the Chinese New Literature movement and modern Western literature, emerged in the early 1920s and played a crucial role in the Taiwanese New Culture movement.

The third stage started with the re-introduction of military rule (1936) and ended with Japan’s defeat in World War II (1945). During this period, Taiwan became Japan’s southern military base. A radical Japanization policy (kominka, 皇民化) movement was implemented for the purpose of general mobilization. Overall, since large-scale armed resistance had become impossible in the early 1920s, Taiwanese intellectuals maintained a tradition of engaging in cultural means of resistance against Japanese colonial rule.

As a result of Japan’s unconditional surrender in 1945, the status of Taiwan turned dramatically from being a Japanese colony to being a province under the Nationalist administration. For the Taiwanese population, the sentiment of Chinese nationalism was initially encouraging; this was because the change symbolized the return to their mother country. However, they soon found that the Nationalist Governor Chen Yi’s oppression and exploitation exceeded that of the Japanese. As a result, on February 28, 1947, a small incident triggered an island-wide anti-Nationalist uprising. The military crackdown by Nationalist troops resulted in 18,000-28,000 deaths and many of the victims were male intellectuals.

The Nationalist government’s total retreat to Taiwan in 1949 after its defeat by the People’s Liberation Army resulted in the flight of nearly 1.2 million Chinese

---

21 Established in 1921 and in existence until 1926, the Taiwan Culture Association was the first organized group to be involved in a variety of activities aimed at cultural enlightenment.

22 Zhang Yanxian (張炎憲) et al., Research Report on Responsibility for the 228 Massacre. (二二八事件責任歸屬研究報告). Taipei: Memorial Foundation of 228, 2006, p. 73.

23 The 228 Incident of 1947 has been recognized as a Taiwan national holiday since 1995.
Mainlanders to Taiwan by 1952. Chinese Nationalism was then systematically imposed as the central tenet of its re-sinicization policy. Above all, the temporary provisions of the Period of National Mobilization for Suppression of the Communist Rebellion (動員戡亂臨時條款) passed by the National Assembly in 1948 were maintained as the basis of the constitutional framework after 1949. Taiwan was then forced into a thirty-eight-year period of martial law (1949-1987) and people’s basic human rights were frozen.

It is also from this point on that the ethnic composition of the island became complicated. The mainlander group formed the last wave of immigrants from China after the retreat of the Nationalist government in 1949, and constituted 13 % of the post 1949 population. In 1979, approximately 85% of people living in Taiwan were Holo (75%, 福佬人) and Hakka (10.05%, 客家人), who are Han Chinese descendants of earlier immigrants (18th and 19th centuries) from Fujian and Guangdong provinces in South China. The two ethnic groups of Holo and Hakka, together with the 1.89 % aborigines who are primarily of Austronesia origin, had a historical background that was distinct from those of the mainlanders; in particular, their experiences during the period when Taiwan was under Japanese rule between 1895 and 1945.

In the cultural arena, the heritage of Taiwan literature that had been developed in the Japanese colonial era was not handed down, and nearly all the prominent writers of modern Chinese literature, particularly those of the leftist social realistic tradition, remained on the Mainland. In this political atmosphere, government-sponsored combat

---

26 Ibid., p. 20.
literature written mostly by Mainlander authors became prevalent in the early 1950s. However, after ten years of promotion, literary styles which had complied with the official cultural policies with either a stereotyped anti-Communist monotone or nostalgic themes became powerless and unattractive in the face of the discontent among the intellectual elite.

As such, inspired by American liberal humanism and global progressive trends, as well as changes in social stratification due to economic development, a new literary approach, Modernist literature which initially emerged from the Foreign Language and Literature Department of Taiwan University in the early 1960s gradually became a trend. In the meantime, literary works with grassroots characters also emerged, many of them appearing in the magazines *Taiwan Wenyi* (台灣文藝) and *Bihui* (筆匯), yet this approach attracted little attention from mainstream literary circles.

In the early 1970s, Taiwan encountered a series of diplomatic setbacks. The first major diplomatic challenge to the Nationalist government was a jurisdictional dispute over the Diaoyu islands (釣魚台列島). This resulted in the patriotic Movement to Protect the Diaoyu Islets, which was supported by Taiwanese intellectuals, including university students and scholars. The movement and the consecutive diplomatic setbacks encouraged people’s patriotic sentiment with an ideology based on Chinese nationalism.

It was also during this period that political opposition began to develop. Stirred by a consciousness of the social reality that Taiwan was not the fictional China that the KMT maintained, a few Taiwanese intellectuals called for the Nationalist government to

---

29 Both Taiwan and Japan claimed the islets. In April 1971, the US declared that the islets and the Okinawa islands would be returned to Japan.
30 These include: the UN vote to admit the PRC and to expel Taiwan in October 1971, and the severing of diplomatic relations with Taiwan and recognition of the PRC by the US in 1979.
face Taiwan’s social reality, and to carry out social and political reform. Some writers from the local literary field began to involve themselves in the process of introducing and translating the literary works of the Japanese period, others engaged in the creation of Nativist literature featuring native themes and the situation of the lower classes. Many university students were encouraged by this trend and began to show interest in social issues.

In the literary arena of the 1970s, modernist writers continued their experimental techniques yet at the same time they also included elements of social realism in their writings. Many authors of literary works published during this period had reached maturity in their writing career and were well accepted by readers and critics. A salient example is Wang Wenxing’s (王文興, 1939- ) novel *Family Catastrophe* (家變, 1973) where family conflicts between a father and his son are explored. Others, in particular, Bai Xianyong (白先勇, 1937- ), produced some of his most influential works in this period, such as the two collections of short stories *Taipei People* (台北人, 1971) and *Lonely Seventeen* (寂寞的十七歲, 1976).

In the meantime, although the Nativist literature campaign was constantly highlighted in the literary arena, in the face of rapid economic development, some writers, regardless of their literary affiliation, started to engage with the city-based lives of the rising middle class. This new trend predicted the flourishing of urban literature in mainstream literary circles in the 1980s. For example, the writer Wang Zhenhe (王禎和, 1940-1990) used a modernist approach to portray socially neglected characters living in villages in his earlier writings, but went on to depict those who migrated from village to city and struggled for survival in the industrialized jungle of a city like Taipei. In Bai Xianyong’s *Taipei People*, the city of Taipei became the place where characters of Mainland origin could lodge their homeland nostalgia.
It is noteworthy that in the 1970s, female writers such as Li Ang (李昂, 1952-), Zhu Tianwen (朱天文, 1955-), Zhu Tianxin (朱天心, 1958-) and Sanmao (三毛, 1943-91) gained a significant profile. For example, both Zhu Tianwen and Zhu Tianxin have demonstrated their talent in writing since their school days, and drew the attention of young readers and literary critics. Their writing style was considerably under the influence of Hu Lancheng (胡蘭成) and Zhang Ailing (張愛玲), and they were the central figures in the literary group associated with the literary magazine Sansan Collection (三三集刊, 1977-1981) established by their father Zhu Xining (朱西甯) and Hu Lancheng.

Li Ang and Sanmao enjoyed immediate success in the second part of the 1970s with unique voices and perspectives. In The Secular World (人間世, 1977) Li Ang explored feminist themes and sexuality, while in Stories of the Sahara (撒哈拉的故事, 1976) Sanmao depicted her life and love while she was living in Sahara Desert with her Spanish husband Jose.

The thriving atmosphere of the mainstream literary arena was further reinforced by the establishment of literary awards hosted by two major newspapers, the “China Times Literature Award” established in 1978 and the “United Daily News Literature Award” established in 1976. Overall, the growth of modernist and nativist literature during the 1960s and 1970s, not only reflected the intellectuals’ discontent with rigid cultural policies, but also symbolized the long term challenge that the Nationalist regime had to face under changing political and social circumstances. More importantly, intensive literary discussions during the Nativist Literature Debates of 1977 and 1978 and afterwards in the early 1980s during debates on the question of political unification or independence also provided the potential conditions for a substantial localization movement for Taiwan literature.
In the aftermath of the Formosa Incident\(^\text{31}\) (1979, 美麗島事件/高雄事件), Taiwan witnessed an increase in opposition activity such as the localization movement, the softening of Nationalist authoritarian rule, and the establishment of the Democratic Progressive Party in 1986. Prior to the lifting of martial law in 1987, the emerging Taiwanese nationalism had developed only to a limited extent. When the unexpected death of Chiang Ching-kuo (蔣經國, 1910-1988) resulted in the presidency of Lee Teng-hui (李登輝, 1923-) in 1988, Taiwanese nationalism had a chance to prevail. Although the Lee Teng-hui-led Nationalist government finally responded to calls for democratic reform, the process remained arduous since, in the post-martial period, Taiwan’s political landscape still faced the continuing presence of the remnants of conservative power, as well as the military threat and united front policy posed by the PRC regime.

3. The instability of “Taiwan” as a category

As a result of its experience of being continuously ruled by foreign regimes, the name Taiwan and what it represents remains an unstable category even as it has followed a process of political transformation that has led to three decades of democracy. In the international community, as China claims ownership of Taiwan as a wayward province which is to be taken back some day, in global events or organizations such as the Olympics or the World Health Organization, Taiwan is not allowed to show its national flag or use its official title “Republic of China” or the name "Taiwan". Instead, “Chinese Taipei” is used. Even though it functions as a nation state with a healthy

\(^{31}\) Also known as the “Kaohsiung/Gaolxiong Incident” (高雄事件). This was the result of a series of oppositional activities but the triggering cause was the pro-democracy demonstrations that occurred in Kaohsiung to commemorate Human Rights Day on December 10, 1979. The event then evolved into a violent confrontation between members of the crowd and the police.
democracy, it cannot be recognized as such and its status remains ambiguous.

As for the domestic cultural field, the way that Taiwanese intellectuals have responded to the instability of “Taiwan” through the decades has varied according to both the corresponding context and individual perspective. For example, when Wu Zhuoliu (吳濁流) was about to establish the bi-monthly literary magazine *Taiwan Wenyi* (台灣文藝)\(^\text{32}\) in 1964, he was advised by the Nationalist authorities to replace “Taiwan” in the title with “Chinese” (中華). Under the circumstances in which the terms “Taiwan” and “Taiwan literature” (台灣文學) were suppressed and considered as political taboos, his insistence on using the title *Taiwan Wenyi* by claiming that “we are committed to promoting local literature and the spirit of this magazine will be undermined if ‘Taiwan’ was removed from the title,”\(^\text{33}\) explored the tolerance level of the dominant discourse.

In addition to Wu Zhuoliu’s strategy of emphasizing the local character of *Taiwan Wenyi*, in later developments the revival of Taiwan literature generally progressed under the guise of local themes. In general, Taiwan literature was discussed as Xiangtu/Nativist literature (鄉土文學) during 1970s when the concept of Xiangtu was constructed under the referencing ideology of Chinese nationalism. Later in the early 1980s, a pragmatic term “Bentu/Localist literature” (本土文學) replaced Nativist literature when Taiwanese consciousness became more prevalent, and which eventually reverted to “Taiwan literature”. Finally, during the post-martial law period starting from 1987, “Taiwan literature” gradually acquired more cultural capital, incorporating the various forms of literature produced on the island. It developed as an individual literary discipline and became viewed as parallel to “Chinese literature” in the mid-1990s.

In the face of the development of Taiwan literature in the early 1980s, some

\(^{32}\) The title “Taiwan Wenyi” was less politically sensitive and was more likely to be granted registration than “Taiwan Wenxue”.

\(^{33}\) Peng Ruijin (彭瑞金). 台灣新文學運動 40 年. p. 127.
intellectuals, however, expressed their concern for its future. For example, in “Two kinds of literary spirits” (兩種文學心靈)” published in Book Review and Bibliography (書評書目, January 1981), literary critic Zhan Hongzhi (詹宏志) commented that all the efforts of literary creation made in Taiwan over the past thirty years may be eventually in vain, as in the long run, these could just be categorized as frontier literature of Chinese literature. This triggered subsequent debates between ‘Chinese knots’ (中國結) and ‘Taiwanese knots’ (台灣結) 34.

In the pro-unification camp, writer Chen Yingzhen (陳映真, 1937-2016) maintained his previous view by asserting that Taiwan literature was a branch of Chinese modern literature. Stimulated by Chen’s inclination to Chinese Nationalism, localists then took further steps in examining the special character and autonomy of Taiwan literature and actively advocated that Taiwan literature should be deemed as an individual subject parallel to Chinese literature. This eventually led to the restoration of the term “Taiwan literature” by the mid-1980s.

Although the authoritarian rule of the Nationalists had loosened to the extent that literary circles and a very few individual scholars were able to begin their research in the early 1980s, in academia, the domestic study of Taiwan literature still remained in its infancy throughout the 1980s. As a result, the quantity of research from the Mainland put Taiwan’s localist literary circles under pressure, sparking concern that “Taiwan might lose the chance of actively and convincingly interpreting this important element of its culture history and identity,” 35 Under such circumstances, Ye Shitao’s (葉石濤) An Outline History of Taiwan Literature (台灣文學史綱) published in 1987 and Peng

Ruijin’s (彭瑞金) *Forty Years of the Taiwanese New Literature Movement* (台灣新文學運動四十年) published in 1991 carried the burden of expectation from native literary circles, and presenting a literary history with a Taiwan perspective in contrast to what was written in China.

The way that scholars in China embraced Taiwan literature as a part of Chinese literature under the influence of China’s cultural united front policy was questioned by Taiwanese intellectuals who argued that the right of interpreting Taiwan literature should be dominated by Taiwan’s academia, and Taiwan literature should not be used as a tool of political conflict at the expense of its academic value. As Lin Ruiming (林瑞明) observed, nearly every volume of research into Taiwan literature produced in the PRC included a political statement either in the preface or conclusion to the effect that: “Taiwan has been the holy territory of China”, which was originally the carved inscription of a stele in the Taiwan Hall in the Great Hall of the People.36

Meanwhile, Taiwan literature was presented in a somewhat contradictory way in the international academy. On the one hand, it was gradually studied, lectured on and translated as an independent academic area by overseas scholars such as those in Japan, Europe and the United States. On the other hand, the overall attitude toward Taiwan literature was still influenced by political factors such as the PRC’s One China Policy and Taiwan’s uncertain international status.

Over time the instability of ‘Taiwan’ as a category has reduced in the domestic sphere compared to the international arena. Nevertheless, discursively, scholars and writers who engage with it are necessarily embedded in a complex political landscape. Returning to the case of Li Qiao, matters are made all the more complex since the trilogy was written at a time when Taiwan was still under the influence of martial law

---

and when narratives regarding Taiwanese consciousness were conveyed in an indirect manner. To account for this, this thesis employs several theoretical modes of narratology so as to explore Li Qiao’s multi-faceted narrative in *Wintry Night Trilogy* where the dual status of “being a work of literature” and of “being a work a national literature” is simultaneously presented.

**4. Methodological approach**

In this section, I first explain three interrelated terms: “narrative”, “discourse” and “representation” and the connections between them. Secondly, I discuss the analytical approach of this thesis by introducing a theoretical framework based on Bakhtin’s dialogic discourse.

According to Onega and Landa, a narrative is “the semiotic representation of a series of events meaningfully connected in a temporal and causal way. […] Narratives can therefore be constructed using a variety of semiotic media: written or spoken language, visual images, gestures and acting, as well as a combination of these.”37 Brooker’s view is similar: “Narrative is a recounted tale or story, whether of fictional or non-fictional material.”38 As for the relationship between “narrative” and “representation”, I agree with what Onega and Landa, as well as Gerald, have emphasized regarding the “representation” of cultural works. As Onega and Landa put it: “[…], a narrative is not ‘a series of events’, but ‘the representation of a series of events.’”39 Gerald gave a similar view suggesting that “Narrative may be defined as the representation of real or fictive events and situations in a time sequence.”40

---

For the meaning of “discourse” and its connection to “narrative”, Onega and Landa have provided a general explanation: “A narrative text is also an instance of discourse, of linguistic action. Discourse is the use of language for communicative purposes in specific contextual and generic situations.”\(^{41}\) In comparison, Fairclough pays more attention to the social-cultural connection: “a ‘discourse’ is a way of signifying a particular domain of social practice from a particular perspective.”\(^{42}\)

With regard to the issue of how a discourse is presented, Hall distinguishes two approaches: semiotic and discursive. A semiotic approach is concerned with how language produces meaning and how its poetics are represented. The discursive approach is concerned with the effects and consequences of representation.\(^{43}\) In essence, it examines how language and representation produce meaning, and how the knowledge in which a particular discourse produces and connects with power is transmitted.\(^{44}\)

I argue that Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* participated in reconstructing the discourse of Taiwan’s history and the Taiwanese national imaginary, and in addition, that the cultural representation corresponded to the changing social-political at the time of production. Starting from this premise, the analytical framework of this thesis is designed to cover three basic theoretical concepts: Bakhtin’s approaches to dialogic discourse, post colonialism, and reader reception. The following accounts explain my considerations in applying these theoretical concepts in this thesis.

### 4.1. Bakhtin’s approaches to dialogic discourse

This study holds the primary assumption that the narrative of the *Wintry Night*  

\(^{44}\) Ibid. p. 6.
Trilogy is simultaneously involved in the aesthetic representation and construction of historical discourse. In other words, it is engaged in reconstructing Taiwan’s past as well as building a Taiwanese imaginary. I argue that the narrative of Wintry Night Trilogy, in regard to the representation of Taiwaneseness, is involved in a process where the narrated information is sometimes involved in obscure expression, and sometimes is explicitly asserted. The presentation medium is, to a certain extent, suggested through contextual, dialogic, intertextual, rhetorical, connotative, or other means, depending on the circumstances.

In this regard, Bakhtin’s approach to narratology, in particular, his insight into dialogic discourse, intertextuality, polyphony and social heteroglossia, provides this thesis with a fundamental analytical guideline. Bakhtin’s theoretical concept is applicable in this thesis because his approach to narratology is based on the idea that individual consciousness is a “social-ideological fact.” According to Bakhtin, language is ideologically saturated, and is also a world view. It is also a “concrete opinion, inspiring a maximum of mutual understanding in all sphere of ideological life.” Hence, in order to understand the essence of the individual consciousness, so as to understand the social-ideological effect that Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy brought about, the presentation of “utterance” is of significance.

As Bakhtin suggests, “every utterance participates in the ‘unitary language’ and at the same time partakes of social and historical heteroglossia”, which works as the centripetal force of language, and moreover, is certainly perceived as the constituting

---

46 Ibid., p. 54.
47 Ibid., p. 259
condition for the possibility of independent consciousness.\textsuperscript{48} In this regard, the formation of ideology needs to account, as Bakhtin argued, at both the micro and macro level, for individual consciousness and, for the whole social arena of meaning production in the various ideological fields with the process of their historical change.

Kristeva developed the idea of “intertextuality” to explain Bakhtin’s dialogic approach to language. For Kristeva, “intertextuality” refers to a “permutation of text” within the semiotic project of textual stratification and typology to specify different textual arrangements within historical and social texts.\textsuperscript{49} Kristeva further developed the concept of the semiotic and symbolic fields to explain her idea of a signifying process. The semiotic is a state characterized by pre-symbolic drives and the symbolic concerns the state. With the acquisition of language, the subject enters into social position and all the rules and relations which underpin society.\textsuperscript{50}

The theory developed by Gérard Genette is also worthy of attention. He developed an integrated theory of what he terms “transtextuality,” to explain how texts can be systematically interpreted and understood. Hence, this thesis adopts an integrated analytical framework of intertextuality in which the concepts of Bakhtin, Kristeva and Gennete are applied to examine Li Qiao’s intertextual approach in the \textit{Wintry Night Trilogy}.

Multilingualism is the act of using two or more languages, either by an individual speaker, or by a community of speakers, in a speech situation or environment.\textsuperscript{51}

Amongst various forms of linguistic hybridity, “code-switching” and “glossing” are the discursive and textual practices Li Qiao represents frequently in the \textit{Wintry Night}

\textsuperscript{48} Ibid., p. 73.
\textsuperscript{50} Allen, G. \textit{Intertextuality}. p. 47.
**Trilogy.** Code switching is when a speaker or writer shifts between different languages or varieties of a language. Glossing is when an explanatory comment is added to a text, an interpretation or paraphrase. Mark Amsler explains “glossing” in an abstract or extensive sense. He contends that by “deteritorializing textual meaning from authorial intention or the narrative’s historical circumstances”, the paratexts produce “textual meaning as an-other.” As such, I examine how and why Li Qiao’s uses of code-switching and glossing in the narrative provide insight into the emergence of the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism, how multi-lingual texts are comprehended and produced, and how they link to the social context implied by the narrative.

**4.2. Post-colonial theory**

As Ashcroft et al., suggest, post-colonialism has been concerned with “the ways and extent to which representation and language are crucial to identity formation and to the construction of subjectivity”. In the sense of post-colonialism, language has been a vehicle for subverting colonial power, and I argue that the discourse of Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* played a role in presenting a process to dismantle the various aspects, both direct and indirect, of those institutional and cultural forces that had maintained Sino-centric cultural values. Hence, this thesis will explore the process of how the signs of Taiwaneseness developed and transformed from a marginalized place into a position where a challenge against the authoritative or canonic discourse of Chinese nationalism became possible.

Thus, the thesis will rely on concepts of post-colonialism to investigate what has been presented in Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*. In addition to the general accounts of

---

52 Amsler, M. *Affective Literacies: Writing and Multilingualism in the Late Middle Ages*. p.215.
post-colonial concepts, post-colonial arguments constructed by Lacan, Fanon and Bhabha, and in addition, the theory of Saussure’s “sign system” will be applied. Lacan’s insight into the formation of individual identity is worthy of attention. His theory of the “mirror stage” explains the process whereby a baby develops its identity distinct from others, but at the same time, is dependent on the image of others to determine itself. Besides, Lacan’s use of the terms “the other” and its distinction from “the Other” is useful for explaining the development of self-consciousness of the main characters in Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy. For Lacan, “the other” resembles the self, which is discovered by a child when it looks in the mirror and becomes aware of itself as a separate being. In post-colonial theory, “the other” can refer to the colonized “others” who are marginalized by the colonial discourse. In contrast, “the Other” refers to the great Other, in whose gaze the subject gains identity.

Fanon’s analysis into the psyche of the colonized people provides insights for us to understand how a mimic man is developed, and as such, for this thesis to examine “the collaborators” described in Wintry Night Trilogy. As Fanon suggests, for a black man attempting to escape the association of blackness with evil, he must wear a white mask, and thus the cultural values are internalized or “epidermalized” into consciousness. Under such conditions the black man becomes alienated from himself.

Saussure’s theory considers language to be a system of signs. Each sign is made up of a “signifier” and a “signified”, the former refers to a material form and the signified as the concept, the meaning or the thing indicated by the signifier. Drawing on Saussure’s sign system, I examine how Li Qiao’s post-colonial representation in the

---

54 Ibid., p. 155.
55 Ibid., p. 155.
Wintry Night Trilogy was involved in establishing a discourse that was opposed to the dominant discourse in both the narrational and story contexts.

In examining the relationship between the colonizer and the colonized, Bhabha stresses their interdependence and the mutual construction of their subjectivities. Bhabha contends that all cultural statements and systems are constructed in what he calls the “third space of enunciation”\(^58\). Cultural identity always emerges in this contradictory and ambivalent “in-between” space that carries the burden and meaning of culture.\(^59\) These concepts are useful for this thesis in order to examine how Bhabha’s postcolonial insight into “the third space”, “ambivalence” and “hybridity” can be applied in analyzing Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy.

4.3. Reader-response approach

According to Bakhtin, the ideology or significance of a text is not a structure, but “a process and the result of interaction,” and further, “meaning is recognized only in the process of active, responsive understanding.”\(^60\) Indeed, in the case of the Wintry Night Trilogy; I argue that readers play a substantial role in the course of meaning making. For Eagleton, “meaning is not deliberately planned by the writer, but rather reached by the reader through the spontaneous play of the meaning of the interplay between writing and reading,”\(^61\) Bakhtin’s concept of dialogism and varied voices also includes the role of readers.

According to Eagleton, reception theory examines the reader’s role in literature,

\(^{58}\) Bhabha, H. K. The Location of Culture. p. 37.
\(^{59}\) Ibid., p.38.
\(^{60}\) Quoted by Alexakos, K. in Being a Teacher/Researcher: A Primer on Doing Authentic Inquiry Research on Teaching and Learning. p. 16.
\(^{61}\) Regan, S. (ed.) The Eagleton Reader. p. 64.
and as such is a fairly novel development. “All understanding is productive: it is always ‘understanding otherwise’, realizing new potential in the text, making a difference to it.” In my opinion, in order to discuss the *Wintry Night Trilogy*, and its relationship with the construction of Taiwanese nationalism during the period from the late 1970s to the turn of the 21st century, the representation of “reader-response” is certainly a significant factor.

I argue that, in order to explore the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism in relation to Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the reception history of the trilogy plays a significant role and an integrated analytical approach is needed. The theoretical framework covers four interrelated concepts: Jauss’s notion of “horizon of expectations”, Deleuze and Guattari’s theory of “minor Literature”, Bourdieu and Guillory’s notion of cultural capital and canon formation, and Fish’s theory of “interpretive communities”.

Since Jauss’s theory concerns the question of how literary works have affected and are affected by current conditions and events, his notion of “horizon of expectations” is worthy of reference when one deals with the reception history of Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*. “Horizon of expectations” refers to “the mental set or predisposition that readers bring to a work of art, formed through their previous experiences of genre and style, and their beliefs and assumptions about meanings likely to be encoded in a particular species of work. The horizon of expectations differs in different periods and cultures.” To explore the horizon of expectations in regard to Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the transformation of the literary canon and the distribution of cultural capital in the literary field of Taiwan first need to be taken into consideration. Bourdieu and

---

63 Ibid., p. 62.
Guillory provide insights into these issues.

For Bourdieu, cultural capital refers to the collection of symbolic elements that one acquires through being part of a particular social class.\(^65\) “Cultural capital” comes in three forms: “embodied”, “objectified”, and “institutionalized”; these are essential elements for us to be able to measure what kind cultural capital has been acquired and accumulated by *Wintry Night Trilogy* over time. Bourdieu’s notions of “field” and “habitus” are also worthy of reference as they provide insights for us to understand the way that the native literary habitus evolved in Taiwan, as well as the limitations and potential of the native literary field.

As the reception history of *Wintry Night Trilogy* bears similarities to the institutionalization process of Taiwan literature, Guillory’s idea of canon formation is essential as a vehicle through which to understand the differences and similarities between the two parallel developments. In addition, Deleuze and Guattari propose three characteristics embodied in a Minor Literature: “the deterritorialization of language”, “the connection of the individual to a political immediacy”, and “the collective assemblage of enunciation”.\(^66\) Their notion of minor literature is useful for examining the historical transition of Taiwan literature during the period from the mid 1940s to 1977 and to explore the roles that *Taiwan Wenyi* and Li Qiao played during this transition.

Fish contends that for the same readers reading either different or the same texts, the key factor leading to the differing interpretations lies in those readers’ varying reading methods, rather than in the differences of the texts. Likewise, different texts could also be interpreted in the same way by the same reader. He further developed the concept of “interpretive communities” where members share a reading methodology.


and “make certain shared assumptions prior to the process of reading that influence their interpretation of the texts.” I argue that Fish’s concept of “interpretive communities” provides an analytical basis for this thesis to explore the way that *Wintry Night Trilogy* was interpreted over the period, both before, and after the lifting of martial law (1987).

5. Overview

Based on the theoretical frame discussed above, the analysis of this thesis is divided into four chapters. Chapter Two provides an integrated analytical framework of intertextuality, including the concepts of Bakhtin, Kristeva and Gennete. It first explores the intertextual genesis of Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*. Second, it discusses the transition of Li Qiao’s writing strategy between 1974 and 1977 and investigates his intertextual use of various historical resources. Third, it explores the intertextual relationship between Li Qiao’s three short stories that were written in the late 1960s and the third novel *The Lone Lamp* that was written in 1978 and 1979.

The analysis in Chapter Three consists of three main topics. First, drawing on Saussure’s idea of a sign system, a case study centering on the theme of “headhunting” is presented. The aim is to explore the role that “headhunting” played in the sign system and the meanings of its associated significations with the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism. Second, by employing Bhabha’s notion of “the third space”, this chapter discusses Li Qiao’s presentation of Chineseness and Taiwaneseness in *Wintry Night Trilogy*, and its relation to hybrid identity. Third, based on the assumption that the narrative of the trilogy is characterized by critical comments and evaluations, in addition to stories and plots, this chapter thus examines what the intruded judgments are,

---

who the targets are, and what the post-colonial significance of this critical discourse is.

Chapter Four deals with two forms of multilingual representation: “code-switching” and “glossing”. In *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the narrative uses several linguistic varieties, including Mandarin Chinese, Hakka, Holo, Japanese and Atayal that are interrelated, either in pronunciation, meaning, or character pattern. First, it examines the alternative ways of reading the narratives provided by Li Qiao in his use of code-switching and glossing. Second, it explores how these multi-lingual texts are comprehended and produced, and how they link to the social context implied by the narrative.

Chapter Five examines the reception history of *Wintry Night Trilogy*. First, drawing on Deleuze and Guattari’s notion of minor literature, it examines how Li Qiao’s literary works were represented in postwar Taiwan. Second, applying Jauss’s notion of “horizon of expectations” and Fish’s theory of “interpretive communities”, it examines the development of native interpretive communities and the way that *Wintry Night Trilogy* was interpreted. Third, applying Bourdieu’s notions of “capital”, “field”, “habitus” and “practice”, it explores what the reader responses were and the way that various forms of cultural capital were acquired, both before, and after, the lifting of martial law. Lastly, I discuss the role that Li Qiao and *Wintry Night Trilogy* played in the process of the institutionalization of Taiwan literature, as well as the contribution made by other contemporary cultural agents.
Chapter Two

Constructing a Sign as National Discourse –
Genesis and Intertextuality in Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy

In this chapter, I argue that, Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy is involved in considerable intertextual operations, which play a significant role, both consciously and unconsciously, in shaping the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism. I will focus on examining the way that Li Qiao’s use of intertextuality serves to reveal and articulate Taiwanese identity, with the aim of exposing a system of sociopolitical, as well as ideological and aesthetic values embedded in the work of Li Qiao and deployed to influence readers in specific ways.

The idea of “intertextuality” can be traced back to Saussure’s notion of the differential sign, in which he argued that “if all signs are in some way differential, they can be understood not only as non-referential in nature but also as shadowed by a vast number of possible relations.”¹ According to Allen’s explanation, when a reader reads a piece of literature, he/she becomes aware that the signs deployed in the text have their reference “not to objects in the world but to the literary system where the text is produced”.² The term “intertextuality” was firstly coined by Julia Kristeva in the mid-1960s in her essays introducing the work of Mikhail Bakhtin. Kristeva used the term to explain Bakhtin’s dialogic aspect of language which is concerned with three main concepts: “the otherness of language”, its “internal stratification”, as well as with what Bakhtin calls “polyphony” or “heteroglossia”.

In comparison to Saussure’s idea that the relational nature of the word stems

---

¹ Allen, G. Intertextuality. 2000, p. 11.
² Ibid., p. 11.
from a vision of language seen as a generalized and abstract system, Bakhtin has argued that the nature of the word derives from “the word’s existence within specific social sites, special social registers and specific moments of utterance and reception.”

Clearly, Bakhtin’s approach to the idea of intertextuality is more concerned than Saussure’s with social context; it is also applicable in this chapter for analyzing Li Qiao’s use of intertextuality in *Wintry Night Trilogy* because I argue that it is likely to affect the way in which Li Qiao writes and the way in which readers read and interpret the work.

The intertextual nature of texts is indeed a major theme of Bakhtin’s dialogism. Bakhtin’s idea of intertextuality derives from his observation that the linguistic sign is “a non-unitary, non-stable, relational unit,” consisting of three major phenomena, as previously mentioned. The first characteristic, “the otherness of language”, is a ubiquitous phenomenon because words used in any particular situation have an “otherness” about them, and people’s speech is always filled with others’ words.

As to the relationship between language and individual consciousness, according to Bakhtin, language lies on the borderline between oneself and the other. The word in language is half someone else’s, and it becomes one’s own only when the speaker populates it through an act of “appropriation.” In addition, as Bakhtin argues, “any utterance is a link in the chain of speech communion…, and each utterance is characterized primarily by a particular referentially semantic content.” Texts and utterances are as such shaped by prior texts that they are responding to, and by subsequent texts that they anticipate.

---

3 Ibid., p. 11.
4 Ibid., p. 11.
5 Ibid., p. 21.
7 Ibid., p. 84.
8 Ibid., p. 75.
As for the notion of heteroglossia, Bakhtin’s theory states that “at any given moment of its historical existence, language is heteroglot from top to bottom: it represents the co-existence of socio-ideological contradictions between the present and the past, between differing epochs of the past, between different socio-ideological groups in the present, [...].”9 In other words, heteroglossia is language’s ability to contain within it many voices, one’s own and others.10 Bakhtin’s insight into the ideological nature of language is also worthy of reference. As he argued, language is ideologically saturated, and it is stratified not only into linguistic dialects in the strict sense of the word, but also into languages that are socio-ideological.11

Influenced by Bakhtin’s vision of dialogic language, Kristeva introduced intertextuality as a “permutation of texts” and argued that “in a space of a given text, several utterances, taken from other texts, intersect and neutralize one another.”12 For Kristeva, intertextuality operates “within the semiotic project of textual stratification and typology to specify different textual arrangements within historical and social texts.”13 Kristeva’s viewpoint covers the scope of Bakhtin’s three main concepts (explained above) and according to the theory which she further elaborated on, she suggested that a text is a network of sign systems situated in relation to other systems of signifying practices.14 Kristeva also developed the concept of the semiotic and symbolic fields in an attempt to explain her idea of the signifying process. According to Allen’s explanation, the semiotic is “a state characterized by pre-symbolic drives”15 and the symbolic concerns the state, after the full acquisition of language, which

---

14 Ibid., p. 568.
Lacan called the symbolic order. With the acquisition of language, the subject enters into all the social positions and the rules and relations which strengthen society.\textsuperscript{16}

In addition, Kristeva further proposed the idea of “transposition” which refers to the ability of a signifying process to pass from one sign system to another, to exchange and permutate them. Hence, transposition plays an essential role as it implies the abandonment of a former sign system, the passage to a second via an instinctual intermediary common to the two systems, and the articulation of the new system with its new representability.\textsuperscript{17} To summarize, both Bakhtin and Kristeva held a consensus view on the notion of “dialogue”, and have agreed that it is “dialogue” which establishes a relation between author, work, reader, society, and history.

Subsequent developments have revealed that textual analysis would no longer be concerned with the relation of language to a referent, but with signification, the relation of signs and texts in sign interaction to other signs.\textsuperscript{18} The theory developed by Genette\textsuperscript{19} is representative of such a trend. In his trilogy, composed of \textit{The Architect: An Introduction} (1992), \textit{Palimpsests: Literature in the Second Degree} (1997), and \textit{Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation} (1997), Genette developed an integrated theory of what he termed “transtextuality,” which emphasizes “all that sets the text in relationship, whether obvious or concealed”\textsuperscript{20}. He used the concept of transtextuality to show how texts can be systematically interpreted and understood. According to Genette’s theory, the term transtextuality can be subdivided into five specific categories: intertextuality, paratextuality, metatextuality, hypertextuality, and architextuality.

\textsuperscript{16} Ibid., p. 48.
\textsuperscript{17} Ibid., p. 52.
\textsuperscript{18} Makaryk. 1993, p. 569.
\textsuperscript{19} Gérard Genette is a contemporary French theorist and critic.
The first category “intertextuality” refers to “a relationship of co-presence between two texts or among several texts” and as “the actual presence of one text within another”\(^{21}\) thus providing “a pragmatic and determinable intertextual relationship between specific elements of individual texts”\(^{22}\).

In the second category, “paratextuality”, a paratext “marks those elements which lie on the threshold of the text and which help to direct and control the reception of a text by its readers”\(^{23}\). This threshold consists of a peritext and an epitext. The peritext includes elements such as titles, chapter titles, prefaces and notes, which according to Genette, could have a major effect on the interpretation of a text\(^{24}\). The epitext consists of “elements outside of the text in question”\(^{25}\), such as interviews, reviews by critics, private letters, and other authorial and editorial discussions.

The third category is “metatextuality”, in which “a text takes up a relation of ‘commentary’ to another text.”\(^{26}\) In Genette’s own words, “it unites a given text to another, of which it speaks without necessarily citing it, in fact sometimes even without naming it.”\(^{27}\) The fourth category “hypertextuality” involves “any relationship uniting a text B to an earlier text A, upon which it is grafted in a manner that is not that of commentary”.\(^{28}\) The earlier text is called “hypotext”, and therefore hypertextuality represents “the relation between a text and a hypotext or genre on which it is based but which it transforms, modifies, elaborates or extends”\(^{29}\).

---

\(^{21}\) Ibid., p. 101.
\(^{22}\) Ibid., p. 101.
\(^{23}\) Ibid., p. 103.
\(^{24}\) Ibid., pp. 103-104.
\(^{25}\) Ibid., p. 103.
\(^{26}\) Ibid., p. 102.
\(^{28}\) Ibid., p. 5.
The fifth category “architextuality” relates to the designation of a text as part of a genre or genres. The architextual nature of texts also includes the thematic and figurative expectations of texts. Genette states that a very important factor of this type is “the reader’s expectations, and thus their reception of the work.”

In this chapter, I adopt an integrated analytical framework of intertextuality in which the concepts of Bakhtin, Kristeva and Gennete are considered. Starting from the point where the idea of intertextuality is embedded, this chapter explores the intertextual operations in Li Qiao’s work and how they are related to the ideological structures and specific social situations of Taiwan in the late 1970s and the early 1980s. First, I examine the genesis of the intertextuality in Li Qiao’s Winter Night Trilogy. Second, I discuss the change of Li Qiao’s writing strategy during the period from 1974 to 1977 and investigate Li Qiao’s inter-textual use of various historical resources. Third, I explore the inter-textual relationship between Li Qiao’s three short stories written in the late 1960s and the third novel The Lone Lamp written in 1978-79.

1. The genesis of a signifying system

Founded in September 1972 by the Hong Jianquan Cultural and Educational Foundation (洪建全文教基金會), Book Review and Bibliography (書評書目) was a monthly journal (1972-1981). It was the first journal during the postwar period to introduce new books and publish book reviews. Hong Xingfu (洪醒夫, 1949-1983) had been a primary school teacher since he graduated from Taichung Teachers College in 1962. He commenced his literary creation in the early 1960s and focused especially on depicting the life of people living in rural villages. In 1974, he was also

---

recruited as a special contract journalist by *Book Review and Bibliography*.

In an interview conducted by Hong Xingfu in 1974\(^1\), Li Qiao revealed his ideas for writing about three generations of his family history who had lived in Fanzai Wood from a numbers of years prior to the first Sino-Japanese War (1895) to the years approaching to the end of the World War Two (the early 1890s to the mid-1940s).

When asked about the writing project at the time and whether, or not, it would be narrated on the basis of Taiwan under Japanese colonial rule, and how the local materials were to be used, Li Qiao made it clear that the scope of the novel would not be confined to Taiwan’s native character even though the story relates to native culture and issues.

Li Qiao also revealed that his intention was to tell the story of “that era” (a few years before Taiwan was ceded to Japan in 1895 to the end of the WWII in 1945), and the narrative was to be divided into three periods. The main theme of the narrative is “mother’s love” and this runs throughout the story.\(^2\) Li Qiao simultaneously linked notions of “mother” to “dadi” (the land/大地), and suggested that “mother” is in a sense an “image” (意象). Since human beings are from dadi, he said, and would return to dadi in the long run, “mother” is therefore the embodiment of “dadi”.\(^3\)

The impression given by Li Qiao is twofold. First, he intended to write a novel depicting three generations of his family and, in addition to that, “maternal love” and “dadi/land” are the major themes of the narrative. Second, he wanted to tell the history of Taiwan’s past, which, as mentioned in the interview, was the time of his parents’ generation and relates to “events that resulted in major social uproar and

---

\(^1\) Hong Xingfu (洪醒夫). “Great Sympathy and Nostalgia” (偉大的同情與大地的鄉愁—李喬訪問記/Weida de tongqing yu dadi de xiangchou — Li Qiao fang wen ji), in *A Complete Bibliography of Research Source Material of Contemporary Writers in Taiwan. V. 27. Li Qiao*. (台灣現當代作家研究 資料彙編. 27 李喬). pp. 161-163.

\(^2\) Ibid., p. 163.

\(^3\) Ibid., p. 163.
significant changes in Taiwan”. As such, the spatial reference of “dadi” is likely to be connected to “Taiwan” even though Li Qiao did not make an explicit statement to this effect. What Li Qiao implied at the time seems to be something which remains as yet untold in the official discourse.

Clearly, at the preliminary stage when Li Qiao was sketching the outline of his trilogy, both micro and macro histories were considered. In addition to his family story, and the history of “that era”, Li Qiao also indicated that he was going to produce a literary work that would be more profound in its genre, rather than being merely described as a “nativist” novel. In other words, he was going to draw his material from local sources, but the way that the material to be presented would not be confined by nativist characteristics.

Li Qiao’s motives can be further discussed as follows. First, as a literary writer, during the period from 1962 to 1974, he had already published at least 150 short stories in various literary/cultural publications, both mainstream and non-mainstream, such as the China Daily News (中華日報), the Central Daily News (中央日報), the Youth Literary World (幼獅文藝) and the Ren Jian Magazine (人間雜誌). According to Li Qiao’s own classification set out in the early 1980s, his writing career consisted of three stages. During the first stage (1962-1967), 69 short stories and novellas were published, and it was in 1967 that Li Qiao’s short story “That Deer Tree” (那棵鹿仔樹) won the Award for Taiwanese Literature (台灣文學獎) given by Taiwan Wenyi (台灣文藝). In the second stage (1968-1976), Li Qiao was involved in writing short stories based on his childhood experiences, and he gradually changed his focus to social reality issues. The success that Li Qiao had achieved during his short story writing phase encouraged him to take up the challenge of novel writing which thus became the focus of the third stage (1975-) of his writing career.

34 Ibid., p. 163.
In the context of intertextuality, the interview reveals Li Qiao’s notion of novel writing as functioning as an epitext to the trilogy as a whole. Notably, it consists of certain elements at the beginning of the text where “dadi”, “maternal love” and “the history of that era” have been included, and which are likely to play a role in the interpretation of the trilogy.

The external circumstances of this time in Taiwan’s history are factors that need to be taken into consideration. The first half of the 1970s was a time when Taiwan encountered a series of diplomatic setbacks, which not only encouraged many intellectuals taking the lead in asking for political and social reform, but also encouraged the development of Nativist literature (鄉土文學). Li Qiao’s principal wish in narrating the history of “that era” is likely to be his response to the social-political changes of the time. However, in his interview with Hong Xingfu, Li Qiao’s larger-scale intention was somewhat disguised both consciously and unconsciously. Instead, more time was given to an in-depth explanation of the two main themes “dadi” and “mother”.

The question as to whether Li Qiao had developed a sense of Taiwanese consciousness at the time of the interview can further be understood using Kristeva’s concept of the semiotic and symbolic fields. The psychological state that Li Qiao discussed in his plan was initially stimulated by his pre-symbolic or semiotic drives and then in the interview he introduced the symbolic realm by making his statement. The references to Li Qiao’s utterances of “dadi” and “mother” in the interview are very much a part of the dominant discourse of Taiwan’s culture and society in the 1970s. However, Li Qiao’s articulation demonstrates the way in which it is possible for the meaning of a text to be understood simultaneously both “inside” and “outside” that text. In other words, Li Qiao’s utterances possess a meaning in what Kristeva
calls “the historical and social text” dominated by social norms and one that has potential implications.

As to the symbolic realm, Li Qiao’s discourse regarding “mother” is ostensibly orthodox for the postwar period in Taiwan when the teachings of Confucius were a major discipline and maternal love was highly praised as a virtue. Moreover, the creation of a novel in which the narrative possessed native features was also justified during the 1970s, a time when a native consciousness expressed within the context of Chinese national identity was tolerated, and during which the popularity of “Nativist Literature” exemplified such a trend.

Hence, Li Qiao’s utterance of “mother” and “dadi” served as two signs, which “provide the basis for an objective sociological understanding of individual consciousness and ideology.” As Bakhtin has argued, “signs represent, depict, or stand for something lying outside themselves, and besides, they do not simply exist as of a reality, they also reflect and refract another reality.”

In sum, the changing political and social context of Taiwan over the course of the 1970s and the 1980s provided the two signs of “dadi” and “mother” in Li Qiao’s text with much potential for the development of a new Taiwanese imaginary. This can also be understood from Chung’s explanation about the relationship between woman’s utterance and the symbolic function. As she has argued, although woman is situated as “the unconscious of the symbolic order, speaking a repressed truth which is outside of time, and which has the potential to displace, disrupt or break the symbolic order.”

---

37 Ibid., pp. 50-51.
Indeed, the impression given by Li Qiao in the interview resembles “a marginal discourse which descends into the (female) body but by so doing truth becomes ‘lost in itself’ and ‘emerges only in the gaps of an identity’”.39

The relationship between dadi and mother derived from the semiotic field, but the terms also possessed great potential for becoming involved in the establishment of a discourse relating to the cultural aspects of Taiwanese identity in the symbolic realm. In this regard, any operation of intertextuality is likely to make the ideological sign vital and mutable and also, cause the sign to be a refracting and distorting medium.

2. Historical material and intertextuality

The Taiwan of the mid 1970s was, on the one hand, a time when Chinese ideology was still dominant and identifying with Taiwanese nationalism was rare; while on the other hand, it was a time when political opposition activity had begun to develop. Li Qiao’s dilemma as to precisely how to depict Taiwan’s history in the course of creating Wintry Night Trilogy should be understood in this context. It is reflected in a systematic change in his writing strategy during the period from 1974 to 1977. By employing Kristeva’s concept of semiotic and symbolic fields, I explore how a socially signifying system was established during this stage, and what its implications for language were. Secondly, I examine Li Qiao’s use of various historical resources by employing the concept of intertextuality.

2.1. The initial stage of data collection

Although some of his literary works were accepted by the mainstream or official literary publications, Li Qiao was more closely affiliated with the local literary group which centred around the local literary magazine Taiwan Wenyi following its

39 Ibid., p. 77.
establishment in 1964. For Li Qiao, his approach to writing *Wintry Night Trilogy* was, to a certain extent, inspired by his predecessor Zhong Zhaozheng (鍾肇政, 1926-). Of a similar Hakka background and also having initially chosen school teaching as a career, Zhong was a generation older than Li Qiao, and was the chief editor of *Taiwan Wenyi* in the second half of the 1960s and throughout the 1970s. Li Qiao was also a constant contributor to *Taiwan Wenyi*. More importantly, Li Qiao and Zhong had been maintaining a regular correspondence since 1968.\(^4^0\)

In a letter to Zhong Zhaozheng dated October 24, 1974, Li Qiao mentioned the efforts he had made in collecting historical resources for his novel. This was nearly two months after the interview with Hong Xingfu:

> I have been reading history almost every night recently, and hence have not completed a single piece of literary work for a long time. Reading the tragic history of the island of Taiwan which our ancestors endured and lived through such hardships is enough to bring one to tears.\(^4^1\)

Clearly, at the initial stage of his trilogy project, as a result of reading through various source materials regarding Taiwan’s history during the Japanese colonial period (1895-1945), Li Qiao developed a sympathy for those early settlers, and as such his Taiwanese consciousness was implicitly brought to the surface. Two months later, in another letter to Zhong Zhaozheng, Li Qiao reviewed his writing strategy with greater confidence:

> For the past six months, I have done only one thing — collected materials

\(^4^0\) These letters were compiled into *A Complete Collection of Zhong Zhaozheng*, 2002.
for my novel. I have also read widely on Taiwan’s history, and this reading amounts to more than twenty books and nearly two million words. The idea that has grown from this reading experience is to write about our ancestors, including the history of the aboriginal people. This is, why I have moved the starting point for the timeframe of my story back six years to the period between 1890 and 1895. Another reason for this is to avoid the use of any direct anti-Japanese implications in my narrative. My intention is to avoid any unconscious influence gained from your own masterpiece, The Trilogy of the Taiwanese. Indeed, your trilogy casts a huge shadow over my work and has put a pressure on me. I now feel that I should not have read it previously.  

Zhong Zhaozheng’s The Trilogy of the Taiwanese (台灣人三部曲) is a three-volume saga depicting the continuous anti-Japanese activities of three generations in a family from northern Taiwan. The first volume Corruption (沉淪) was serialized in the Taiwan Daily (台灣日報) in 1968, and the second volume, Song of Mt. Chatian (插天山之歌), was serialized in the official Nationalist newspaper the Central Daily (中央日報) from 1975 to 1976. When Li Qiao submitted the draft of his first novel, Wintry Night, Zhong’s third volume, Walking Between Heaven, Earth and the Sea (滄溟行) was still being serialized in the Central Daily (1976). The Central Daily was the official newspaper of the Nationalist Party, and obviously Zhong’s narrative conformed to the norm of the dominant discourse where the emphasis on Chinese nationalism and an anti-Japanese theme were considered proper.

Li Qiao’s decision to set the timeframe of the trilogy can be further explained as follows. First, Li Qiao believed that the life of the tribespeople of Taiwan should be

42 Ibid., pp. 402-403.
incorporated into Taiwan's historical narrative, thus their relationship with the Hakka settlers in the late Qing period needed to be addressed. This reveals Li Qiao’s unique vision in regard to the chronological context of Taiwan history. Second, by doing so, as he states, Li Qiao was able to avoid repeating the anti-Japanese message of Zhong Zhaozheng’s trilogy. Li Qiao’s letter to Zhong shows that it was as early as 1974 that Li Qiao had developed a native viewpoint with regard to the narrative of Taiwan history. To a certain extent, such a viewpoint, ran counter to the official discourse that traced Taiwan’s history back to the Republican era (1912-1949) in China. In other words, by rejecting the intertextual repetition of an “anti-Japanese theme”, Li Qiao was attempting to correct or subvert the ideology that was considered proper and orthodox. It also shows that although the story of the two sagas shared a similar historical background and a parallel framework in depicting the lives of three generations of a Hakka family, the development of the symbolic language was different; whereas Zhong Zhaozheng explicitly presented the characteristics of Chineseness, Li Qiao attempted to include the elements of Taiwaneseness.

Meanwhile, faced with a considerable quantity of historical resources, even after Li Qiao had decided to incorporate historical resources into his novel, he still insisted on the importance of the aesthetic presentation of them. See a letter to Zhong dated January 10, 1975:

But, I think I will not be bothered too much by these historical source materials, because I always hold a view inspired by a phrase from the Preface of the Japanese work Human Condition (人間的條件): “Only when a fictional rope is used and allowed to pass through countless subtle truths, will it be closer to history.” I will not allow the historical material to appear directly in my work. Instead, I will borrow some of it and use to colour my
thinking so as to induce my nostalgia.\textsuperscript{43}

This passage discloses Li Qiao’s intention to take up a literary pen to write history, and besides, with reference to Li Qiao’s comment made on October 24, 1974, it also indicates that the spatial reference of Li Qiao’s nostalgia is “Taiwan” rather than “mainland China”. In short, at the initial stage of collecting data, Li Qiao’s conceptualisation of his novelistic project involved a both native viewpoint and the indigenous people of Taiwan. Li Qiao’s decision to include some untold history in his novelistic writing is likely to involve representation of “ambivalence”, “heteroglossia” and “hybridity”. Since these concepts feature an ever changing state and the reality referenced is related to a masked history, Li Qiao’s writing project of the \textit{Wintry Night Trilogy} inevitably foresaw the possibility of intertextual practice.

\section*{2.2. The first draft}

Li Qiao commenced writing the first volume, \textit{Wintry Night}, in 1975. In a letter dated February 11, 1976, Li Qiao sought advice from Zhong Zhaozheng in regard to certain technical problems that were worrying him at the time. In the letter, he indicated how, under the main plot of his book in which the life of the Peng family living at Fangzai Wood was depicted, he still hesitated about how to deal with two of the other sub-plots: one concerning the characteristics of aboriginal life and their custom of headhunting, and the other relating to the post guards\textsuperscript{44}. Li Qiao remarked in the letter that he faced the dilemma of whether to narrate them together or individually.\textsuperscript{45}

Although Li Qiao had fulfilled his plan to depict the life of the aborigines and

\textsuperscript{43} \textit{A Complete Collection of Zhong Zhaozheng} (V. 25, Shu Jian Ji (3) 情深書簡).2002, p. 405.
\textsuperscript{44} \textit{A complete collection of Zhong Zhaozheng} (V. 25, Shu Jian Ji (3) 情深書簡).2002, p. 400.
\textsuperscript{45} Ibid., p. 438.
had avoided adopting an anti-Japanese theme, the development of his symbolic language was in fact in a state of fluctuation. On June 9, 1976, Li expressed his concern in regards to the term “homeland” (故鄉) in another letter to his mentor Zhong Zhaozheng. He wrote: “I have recently transcribed the long draft, and have suddenly wondered where my homeland is?” This shows clearly that, in the course of actualizing his initial plan to depict his family history where some untold historical events were to be involved, Li Qiao confronted the dilemma of how to break away from traditional discourse with regard to “dadi”. Rather than describing “dadi” in a broad and abstract sense implying a Chinese imaginary, Li Qiao revealed his desire to interpret “dadi” by adopting a substantial change in approach as a result of reading a considerable amount of historical resource material. However, the question is, to what extent had Li Qiao researched the upper tolerance limit of the symbolic order with regard to historical taboo?

By the end of 1976, Li Qiao had written 60 thousand words of the first novel Wintry Night, which gives rise to two questions. Firstly, in what way had he made use of the source material? Secondly, how had he approached the aesthetic presentation? In the following discussion, I examine the further challenges that Li Qiao encountered and the changes brought out in regard to his writing strategy after he had become involved in another writing project in early 1977 that pertained to the biography of the Taiwanese anti-Japanese hero Yu Qingfang (余清芳).

In February of 1977, Li Qiao was assigned by the Committee of the History of the Nationalist Party (國民黨黨史會) to take part in a writing project entitled: The Collection of the Biographies of Taiwanese Heroes of Lofty Virtue (先賢烈士傳). This project featured ten Taiwanese historical figures who were either, anti-Japanese heroes or, who were known for their distinguished conduct. Whilst Li Qiao was still at an

46 Ibid., p. 443.
early age, his father Li Mufang had sometimes recounted stories to his children about Taiwan’s history during the Japanese period. They included the story of the Jiaobanian Incident (噍吧哖事件, also called Xilai Temple Incident/西來庵事件, 1915), an anti-Japanese action led by Yu Qingfang. Li Qiao chose to write about this anti-Japanese hero, and became engaged in writing a historical story entitled Sworn Brothers in Xilai Temple (結義西來庵）.47

According to the editor’s advice, the content was required to consist of biographic and historical narratives; the suggested proportions as being 70% and 30% respectively. In order to collect sufficient resources, Li Qiao read a series of historical materials relating to the Jiaobanian Incident (噍吧哖事件) and also undertook a field study in Yujin (玉井) where the specific incident took place. This indeed helped him establish the confidence in writing historical narrative that he had previously lacked. In particular, he “spontaneously developed an irresistible passion and consciousness”,48 when he visited the grave tower in which the remains of the sentenced people were kept. Li Qiao recalled what he had witnessed in the grave tower in the following terms:

Some of the skulls had a glossy 45 degree tilt downwards to the point where they connected with the spine. This condition was apparently caused by a straightforward cut with a sharp knife. Other skulls had two holes in them aligned in the same direction; these were exactly the points where the bullets from gun shots had passed in and out.49

47 It was part of a writing project commissioned by the Nationalist authorities and the story related to the leader of the Jiaobanian Incident (噍吧哖事件) Yu Qingfang (余清芳). This was the last large-scale Taiwanese armed anti-Japanese movement. 866 people were sentenced to death.
49 Ibid., pp. 48-50
Although the appreciation of aesthetics was still Li Qiao’s major concern\textsuperscript{50}, the deep impression that he felt when he visited the historic scene of the Jaobanian Incident, led him to realize that the project as set had become a hard task for him to undertake since he no longer felt sufficiently detached and hardhearted to write the story (Jaobanian Incident) as a fiction.\textsuperscript{51} Such an experience, as Li Qiao noted, “had provided the essentials for him to write a biographical work based on historical resources.”\textsuperscript{52} Clearly, what Li Qiao’s field study on the Jaobanian Incident had a decisive influence on his writing of the *Wintry Night Trilogy*; most significantly, he became dissatisfied with the draft that he had written. According to comments he made later, in the early 1980s, the fifty thousand-word draft of *Wintry Night* that had been written during the period between 1975 and 1977, resembled a “pastoral song”, possessing a romantic, natural and unrestrained feel.\textsuperscript{53}

After Li Qiao had accessed various historical sites and archives relating to the Jaobanian Incident, his pre-symbolic drive and impulse began to fluctuate and lifted to the extent that he had to draw attention to his findings and present them to his readers in a more explicit way. Stimulated by the impact of his field study on the Jaobanian Incident he revisited his original use of symbolic language in the initial draft of the *Wintry Night* and raised his narrative to another level. Such a change indicates that Li Qiao was developing a Taiwanese consciousness and thus demanded a new language to be presented in the trilogy.

Since the draft that he had commenced in 1975 turned out to be disappointing by

\textsuperscript{50} Li Qiao notes in a letter (Aug. 17, 1977) that since I have got used to writing something purely fictional, in the face of so many “historical facts” (史實), the scale of this project will become very large in order to rationalize the facts. See \textit{A Complete Collection of Zhong Zhaozheng}. p. 460.


\textsuperscript{52} Ibid., p. 49.

\textsuperscript{53} Ibid., p. 49.
1977 when he was involved in writing *Sworn Brothers in Xilai Temple* (結義西來庵), he became aware of a change in his thinking and tried to resolve the ensuing conflict. Part of Li Qiao’s problem was how to satisfy his fluctuating semiotic desire and he attempted to do this in subsequent writings by presenting a renewed symbolic language under circumstances in which the dominant discourse of the country was also changing due to the gradual loosening of political taboos. In other words, he needed to discover a new language in which to communicate so as to respond to the new symbolic order.

### 2.3. Land Archive

Later the same year, 1977, in the Economic Research Unit of the Bank of Taiwan, Li Qiao came across a series of archives relating to the land issues experienced by the Taiwanese under Japanese colonial rule. As Li Qiao recalled later, his reaction to what he had discovered in the archive was enthusiastic: “This is what I had been looking for, and now I had found it.”

It appears to have been the answer to his dilemma about how to develop a narrative beyond the personal context and present his larger-scale intent. As a result, Li Qiao decided to abandon his initial draft of *Wintry Night*, and instead re-wrote his family’s history with reference to the information found in the land archives.

The historical resource housed in the Economic Research Unit of the Bank of Taiwan contains nearly one hundred volumes of material relating to Taiwan’s history, geography, and social/economic development. The land archive is the ninth volume. According to Li Qiao, what he had learned from reading the archive included the aborigines’ concepts of land, their ownership and use of that land, and in addition, the

---

ways in which the Han settlers had obtained the land both legally and illegally. Consequently, through inter-textual operations, the information obtained by Li Qiao served to enrich his narrative and thus became party to the establishment of a narrative in which the sign of dadi/land acted as “the core of the Trilogy”.55

At the final stage of writing Wintry Night, Li Qiao made a comment on what he had written: “The narrative (Wintry Night) manifests what I have always believed: namely that the first generation of Taiwan’s wealthy and powerful families became established in the early settler period either through the exploitation of land, or through their formation during the Japanese period; this transpired due to their cooperation with the colonial authorities.”56 This account clearly shows that, without actually citing the relevant text from the archive, Li Qiao had conceptualized what he had learned and then united this text with other texts without citing or naming them. As he implied, the narrative was more focused on the spirit of anti-exploitation and anti-oppression than on being anti-Japanese. Consequently, the implications of “dadi” expanded from simply referring to the nature of land and maternal love to implying the complex relationship between land and people, as well as between colonizer and colonized, landlord and peasant. In particular, this transformation provided the essential elements for Li Qiao to engage in a series of dialogic operations.

2.4. Oral history and field study

As noted previously, from an early age Li Qiao had learned about certain historical “stories” such as the Jaobanian Incident and the activities of the Peasant Movement from his father Li Mufang. While Li Qiao was engaged in writing Wintry Night between 1975 and 1977, he was also involved in collecting material, and it was

during this period that Li Qiao accidentally discovered that his father’s name was included in the “gangster” list in the *History of Taiwan Government Police Records* (總督府警察沿革誌)\(^{57}\) for being involved in peasant movements in the 1930s. Li Qiao therefore had the opportunity to explore his father’s life in depth and his association with anti-Japanese activities through these source materials and continued reviewing his father’s oral history.

In addition to Li Mufang’s stories, Li Qiao also made some field trips, for example, he visited sugar cane factories and the descendents of his late father’s acquaintances such as Kuo Chang (郭常) who died because he had been involved in the Peasant Movement. And it was this, as Li Qiao noted, “with the help of so many friends, and the valuable information I had gathered that reinforced my responsibility for writing and telling the story.”\(^{58}\)

On several occasions, Li Qiao clearly claimed that Liu Ahan, one of the main characters in the Trilogy, was in fact, based on his own father, Li Mufang. In a sense, the historical events that Li Qiao had learned from his father, combined with the field trips and interviews, were meta-intertextually operated and became part of the conceptual resources of his thinking. Drawing on Genette, those stories told by Li Qiao’s father had previously evoked memories more or less perceptibly without necessarily speaking of them or citing them. In other words, during the period of writing the trilogy, Li Mufang’s personal experiences and stories were absorbed by Li Qiao, who then integrated them into his narrative. Hence, they were presented in a spontaneous manner. This was the kind of relationship that sustained Li Mufang and

---

\(^{57}\) The Japanese colonial authorities used the police as major force in dealing with “bandits” instead of using military force. The Japanese rule in Taiwan was thus called “police politics”, and as a consequence the police organization had been expanded considerably. The Taiwan Governor’s Police Bureau continuously published *History of Taiwan Governor’s Police Records* during the period from 1933 to 1942. They were classified as confidential information. The chief editor was a police officer Atsuya Washinosu (鷲巢敦哉, 1896-1943).

Liu Ahan. The former is the man who implicitly inspired his Taiwanese consciousness, and the latter is a fictional figure involved in various anti-Japanese activities. Liu Ahan’s story is meta-textualizing that of Li Mufang.

Li Qiao’s narrative was further enhanced by other metatextual details, showing how historical accounts and fiction can be mixed and imposed on a narrative. The anti-Japanese theme with its simple implications was thus enhanced by this input, which led to the representation of a broader sense of being anti-Japanese in combination with the theme of survival and the protection of the land, all pertaining to “Taiwan” without any implications for greater China.

2.5. Police records

In the course of writing the second volume of the trilogy, *The Deserted Village*, between 1977 and 1979, the *History of the Taiwan Governor’s Police Records* (總督府警察沿革誌) played a significant role as the main hypotext. To understand the history and operation of police politics in Taiwan under Japanese rule, the *History of the Taiwan Governor’s Police Records* were considered as a first hand source of material by members of the local literati, including Li Qiao, in the postwar period. Although there were a few publications in the 1970s with contents referring to the police records, for example, the *History of the Taiwanese National Movements* (台灣民族運動史) published in 1971 by the *Independence Daily*, any narrative relating to leftist ideology was avoided. It was during this period that Li Qiao had the opportunity of borrowing a complete reprinted copy of the *History of Taiwan Government Police Records* published by Longci Bookstore in Japan from Yan Kui in 1977, and the content covering Taiwanese leftist movements was what Li Qiao intended to cover.

In the second volume *The Deserted Village*, historical events depicted by Li Qiao,
include the establishment, development, and the dissolution of the Taiwanese Cultural Association, the Erlin (二林) Incident, the Zhongli (中壢) Incident, the Dahu (大湖) Incident, as well as the establishment and development of the Peasants’ Association and Peasant Movement. The way that Li Qiao united the text of the History of Taiwan Governor’s Police Records in which those events were depicted, is worthy of discussion because the events are narrated through hypo/hypertextual operations.

The police record provides major source material for The Deserted Village. According to Genette’s sense of “hypertextuality”, Li Qiao’s text is intentionally inter-textual. The intended and self-conscious relationship between the texts reveals Li Qiao’s attempt to establish a historical discourse in which the mysterious history of Taiwan is addressed. Hence, the hypertextual transposition is made of specific hypotexts with the texts being transformed by the process of revision. In essence, Li Qiao has transformed the perspective of the narrative. Narrative, in relation to the Taiwanese Cultural Association, was processed from a counter perspective. For example, when describing the influence of the Taiwanese Cultural Association (台灣文化協會), the police record takes the perspective of the Japanese colonial regime:

The enlightenment movements promoted by the Taiwanese Cultural Association in the agricultural villages, aimed to incite peasants’ sentiments about national conflicts and class struggle. As far as incentives and protective rulings relating to the sugar industry are concerned, the members of the association have laid the blame on the sugar producers and on government policies.59

By contrast, the description in Li Qiao’s narrative maintained a positive view of the Taiwanese Cultural Association:

From then on, inspired by the Taiwanese Cultural Association, and led by the Peasant Association, all kinds of social movements gradually arose, and the numbers of participants in related groups increased continually.60

In the *History of the Taiwan Governor’s Police Records*, the founder of the Taiwanese Peasant Cooperative Li Yinzhang (李應章) is also depicted from the perspective of the colonial regime:

A practicing doctor, Li Yinzhang, from Erlin, who was also a member of the Taiwanese Cultural Association, became hostile towards Xuxue (許學) and Linlu (林爐) due to his jealousy of the success of these two men. He then stirred up the peasants’ resentful sentiments towards the sugar companies and the government’s sugar policy, and established the Erlin Peasants’ Association.61

In Li Qiao’s narrative, Li Yingzhang was depicted as a doctor who was full of compassion. His humanity and sympathy for peasants who suffered injustice, is the catalyst for his decision to assist them to find a way out of a difficult situation.62 As a result, historical figures and fictional figures are brought together in the narration. For some events and historical figures, Li Qiao provided a more detailed explanation by

---

adding footnotes. In addition, subsequent developments in the life of Liu Ahan’s son, Liu Mingding, following his decision to affiliate with the left leaning Taiwanese Cultural Association, was depicted separately in the Afterword section of Deserted Village: this was entitled “Beyond the Deserted Village” (荒村之外). In particular, Li Qiao noted that the narrative had been written according to the History of Taiwan Governor’s Police Records.

In Genette’s sense of intertextuality, the writing of “Beyond the Deserted Village Beyond” is an example of self-amplification, since the content relates to a political taboo, and the scale of free speech in Li Qiao’s narrative in The Deserted Village stretched the bounds of tolerance of the Nationalist authorities.

3. The intertextual use of “The Sound of Weeping” in The Lone Lamp

In this section, I explore the inter-textual relationship between Li Qiao’s short story, “The Sound of Weeping” (哭聲), which was written and published in 1969 and his third novel of the trilogy, The Lone Lamp, written in 1979. I argue that Li Qiao’s intertextual manipulation of “The sound of Weeping” in the opening chapter of The Lone Lamp, provides an account of how transformation becomes capable of reflecting another reality and can engender self-awareness and resistant/land consciousness. As such, I examine the essence of the transformation as well as its significance and effects.

“The Sound of Weeping” depicts the psychological conflict of two young men Afu (阿福) and Aqing (阿青), who had tramped up to Hawk’s Beak before they left Fanzai Wood to set out for the South Pacific for conscripted service. During the Pacific War, many Taiwanese youths were conscripted to serve in the warzone.

63 It was a mysterious place that most people avoided, because they were told that some who went to climb it never returned.
fighting for Japan or working as troop labourers. Afu and Aqing were no exception. Hawk’s Beak is a mysterious place that most people avoided because strange noises are heard emanating from that place. As the narrator notes, these are the sounds of sad, broken-hearted weeping, a ghostly weeping from the rock. Since the chances of returning home alive were slim, Afu and Aqing decided to go and explore the mystery of the Hawk’s Beak.

The story of “The Sound of Weeping” was relocated to the opening chapter of the third volume, *The Lone Lamp*. In the sense of intertextuality, “The Sound of Weeping” is a preceding “hypotext” for the first chapter which shares the same title. In the hypertext, it is transformed, modified and extended to a certain extent. In a letter written to Zhong dated Sep. 12, 1978, Li Qiao expressed his concern about using the text which was published previously in 1969:

> The first chapter will be derived from the short story “The Sound of Weeping”, I think that should not be a problem, and my purpose is to introduce the background and characters, so as to create atmosphere for *The Lone Lamp*.64

Despite Li Qiao’s light touch in describing how the hypotext is to be applied in *The Lone Lamp*, I argue that the hypertext possesses the strength to disturb the boundary between being inside and outside of the dominant symbolic order as a result of inputting a formative discourse in regard to self-awareness and consciousness. This is the force of Kristeva’s argument that “the transformational method…leads us to situate literary structure within the social whole considered as a textual whole”.65

---

64 A complete collection of Zhong Zhaozheng (V. 25, Shu Jian Ji (3) 情深書簡). p. 506.
this regard, I explore the processes and outcomes of Li Qiao’s intertextual operations on “The Sound of Weeping” in terms of the following two characteristics developed in the hypertext in relation to the development of Taiwanese consciousness.

3.1. A promising transformation

The short story “The Sound of Weeping” is depicted under a vague historical context. Although readers are informed that the story is set during the later period of the Japanese rule, and Afu (阿福) and Aqing (阿青) are about to set out on a journey of conscription to fight for Japan in the Pacific, by avoiding any political or historical implications, Li Qiao presents the narrative as being a story derived from his own childhood experiences.

In comparison, in the opening chapter of The Lone Lamp, the two protagonists have been transformed from the two young fictional villagers, Aqing and Afu who have no family links with the anti-Japanese activist Liu Ahan, to Liu Mingji (劉明基) who is Dengmei and Liu Ahan’s youngest son, and Peng Yonghui (彭永輝) who is Peng Renjie’s eldest grandson. Although the anti-Japanese characteristics of Liu Ahan are vaguely described in the hypotext, a close family link centring on Liu Ahan is presented in the hypertext. In addition, despite their relationship as uncle and nephew, Liu Mingji and Peng Yonghui are of the same age group and are both conscripted to the Philippines.

In The Lone Lamp, Li Qiao clearly introduces Mingji’s family background and describes him as being the family member most like his father in both appearance and character. The narrator also emphasizes the fact that Mingji’s father, Liu Ahan, had spent his entire life fighting the Japanese, thus indicating that the presentation of the

---

hypertext is inevitably political with the textual and the extra-textual inhabiting each other at the same time.

Further, in *The Lone Lamp*, Mingji is described as the only person in Fanzai Wood who has received a higher education having gained a night school diploma from a technical college. Moreover, he no longer believes much in gods and spirits, except for the spirits of his ancestors, the Earth God and the Righteous Lords. This demonstrates the relevance of Li Qiao’s strategy in introducing the positive influence of colonial modernity into the hypertext, when Mingji’s rational attitude of anti-superstition is delivered. While at the same time, he still keeps traditional family values, for example, paying respect to family ancestors.

Through the depiction of Mingji’s educational experience and his views on cultural values, Li Qiao, in *The Lone Lamp*, reveals his selective recognition of the Japanese implantation of modernity. Nevertheless, most of the hypertext is still focused on life in a pre-modern village, a place that seems to have been deliberately chosen because of the minimal influence of modernity upon it, with the exception of the policy of conscription which resulted in the deaths of many of the youths from Fanzai Wood. Li Qiao’s narrative about life in the pre-modern village of Fanzai Wood, has much potential to develop as a counter discourse and to take a dig at the dark side of colonial discourse. Hence, from the starting point of “pure imagination” as commented on by Mingji with respect to the “sound of weeping”, life in the pre-modern village, where only the old, the weak, the women and the defective ones remain, a counter discourse gradually comes into being through intertextual operations which are further analyzed in the following section.

3.2 Resistant consciousness

In “The Sound of Weeping”, Liu Ahan is mentioned only once in a conversation
between Afu and Aqing as being an anti-Japanese activist and an acquaintance of another anti-Japanese figure, Uncle Amei. While in *The Lone Lamp*, Li Qiao engaged in a narrative approach that attempted to bring out the spirit of anti-Japaneseness and the resistant consciousness of the two protagonists. The following analysis explains the transformation.

When the two pairs of characters, Afu and Aqing and Mingji and Yonghui, tramped up to the Hawk’s Beak, they found a large cave that was open to the south. The conditions inside the cave were quite dry and they saw a complete human skeleton, which was covered with a piece of wood that protected it from the rain.\(^67\)

The dialogue between Afu and Aqing in “The Sound of Weeping” includes the following:

“Someone – man or demon – must have lived here.”

“I think so too.”

“Maybe it is an escaped convict like Uncle Amei.”

In comparison, the conversation between Liu Mingji and Peng Yonghui in the in *The Lone Lamp* is enriched by adding a passage explaining the reason why Uncle Ahan and Amei had to escape. By indicating that they were of the same anti-Japanese stance, the narrator links the relationship between the identity of the skeleton, Uncle Amei, and Mingji’s father, Aha:

“Someone – man or demon – must have lived here.”

“I think so too.”

“Maybe it is an escaped convict like Uncle Ahan and Amei.”

Mingji recalled that his mother had told him that Uncle Amei and his father, who were in the same resistance group, had hidden deep in the mountains for a fortnight evading the police.68

A further conversation presented shortly afterwards between the two protagonists, shows a more explicit distinction. The conversation between Afu and Aqing in the in “The Sound of Weeping” is as follows:

“Who do you think it was?”

“Didn’t you just say that perhaps it was one of the fugitives, who had escaped from Japanese detention?” Aqing revived some of his memories, those stories told by his father when he was a boy.

“So, you also think so?”

“Well, it really does not matter whether it is or not.”69

The anti-Japanese trait of the Taiwanese people can be found in the text, yet it soon weakens. While in The Lone Lamp, the conversation between Mingji and Yonghui goes like this:

“Who do you think it was?”

“Must be one of us.”

“Anyway, not from the four-legged camp.”70

“You think it was someone who ran away from the Japanese?”

69 Ibid., pp. 44-45.
70 “Four-legged” refers to “Japanese”, a scornful title coined by the Taiwanese.
“Probably, huh?”

“...My father told me that, Ahan, your father, was also...”71

Relevantly, the above passage of hypertext shows a distinction between self and other, where Mingji and Yonghui identify with the anti-Japanese group in which both Uncle Amei and Mingji’s father Ahan had been involved. Besides, a highly resistant consciousness had been passed down from the earlier generation, such as Uncle Amei and Ahan, to the members of the younger generation, such as Mingji, who had a higher level of education than their forbears. As Bakhtin suggested, individual consciousness lies on the borderline between oneself and the other72; through the dialogue, Mingji and Yonghui populate their identity with their own intentions, and thus show a sense of self-awareness.

To summarise, in the short story “The Sound of Weeping”, the question of whether Aqing and Afu positioned themselves on the fugitive’s or the ruler’s side, is not clear. It is relevant that Li Qiao used “fugitive” rather than “anti-Japanese activist” to avoid any political implications. However, through the intertextual process, Li Qiao shows in the opening chapter of The Lone Lamp how an individual comes to recognize himself as distinct from others, this development going through two phases. First, by claiming that they were chased by the “three-legged” and the “four-legged” for half a month, Uncle Amei and Mingji’s father are classified into the same resistant group. Second, Mingji and Yonghui include themselves in the fugitive group which was also noted by the narrator as an “anti-Japanese group”.

The way that the hypertext has been transformed reveals the difference in Li Qiao’s state of mind of between 1969, when he wrote “The Sound of Weeping”, and

72 Allen, G. Intertextuality. 2000, p. 28.
1978-79, when he wrote *The Lone Lamp*. As Bakhtin has argued, signs emerge only in the process of interaction between one individual consciousness and another. The input of ideological content in the hypertext shows that Li Qiao was ready to engage in building a discourse in which individual consciousness could be articulated. Indeed, it shows the imagination of individual subjects in terms of the notion that we are not “three-legged” or “four-legged”, and “we are not those others”. Overall, the transformation has developed from a phase where the self-image was not seen, to a phase where the self-image was explicitly presented.

Hence, it is noteworthy that both before and after the dialogues between Mingji and Yonghui are presented, the hypertext is simultaneously enriched by the narration with the inclusion of reference to the sign of dadi/land and great maternal love:

Feeling at one with the world, he saw himself standing on the earth,
connecting the earth with heaven, providing nature with consciousness.

He remembered his father’s final words, as relayed by his brother: “If it wasn’t for your mother, the family wouldn’t exist; you’d have no brothers and sisters.” [...] The following day he left his homeland and his family with full confidence and determination.

The symbolic meaning of dadi and maternal love is then expanded and becomes more specific. As such, what has been reflected and refracted through the sign of land seems ready to come alive.

---

75 Ibid., p.23.
4. The Voices of the vulnerable

In Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the notion that “the soil is the source of great suffering” is constantly reinforced by a series of narratives in relation to the Peng family’s hardships, struggles and frustrations amid continuous natural and man-made trials. These include their struggles in opening up previously unsettled mountainous land, their conflicts with the aborigines and the powerful landlord gentry, as well as the mission of the conscripted Taiwanese youth in the Pacific War. The forces of man-made oppression include the system of patriarchy, the Qing system of tenure, predatory landlords and Japanese colonial rule.

Indeed, the emotional embodiment maintained by Li Qiao throughout his narration is the all-pervasive texture of suffering. As indicated in Section three, exemplifying his intertextual approach, Li Qiao’s narrative in *The Lone Lamp* regarding human suffering has its origins in the short story “The Sound of Weeping” (哭聲, 1969). In addition to “The Sound of Weeping”, another three short stories written by Li Qiao and featuring the central theme of “suffering” are also involved in these intertextual operations. They are “The Story of Fanzai Wood” (蕃仔林的故事, 1969), “Women of the Mountains” (山女, 1969) and “He He, Alright!” (呵呵，好嘛！, 1969).76

Similar to “The Sound of Weeping”, the three short stories are intertextually re-located in the latter part of the novel. “He He, Alright!” and “Women of the Mountains” are grafted consecutively into Chapter Nine of “Women of the Mountains”; Chapter Eleven of “A Late Summer in Fanzai Wood” is primarily based on “The story of Fanzai Wood”. The background to these short stories is the time

---

76 They were all collected in *Women in the Mountain - A Collection of Stories about Fanzai Wood*. (山女—蕃仔林故事集) published in 1970.
when the Pacific War, in which Mingji and Yonghui, were involved was drawing to a close; as a result of the counterattack of the Allied forces, Japanese troops were continuously forced to retreat. In the meantime, the settlers of Fanzai Wood continued to face hardship, mainly due to the relative poverty of the village, the wartime shortages of goods and materials, and the absence of male family members, who were generally seen as the masters of their families, to take on the responsibility of the family livelihood.

The way that Li Qiao used the three stories is much the same as in the case of “The Sound of Weeping”. The shift from hypotext to hypertext is massive, which means that most of the content and events portrayed in the hypertext are derived from the individual short stories of the previous works. The texts are absorbed into the more complex novelistic circumstances, and in the narrative of the hypertext, the final stage of the Pacific War in which many Taiwanese youths had lost their lives, and many others had had to flee from the advancing Allied troops, are explicitly depicted. The atmosphere of sufferings is accordingly reinforced.

However, I argue that, despite the continuously reinforced level of suffering, Li Qiao’s intertextual narrative is engaged in constructing a discourse that might encourage a sense of Taiwaneseness. In the following discussion, I analyze the portrayal of specific socially/economically vulnerable characters which further contributes to the discourse of subversion; they are, Angmei (昂妹), Achun (阿春), Fuxing’s wife (福興嫂) and Angzai (安仔).

4.1. A natural survivor – Angmei

Angmei is the central character of Li Qiao’s short story “He He, Alright!” (呵呵，好嘛！1969). Originally from an indigenous tribe, Angmei is married to Huoxian, who had once taught Chinese, but who becomes a priest conducting funeral services
in Fangzai Wood under Japanese rule. Huoxian often affectionately calls Angmei, “my fat piggy”, and “fat Angmei” is the nickname given to her by other villagers who often laugh at her. She is unfairly depicted as being overweight when everyone else in Fanzai Wood is portrayed as being underfed and it is said that she “didn’t seem to know hunger like everyone else.”

Fat Angmei is a woman who had formerly been looked down upon with some contempt by most of the Fanzai Wood settlers, being regarded as fat, messy, and unkempt, but it is she who, in the later part of Chapter Nine, is depicted as an energetic and brave woman leading a field trip in search for food. As a result, Angmei’s status in the village is unexpectedly raised. Indeed, she becomes a “natural survivor” because in her view, “there isn’t a thing that can’t be eaten”, and during a time when there is a shortage of food and other resources, she appears to be able to make almost anything palatable, including mountain frogs, snakes, snails, wildcat, gibbon and boar.

Li Qiao’s description of the way in which Angmei captured a poisonous snake, and how she cleaned its guts, is excessive and is phenomenally presented as though a sumptuous banquet was about to take place:

“Look,” said Angmei, holding the snake firmly at the base of its head while showing the others how it had opened its mouth. […]

“It makes the best tonic,” said Angmei in a whisper. “My old man always eats them. It’s such a delicacy; he eats them bones and all. Don’t tell him about it; I’m going to eat this one.”

As Angmei spoke, she squeezed her fingers together, crushing the life out of the snake. She really was an expert at dressing snakes. She broke the fangs

---

off in a tree branch, and then tipped the lifeless body into a cloth sack she was carrying.\(^78\)

In addition, through the narrator, Angmei describes the tastiness of mountain frogs and other creatures:

The frogs were tender and fat and if boiled, would produce a fatty broth. […]

The things that other people thought were useless – the bones of wildcat, gibbon, or boar – found a place in Angmei’s pot.\(^79\)

Fat Angmei’s ability to catch and describe vividly the various creatures and how to cook and eat them, shows a carnival like spirit in which the body image of being “fat” and “boisterous” as well as the possession of an abundance of food are emphasized. For Bakhtin, carnival is an event in which all rules, inhibitions, restrictions and regulations which determine the course of everyday life are suspended, and especially all forms of hierarchy in society. In addition carnival is the context in which distinct individual voices are heard, flourish and interact together.\(^80\)

The carnival creates the "threshold" situations in which regular conventions are broken or reversed and genuine dialogue becomes possible, and besides, everything is permitted.\(^81\) In other words, it creates an alternative social space, characterized by freedom, equality and abundance,\(^82\) and this effect is achieved by emphasizing Angmei’s eating practices which connect the body to the world. As a result, the idea

\(^{78}\) Ibid., p. 251.
\(^{79}\) Ibid., pp. 251-252.
\(^{80}\) Bakhtin, M. M., Morris, P., Voloshinov, V. N., & Medvedev, P. N. The Bakhtin Reader: Selected Writings of Bakhtin, Medvedev, and Voloshinov. p. 91.
\(^{81}\) Ibid., p. 91.
of simultaneous death and rebirth comes into being and challenges the colonial frame which is, well-ordered, ready-made and complete.

In addition, Angmei’s positive view of life is evidently appealing. A salient example is her interaction with the young widow, Azhen, whose husband Peng Yonghui had previously lost his life in the battlefield of the Philippines. Angmei’s optimistic view of life is presented in contrast to the miserable and hopeless situation being endured by most of the villagers. Influenced by Angmei’s personality trait of fearlessness, and her description of how to make use of local material for survival, Azhen regains the courage to forge ahead with her life, and starts to feel stronger and more confident after conversing with others during the hunt for food led by Angmei.

Attitudes and behaviours such as those demonstrated by fat Angmei indeed create character. Those who appear at first to be humble and inferior prove to be the strongest, because they are the ones who are able to adapt to extreme poverty by dint of being deeply attached to the mother-earth. Fat Angmei takes her stand, not in accordance with stereotyped values, but, rather, within her own habits and attitudes. Her overwhelmingly passionate desire to feed herself with whatever creature she can catch brings about a symbolic meaning, which is “the strength of a rebirth”.

Moreover, those who do develop vitality and the will to live under the circumstances of extreme hardship are mainly widows, mothers and children. This reinforces the strength of rebirth and forms a counter force which pushes aside the seriousness of the discourse of “suffering”.

4.2. A naïve hero -- Achun

In addition to Angmei, other characters involved in Li Qiao’s carnival presentation are various people described as being fools or those who manifest bizarre behaviour patterns. The second section of Chapter Nine was derived from the short
story “He He, Alright!” (呵呵，好嘛！), which depicts a visit made by an old woman “Auntie Pickles” to Achun’s place, and her purpose, is to ask Achun to return the two bowls of raw rice that she had lent her. Achun is a mother with a low IQ. Her husband Awhai has been conscripted to the battlefield and has not returned home. Due to poverty, she only has a single set of underwear for her teenage daughter, Achunzhi, and another set for herself. Hence, when the underwear needed replacing, villagers were embarrassed to see her and, in particular, her daughter, wandering around with the lower part of their bodies unclothed.

An introduction in which the main character, Dengmei (燈妹), is involved was added to the opening paragraph of the hypertext in order that a coherent connection to the narrative can be made. Auntie Pickles calls on Auntie Ahan (阿漢嫂, Dengmei) and complains to Dengmei about what she has seen at Achun’s place. She is a thin and undernourished old woman and the purpose of her arduous journey tramping up to Hell cliff where Achun lives, is to ask her to return the two bowls of raw rice that had been borrowed by Achun’s husband Lin Ahwai about one year earlier. Auntie Pickles waits outside Achun’s place deliberately until it is lunch time before knocking on the door, expecting a free lunch. As Auntie Pickles is about to enter Achun’s home, she sees Achun’s teenage daughter, Achunzi, running out from behind a bush looking like a savage with her hair all disheveled; she is also naked from the waist down.

When Auntie Pickles pushes open the door and enters Achun’s place, she tentatively inquires: “Dead yet?” Seated on a crooked bamboo chair, Achun replies in a smooth and calm tone: “Still alive.” In the meantime, according to the narrator, “from the west, a beam of light passed through a gap in the wall, projecting onto her face. This was a face that held an astonished expression and upon which laughter lines
were still visible”\textsuperscript{83}

At the time Achun was sewing underpants and wore only a pair of black trousers to cover her naked bottom. Auntie Pickles inquires as to whether there is any food to fill her empty stomach, but suddenly realizes that Achun has not had any fuel for cooking for a while, and besides, the only food she does have is uncooked sweet potato, which she describes as “very delicious”. Further, when Auntie Pickles blames Achun for letting her daughter run outside without wearing any underwear, Achun just gives her an apologetic smile, and when asked about what she would do if Ahwhai never came back, Achun says optimistically that Ahwai will return from the war.

For most villagers, such a miserable life would be so unbearable that the sentiments of sadness and plaintiveness seem to have no place to hide. Achun’s attitude, however, appears to be unexpectedly easy and calm; what she has been through and her general view of life is reflected in the innocent smile that she constantly wears.

“Is the smile completely meaningless?” is a question asked by the narrator immediately after the conversation between Auntie Pickles and Achun. The narrative then continues in this vein: “It is not clear if her smile is fully meaningless. Is that the case? Or, is she laughing at herself, laughing at Auntie Pickles, or laughing at all human beings?”\textsuperscript{84} In a sense, Achun acts as the “naïve hero” who is a character who innocently ignores what has happened in reality. As a result, under the circumstances that the young men from Fanzai Wood with a higher level of education have made unnecessary sacrifices in the controversial Pacific War, the presentation of a naïve hero like Achun is ironical. Despite being illiterate and humble, she becomes capable of surviving all this misery.


\textsuperscript{84} Ibid., p. 357.
Indeed, Achun possesses most of the characteristics of a naïve hero, including innocence, ignorance, and stupidity. She misses some of the plot while the other villagers and even readers know what was going on. She has not been informed of the truth about Awhai’s death because she has been perceived as a fool. Through her innocence and ignorance, she presents herself as aloof from the world. Seeing through her eyes the extremely difficult but also ambivalent situation of Achun, Auntie Pickles eventually comes to like her, and gives up her quest for the return of the two bowls of raw rice, even though she is also in a difficult position.

This produces an unexpected literary effect that destabilizes the existing symbolic order where the relation of the dominance maintained through binary oppositions between civilized/primitive; beautiful/ugly; human/bestial is undermined. As a result, Li Qiao’s intertextual operation in The Lone Lamp brings vitality to the helpless scene.

4.3. An unreliable narration -- Fuxing’s wife and Angzai

“The Story of Fanzai Wood” is a short story used intertextually in Chapter Eleven of “A Late Summer in Fanzai Wood” in the third novel, The Lone Lamp. The opening paragraph of this chapter is about the air raids conducted by the Allied forces in most areas of Taiwan. As a result of the raids, classes were suspended in both primary and junior high schools. In the country area near Fanzai Wood, children from the landlord’s family who owned the area of Fanzai Wood, were evacuated to the rural village to escape the air raids.

Angzai is described as being the most stupid person among the many idiot-like people living in Fanzai Wood, and hence, although being in the age group covered by the compulsory conscription policy, he becomes the only youth in the Fanzai Wood community who is exempted from conscription because of his low IQ. Li Qiao’s
depiction of Angzai’s idiotic appearance is both colourful and sensual. Examples include: “His feet look like a skinned pine trunk, terribly pale. His belt is incurably loose, and hence, his pants are ready to fall down anytime. His eyelids are so thick and cover nearly half of his eyes, thus he can only open the other half of his eyes. As to his nose, this always has two streams of yellow running fluid, twitching upwards and downwards.”

Fuxing’s wife, who is described as “a shameless woman” or a “flirtatious woman”, because quite often, she mistakes any man she encounters for her husband because of the long time she spends thinking of Fuxing who never returns from the Pacific War. Hence, whenever she meets a man, she would smile and make a strange giggling sound, and then she would shout loudly: “don’t run away, don’t ignore me, I want to sleep with you.”

A rumour about Fuxing’s wife and Angzai is spread among the village children. This was started by a pair of brothers, Jianfu and Jiantueng, who are Denmei’s grandsons. The rumour is that Fuxing’s wife has slept with Angzai, and that the incident had occurred on the open ground behind the Uncle temple. As a result, the children busy themselves looking for evidence in order to win the trust of the villagers. The rumour soon spreads among the village women, and then through the entire Fanzai Wood community. In a sense, these children and women are “unreliable narrators”, who, according to Booth, hold a distorted view of the events, which may lead to an inaccurate telling of the story.

Since the children’s unreliability is never fully revealed, readers are left to wonder how much the claim should be trusted and how the story should be interpreted.

---

86 Ibid., p. 434.
Nevertheless, I argue that the extremely difficult situation in Fanzai Wood at the time is likely to drive readers to make a compromise about the claim. Indeed, the claim that Fuxing’s wife has slept with Angzai gradually becomes convincing as a result of continuous guess work and gossip from the children and the women, in particular, when the proof includes a pillow and a quilt that were found. In a sense, an intimate relationship between Fuxing’s wife and Angzai even becomes an imaginary expectation of the villagers under circumstances whereby “those who were in Fanzai Wood, were either too old or too young; there was no other suitable match except Fuxing’s wife and Angzai.”

In the meantime, the narrator repeatedly uses the term “having sexual intercourse” (通到) between the lines, which both has a humorous effect and further weakens the extent of the misery experienced, especially when the narration of The Lone Lamp has almost drawn to a close in the final chapter in which the death of Dengmei and Mingji are depicted.

Generally speaking, these people are among the marginal group who live on the verge of relative poverty, yet they also show their humanity and their ability to accommodate themselves in difficult situations through various presentations. The effect therefore makes room for a multiplicity of voices and meanings, and further, indicates considerable potential to reconstruct a substantial imaginary plot based on people’s attachment to their native land.

---

5. Constructing land consciousness through the presentation of polyphonic voices

In general, the broad sense of intertextuality is the significant feature that Li Qiao applies in *Wintry Night Trilogy*, and this, results in unexpected effects through the reflection and refraction of the sign of “dadi” and “mother”. The representation of a sign in language, hence, is as Bakhtin emphasized: “the social influence of language”, since language is “perceived as ideologically stratified through and through into multiple social discourses each representing a specific ideological-belief system, a way of seeing the world: heteroglossia.”

As Bakhtin argues, language is “stratified not only into linguistic dialects in the strict sense of the world, but also into languages that are socio-ideological [...].” Thus, it consists of two forces: the centripetal and the centrifugal. The centripetal forces of the life of language, “are embodied in a unitary, operated in the midst of heteroglossia,” and alongside the centripetal forces, the centrifugal forces of language “carry on their uninterrupted processes of decentralization and disunification.”

In this section, I explore Li Qiao’s intertextual approach to the emotional texture of comfort and joy and their connection with the sign of land. The aim is to examine Li Qiao’s polyphonic presentation and its relation to both the centripetal and centrifugal forces in regard to the development of Taiwaneseness. The following discussion deals with the emotional presentation relating to the land in Li Qiao’s narrative where the protagonists gain comfort or joy in various, or similar,
circumstances. I argue that by means of intertextual operations, the stratified languages develop as a counter strength against the discourse of suffering. Overall, the emotional presentation is embodied in a “unitary language”, and operates in the midst of heteroglossia”, which, according to Bakhtin, is perceived as the constituting condition for the possibility of independent consciousness.93

The Faizai Wood community is made up of eight Hakka families, and their livelihood is based on subsistence agriculture. Even though Nature had provided extremely harsh material conditions in which the barren land could only be used for the planting of sweet potatoes and beans, or the making of potash and the distillation of camphor; it was, nonetheless, the land on which the Faizai Wood settlers believed their ultimate goal of becoming independent land-owners was to be achieved. For the Peng family, the opening up of the land that was allocated by the aborigines with an area of a jia (甲) and a half94 of terraced fields was the starting point of the fulfillment of their dreams. Such a longing was well expressed in Li Qiao’s description:

If their luck held, in three years’ time, they would no longer have to eat potatoes at every meal.95

Moreover, the head of the Peng family, Peng Aqiang (彭阿強), was inspired by such an expectation; this is evidenced in a conversation with his son Renxiu (人秀):

“Don’t we have to pay rent to the landlord?”

“Our landlord is the state. What other landlord is there?”

93 Ibid., p. 73.
94 A jia (甲) is approximately equal to one hectare.
“Land for our family? Our own land?”

Another salient example of Li Qiao’s depiction of the sentiments and the atmosphere of delighted rebirth can be seen in his description of the Peng’s first New Year celebration in Fanzai Wood; this occurs one month after their arrival:

[...] Although they were beginning to look thin and wan after more than a month, as people who had worked for others for years, they now had an irrepressible gleam in their eyes and a sense of exhilaration.

Not only did the land bring hope for the Peng family, it also provided a natural bed for Renjie and his wife Liangmei (良妹) on which they could enjoy the pleasure of sex while taking a rest on one grassy spot when they worked on the production of potash. They had borrowed this piece of land in order to seek their joy because of the fact that they and twelve other family members shared just one house.

At the early stage of their settlement in Fanzai Wood, members of the Peng family generally enjoyed the inkling of what an independent life might look like, even though the natural conditions and material provisions were totally inadequate as far as the basic standard of a material life was concerned. In this regard, it is also at this stage that the characters participate in echoing the joy of owning land which, at the same time, provides the basic needs of the Peng family. However, due to the emergence of the landlord gentry class who hold the official ownership of the land, the language regarding the inklings of joy does not continue to develop to a wider and deeper extent. The presented joy is therefore short-lived, and is unable to be further

developed as a stratifying force.

Although the joy of owning land perished, it was nonetheless mother earth that provided the Fanzai Wood settlers with the comfort whereby the warmth of the land and the beauty of the natural surroundings played a significant role in comforting their “wounded souls”. More significantly, this empathy is felt by different people in a variety of circumstances.

The first occasion such an expression manifests itself is in the first volume, *Wintry Night*; specifically it is when Liu Ahan has safely guarded the Peng family en route to the destination of Fanzai Wood and then decides to resign his job as a guard. In the face of an unpredictable future, the narrator, through Ahan’s eyes, describes how the beauty of the nature of the South Lake Village (南湖庄) had touched and pacified Ahan’s uneasiness:

[…] All of a sudden, the beautiful chain of mountains rushed into his mind. On the spur of the moment, he himself melted into nature and became one […] Feeling warmth in his heart, tears flowed down his face. This was a feeling he had never had before, and for the first time he burst into tears of delight.99

A re-accentuated expression where intertextual relations are involved is presented in the second volume, *The Deserted Village*. It comes after Dengmei recalls her suffering during the past twenty years of her marriage to Liu Ahan—a man who had always shown his determination to resist Japanese colonial rule by continuously engaging in peasant movements, yet was reluctant to resign himself to just being a

---

farmer, a father and a husband. On this occasion, the narrator continues in praise of the beauty of the nature and Dengmei’s close attachment to it by using emotional utterances similar to “feeling warmth”, “melted into nature” and “becoming one” that had previously been spoken by Ahan:

[…] Over the last decades, she had spent most time here in Fanzai Wood, getting along with the natural environment of mountains and forests. These were feelings filled with familiarity and complete understanding. [..]. Gradually, she felt that she had walked into the warmth of something. Oh no, she was not just ‘entering’ into the warmth, she had indeed melted into the softness and was together with it; it was a feeling of being at one with nature.  

These utterances are absorbed and digested, and lead to the formation of a chain of speech communions. The earlier text then makes room for Dengmei’s responsive reply. As a result, Dengmei’s sad frame of mind suddenly becomes lighter and a sense of comfort wells up within her.

Another hypertext for admiring nature and its integrity is also used when Dengmei’s youngest son, Liu Mingji (劉明基), and Peng Renjie’s eldest grandson, Peng Yonghui, (彭永輝) tramp up to Hawk’s Beak; this occurs during the time of the Pacific War, before the young men leave Fanzai Wood and set out for the South Pacific on conscripted service. In the face of a future fraught with little possibility of a triumphant return due to Japan’s successive defeats in the South Pacific, nature embraces their anxious minds and at the same time gives them the strength to face the

---

101 It was a mysterious place that most people avoided, because they were told that some who went to climb it never returned.
cruel reality:

He (Mingji) could feel the earth under his two bare feet; he could feel the beat of his heart in his feet. [...] Feeling at one with the world, he saw himself standing on the earth, connecting the earth with heaven, providing nature with consciousness.  

At a superficial level, each of these passages is uttered as a monologue by the narrator when one of the protagonists encounters distress, hopelessness, or a dilemma in a particular situation. However, each passage is simultaneously presented as if it was also the voice of either the narrator or the protagonist, and as a result, a synchronically dialogic effect occurs between the protagonist, the author and the narrator. Accordingly, not only is the beauty of the land and nature sympathetically echoed by the “self”, for instance, on differing occasions, by Ahan, Dengei, Mingding or Mingji, respectively. It is also felt by “others” such as readers, the author, and the narrator. This kind of phenomenon undoubtedly leads to the presentation of another layer of social heteroglossia which is to be examined as follows in terms of diachronic dimension.

As a result of the intertextual operation, a collective consciousness stemming from the locality of Taiwan develops among those people who are directly involved and is then constantly reinforced. The reason lies in the concept of the centripetal/centrifugal forces that Bakhtin argued for, “[e]very utterance participates in the ‘unitary language’ and at the same time partakes of social and historical heteroglossia.”

\(^{103}\) Bakhtin, M. M., Morris, P., Voloshinov, V. N., & Medvedev, P. N. *The Bakhtin Reader: Selected*
forces that work towards a concrete ideological unification, resulting in the land consciousness that comes into being based on native Taiwan.\textsuperscript{104}

As Bakhtin argued, a monologue resembles an inner speech and is best understood as dialogue which is a continuous two-way interaction between the subjective and the social.\textsuperscript{105} In this regard, I argue that Li Qiao’s narrative is involved in a unitary discourse as discussed above, and at the same time Li Qiao also engages in presenting heteroglossia at various stages. The two examples provided below are also presented as monologues taken from \textit{The Deserted Village}. They are spoken by Mingding, who decides to follow in the footsteps of his father, Ahan and to engage in the activities of the Taiwanese Cultural Association and a peasant movement in Fengshan (鳳山). The following passage occurs after Mingding reveals his dilemma in his determination to participate in opposition activities, yet is not able to tell his parents the truth for fear that they will be worried:

\begin{quote}
How beautiful and how lovely the small mountain village is!

Yet, how hard, broken and hopeless were those people!

Only because they are Taiwanese,

No, the general masses from all over the world are in fact facing this fate,

No, I should say, the general masses of Taiwan are in fact facing such a fate.\textsuperscript{106}
\end{quote}

After leaving his beloved mother, Mingding travels down to the south of Taiwan by train in order to take part in a peasant movement held in Fengshan. The beautiful

\begin{flushright}
\textit{Writings of Bakhtin, Medvedev, and Voloshinov}. p. 75.
\textsuperscript{104} Ibid., pp. 74-75.
\textsuperscript{105} Ibid., p.57.
\end{flushright}

79
scenery of the plain in south Taiwan touches his heart and he declares his feelings:

It turns out that Taiwan is so beautiful!

It turns out that there is indeed such a wonderful free world in our life!

How wonderful it would be if I did not bear such a burden of worries!

[...]

How wonderful it would be if the island of Taiwan had not been occupied by foreign forces! [...]

Clearly, the natural beauty that Ahan and Denmei felt earlier is also embraced by their son Mingding. It shows explicitly that the emotional expressions such as “the beautiful chain of mountains”, “melting into nature”, “feeling the earth”, and “feeling of being at one with nature” have converged to a new utterance “Taiwan” or “Taiwanese”. However, for Mingding, who was educated and grew up under the influence of the Japanese assimilation policy, the question is – can this imply that he has developed a Taiwanese national identity? Despite Mingding’s determination to take part in opposition activities, a determination derived from his land consciousness, the expression of an explicit national identity with Taiwan, seems in my view to be somewhat abrupt. In this regard, I argue that it was the narrator’s subjective emotional evaluation that decided the content of his intertextual utterance, and that this is a result of an interaction between his individual consciousness and socio-political change.

As a result, the operation for re-contextualizing the praise of nature and land leads to a clear signal of the identity belonging to the people who were living on this

---

island, and the words “Taiwan” or “Taiwanese” are able to be uttered without any hesitation in Li Qiao’s text. Therefore, not only does Mingding’s utterance echo the main concept of embracing the beauty of nature as its precursor did, it also reflects another reality. Thus it is that social heteroglossia develops and its effect on promoting a new identity based on the locality of Taiwan then challenges the canonic ideology of Chineseness.
Chapter Three
A Post-Colonial Perspective into Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*

In Chapter Two, I have demonstrated how Li Qiao’s use of intertextuality played a significant role in revealing and articulating Taiwanese identity in his *Wintry Night Trilogy*. In this chapter, I adopt a broader perspective to analyze the text, using a theoretical framework based on post-colonial arguments constructed by Lacan, Fanon and Bhabha. I argue that Li Qiao’s post-colonial discourse in the narrative of *Wintry Night Trilogy* involved three basic themes: the development of self consciousness, the role of the collaborators and the establishment of counter discourse.

To begin with, Lacan’s insight into the formation of individual identity is important to help grasp the development of self-consciousness in Li Qiao’s text. Lacan reread Freud’s theories and developed them further to explore their meaning in relation to human behaviour and identity. According to Lacan, the “mirror stage” is a stage of psychological development in which a child recognizes himself/herself in the mirror and becomes conscious of selfhood and himself/herself as a separate being.¹ This recognition begins the process of the young individual developing an identity that is distinct from others and yet, at the same time, is dependent on the images of others to determine oneself.

Lacan’s use of the term “other” involves a distinction between the “Other” and the “other”, which is useful in explaining the development of self-consciousness among the main characters in Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*. For Lacan, “the other” resembles the self and his theory of the mirror stage can be applied to understand the representation of colonized others who are marginalized by imperial discourse and

come to recognize themselves and be recognized by others according to their
difference from the centre.²

Lacan contrasts the "other" with “the Other” or “the great Other” in whose gaze
the subject gains identity and through which the “Symbolic order” comes into being.³
According to Ashcroft et al., the Symbolic order “is not a real interlocutor but can be
embodied in other subjects such as the mother or father that may represent it”.⁴ The
Symbolic order is also embodied in cultural institutions and normative practices. The
Other is crucial to the subject because the subject exists in its gaze and it functions in
two ways. First, it provides the terms in which the colonized subject gains a sense of
his or her identity as somehow “other” and dependent. Second, “the Other” becomes
the “absolute pole of address” whereby the colonized subject comes to understand the
world and to understand his/her place in it as a “subject.”⁵

Juxtaposed with Lacan’s theory of the mirror stage, Fanon’s critical analysis of
the psyche of colonized people provides a fruitful way to understand how a mimic
man or a collaborator is produced in Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy. As he suggests,
“for a black man attempting to escape the association of blackness with evil, he must
wear a white mask, or thinks of himself as a universal subject equally participating in
a society that advocates an equality supposedly abstracted from personal
appearance”.⁶ For a black man wearing a white mask, “the cultural values are
internalized or ‘epidermalized’ into consciousness, and as such, a fundamental
disjuncture is created between the black man’s consciousness and his body as it is

³ Ibid., 155.
⁴ Ibid., 155.
⁵ Ibid., 156.
apprehended in the world. Under these conditions, the black man becomes alienated from himself.” 7

Indeed, in the face of the dominant culture, those who internalize such values are likely to become the sort of “collaborators” described in Wintry Night Trilogy, comparable to the “comprador class” described by Fanon. Fanon developed the idea of a “comprador class” or “elite” who “exchanged roles with the white colonial dominating class without engaging in any radical restructuring of society which takes account of the people and their values.” 8 Moreover, “the black skin of these compradors was “masked” by their complicity with the values of the white colonial powers.” 9

In Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy, characters such as Liu Minding and Liu Mingji are members of the native intelligentsia and are engaged in a radical restructuring of society on the basis of people’s values. They are essentially different from those being described as “collaborators” or, colloquially, as being “three legged”. In this regard, the work of Namiki Masato (並木真人) 10 and Poshek Fu 11 provide us with a comprehensive outline regarding the “comprador class” as they appear in the history of Taiwan.

Since Taiwan, Korea and Shanghai shared similar experiences of being occupied and colonized by Japan during the first half of the twentieth century, Namiki Masato’s research on Korean collaborators and Poshek Fu’s study of Chinese intellectuals under Japanese rule are relevant for Taiwan’s colonial context. Namiki argues that the Korean collaborators under Japanese rule can be roughly divided into two categories:

9 Ibid., p. 91.
10 A Japanese scholar specialized in Korea’s history under Japanese rule.
11 Poshek Fu is professor of history, EALC, and cinema studies. His research focuses on the intersection between social and cultural history and Chinese and Hong Kong cinemas.
the ideological type (traditional elite), and the technocratic type (new elite). Based on Namiki’s framework, Taiwanese scholar Ho I-lin (何義麟) argues that collaboration in colonial Taiwan was a result of the structural problems of colonial rule and should be treated as a class problem. This situation is represented in Li Qiao’s narrative through the exploitative landlord Ye Atian (traditional elite) who belonged to the upper social class and those collaborators dubbed “three legged” (new elite) who acted as executors of the colonial power.

Namiki Masato contends that a critical approach to collaboration needs to take into account the psychological condition of the collaborators, especially their conformity, as expediency or internalization. He further divides the thought and actions of colonial subjects into three categories: those who conformed and internalized; those who conformed but did not internalize; those who neither conformed nor internalized. Namiki’s analysis is similar to the classification of Poshek Fu, who studied the reaction of Chinese intellectuals at a time when Shanghai was under Japanese occupation (1936-1945) and divided them into three types: resistant, passive, and collaborating. Namiki also suggests that passivity mediates between resistance and collaboration, and that there always existed a gray zone which was neither directly active nor completely passive. As we shall see, Li Qiao’s narrative in Wintry Night represents Japanese colonial policy during its occupation of Taiwan and includes the above three types of colonial subjectivities suggested by Namiki and Fu.

13 Ts’ai, Hui-yu Caroline. Taiwan in Japan’s Empire Building. p. 137.
As for the third theme, “the establishment of a counter discourse”, I argue that Li Qiao in his novel engaged in a multi-layered approach, explicitly and implicitly responding to colonial discourse both in the story context and the narrating context. To show this in detail, I will refer in my analysis to Fanon’s notion of “absolute violence”, Saussure’s sign system, and Homi Bhabha’s concepts of “ambivalence”, “hybridity” and “the third space”.

In The Wretched of the Earth, Fanon develops a critical Manichean perspective and argues that to overcome the binary system where black is bad and white is good, an entirely new world must come into being. In other words, a total revolution with “absolute violence” is required.\(^\text{15}\) He further argues that in the case of Africa, a true revolution can only come from the peasants. Fanon’s viewpoint serves as a guideline for this chapter to examine whether an “absolute violence” fits the Taiwan context and Li Qiao's novel and the extent to which, in the narrative, the colonized subjects engage in such a struggle for personal dignity or self-consciousness.

Saussure considers language as a system of signs, which can be studied synchronically as a complete system at a given point in time. Each sign is made up of a “signifier” and a “signified”. The signifier is the pointing finger, the word or the sound-image; the signified is the concept, the meaning or the thing indicated by the signifier.\(^\text{16}\) Except in a limited number of cases, the relation between the linguistic signifier and signified is arbitrary, and it is in the interpretation of the signifier that meaning is created.\(^\text{17}\) I argue that Li Qiao’s post-colonial representation in Wintry Night


\(^{17}\) Ibid.
*Trilogy* constitutes a strong intervention in the operation of the colonial sign system so that a discourse opposing the dominant discourse gradually comes into being in the narrative.

Bhabha’s research focuses on the representation of language and culture in colonial society as the means by which the colonizer maintains its ruling power. He pays particular attention to the impact of the colonial modernity on the people of the colonies. Indeed, Bhabha’s analysis of colonizer/colonized relations complicates any theory of oppression by stressing their interdependence and the mutual construction of their subjectivities, an extension of Lacan’s mirror stage into a kind of two-way mirror. Bhabha contends that all cultural statements and systems are constructed in what he calls the “third space of enunciation”\(^\text{18}\). Cultural identity always emerges in this contradictory and ambivalent “in-between” space that carries the burden and meaning of culture.\(^\text{19}\)

In the preface of *Nation and Narration*, Bhabha argues that the ambivalence of language is central to the construction of the discourse of the "nation." For Bhabha, the sense of the nation is one of the major structures of ideological ambivalence within the cultural representations of “modernity”.\(^\text{20}\)

In Li Qiao’s narrative, the resistance of the colonized is not particularly aimed at the Japanese. Rather, the narrative expands the scope of the relationship between “the colonizer and the colonized” to “suppressor and suppressed”. Since the critical practice defined as “post-colonial” deals with ways to “deconstruct the hidden codes and assumptions of the colonial powers and their traditions,”\(^\text{21}\) in this chapter, I apply the post-colonial theories outlined above to Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* so as to

---


\(^{19}\) Ibid., p.38.


explore the post-colonial discourses, meanings and resistances embedded in the trilogy. First, I discuss the theme of “headhunting” and explore the role it played in the colonial sign system. Second, I explore how Li Qiao’s presentation of Chineseness and Taiwaneseness in Wintry Night Trilogy relates to Bhabha’s notion of “the third space”, especially where different identities encounter and negotiate with each other, and where the dominant identity discourse encounters challenges and gives rise to the reconstitution of a new hybrid identity. Third, I argue that the stories and plot in Wintry Night Trilogy are framed intertextually by critical comments and evaluations from characters and the narrator.

1. “Headhunting” as a signifier

In 1884, Taiwan became a province of the Imperial Qing (清). Under Qing rule, much of Taiwan’s land was occupied by aboriginals and beyond direct government control. Under the first governor Liu Mingchuan, the “raw” or “uncivilized” aborigines were eventually forced to submit to Qing rule. However, most tribes still kept their traditional headhunting practice (出草). Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy reflects this historical context in that many lower class Han settlers such as Peng Aqiang entered into private agreements with the aborigines to gain free use and control of their land.

In the first volume of Wintry Night, Li Qiao’s introduction depicts the Hakka ethnic group’s historical link with Canton province in China. He then describes the geography of Miaoli (苗栗) County and its settlement by various ethnic groups. Li Qiao’s narration then focuses on the Hakka family led by Peng Aqiang (彭阿強).

In the fifteenth year of the Guangxu reign of the Qing Dynasty (1889), a drastic
flood destroyed 60 to 70 percent of the rice paddy field in Miaoli, where Peng Aqiang and his sons worked as peasant labourers for their employer Uncle Shanqing (善慶伯)\(^{23}\). The place where the Peng family settled was Stone Wall (石圍牆) which marked the end of the oxcart road from Miaoli. Facing this disaster, Peng Aqiang considered that his married sons Renjie (人傑) and Renhua (人華) needed to make their own way in order not to fail their ancestors. Hence, Peng Aqiang decided to ask Uncle Shanqing’s permission to leave and face the dangers and hardships of relocating his family to Fanzai Wood (蕃仔林). There, a complex partnership develops between nature, land, aborigines and the Peng family. Fanzai Wood, located in the hilly area east of Great Lake\(^ {24}\), was still under the control of the indigenous people and was at the same time in the process of being opened up.

For the Peng family and other people living in Fanzai Wood, their self consciousness is initially engendered through their distinctly uncolonial understanding of the difference between “us” and “them”, between the indigenous people and the Han settlers. In other words, their subjective realization is built on the primary feeling of “sameness” or “difference” in the context of human/human or human/nature interactions. Later in the narrative, the aboriginal practice of “headhunting” is employed as a signifier of cultural difference. More significantly, the practice plays a prominent role as both signifier and signified in the operation of sign system where a counter discourse comes into being and undermines the dominant discourse of the subsequent Japanese rule.

1.1. The development of self consciousness in the pre-modern era

In comparison to the “Han Holo” (福佬) settlers, who had mainly migrated to

\(^{23}\) “Uncle” is a courtesy title here.

\(^{24}\) A hilly village located in the south-east of Miaoli.
Taiwan earlier than “Han Hakka” (客家) settlers and had settled most of the plain areas, the belated arrival of Han Hakka settlers manifested the common fate of Hakka in Taiwan and across China. The Hakka were normally considered to be a minority ethnic group, and to be a lower class of farm workers. In addition, in Taiwan, they often had to locate themselves in the hilly areas close to aboriginal villages. Hence, the journey of the ethnically Hakka Peng family from Stone Walls to Fanzai Wood (蕃仔林) symbolizes a significant meaning which is deconstructive yet also constructive for the transition of their identity consciousness.

Li Qiao’s depiction of the journey on which Peng Aqiang led the Peng family to Great Lake Village carrying a basket in which the spirit tablets of his ancestors were placed\(^\text{25}\) shows Peng Aqiang’s determination to carry on the line of the Peng family, and in addition, the heritage of being Hakka. The journey also indicates the determination of the Peng family to seek a new identity based on the new land that they are going to explore and cultivate. In other words, the Peng family is determined to break away from the traditional stereotype that the Hakka people are among the lower socio-economic classes, so they decide to be the masters of the land rather than working as peasant labourers under the gaze of a landlord. The following speech by Peng Aqiang conveys the party’s decision after their arrival at Fanzai Wood:

“Listen, everyone,” said Peng Aqiang with a wave of his hands, “we can plant anything we like – this is our land.” His elation knew no bounds.\(^\text{26}\)

What has been presented in Li Qiao’s narration at this stage is the strength of the family and the sense of clan consciousness, along with a developing land


consciousness, rather than any form of national consciousness.

a. Headhunting as a marker between us and them

The headhunting practice (出草) of the aboriginal mountain Atayal (泰雅) tribe according to Li Qiao, is not just a way of fighting enemies, but also a rite of initiation for young men. For the Peng family and the other Hakka settlers of Fanzai Wood, the “raw” or “uncivilized” headhunting aborigines, are regarded in the same way as ghosts\(^{27}\), or natural disasters, that are unlikely to attack Fanzai Wood very often. As one of the English translators of *Wintry Night*, John Balcom observes: “The aborigines tend to be portrayed as just one more impersonal force of nature, much like storms or earthquakes. [...]”\(^{28}\) As such, the attitude of the Hakka settlers towards the practice of head-hunting is more a reaction of fear and reverence rather than a feeling derived from hostility or hatred. Since feeding all the family members is the first concern, in the narrative Peng Aqiang weighs up the gains and losses of venturing into the woods and concludes:

We will end up starving to death if we don’t move to the mountains. I would rather lose my head than starve to death.\(^{29}\)

Liu Ahan, one of the armed escorts for the family during the journey and also a member of the guard post and still later Peng Aqiang’s son-in-law, expresses his optimism and trust in Heaven in the face of natural danger:

The head-hunting of the aborigines, their shining white edges and our


flowery blood are all concerns that may or may not happen later, tomorrow or at nightfall. Why not just grasp the joy of the present moment?³⁰

Xu Shihui (許石輝) who has the most manpower and the most land under cultivation in the region, conveys a similar view about the settlers' fortunes in the face of natural danger:

Fanzai Wood is a place of good fortune. The tribesmen always passed the place by and never really launched an attack on it. For most of the time, this (headhunting) is unlikely to occur.³¹

As a result, Li Qiao's narrator concludes that “the worries at Fanzai Wood around New Year proved groundless.”³² In fact, prior to the appearance of the oppressive landlord Ye Atian, the Han settlers of Fanzai Wood and the Atayal aborigines develop a distinctive relationship more like neighbours than enemies. For example, aboriginal women often visit the markets of the Han settlers. More importantly, the Hakka settlers are able to live and farm in Fanzai Wood because of their acceptance by the tribespeople. For the Peng family and others living in Fanzai Wood, head-hunting is indeed a storm that might cause casualties but the danger seems unlikely to occur.

The relationship between the aboriginals and the Peng family becomes more positive in Li Qiao’s narrative after the advent of Japanese rule. The Japanese are perceived as the common enemy by both the Han settlers and the aborigines. The following conversation between a tribesman from the Atayal tribe and a guard from one of the outposts (隘寮) exemplifies this phenomenon:

---

³⁰ Ibid., p. 39.
³¹ Ibid., p. 72.
³² Ibid., p. 79.
“Do the Atayal people also hate the Japanese?”

“Yes. We get along with the Chinese. There will be too many people and nothing to eat if the Japanese come.”

“Are you going on the warpath?”

“We have made peace with the Chinese. So we’ll kill the Japanese.”

Obviously, both the aborigines and the Han Hakka living in Fanzai Wood have reached a consensus understanding and consider each other part of “us” while the foreign Japanese invaders are “them”.

b. Rejecting “othering”

The three-way partnership between the eight households who settled in Fanzai Wood, the indigenous Atayal people, and their natural environment remains stable until ownership of the land is challenged by the emerging landlord class who have also managed to become the legal owners of the rural land. Ye Atian (葉阿添), one of the settlers of the Great Lake area, obtained the land deeds for Fanzai Wood and thus destabilizes the consensus between the Atayal and the Peng family.

The fact that Ye Atian obtained official tenure of the land from the Japanese officials after Peng and others had opened up the land of the Fanzai Wood irritated the Pengs. For the Peng families and others living in Fanzai Wood, the land they cultivated is the livelihood into which they poured their sweat and blood. Not

---


34 According to the narrator, the Japanese grew impatient with the complicated litigation and finally set terminal dates for all cases; they decided that if a claimant was not able to produce proof of ownership, his land would be confiscated and sold. (*Wintry Night*, p. 292) The Japanese colonial authorities imposed land-tenure reform and a three-year land investigation in Taiwan between 1901 and 1905. See more in Lamley, H. J. “Taiwan Under Japanese Rule, 1895-1945: The Vicissitudes of Colonialism”, in Rubinstein, Murray A. (ed.) *Taiwan - A New History*. pp. 201-260.
reconciled to the treatment of Fanzai Wood settlers as “bandits” and “squatters” nor to the prospect of losing his land, Peng Aqiang’s final desperate action is to courageously sink his teeth into Ye Atian’s neck and killing him. For a tough Hakka like Peng Aqiang, illiterate and working as a peasant farmer for most of his life, it is important to lead the way to Fanzai Wood for the future of his offspring. Ye Atian’s legal maneuvering to obtain control of the land of Fanzai Wood is just beyond his humble comprehension.

In the face of Ye Atian’s ongoing provocative action, Peng felt he was powerless to do anything except to adopt an extreme measure, since his persistent nature strengthened his determination not to revert to a life of dependency and degradation. Confronting the domineering Ye Atian, Peng argued: “We don’t owe any money. We never borrowed any money, so where does the interest come from? It was Ye Atian who took over the land we opened and then cheated us into signing a tenancy agreement.”

Because the Atayal tribe people are recognized by the Peng family as one of “us”, their kindness and early warning of headhunting contrast in the narrative with Ye Atian’s brutal act of “killing without spilling blood”. In his final physical act, Peng Aqiang would rather become aboriginalized and even describes his upcoming negotiation with Ye Atain as a “headhunting practice”.

In a cultural version of Lacan’s “mirror stage”, the villagers of Fanzai Wood discovered during the confrontation that they were “the colonized other” marginalized by a suppressive discourse, that of the landowners. They recognized the formation of "the Other" and the symbolic Order was embodied in people like Ye Atian and in the law implemented by the new Japanese colonial government. Under the gaze of "the

37 Ibid., p. 414.
Other”, Peng Aqiang and the other villagers gained their identity as “the colonized other”.

The villagers gained a sense of their identity as “other” and “dependent” when they realized they were no longer eligible to be masters of the land they had opened. Not only was their economy dominated by “the Other”, Ye Atian, but they also had to comply with the law imposed by the Japanese. “The Other” becomes the “absolute pole of address”, the ideological framework within which the villagers of Fanzai Wood came to understand the world and recognized that an “othering” process was in progress.

Peng Aqiang’s brutal action towards Ye Atain conveys a strong message. He is rejecting the new symbolic order, which resembles, in an eerily literal way, Fanon’s description of the situation of the colonized black: “Mankind set free of the trampoline that is the resistance of others, and digging into its own flesh to find a meaning.” For Peng Aqiang, Japanese laws and regulations are meaningless. His violent refusal to become Ye Atian’s “other” exemplifies how, according to Fanon, “fever is the weapon of choice of the impotent.” The driving force behind Peng’s violence is his resentment, which, following Fanon, begins with “a consciousness of powerlessness” and then develops as a weapon. That Ye Atian has become the owner of Fanzai Wood is a fact that Peng Aqiang can neither change nor accept. His violent action against Ye Atian masks the helplessness of all the Fanzai Wood residents, and accordingly the power of the suppressor is disabled through Peng Aqiang’s fatal bite.

Peng’s violent action also plays a role in “retaining this fire through

---

39 Ibid., p.11.
self-combustion.”⁴¹ As Li Qiao’s narrator describes the action, “he had chosen to die there, and he had chosen how to die.”⁴² Peng decides that the place of his death is to be under the hanging tree, at the base of which he will sit upright with a rope in his hands. Peng’s choice and his determination to die in a dignified and calm manner without pain or regret affirm his autonomy. As a consequence, through absolute violence Peng Aqiang gained self identity by refusing to be distinguished as “the other”. Nonetheless, Peng Aqiang’s absolute violence was short lived and a single event in a much larger binary contrast between the suppressor and the suppressed at a time when resistance was still unconsolidated and the ambivalent boundary between the suppressor and the suppressed had not yet been established.

Li Qiao attempts to rationalize Peng Aqiang’s violence through narrative point of view and literary technique. Peng Aqiang’s optical illusion, seeing Ye Atian as a big, soft sweet potato during the conflict seems to explain why Peng resorts to the "primitive" act of biting his enemy. Peng’s intense perception of Ye Atian as a sweet potato also prefigures the Taiwan national imaginary. The island of Taiwan is in the shape of a sweet potato and Taiwanese people often call themselves “sons of sweet potatoes”.⁴³ In the post Formosa Incident era when the slogan “We are sweet potatoes, you are taros” became popular in the everyday lives of the people; the “sweet potato” that Peng Aqiang swallowed through extreme means, provides proto potential for articulating a Taiwanese imagery.

2. The signification of “headhunting”

Although the story of Wintry Night Trilogy is based mainly on the experiences of Han Hakka communities, Li Qiao also pays close attention to the life and customs of

---

⁴³ The Chinese Mainlanders who migrated to the island after 1945 are called “taro”.
the indigenous people living in mountainous area of Taiwan. Li Qiao is one of very few Han Taiwanese writers in the 1970s who showed an interest in including issues of indigenous people in their writings. Besides Li Qiao, another Hakka writer, Zhong Zhaozheng (鍾肇政), also represented indigenous people in his texts. Zhong Zhaozheng had been Li Qiao’s mentor. In 1974, Zhong composed the novel *The Unpredictable Changes in Ma Hepo* (馬赫波風雲) in which the anti-Japanese *Washe Incident* (1928) instigated by the Atayal tribe is the main theme. Two factors explain Li Qiao’s inclusion of indigenous people and their themes in *Wintry Night Trilogy*. One is the commonality of Hakka communities and the aborigines experienced as minor groups; the other is the geographical proximity of the two groups.

In the 1970s the question of the indigenous tribes in Taiwan was still largely neglected by the dominant discourse. Li Qiao’s inclusion of Taiwanese indigenous people in his narrative is meaningful for that reason alone. For the aboriginal tribe people like the Atayal described in *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the practice of headhunting was a reinforcement of territorial boundaries and a way of settling disputes within indigenous communities. The practice was also a rite of initiation for young men and a guaranteed entrée to the afterlife.\(^4^4\)

Li Qiao’s narrative depicts the headhunting practices of the Atayal tribe mostly in the first volume *Wintry Night*. As discussed above, for the Peng family and other villagers settling in Fanzai Woods, the practice of “headhunting”, despite its threatening aspect, plays a key role in distinguishing “us” and “them”, and thus in the formation of Taiwanese self consciousness in the pre-modern period under late Qing and early Japanese rules.

In the second volume of the trilogy, *The Deserted Village*, the aborigines are

absent as the narrative mostly relates to the activities of the Taiwanese Cultural Association and Peasants Movement. These activities are not geographically significant to the aborigines who live in the rural mountainous area. Those involved in these social and political enlightenment activities or anti-Japanese movements are mainly from among the Han ethnic groups. However, since the story time of the second and the third volumes is exactly the time when modernism and the Japanization movement were being introduced or implemented island-wide in Taiwan, the experiences of Taiwanese aborigines are included in the narratives as part of Li Qiao's respect for full historical context.

For example, the Japanese colonial government enacted a series of measures prohibiting older inadequate and rooted customs such as foot-binding and queue-wearing. Since headhunting was considered a savage practice by the Japanese colonial authorities, the ritual practice of the aborigines was also prohibited. The prohibition affected the social order of the indigenous people as headhunting had been among the teachings of their ancestors (gaya), and it is believed that one of the triggering factors of the Wushe Incident of 1930 was the indigenous people’s discontent over being forced to abandon some of their beliefs such as the practice of headhunting.45

The Japanization movement implemented island-wide by the Japanese colonial regime after 1910 aimed at implanting the spirit of Japanese imperial nationalism in Taiwan, promoting Japanese education, encouraging the learning of Japanese language and customs, and cultivating the character of loyal imperial subjects. The assimilation policy was further reinforced in 1937 in response to the Marco Polo

Bridge Incident in China.46 These reinforced measures included the elimination of Chinese columns in newspapers, the promotion of Japanese language, and the abolition of traditional temples and idols. In early 1940, a name-change movement was implemented to encourage Taiwanese to use Japanese names.

During the Pacific war (1941-1945), Taiwan became the base of Japanese imperial policies as part of the Southward March and wartime industrialization. Starting in April 1942, Japan began to enlist Taiwanese youth as so-called “Special Army Volunteers”. Between 1942 and 1944, about 6,000 "volunteers" were sent to the front; approximately 1,800 were aborigines.47 Beginning in August 1943, about three thousand men were recruited as “Navy Special Volunteers”, and the military unit composed of "volunteer" aborigine youth was called “Takasago Volunteers”. (高砂義勇隊).

In postwar Taiwan, the historical account regarding “Takasago Volunteers” was excluded by the dominant discourse, as were many aspects of Taiwan aboriginal history. Instead, what has been highlighted by the Nationalist authorities is the Wushe Incident (霧社事件, 1930),48 in which aborigines are represented as patriotic heroes for their anti-Japanese upheaval and destruction. By contrast, Li Qiao’s representation of the history of “Takasago Volunteers” in his trilogy is suggestive and interventionist since it involves narrating the suppressed history of Taiwan.

The ritual yet violent practice of headhunting becomes politically and culturally meaningful in the third volume, The Lone Lamp, which depicts the “Takasago

---

46 Marco Polo Bridge (Lugouqiao/盧溝橋) Incident, (July 7, 1937) was the conflict between Chinese and Japanese troops near the Marco Polo Bridge, which developed into war between the two countries and was considered the prelude to the Pacific side of World War II.


48 Wushe Incident is to be discussed later in this section.
Volunteers,” exclusively comprising of aborigines, who fought bravely for Japan in Southeast Asia against the Allies. As reflected in Li Qiao's trilogy, the actions taken by the Takasago Volunteers in the Pacific War involve multi-layers of signification. First, the unit's actions signify metaphorically the practice of headhunting which distinguishes the aborigines of Taiwan. Second, the military acts of the Takasago Volunteers also coopted the Japanese samurai spirit and draw a further analogy to other signified themes of Japaneseness such as the seppuku/hara-kiri practice, the Kamikaze pilots and Li Qiao's narrative of Su Ahua’s suicide-like revenge against the Japanese officer Tanaka. Competing nationalist themes are invoked in the narrative representation of aborigines under Japanese command in the Pacific War.

2.1. “Takasago volunteers” as a signifier

In Chapter Nine of the third volume, The Lone Lamp, the acts of bravery of the “Takasago Volunteers” are depicted concisely yet powerful. Japanese military forces were confronted with fierce counterattacks in the Pacific from the Allied forces. The narrative describes how a team of “Takasago Volunteers” became real imperial subjects:

On November 26, 1944, the Takasago Volunteers team “Xun Airforce” landed on the U.S.-controlled airport. Each of them carried a slightly curved, three foot long, sword on his back. With two hand grenades each hanging from their chests, these topless “Takasago Volunteers” showed their gaya spirit, by bursting into the U.S. military camp and fighting face to face with the Americans. As a result,

---

49 Seppuku refers to a form of Japanese ritual suicide. It was originally reserved for samurai and has been considered to be an honourable form of death for the samurai. A short sword was thrust into the left abdomen. Cut to the right, cut up and then pulled out, after which the seppuku would be headed by one of his friends using a long sword.
they ended up as “all gyokusai” (全體玉破, all devoted their lives).\textsuperscript{50}

Li Qiao's narrator further notes that on December 6, 1944 another Takasago team Gao Qiansui (高千穗空挺隊) also fought bravely against the Americans and showed their gaya spirit, but nonetheless, their efforts resulted in “all gyokusai”.\textsuperscript{51}

For these Takasago Volunteers, the jungle combat they engaged in on behalf of imperial Japan in the Pacific War resembled the practice of headhunting suppressed by the Japanese colonial authorities. However, the resemblance is ambivalent, displaced, because only during these wartime engagements in the jungle battlefields of the Philippines and elsewhere, not in their native country, are they allowed to practice ritual headhunting and thus regain the honour which the headhunting practice bestows on indigenous warriors. Their native ferocity and honour are coopted into the service of Japan's militaristic imperialism. In addition to enacting their ancestral ritual of headhunting, the episode featuring Takasago volunteers manifests the success of Japan's assimilation policy and the Japanization movement where Taiwanese youngsters including the indigenous youth were indoctrinated as loyal imperial subjects during the Pacific War.

The cultural meaning of these headhunting practices was transformed as a result of the colonial regime and the Japanization movement. Formerly stateless tribespeople were incorporated into a new and different cultural and national identity. Above all, their enlistment as “Takasago volunteers” actually enabled the indigenous youth to be treated equally with Japanese soldiers, in contrast to their previous lower social-economic status as colonial subjects. Given the fact that in postwar Japan the souls of the killed Takasago volunteers have been commemorated by Japanese in the

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{50} Li Qiao. \textit{Wintry Night Trilogy -3. The Lone Lamp} (寒夜三部曲. 3. 孤燈). 2001, p. 189.
\item \textsuperscript{51} Ibid., p. 190.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
Yasukuni Shrine (靖國神社), one ironic result of the war is that a counter discourse opposing and challenging the legitimacy of the Nationalist’s discourse began to come into being.

After the war, under the dominant Nationalist discourse, Taiwanese aborigines are described as possessing a strong anti-Japanese spirit, and the Wushe Incident of 1930 is among those included in the official discourse to support that claim. In postwar Taiwan, the anti-Japanese spirit of the Wushe Incident has been constructed as a common historical memory of Taiwanese people. Used as a model example of Taiwanese indigenous people fighting against colonial Japan, the Wushe Incident is included in the official history curriculum where Taiwanese indigenous tribes are introduced as one of the Chinese family ring. For example, in National Revolution and Taiwan (國民革命與台灣) edited by Chin Xiaoyi (秦孝儀), the historical role of the Wushe incident is clearly stated:

Despite the repeated defeats of the armed anti-Japanese activities of the Taiwanese people, their spirit to fight against Japanese rule has been deeply rooted in people’s minds. Although Taiwanese armed resistance has gradually transferred to non-violent means since 1921, the Wushe Incident of 1930 is the only armed anti-Japanese uprising during this period.52

The way that the Nationalist government interpreted the incident continues to be passed down as part of national ideology. For example, in a school history textbook edited by Wang Shufen (王淑芬) and Zhang Yiren (張益仁), the Wushe incident is concisely narrated as follows:

In addition to the Han Chinese anti-Japanese activities, the indigenous tribes also showed their resistance against Japanese brutality and oppression, there were one hundred and fifty anti-Japanese actions during the period of Japanese occupation. Among them, the most famous is the Wushe Incident led by Atayal aboriginal leader Mona Ludo, which unfortunately failed under Japan’s brutal repression.53

However, what has not been included in the official narrative is the fact that under the influence of Kominka (Japanization) education, many survivors of the Wushe Incident voluntarily enlisted as members of the Takasago Volunteer Force during the Pacific War.54 As I have argued earlier, the narrator of Wintry Night Trilogy does not reflect the dominant discourse of the Nationalist rule, and that different narrative perspective is evident in the novel’s account of the Takasago Volunteers. In the novel, the aborigines are represented as imperial subjects, not as anti-Japanese fighters. They enlisted as Takasago Volunteers and devoted themselves to headhunting-like suicide attacks against the Allied forces in the jungles of the Philippines and elsewhere. Thus Li Qiao is involved in developing a counter discourse in the novel in which the dominant discourse of the narrating time is undermined by the discourse of the narrated time. Without any reference to the ideology of Chinese nationalism, what is presented in Li Qiao’s narrative regarding the identity of “Takasago volunteers” is hybrid and ambivalent: their identity as Japanese imperial subjects, and their reclaiming of their native honor as real Atayal warriors.

2.2. Analogical links of Takasago volunteers

a. Seppuku ritual

As mentioned above, the wartime acts of Takasago volunteers bear partial similarity not only to tribal headhunting but also to themes associated with the Japanese ideal of the “samurai spirit”. The brief and exuberant blooming of Japanese cherry trees is an important symbol for the samurai spirit. The samurai warrior’s highly disciplined life as a cultured man of war has its highest goal to die honorably and preferably in the service of their country and in the prime of their life. In the history of Japan, seppuku and kamikaze pilots\textsuperscript{55} are two well known examples of the samurai spirit.

In \textit{The Lone Lamp} however, Mingji witnesses a conflicted, even botched Seppuku ritual carried out by Japanese officer Major Tani Nobunari as a result of Japan’s continuous defeats in the Pacific War. The incident confuses him because what Mingji observes is very different from what he had been taught about an honourable samurai death ritual. As Mingji puts it: “He’s going to commit hara-kiri, […]. But he looks different from the way they are described in books.”\textsuperscript{56} Mingji then tries to clear his bewilderment and comments:

The descriptions contained in novels glorifying hara-kiri by military men made it seem so solemn, so awesome, even holy. But obviously the major had drunk a great deal of sake, and his face was smeared with tears and snot. His wildly

\textsuperscript{55} Kamikaze were Japanese suicide pilots who attacked Allied warships in the Pacific Ocean during the Second World War.

protruding eyes were filled with hatred. He had nothing in common with the descriptions of ancient warriors who viewed death as a return home of sorts.\textsuperscript{57}

Instead of a noble death, Mingji sees a dishonorable scene filled with fear, sadness, anger and hesitation which challenges the dignity of the samurai spirit whose value is then undermined. For Mingji, a Taiwanese yet under the influence of the Japanization movement, what he has witnessed proves to be an awakening journey into self consciousness. He concludes that only those who hate their own lives are capable of inventing the kamikaze, that the ritual ideal is in fact an inhuman means of total destruction and the opium of the Japanese army.\textsuperscript{58}

Although Mingji’s bewilderment is tinged with sadness and helplessness, at the same time he develops a sense of liberation and is able to shed at least some of the colonizing stereotyped viewpoints which were the result of the Japanese brainwashing education he received during six years of primary school, two years of high school, and three years of technical school.\textsuperscript{59}

b. Kamikaze pilots

Unlike the embarrassing spectacle of the Japanese officer that Mingji witnessed when Major Tani Nobunari committed hara-kiri, the idealized beauty of a brief, honourable military life is reflected in other episodes of The Lone Lamp, when Kamikaze pilots from various ethnic backgrounds performed their astonishing feats during the Pacific War. The pilots' sudden death at a young age in the service of imperial Japan maintain the samurai spirit of being true Japanese. The blooming cherry trees carry a spiritual meaning for the Japanese people. As the narrator reminds

\textsuperscript{57} Ibid., p. 242.
\textsuperscript{58} Ibid., p. 244.
\textsuperscript{59} Ibid., p. 244.
us, “Cherry Blossoms” is a sad song and a favorite among the pilots. The lyrics convey a beautiful yet heart-breaking sentiment when the hara-kiri (suicide attack) was performed:

We are cherry blossoms of the same season,
Together we flower in the air force garden;
The southern sky was aglow with fire from the sun,
You shall never see a plane return.

However, the solemn atmosphere in these episodes is somewhat weakened by the dialogues among the main character Yonghui, Mingji and others. For example, when Yonghui and his comrades see four men approaching wearing white headbands with a red sun insignia and dressed in snow-white kimonos, the conscripted Taiwanese emphasize the death, not the honour:

They are going to commit hara-kiri.

“Are they going to kill themselves?”

“They are going to their deaths.”

“Yes, to their deaths,” said Yonghui.

A conversation between Mingji and a pilot from the kamikaze force produces a similar narrative effect. After Mingji is asked by a young Japanese officer for a chat when they meet at Nichols Field, the conversation reveals the Kamikaze pilot’s regret

---

over the brevity of his life. The pilot never gives Mingji his name as in his mind he will soon vanish in the sky, his strong body and handsome appearance will turn into a ball of flame with ashes blowing in the wind and falling down into the sea, and all will be gone.\textsuperscript{62} Although Mingji bows before him and shows respect for the pilot’s coming sacrifice and emphasizes that he is a Kamikaze warrior and a guardian of the Japanese empire, the pilot’s own expressed regret about his short life reveals a different interior psychology for the heroic character, his inner ambivalence, which through the dialogic technique of shifting narrative points of view necessarily weakens the sublime representation of samurai spirit.

c. Su Ahua’s suicidal acts

Su Ahua is Mingji’s girlfriend. As the Pacific War expanded and military personnel ran short, many Taiwanese youths were enlisted as civilian military personnel and sent to the front. Mingji was no exception, and his employer volunteered him for service. When Ahua heard the news, she said she would find a way to have the order rescinded. Her strategy to have Mingji exempted from being sent to the front was to positively respond to the sexual advances of her supervisor, a Japanese officer named Tanaka.

However, not surprisingly, Ahua’s attempt to save her lover proved to be a failure. When continued attempts at negotiation failed, she used non verbal tactics and employed body language with the Japanese officer. All was in vain because as Fanon suggests in the eyes of the colonizer, a colonized woman would never be respected, even she was the beloved of the colonizer.\textsuperscript{63}

\textsuperscript{62} Ibid., p. 224.
Nevertheless, Su Ahua’s suicidal revenge by putting herself in a situation where she had no room for retreat and confronting the Japanese officer is another signifier in the novel of how the Japanese samurai spirit is coopted or challenged. During a speech to a gathering at the youth training school, Su Ahua decides to make a radical commotion by cursing Tanaka and revealing his sexual extortion in front of everyone. Ahua’s later actions as a volunteer nurse aid in the Philippines also reinforce her fearless, samurai like spirit. The narrative thread involving Su Ahua is important in two respects. On the one hand, it supports the construction of the novel’s counter discourse, which undermines and partially rebuts the seriousness and dignity of the ruler’s dominant discourse. On the other hand, the Ahua narrative shows that a woman’s voice was still considered inferior and that to have her voice heard she needs to employ extreme means, just as the leader of the Peng family Peng Aqiang was forced to do in the pre-modern era.

In sum, whether or not the analogical links discussed here are consciously arranged by Li Qiao as part of the novelistic narration, the above analysis has reached the following conclusions about the coherence of the representations of the suppressors and the suppressed in *Wintry Night Trilogy*. First, during the pre-modern era (late Qing and early Japanese period) narration, “headhunting” works as an indicator for distinguishing “us” (the suppressed) from “them” (the suppressor). Under the gaze of the suppressing class, the Fanzai Wood villagers gained identity as “the other” of the suppressors. However, Peng Aqiang rejects this “othering” by resorting to a headhunting-like action against the suppressor.

Second, the representation of the “Takasago volunteers” signifies headhunting practice as a cultural identity marker which has ambivalent analogues not only with “Samurai spirit “ themes such as “Kamikaze pilots” and “seppuku” but also with Ahua’s “suicidal act”. Each narrative instance of the signifier “Takasago volunteers”
constitutes a narrative sign, which collectively challenge the validity and authenticity of the dominant colonial discourse both in the context of story (narrated) time and narrating time.

Through their headhunting and headhunting-like practices, the Takasago Volunteers carry out the spiritual journey of Gaya. At the same time, as marginalized aborigines, their actions bring them into the centre of colonial identity but produce ambivalent or hybrid subjectivity. The ambivalent space where their cultural and colonial identities were juxtaposed and previous “prohibited” knowledge was made available as part of the imperial war challenges the later dominant discourse which was part of Nationalist rule, and as such, contributes to the construction of “Taiwan” history.

3. Representing the third space

As I have argued (Introduction), the development of cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism in the postwar period needs to be studied in an intersectional framework. In this section, I explore how Chineseness and Taiwaneseness as constructed and represented in Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* relate to Bhabha’s notion of “the third space”, “an alternative space that blurs the limits and boundaries between the colonizer and the colonized, and engenders new possibilities for new identities and cultural formations.”64 Bhabha contends that a new hybrid identity emerges in the third space from the interweaving relationship between the coloniser and colonised, challenging the validity and authenticity of any essentialist cultural identity. In other words, hybridity is an antidote to “the belief in invariable and fixed

---

properties which define the ‘whatness’ of a given entity,” as suggested by Fuss.\(^65\)

This is especially applicable to the emergence of Taiwanese identities.

In Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, I argue that “the third space” plays a prominent role in articulating hybrid identity and acts as a metaphor for the space in which “cultures meet where colonial authority is challenged and hybrid identities are created”\(^66\). Bhabha further argues that the third space is not cohesive, rather, a site of tension, competing powers and sometimes insurmountable differences.\(^67\)

The discussion of *Wintry Night Trilogy* and construction of the “the third space/place” needs to take into consideration two key narratological temporal concepts: narrating context (narrational time) and narrated context (story time). Narrating context involves the time of the telling and that of reading, watching, or hearing; and narrated context refers to the time of story.\(^68\)

In terms of narrating time, we need to look back to an earlier stage of Li Qiao’s writing experience so as to understand the way that “third space” comes into being and how it relates to Li Qiao’s literary works, including the novel *Wintry Night Trilogy*. In the context of story, the third spaces are presented both explicitly and implicitly in *Wintry Night Trilogy*, where the dominant Japanese identity discourse encounters challenges and also gives rise to the reconstitution of a new hybrid identity.

I argue that “the third space” has been a device of post-colonial representation in Taiwan literature due to the fact that Taiwan had been under continuous foreign rule. The tradition of Taiwan literature established in the 1920s under Japanese rule

---


67 Ibid.

became alienated and marginalized after the Nationalists took over power from Japan in 1945. In postwar Taiwan, the process for Taiwan literature to regain a position near the dominant centre following this takeover still relates to the ruling strategies of the KMT. The main reason lies in the political nature of the KMT as being a settler regime under which the Mainland Chinese settlers had to maintain the status of being politically dominant over the native inhabitants through the implementation of a series of conciliatory and pragmatic measures to win over people’s support.

Since the Nationalist settler regime had lost its mother country in the mainland during the civil war, the dilemma it faced constantly was the question of how to rule the majority of native Taiwanese. Hence, in postwar Taiwan, the conciliatory approach of the KMT was twofold. Firstly some important posts were offered to reliable Taiwanese in the mainstream cultural arena; secondly Taiwanese anti-Japanese heroes were included in the KMT’s anti-Japanese discourse. As a result of these two strategies, various in-between spaces emerge and the postcolonial characteristics of hybrid identity are likely to develop.

Li Qiao’s literary approach in Wintry Night Trilogy represents “the third space” of cultural hybridity that the Nationalist regime did not like to see. In the 1970s by the time the trilogy was completely published in 1979 by Yuanjin, the hybrid representation of cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism in literary works had gone through three phases: the gestation stage, the sprouting stage and the developmental stage. The following discussion thus consists of two major parts distinguished by “narrating context” and “narrated context”.

3.1. The third space in gestation

Lin Haiyin’s (林海音) role as chief editor (1953-63) of the supplement page of the United Daily is significant because through her position, a network through which
literary works by native writers circulated in the literary field of dominant Taiwan culture gained access to the dominant literary field.

Lin Haiyin was welcome in the mainstream literary field mainly for her hybrid background. A Taiwan native with a Hakka background, Lin was brought up in Beijing, where she received professional training in journalism. Her pedigree and linguistic abilities were undoubtedly useful, but her ethnic origin was equally valuable: it was to the advantage of the Nationalists as minority rulers to include sympathetic native Taiwanese in their cultural bureaucracy. As Chang notes, Lin Haiyin “once half jokingly remarked that she was chosen for the job because she spoke Mandarin with an impeccable Beijing accent.” Besides, since “cultural policies conceived within a harsh political reality might be perceptibly softened somewhat by a feminine façade of gentleness and benevolence.”

The first two decades of the postwar era was a period when native Taiwanese endured considerable discrimination in many aspects. In literary terms, native literary works were largely excluded from mainstream publications and school textbooks. However, due to Lin Haiyin’s dynamic personality and editorship, native writers such as Zhong Lihe (鍾理和), Zhong Zhaozheng (鍾肇政), Huang Chunming (黃春明), Qideng Sheng (七等生), Zheng Qingwen (鄭清文) and Lin Huaimin (林懷民) came to public notice. Indeed, Lin Haiyin’s unique editing style played a significant role by including articles that were neutral or not overtly political in a daily publication affiliated to the dominant cultural arena. It was also during this period that Li Qiao became acquainted with Zhong Zhaozheng, who was among those noticed by Lin Haiyin. Through this connection Li Qiao became involved in the literary network later

---

70 Ibid., pp. 85-86.
on in the 1960s. Zhong Zhaozheng recalls Lin Haiyin’s editorship in the following terms:

The supplementary section of the United Daily was so small, that in addition to the space allotted for serials for pieces of creative writing and translation work, a piece of fiction had to consist of a maximum of 3,000 words in order to be published. Overwhelmed by Lin Haiyin’s kind response, we circulated the news among the local literary circles; moreover, we were all eager to submit our works to her. Such a harvest was considered to be rich. As a result, we established a close friendship with her, whereby communication was maintained by frequent letters back and forth.71

By establishing a network of publication for previously excluded writers, Lin Haiyin served as a cultural agent between the government and native Taiwanese writers. Her decision to include articles by native writers in a mainstream publication helped open the way to articulate cultural hybridity where elements of Chineseness and Taiwaneseness coexist. To be more specific, Lin Haiyin’s broadminded editorship helped create an “in-between” or the third space in the mainstream literary arena and enabled native cultural works to become accessible within the dominant discourse. As a result, the scope of the network expanded further by including the literary supplement pages of other newspapers. In the case of Li Qiao, during the period from 1962 to the mid 1970s, in addition to the United Daily, his short stories were also occasionally published in the literary supplement pages of newspapers such as the China Daily News (中華日報), Central Daily News (中央日報) and China Times (中

These were either operated by the authorities or affiliated with mainstream discourse. The influence of Lin Haiyin’s editorship is self-evident, and later in the 1990s she was continuously recognized by localist critics for providing publishing opportunities in the 1960s for native Taiwanese writers.72

3.2. The sprouting of the third space

Over the course of Nationalist rule (1945-2000, 2008-2016), patriotic heroes engaged in anti-Japanese activities had been used as role models in Nationalist education where Chinese nationalism was the central ideology. Among them, Luo Fuxing (羅福星) was favoured by the Nationalist authorities because he not only participated in Dr. Sun Yat-sen's Chinese Revolution of 1911, thus symbolizing Chineseness, but also helped prepare a revolution against the Japanese in Taiwan in 1912-13. The Chineseness that Luo Fuxing represented possessed hybrid characteristics relating to Taiwan, and has been welcome by the contemporary KMT authorities. For example, a news article (March 4, 2009) in China Post, reported the remarks of the then President Ma Ying-jeou (also the President of the Nationalist Party) during the unveiling of a statue of anti-Japanese hero Luo Fuxing. The president's attempt to please both supporters and opponents is obvious:

“Show you love Taiwan by action,” President Ma Ying-jeou urged the people yesterday. Speaking after unveiling a statue of Luo Fuxing, a Hakka revolutionary executed by the Japanese authorities, President Ma said some people profess they love Taiwan but do nothing to demonstrate their patriotism. These people should follow the example Luo set. […] “Luo is a great revolutionary,” the president said.

[...] Ma quoted Luo's last words at the ceremony for unveiling the statue at Tahu, near Miaoli. “Not dying at home to be remembered by one’s children,” said Luo, who was born in Indonesia, “I die in Taiwan to be remembered by the people of Taiwan.” The statue was unveiled at a Luo memorial hall to mark the 95th anniversary of his martyrdom. Ma also presented a plaque in praise of Luo setting an example to be followed forever.73

In May 1972 Chiang Ching-kuo, Chiang Kai-shek’s eldest son, was made Premier. In the face of a series of diplomatic failures following the jurisdictional dispute over the Daioyu Islands, he began to pay attention to ethnic issues by appointing more members of the Taiwanese elite to important party and government positions in an attempt to secure the support of the Taiwanese people. Despite an increased share of power for the native Taiwanese, Chinese Mainlanders still outnumbered Taiwanese at the higher echelons of the Nationalist party, the government, and in the national representative bodies.

Soon after Chiang Kai-shek died in 1975, Chiang Ching-kuo was elected as the Chairman of the Nationalist party. In 1978, the National Assembly elected him as the President of the ROC. Despite some moderate reforms being made, the authoritarian nature of the political system changed little during the early years of Chiang Ching-kuo’s rule. Martial law remained in force and other forms of strict political control continued. Nevertheless, when Chiang Ching-kuo assumed power in the second half of the 1970s, the Taiwanese political opposition campaign had become

more pervasive and visible.

One of the strategies implemented in the mainstream cultural field was the reinforcement of patriotic spirit by inviting native Taiwanese writers to become involved in national cultural events. As a member of the local literary network where his mentor Zhong Zhaozheng had become a literary agent, in 1972 Li Qiao wrote a play entitled “Luo Fuxing” for the monthly literary magazine Xin Wenyi (新文藝), the official publication of the Ministry of Military Defence that was circulated amongst military personnel. In the play Li Qiao highlighted Luo’s patriotic spirit and thus reinforced Chinese nationalism which was also the central theme of the KMT’s cultural policy as well as the guideline of school history curriculum.

However, I argue that Li Qiao also placed himself in a hybrid situation where negotiation with regard to his national identity tended to happen. The dilemma was twofold. First, Li Qiao’s involvement in this kind of writing resembled the task of writing history text books for schools in which it was required that the official norms be followed. Second, as a member of the native literary network, the fact that Li Qiao was occasionally recruited into official literary projects also enabled him to discover the cultural differences between the official discourse and the local variants. As a result, the increasing uncertainty of the dominant tradition was likely to be reflected in his subsequent writings.

As it was also a time when opposition activities began to develop, resulting in the gradual awakening of Taiwanese consciousness, the cultural propaganda of the Nationalist regime, namely that the Republic of China, as a multi-ethnic nation, is made up of at least five ethnic groups including; the Han, Manchurians, Mongolians, Hui, Tibetans and Uyghurs, proved to be a kind of mirage designed to gloss over the authoritarian nature of the regime. In reality, Taiwan was a society where

74 The play was published in issues 193 & 194 of Xin Wenyi (新文藝).
multiculturalism had been restricted. To show it was a broad-minded democratic regime where cultural diversity was in progress, the Nationalist government had to constantly reinforce its national discourse by fine-tuning its cultural policy to a localized approach in the face of the growing demand for substantial social and political reform from the developing opposition activities in Taiwan.

In 1977, Li Qiao was invited to join the writing project “The biographies of Taiwanese heroes and martyrs” (先賢先烈傳) organized by the History Committee of Nationalist party (黨史會). He was appointed to write the biography of Yu Qingfang, the leading figure in the Selai Temple (Tapani) Incident (西來庵/噍吧哖事件) of 1915. As discussed in Chapter two, although Li Qiao’s narrative in the biography fits in with the dominant Chinese ideology, he accidentally rediscovered his Taiwanese consciousness whereby a third space began to emerge as a result of reading abundant historical archives and visiting historical sites relating to the incident. By working on the biography project Li Qiao in a sense gradually constructed a third space where a hybrid identity might emerge. As a result of his growing Taiwanese consciousness, Li Qiao abandoned the initial draft of the first volume of his trilogy Wintry Night, and commenced rewriting in 1977. In a sense, Li Qiao’s re-vision and re-writing placed him in the position of liminality where a new cultural discourse might develop.

Li Qiao's realization of emergent Taiwanese consciousness followed a similar trajectory to some of his peers who also investigated historical figures of the Japanese period. For example, in 1976 Lin Ruiming, one generation younger than Li Qiao, was involved in writing a biography of an anti-Japanese figure Yang Kui, eventually publishing The Portrait of Yang Kui (楊逵畫像) in 1978.

Whereas Luo Fuxing was always portrayed as an upright anti-Japanese activist and a revolutionary, Yang Kui was a leftist leaning figure, also anti-Japanese under Japanese rule, yet considered an anti-Nationalist in the early postwar period. Yang
Kui finally regained his reputation in the early 1970s when he finished his term in jail as a political prisoner. As a result of KMT’s acknowledgement of Yang and the advocacy of some liberal scholars such as Qi Bangyuan (齊邦媛), Yang Kui’s prose work “The Light of Spring Cannot Be Shut Out” (春光關不住) was renamed as “Unflattened Rose” (壓不扁的玫瑰花) and included in the official text book for all Junior High schools in Taiwan in 1976.  

The writing approaches that Li Qiao and Lin Ruiming adopted by narrating their biographical works in terms of Chinese nationalism are similar. As Bhabha argues, “although there is always an entertainment and encouragement of cultural diversity, there is always also a corresponding containment of it.” This bipolar dynamic applies to the biographies and rehabilitations of Yu Qingfang Yang Kui, and the respective texts by Li Qiao and Lin Ruiming. Bhabha’s concept of “cultural difference” helps explain the social and political context Li Qiao and Lin Ruiming shared, as well as the political taboo they had to avoid in the second half of the 1970s when they engaged in their biographic writings of Yu Qingfang and Yang Kui. By locating Taiwanese culture within the grid of Chinese culture, Li Qiao and Lin Ruiming easily avoided trouble since they had been taught since their formative age that Taiwanese culture is part of Chinese culture. In effect, Li Qiao and Lin Ruiming were writing in the wake of successful Nationalist educational brainwashing and political suppression.

Nonetheless, Li Qiao and Lin Ruiming also had opportunities to develop a hybrid identity in the third space where they were located. Li Ruiming’s decision to

---


write a biography of Yang Kui contributed to his emergent new consciousness because he had constant contacts with people from local literary circles and lived in Donghai Garden with Yang Kui for one year. Li Qiao’s field trips and interviews for the biography project became important seeds for writing *Wintry Night Trilogy* with its themes of hybrid identity and Taiwaneseness.

### 3.3. The third phase in progress

In the following section, I analyze the hybrid representation of Chineseness and Taiwaneseness in relation to the anti-Japanese figure Luo Fuxing in *Wintry Night Trilogy*. Liu Ahan, one of the central characters of the trilogy, is somewhat of a hero-figure. He participated in several anti-Japanese activities under Japanese rule, most of which are depicted in the second volume, *The Deserted Village*. In an episode where some anti-Japanese activities are depicted, Ahan confesses via the third person narrator that he does not possess much national consciousness nor does he think that those anti-Japanese actions he participated in are based on his national sentiment. Rather, he says, his purpose is simply for life, namely, being able to survive the hardships under the occupation of the invaders.\(^77\)

However, Ahan is in fact situated in an ambivalent identity corner regarding the question of what he is fighting for. The narrator describes Ahan’s ambivalent mental state as follows:

> At times, he would explore deeply into his mind: “Is this the only aim?”
> “Yes, it is the sole purpose.” He confirms the thought to himself.
> However, after he made further contacts with “them”, surely, he gradually

learned some knowledge about “those things”.78

Instead of clearly stating what sort of national sentiment Liu Ahan is attached to and what goal he fought for, the narrator opts to use an indirect deictic approach. In the above passage, “them” refers indirectly or obliquely to “anti-Japanese activists” or “those who possessed knowledge”; and “those things” refers to “those enlightenment activities of Taiwanese Cultural Association and Peasant Movement”.

The Luo Fuxing Incident is among various anti-Japanese activities that the fictional Ahan is said to have participated in. Others include assassinating Japanese police officers, setting fire to Japanese facilities, administration buildings and police offices, and participating in the Zhan’ e Incident (詹惡事件). As a result of taking part in the Luo Fuxing Incident, Liu Ahan was imprisoned for five years. Although Li Qiao’s narrative comes to the details of the event directly, the narrator does not frame the incident in terms of an explicit Chinese nationalist sentiment. For this reason, Zhong Zhaozheng, one of the critics of the 1982 symposium focusing on Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy, stated that Li Qiao failed to gain more influence and official respect by not depicting more of the patriotic, i.e. Chinese, spirit of Luo Fuxing:

[…] But I felt quite sorry that Li Qiao did not make good use of Luo Fuxing as an anti-Japanese hero. In his narrative the plot and layout the incident was sketched with light shading. Since the Luo Fuxing Incident is so significant in Taiwanese anti-Japanese history, I would like to hear from the author about his arrangement for such a character.79

78 Ibid., p.12.
Li Qiao responded as follows: “Those details about Luo Fuxing Incident do not quite accord with the tone of the novel.” This implies that the novel is not narrated on the basis of a consistent anti-Japanese spirit, a position which tends to be associated with Chinese identity. It seems that Li Qiao has a mind to reduce the inherited "Chineseness" of the historical figure Luo Fuxing in the fictional narrative.

A narrative including Luo Fuxing is capable of conveying a certain degree of Chineseness since the historical events that Luo Fuxing was involved in, for example, the Battle of Huanghuagang (黃花崗之役) in 1911 and the revolution in 1912, have been understood as symbolic events of Chinese nationalism and have been included in school history textbooks and so are familiar to Taiwanese people of younger generations within a narrative of "Chineseness." Luo’s attempt to organize a secret Revolutionary Party in Taiwan and to establish a headquarters office in Miaoli strongly link to Luo’s perceived Chineseness originating in China. However, few of these events and links are addressed in Li Qiao’s narrative with respect to Luo Fuxing.

The role that Liu Ahan’s wife Dengmei plays around the narration of the Luo Fuxing incident is another episode highlighting the weakened Chineseness in Li Qiao’s trilogy. Dengmei’s attitude toward Ahan’s enthusiasm for participating in anti-Japanese activities substantially undermines the Chineseness associated with Luo Fuxing. For Dengmei, Ahan is a village man from a mountainous rural area and the head of their household. She values his being a caring husband and a responsible father more than anything else.

A conversation between Dengmei and Uncle Amei (阿妹伯) exemplifies the weakened emphasis on Chineseness. Concerned for her family, Dengmei asks Amei to stop Ahan from participating in such activities. After Dengmei (D) keeps bothering

---

80 Ibid., p. 268.
him to do something, Uncle Amei (A) replies:

(A) “There is a man, Luo Fuxing, sent by the government of the other side.”
(D) “What government of the other side?”
(A) “From mainland China, it is the Nationalist government of our homeland.”
(D) “What is he coming to Taiwan for?”
(A) “Leading the Taiwanese people and fighting for the revolution.”
(D) “Then, what is the revolution for?”
(A) “Against Japanese rule.” 81

Despite her astonishment, she still keeps pestering Uncle Amei and asks him to stop Ahan from taking part in such a revolutionary act.

Dengmei’s innocence and her wish that Ahan desists from participating in anti-Japanese activities led by Luo Fuxing destabilizes the novel’s Chineseness. In other words, the spirit of sacrifice that a patriotic figure should possess, something taken for granted in the Nationalist discourse, is not found in Dengmei’s attitude toward her husband’s anti-Japanese activities. Dengmei’s major concern to protect her family from splitting apart contrasts with what has been taught in the education system, that a married woman should always support her husband’s patriotic actions without hesitation. Unlike traditional depictions of Chinese women, who tend to be absent or ignored in the masculine-centred discourse relating to their husbands’ patriotic activities, Dengmei’s intervention in politics on behalf of her family indicates her desire to participate in the decision-making regarding the future of her family and gives voice to people, women and children, often neglected.

3. 4. The representation of hybrid identity

In comparison to the attention that Luo Fuxing has received within the dominant discourse, the history of the Taiwanese Cultural Association, Peasant Movements and associated events was not welcomed by the ruling class due to their counter hegemonic and left-leaning activities. In the following discussion, I examine Li Qiao’s ambivalent narrative with regard to these events and their larger historical contexts. In particular, I discuss Li Qiao's narrative representation of the Taiwanese Cultural Association in three perspectives: “narrative regarding historical events”, “narrative without dialogue” and “narrative with dialogue”.

In Li Qiao’s narrative, when there is a depiction relating to historical facts with reliable sources, such as the cultural speeches or poster slogans used at the time, Chinese nationalism would at times be addressed in an attempt to neutralize the Taiwaneseess implied by those activities.

Li Qiao’s narrative depicts in detail the history of the establishment of Taiwanese Cultural Association. The narrative resembles an historical makeup act by attempting to provide the historical facts regarding anti-Japanese sentiment and actions excluded from the official discourse under Nationalist rule. For example, in the following passage, Li Qiao's narrative describes the establishment of the Taiwanese Cultural Association:

On the 17th of October, called together by Jiang Weishui (蔣渭水), a physician in Taipei, the founding ceremony for the establishment of the Taiwanese Cultural Association was held in Blessed Imelda’s School (靜修女中). There were more than 1,000 members and more than 300 attendees. In the meeting, the constitution of the association was passed, and Lin
Xiantang was elected president. Along with 41 directors and 44 councilors, members were mostly intellectual youths or from the upper classes.  

The narrator establishes the aim of the association as well as its activities:

The Association aimed to promote the growth of the cultural development of Taiwan. After its establishment, the association vigorously promoted modern knowledge and cultural enlightenment by issuing newsletters, establishing newspaper-reading and study groups, holding summer schools, cultural speeches, and promoting a cultural theater movement. The cultural speeches were well received by Taiwanese people, and in 1925 and 1926, a new record of more than 300 speech events was set. [...] The cultural enlightenment movement attracted the youth, peasants and ordinary people, spurring flourishing social movements and the transmission of political thought during the 1920s.  

For people living in Taiwan in the late 1970s and 1980s when Taiwan was still under the influence of martial law but at the same time when opposition activities were developing, Li Qiao’s narration of the time when Taiwanese people had enjoyed a certain degree of freedom of speech, of the press, and of the right of assembly in the 1920s and 1930s is inspiring and counter hegemonic as it highlights the difference between the progress of the past and the counter progress of the present. However, given that those activities may further signify embedded Taiwaneseness, Li Qiao simultaneously adopts a restrained approach in the narrative where Chinese national

---

83 Ibid., pp. 29-30.
sentiment is also highlighted so as to balance the counterhegemonic implication of the narrative. Hence, the narrative ambivalence of Li Qiao's "third space" comes into being.

The way the narrative depicts action and attitudes around cultural speeches is a salient example. In describing the cultural speeches held by the Taiwanese Cultural Association, Li Qiao does not fail to intertextually appropriate the slogans of the posters actually used by members of the association in the 1920s. One of the posters conveyed the anti-Japanese sentiment as follows:

National enemy, national enemy, Japan is our national enemy.
Taiwan was taken apart from the mainland for thirty years.
...
We should not forget the enemy,
We pledged to take revenge against the enemy, who occupied Taiwan for thirty years,
Gentlemen, you should appreciate our Chinese civilization,
Japan is just the third son of our nation,
[...] The thirtieth anniversary of Japanese rule is a disgraceful day.84

As the above poster indicates, under the circumstances the representation of Taiwanese Cultural Association itself possesses the value of Taiwaneseness, while the TCA's Chineseness was deliberately presented through other means such as the representation of meeting slogans of the time. A similar hybridity is also shown in dialogues among characters in the novel in relation to the association. For example,

Guo Qiuyang (郭秋揚), the leader of the Dahu (大湖) branch of the Taiwanese Cultural Association, talked to Liu Ahan in a way which conveys a sense of Taiwaneseness:

“Brother, I believe you have learned that we, as Taiwanese/islanders (本島人), should fight for our rights by ourselves, since our rulers will not give us those rights for any reason.”

However, another conversation between Guo Qiuyang and the Japanese police officer Morita (森田) shows a sense of Chineseness, in which the blood link between China and Taiwanese people is repeatedly emphasized:

“Oh, China is originally the homeland of the Taiwanese.” Guo said loudly and deliberately so that the audience could hear clearly.

“But you are not allowed to say so.” Morita responded loudly as well.

Guo laughed and said: “Okay, what you mean is that China is our homeland, but the term is not allowed to be used in public. Everybody knows about that.”

Moreover, when the narrator describes fictional characters and no dialogue is involved, a more indirect, allusive approach is used to convey Taiwaneseness. For example, “Taiwan shirt” (台灣衫) or “Taiwan shirt and trousers” (台灣衫褲) are salient expressions used in some episodes to connote Taiwaneseness in addition to their literal meanings. In Li Qiao's narrative those who are described as wearing a

---

85 Ibid., p.135.
“Taiwan shirt” during Taiwanese Cultural Association activities include Zheng Minglu (鄭明祿), Guo Fanzhi (郭芳枝) and Liu Ahan. Zheng Minglu is a promising young man who is described as wearing a pair of wire-rimmed glasses, showing his enthusiasm for reforming Taiwan by joining the Cultural Association and speaking at cultural events. Guo Fanzhi is the daughter of Guo Qiuyang; Mingding is the third son of Liu Ahan and Dengmei. Mingding and Fanzhi have shown affection for each other and are further connected through the image of the "Taiwanese shirt":

She (Fanzhi) had put on a white “Taiwanese shirt” with small floral print when Mingding, the third son of Liu Ahan and Dengmei, also her admirer, saw her walking on a street after a gathering of Taiwanese Cultural Association.

Zheng Minglu, Guo Fanzhi and Liu Mingding are among the younger generation and have grown up under the influence of Japanese colonial modernity at a time when the Japanese authorities introduced Western democratic thought into Taiwan. They have the chance to advocate for the cultural enlightenment of the Taiwanese people through legal means such as holding cultural speeches and staging political demonstrations.

The frequent representation of the “Taiwan shirt” in the novel thus leads to three kinds of effects. First, although the cultural activities in which they are involved are narrated in a plain tone where Chineseness and Taiwaneseness seem to be evenly presented, the characteristics of Taiwaneseness are at times highlighted, for example, through the connotative allusion to the “Taiwan shirt”.

Second, “Taiwan shirt” mediates the “Taiwaneseness” possessed mainly by the

---

87 Ibid., p.45.
88 Ibid., p.45.
older generation like Liu Ahan and the “colonial modernity” associated mainly with intellectual youth such as Zheng Minglu, Guo Fanzhi and Liu Mingding. For example, Ahan changes his guard uniform to a “Taiwan shirt” and shows his determination to be involved in further anti-Japanese activities, after he is dismissed from a post as a result of participating in anti-Japanese activities. Although Ahan is not among the younger generation who are more influenced by Japanese colonial modernity, through the symbolic reference to the “Taiwan shirt”, he becomes indirectly associated with positive democratic modernity such as promoting democratic thought and political, social and cultural reforms.

Third, Fanzhi in the novel represents the few female intellectuals who had opportunities to receive modern education. Through her association with the “Taiwan Shirt”, she is perceived as breaking through the traditional cliché where women are considered inferior and are not included in public discussions and events. The narrator’s representation of Fanzhi’s viewpoint about her life and future plans for Mingding and herself as well as the novelistic dialogue gives a voice to culturally invisible and unheard female experiences in narrative fiction. Thus the narrative’s “third space” includes modern ideals of “anti-federalism” and “gender equality” in the representation of Taiwaneseness.

In conclusion, the above analysis has shown that there is no shortcut and nothing straightforward about the formation of Taiwanese identity. In Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy, the “third space” plays a significant role in articulating hybrid identity, an ambivalence and multiplicity which, in turn, opens up new ways to reflect on the establishment of Taiwanese identity in cultural practices.

Moreover, in Wintry Night Trilogy, the novel’s essence of Taiwaneseness includes the representation of the untold history of Taiwan under Japanese rule. In

addition, Li Qiao also recognizes the positive influence of Japanese colonial modernity by using the connotative reference to the “Taiwan shirt” which enriches and complicates the association of Taiwaneseness with modernity but not especially with Japanese.

Rather than using an explicit historical reference to present Taiwaneseness, these fictional characters’ Taiwanese consciousness is conveyed in an implicit manner, namely, by using the “Taiwanese shirt” as a symbolic trigger of “Taiwanese consciousness”. Whereas the history surrounding the Taiwanese Cultural Association was considered politically sensitive, even dangerous, during the postwar period, Li Qiao, in the late 1970s, emphasized its Chineseness on many occasions by making use of historical evidence. In addition, in comparison to his depiction of the revolutionary Luo Fuxing, in his narrative in the trilogy relating to the role models for Chinese identity, Chineseness is deliberately weakened.

The above analysis manifests Bhabha’s argument, that the production of cultural identity in hybridity is likely to be a game where both the colonizer and the colonized are involved. As part of the game, a new border line can be drawn and some people will leap over to the other side. Then, at a different time people will redraw the line and leap over again, repeatedly. Significantly, when the colonized possess sufficient agency, each repetition of boundary drawing carries contextual and language differences. The ambivalence then leads to the language hesitation of colonialism. Indeed, the ambivalent status that Li Qiao conveys in Wintry Night Trilogy, where some colonized subjects are complicit and some resistant, shows that complicity and resistance always exist in a fluctuating relationship within both the colonizer and the colonized. As a result of cultural and discursive hybridity, the singular authority of colonial domination is disrupted.

---

4. The development of a critical discourse

As discussed in Chapter Two, when Li Qiao first planned the writing of Wintry Night Trilogy, he described its genre as “a novel based on historical resources”. Hence, it would be logical to assume that the story will be told in chronological order, and that the narrative structure will include plots where the causal connections between those chronological sequences of events are depicted. But in fact, in addition to the chronological narrative approach, the text’s narrative also includes dialogic and nonlinear narration.

The narrative of Wintry Night Trilogy involves more than chronicle and causality. The narrative is characterized by stories and plots, causal and remembered, as well as narratorial judgments, commentary and evaluations. Commentaries and evaluations are attributed to the narrator and main characters of the Peng family, and the objects of their criticism include collaborators and Taiwanese people.

Looking back over the history of Taiwan, we see how Japan’s colonial management in Taiwan deployed a carrot and stick approach. While Taiwanese people were considerably suppressed by colonial rule, many were also gradually pulled under the influence of strong assimilation policies. In particular, imperial Japan's conciliatory approach to colonial rule helped encourage Taiwanese to collaborate with the regime. Collaborators not only engaged in political cooperation or negotiations, but also participated in many other activities and enterprises initiated by the Japanese.

As discussed earlier in this chapter, Li Qiao’s narrative in the Wintry Night Trilogy reflects Japanese colonial policy on ruling Taiwan and also includes the three traits of personality suggested by Poshek Fu and Namiki Masato, which are “resistance”, “passivity” and “collaboration”, and respectively referring to “those who neither conformed nor internalized; “those who conformed but were not internalized”;
“those who conformed and internalized”.

In the narrative of *Wintry Night Trilogy*, collaborators joined the colonial system, and mostly acted as the implementers of colonial policing policies as lower ranking police officers or engaged in spying, informing, arresting and physically abusing resistant Taiwanese. They were despised as “three legged” (三腳) by those who did not yield to the colonial power. Other collaborators with similar characteristics in the third novel *The Lone Lamp* were conscripted and deployed to the Philippines, but they enjoyed more privileged positions, including characters such as Nozawa Saburo (Huang Huosheng, 黃火盛) and Murakawa Tadao (Chen Zhongchen, 陳忠臣) who served as squad leaders of the technical team or the youth-labor group. Still other collaborators who were involved in the “Bao-Jia” (保甲) systems, acting as neighborhood leaders, include characters such as Mr. Xie, village head of Dahu (大湖), and his son Xie Shixiang (謝時祥).

The cohort of resistant characters includes those who sought justice and equity by working with the Taiwanese Cultural Association or Peasant Movements, including characters such as Liu Ahan and Liu Mingding and the conscripted Taiwanese youth Peng Yonghui and Liu Mingji, described in the novel as village intellectual youths.

In *Wintry Night Trilogy*, only those who directly exploited and suppressed the Taiwanese are targeted for criticism by the narrator. Through the narrative voice, Li Qiao is taking a risk for “telling” too much by providing an artificial authorial justification. The narrator's interventions and evaluations tell readers about the misconduct of collaborators and about the character flaws of many Taiwanese. These narrating interventions raise questions regarding the aesthetic value of the novel because according to formalist theories of art, “the art of fiction does not begin until

---

91 The Bao-Jia system was introduced in the Qing era, and was put under police jurisdiction during Japanese rule. Those who worked for the Bao-Jia system were involved in reinforcing joint responsibility, mutual watch and informing on other Taiwanese.
the novelist thinks of his story as a matter to be shown, to be exhibited such that it will tell itself.”\textsuperscript{92} Li Qiao’s narrating judgments regarding collaborators disrupt the formal shape of the fiction as a self-contained narrative.

In the ongoing development of the narrative, Li Qiao or at least Li Qiao’s contrived narrator, adjusts the plot to include explicit and direct judgments about characters’ motives and actions. The turning point in the narrative is the change of historical circumstances when the conscripted Taiwanese and Japanese in the Philippines face defeat in the war. At that point in the narrative, Li Qiao’s critical discourse regarding Taiwanese collaborators manifests itself in two stages, the first engaged more with “telling” than “showing”, and the second with the various characteristics of “showing”.

First, I will discuss these extradiegetic judgments and evaluations, and explore how Japanese rulers, the collaborators and resistant Taiwanese are presented within the narrative and how the narrative description and evaluation constitute a critical discourse. In particular, I examine the negative judgments expressed toward Taiwanese collaborators and how there emerges in the novel a parallel discourse where Taiwanese character flaws of weakness are criticized.

Second, I explore the factors hidden behind Li Qiao’s judgments and evaluations in the novel. I argue that Li Qiao’s criticisms are partly the result of his desire to speak in the aftermath of the collective “dysphasia shock” that Taiwanese native intellectuals experienced in the early postwar period, and more importantly, partly the result of his effort to establish a Taiwanese narrative voice capable of speaking authoritatively about Taiwanese nationalism. As a native cultural intellectual, the cultural critic Li Qiao intends to speak through the novelistic form.

Third, I analyze how Li Qiao’s narrative representation as “showing” changed in

the third novel *The Lone Lamp*. The plot becomes extremely complicated because of the collaborators’ shifting identities, and as a result the narrative represents post-colonial characteristics of mimicry and ambivalence.

4.1. The formation of the critical discourse

In *Wintry Night Trilogy*, Li Qiao repeatedly highlights the persistent conflicts between collaborators and resistant forces under Japanese rule. We read this conflict via three generations of the Peng family. The oppressive forces include an exploitive landlord, suppressive police, conscripted officers and the head of Fanzai Wood neighborhood. At first, the head of the Peng family Peng Aqiang and the privileged landlord Ye Atian fight verbally and physically. Then the conflict develops in parallel with the anti-Japanese actions that Liu Ahan and Liu Mingding undertake. In the third stage, conflicts are seen between those who were conscripted to the battlefield, in particular, between the collaborators and resistors. Gradually, over the course of the trilogy, a critical discourse consisting of two parallel sub-discourses emerges in the narrating voice. The first are the critical comments voiced against the collaborators; the second are continuous calls for Taiwanese people to reform their cowardly character with particular mention of “conformity”.

In the first part of the trilogy, *Wintry Night*, the suffering of people living in Fanzai Wood village is repeatedly addressed by the narrator and the leading characters. These people suffer through natural disasters, the hardship of opening the land, and the threat of headhunting from tribespeople. But it is the man-made disasters that forced villagers to compromise. A salient example of a man-made disaster is a scene describing how the villagers yield to the suppressive force of the exploitive landlord. In the face pressure from the self-proclaimed landlord Ye Atian, villagers of Fanzai Wood acknowledge the hopelessness of the situation and decide to give up their
struggle. But when they ask Ye Atian to return the interest they have already paid as a result of an earlier compromise by most villagers, they are rejected.

Peng Aqiang seems to be the only villager who decides not to compromise and shows his courage by confronting Ye Atian face to face. Despite being physically attacked by accomplices of Ye Atian, he scolds the exploiter’s evil actions without fear:

“You have occupied other men’s land with the backing of the officials. I have even heard that you abducted other men’s wives and raped their daughters.[…] You blood-sucking opium addict.”

In another dialogue Peng Aqiang also declares the cowardly character of his neighbours who hesitate to confront Ye Atian:

“You guys are useless. When the time comes, you’ll all hide and leave me on my own.”

The narration is filled with such explicit critical discourse. In addition to the exploitative landlord, the police are another major target of the narrator’s and some characters’ criticism. Unlike some scholars, such as Ts’ai Hui-yu, who comment that the police force played a positive role in restricting the anti-Japanese activities within the legal context, Li Qiao’s narrator and characters speak from the perspective of the suppressed and criticize Taiwanese collaborators acting as police for the Japanese

---

94 Ibid., p. 161.
colonial regime, with particular criticism aimed at those who directly suppressed Taiwanese anti-Japanese activities and were labeled as “three legged”. Throughout the trilogy, these sorts of critical comments are presented by the narrator or in dialogues between leading characters and collaborators. The settings include public meetings held by Taiwanese Cultural Association and the detention room of police office where corporal punishment is handed out.

In addition to criticising collaborators, some narrator and character criticisms point up the cowardly character of the Taiwanese, especially in the second novel The Deserted Village. A conversation between Ahan and his wife Dengmei regarding the suppressive force of the collaborators is exemplary. When Dengmei asks him not to participate in anti-Japanese activities and to be more focused on his family, Ahan does not directly respond to Dengmei’s appeal but instead turns away and expresses his views on “tolerance” by muttering to himself, whispering from the depths of his soul:

Since ancient times, each family has been taking “the spirit of tolerance” as its family instruction, and often, the tolerance is endured to ridiculous extremes. People endure everything, even those things that are not worthy of toleration. Then, what is the difference between tolerance and cowardice? […]

Chinese people tend to endure the oppression imposed on them, especially the Taiwanese Hakka. Endurance and cowardice are characteristics of the Hakka people.

Traitors are the most despicable of people.⁹⁶

As such, the extent of the objects of Ahan’s criticism spread from the villagers

living in Fanzai Wood to the Taiwanese people as a whole, in particular, to those of Hakka ethnic background. Later when Mingding is engaged in resistance activities with the Peasant Movement, his father Ahan’s attitude towards the “traitor” has influenced the younger generation. In other words, Peng Aqiang and Liu Ahan’s viewpoint toward Taiwanese collaborators, across two generations of the Peng family, has been passed down to the third generation. Mingding recalls his father Ahan’s words after he was monitored by a “three-legged” while taking part in a public meeting pertaining to the peasant movement: “Any traitor, I can tell him at first glance, no matter how he pretends,”97 and “The spying, betrayal, capture and torture of people in Taiwan was mainly carried out by the Taiwanese themselves!”98

Mingding also explores the reasons why there were so many collaborators, but he is reluctant to attribute these actions to the natural character of the Taiwanese people. He convinces himself that the behaviour of those collaborators was not the real nature of the Taiwanese, but rather was mainly for “protecting themselves in order to be able to survive”.99

In Wintry Night Trilogy Li Qiao decides not to emphasize the binary contrast between the Japanese colonial rulers and the ruled. Rather, he opts to establish a critical discourse where the three types of colonized Taiwanese, as suggested by the historian Poshek Fu are included: “Resistors”, “Collaborators” (or “Three legged”), and “Passives”. These types, as we have seen, also correspond to Namiki Masato’s classification of the three types of colonized people: “those who neither conformed nor internalized”, “the conformed and internalized”, and “the conformed but not internalized”.

97 Ibid., p. 344.
98 Ibid., p. 344.
99 Ibid., p. 344.
4.2. The focalization of the discourse

Li Qiao's narrative maintains a consistent evaluative tone when developing a critical narrative discourse even when the narrative setting is partially shifted to the war zone in the Philippines in the later part of the third novel *The Lone Lamp*. In the following discussion, I analyze the novel’s critical discourse when the setting is shifted from the village of Fanzai Wood and various locations of the Peasant Movement to the battlefield in the Philippines.

Those who were conscripted to the South Pacific include members of the third and the fourth generations of the Peng family, Japanese officers and Taiwanese collaborators. In the early period of their stay in the Philippines, the collaborators’ abuse of power was on full display. The following conversation between Mingji, the collaborator Huang Huosheng who has changed his name to Nozawa Saburo, and another Taiwanese (Old Man Jiang) shows the extent of the collaborator’s arrogance as a Japanese colonial mimic, marked by his preference for using his Japanese name. The episode is set in mid-September 1944 as the Japanese military position continues to decline:

[…]  
“Mr. Wang, how can you have so little confidence?” said Huang Huosheng, frowning.  
“The Americans have too many planes, their bombs are huge, and their machine guns are merciless,” said Old Man Jiang. […]  
“Old Man Jiang, you…” said Huang Huosheng, struggling to his feet.  
“Are you going to report us again?” asked Mingji.  
“Forget it. You’re one of us, not a Japanese officer.”  
“How can you say that Nozawa Saburo is the same as the rest of us?”
“I am Nozawa Saburo, and don’t you forget it,” said Huang Huosheng as he hobbled away.100

Having witnessed and experienced Huang’s misdeeds, including physical and verbal abuse, Mingji comments on this exchange by saying: “Why does the bad side of such people always come to the fore when they are given a position of authority?”101 The narrator then adds that his mother had previously told him: “All the spying, betrayals, and capturing and torturing of people in Taiwan had been done by the Taiwanese themselves!” and “Most Taiwanese were collaborators.”102

The experience of the other leading character of *The Lone Lamp*, Peng Yonghui, reflects that of many Taiwanese youth who had similar experiences after they were conscripted into the Taiwan Youth Labour Corps in Cebu base where airfield runways and hangers suffered damage as a result of the Allied bombings. In addition to the heavy and endless labour, insufficient food supply and air raids, Yonghui and his companions also endured physical and mental abuse from the squad leader Murakawa Tadao (Chen Zhongchen).

However, Yonghui is relatively silent regarding collaborators when compared to his uncle Liu Mingji, the youngest son of Ahan and Dengmei. Amongst the villagers of Fangzai Wood, Mingji and his older brother Mingding are described as village intellectual youths due to their having received middle education. It would seem that Li Qiao’s artistic strategy was to associate the younger generations of the Peng family with the critical voices in the narrative, thus linking education, modernity, and social critique in the novelistic discourse.

In addition to the narrator who plays a role in constructing a critical voice, the

---

critical comments in the narrative are mostly conveyed through those main characters of the three generations from the Peng family. The frequency of the utterances is high, the temporal distance between story and narrating times is likely to be reduced in the reading experience, such that events narrated in the novel tend to be associated with issues contemporary with the time of the novel's first circulation among readers.

The narrative maintains its persistent judgment of collaborators in the third volume, *The Lone Lamp*. For example, in one episode, responding to the arrogance of Nozawa and other collaborators, Mingji imitates the voices of his father Ahan and his brother, Mingding, asserting that if Taiwanese people do not wake up, their cowardly character would inevitably remain unchanged in the future. The critical discourse is further reinforced by the narrator when he compares Taiwanese, Japanese and the aborigines of the Philippines who were fighting for Japan. The following three examples exemplify this critical discourse in the narrative.

In an episode where Mingji and the Japanese soldier Aoki clashed, each insults the other by using slang words such as “Manchu slaves”, “dog” and “animal”. The verbal argument was settled with a physical fight when both agreed that five against five was fair. Later, however, members of the Taiwanese team blamed Mingji for going too far and creating their current predicament.

As a result, when the two parties approached the sandy area at the appointed time, Mingji’s companions, including the four volunteers, stopped unexpectedly and were reluctant to proceed further. Mingji had to face the five-man Japanese team alone, and the outcome was predictable. When he regained consciousness, his companions, apart from their consolation, urged him to tolerate more from the Japanese since there had been no chance to win. For Mingji, the more serious trauma was his feeling that he had been betrayed, and as the narrator describes, it is “a feeling more drastic than any
physical wound”.\textsuperscript{104}

The second example relates to Mingji’s exploration of the reasons why so many Taiwanese people worked as collaborators. Earlier his older brother had attributed collaboration to “self protection”. Mingji, however, attributes the phenomenon to the collaborators’ greed for an easy and comfortable life, which they could have by suppressing their own people.\textsuperscript{105}

The last example also comes from The Lone Lamp, where the narration is mostly focused on Taiwanese troops in the Philippines, those conscripted men including Taiwanese youth and Philippine aborigines who were frequently cursed and beaten by Japanese officers and Taiwanese collaborators. The narrator compares Taiwanese and the aborigines of the Philippines with respect to their reaction to the abuse from their supervisors. Compared to Taiwanese, who mostly adopted a tolerant attitude and tried to avoid head-on confrontations, the fearless personality of indigenous Filipinos was greatly praised by the narrator.

4.3. Telling: risk and its implications

Thus far we have seen how Li Qiao engaged in constructing a solid critical discourse with explicit judgments and commentary inserted from both the narrator and some characters. On the one hand, he criticizes the extent of the collaborators’ abuse of power; on the other hand, he comments on the cowardly and submissive character of Taiwanese people. In these instances Li Qiao the novelist is “telling” rather than “showing”. In this section I argue that the development of Li Qiao’s narrative in regards to the critical comments where both the collaborators and the

\textsuperscript{104} Li Qiao. The Lone Lamp (孤燈). p. 135.
\textsuperscript{105} Li Qiao. The Lone Lamp (孤燈). p. 122.
majority of Taiwanese people are involved needs to be further examined in terms of literariness and postcolonial concepts of ambivalence and mimicry.

According to Henry James, “telling” is a type of writing which tends to pass more fleetingly over the details, and “showing” is a type of writing which unpacks the detail of a scene or episode. In addition, as Booth indicates, a good story needs to be presented without comment and leave readers without the guidance provided by explicit evaluation. However, narratologists and discourse analysts have shown how narratives regularly contain diegetic and evaluative elements as narrators and storytellers weave back and forth between implication and explicit statement regarding narrative events and motives. To some degree, the Jamesian/Boothian rule about how a “good fiction” should be written – maintaining the balance between “telling” and “showing” with more of the latter and less of the former – seems to have been ignored by Li Qiao. As the storyteller, Li Qiao seems to risk presenting parts of his story in a subjective and personal manner, which some critics have considered inartistic. In a sense, Li Qiao engaged in what Booth said of Homer as “intruding deliberately and obviously to insure that his judgment will be sufficiently favourable.”

Li Qiao’s intrusive narrator and critical judgments reinforce a particular narrative viewpoint but somehow do not affect the flow and progress of the story. In other words, the plot remains largely unaffected even after these critical passages are removed. However, the passages containing critical judgments acquire their significance from the way in which they are narrated. A judgment is not made by a single univocal speaker but often embodies the various narrating agents, such that they gradually develop into a focalized critical discourse of Taiwaneseness.

---

Such a representation and intrusive narration reflects Li Qiao’s “desire to talk” relating to the awakening of his Taiwanese consciousness. In fact, Li Qiao was not alone in making this kind of literary or cultural expression. Similar narrative and critical practices are also found in the literary works of other Taiwanese writers such as Wu Zhuoliu (1900-1976) and Ye Shitao (1925-2010).

After Japanese was replaced as the official language with Chinese as a result of the Nationalists’ taking power in October 1945, Taiwanese intellectuals suffered a collective “dysphasia shock”, as suggested by Yang Zhao.109 Ye Shitao grew up and was educated during the later part of Japanese rule, and it took nearly two decades for him to gain fluent command of Chinese writing. He then attempted to ease his anxiety of belatedness through continuous and productive parallel writings, including literary reviews, translation and introducing literary works of Japanese period. This further led to his engagement in constructing the theoretical concept of Taiwan literature as he argued in An Outline History of Taiwanese Literature (台灣文學史綱).110 Ye Shitao’s “desire to talk” had unexpectedly laid the theoretical foundation for the historical concept of Taiwan literature.

Younger than Ye Shitao by one generation, Li Qiao’s difficulty in adapting to the new cultural order was undoubtedly less than that of Ye, yet they still shared similar feelings about the impact of the cultural suppression stemming from the ruling Nationalist regime. As we have seen, Li Qiao’s narrative in Wintry Night Trilogy repeatedly shows his observations concerning the perceived character flaw of in the Taiwanese people and his eagerness to retell the misdeeds of Taiwanese collaborators and cowards. His narrating voice is deeply involved in “intruding to tell” readers about his judgments of these two types of Taiwanese. As a novelist, he is well aware

110 Published in 1987 by Wenxue Jie Magazine.
of the impact of the aesthetic taboo of telling too much, as his letter to his mentor Zhong Zhaozheng shows:

These historical facts, pose a challenge for me since I am not going to give up the fictional artistry and accommodate myself to them.\footnote{Letter dated March, 20, 1977. See Zhong Zhaozheng. 情深書簡. p. 456.}

Li Qiao’s “desire to talk” in a sense resembles the phenomenon of “passionate research” as described by Fanon\footnote{Fanon, F. “On National Cultural” (1967). Pdf. Available: http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/arts/english/currentstudents/pg/masters/modules/postcolonial/franz_fanon_on_national_culture_in_the_wretched_of_the_earth_1967_1.pdf.} \footnote{Fellner, A. M. et al. American Studies in Austria. (Pdf), p. 155. Available: https://books.google.co.nz/books?id=3gNaLF4CC0QC&pg=PA155&lpg=PA155&dq=negation+Fanon+depends+for+its+stability&source=bl&ots=Qs4V6kT5j_&sig=NK7-VtzEEk08qOGH1mPU96VQGP I&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwjPhL6J2ZbLAhUHmZQKHQzLCp0Q6AEIIDAB#v=onepage&q=ne}. However, whereas Fanon’s passionate research refers to the fact that there had existed a wonderful Negro intellectual and artistic culture in Africa, Li Qiao’s repeated narrative “telling” and critical discourse is part of his attempt to rebuild a national character for Taiwan by first revealing its dark side, the characteristics of weakness and conformity. Li Qiao’s later works in the 1980s showed that his criticism presented in the trilogy regarding the collaborators and the cowardly character of Taiwanese was the theoretical prototype of his discourse on Taiwanese cultural nationalism, which was then put into full play in the book The Ugly Taiwanese (醜陋的台灣人) published in 1988.

4.4. The representation of ambivalence and mimicry

As Fanon indicates, the category “colonizer/white” depends for its stability on its negation, “colonized/black”; neither exists without the other.\footnote{\footnote{Letter dated March, 20, 1977. See Zhong Zhaozheng. 情深書簡. p. 456.}} Li Qiao later had a
chance to dismantle or at least destabilize the colonizer/colonized opposition in his narrative when in the later part of the third novel *The Lone Lamp* a change emerges in the context and narrative situation. Indeed, when the story shifts into the final stage of the Pacific war, the binary opposition between the oppressor and the oppressed starts to fluctuate as Japan is continuously defeated on the battlefields of the Philippines. All the characters then face the threat of death regardless of their positions, rank, or ethnic origins.

At this point in the novel, a new picture is presented in which people are dead, alive, wounded and unwounded. The arrogance and bullying of collaborators and Japanese, and the tolerance of the suppressed recede into the background. In the war zone there are more frequent interactions between these people and class and ethnic differences deteriorate. In the following section, I explain the postcolonial phenomena of “ambivalence” and “mimicry” by analysing various dialogues between main characters in the new historical context of wartime.

a. Ambivalence: Mingji and Nozawa

As the Japanese suffered continuous setbacks in the Pacific War, the advantages that the two collaborators, Nozawa and Murakawa, had enjoyed decline dramatically. Nozawa’s change in his attitude towards the Taiwanese people in the aftermath of his injuries, which included, hearing loss, is a striking example of such a phenomenon. Realizing that he was likely to die at any moment, Nozawa started pestering Mingji and began to use their common Hakka dialect when talking to Mingji:

[…] Nozawa’s face was red and swollen. He was unconscious. Mingji
turned and walked away.

“Don’t go!” said Nozawa, opening his eyes. He reached out and seized Mingji by the leg.

Mingji tried to shake him off violently with a kick.

[…]

“Don’t leave me, Mingji,” said Nozawa.114

[…]

“Mingji, save me,” said Nozawa, struggling after him. Nozawa was actually speaking to Mingji in their native dialect. “Mingji, just look at me, and I’ll be saved!”

[…]

“Won’t you do that for me, brother?” […].

“Call me Huang, Huang Huosheng.”

No you are no longer Huang Huosheng; you are a Japanese soldier.”115

Although Mingji felt it beneath his dignity to treat Nozawa as his fellow countryman, the situation where one end of the binary opposition is always dominant has weakened. Clearly, what Nozawa says, including his return to speaking Hakka, his appeal to Mingji to call him by his Han Chinese name and to call him brother are all indicators of their shared Taiwaneseness. As a result, there emerges in this scene an ambiguous or interstitial space, as the following narrated passage shows:


Mingji’s feelings were very confused. He decided he would look out for Nozawa – not something he wanted to do, but something he couldn’t refuse.

Mingji felt guilty, and somewhat responsible for his becoming deaf.116

b. Ambivalence: Yonghui and Murakama

The other main character Peng Yonghui encounters similar destabilizing experiences when his squadron leader Murakama Tadao (Chen Zhongchen) loses a leg and an eye in the battlefield. The following episode involving a dialogue between Yonghui and Murakawa exemplifies the change in attitude:

[...] He was moaning and tearing at his hair.

“Who are you?” asked Yonghui in Hakka.

The man moaned.

“You must be a native.”[...]

“Are you Murakawa Tadao?”

The man moaned again.

“Is it really you, Murakawa Tadao, you animal?”

“Peng Yonghui!” said Murakawa, recognizing him.

“Who cut off your feet?”[...]

“Please take me back to Taiwan.”

“If it had been me, I’d have sent you to hell with one blow.”

“No, don’t kill me.” … “Don’t kill me. Take me with you.”

“Take you with me?”

“After all, we’re both imo.”117[...]

---

“Are you still an imo?”

“Yes, I am.”

“You’re just saying that to save your skin, you stinking, rotten imo.”

“Stinking or rotting, I’m still an imo.” […]

“Take me with you and I’ll be forever in your debt.” Murakawa’s one good eye misted over and he began to cry. […]

“No, Murakama. You can just go stay with the Japanese Imperial Army.”

“Yonghui, I want to die among people from Taiwan.” Murakama was sobbing now. “It’s a request you can’t deny.”118

Yonghui witnesses with his own eyes the shifting of Murakawa’s identity from being Japanese to “imo.”. He also recognizes Murakawa’s willingness to identify with Taiwanese people, such as “wanting to die with the Taiwanese” and asking Yonghui to take him back to Taiwan. As a result, Yonghui finds himself in a serious dilemma:

Yonghui was reluctant to help the collaborator, but he couldn’t take revenge; nor could he save him. He made up his mind.119

[...] Yonghui took two gulps of water from his canteen and handed it to Chen. He looked at him with mixed emotions and turned to leave.120

Confronted with Chen Zhongchen’s regret for being a collaborator and his plea that everyone forget a Taiwanese like him and erase all memories of him, Yonghui

---

117 Since Taiwan produced sweet potatoes which are called imo in Japanese. The Japanese began to refer to the Taiwanese as imo.
decides to show his humanity. He “tightened his belt, rubbed his hands, hoisted the thin, maimed body over his shoulders, and hastened back along the path on which he had come.” Then, amid the sound of machine-gun fire and bullets whizzing past in the air, Murakawa asks Yonghui to put him down and run.

In the face of the desperate situation, both Yonghui and Chen show human goodness and generous humanity without overt external interference. For Chen, he has lost his original advantage and decides to turn to honesty and face his own human nature. For Yonghui, he has been through a journey full of resistance, rejection, ambivalence and conciliation.

These are scenes in which each character feels trapped in his surroundings without any prospect of escape. However, there are also scenes where an emotional state of sadness could be assumed from the action. The narrative outcomes indicate that both Mingji and Yonghui attempt to seek a new accommodation with collaborators and vice versa after the boundary of the binary opposition has collapsed.

As such, the narrator and the leading characters have an opportunity to escape the restraint of “telling”; this enables the narrative to forge into another sphere where the unpacking of the details in the scenes and episodes becomes convenient since the new sphere of “showing” generates more vivid sensory pictures and arouses a more pressing intrigue than telling. Readers might well be intrigued to delve into what is not being said and pursue the dynamic implications.

c. The mimicry: Nozawa

As post-colonial theory suggests, mimicry is a favored phenomenon for colonial rule as the colonized subjects are encouraged by colonial discourse to mimic the colonizer by adopting the colonizer’s cultural habits, assumptions, institutions and

---

values. Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* represents such mimicry particularly in collaborators’ behavior related to operation of colonial policies. However, in the trilogy, a mimic man is also unwelcome to both the colonizer and the colonized in some circumstances. The following conversation between the Japanese officer Aoki and the collaborator Nozawa is a salient example of the mimic's marginalization in the narrative. It is the episode discussed earlier where Mingji (M) quarrels with Japanese officer Aoki, and they decided to settle the argument with a fight where there would be five volunteers for each side. Shortly after the decision, Aoki (A) comes across the collaborator Huang Huosheng (N/ Nozawa Saburo), he turns around and speaks to Huang who just stands there gaping:

(A): “Hey, Mr. Nozawa, whose side are you on?”

(N): “Of course I…”

(M): “Nozawa, you go join their side!” Interrupted Mingji.

(N): “Are you saying… Yes, I’ll join the commander’s side.”

(A): “No, we have enough. One more might prove to be a spy. Then what would we do?”

The conversation shows Nozawa’s obsession with Japanese identity, but to his surprise, he is disliked by his “fellow Japanese”, Aoki as well as by Mingji. In such an uncomfortable state he reinforces his Japanese identity further so he can maintain the binarism which favours him.

The following example shows how Mingji, Nozawa and others become refugees as a result of the Japanese failure in the war, and this manifests Nozawa’s anxiety.

---

about being a mimic man. In the scene they come across a group of Japanese war warriors. When Mingji is asked about his identity, he replies “Taiwanese” without hesitation. However, when Nozawa is asked the same question by a short Japanese officer: “Hey you, also Taiwanese?” he replies: “No, I am Japanese. Nozawa, Nozawa Saburo.”124 The short man then asks him where his hometown is. Nozawa lies and says that he is from Kasumigaura (霞浦). However, Nozawa's Japanese geography is a bit hazy. He mistakes Kasumigaura as a town located in the Fukushima area, and his lie is exposed. As a result Nozawa is punched hard by the short Japanese soldier.125

Nozawa’s commitment to and coopting of Japanese cultural habits and values prove to be ineffective. This episode reveals that the colonizers never really wants colonial subjects to be exact replicas of themselves. What results instead is a mock “blurred copy”, which is at times bothersome and offensive for the colonizer.

d. The ambivalence: Mingji and Masuda

According to Ashcroft et al., colonial ambivalence describes “the complex mix of attraction and repulsion that characterizes the relationship between the colonizer and the colonized. The relationship is ambivalent because the colonized subject is never simply and completely opposed to the colonizer.”\(^\text{126}\) In Li Qiao’s narrative, the counterparts who are involved in this kind of ambivalent complex are Mingji and Masuda.

They attract and repulse each other for similar reasons: being genuine Taiwanese, in Mingji’s case, and being genuinely Japanese, in Masuda’s. What has attracted Mingji is the positive side of the Japanese character that the dying Masuda possesses. Likewise, Mingji’s insistence on being Taiwanese rather than “the same, but not really

---

the same” character as the collaborators draws the attention of the Japanese officer. The following conversation illustrates this ambivalence clearly:

Mingji spoke to the dying Japanese officer Masuda.

“I’m glad to have known someone like you from Taiwan,”

“Same here,” said Mingji earnestly, “You’re a real Japanese.” Not all Japanese people are extremists.127

In terms of Macaulay’s concept of “mimicry”, the collaborators as depicted in Wintry Night Trilogy resemble the “appropriate” colonial objects such as Macaulay’s interpreter and Naipaul’s “mimic man”.128 Apart from Nozawa and Murakawa, Mingji and Yonghui are to some extent unable to prevent themselves from acting as “appropriate” colonial objects since they are also part of the Japanization system and therefore somewhat appropriate objects of “a colonial chain of command”. The theoretical and critical point lies in the way Li Qiao’s narration creates a gray zone where the submissive attitude of Mingji and Yonghui are latently described, while the internalized behavior of Nozawa and Murakawa is explicitly presented. In a postcolonial sense, these appropriate colonial subjects are also ‘inappropriate’ because “what is being set in motion in their behavior is something that may ultimately be beyond the control of the colonial authority”.129 Indeed, under the influence of advanced colonial education, various characters in Wintry Night Trilogy learn how to fight against the colonial rule, while others learn how to affiliate themselves to the colonial regime. However, in Li Qiao’s narrative, Nozawa and Murakawa are by no means inappropriate until they lose the status of being advantaged appropriate

For the Japanese rulers, the collaborators are attractive and essential whereas Mingji and Yonghui are repulsive. But in the narrative’s critical discourse and viewpoint, collaborators are repulsive and Mingji, Yongji are attractive. For Mingji, having a sense of humanity and a strong resistant national character are the criteria for deciding on a character’s attraction or repulsion regardless of the national/ethnic origins of his counterpart.

The interaction between Mingji and Masuda manifests the postcolonial concept that the colonized subject is never simply and completely opposed to the colonizer; such an ambivalent situation also suggests that complicity and resistance co-exist in a fluctuating relation within the psychological state of the colonial subjects. In addition, this ambivalent representation also explains how a colonial discourse relates to the colonized subject such its the influence can be exploitative and nurturing at the same time.

To sum up, the above analysis has reached several conclusive points. First, in Li Qiao’s narrative only those collaborators who directly exploited and suppressed Taiwanese are targeted. Gradually, a focal critical discourse emerges, consisting of two parallel sub-discourses. The first comprises the narrator’s and characters' critical comments against the collaborators; the second is a continuous call for Taiwanese people to examine their cowardly character under Japanese rule. Critical commentators and the objects of critique are both Taiwanese, that is, the colonized Taiwanese rather than Japanese colonizers.

Second, Li Qiao’s enthusiasm in recounting the misdeeds of the collaborators and the cowardly characters of Taiwanese shows that he is involved in intrusive, evaluative narration as much as in "showing" narration. Such narration is motivated by Li Qiao’s “desire to talk” due to his and others' prolonged suppression under
Nationalist rule. The critical nature of the novel’s discourse resembles the passionate research suggested by Fanon and laid the groundwork as the theoretical prototype of Li Qiao’s discourse on Taiwanese cultural nationalism in the 1980s.

Third, the contextual change of the plot setting in the novel enabled Li Qiao’s narrative to forge into another sphere where the postcolonial representation of ambivalence and mimicry take place. Li Qiao’s narrative goes “beneath the surface of the action to obtain a reliable view of a character’s mind and heart” where Taiwaneseness is embedded. As a result of the dynamics generated between characters, readers are encouraged to delve into what is not being said and to imagine a Taiwanese identity.

130 Booth, W.C. *The Rhetoric of Fiction*, p. 3.
Chapter Four
Representing Multilingualism

In the previous chapter, I discussed how a “Third Space” is constructed in Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* and how that narrative construction of contradictory and hybrid Taiwaneseness encouraged an ambivalent and emergent cultural identity for Taiwanese people. In this chapter, I focus on the representation of linguistic hybridity in the trilogy. Cultural hybridization takes many forms, including linguistic, cultural, political and racial forms, and they are often used to suggest the disruptive and transfiguring power of the multi-vocal, post-colonial situation. I argue that Li Qiao’s narrative in *Wintry Night Trilogy* enacts a linguistic form of hybridity where the multi-lingual narrative representation of fiction and history works as a medium for subversion or transformative power.

Multilingualism is the act of using two or more languages, either by an individual speaker or by a community of speakers in a speech situation or environment. In *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the narrative uses several linguistic varieties, including Mandarin Chinese, Hakka, Holo (South Min/ Hokkien Chinese), Japanese and Atayal, which are inter-related either in pronunciation, meaning or character pattern. Holo and Hakka are varieties of Chinese; Atayal is the language of the indigenous Atayal tribe (泰雅族) in Taiwan.

One of the main features of the Nationalists’ (KMT) authoritative rule had been its control over language and its major implementation of a re-sinification policy. The KMT’s cohesive education system installed a standard version of the Chinese language as the norm and marginalized all ‘variants’ as impurities. For example, TV

---

dramas in Holo were never programmed in prime time and villains were generally portrayed as Holo-accented and lacking in ‘proper cultivation’. Hence language became a medium through which a hierarchical structure of power was perpetuated.

However, such power can be decentred by means of an effective post-colonial discourse, which in Li Qiao’s trilogy, apart from what has been discussed in previous chapters, is represented through multilingualism, in particular, through abrogation and appropriation. According to Ashcroft et al., abrogation is “a refusal of the categories of the imperial culture, its aesthetic, its illusory standard of normative or ‘correct’ usage, and its assumption of a traditional and fixed meaning ‘inscribed’ in the words.”2 Appropriation is the process by which “the [official] language is taken and made to ‘bear the burden’ of one’s own cultural experience, or, as Raja Rao puts it, to “convey in a language that is not one’s own the spirit that is one’s own.”3 In this chapter, I argue that Li Qiao’s narrative in *Wintry Night Trilogy* as a postcolonial discourse is simultaneously involved in both the abrogation of the dominant language and the appropriation of marginalized languages.

Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* reproduces multilingualism as a two-part process, displacing a dominant standard language and replacing it with local variants that reflect distinct cultural outlooks and alternative social perspectives. Li Qiao’s narrative pregrounds the function of language as a medium of power and seizes the language of the centre and re-places it with a more agentive discourse adapted to the colonized place. In the narrative’s linguistic practices of hybridity, where acts of abrogation and appropriation take place, the ‘standard code’ (Chinese) and various post-colonial ‘linguistic codes’ (Hakka, Holo, indigenous languages)4 are juxtaposed in the narrative to pluralize and decenter the linguistic and cultural hegemony.

---

2 Ibid., p. 5.
3 Ibid., p. 38.
4 Ibid., p. 8.
Amongst various forms of linguistic hybridity, “code-switching” and “glossing” are the discursive and textual practices Li Qiao represents most in *Wintry Night Trilogy*. Code-switching is when a speaker or writer shifts between different languages or varieties of a language. Glossing is when an explanatory comment is added to a text, an interpretation or paraphrase. As such, I examine why and how Li Qiao’s uses of code-switching and glossing in the narrative provide insights into the emergence of the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism, how multi-lingual texts are comprehended and produced, and how they link to the social context implied by the narrative.

1. Code-switching

In *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the narrative combines many linguistic varieties, often mixing Mandarin Chinese with Japanese and Taiwanese dialects: Holo, Hakka and Atayal. Li Qiao uses multi-lingual code-switching to characterize different ethnic groups in various social contexts. Such linguistic representations convey Taiwaneseness, and the code-switching textual practices in the novel should be understood in terms of both diegesis and reception. In other words, the novelistic code-switching simultaneously relates to the actual time of the narrative and to the time when the novel was published in the late 1970s.

1.1. The use of Japanese

In *Wintry Night Trilogy*, Mandarin Chinese is presented as the major language of the text, while Japanese is mainly used when a plot includes Japanese characters and conversation is represented. The occurrence of Japanese becomes more frequent.

---

5 Amsler, M. *Affective Literacies: Writing and Multilingualism in the Late Middle Ages*. Turnhout: Brepols Publishers, 2011, p. 60.
along with the progress of time as the narrative develops, which reproduces the influence of Japanese assimilation policy. For example, in the first volume *Wintry Night* when the leader of the Peng family Peng Aqiang confronts a Japanese land officer, he requires an interpreter. In the second volume *The Deserted Village* and the third volume *The Lone lamp*, the multilingual situation becomes more complex as Taiwanese characters of younger generations have acquired fluent Japanese during the occupation.

Indeed, the increasing use of Japanese in the novel shows the penetrating force of the assimilation policy under the Japanese rule, yet also simultaneously reveals the ambivalent attitude of the colonial subjects toward the forceful dominant language. The representative figure of the first generation, Peng Aqiang, completely rejects the language of the colonizer. However, the younger generation of the Peng family, such as Liu Ahan (劉阿漢), Liu Mingding (劉明鼎), Liu Mingji (劉明基) and Peng Yonghui (彭永輝), show different attitudes toward the language of the colonizers. For example, Ahan, already an adult at the early stage of Japanese rule, is reluctant to speak Japanese even though he appears to be able to utter simple colloquial Japanese. Instead, he adopts Hakka or Holo vernaculars in his conversations with Japanese. Mingji and Yonghui, who received a complete Japanese education, mix Japanese and native vernaculars when they talk to the Japanese rulers and administrators.

Li Qiao’s strategy in dealing with multilingualism is more complex than simply presenting a mixture of Chinese, Taiwanese vernaculars or Japanese in specific situations. In the novel, most Japanese language instances are textualised in Chinese characters rather than in the conventional Japanese hiragana, katakana or kanji (Japanese Chinese characters). Chinese characters are also used to textually represent multiple written forms of Mandarin, Holo, Hakka and Atayal. In most occasions of multi-lingual representation, Japanese is mixed with Chinese and is presented by
Chinese characters, which are used as pronunciation guides for readers, while the syntax is a mixture of Chinese, Japanese, Hakka and Holo grammatical forms. When Li Qiao’s text is read in Mandarin Chinese, a process of code-switching moving back and forth between Mandarin Chinese, Hakka, Holo and Japanese is in fact in practice for readers.

For example, consider the conversation between a Japanese police officer (J) and the collaborator Yu Zhaogui (Y) (余兆貴):

[...]
Y: 哈伊！確實得是。 (hayi, qeshi deshi / Yes, indeed.)
J: 咩，摩西確是看罪那拉，汝，立功一件嘍。
(wu, moxi queshi youzui nala, ru, ligong yijian zhao. / Oh, if he is found guilty, then it means that you have made great achievements.)
Y: 哈伊！ (hayi. / Yes.)

The representation of code-switching in this conversation is typical of what happens in the novel. The Japanese conversation is presented in Chinese characters with Japanese syntax. The spoken Japanese needs to be completed by uttering those Chinese characters whose pronunciations are textually associated with spoken Japanese. A reader has to read or mumble those Japanese in Chinese to be able to apprehend their meanings in Japanese. In other words, they are read in Chinese but to be textually “heard” in Japanese.

In this colloquial passage, the words in bold such as “哈伊”, “得是”, “摩西” and “那拉”, are Japanese and written/textualised in Chinese characters whose pronunciations are “borrowed” to reproduce spoken Japanese for Chinese/Taiwanese.

---

readers. For Taiwanese readers of older generations who had learned Japanese at school during the Japanese period, or for younger generations who had learned Japanese through private means or from public educational sectors during the postwar period, this kind of code-switching is comprehensible since those Japanese terms are either conjunctions or interjections. Moreover, for those who only understand Mandarin Chinese, the passage is also easy to comprehend because although the grammar follows Japanese rules, “一件”, “確實”, “有罪”, “汝” and “立功” are shared by Japanese and Chinese, both their literal meanings and characters.

In a sense, the use of Chinese characters as the visual image and as the pronunciation guide for Japanese has an ironic effect where the Japanese language is deliberately played with. As a result, the language’s dominance is undermined. In the course of code-switching, Chinese is appropriated and Japanese is abrogated. However, neither the appropriation nor the abrogation is complete since in the course of code-switching, Japanese and Chinese become variants of each other and hence, interdependent on each other.

Another example of the novel’s sophisticated multilingualism is the episode of Su Ahua (蘇阿華). Ahua is a team leader of a youth group aimed to produce and articulate young soldiers. She is pretty and falls in love with Mingji. However, her beauty also attracts her Japanese supervisor, Tanaka, who continuously makes sexually suggestive remarks to her. In order to keep Mingji from being conscripted, Ahua sleeps with Tanaka in exchange for Mingji’s exemption. Although she at first succeeds in keeping Mingji from being conscripted, eventually Tanaka betrays Ahua and he is conscripted. Ahua is consequently overwhelmed with anger and regret, and also discovers that she is pregnant. Ahua finally decides to reveal Tanaka’s misdeed in a public assembly.
Table 4.1. Oral orders uttered by Su Ahua in the assembly

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text in Chinese</th>
<th>Pronunciation in Chinese</th>
<th>Meaning in Japanese</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>卡息啦—覓息</td>
<td>kaxila – mixi</td>
<td>pay salute to the right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>拿喔堆</td>
<td>Nawolei</td>
<td>ease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>哈鴨哭</td>
<td>hayaku</td>
<td>quickly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>正歩—偷裂</td>
<td>zhengbu–toulie</td>
<td>move forward</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>卡死啦—命給</td>
<td>kasila–minggei</td>
<td>pay salute to the right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>米去木給—時事昧</td>
<td>miqu mugei–shishimei</td>
<td>turn left and walk</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Li Qiao. *The Lone Lamp* (孤燈).

Table 4.1. contains a list of oral orders made by Su Ahua in the assembly where her revenge action is to be made. The oral orders given by Ahua as a team leader are in Japanese, yet they are textualised in Chinese characters where their Chinese pronunciations are borrowed. Significantly, most of the words possess negative Chinese meanings, as listed in Table 4.2. In a sense, Li Qiao’s selection of these words metaphorically implies Ahua’s desperate anger at the deceitful Japanese officer.

Furthermore, through the abrogation of Japanese written characters and the appropriation of Chinese words with negative meanings, Japanese and Chinese as the dominant languages in the Japanese colonial period and the Nationalist era respectively are both substantially undermined.

Table 4.2. Chinese words possessing negative meanings in Ahua’s oral orders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>words</th>
<th>哭</th>
<th>累</th>
<th>偷</th>
<th>裂</th>
<th>卡死</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>meanings</td>
<td>cry</td>
<td>tired</td>
<td>steal</td>
<td>tear apart</td>
<td>deadly stuck</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Li Qiao. *The Lone Lamp* (孤燈).

---

1.2. The use of Taiwanese vernacular languages

Whereas the Japanese language is presented in either lexical form or complete sentences, Taiwanese vernacular languages (Holo, Hakka and Atayal) are mostly presented in clauses or lexical forms such as nouns, adjectives and curse words. Examples of lexical Holo are “the old guy” (老貨仔), “incapable” (沒才調), “bountiful” (龐湃), “a coward” (軟腳蟹), “son of a wealthy family” (阿舍), “a bachelor” (羅漢卡), and “fuck your mother” (幹依娘). Holo is mixed randomly with Mandarin Chinese in descriptive and dialogic sentences.

Examples of lexical Hakka include “wife” (鋪娘), “suffering acute cecitis” (著天釣), “a woman having an extramarital affair” (他媽契哥), “fuck his/her mother” (屌他媽的). It is noteworthy that “incapable” (沒才調), “the old guy” (老貨仔) and “humiliating” (苦毒) are shared by Hoklo and Hakka vernaculars in their written form of Han characters and meanings but pronounced divergently.

Hakka vernacular appears more frequently in Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy than Holo vernacular. The reason lies in the fact that the story is mainly based on a Hakka family living in the Hakka village Fanzai Wood, and most characters are from the Hakka ethnic group. At a functional level, the textual representation of switching between Mandarin Chinese, Hakka, Holo and Atayal, emphasizes how the speaker or the narrator is talking to his native peers rather than to the ruling class. Li Qiao uses individual languages to constitute a way of expressing different voices and showing Taiwanese identity.

A salient example of the multi-lingual representation of national identity is the episode where Ahan is arrested and detained by the Japanese police. The following passage is a conversation between Liu Ahan (H) and a Japanese police officer(J):
J: 嘿嘿，清國奴！(hei hei, qingguonu!/Hey, you Manchu slave!)

H: 我們不是。 (women bushi/We are not.)

J: 哦，不是清國奴得？(Oh, bushi qingguonu de?/Oh, then what are you if you are not a Manchu slave?)

H: 台灣人。 (taiwan ren./Taiwanese.)


H: 不是日本人！ (bushi ribenren!/We are not Japanese!)

J: 哦呵！野郎，不簡單嘅！(Ohe! yelang, bujiandan zhao!/Oh--oh, you barbarians are really not easy to deal with!)

H: 是日本人，你們不會這樣苦毒我們。（shi ribenren, nimen buhui zheyang kodou women./If we were Japanese, you would not insult us to such an extent.)

J: 苦毒？苦毒哇，那呢？ (kodou? kodou wa nane?/kodou, what is kodou?)

There are three linguistic varieties involved in this code-switching conversation: Mandarin Chinese, Japanese and Holo. However, Holo is not used by the Japanese officer, and Japanese is not used by Liu Ahan. “清國奴” and “野郎” are formal Japanese words textually presented in Kanji characters, while “哪呢”, “嗒”, “得” and “哇” are Japanese words textually presented in Chinese characters in order to borrow their pronunciations. In addition, “台灣人” (Taiwanese) and “日本人” (Japanese) are common words shared by Mandarin Chinese, Holo, Hakka and Japanese. The utterance “you would not insult us to such an extent” (你們不會這樣苦毒我們) is a code-switching sentence where “Kodou” (苦毒) is the Chinese written form shared by Holo and Hakka. As such “Kodou” comes to signify Taiwaneseness.

To comprehend this linguistically complex passage, a reader is forced to slow down his reading speed in order to cognitively shift between Mandarin Chinese, Taiwanese Holo, proper Japanese and Japanese with Chinese pronunciation. “Kodou” (苦毒) is deliberately used in the dialogue and accordingly reinforces Ahan’s identity with Taiwanese. As a result, the written text and vocabulary reinforce Ahan’s claim to being Taiwanese.

In this extract, the dialogic interaction between Ahan and the Japanese officer shows Ahan’s capability to understand Japanese, the language of the colonizer, but he opts to abrogate it in his utterance. Such an attitude is then reinforced by his insistence on identifying himself as Taiwanese rather than Japanese or a Manchu slave. This leads to a two-layered linguistic contest between those varieties involved. Ahan’s reluctance to use Japanese and his preference for using Taiwanese Holo mask and contain his cognitive ability to comprehend Japanese, even as he refuses to overtly acknowledge the language of the colonizer.

Another conversation between Liu Mingji, the key member of the third generation of the Peng family, and the Japanese soldier Aoki in the battlefield reveals the syntactic complexity of code-mixing in the novel:

“Ha ha! Just one man?” laughed Aoki as he stroked his moustache knowingly. (「嘿！一人嘎？嘿嘿！」青木摸著小鬍髭，譎然而笑。/mixed Chinese and Japanese grammar and characters)

“You’re going to have the tar beaten out of you.” Said Matsushita (「喂！會被瓜分吃掉嘍！」松下說。/Chinese grammar with Japanese)

“One man is enough,” said Mingji indifferently. (「一人，夠了。」明基漠然。/Chinese grammar)

“You’d better give up now. Mr. Liu, Ha ha!” Said Iwami. (「投降算啦！劉君！
“You Taiwanese cowards have no courage,” said Matsushita. (「汝們台灣人，鳥卵，沒有嗒哪！」/Japanese grammar mixed with Chinese and Japanese characters)

“There’s one Taiwanese here. Come on!” said Mingji proudly. (「台灣人，在這裡！撲過來吧！」明基昂然說。/Chinese grammar)

“Come off it, Mr. Liu, you can’t be Taiwanese—you’ve got backbone,” said Aoki. (「呦息！劉君！」清木說：「骨氣、有！不像個台灣人嗒哪！」/Japanese grammar mixed with Japanese and Chinese)

“I’m a regular Taiwanese guy.” (「俺是標準的台灣人薩!」/mixed Chinese and Japanese grammar and characters) 10

The linguistic varieties included in the exchange are Mandarin Chinese, Taiwanese Holo, proper Japanese and Japanese with Chinese characters. Whereas Mingji’s father Liu Ahan had refused to use Japanese even though he could handle simple Japanese colloquial terms, Mingji here speaks some colloquial Japanese, limited to short nouns like “俺” (I) and conjunctions such as “薩” (sa).

The mixture of languages and the interplay between languages in these conversations from Li Qiao’s novel reveal several layers of hybridized structures. The novel’s use of Taiwanese vernacular languages reflects the multilingual reality of Taiwanese people living under Japanese rule, where mixing Japanese with Taiwanese Holo, Taiwanese Hakka, or indigenous languages was considered a normal way to talk in the various local ethnic communities. The various layers of hybridized lexical and grammatical structures are also in contrast to the collaborators’ active

accommodation to the dominant language compared to Liu Mingji and others’ reluctance to acknowledge Japanese, as part of their subversion of the dominant colonial language and those who use it.

1.3. Narrative metonymy and multilingualism

In this section, I deal with the indirect political messages conveyed in Li Qiao’s trilogy during the time when the novel was written and serialized in the late 1970s, a time when Taiwan encountered diplomatic setbacks and pressure for the Nationalist government to conduct democratic reforms.

In postwar Taiwan, the Nationalist authorities tried to build a monoglossic society with Mandarin as the only official language and the only recognized national tongue. As a consequence of imposing national language education in Mandarin, the use of Holo and Hakka vernaculars in Taiwan gradually declined. The decline was greatest in metropolitan cities where the National language policy was more completely implemented and more widely accepted by people who were mainlanders and/or worked for military, educational, governmental and public service sectors.

However, despite the public dominance of the Nationalist language policy, people with Holo, Hakka and aboriginal ethnic backgrounds were still using their mother tongues in private or local contexts such as neighbourhoods and homes. In addition, one unintended consequence of Japanese-colonial education was that different levels of spoken Japanese conversation were used among some Taiwanese

---

11 According to Ashcroft, B. et al., there are three main types of linguistic groups within post-colonial discourse: monoglossic, diglossic and polyglossic. Monoglossic groups are those single-language societies using the dominant language as a native tongue, which correspond generally to settled colonies. However, despite the term, they are by no means uniform or standard in speech. See Ashcroft, B. et al., The Empire Writes Back: Theory and Practice in Post-Colonial Literature. 2002.
families. During the 1970s when Li Qiao was writing *Wintry Night Trilogy*, those who grew up and were educated in the Japanese period still possessed the ability to hear and speak Japanese. However, those youngsters who were raised and educated under Nationalist rule acquired spoken Japanese competence at home from older family members or they learned Japanese from other education providers. In other words, factors affecting a Taiwanese person’s willingness to use or capability of using Holo, Hakka, aboriginal vernaculars or Japanese under the Nationalist rule, include his/her ethnic origin, family background, education and social influence. To some extent, the act of speaking various languages became subversive activities.

a. Japanese as a metonym for Chinese

The Nationalist policy of imposing Mandarin Chinese in Taiwan is displaced in Li Qiao’s narrative presentation of Japanese in the *Wintry Night Trilogy*. Japanese and Chinese are the dominant/ruling languages in the Japanese and Nationalist periods respectively, and a metonymic relationship between the two socio linguistic contexts is formed in the narrative. In other words, Japanese in the narrative diegesis signifies Chinese in the reading formation.

I will illustrate this point with the three generations of the Peng family. The Japanese usage in relation to the first generation figure Peng Aqiang is relatively small in comparison to the usage in relation to the second and third generations, Liu Mingding, Liu Mingji and Peng Yonghui. The presence of Japanese language in the trilogy implicates the role of Chinese education in postwar Taiwan. To be more specific, people’s acquisition of Japanese during the Japanese colonial period as represented in the novel metonymically refers to the Taiwanese acquisition of Chinese under Nationalist rule. The metonymic association of Japanese with Chinese is significant since during Japanese rule Japanese was a language the colonized subjects
were ambivalent about. Different people welcomed the language, resisted it or yielded to it reluctantly.

Despite the metonymic association of Japanese with Chinese, Li Qiao’s narrative also occasionally reveals the difference between dominant Japanese and dominant Chinese in the two periods. When the Nationalists took over the running of Taiwan in 1945, Mandarin Chinese was rarely spoken. Those competent to speak or write Mandarin Chinese were mostly new Taiwanese intellectuals who admired the New Culture Movement of the 1910s and 1920s in China, and learned vernacular spoken or written Chinese through private means. Apart from the official language of Japanese, the usage of Holo, Hakka or indigenous languages mainly depended upon the ethnic group with which speakers were affiliated, and Holo and Hakka were written in classical Chinese.

In the narrative of Wintry Night Trilogy, during the period of Japanese rule, Holo and Hakka vernaculars were permitted in public gatherings such as the cultural speeches held by the Taiwanese Cultural Association. This manifested what was depicted later, namely that it was not until 1937 that the Japanese colonial authorities banned Chinese columns in newspapers. In comparison, in the post war context of Taiwan Japanese newspaper columns were banned in 1946, which is only one year after the Nationalists’ takeover and furthermore, Holo, Hakka and indigenous languages were systematically suppressed, whereas the multilingual environment was relatively friendly in the Japanese period.

In Li Qiao’s trilogy, the narrator engages in a practice where the act of speaking Holo or Hakka is continuously reinforced. On several occasions when the narrator introduces a new character, the character’s language preference is mentioned. For example, in a cultural speech session that involves Zheng Minglu, the narrator notes:
“Next, we are going to have a speech from Zheng Minglu. He and Tsai\textsuperscript{12} are from the same Holo background; hence, he is unable to speak fluent Hakka. [...]”\textsuperscript{13} This shows how native languages were used not only in private settings, but also at public gatherings and speeches. The narrative metonymically provides a platform for readers living in the 1970s and later to make a comparison with scenarios when the usage of their native languages in public settings such as schools was discouraged, suppressed or banned.

b. Japanese as a variant of the Taiwanese vernacular

Sometimes the narrative presents Japanese as a variant among the Taiwanese vernaculars. For example, when a Japanese land inspector assaults the village people, the head of the Peng family Peng Aqiang comes forward to protect them. The Japanese officer shouts abuse at Peng continuously in one scene:

“You are not a human being, and you will be treated as an animal.”

“We will treat Manchu slaves the same way we treat animals.”

“Go home and think it over, and then hurry up and sign the tenancy agreement; otherwise you’ll be executed, you criminal.”\textsuperscript{14}

Since Peng Aqiang does not comprehend Japanese, Li Qiao’s narrative here resembles a scene where a demonstration of Japanese language teaching takes place. Each sentence is presented twice: the first uttered by the Japanese inspector in Japanese and the second uttered by an interpreter in Mandarin. Taking the first

\textsuperscript{12} Tsai refers to the lawyer Tsai Shigu (蔡式穀) that the narrator mentioned earlier in \textit{The Deserted Village} who was also a board member of Taiwanese Cultural Association.

\textsuperscript{13} Li Qiao. \textit{The Deserted Village} (荒村). Taipei: The Vista publishing, 1995, p 35.

sentence of the above passage as an example, the one uttered by the Japanese
inspector is presented as “畜牲哇，畜牲尼太斯路侯候得宜” which is followed by
“是畜牲，就要用對付畜牲的方法來對付” uttered by the interpreter. Both are
presented in the narrative in Chinese and are to be read in Chinese, yet the former is
heard as Japanese and the latter as Chinese.

In a sense, Li Qiao’s representation of this kind of code-switching reflects the
cultural atmosphere of the late 1970s when some local cultural intellectuals were
involved in developing a new cultural trend whereby Taiwan’s past was renovated.
Li Qiao uses the passage, the visual text, to undermine the dominant language in the
narrative diegesis. Instead of using proper Japanese in the forms of hiragana, katakana
or kanji, the officer’s scolding words in Japanese are assembled according to author’s
selection of Chinese characters. Moreover, when the reader reads the text, both the
visual and cognitive processes lead to a humorous and ironic effect where Chinese is
exaggeratedly presented and Japanese is downplayed. As such, the dominant force of
the Japanese officer became weakened when a reader has to read or mumble those
Japanese words articulated with Chinese sounds.

In addition, readers who had experienced Japanese rule are likely to enjoy
reading the text and are able to respond to it in a direct way. Japanese is presented
textually in such a way that the Japanese language metonymically becomes a common
cultural legacy of those Taiwanese people. The code switch therefore reinforces the
connectedness of Taiwanese people to each other by referring to their common
heritage and further makes Japanese a variant form of Taiwanese vernacular.
2. Glossing

Glossing refers to an explanatory comment added to a text, or to an interpretation or paraphrase attached to the text as an object. Mark Amsler explains “glossing” as a textual practice. He contends that glosses attach “contextual or grammatical information to a literary text”; by “deteritorializing textual meaning from authorial intention or the narrative’s historical circumstances”, these paratexts produce “textual meaning as an-other.”\(^1\) I argue that glossing in *Wintry Night Trilogy* is more intentional, part of its authorial intention to tell the suppressed history of Taiwan which may provoke the imagination of Taiwanese national identity. Further, glossing’s dual voice of adding and displacing enacts Li Qiao’s dilemma in dealing with history and literature at the same time.

In this section, I examine the various kinds of glossing in *Wintry Night Trilogy* and explore what information Li Qiao has brought into the textual frame through the use of glossing. In addition, I discuss how Li Qiao’s glosses propose alternative ways of reading his narratives.

2.1. A parenthetic translation using brackets

In many passages in *Wintry Night Trilogy*, a parenthetic translation of an individual word or a term appears in round brackets. A typical example is this sentence in the scene where a headhunting incident is enacted by Atayal tribespeople: “They saw five male and female bodies lying on the yard.” (五具男女屍體躺仆在禾埕 (院落) 上).\(^2\) The Hakka term “hecheng” (禾埕) is followed by a parenthetical Mandarin translation “yuanluo” (院落) with round brackets.

Another example of parenthetical glossing is a scene where a typhoon hits the

---

\(^1\) Amsler, M. *Affective Literacies: Writing and Multilingualism in the Late Middle Ages*. p. 215.
village of Fanzai wood: “Muddy torrents were rolling down the river.” (混濁的山花水 (山洪) 滾滾而來) The Hakka term “shanhwa shui” (山花水) for “muddy torrents” is immediately glossed by its Mandarin translation “shanhong” (山洪). Other examples include the placename glosses: Taliwu/他里霧 (Niunan/牛南), Dapulin/大莆林 (Dalin/大林), Dagou/打狗 (Gaoxiong/高雄). Most place names used in the novel were established during Japanese period, while some were derived from the Qing period. All these place names are in Han characters and followed by their alternative names imposed by the Nationalist authorities.

In general, the frequency of glosses presented as “Hakka (Mandarin)” is similar to those presented as “Japanese (Mandarin)”, and they both are more frequently presented than the “Hoklo (Mandarin)” type or the “Atayal (Mandarin)” type. The following three sentences are examples of the “Atayal (Mandarin)” type of glossing:

“那時先把敵首放在「達極仔」(網織背袋)中，迅速脫離現場。”18 (Then they first put the head of the enemy in a woven mesh backpack, and quickly left the scene.)

「伊索 (你)，阿達樣也討厭東洋蕃嗎？」19 (You, as Atayal, also hate the Japanese?)

「是。伊索和貢 (我) 阿達樣人，在臺員就都都好；東洋蕃來，人就太多，太多就沒東西吃了。」20 (Yes. You and we Atayal are well enough living in Taiwan. But, there will be too many people and nothing to eat if the Japanese come.)21

---

17 Li Qiao. Wintry Night (寒夜). p. 263.
18 Li Qiao. Wintry Night (寒夜). p. 64.
19 Li Qiao. Wintry Night (寒夜). p. 318
In these sentences, “達極仔” (a woven mesh backpack), “伊索” (you) and “貢” (I) underlined above are Atayal terms textually presented in Chinese characters and associated with Chinese pronunciations. “網織背袋”, “你” and “我” are their Mandarin Chinese translations respectively. The following sentence is an example where a Japanese term is followed by a Mandarin Chinese glossing: “They are retired officers, […] wearing “helumedau”, a white coloured hat. (他們是官場退下來的「主人」, […] 頭上戴的是「黑魯味道」)22. “黑魯味道” is a Japanese term presented in Mandarin Chinese rather than Japanese Kanji and associated with its Mandarin Chinese pronunciation. Immediately after the term, a Mandarin parenthetical explanation appears to gloss “helumedau”: “It is a kind of summer cap made of hard material. It is helmet-shaped and broad-brimmed. Traditionally, only senior gentlemen wear this kind of hat.”23

The only exception to such Han character based parenthetical glossing is a passage where the lyric of a Hakka folk song is inserted in the narrative. Peng Aqiang’s second son Renhua is described as being good at singing Hakka folk songs. The text uses Mandarin phonetic symbols (Zhuyin fuhao/注音符號), a system of phonetic notation for the transcription of Chinese Mandarin used in postwar Taiwan, rather than translation to help readers sound out the Hakka lyrics: 田邊種蔗 (ㄗˊ), 丈二長 (ㄋㄚˊ), 到頭啃 (ㄌㄧㄛ)24. However, the Mandarin phonetic symbols are only provided for the last one or two words in each verse mainly to show their function in helping readers pronounce the Hakka lyrics.

Among contemporary writers in Taiwan, Li Qiao was not unique in using parenthetic translation glossing. However, Wintry Night Trilogy uses such glosses much more frequently than do other literary works of the period. For example, Zhong

22 Li Qiao. The Deserted Village (荒村). p.147.
23 Li Qiao. The Deserted Village (荒村). p.147.
24 Li Qiao. Wintry Night (寒夜). p.50.
Zhaozheng’s short story “The Ghost Festival Composition” (中元的構圖) shows a different approach to the use of parenthetic glossing. A Japanese proverb is inserted into Zhong’s text, followed by an explanatory sentence in Mandarin Chinese. The proverb is presented directly in its Chinese translation: “狗走路也會碰見木棒” which literally means in Chinese that “when a dog walks, it would at times come across a wooden stick.” In Zhong’s text, the Japanese proverb in Chinese is followed by a Chinese glossing in brackets, providing readers with its metaphoric meaning: “If one keeps going, someday he will come across a good fortune. (Japanese proverb)” 25 Zhong’s use is less sophisticated compared to the way Li Qiao used glossing by borrowing Chinese characters for rendering spoken Japanese.

Ashcroft considers “parenthetic translation of individual words” to be “the most obvious and most common authorial intrusion in cross-cultural texts.” 26 Such glosses, he says, “foreground the continual reality of cultural distance.” As Amsler claims, glosses produce “textual meaning as another,” 27 the simple juxtaposition of Hakka Chinese and Mandarin Chinese in Li Qiao’s text (“禾埕” and “院落”, “山花水” and “山洪”), suggests the lack of a general knowledge about these textual and linguistic connections in Taiwan, where the monoglossic use of Mandarin has been officially promoted. We also see here how there existed in Taiwan generational divergence over using the Hakka language among Hakka ethnic communities. Being simultaneously the author, the narrator and the glossator of Wintry Night Trilogy, Li Qiao’s conscious use of parenthetical glossing reflects what he regarded as the absence of any real link between language and reality in Taiwan’s society. Multilingual glossing as subversion

26 Ashcroft, B. et al. The Empire Writes Back. p. 60.
also implied the suppression of the vernacular language in Taiwan under the Nationalist rule.

If a given word or place name’s simple ostensive reference was unfamiliar to people with a Hakka background, that reference was even more difficult for *Wintry Night Trilogy* readers from other ethnic backgrounds. As Ashcroft argues, glossing is useful for “showing how simple referential bridges establish themselves as the most primitive form of metonymy.”²⁸ For example, the unfamiliarity between Hakka vernacular and Mandarin Chinese, such as between “禾埕” and “院落”, and between “山花水” and “山洪”, reflected Li Qiao’s concern for the inferior situation of the Hakka language in Taiwan. Indeed, in comparison to Mandarin and Holo, whereby the former was upheld as the official/dominant language and the latter was suppressed but still used by many Holo people who made up around 70% of population in Taiwan, Hakka language was doubly marginal against both dominant Mandarin and native Holo languages.

Li Qiao’s considerable but challenging use of Hakka with Mandarin glossing in *Wintry Night Trilogy* reveals the suppressed extent of the Hakka language in Taiwan’s society as well as his desire to represent the subordinate language through literary means. In a sense, Li Qiao’s approach tends to encourage Hakka consciousness against both dominant Chinese and emerging Holo discourses.

### 2.2. Paraphrase as glossing

In addition to the simple forms of glossing and parenthetic translation, another form of glossing in the novel is paraphrase. A paraphrase is a restatement of the meaning of a text or passage using different words either in the source language or in

In Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, paraphrases appear in the text, in marginal notes or in footnotes, and they reference terms, historical figures and historical events.

Glosses of names, phrases or titles include historical terms, official titles, the names of private enterprises, slang terms, official rules and regulations, and business/industrial terminology. They appear in the novel in Chinese vocabulary. Individual glosses are definitions, explanations, or serve informative purposes. Most terms are presented in Chinese, such as an official’s title under Qing rule: “Tongshi” (通事), an official regulation under Japanese rule: “issuing the license for land development” (開墾給照), and the explanation for “the qualification for being an armed guard” (隘首資格) under Qing rule. Others are presented in Japanese Kanji, such as “price lifting” (上引), “senior police officer” (特高系), “no tenant into the paddy fields” (立入禁止處分) and “provisional seizure of the rice harvest” (合毛差押). Some slang terms appear in the vernaculars or indigenous languages: in Hakka Chinese, e.g. “fuck his mother” (屌他媽), or in Holo Chinese, e.g. “the son from a wealthy family” (阿舍).

The gloss for the Japanese Kanji term “上引” (price lifting) appears after a dialogue between a staff member of a sugar manufacturing business, Chen Fa, and a Japanese officer who is described by the narrator as “fat pig”. Chen Fa’s response to the officer’s question is: “Yes, it would be unreasonable if the price ‘remains the same’ (不上引)”. In the text the phrase is followed by an authorial gloss: “‘上引’ refers to ‘lifting the price’”30 The gloss is first addressed to Taiwanese readers and reflects the author’s concern about readers’ lack of historical understanding of past idioms.

The English translation of *Wintry Night Trilogy* does not incorporate Li Qiao’s translation.29

---

parenthetical and paraphrase glosses, perhaps the translator felt the glosses would inhibit a smooth reading environment for English speakers. However, the translator John Balcom of the English version still considered that an introduction was required to explain the cultural and historical background of the trilogy for readers with little or no knowledge of Taiwan.31

2.3. Characters, glossing and history

In Wintry Night Trilogy, real historical figures judged positively by the author/narrator are portrayed under their real names, and some of their stories are incorporated in the narrative. Such historical figures include Li Yingzhang (李應章), the leader and organizer of the Erlin Incident (1925) during the peasant movement, and Zhan E (詹惡), the leading figure of Zhan E Incident (1903), one of many anti-Japanese activities that the character Ahan was involved. As a result of being involved in the Zhan E Incident, the fictional main character Liu Ahan was sentenced to one year in prison and sacked from his job as an armed guard. Another main character Liu Mingding, second son of Liu Ahan and Dengmei, collaborated with Li Yingzhang during the Erlin Incident and helped establish the Peasant Cooperative.

Other stories or historical accounts are inserted in the margin of a page or arranged as a footnote to a chapter. For example, in a passage where Zhan E’s background and life are briefly introduced in the text: “[…]. Because of his bad temper, some people dubbed him as Zhan E (詹惡),”32 a footnote then provides the source in the margin: “See Historical Collection of Taiwan Province (台灣省通誌稿) for the records of the thirty-sixth year of the Meiji period.”33

31 The seventeen-page “Translator’s introduction” is divided into seven parts with the following titles: Qing dynasty Taiwan; the island during the Japanese occupation; the Hakka; the aboriginal peoples; religion in Taiwan; festivals in Taiwan; and the historical and literary significance of the novel.
32 Li Qiao. The Deserted Village (荒村). p. 85.
33 Li Qiao. The Deserted Village (荒村). p. 85.
Huang Shishun (黃石順) is another example of a real historical figure whose significance is glossed in the novel. Huang is one of the speakers at the cultural talks conducted by the Taiwanese Cultural Association, and is described in the novel as “originally from Zhongli, now making a living in the south, and he is also an expert on agricultural issues.” The text is then followed by a footnote, noting that “According to the police record, Huang was from Usong village in Fengshan county, he then became one of the major cadres of the Peasant Cooperative (see Chapter 6, “Peasant Movement” p. 1165.).” Li Qiao further expanded the gloss to note that “In fact Huang was from a Hakka family living in a village located between Dayuan county in Taoyuan and Dajue village in Zhongli (see The History of Taiwanese Social Movements by Miyagawa Jiro (宮川次郎))”34 By providing a detailed background and related resource links for readers when describing a collaborator, Li Qiao is establishing a discourse on the basis of valid evidence.

Negative characters in the novel are mostly described as collaborators. Some are fictional, while others are real historical figures. The former includes Ye Atian and Xie Shixiang. The latter historical figures represented negatively include Zhong Yihong (鍾益紅), Li Shengding (李勝丁), and Chen Zhongchen (陳忠臣). When Zhong Yihong was first mentioned in a conversation between Liu Ahan and his friends, the author inserts a footnote explaining that Zhong Yihong was a senior police officer from the Miaoli Police Office, in charge of monitoring the activities of members of the Cultural Association and involved in cases in the three counties of Miaoli, Chunan and Great Lakes.35 In Wintry Night Trilogy, the character Liu Ahan is portrayed as a representative of the Fanzai Wood neighborhood, the minority and the colonized. He resists colonial rule, and due to his involvement in anti-Japanese

activities, Liu Ahan becomes a major target of Zhong Yihong and Li Shengding.

Although the text incorporates Zhong Yihong and Li Shengding in the narrative, these are in fact not their real names. At the final stage of his struggle against the Japanese, Liu Ahan is injected with poison by a collaborator. When he dies, the representation of Zhong and Li Shengding also concludes. However, Li Qiao expressively inserts a footnote which summarises the later lives of Zhong Yihong and Li Shengding under Nationalist rule. In the footnote of the associated page, Li Qiao notes that both Zhong Yihong and Li Shengding continued to work in the police force until retirement. He also informs readers that Liu Ahan’s son Liu Mingqing and two other victims, all fictional characters, had tried to look for the police officers after the war without success. The footnote then notes that during the time when Li Qiao was writing *The Deserted Village*, Zhong Yihong died. While Li Shengding suffered a stroke which left him partially paralyzed.

Another similar type of glossing is seen in the third volume *The Lone Lamp*. Although the collaborators abused their power and rode roughshod over other Taiwanese, in the eyes of the Allied troops, they were not considered different to those mistreated subjects. There was no exception for the Taiwanese collaborators when the whole troop encountered a life and death situation in the battle field. When the Pacific War was drawing to a close, some of the conscripted Taiwanese were dead, while others tried to flee, and an authorial footnote depicts the fate of the collaborator Chen Zhongchen:

Despite losing an eye and one leg, Chen Zhongchen survived the battlefield of the Philippines. Now, he lives in a small town in Miaoli, making a living by

---

doing fortune-telling, and of course, Chen Zhongchen is not his real name.\(^{38}\)

Using real locations and real historical characters, although with assumed names, Li Qiao’s narration and historical glosses position the story in a believable world. The narrative becomes versatile and even persuasive for readers as a result of this intrusive device because when readers become aware that these collaborators are in fact real people, the informative glossing provided by the author is likely to satisfy their curiosity.

Indeed, Li Qiao has created a world in which real and fictional characters mix, where characters not only witness history but also create history. In the novel, historical accounts are initiated by a historical or fictional figure and then further expanded on by an authorial gloss. The Japanese officer Colonel Ikumoto (生本大佐) is a good example of this mixture of history and fiction. The name of Colonel Ikumoto is unwittingly mentioned in a conversation between those who were conscripted to the Philippines. The text includes an authorial gloss, explaining that Colonel Ikumoto was one of three Japanese officers sentenced to death by hanging in the aftermath of World War II.\(^{39}\)

Another example of such historical/fictional mixing and the role of glossing is the depiction of Liu Mingding who helped establish the Peasant Cooperative. The text includes an informative gloss explaining the population distribution of peasants, tenant farmers and semi-tenant peasants in Taiwan during the 1930s.\(^{40}\) These historical glosses indicate Li Qiao’s concern to situate these fragments of Taiwan’s history in the narrative, and show his strong desire to inform readers of the unknown past of Taiwan under Japanese and afterwards.

\(^{38}\) Li Qiao. *The Lone Lamp* (孤燈). p. 182.

\(^{39}\) Li Qiao. *The Lone Lamp* (孤燈). p. 182.

\(^{40}\) Li Qiao. *The Deserted Village* (荒村). p. 274.
The second novel *The Deserted Village* includes an appendix “Beyond the Deserted Village”, which is a supplement narrating the later history of Liu Mingding after he was targeted by collaborators and repeatedly arrested by police on account of his participation in the peasant movement. The appendix is in effect an extended gloss vividly revealing Li Qiao’s dilemma in dealing with history laden with political taboo and literature at the same time. In a passage in the appendix, the author inserts this direct meta-comment on the narrative:

> Currently, I am still short of the wisdom for examining the foggy history of this period from a clear perspective, and as such I am incapable of handling it. Someday, when history has pulled farther away, we may gain the wisdom to write.

The appendix then summarizes the whereabouts of Liu Mingding during the period from the fourth to the ninth year of the Showa period (1929-1934) and states that he died in a detention room in 1934. This passage in the appendix delivers an unapologetic and a third-person omniscient voice with an authorial point of view in terms of the novel’s historical-related narrative. Li Qiao’s omniscient narrator enters the consciousness of various characters and describes their appearance, speech, behaviour, thought, history, and motivation. The narrator knows what has happened elsewhere or in the past and what will happen in the future and intervenes in the narrative to comment on actions and characters involved. The appendix continues this sort of omniscient narration, but the passage quoted above also suggests that Li Qiao recognizes that even omniscient narrators have limits.

---

In *Wintry Night Trilogy* the textual glossing becomes a territorialized hypotext for Taiwanese people/readers to learn Taiwan’s history. In other words, the use of contextualizing glosses fulfills Li Qiao’s intention to tell Taiwan’s history through a fictional but historically grounded narrative.

In conclusion, Li Qiao’s use of code-switching and glossing is meaningful and integral to *Wintry Night Trilogy*. His multi-lingual practice of code-switching characterizes different ethnic groups in various social contexts and adds linguistic significance to the representation of Taiwaneseness. The dominant position of the Japanese language in many narrative circumstances is undermined through various code-switching practices, especially with Taiwanese vernacular languages. At the same time, the mixture of languages and the interplay between languages as well as the reordering of language power and dominance combine to create a rich narrative in which the emergent characteristics of Taiwaneseness are highlighted.

Li Qiao’s use of code-switching also reflects the multilingual reality of Taiwanese people living under Japanese rule. Since Japanese and Chinese were dominant languages in the Japanese and Nationalist periods respectively, the novel redeploy Japanese as a metonym for the more contemporary Chinese domination.

The textual glosses, all authorial, function as signifiers of the untold history of Taiwan. The glosses historicalize the narrative overtly. Li Qiao expresses through literature what he learned about Taiwan’s past. Using parenthetic glossing, he explicitly attempts to restore the suppressed vernacular languages, in particular, Hakka, the language most closely identified with the author and the main characters of *Wintry Night Trilogy*.

In addition to direct translations, glosses arranged as footnotes in the margins or at the end of chapters, the narrative supplement incorporates fictional and historical figures and events related to the suppressed history of Taiwan under Japanese rule. As
Li Qiao is simultaneously involved in writing a history and a literary work. The resulting multilevel and multilingual narrative that *Wintry Night Trilogy* presents is distinct from what has been taught through the education system. The novel creates a new understanding of what it means to be Taiwanese in the context of history and literary narrative.
Chapter 5

Reception History of Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy

In this chapter, I examine the reception history of Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy. My approach is twofold. First, I pay attention to the transformation of the literary canon and the distribution of cultural capital in Taiwan which may affect the interpretation and reception of the trilogy. Second, I explore the ways in which the trilogy has been received, understood and theorized upon, either by individual readers, or by readers affiliated to specific groups, so as to understand the position of the Wintry Night Trilogy in Taiwan’s cultural field over the course of Taiwan literature’s institutionalization.

The term “reception history” consists of two basic elements: “reader-response criticism” and “history”. “Reader-response criticism” refers to “a general shift in attention from the author of the work to the text-reader pole, [...]”. In other words, it relates to a change in which the review focus is shifted from “the author and the text” to “the text and readers”. As to the concept of “history” in regard to “reader-response criticism”, Jauss’ theory provides the critical framework of this Chapter. He argued that “literature should be treated as a dialectical process of production and reception.” In addition, “literature and art only obtain a history that has the character of a process when the succession of works is mediated not only through the producing subject, but also through the consuming subject – through the interaction of author and public”.

In regard to the Wintry Night Trilogy, the dialectical process of its reception history is composed of four stages. First, the local literary circle centred around Taiwan

---

2 Ibid., p. 57.
3 Ibid., pp. 57-58.
Wenyi had a chance to acquire some cultural capital based on native cultural value from a peripheral position. Second, it was the critics affiliated to the Taiwan Wenyi circles who took the lead in constructing the interpretive assumption of the trilogy, whereby the historical oriented value was highlighted. Third, other critics and the reading public followed suit and engaged in a task in which the filling of gaps in the text and the actualization of the potential meanings in the text was taking place. Lastly, Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy was one of few contemporary literary works attracting academic research prior to the time when Taiwan literature was recognized as an independent literary field in the mid 1990s, and this resulted in the trilogy acquiring an increased amount of cultural capital from the canonical, bureaucratic and popular cultural fields.

The analysis of this chapter is therefore organized into four major themes:
1) the development of Taiwan literature as a minor literature in the postwar period;
2) the role of Li Qiao and his literature in both the mainstream and local literary fields;
3) the development of reader-response to Wintry Night Trilogy after it was published as a three-volume novel in 1981; 4) the reception of Wintry Night Trilogy and its relationship with the institutionalization of Taiwan literature.

The theoretical concepts that are to be employed in this chapter include Deleuze and Guattari’s notion of minor literature, Jauss’s notion of “horizon of expectations”, Bourdieu and Guillory’s notion of cultural capital and canon formation, and Fish’s theory of “interpretive communities”. Since the analytical approach is topically related, each theoretical concept to be employed will be further discussed in the relevant section.

Since Jauss’s theory is concerned with the question of how literary works have affected and are affected by current conditions and events, his notion of “horizon of expectations” is worthy of reference when one deals with the reception history of Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy. Jauss defined the key concept of the “horizon of
expectations” as “an inter-subjective system or structure of expectations, a “system of references”, or the mind-set that a hypothetical individual might bring to any text.”⁴ He also insisted on the possibility of a reconstruction of the horizon of expectations with evidence or signals from the work.⁵ Jauss also proposed the notion of “aesthetic distance”, which refers to “the difference between the horizon of expectations and the work or, as the “change of horizons”, as measured by the “spectrum of the audience’s reaction and criticism’s judgments.”⁶

To explore the horizon of expectations in regard to Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the transformation of literary canon and the distribution of cultural capital in the literary field of Taiwan first need to be taken into consideration. In this regard, Bourdieu and Guillory have provided insights for dealing with the issue. Bourdieu extended Marx’s idea of capital beyond the economic and into the more symbolic realm of culture. He then developed three major concepts: “cultural capital”, “habitus” and “field”. Deleuze and Guattari’s notion of minor literature and its relation to the literary canon is useful for this thesis in order to examine the historical transition of Taiwanese literature during the period starting from the mid 1940s until 1977 and to explore the roles of *Taiwan Wenyi* and Li Qiao in this transition up until the time when Li Qiao began rewriting *Wintry Night Trilogy* in 1977.

Hence, applying Deleuze and Guattari’s notion of minor literature, I first examine how Taiwanese works of literature, including Li Qiao’s literary works, were represented under the circumstances whereby Taiwan literature encountered a de-territorialization and re-territorialization in the use of the official language after the Nationalists took over power from the Japanese in 1945. Second, drawing on Jauss’s notion of a “horizon

---

⁴ Ibid., p. 59.
⁵ Ibid., p. 61.
⁶ Ibid., p. 62.
of expectations” and Fish’s theory about “interpretive communities”, I explore the development of interpretive communities in the literary field, as well as how the *Wintry Night Trilogy* was interpreted. Third, applying Bourdieu’s notion of “capital”, “field”, “habitus” and “practices”, I explore how the reader’s actualization of this potential through the reading process was presented and the way that the various forms of cultural capital were acquired, both before and after the lifting of martial law. Lastly, I discuss the role that Li Qiao and his *Wintry Night Trilogy* played in the process of the institutionalization of Taiwanese literature, as well as its relation to the representation of cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism.

1. Literary canon vs. a minor literature

In discussing Kafka’s use of Prague German in his writings, Deleuze and Guattari proposed that there are three characteristics that are embodied in a Minor Literature: “the deterritorialization of language”, “the connection of the individual to a political immediacy”, and “the collective assemblage of enunciation”. The first characteristic of minor literature is that its language is affected with a high coefficient of deterritorialization. A minor literature does not come from a minor language; rather, it is constructed within a major language. The second characteristic of a ‘minor literature’ is its political nature because “its cramped space forces each individual intrigue to connect immediately to politics”. Third, Deleuze and Guattari argued that in minor literature everything takes on a collective value.

Applying the Deleuze and Guattari theory of minor literature, I argue that, in the

---

8 Ibid., pp. 273-274.
9 Ibid., p. 274
10 Ibid., p. 274.
first three decades of the postwar period, Taiwan’s literary field experienced a two-phase process: initially a forceful deterritorialization, and this was immediately followed by a systematic re-territorialization. As such, I examine the historical transition of Taiwan literature during period from the mid 1940s to 1977 and show the roles played by Taiwan Wenyi and Li Qiao in this transition until the time when Li Qiao began rewriting Wintry Night Trilogy in 1977.

1.1. The implementation of a sinocentric cultural policy

During the final stage of Japanese rule, more than 70% of Taiwanese people could comprehend Japanese;\(^1\) while at the same time, only 2% of Taiwanese aged over 30 could read and write Chinese.\(^2\) In the early postwar period after the Nationalist authorities (KMT) had taken over power, the government ignored the need for the Taiwanese people to have a transitional period of adaptation and forcibly launched the national language movement less than a year after the “retrocession” of 1945. Many of the Taiwanese people who had received an integrated Japanese education became alienated in the face of such a drastic change of language policy.

Under the rule of the first Nationalist provincial governor, Chen Yi (陳儀, 1883-1949),\(^3\) the fact that in Taiwan there existed a Japanese living environment which was as a result of fifty years of colonization was purposely ignored and devalued as enslavement. Chen Yi also asserted that the cultural policy of the new government should be focused on the “promotion of the national language and the eradication of the Taiwanese slave mentality.”\(^4\) As such, Chen Yi was exercising hegemonic control over

---

\(^1\) Lin Ruiming (林瑞明). *A Historical Examination into Taiwan Literature* (台灣文學的歷史考察). p.31.


\(^3\) Chen Yi was appointed by Chiang Kai-shek as the governor of Taiwan after Japan’s surrender in 1945.

Taiwanese people by emphasizing the superiority of the ruler’s language, Mandarin Chinese, while disregarding the languages used by the Taiwanese people including oral and written Japanese, oral Holo, oral Hakka and other indigenous languages.

Following the retreat to Taiwan of the Nationalist government in early December 1949, the Chinese Literary Association (the CLA / 中華文藝協會) was established in May 1950 and became dominant in the literary circles of Taiwan throughout the 1950s. Its goal was to improve the cultural construction of “Three Principles of the People” (三民主義)\textsuperscript{15}; to fight communism and the Soviet Union, and to help recover and rebuild the nation. The CLA established a new literary canon favouring literary works with themes such as combat, anti-communism and nostalgia for the Mainland past.

The notorious reputation of the Nationalist government was bolstered by the massacre of Taiwanese elite in the “228 Incident” in 1947. Thus it was that the Nationalist rulers in Taiwan immediately focused on reconsolidating the shaken social order. As a result, in Taiwan following WW 2, traditional Confucian moralism and family values were promoted as the basic principles of the new sinocentric ideology. Literature thus became a tool for consolidating these traditional values so as to maintain social order. Native works of literature that possessed the spirit of the Taiwanese New Literature of the 1920s then became alienated as being minor literature.

1.2. The minor literary field

In terms of presenting the three characteristics suggested by Deleuze and Guattari, my discussion shows firstly that Taiwan literature went through a top-down process of deterritorialization where Mandarin and vernacular Chinese acted as the

\textsuperscript{15} It is a political philosophy developed by Sun Yat-sen to improve China in every aspect. The three principles are often summarized as nationalism, democracy, and the livelihood of the people.
deterritorializing language. In the face of a rigid cultural policy where a high coefficient of deterritorialization was effectively taking place, Taiwan literature had indeed to be re-constructed from a peripheral position.

a. The impossibility of not writing Chinese

The influence of the national language policy on postwar Taiwanese society was far-reaching. For example, in the government sectors, fluency in Mandarin became a requirement for employment as a government officer, so there were fewer native Taiwanese who occupied official positions than there were under Japanese rule. The government positions that native Taiwanese did attain were mostly lower grade ones in contrast to the higher and more strategic positions occupied by mainlanders. In terms of the higher education system, as most prominent Chinese studies scholars had remained on the Mainland, those who took positions in the Chinese and History Departments of the universities in Taiwan were generally loyal Nationalists who had a background in academia. Because mainlanders dominated the government and the educational and academic institutions, the Taiwanese public gradually formed the general perception that mainlanders with a good command of Mandarin were superior to the local Taiwanese in every aspect, and as a result, a collective internalization of self-loathing developed in the minds of many Taiwanese people.

The effect of imposing the national language and a sinocentric cultural policy on the native literary field was also discouraging and destructive. Chen Yi’s order in February 1946 to abolish the Japanese language sections in all newspapers, combined

---

16 Hsiau A-chin, Contemporary Taiwanese Cultural Nationalism, p. 54.
18 Ibid., p.31.
with the Nationalists’ implementation of a sinocentric cultural policy following the retreat to Taiwan, had severely hampered the creative careers of many Taiwanese writers and generally distressed the Taiwanese people who mostly wrote and read in Japanese. Facing this drastic change which crippled local literary circles, some writers who had won literary awards during the Japanese period, for example, Long Yingzong (龍瑛宗) and Zhang Wenhuan (張文環), became inward-looking and pessimistic. They stopped writing and focused on other careers.¹⁹ Others such as Lu Heruo, Ye Shitao and Zhong Zhaozheng made efforts to write in vernacular Chinese. In the meantime, the literature representing the majority of Taiwanese people was fast becoming a minor literature.

As a result, the distribution of cultural capital in the early postwar period of Taiwan encountered a drastic change. Those who could speak fluent Mandarin and write acceptable vernacular Chinese, who were mostly Mainlanders, were able to get better positions in the literary production sectors, such as editors of the supplementary pages of newspapers, literary magazines and publishing houses.²⁰ Clearly, the cultural field of Taiwan at this stage was undergoing a forceful “deterritorialization” process in which Mandarin Chinese that was written in the vernacular was transplanted into Taiwan and acted as a very highly efficient form of “deterritorialized” language which then quickly replaced Japanese and became the reterritorializing language in postwar Taiwan.

One of the means for the KMT regime to accelerate its systematically designed cultural policy, or in other words, to actualize the re-sinification process of

¹⁹ For example, Zhang Wenhuan worked as a hotel manager, and Long Yingzong as a bank clerk.
²⁰ As Yvonne Chang outlines, “In the early post-1949 years, mainland émigrés were the government’s trusted allies; through them, it was able to effectively impose guidelines on, and set parameters for, media representations, school curricula, and all kinds of cultural activities and discourses. In the field of literary production, a large majority of publishers, editors of fukan in newspapers and literary magazines, and cultural bureaucrats were mainlanders. […]” See Chang Sung-sheng Yvonne. Literary Culture in Taiwan – Martial Law to Market Law. p.76.
reterritorialization, was the establishment of literary awards. Throughout the 1950s, literary awards were established by various organizations such as the Nationalist Party, political institutions, military units, schools and universities, in a bid to comprehensively control all literary activities in Taiwan. They were either coordinated by the Nationalists or were separately developed, but necessarily complied with the norm of the new literary canon.

Under such circumstances, most native Taiwanese writers felt marginalized; only those familiar with the ability to write in Mandarin Chinese gained through previous Chinese experience, or those who conformed to the judging values of the new literary canon, had the chance to be embraced by it. Acceptable novels included *The Story of Gratitude, Hatred, Blood and Tears* (恩仇血淚記) by Liao Qingxiu (廖清秀) and *Mother Country and Fellow Compatriots* (祖國與同胞) by Li Rongchun (李榮春), which were honoured by the Chinese Literature and the Arts (CLA) Awards Committee (中華文藝獎金委員會) in 1951 and 1956 respectively.

The literary critic and scholar, Qiu Guifen (邱貴芬), points out that, among the thirty most published Taiwan writers of the 1960s, twenty-eight were mainlanders. Only Zhong Zhaozheng (鍾肇政) was a Taiwanese native, and Lin Haiyin (林海音) was a *banshan*. (半山) In addition, among the nine female writers who were active during the early postwar period, all were mainlanders, with the exception of Lin Haiyin, who was Taiwanese, despite having been born in Japan and brought up in Beijing. This exemplifies the dilemma of being alienated that many

---

22 *Banshan* (Half Mainlander) refers to Taiwanese who moved to China during Japanese rule, and shifted back to Taiwan after the end of World War Two. Many of them were trusted by the Nationalist government and occupied important positions.
Taiwanese writers encountered in the early postwar period.

In the second half of the 1960s when Modernist literature occupied a leading position in the literary field, the journal *Taiwan Wenyi* did not attract much attention from the literary mainstream. However, the magazine became a “base camp” for native Taiwanese writers.\(^\text{24}\) Chen Fanming (陳芳明) has proposed that writers affiliated with *Taiwan Wenyi* at the time consisted of four types of native writer.\(^\text{25}\) The first category is comprised of writers who re-entered the native literary circles during this period after having earlier withdrawn from their writing careers as a result of the implementation of the new national language policy.\(^\text{26}\) For example, Wu Zhuoliu (1900-1976) had been forcibly alienated from the literary circles for nearly two decades after the Japanese literary page of *China Daily* (中華日報) was abolished in 1946. As Chih Yuwen states, he continued writing classical Chinese poems and novels in Japanese in the belief that a good command of vernacular Chinese writing was impossible to achieve in a short period of time.\(^\text{27}\) As a consequence of his insistence on not giving up writing, a collection of his Chinese classical poems, *Zhuoliu Qiancao Ji* (濁流千草集), was published in 1964, and novels, that had been written and published initially in Japanese, such as *Taiwan Lianqiao* (台灣連翹), were serialized in *Taiwan Wenyi* in Chinese translations.

The second category of *Taiwan Wenyi* writers is comprised of those who had overcome the linguistic obstructions and were fluent enough to submit their Chinese writings to literary publications\(^\text{28}\); this includes writers such as Zhong Zhaozheng and

---


\(^{25}\) Ibid., pp. 483-484.

\(^{26}\) Ibid., p. 484.


Ye Shitao. In addition to literary creation, they were also engaged in writing commentaries, translating Taiwanese literary works written initially in Japanese into Chinese, and editing tasks. Writers who had received an incomplete Japanese primary education but who had then been given a more integrated style of Chinese education under Nationalist rule than had their predecessors, constitute the third category. These writers, such as Li Qiao and Zheng Qingwen, had become fluent in Chinese during their adolescent years. The fourth category is comprised of writers or critics, such as Peng Ruijin and Lin Ruiming, who had been born and educated entirely under Nationalist rule.

The skill of native Taiwanese writers who were able to write in Chinese ranged from “average” to “skilled and accomplished”. All were writing in a second language, yet in the case of Wu Zhuoliu, the second language refers to “Japanese”, which was the language of the previous colonial regime. For those who felt disabled when writing in vernacular Chinese, like Wu Zhuoliu, the strategy to cope with the pressure of “the impossibility of not writing in Chinese” was through translation. When his literary works were transformed into vernacular Chinese translations, his Japanese writings effectively constructed a minor literature within a major language. Clearly, in the face of the KMT’s sinocentric re-territorializing approach, these four categories of Taiwanese writers were coping with the approach through different means.

Undoubtedly, in order to develop a Taiwan-centred literary approach, another process of language deterritorialization seemed to be needed. In other words, the process required a minor literature written in the dominant Chinese language from a marginalized position. However, I argue that under the rigid circumstances in which

29 Ibid., p. 484.
30 Ibid., p. 484.
vernacular Chinese had been established as the dominant written language of Taiwan, what was presented in native literary works was an attempt of a very low coefficient of deterritorialization, at least in the first two decades of the postwar era. In other words, a high coefficient of using Taiwanese Chinese, namely, Holo, Hakka or indigenous languages, was unlikely to work during this period. Li Qiao’s short story “Auntie Ajen” (阿壬嫂這個人, 1965) exemplifies the situation. Initially, Li Qiao used a considerable amount of Hakka Chinese in the short story, yet the submission was rejected by the supplement page of Gonglun Bao (公論報). He then revised it by replacing most of the Hakka Chinese with Mandarin Chinese, and the article was published in Taiwan Wenyi in 1965.31

Another factor accounting for the phenomenon of the impossibility of not using Chinese was the self-confined approach. Zhong Zhaozheng and his contemporaries were making efforts to write in standard Chinese which prevented them from using very much Hakka or Holo because they had to concentrate on a language considered superior to their native languages. In addition to aesthetic standards, they also faced the question of how to comply with the Chinese literary norms set by the literary canon so as to increase the opportunity of having their writings published.

b. Is everything political?

In a closed society like that of post-1949 Taiwan, native writers carefully avoided issues relating to political taboos. I argue that their apolitical approach in fact possessed a political nature, whereby two types of writing strategies were presented: “active conformity” and “passive conformity”. In order to obtain publishing opportunities, native writers were likely to cater to the preferences of the literary canon. The two,

previously mentioned, award winning literary works by Liao Qingxiu and Li Rongchun are clear examples of active conformity in which the spirit of anti-communism or anti-Japanese-ness was explicitly emphasized in their writings.

Other native writers adopted an approach of passive conformity to secure publishing opportunities. Safe themes relating to “ordinary people”, “native subjects” and “hardship in life”, were likely to be included in a writer’s agenda, whereas politically sensitive themes which tended to be connected to political taboos were excluded. Li Qiao was such a writer, at least initially. As discussed in Chapter Three, his early writings such as short stories “Mountain Women” (1969), “The Sound of Weeping” (哭聲) and “The Story of Fanzai Wood” (1969) are filled with implicit historical context and unimportant village people who always struggle for survival. This kind of narrative is also read by critics as possessing versatile topics, expressing sorrow, yet able to convey feelings of warmth and hope.\(^{32}\)

The journal, \emph{Taiwan Wenyi}, maintained a similar stance to that of those individual writers who adopted an approach of passive conformity; this attitude extended into the second half of the 1970s, even to the time of the Formosa Incident (1979). \emph{Taiwan Wenyi} was described as showing a detached editing attitude towards political and social realities.\(^{33}\) In addition, Ye Shitao and Chen Fanming, in their historical writing about Taiwan literature, have both argued that, in the 1970s, \emph{Taiwan Wenyi} did not attract much attention from the literary field because the magazine was very small in scale.\(^{34}\)


\(^{33}\) For example, Hsiau A-chih in \emph{Return to Reality: Political and Cultural Change in 1970s Taiwan and the postwar Generation} (2008), Ye Shitao in \emph{An Outline History of Taiwan Literature} (1987) and Chen Fanming in \emph{History of Modern Taiwanese Literature. Volume II} (2011).

This view is also echoed by another scholar, Chen Jianzhong (陳建忠). When analyzing how Lai He’s literature was accepted in the 1970s, he does not mention *Taiwan Wenyi* at all. Instead, he suggests that, in the first half of the 1970s, there emerged two new literary circles, a modernist school led by Ji Xian, and another centred on the *Summer Tide* magazine (夏潮, 1976-78)\(^{35}\) established by Su Qingli (蘇慶黎).\(^{36}\)

I argue that two interconnected factors explain the passive-conformist approach of the magazine: internally, there were financial challenges and externally, *Taiwan Wenyi* and its authors were able to maintain a small but unique network. The issue of financial difficulty had been of great concern ever since the magazine was first established by Wu Zhuoliu in 1964. After Zhong Zhaozheng took over the magazine’s operation in 1976, it changed from “monthly” to “bi-monthly” to “quarterly”. The sales fell short of the amount required; often, less than 300 copies of an issue were sold.\(^ {37}\)

Furthermore, key members of *Taiwan Wenyi* were amateur writers and editors. For example, Li Qiao was a high school teacher (1960-82) and Zheng Qingwen (鄭清文) worked in a state-owned bank (1960-98). During the period from 1946 to 1979, Zhong Zhaozheng also successively held positions as primary school teacher, junior high school teacher, and part-time university lecturer in Japanese. For such writers, after dedicating their time to full-time jobs, writing, and running the magazine, there was little time left for them to attend to other cultural and literary activities, even when the opposition movement gathered momentum in the second half of the 1970s. Li Qiao, for example, often mentioned in his letters to his mentor, Zhong Zhaozheng, how his family

---

\(^{35}\) *Summer Tide* is a left-leaning magazine, and Su Qingli was the daughter of Suxin (蘇新) who was one of the leaders of Taiwanese Communist Party.


was hard up for money. We can therefore presume that he worked at least in part to earn money to help support his family.

Literary historians and critics have also criticized Taiwan Wenyi for neglecting social reality, perhaps in part because the magazine’s authors occupied a limited cultural space. As “capital” is considered the “energy” that drives the development of the cultural field overtime, the fact that most of the Taiwan Wenyi writers also submitted their writings to other publications to gain recognition and to receive more payment, reflects the difficulties that Taiwan Wenyi encountered in achieving a more prominent position in the cultural field. As Lin Ruiming recalls, “when my work was published in the Chung-wai Literary Monthly (中外文學), I felt that my writing had been recognized, and besides, they paid higher author’s fees.”

Other native writers who had gained recognition from mainstream literary publications were less willing to submit their articles to Taiwan Wenyi. For example, in the late 1960s, literary works by Huang Chunming (黃春明, 1935- ) and Wang Zhenhe (王禎和, 1940-1990) attracted attention from the mainstream literary circle and were published in either the Chung-wai Literary Monthly or the Literature Quarterly (文學季刊). Their writing style was valued for being able to depict grass-root subjects using Modernist narrative techniques, and it was also a time when Nativist literature had gathered greater momentum in the mainstream literary field and became a competitive literary style as opposed to Modernist literature. Clearly, Taiwan Wenyi’s lack of cultural capital was, at the same time, both the cause and the result of intertwined internal and external circumstances, which caused the size of the magazine to be smaller than those magazines from other literary camps.

In the Taiwan of the 1970s, the magazine, *Taiwan Wenyi*, was also seen as being slower to react to the changing social-political context and the literary trends than other publications. For example, Hsiau A-chin criticizes the magazine for lagging behind in introducing Taiwanese writers from the Japanese period. He argues that it was *Summer Tide* which stepped ahead to introduce Lai He in 1976,\(^{40}\) and, it was *Literature Quarterly* (文學季刊) which first introduced the respected deceased Taiwanese writer Zhong Lihe (鍾理和) in 1970, well before *Taiwan Wenyi* did in 1976.\(^{41}\)

The fact that there existed a time-lag in regard to *Taiwan Wenyi*’s response to changing social and cultural contexts was more evidence of the internal and external difficulties *Taiwan Wenyi* made for themselves. However, later the magazine did manage to remedy the situation and regain a cultural profile. As a consequence, a special commemorative section dedicated to Zhong Lihe was presented in issue number 53 (Oct. 1976). Also, when writers such as, Wu Zhuoliu (吳濁流, 1900-1976), Zhang Wenhuan (張文環, 1909-1978) and Ye Rongzhong (葉榮鐘, 1900-1978) died during this period, the magazine published special commemorative sections in issue numbers 54 (Mar. 1977), 59 (June 1978) and 62 (Mar. 1979), respectively.

*Taiwan Wenyi* also organized a special section entitled “Research on contemporary writers”; this was to introduce the writers Ye Shitao and Huang Chunming in issue number 60 (Sep. 1977) and 62. Besides, the magazine published numerous discussions on the history of Taiwan literature and papers on Taiwan literature of the Japanese period, in addition to Chinese translations of Taiwanese literature written in Japanese. Overall, although what had been presented within and without *Taiwan Wenyi*, was a process of passive conformity relating to the characteristic of being considered a minor


\(^{41}\) Ibid., p. 229.
literature, its unique grass-root taste simultaneously presented essential elements for a possible future process of deterritorialization.

c. A collective value

Perhaps it was because of being situated in such a peripheral place that Taiwan Wenyi developed the third characteristic of minor literature in its circles: a collective value. Throughout the 1970s, the Taiwan Wenyi circles were, in a sense, engaged in a collective enunciation; they achieved this by holding literary symposiums, publishing literary commentaries and setting up literary awards. Ye Shitao once argued: “since no one paid attention to us, we therefore decided to do it by ourselves.” A salient example is Taiwan Wenyi’s establishment of literary awards. In honour of outstanding Taiwanese writers, in 1970, the “Taiwanese Literary Award” (台灣文學獎) was renamed the “Wu Zhuoliu Literary Award” (吳濁流文學獎); this was followed in 1978 by the “Wu Yongfu Literary Criticism Award” (巫永福文學批評獎). Although not as generous as other literary awards established in the mainstream circles, in addition to which the competitors of these two literary awards were restricted to literary works published in Taiwan Wenyi during the current year, both awards encouraged those who had the same grass-roots orientation in writing Taiwanese literature; participation in the event provided a feeling of solidarity that encouraged those writers.

Ye Shitao’s comment on the marginalized situation of Taiwan literature connects with Deleuze and Guattari’s claim that a minor literature needs to develop a collective value. They suggest that since “talent” is not abundant in a minor literature, “there are no possibilities for an individuated enunciation that would belong to this or that ‘master’

---

42 Established in 1966 by Taiwan Wenyi.
and that could be separated from a collective enunciation.” I argue that in a minor literary circle like that of *Taiwan Wenyi* in the 1970s, the necessity of establishing a collective value was not due to the lack of talented writers at the time, but rather to the stereotyped perception that, in Taiwan, there were scarcely any talented native writers. Such an attitude was mainly as a result of the ideologically and politically manipulated evaluative judgment that literary works by native Taiwanese writers were inferior and out of style.

Overall, by the mid 1970s the landscape of *Taiwan Wenyi* circles resembled a network of collaboration in which each member played a specific role. Li Qiao was seen committed to writing the *Wintry Night Trilogy*, Ye Shitao continued his enthusiasm for writing commentaries and introducing/translating literary works by Taiwanese writers of the Japanese period. Zhong Zhaozheng was busy editing *Taiwan Wenyi* and the supplement pages of the *People's Daily*. Each acted individually and, as a result, a collective Taiwan-centred value came into being.

Their enthusiasm and insistence on the practices of a minor literature are just like “a dog digging a hole” or “a rat digging its burrow,” as described by Deleuze and Guattari. Although an individual’s absorption in his/her own work and other factors discussed previously had resulted in the negative criticism from commentators that *Taiwan Wenyi* authors were detached from social reality in the way that they were writing about their own world and their own “desert,” both individually and collectively, this phenomenon, in fact laid the foundation for the *Taiwan Wenyi* circle to enter into another state of being a minor literature.

---

45 A term borrowed from Deleuze and Guattari.
The above analysis has demonstrated that, during the first three decades of the postwar period when Taiwan was under the authoritarian rule of the Nationalists, Taiwan literature was forcefully downgraded as a minor literature as a result of the implementation of a sinocentric cultural policy which changed the national language from Japanese to Mandarin Chinese. The three characteristics of a minor literature are clearly manifested in the postwar period. In particular, Li Qiao’s literary activities where the writing of *Wintry Night Trilogy* was involved, played a significant role in presenting these characteristics.

### 2. The Interpretive communities

Overall, the representation of the three characteristics of a minor literature, as proposed by Deleuze and Guattari, was a consistent feature of native literary works in the postwar period of Taiwan. In the case of Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the narrative is involved in presenting the first two characteristics of “deterritorialization” and an “apolitical approach”, which have been discussed in previous chapters from the perspectives of post-colonialism, multi-lingualism and intertextuality. As to the third characteristic of “presenting collective value”, I argue that an effort made by the interpretive community has resulted in the emergence and development of a consensus value. In other words, there is a close relationship between the reception history of *Wintry Night Trilogy* and the development of an interpretive community in which a collective value gradually came into being.

In order to address the way in which the collective value was established, in this section, this study employs Stanley Fish’s ideas on “interpretive community” to gain an in-depth and holistic understanding of the development. Fish examined the reasons behind the differences in the interpretations of different readers and concluded that
readers who make similar assumptions about a text would employ similar ways of reading the text and would reach similar interpretations, and vice versa.\textsuperscript{47} For Fish, interpretive communities are made up of those who share interpretive strategies; members of the community make certain shared assumptions prior to the process of reading that influences their interpretation of the texts.\textsuperscript{48} He further pointed out the key factor that decides the interpretive principle:

\begin{quote}
[…] It follows, then, that when one interpretation wins out over another, it is not because the first has been shown to be in accordance with the facts but because it is from the perspective of its assumptions that the facts are now being specified.\textsuperscript{49}
\end{quote}

As for Li Qiao’s \textit{Wintry Night Trilogy}, I argue that the reading assumption does not necessarily emerge before the act of reading; rather, it is a result of a dialectical process between earlier readings and the contextual circumstances of those readings. Individual critics who share the same code and beliefs then propose possible reading assumptions. The reading strategy winning the consensus of the interpretive community then serves as a referencing guideline for further readings, and as such it also plays a significant role in the history of reader reception regarding the trilogy.

In the following discussion, first, I explain why, in the case of \textit{Wintry Night Trilogy}, both text and readers are of equal importance; the analysis will support my argument that not only the reader’s mind, but also the narrative characteristics of a text, provide nutrients for the formation of a reading strategy. Second, I explore the

\textsuperscript{47} Fish, S. \textit{Is there a Text in This Class}? 1980, pp. 340-341.
\textsuperscript{48} Ibid., p. 14.
\textsuperscript{49} Fish, S. \textit{Is there a Text in This Class}? 1980, p. 340.
development of the interpretive communities and their proposed reading assumptions. Third, I discuss the transition of the prominent assumptions and how they changed and developed into a collective value.

2.1. A more open text? Does it matter?

As discussed in Chapter Two, Li Qiao’s earlier short stories, such as “The Sound of Weeping” and “Mountain Women”, are “hypotexts” when reproduced in the third novel of the trilogy, The Lone Lamp. Between 1976 and 1978, when Li Qiao was committed to writing Wintry Night Trilogy, there were two representative reviews and a symposium that focused on his short stories. The two reviews were written respectively by Huacun (花村, 1976) and Peng Ruijin (彭瑞金, 1978), the former was published in the government sponsored magazine, Zhonghwa Wenyi (中华文艺) and the latter in the local literary magazine Taiwan Wenyi. Huacun compared “Mountain Women” to “The Story of Fanzai Wood” and suggested that it would tell the history of the suffering of a nation, if these short stories are rearranged to form a novel. Peng Ruijin examined a series of Li Qiao’s short stories and adopted a similar view focusing on the theme of “suffering”.

At the symposium conducted by Taiwan Wenyi in 1977, most of the participants were key members or contributors to the magazine, such as writers Zhen Qingwen, Li Dugong (李笃恭), Hong Xingfu (洪醒夫), Peng Weijie (彭维杰) and Li Qiao himself. The contents of these short stories were characterized by most critics as possessing no

---

50 The June 1976 Issue.
53 The proceedings of the symposium were then published in the January 1977 issue of Taiwan Wenyi.
historical resources and showing a vague historical background. In particular, the critic and writer, Hong Xingfu, argued that the anti-Japanese activities depicted by Li Qiao, whether directly or implicitly presented, were reflections of people’s struggle for survival rather than stemming from a narrow nationalism. Hong Xingfu’s interpretation indicated that a narrative strategy, in which anti-Japanese activities were not related to Chinese nationalism, already existed in Li Qiao’s earlier short stories. Hong Xingfu’s viewpoint was then echoed by Lin Ruiming and the writer Wu Jinfa, in another symposium held in 1982 focusing on *Wintry Night Trilogy*.

The relationship between text and reader reception can be further understood by the comparison that is to be made in the following discussion between two similar novels: Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* (WNT) written between 1977 and 1980 and Zhong Zhaozheng’s *The Trilogy of the Taiwanese People* (台灣人三部曲, TTP), written between 1968 and 1978. Possessing a similar nature to *Taiwan Wenyi, Wenxue Jie* (文學界) was a local literary magazine established in early 1982. It held two literary symposiums in the January and December of 1982, respectively. The first focused on Zhong Zhaozheng’s TTP, and the second on Li Qiao’s WNT. Those who participated in the meetings were writers or commentators affiliated with *Taiwan Wenyi* and/or *Wenxue Jie*. Discussions relating to these two symposiums were then published in the February 1982 issue of *Taiwan Wenyi* and the October 1982 issue of *Wenxue Jie*, respectively.

There are considerable thematic similarities between the two trilogies, for example, historical context, the hardships suffered by three generations of a Hakka family in opening up the land, and the involvement of the Hakka family members in

---

continuous anti-Japanese activities. In the preface to the first volume of TTP, *The Sinking* (沉淪), the central theme, which possessed a strong sentiment toward the Chinese nation, was clearly presented. As the narrator argues, “history is waiting there for them (the main characters) to write, and the spirit of the Chinese nation is waiting there for them to develop.” However, in the symposium focused on TTP, critics did not show much interest in discussing the theme of the “Chinese nation” or the “mother country” which implies Chinese national identity. Rather, the issue seemed to be unwittingly avoided by those native critics, and at the same time, TTP was described by critics as an epic whereby the narrative strategy was basically triggered by a Taiwanese author’s sense of calling. The trilogy was also commented on as being a peasant-centred novel depicting the lives of ordinary people under Japanese rule.

The interpretive approach of the 1982 symposium focusing on TTP manifested the preference of those critics for the roman-fleuve feature of TTP where the narrative regarding Taiwan’s history had drawn the attention of native literary critics. The phenomenon echoes Fish’s idea that meaning lies in the minds of the readers who choose to engage with the material that the authors encrypt in the pages. Indeed, as the early post-Formosa Incident era was the time when Taiwanese people developed a Taiwanese consciousness, the native literary field went ahead of others in joining the campaign. It is therefore explicable in answer to the question as to “why native literary critics tended to interpret Zhong Zhaozheng’s trilogy from a Taiwan-centred perspective?” In comparison, in his *A History of Modern Taiwanese Literature* published in 2011, a time when Taiwan had enjoyed considerable democratic achievements, Chen Fanming adopts a more relaxed view of Zhong Zhaozheng’s

---

literature and comments that “Zhong Zhaozheng’s pen had been entangled in the ghostly image of the “mother country”, which then became the foundation for Taiwanese people’s expectations for salvation.”  

As for Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, later developments showed that WNT was better accepted during the period before and after the lifting of martial law in 1987, and was further recognized as a classic that depicted Taiwan’s untold history. I argue that several text-associated factors explain this difference. First, the two trilogies differ as to the representation of anti-Japanese activities. Unlike Zhong Zhaozheng’s constant claim to re-establish the soul of Chinese nation in his narrative, Li Qiao’s anti-Japanese narrative is in general not based on Chinese nationalism. As such, a broader sense of interpretive assumption can be reached for Li Qiao’s trilogy. Second, in *Wintry Night Trilogy*, richer historical resources are used and a more integrated narrative structure is designed. Moreover, other characteristics that *Wintry Night Trilogy* possesses regarding Taiwaneseness also provide readers with broader imaginary spaces and enable members of the interpretive community to generate more consolidated reading assumptions.

The above explanation has manifested my argument that text and readers are of equal significance for the interpretation of literature. In particular, the more open text of *Wintry Night Trilogy* seems to be more likely to trigger readers’ imagination, and is therefore able to provide dynamic elements for readers with different ideologies to generate their own horizons of expectation and interpretations which connect with their collective national imagination. In addition to “text”, readers are also constantly affected by the socio-political conditions and events which occur when the acts of reading take place.

---

2.2. The interpretive community and the assumptions

In late 1980 when Li Qiao’s writing of the second novel *The Deserted Village* was drawing to an end, the writer Huang Wuzhong (黃武忠) presented an interview article: “The Explorer of Human Nature -- An Interview with Li Qiao” (人性的探討者). In this article, Huang describes Li Qiao as a writer possessing a historical sense of calling by commenting that Li Qiao had included major historical events of the period from 1890 to 1945 in his trilogy. Evidently, commentaries on Li Qiao’s narration of Taiwan were gradually changing to include, not only “people’s suffering”, but also, “the depiction of Taiwan’s history.” At a time when some Taiwanese were dissatisfied with the official discourse and anticipated an alternative discourse pertaining to Taiwan’s history, the trilogy’s characteristic of telling the history of Taiwan was highlighted by the formative interpretive community which promoted that interpretive assumption.

Shortly after the trilogy was published in 1981, it was awarded the Wu Shanlan Literary Award (吳三連文藝獎). The judges’ comment was made from a comprehensive perspective where the general characteristics of the trilogy, such as the people’s opening up of the land of Taiwan, their anti-Japanese spirit, their involvement with lawful resistance through cultural activities and their sufferings under Japanese rule, were highlighted. Overall, the judges’ comments were carefully focused on the features compatible with the official discourse and hence did not violate the canonical norm at a time where “anti-Japanese spirit” and “resistant actions” were constantly

---


upheld. However, the comments simultaneously implied that, in the spectrum of “anti-Japanese spirit”, where one end stood for the ideology of Chinese nationalism, and the other for the opposite ideology of Taiwanese nationalism, Li Qiao’s narrative had provided a platform for various expectations and interpretations to negotiate with each other.

In the early 1980s, the localist literary trend that, originally, had been maintained by the Taiwan Wenyi-led literary circles in northern Taiwan, expanded into the south. Established in 1982, the native literary magazine Wenxue Jie (文學界) provided publication space for writers from southern Taiwan, and thus became an outlet for literary creation and commentary, in addition to Taiwan Wenyi, since literary activities associated with Taiwan literature had been constrained in the academic field.

At this stage, the running of literary journals and non-academic research on Taiwan literature still relied on private sponsorship and collective editorship. To take Wenxue Jie as an example: those who sponsored its publication included; physician/poet Zheng Jiongming (鄭炯明), and amateur poet Zeng Guihai (曾貴海), who had aligned themselves with non-academic literary critics such as, Ye Shitao and Peng Ruijin (彭瑞金), as well as the young academic scholar Lin Ruiming (林瑞明). They established an editing team and collaboratively engaged in the task of re-constructing Taiwanese literature. To a certain extent, these native literary magazines served as an alternative academy, embracing scholarly functions such as the presenting of research papers and the organizing of seminars/symposiums on Taiwan literature.

The 1982 symposium conducted by Wenxue Jie of which the focus was the WNT, in effect created an interpretive community. Those who took part in the symposium included the literary critic, Peng Ruijin (the editor of Taiwan Wenyi), the writer, Ye Shitao, Zhong Zhaozheng, the historian and writer Lin Ruiming, and the author of
Wintry Night Trilogy himself, Li Qiao. Other participants included the writers, Zhong Tiemin (鍾鐵民), Wu Jinfu (吳錦發) and Wang Youhua (王幼華). Most were also active members of Wenxue Jie.

In addition to familiar topics such as “the meaning of suffering” and “the close connection between the soil and mother”, two other influential themes of the trilogy were proposed in the symposium: “land consciousness” and “historical account”. In terms of the issue of land consciousness, for example, in the third novel The Lone Lamp, the plot depicts the fatal march of the conscripted soldiers/labourers after the Japanese were defeated by the allies on the battlefield: whenever Mingji and his comrades felt physically exhausted and needed a rest, they would all sit on the grass and face toward the north where Taiwan was. In the symposium discussion, Zhong Zhaozheng highlighted that scene to exemplify the land consciousness of these Taiwanese youths.\(^\text{60}\) Moreover, Peng Ruijin commented that those who love this land are Taiwanese and also the protagonists of history.\(^\text{61}\) Ye Shitao argued that the trilogy is about the land issues of a small weak country. Li Qiao himself noted that the master of the land is the one who loves it, while Lin Ruiming suggested that the narrative conveyed people’s sentimental attachment to the homeland.\(^\text{62}\)

Overall, at this stage, what had been presented at the symposium regarding the issue of land consciousness can be further concluded as follows: first, the idea of “people’s sentimental attachment towards the land” has been described as a more concrete assumption of “land consciousness.” Second, by means of highlighting the notion of land consciousness, Peng Ruijin and others were, in a sense, promoting a Taiwanese national identity in an implicit way because the claim of “land

---

\(^{60}\) Li Ruiming. A Historical Examination on Taiwan Literature. p 260.
\(^{61}\) Ibid., p 260.
\(^{62}\) Ibid., p 261.
consciousness” was, to a certain extent, synonymous with “Taiwanese consciousness”.

As for the theme of “historical narrative”, Lin Ruiming echoed the viewpoint of Huang Wuzhong and suggested that Li Qiao had “bravely touched on Taiwan’s history in relation to political taboos.” In Li Ruiming’s view, Li Qiao’s narrative challenged the canonical authoritative narrative of Taiwan’s history.

Another single commentary entitled, “A Brief Introduction to the Wintry Night Trilogy” (簡介「寒夜三部曲」) by the local literary critic, Xie Songshan (謝松山), was also prearranged and included in the same issue of Wenxue Jie (October 1982). Xie Songshan emphasized Li Qiao’s characteristic of “presenting untold history”. As he argued, “the use of historical resources has established an eternal value whereby I feel gratified because Taiwan literature no longer depicts only the underclass, the unimportant people, the poor and those in backward situations under foreign rule.

Drawing on unearthed historical sources, Wintry Night Trilogy makes a step forward towards the realm of the ‘grand narrative’, and as a result, it also presents a considerable national delicacy in examining human nature.” Xie further commented on Li Qiao’s strategy of making use of historical material as follows:

Considering the politically sensitive nature of those historical resources, they were deliberately blurred in the narrative. Some of them were arranged in the “Afterword” section entitled “Beyond the Deserted Village”, and this might satisfy the imagination of readers.

Xie Songshan suggested that in Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy, the narrative about

---

63 Ibid., p 252.
Taiwan has broken away from belittled subjects and marched toward a higher state where a broadened vision related to Taiwanese nationalism was taking shape. In a sense, Xie Songshan was implying that Taiwan literature had developed to a level where it was able to be juxtaposed with Chinese literature.

Soon after the period following the Formosa Incident, the historical representation of the trilogy had drawn the attention of the native literary circles. Such an interpretive approach is also reflected in “Walking From the Land to History” (從大地走進歷史) that had been published earlier in the same year (1982) by Gao Tianshen (高天生), the executive editor of Guanhuai (關懷) magazine. As Gao described it, Li Qiao attempted to draw back the curtain of history by revealing the truth with his own explanations. For those who used the Japanese period as the historical background to their writing, Li Qiao’s endeavour in disclosing the untold history had been what they tried to avoid. With determined enthusiasm, Li Qiao worked on these revelations and, as a result, gained credit from the interpretive community.

2.3. The collective agreement

At the 1982 symposium, however, it appeared that critics were putting more emphasis on discussing the theme of “land consciousness” than that of “historical account”. For example, Peng Ruijin suggested that “land” is the broader term in which “history” is embraced. “Although it was described as a novel based on historical events, […] in fact, history is the temporal aspect of land. The development of the land is

---

65 Ibid., p. 63.
undoubtedly a history.”67 I argue that the main reason behind this interpretive approach in the symposium was the concern of members of the interpretive community to echo Li Qiao’s views on the genre of the trilogy, as discussed in Chapter Three. Since Li Qiao has continuously claimed that the trilogy is a novel based on historical resources rather than a historical novel, the interpretive approach of his literary friends is unlikely to follow the assumption that the trilogy is a historical novel, due to the consideration that an approach to classify the genre of *Wintry Night Trilogy* as a historical novel would undermine the aesthetic value of the novel.

Nevertheless, subsequent developments regarding the interpretation of the trilogy (from 1982 through to the end of the 1990s) showed that the theme of “historical account” won out as a consensus assumption among the critics. I argue that the assumption that in the early post-Formosa Incident, “exploring Taiwan’s past” gradually became a new trend is a major concern. The consideration of political sensitivity is another key factor leading to this change of emphasis. For those critics, including critics from the mainstream literary field as well as domestic readers, who had generally been brought up under the Nationalist education system, when a literary work was described as possessing “historical accounts”, the work tended to be cognitively connected to a diachronic sense of “the past” rather than “the present”. Historical accounts in a novel contain historical figures and events that happened in the past, and they can be easily distinguished from contemporary figures and events. To be more specific, when the act of reading took place under the assumption that a book was classified as a historical novel, a temporal distance between the past and the present of Taiwan would come into existence, and thus, a feeling of security would come into the minds of readers,

especially at a time when freedom of expression of opinion was still constrained; this was prior to 1993 when Article 100 of the criminal law was revised by the Nationalist authorities.

In comparison, “land consciousness” can be associated with a present sense of space. In terms of the issue of reader reception, I argue that a native spatial perception of Taiwan was more politically sensitive than when Taiwaneseness was understood or emphasized from a historical/temporal perception. In this regard, critics from different backgrounds would tend to adopt a less politically sensitive approach to their interpretation; this approach was further confirmed when the readership of Wintry Night Trilogy became more established and the interpretive community of the trilogy expanded beyond the local literary field during the post martial law period.

Evidence and truth are derived from interpretive assumptions. As Fish argued, “The fact of agreement is a testimony to the power of an interpretive community to constitute the objects upon which its members can then agree.” The above analysis shows how the agreement about the reading assumptions of the Wintry Night Trilogy was produced and how the changing horizon of expectations was affected by the interactions between texts, the contextual circumstances of the acts of reading, and by the critics themselves.

It is noteworthy that, in another commentary published in 1993, the critic Chen Mingcheng (陳銘城) was still in favour of including the historical sense of the trilogy in his title: “Sailing Literary Writing into the Harbour of History” (把文學創作駛進歷史的港灣), indicating how the preoccupation with the “historical accounts” in Wintry Night Trilogy remained attractive over time. This, also explains the consequence of the

---

69 Chen Mingcheng was a journalist from *Independence Evening News* (自立晚報) at the time.
prolonged absence of an understanding of the history of Taiwan and shows the demand from the public for an alternative historical discourse.

When commenting on Li Qiao’s subsequent writings, critics also acted coherently by describing the saga Wintry Night Trilogy as a classic. They often provided readers with a summary review of the trilogy before focusing on the main point of their article. In an essay written in 1995, Yang Zhao (楊照) endorsed the trilogy positively:

During the martial law period, Wintry Night Trilogy was not just a novel; it was also an important textbook that educated a whole generation of newly awakened localists.  

In the preface to A Collection of Li Qiao’s Short Stories (李喬短篇小說集), the editor Peng Ruijin emphasized the historical value of Wintry Night Trilogy:

Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy and his successive novels have won him a good reputation as a Taiwanese historical novelist. The Trilogy is essentially not the literary work of the individual author, because it has become the work of the whole of the Taiwanese people. This is a significant milestone for Li Qiao as a Taiwanese writer. His writing followed the tradition of Taiwanese New Literature established in the 1920s, and explicitly depicted the process of the Taiwanese striving for a living on their land.

---


71 It refers to a new strand of modern Taiwanese literature that emerged in the early 1920s in a process commonly called Taiwanese New Literature Movement.

Initially, Li Qiao’s intention was to write the story of three generations of his family, and he has consistently claimed that the trilogy is about the history of his family. However, the imaginable space of the trilogy and the changing horizon of expectations from readers have enabled the members of interpretive communities to connect their assumptions to the previously untold history of Taiwan. Hence, a history of Li Qiao’s family has become a history of Taiwan. As Deleuze and Guattari comment in their discussion of minor literature, “The individual concern thus becomes all the more necessary, […]. In this way, the family triangle connects to the other triangle, […] that determines its values.”

Originating in the marginalized local literary field, the interpretive communities have, over time, constructed a collective value for Wintry Night Trilogy as “unmasking the untold history of Taiwan’s past” which then became a generally accepted interpretation. It is noteworthy that, during the period before and after the lifting of martial law when people showed their interest in understanding Taiwan’s past as a result of their awakening Taiwanese consciousness, the quality and quantity that the narrative of Wintry Night Trilogy provided, had just started to meet the demands of various readers including overseas scholars, university students and ordinary readers.

2.4. The reading assumption is widened

a. Overseas scholars

In the second half of the 1980s, local scholars in Taiwan became enthusiastically engaged in research into the island’s past, and this accordingly drew attention from some overseas scholars. This was partly due to the previous colonial connection.

between Taiwan and Japan, and in addition, some Japanese scholars had the opportunity to learn more about Taiwan’s past in Japan through the campaigns of Taiwan independence by expelled Taiwanese advocators such as, Shi Ming (史明) and Wang Yude (王育德), who were, at the same time, gradually becoming known to Taiwanese intellectuals.

In Japan, the study, teaching and translation of Taiwan literature was initially pursued by individual scholars at the universities of Ochanomizu, Kyushu and Tenri. More frequent communication and scholarly exchanges thereafter caused Taiwan literature to be seen as more attractive, and resulted in approximately ten books of research into Taiwan literature in the Japanese language being published in the 1990s.74

Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* was among the first wave of works which attracted Japanese scholars such as, Matsunaga Masayushi (松永正義), Masahiro Wakabayashi (若林正丈) and Okazaki Ikuko (岡崎郁子). In an article entitled “Taiwan Literature in the 1980s” (八十年代的台灣文學), published in 1986, Matsunaga Masayushi echoed the consensus view promoted by the interpretive community and suggested that the trilogy visualized Taiwan’s history since the first Sino-Japanese War and had received enthusiastic reviews.75 In addition, Masahiro Wakabayashi also commented that *Wintry Night Trilogy* offered a serious look at Taiwan’s history.76

In China, the academic field also showed interest in studying Taiwan literature in the early post-martial law period; this occurred partially after academic communication

---


between trans-Taiwan Strait scholars became possible in late 1987. Further, more in-depth research approaches were adopted when scholars of the PRC had opportunities to visit Taiwan and were able to explore the resources in person.

Although the funds provided by the PRC government had allowed some significant research, the way that Chinese scholars embraced Taiwan literature as a part of Chinese literature under the influence of China’s cultural united front policy and a generalized Chinese nationalist ideology, was omnipresent. The historical accounts in Wintry Night Trilogy drew their attention, and their focus was on the realistic narrative regarding anti-Japanese activities. For example, in A History of the Development of Taiwan’s Novels (台灣小說發展史) by Gu Jitang (古繼堂, 1989), Li Qiao is introduced in Chapter Eight “Taiwan’s novel at the low tide of the 1960s”, and Li Qiao is described as an outstanding representative among the realistic writers of Taiwan in the 1960s. While in Chapter Nine entitled, “The rise of Taiwan’s nativist literature”, Li Qiao is not included. Wintry Night Trilogy is classified as a realistic novel and the anti-Japanese spirit of the main characters is consistently highlighted. The united-front perspective dominates the commentary approach. For example, the trilogy is described as a volume of Taiwan’s history, depicting how the Han people developed the land and resisted foreign aggression, and how they consolidated the foundation of the Chinese nation and maintained Chinese dignity and the blood line of the descendants of the Fiery Emperor (炎黃子孫).

Overall, the comments issued by China’s academia were unable to break away

77 As Lin Ruiming observed, nearly every volume of the PRC’s research of Taiwan literature included a political statement either in the preface or conclusion to the effect that: “Taiwan has been the holy territory of China”, which was originally the carved inscription of a stele in the Taiwan Hall in the Great Hall of the People. See Lin Ruiming. “Two versions of the history of Taiwan literature—Taiwan V.S. China” (兩種台灣文學史—台灣 V.S.中國), in 台灣文學史書寫國際學術研討會. p. 17.
79 Ibid., p. 443.
from the united front discourse. Interestingly, such a perspective was taken further in subsequent years. For example, in another work, *A Concise History of Taiwanese Literature* (簡明台灣文學史), edited by Gu Jitang and published in 2003, the author expressed his disappointment about Li Qiao’s involvement in advocating Taiwan’s Independence.

The foregoing analysis shows that the characteristic of narrating history in the *Wintry Night Trilogy* was generally agreed by various critics as being flexible and tolerant, and had thus enabled a wider range of various interpretations. The phenomenon further advanced to the extent that when Li Qiao committed to the campaign for Taiwanese cultural nationalism from the mid 1980s and was considered to be an advocate for Taiwanese independence, the reception of *Wintry Night Trilogy* was more or less unaffected and continued to gain various forms of cultural capital from the dominant literary field.

b. University students and other readers

In the years since 1980 when *Wintry Night Trilogy* was published, other reader responses and criticisms were put forward in Taiwan. Among the younger generation who had been brought up under the influence of the KMT’s sinocentric cultural policy, some were involved in building a discourse relating to Taiwaneseness. In other words, the interpretive assumption proposed by the interpretive community provided readers with an alternative explanation about Taiwan which might have triggered their national imagination in varying degrees.

Among the various ordinary readers who responded to their reading of the *Wintry

---

81 Ibid., p. 286.
Night Trilogy or other works of the author Li Qiao, three types of reader can be identified. They are principally the university students who had an interest in Taiwan literature and Taiwan’s history, and secondly, are the readers who had developed Taiwanese consciousness as a result of the Formosa Incident and the series of opposition activities. The third group of readers is those who were only familiar with light literature or popular novels. It appears that the reading strategy developed by the localist interpretive community had effectively influenced some readers, in particular, university students. For example, in an interview conducted by Huang Yi (黃怡) and published in the supplement page of the China Times (中國時報) from October 20 to 23 in 1998, Li Qiao recalled some of the responses of his readers as follows:

It seems that the trilogy was mostly discussed in the local literary circles. But, there were indeed quite a few readers who expressed to me how they were touched to tears by the story. This was beyond my expectations. […] I still remember the visit of two students when I was still at the stage of writing The Deserted Village. One of them came from Shih Hsin College (世界新專), and the other was from the Physics Department of the National Normal University. They said: “In the past, we knew nothing of Taiwan’s history. Regardless of what we are studying now, we will be committed to research into Taiwan’s history when we go abroad to study in the future.”

Okazaki Ikuko (岡崎郁子) is one of a number of Japanese scholars who became interested in Taiwan Literature in the 1980s. In an article entitled “The Legacy of

---

Taiwan Literature” (台灣文學的香火), she noted what she had observed about the responses from some university students in relation to the trilogy:

It was said that some Taiwanese youths, after reading the trilogy, made a special trip to visit Li Qiao. Students from Chengchi (政治) University also prepared to organize a meeting, adopting the Wintry Night Trilogy as the main material to be used in discussions about the lives of different ethnic groups in Taiwan.83

Another similar example was noted in an article entitled “In Search of Taiwan’s Spirit” (追尋台灣的心靈), which was an interview article by Wang Zhaowen (王昭文) who was a student in the History Department at Taiwan University at the time. As a university student majoring in History, she confessed that she had only learned the history of Taiwan through reading the trilogy rather than from history classes. She then commented that Li Qiao is a man who loves Taiwan deeply and that his love stems from understanding the history of Taiwan and himself rather than from an unreal mirage.

These individual readers, in particular, university students, have actualized what was shaped by the interpretive community through their activities or readings. The notion of learning Taiwan’s history through literary works such as Li Qiao’s trilogy became an undercurrent for some university students. As a result of this repeated reinforcement, a broadening of the interpretive community started to come into effect.

The second category of ordinary readers includes readers who developed a sense of Taiwanese consciousness as a result of the Formosa Incident or other opposition

activities and campaigns. For example, in a speech delivered at Columbia University in 1984, Li Qiao recalled an earlier episode where he met and talked to a Taiwanese compatriot living in the USA:

I was asked by an overseas Taiwanese about the question of whether or not the second volume The Deserted Village is depicted on the basis of the Formosa Incident and the Zhongli Incident.  

Firstly, this shows the extent of the Taiwanese people’s lack of knowledge of their own history. Secondly, the trilogy evoked the reader’s horizon of expectations which was then constructed by a connection between fiction and reality, or through further imaginings.

Indeed, as Eagleton suggested: “The text itself is really no more than a series of ‘cues’ for the reader, invitations to construct a piece of language into meaning.” When such people read the plot of the trilogy, they made a set of inferences and engaged in constructing a reading assumption of their own, whereby the horizon of expectations might or might not match that of the interpretive community. In the case of this kind of reader who had developed a sense of Taiwanese consciousness after Formosa Incident, the cues they identified in the text helped to fill in the gaps between the past and the present for them.

As to the third category of ordinary readers who were only familiar with light literature or popular novels, an experience of the Japanese scholar Okazaki Ikuko exemplifies the possible response. She recalled a conversation held in a café in 1986

---

85 Eagleton, T. Literary Theory: An Introduction. 1996, p. 66
when she had a meeting with Li Qiao and Zhen Qingwen. The episode took place when a waitress approached them and asked:

“May I ask who Mr. Li Qiao is?”
“I am. How can I help you?”
“Recently, my sister advised me to read novels of a better quality, and she recommended Li Qiao’s new story of the Tale of the White Snake Madam (晴天無恨—白蛇新傳) to me.”

Such an example shows that there were some readers who neither developed Taiwanese consciousness nor showed interest in exploring Taiwan’s past, and as such were not likely to be influenced by the assumptions of the interpretive community. Hence, they tended to get to know Li Qiao through his other works with popular themes.

3. Li Qiao’s response as a reader

Bourdieu’s conceptualization of the relationship between “habitus”, “capital” and “field” helps us understand the representation of cultural practices in different social situations. He defines “habitus” as “a property of actors (whether individuals, groups or institutions) that comprises a structured and structuring structure”. This is structured by one’s previous experiences and present circumstances, and it is in structuring that one’s habitus helps to shape one’s present and future practices. In the case of the Wintry Night Trilogy, I argue that factors relating to “habitus” include the text of the

trilogy and its author, Li Qiao, at the same time, the text and the author are simultaneously involved in comprising the “structured and structuring structure”, as well as interacting with “field’ and “practice”.

Bourdieu’s definition of the term “capital” includes more than the economic sphere. It also includes material and immaterial forms of cultural or social capital. As to “field”, it is “[…] a structured social space, a field of forces, a force field […].” Bourdieu also suggests that practices are not simply the result of one’s habitus but rather of the relation between one’s habitus and one’s current circumstances.

Over the period when Li Qiao committed himself to writing the Wintry Night Trilogy, his habitus underwent a continuous re-structuring process due to changing external circumstances. Deleuze and Guattari’s concept of minor literature provides the insight for us to understand the transformation of the process. First, Li Qiao’s representation of language has transformed from a low to a high coefficient of deterritorialization. Second, the way that Li Qiao presented the political characteristic of a minor literature shifted from being obscure and vague to the active use of a considerable amount of, previously undiscovered, historical archives relating to the Japanese period.

Moreover, what triggered Li Qiao’s writing of the historical novel, as analyzed in Chapter Three, stemmed from his semiotic desire to unfold the histories of the marginalized, the forgotten and the unrecorded. The phenomenon of the existence of subtle changes in the presentation of minor literature during the period of writing the trilogy indicates that Li Qiao’s habitus had been situated in a repeatedly structured-
structuring process.

Over the period before and after the *Wintry Night Trilogy* was consecutively published in 1980 and 1981, the renewed habitus of Li Qiao was again confronted with changing circumstances. As such, the latest updated habitus helped shape Li Qiao’s future practice. At the same time, the dominant cultural values and belief system also faced challenges in the changing political and social contexts in which the opposition movement was poised for “take off” and the characteristic of Taiwaneseness was highlighted at a time when the issue of the status of Taiwan literature was hotly debated in the literary field. Knowledge of this background helps to explain how the writing and the acceptance of literary works, during a period when habitus was evolving, could be affected by the conditions and events of the time.

As for another closely related element, “practice”, as Bourdieu argues, “practices” are the result, not simply of an individual’s experiences and motivations related to a habitus, but also of relations and dialogues between habitus and changing circumstances.\(^\text{92}\) Clearly, the interaction between the habitus of the trilogy and the expanding literary field became more frequent and consolidated in the early post Formosa Incident era. In the face of such dramatic change, Li Qiao needed to make a response to the new atmosphere where Taiwanese nationalism and consciousness were developing and a new structure for the reader’s horizon of expectation was also established. Besides, the positive reaction also encouraged an active response from the interpretive communities.

In retrospect, for Li Qiao, the timing of two specific events had previously affected his writing plan for the trilogy. As discussed in Chapter Two, the first was in 1977 when Li Qiao was engaged in collecting historical material for writing the

biography of Yu Qingfang who was the leader of the Selai Temple Incident (1915). This resulted in the awakening of Li Qiao’s historical consciousness about Taiwan. The second incident occurred in the same year during which Li Qiao discovered a considerable amount of information in the historical archives relating to land issues in Taiwan; such issues arose initially, under Qing rule, and secondly, under the rule of the Japanese. This led to Li Qiao’s decision to abandon a fifty-thousand word draft and thus he re-wrote the first volume of the *Wintry Night Trilogy* in 1977.

A third turning point arrived in the aftermath of the 1979 Formosa Incident when the Nationalist authorities conducted a series of political crackdowns. The Formosa Incident is generally considered to be a significant turning point in Taiwan’s transition to democracy and it also aroused the suppressed Taiwanese consciousness of many Taiwanese people; it also motivated some people into political action. Coincidently, the early post-Formosa Incident era was also the time when the three volumes of the trilogy were published consecutively by Yuanjing (遠景). The fact that the publisher, Shen Dengen (沈登恩), was once described by Li Qiao as “a guy who feared nothing” explained the possible consequences for people getting involved in activities related to political taboos. Under such circumstances, it was unlikely that the existing structured habitus that Li Qiao possessed during the time when the trilogy was composed would remain undisturbed. Indeed, Li Qiao faced a new social structure where the system of the existing habitus had yet to evolve and further, as Bourdieu suggested, was about to generate perceptions, appreciations and practices.  

Thus, in terms of the reader reception of *Wintry Night Trilogy*, to understand the cultural/literary practices of Li Qiao, who was, simultaneously, both the author and a

---

93 Both *Wintry Night* and *The Lone Lamp* were published in 1980, and *The Deserted Village* in 1981.
reader of the trilogy, one needs to understand both of the evolving fields within which Li Qiao was situated and the evolving habitus within which he wrote. Since habitus and field are relational structures and it is the relation between these associated structures that provides the means for understanding practice, the following discussion is organized into three sections. First, I examine the transition of Li Qiao’s structured and structuring habitus and its relation to the evolving cultural field. Second, I explore the position of Li Qiao and the trilogy in the cultural field and investigate how the cultural capital of *Wintry Night Trilogy* was gained and had accumulated in the 1980s prior to martial law being lifted in 1987. Third, I investigate Li Qiao’s ongoing cultural practices as a result of the interactions between the structuring habitus and the evolving field.

### 3.1. The evolving habitus and its relation to the native literary field

During the period when the first volume, *Wintry Night*, and the third volume, *The Lone Lamp*, were being serialized in *Taiwan Wenyi* (1978-1979) and the *People’s Daily* (1978- May 1979), respectively, Li Qiao paid attention to the feedback from readers; this was revealed in his regular correspondence with his mentor, who was also the editor of *Taiwan Wenyi*, Zhong Zhaozheng. Zhong was simultaneously the editor of the literary supplement page of the *People’s Daily* (人民日報, 1978-1979). In a letter to Li Qiao dated August 13, 1978, Zhong Zhaozheng mentioned a comment made by a mutual friend, Awen (阿文), who considered the *People’s Daily* to be a minor newspaper and wondered whether it could attract any readership.

A few days later, Li Qiao expressed his own pessimistic view about the publishing agenda of *Wintry Night* proposed by Yuanjing: “I reckon that the sales for

---

this novel will be poor if there is no effective marketing." However, two months later Li Qiao showed his delight about the positive feedback from the readership of the *People’s Daily*. In another two letters written to Zhong Zhaozheng dated October 29, 1978 and March 19, 1979, he wrote:

> It seems that *Wintry Night* received a few warm accolades; how about *The Lone Lamp*?

So far *The Lone Lamp* has received favourable notice. It seems to be quite well accepted by readers regardless of whether they are my acquaintances or not. So how about the response there, on your side?

Most readers of *Wintry Night* and *The Lone Lamp* were subscribers to *The People’s Daily* and *Taiwan Wenyi* which were not considered as mainstream cultural products. No matter what their reading motive was, or whether or not their reactions were triggered by Li Qiao’s narrative, the positive feedback indicates that, over the course of writing the first and the third novels, Li Qiao was constantly encouraged by readers who recognized or echoed the habitus that the trilogy had evoked. As such, the aroused resonance was likely to continue to develop and furthermore, played a role in guiding Li Qiao’s writing practice and in shaping his future writing, in particular, the second volume of the trilogy, *The Deserted Village*, written between 1979 and 1980.

While Li Qiao was writing *Wintry Night* and *The Lone Lamp*, he also engaged in collecting material for the third novel *The Deserted Village*; however, he had more than

---

once expressed his consideration of postponing his writing agenda for *The Deserted Village*. In particular, during the period of time between October 1978 and January 1979, Li Qiao showed explicit hesitation in deciding whether to follow the agenda for writing the second volume.\(^{100}\) Two factors explain his hesitation. First, in the face of the new historical sources that he acquired from his field trip, Li Qiao was under pressure regarding the issue of how to present those historical events in his writing. As he noted: “I cannot guarantee that *Deserted Village* will be written out as scheduled. […] Although I have acquired precious historical material from the descendants of Guo Chang (郭常), I was overwhelmed and heavy hearted; I am not sure when I will be able to start writing *The Deserted Village.*\(^{101}\)

The other factor was the heavy workload which led to Li Qiao’s exposure of huge pressure, both mentally and in other ways. As he wrote on December 28, 1978: “I feel exhausted, and hence I am thinking of putting off my writing schedule.”\(^{102}\) At the same time, he was also worried about the reader response to the second volume, and expressed the viewpoint that, without the help of Zhong Zhaozheng, the publication of *The Deserted Village* would not be accomplished smoothly.\(^{103}\)

Nevertheless, he eventually made up his mind to continue with his plans for writing *The Deserted Village*. This was mainly due to the continuing positive feedback and Li Qiao’s growing sense of calling; this developed after many interviews and field trips. Additionally, in the social reality of the time, it appeared that an opposition movement was gradually gathering momentum, in particular, in the aftermath of the Zhongli Incident (中壢事件, December, 1977).\(^{104}\) The Formosa Incident took place in


\(^{101}\) Ibid., p. 512.

\(^{102}\) Ibid., pp. 520-521.

\(^{103}\) Ibid., p. 517.

\(^{104}\) The Zhongli Incident was a 1977 riot in response to the KMT’s attempt to illegally influence the

The positive feedback from readers during serialization was taken a step further in a professional way in the 1982 symposium that focused on *Wintry Night Trilogy*. A passage from an introduction written by Peng Ruijin (彭瑞金) regarding the participants of the symposium provides the evidence:

> It was initially arranged as a two man talk between Lin Ruiming and Peng Ruijin. But the result turned out to be a symposium since all the participants were enthusiastic about presenting their viewpoints.  

> Apparently, not only had the symposium provided a platform for the participants to embody and link the habitus of the individual critic, but it also provided an opportunity for each individual’s habitus to be negotiated so as to be in line with the changing social-political context of the early 1980s, and further, enabled the generation of perceptions and practices. In a sense the interplay between literary agency and external structure was evolving and the effect of the ongoing development was twofold.

> In Bakhtin’s terms, the novel’s serialization in three different native publications and the 1982 symposium produced a centripetal and a centrifugal force simultaneously. First, the serialization reinforced the essence of the embodied habitus initially developed in the native literary field. Second, since the trilogy was serialized in *The People’s Daily* and *The Independent Evening News*, in addition to *Taiwan Wenyi*, and was further published as a three-volume novel, the scope of the readership was accordingly enlarged.

---

105 Editor’s note by Peng Ruijin in *Wenxue Jie* (文學界), Winter issue, 1982. p. 296.
Although the nature of the readers was mainly native-leaning, the repeatedly structured and structuring habitus had opportunities to be shared with other readers through the act of reading.

As such, the domain of the habitus was opened up to a much larger reading public, resulting in an increased readership and criticism from a wider literary field. For the native literary critics, they were encouraged to engage in, and to establish, a consensus value about the trilogy. For ordinary readers, the previously untold history and novelty of the trilogy were likely to trigger their imaginations and open up a new horizon of expectation. While for mainstream literary critics, the establishment of a new aesthetic value became demanding.

3.2. **Restoring cultural capital**

However, in the case of reader reception of the *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the evolving habitus did not simultaneously guarantee a quick acquisition of cultural capital. In retrospect, in the early post 228 Incident era, the social order of Taiwan was quickly re-established through various means of political suppression and the continuous reinforcement of a sinocentric cultural policy and, as a result, the native literary habitus maintained in the Japanese period was undermined and devalued. Moreover, the accumulated cultural capital suddenly disappeared into a void.

As Chang describes it, it was a time when the collective “habitus” of the KMT’s cultural agents naturally shaped a legitimate literary discourse and new evaluative criteria.\(^{106}\) By means of various efficient means, such as the publication of cultural productions that complied with the official norms, and, in particular, the implication of the new educational curriculum, sinocentric value was progressively being inscribed in

---

people’s minds.

As discussed previously, during his earlier literary career when the short story was his main creative genre, Li Qiao used to submit his work to mainstream literary magazines or newspapers. Some of Li Qiao’s efforts were favoured by the editors of these literary entities and thus gained access to the canonical cultural sphere. However, the fact that Li Qiao occupied two literary fields did not mean that he had integrated into the mainlander-dominated literary field. As a writer, his realistic concern was how to have his works published in the canonical literary arena, because there was guaranteed economic capital and readership. Li Qiao’s ambivalent position in the canonical cultural field was peripheral because his disposition was basically inclined to the native literary circles, and it was in the native literary field where he felt comfortable.

A viewpoint, expressed by Li Qiao in a letter to Zhong Zhaozheng dated August 27, 1977, in regard to a literary conference to be held by mainstream literary circles, explains his stance: “As for the literary conference, I guess that no one among us except you is likely to be invited.”107 He also constantly considered himself to be a person favoured neither by the “left” nor by the “right”.108 The former refers to the leftist leaning literary group centred on the magazine Summer Tide (夏潮), and the latter includes the literary productions that complied with the canonical norms or were operated by the government or by the KMT’s cultural institutions.

Unlike some of his short stories, which occasionally gained access to the canonical field, the Wintry Night Trilogy is a work that was initially neglected by the mainstream literary critics, despite gaining a positive reception from the academics. During the period from 1980 to 1987 when it had already been well received by the

native literary communities, only one introductory critique regarding the trilogy was published in the mainstream literary field; it was a short review entitled, “The Inner Voices of *Wintry Night*” (寒夜心曲),\(^{109}\) written by Li Qiao himself, and published in *Wenhsun* (文訊). *Wenhsun* was a literary review magazine owned by the Nationalist Party, although it operated in a rather liberal style under its longtime chief editor, Feng Deping (封德屏).

The way of gaining cultural capital, in the case of Li Qiao and the trilogy, basically started from the minor local literary field. In terms of symbolic capital, the first opportunity to motivate a localist-leaning habitus, was the winning of the Wu San-lien Literary Award (吳三連文藝獎). In 1981 the trilogy won this Award in the category of “Best Novel”. Established by “The Literary Prize Foundation of Mr. Wu San-lien” on January 30, 1978, the Wu San-lien Literary Award aimed to promote Taiwan’s native culture. Wu San-lien (1899-1988) was also the founder of *The Independent Evening Post*, a daily newspaper with a localist leaning, and its supplement page was also where the second volume *The Deserted Village* was serialized (1979 to 1980).

During the period from 1980 to 1987, eighteen introductory articles by Li Qiao relating to his literary works were published. Others were usually works of local commentary, including four general reviews by other critics, six interviews and talks, and eight review papers focusing on the *Wintry Night Trilogy*.\(^{110}\)

The reception of the trilogy appeared optimistic in southern Taiwan during this period since *The People’s Daily* was based in Kaohsiung (Gaoxiong). Apart from the symposium held by local literary magazine, *Wenxue Jie*, Li Qiao was also invited to join literary circles in Tainan in 1982 and lectured at the annual literary camp of the Saline


\(^{110}\) *A Complete Bibliography of Research Source Material of Contemporary Writers in Taiwan. V. 27. Li Qiao.* (台灣現當代作家研究資料彙編. 27. 李喬). 2012.
Region (鹽分地帶文藝營); thereafter he became its regular lecturer. Evidently, the habitus of the Wintry Night Trilogy seemed likely to evolve and it became the “glue” which held together the native literary/cultural circles. Later in 1983, Li Qiao co-edited An Anthology of Political Novels in Taiwan (台灣政治小說選) with Gao Tiansheng (高天生), who was also a critic from native literary circles.

Overall, the objectified/material forms of cultural capital that Wintry Night Trilogy and its author, Li Qiao, acquired during the first few years between 1981 and 1987 included book form, coverage in the supplement page of a newspaper and discussion by a symposium. As for acquired symbolic capital, this included the winning of literary awards, lecturing at a local literary camp, and editing a literary anthology. Although the symbolic capital appeared to be taking shape in terms of canon formation, the cultural capital was mainly acquired within the minor literary circles.

These developments simultaneously show that Li Qiao’s performance in the native literary field was so much in evidence that the mainstream literary circle had to confront it. In 1984, Li Qiao was recruited by Erya Publishing (爾雅出版社), to take on the role of editor for The Anthology of Short Stories, published in 1983 (七十二年短篇小說選). Erya Publishing had been a part of the mainstream literary field since its establishment in 1975. Together with the other four publishing companies, Jiuge (九歌), Hongfan (洪範), Dadi (大地), and Chun Wenxue (純文學), they were among the dominant literary circles and were jointly known as the “Five Small” (五小). In his research into the development of Taiwan’s literature, David Wang used the term “the formation of a canon” (典範的生成) to describe the annual literary collections conducted by Erya during the three-decade period from 1968 to 1997. It is thus

111 The publisher is Taiwan Wenyi.
112 Wang, David D.W. The Making of the Modern, the Making of a Literature (如何現代，怎樣文學？
extremely significant that, in the first half of the 1980s, the mainstream literary field had acknowledged Li Qiao’s achievement in aesthetic representation and had recognized him as an outstanding novelist. Nevertheless, little attention had been paid by critics from the canonical literary field to reviewing or discussing Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*.

In comparison to the reluctance of the domestic canonical world to open a wider door for the introduction or review of Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*, literary production industries and academia in the USA and Japan showed their enthusiasm. For example, in 1984, Li Qiao was invited by “the Taiwanese Literature Research Association of North America” to the USA where he delivered a speech entitled “A Soul Journey of a Writer” at Columbia University. Moreover, in 1985, the Tokyo based publishing company, Tokyo Kenbunsha (東京研文社), published an anthology entitled the *Three Legged Horse* (三腳馬) in which the literary works of Zhen Qingwen (鄭清文), Chen Yingzhen (陳映真) and Li Qiao, were selected and translated into Japanese.

To sum up, the growing distribution of the cultural capital centred on the *Wintry Night Trilogy* in the first half of the 1980s was encouraging yet divergent at the same time. The development of the habitus focusing on the trilogy emerged initially within the *Taiwan Wenyi* centred minor literary field, or in Rob Moore’s words, it started by being a “domestic habitus”. Along with the widened readership of the trilogy, the habitus was then expanded and shared by other native literary/cultural groups such as, *Wenxue Jie*, the literary group in the Saline Region of Tainan; it was also shared by

---

113 In the speech, Li Qiao announced in public his plan to write another historical novel. See The Complete Works of Li Qiao’s Short Stories – A Compilation of Materials (李喬短篇小說全集—資料彙編). p. 52.
overseas scholars. However, the literary canon in Taiwan retained its cautious, aloof, attitude in dealing with the trilogy in comparison to the enthusiasm it had received from foreign scholars from Japan, China and the USA.

3.3. Li Qiao’s cultural practice

As discussed in the previous section, Li Qiao had been paying attention to the way that *Wintry Night Trilogy* had been received by readers since 1978, when it had initially been serialized in *The People’s Daily* and *Taiwan Wenyi*. In other words he was concerned with the history of responses and the potential effect of the literary text. Together with these positive signs, resulting from the interactions between the objective social context and subjective personal experiences, Li Qiao was offered a particular part to play. As both a reader and author of the trilogy, he was situated in a particular position where he could re-assemble the meaning towards which the perspectives of the text had guided him. Hence a further question emerges: How would the evolving habitus and the acquired cultural capital affect Li Qiao’s future cultural practice.

In an article entitled, “The Colourful Two Decades” (繽紛二十年), published in *Liberty Daily* (自由日報) on October 3-4, 1981, Li Qiao looked back on his literary career over the past two decades and revealed a plan to temporarily stop writing novels based on historical sources. As he noted: “I would not be confined to a fixed style, but still, I will resume writing this kind of novel some other time, and for the coming stage, I have already scheduled myself to write a pure novel based on the Chinese traditional story: *Tale of the White Snake Madam.*” (白蛇傳)

Nevertheless, during the first three years after the trilogy had been published in

---

115 The former title of the *Liberty Times* (自由時報).
1981, Li Qiao, in fact, engaged in several other literary activities apart from writing a new version of the Tale of the White Snake Madam, which was then published in 1983. First, earlier than anticipated, he commenced the task of collecting material pertaining to the 228 Incident in preparation for writing another novel based on this event; furthermore, he went abroad to Japan in 1983 to look for further source material. Second, he continued writing literary works with explicit political or historical implications. Examples included three short stories: “Novel” (小說), “The Informer” (告密者) and “Notes from Mt. Taimu” (泰姆山記). The first two were published in early and late 1982, respectively, in Wenxue Je (文學界), and the third appeared in the 1983 summer issue of Taiwan Wenyi.

The subtle change in his writing agenda, in fact, corresponded to the transformation of his literary conception of Taiwan literature that he successively revealed in the public sphere during the early years of the 1980s. Unlike his original idea of not involving himself in any literary debate, such as the Nativist Literary Debates in 1977 and 1978, Li Qiao actively engaged in the debates of the early 1980s in which the issue of whether Taiwan’s literary status was one of being independent, or of being a part of Chinese literature was hotly debated among literary groups with varying degrees of national consciousness.

The article “My Opinion on Taiwan Literature” (我看台灣文學) was written in 1981 and published the same year in issue number 73 of Taiwan Wenyi (June 1981). In it, Li Qiao expressed his view on the position of Taiwan literature. He suggested that to discuss Taiwan literature, one should focus on “literary phenomena”, and try not to touch upon the “political reality”. He then argued that, although the essence of

---

Taiwan literature includes its specific historical experience over the past four hundred years, it is still, nevertheless, part of Chinese literature.\textsuperscript{118} He also contested that Taiwan literature and the literature of the Mainland are connected because of their national, blood and cultural links. Besides, since Chinese literature is part of world literature, likewise, Taiwan literature is part of Chinese literature.\textsuperscript{119}

Two years later in 1983, in another article entitled, “The Correct Explanation of Taiwan literature” (台灣文學正解), Li Qiao argued that “Taiwan literature refers to literary works where the experiences of people living in Taiwan are depicted and besides, they also ought to be created from a Taiwan-centred perspective.”\textsuperscript{120} At the time, his argument obviously echoed those of Ye Shitao and Peng Ruijin. For Ye Shitao, Taiwan literature should develop novels possessing the characteristic of originality; and for Peng Ruijing, the most important issues for Taiwan literature were the development of its autonomy and localization.

In 1986, when the Cultural Bureau of Miaoli County published a collection of Li Qiao’s literary works, in which “My Opinion on Taiwan Literature” was included, Li Qiao added a passage after the original text to explain the difference in his views on Taiwan literature between 1981 and 1983. He claimed that, due to the changes in external circumstances, notably his ongoing self-examination and retrospection, his theoretical concept of Taiwan literature had been adjusted somewhat over the past five years. He further argued that his fundamental beliefs and thoughts remained constant and undisturbed, and the main reason for the apparent difference lay in the fact that the suppression of free speech had been loosened as a result of the changing political and

\textsuperscript{118} Ibid., p.56.
\textsuperscript{119} Ibid., p. 55.
\textsuperscript{120} Li Qiao. “The Correct Explanation of Taiwan literature” (台灣文學正解), in Li Qiao. The Complete Works of Li Qiao’s Short Stories – A Compilation of Materials (李喬短篇小說全集—資料彙編). pp. 64-66.
social circumstances.

Indeed, the above discussion exemplifies how an utterance or a habitus might be affected by a changing external context. In particular, Taiwan had stepped into an era when the issue of Taiwan’s political future of independence or of unification with China became hotly debated in the public sphere; in addition, many Taiwanese cultural intellectuals, including Li Qiao, openly revealed their national identity as being Taiwanese, rather than Chinese. In a sense, the localist-leaning habitus shared by Li Qiao and others who had previously appeared to be humble and insignificant was therefore likely to develop into a Taiwan-centred collective consciousness.

As analyzed in Chapter Three, the *Wintry Night Trilogy* was involved in the presentation of three major themes: “telling the untold history of Taiwan”, “criticizing collaborators”, and “criticizing the weakness of the Taiwanese”. In the following discussion, I explore how the interactions between the evolving habitus and increasing cultural capital affected Li Qiao’s later practice.

I argue that, as the author of the trilogy, as well as its reader, the way that Li Qiao responded to the trilogy and the readers’ horizon of expectations in the aftermath of its publication was basically a practice in which the three previously mentioned themes were continued and reinforced. Moreover, they further developed beyond the scope of a literary text and evoked the structured habitus which was moving into another phase of restructuring under the changing social-political context. The following discussion is accordingly analyzed in terms of the three extended themes.

a. Criticizing the collaborators

Among many works where Li Qiao’s discourse of “criticizing the collaborators” is reinforced, the short story “Novel” published in 1982 is a typical example representing
the discourse. It includes two historical contexts. One is Taiwan in the 1920s and 1930s when it was under Japanese rule, and the setting for the other context occurs two decades later when the 228 Incident took place under early Nationalist rule. Li Qiao depicts the ordeal of two generations of Taiwanese intellectuals from the same family. First, in 'that year’, the protagonist Zeng Yuanwang (曾淵旺) was arrested by the Japanese for being associated with members of the Taiwanese Cultural Association and Peasant Movement. Then two decades later in ‘this year’, he was again imprisoned by the new ruler for attending a parade associated with the 228 Incident.

In addition, those who are dubbed as “three legged” in the trilogy such as Zhong Yihong and Li Shengding, also deliberately appear in “Novel”. This demonstrates explicitly that, through the use of intertextuality, Li Qiao reinforces the main themes of the trilogy by extending them from the context of Japanese rule to the context of Nationalist rule, whereby the resistance goals of the suppressed Taiwanese and the means of suppression of the rulers remain the same. More importantly, the reinforced discourse reveals Li Qiao’s concern about Taiwan’s status of being continuously ruled by a suppressing power.

“Novel” is a work in which its plot imitates that of the second volume of the trilogy, *The Deserted Village*, but is presented in a satirical and humorous manner. In other words, Li Qiao presents his critique of the collaborators by applying the narrative style of ridicule throughout the entire work. His brutal presentation of satire brings to mind his concern about expressing political criticism under the period of martial law. Hence, the satiric presentation functions as a double-edged sword. On the one hand, the narrator directs the satire toward an individual collaborator and the ruler as a whole and is therefore, serious. While, on the other hand, a satire can also acts as a protest or to expose the misconduct of the collaborators by poking fun at something or someone, and
as a result, a comical effect comes into being. This reduces the extent to which his work might be linked to political taboo.

b. Criticizing the cowardly character of the Taiwanese people

On August 26, 1984, Li Qiao delivered a speech to Taiwanese compatriots in Chicago and this was one of many speeches he made during his one-month long visit to the USA. In the speech entitled, “Examining the Image of the Taiwanese through Literary works” (從文學作品看台灣人的形象), Li Qiao made an appeal to all Taiwanese, asking them to discard their traditional character of weakness, dependence and feeling inferior. He then encouraged Taiwanese people to re-establish a new modern Taiwanese image by building a new character.

Apparently, the context of Li Qiao’s criticism of the Taiwanese character of weakness had at the time shifted from the Japanese colonial period into the reality of 1980s Taiwan. He then engaged in writing cultural criticism and developed a series of cultural discourses. Examples include *The Ugly Side of the Taiwanese* (台灣人的醜陋面, 1988), *The Modelling of Taiwanese Literature* (台灣文學造型, 1992), *The Modelling of Taiwanese Culture* (台灣文化造型, 1992) and *The Difficulties and Turning Opportunities of Taiwanese Cultural Movements* (台灣運動的文化困局與轉機, 1989). In the meantime he also engaged in constructing a cultural discourse promoting Taiwanese independence.

Although he continued to argue that literature should represent the resistant voice of the masses, he simultaneously agreed that the influence of literature is so tiny that

---


122 For example, in a short essay entitled “Literature and Politics” by Li Qiao and published in *Taiwan Wényi*. No. 109, 1988.
one needs to commit to more efficient action,\textsuperscript{123} and perhaps this was one of the reasons why Li Qiao engaged in cultural criticism through a multi-dimensional approach.

In a sense, Li Qiao’s involvement in cultural discourse was a result of the redistribution and reconstruction of cultural capital, which had been initially acquired as a consequence of the positive reception of the \textit{Wintry Night Trilogy} in the early 1980s. Along with the further loosening of political constraints and the new market-dominated trend that developed later regarding the consumption of cultural production,\textsuperscript{124} Li Qiao’s cultural discourse was able to be presented in other forms. The various forms of cultural capital that provided the space for Li Qiao to advocate his cultural discourse include making public speeches, hosting TV programmes and canvassing for the political candidates that he supported.

Apparently, Li Qiao was content with this range of cultural activities. As he commented, although hosting TV programmes had disturbed his writing agenda, he was accordingly able to engage in more direct and clear cultural thinking, and to make closer and deeper connections with the changing social and political circumstances.\textsuperscript{125} In short, the practice of his cultural criticism initially presented in the trilogy had been transformed to a mild appeal for cultural reform after he acquired popular cultural capital.

c. Writing the suppressed history of Taiwan

In the Preface of the historical novel, \textit{Injustice in 1947} (埋冤 1947 埋冤), Li Qiao summarized his motive for writing a historical novel based on the 228 Incident of 1947:

\textsuperscript{123} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{125} Li Qiao. \textit{A Concise History of the Taiwanese Soul} (心靈簡史). 2010, p.67.
After I had finished writing the *Wintry Night Trilogy*, the emerging feeling of responsibility and the strong sense of calling towards ‘history’, were transformed into a reverent and devout wish, which then urged me to write another novel relating to the 228 Incident. Besides, owing to my strong feelings about Taiwan, I could not persuade myself to abandon history and devote myself solely to literature.\(^{126}\)

Apparently, unlike the time when he was writing the *Wintry Night Trilogy* when he constantly struggled between a historical and a literary presentation, Li Qiao had become confident about his cultural practices and felt more relaxed in making use of historical resources. Factors attributed to this consistency of cultural practice that originated in his critical discourse in the *Wintry Night Trilogy* included the growing localist-leaning habitus, the accumulated capital, a series of encouraging reader responses, and in particular, an appreciative reading assumption developed by the interpretive community. As a result, the sale of the trilogy led to five reprintings from 1980 to 1997, and the interaction between evolving habitus, capital and fields also led to Li Qiao’s complete ease in playing the role of historical novelist in his ongoing cultural practice.

Nevertheless, the continuous practice of writing historical novels also indicates that, in the aftermath of the publication of *Wintry Night Trilogy*, there was a need for Li Qiao to continue engaging in re-telling history in the guise of writing literature. The post Formosa incident era (1979-1987), was a time when people developed Taiwanese consciousness and were eager to understand more about Taiwan’s hidden past. Although martial law was lifted in 1987, freedom of expression of opinion was still constrained

by Article 100 of the criminal law act prior to 1993, when it was revised. By then, unearthing the suppressed history through literary means, remained one of the ways in which Taiwanese intellectuals could safely respond to the changing political and social-economic context.

4. Canon formation

Moore explains Bourdieu’s idea of cultural capital in the following terms:

“Capital can be understood as the ‘energy’ that drives the development of a field through time. Capital in action is the enactment of the principle of the field. It is the realization in specific forms of power in general.” 127 In terms of the reception of Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy, the above analysis has demonstrated the capacity and the strength of the energy generated from the evolving habitus and accumulated capital, and it has also discussed the role Li Qiao played in the process, and how he reflected his response in his subsequent writings.

In the following discussion I explore the development of a promising canon formation in which Wintry Night Trilogy and its author, Li Qiao, participated. As Guillory suggests, “the problem of what is called canon formation is best understood as a problem in the constitution and distribution of cultural capital, or more specifically, a problem of access to the means of literary production and consumption.” 128 In this section, firstly, based on Chih Yuwen’s research on the institutionalization of Taiwan literature, I comment on the efforts made, both individually and collectively, regarding the process, so as to understand the relationship between Wintry Night Trilogy and the development of Taiwan literature as a field of academic study. Secondly, I explore the

role that the trilogy and Li Qiao played in the course of the institutionalization of Taiwan literature by examining the distribution of capital and cultural agents, such as, publishers, publications and critics. Thirdly, I examine the role that the cultural agent and academic scholar, Qi Bangyuan (齊邦媛, 1924-), played in the course of the Taiwanese literary canon formation in relation to *Wintry Night Trilogy*.

### 4.1. The journey from non-canonical to canonical

During the early postwar period, local literary values and traditions that made up the fundamental spirit of Taiwan literature became comprehensively alienated as the Nationalist government established a new literary canon. Taiwan literature struggled to survive on the peripheral fringe. A few local intellectuals learned to appropriate the dominant language and created the glimmer of hope that the spirit of Taiwanese New Literature could be handed down. Their individual efforts, either in local literary circles, or in the academic field, unexpectedly served as a preparation for the future institutionalization of Taiwan literature. In particular, the aesthetic standard applied by Lin Haiyin, editor of the literary supplement page of *United Daily* (1953-1963), made a considerable contribution to the renaissance of the spirit of Taiwanese literature. As a result, Taiwan literature was able to occupy a tiny space in the canonical cultural field.

During the 1980s, prior to the lifting of martial law, the development of Taiwan literature in the area of teaching and research showed divergence between the activities of local literary circles and the academic community. In the first half of the 1980s, along with the gradual loosening of political constraints and the localization movement, local literary circles played a leading role in bridging the gap in Taiwan literature; they engaged in the re-construction of the spirit of the Taiwanese New literature of the 1920s, including the building of the historical concept of Taiwan literature. Those who were
involved in the reconstruction process consisted of writers, literary commentators and young scholars. For example, Ye Shitao established the theoretical foundation and historical concept of Taiwan literature. In the literary review article, “Taiwan’s Nativist Literature” (台灣的鄉土文學, 1965), the term “nativist literature” resurfaced in the literary field for the first time since the first nativist literature debate of the 1930s, as well as in, “An Introduction to the History of Taiwan Literature” (台灣鄉土文學史導論, 1977), where a Taiwanese-centred literature was suggested.

In academia, in the early 1980s, Lin Ruiming from the History Department of Cheng Kung University commenced a comprehensive study of Lai He’s literature; he revealed the richness of Taiwanese literature, related details of which will be outlined in the following discussion. Overall, the domestic efforts made in the 1980s provided substantial energy for further progress in the institutionalization of Taiwan literature.

The lifting of martial law made a significant impact on the distribution of cultural capital in Taiwan. As traditional aesthetic values were confronted with new challenges, which were due to the release of long-suppressed creative energy, literary creation and discourse accordingly moved to a level in which new forms of writing and discourse theory were attempted. However, Taiwan did not simultaneously transform itself into a politically independent state: this was because the hegemonic cultural system where the ideology of Chinese nationalism was constantly promoted was still in practice. For Taiwan literature to become an independent academic field inevitably required a staged process whereby associated fields, habitus and capital were to be revalued and transformed.

As Chih Yuwen discusses, during the early post-martial law period, a few scholars, who were mainly from university departments of Chinese and History, committed

themselves to the study and teaching of Taiwan literature. For example, Chen Wanyi (陳萬益) and Lu Xingchang (呂興昌) were considered pioneers in the academy, transforming their research and teaching focus from Chinese classical to Taiwan literature. They were from the Chinese Department of Tsing Hua University and were ahead of others in advocating the institutionalization of Taiwan literature. The Graduate Institute of Literature at Tsing Hua University, co-established in 1989, by the Department of Chinese Language and Literature and the Department of Foreign Languages and Literature, was transitional and experimental in terms of promoting Taiwan literature as an independent department. The Institute was divided into a division of Chinese literature and a division of English literature. For the division of Chinese literature, the structure of its curriculum provided a basic framework for later development. The core courses included, Lin Ruiming’s “Special topics in the history of Taiwan literature”, Chen Wanyi’s “Taiwanese novels of the Japanese colonial period”, Lu Xingchang’s “Modern poetry in the Taiwanese dialect” and Shi Shunu’s (施淑女) “Literary theory”. Research into Taiwan literature then gradually became a major part of Taiwan studies in the academia.\(^{131}\)

The controversial sedition clause of Article 100 of the Criminal Code in Taiwan was revised in 1992. As a result, discussion of Taiwan’s independence was no longer considered as a crime; this encouraged a public campaign for the institutionalization of Taiwan literature. The process for Taiwan literature to be able to obtain a proper position in academia, including its development as an independent discipline, became a seesaw battle between supporters of its institutionalization and the residual forces of the

\(^{131}\) Ibid., p. 80.
Nationalist cultural hegemony. In other words, it was a confrontation between the forces of government/academic conservative and non-government/academic reform. As Chih Yuwen suggests, the year of 1995 was critical for the development of university departments of Taiwan Literature; this was because collaboration between the native cultural groups, media and politicians had helped to accumulate considerable support and energy, and accordingly accelerated the process of institutionalization. Among these efforts, the media’s propaganda and the opposition legislators’ efforts in organizing public hearings and including the issue on the question agenda of the Legislative Yuan, were the most effective.

Indeed, the issue was politicized and expanded to the scale of a social movement since the goal seemed unlikely to be achieved through regular institutional processes. For example, the unsuccessful attempt made by Providence (靜宜) University in 1993 indicated that Taiwan literature could only exist under the shelter of the division for Modern Literature in the university departments of Chinese.

Between 1995 and 1997, Tamsui College and Providence University were the only two higher education providers who repeatedly proposed their plans to the Ministry of Education. After seven such attempts, a proposal by Tamsui College, a private four-year independent college without any academic background of Taiwan studies, was approved in February of 1997. Providence University’s application to establish a division of Taiwan literature studies under its Chinese Department was still, however, rejected by the Ministry of Education in 1996; the reasons included: “Research on Taiwan literature

132 Ibid., p. 76.
133 Ibid., p. 131.
134 Ibid., 115.
136 Tamsui College was upgraded as a university in 1999, and changed its name to Aletheia (真理) University.
should certainly be paid attention to; however, whether Taiwanese literature can be
established as an independent academic field still requires long term exploration and
further consideration.”

In the meantime, the National Taiwan University was the only national university
making efforts to establish a new Graduate Institute of Taiwan literature. However, at an
initial stage, its Arts Faculty Council rejected the proposal prepared by a group of
professors from the Chinese Department. The repeated rejections of applications to
establish Taiwan literature as a field of study showed the residual strength of the
previous Nationalist cultural hegemony both in the academic field and in government
agencies. Despite the fact that members of the native literary circles, certain
pioneering scholars and members of cultural groups were all vigorously taking action to
advocate for Taiwan literature, the academic and government agencies remained
conservative and showed reluctance to share their cultural capital and resources with
Taiwan literature.

As Chih Yuwen suggests, “the success of Tamsui College was apparently not due
to the overall readiness of the objective conditions. Rather, it was as a result of intensive
public lobbying.” However, the approval of Tamsui’s application in 1997 was
significant because Taiwan literature was, at that moment, officially recognized as an
individual academic discipline and became entitled to a government subsidy. The
establishment of the new department paved the way for further development towards
full institutionalization. Zhang Liangze (張良澤) was invited to act as the head of the

137 Zheng Bangzheng (鄭邦鎮). “回首台灣文學系的來時路”, in Peng Ruijin. (ed.) The Almanac of
139 See details in Chih Yuwen. De-Colonization in Taiwan: the case of the institutionalization of Taiwan
140 Ibid., p. 133.
141 Ibid., p. 133.
department, and Li Qiao (李喬) was among some of the veteran writers recruited as part time lecturers.

Eventually, it was in 1998, a year after Tamsui established the first Taiwan Literature Department, that Cheng Kung (成功) University submitted its proposal to establish a Graduate Institute of Taiwan Literature, and this was granted in 1999. After two years’ preparation, in 2000, Cheng Kung’s Graduate Institute of Taiwan Literature was formally established.142

4.2. A parallel development

The reception history of *Wintry Night Trilogy*, during the period before and after the lifting of martial law, was in line with the development of Taiwan literature’s gradual recognition in the academic field. I argue that in terms of the reception of *Wintry Night Trilogy*, since 1974, there had been a steady doubling or tripling of support. The following analysis consists of three approaches. Initially, I discuss the distribution of cultural capital in regard to Li Qiao and *Wintry Night Trilogy* and secondly, I examine the role of various agents involved such as publishers, publications and critics. Finally, I discuss the transition of the symbolic and material capital that Li Qiao and *Wintry Night Trilogy* acquired overtime.

a. Distribution of cultural capital

Table 5.1 shows the distribution of various types of commentary, introduction and review in which Li Qiao’s literary works, including the *Wintry Night Trilogy*, were discussed at four successive stages during the period from 1974 to 2011. According to

the data, a total of 377 articles/papers were published, the majority are within the
twenty-four years following the lifting of martial law in 1987; 23.6%, or 89 of the
articles, were published between 1988 and 1996, 57%, or 215 articles, between1997
and 2011, 11.1%, or 53 articles, in the period from 1980 to 1987, and only 5.3%, or 20
articles, during the period from 1974 to 1979.

Table 5.1: Distribution of reviews, research papers and introductory works relating to Li
Qiao’s literary work and Wintry Night Trilogy (1974-2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Review or introduction by Li Qiao</td>
<td>4 (6.4%)</td>
<td>18 (29%)</td>
<td>11 (17.8%)</td>
<td>29 (46.8%)</td>
<td>62 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review or introduction by other critics</td>
<td>4 (7.2%)</td>
<td>4 (7.2%)</td>
<td>12 (21.9%)</td>
<td>35 (63.6%)</td>
<td>55 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews / Talks</td>
<td>3 (6.9%)</td>
<td>6 (13.9%)</td>
<td>6 (13.9%)</td>
<td>28 (65.1%)</td>
<td>43 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timeline / Chronicle of events</td>
<td>1 (11.1%)</td>
<td>1 (11.1%)</td>
<td>3 (33.3%)</td>
<td>4 (44.4%)</td>
<td>9 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive discussion/papers</td>
<td>7 (5.9%)</td>
<td>11 (9.2%)</td>
<td>38 (31.9%)</td>
<td>63 (52.9%)</td>
<td>119 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wintry Night focused reviews/papers</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
<td>10 (100%)</td>
<td>10 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lone Lamp focused reviews/papers</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deseretd Village focused reviews/papers</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
<td>6 (100%)</td>
<td>6 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trilogy focused reviews/papers</td>
<td>1 (1.5%)</td>
<td>10 (14.7%)</td>
<td>19 (27.9%)</td>
<td>38 (55.9%)</td>
<td>68 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20 (5.3%)</td>
<td>53 (14.1%)</td>
<td>89 (23.6%)</td>
<td>215 (57.0%)</td>
<td>377 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: A Complete Bibliography of Li Qiao’s Literary Works (2012)
Overall, the data provides strong evidence for the significance of the lifting of martial law in 1987 and the establishment of the Department of Taiwan Literature at Tamsui College in 1997. The steadily increasing development reflects the extent of the suppression that Taiwan literature had encountered over the period of martial law (1949-1987). Although Li Qiao’s previous works were occasionally included in the canonical production, the fact that the trilogy was nearly ignored by the canonical field in the 1980s, before martial law was lifted in 1987, indicated that the content and themes of the trilogy and the associated habitus did not completely match the ideological value of the cultural canon.

As such, Li Qiao and his trilogy had to settle at a minor position in the system of cultural reproduction, even though the types of cultural capital that they had accumulated in the native literary field were appreciable. The situation somewhat resembles “a big fish in a small pond”143, as suggested by Maton. Since the transposability of cultural capital associated with the trilogy had been restricted, related practices were also confined to the non-canonical field. The phenomenon manifests Guillory’s argument that the “ideological” content of literary works is a content which “the critics of the canon see as reinforcing the exclusion of minority authors from that canon.”144

The lifting of martial law guaranteed *Wintry Night Trilogy* a place which was closer to the canonical centre. However, the acquired cultural capital was only extended to the mainstream literary field. Although the substantial loosening of the political taboo played a role as a determinant for Li Qiao and *Wintry Night Trilogy* to be included in the mainstream literary field, it was after the Li Denghui-led government approved the

---

application of Tamsui College in 1997, that Li Qiao and the trilogy gained a more substantial form of cultural capital.

b. Agents: publishers and publications

In terms of types of review, as well as the canonical or non-canonical nature of publishers, over the years from 1974 to 1979, Li Qiao’s own introductory writings and the reviews of his works by other critics were mainly published by mainstream publishing agents, such as CunWenxue (純文學), Liming publishing (黎明) and The Chinese Daily (中華日報). The renowned book reviewing magazine, Book Review and Bibliography (書評書目), of the time was also among the list, while well-established comprehensive reviews were generally published by Taiwan Wenyi. This phenomenon indicates that, during this period, some of Li Qiao’s literary works satisfied the evaluative norm of the canonical literary field. As it was a time when the difference of opinion on the issue between Taiwanese identity and Chinese identity had not yet surfaced, inclusion was mainly judged on the basis of aesthetic presentation and whether, or not, it violated the hegemonic ideology. As for a systematic review, at this stage, a larger scale review of literary works by native writers, including Li Qiao, was mainly conducted in the native literary field, for example, by the staging of symposiums.

According to Table 5-1, during the period from 1980-1987, the amount of introductory and commentary works by Li Qiao himself explicitly exceeded that of other categories. Content of this kind included descriptions of his writing career and his literary conception of Taiwan literature, as well as introductions to Wintry Night Trilogy. This shows that, at this stage, the native literary field paid considerable attention to introducing the Wintry Night Trilogy. As it was a time when people were gradually developing a Taiwanese consciousness and becoming interested in exploring Taiwan’s
past, the trilogy fitted well into that time by presenting the knowledge form of cultural capital.

Partly because of the promotion of the interpretive communities, the trilogy in which the previously untold history of Taiwan was represented, helped some readers, in particular, university students, opt for acceptance of that alternative historical link in preference to others. Indeed, the traditional view established by the Nationalist government, was that Chinese literature had started with a vast and profound classical literary heritage, moved on to the right wing literature of the May Fourth era of the 1920s, and had then jumped to the postwar era in Taiwan. Now, the system encountered challenges which were the result of the prevalence of the awakening of Taiwanese consciousness; the new approach was based on the literary experience of the island starting from the initial aboriginal oral legend stage in Taiwan. In a sense, the Wintry Night Trilogy played a role for readers by filling the gap in Taiwanese history that had been caused by the suppression of the KMT regime.

For the second stage (1980-87), most of the reviews and introductory papers were published in local literary productions, with only two exceptions: Wenhsun and Chung Wai Literary Quarterly (中外文學). The publisher of Chung Wai Literary Quarterly was the Department of Foreign Languages and Literature at the National University of Taiwan, and Wenhsun was the literary journal operated by the Cultural Work Council (文工會) under the Nationalist Party. The paper published by Wenhsun was an introductory article by Li Qiao, and the other, published in Chung Wai, was a review by David Wang.

The distribution of each category grew rapidly at the third stage (1988-1996), when Taiwan stepped into the early post martial law era; the fourth stage (1997-2011) commenced when Taiwan literature became an individual academic discipline. In
particular, eighty-eight academic research papers were published during the period from 1988 to 2011, and they were focused, either on individual volumes, or the trilogy as a whole. In contrast, there were only eight research papers published during the period from 1980 to 1987. Besides, in comparison to the same category in the previous three stages, each category at the fourth phase occupies a relatively high proportion of between 64.5% and 100% of the total.

The promising developments in the post martial law period show that the common social space, shared by the dominant literary field and the native literary arena in regard to the trilogy, or “field of power” as described by Boudieu, gradually enlarged over time. In particular, the common social space developed rapidly where multiple social fields, such as the economic, educational, bureaucratic and political fields, were included. Such a result also shows that the scope of similarities/homologies between the dominant and native social fields had broadened during the first two decades of the post-martial law period.

It is also worthy of note that, in the early post martial law period, a considerable amount of introductory work relating to Li Qiao and the Wintry Night Trilogy was published. The phenomenon indicates that the majority of ordinary readers were assumed by publishers to be unfamiliar with Li Qiao and the trilogy. In other words, publishers considered the sale of Li Qiao’s literary work, including the trilogy, to be a potential market, particularly for readers who had just developed their Taiwanese consciousness, whilst still retaining their consumption habit of choosing literary products from the mainstream publishing agents.
Table 5.2: Distribution of postgraduate degree theses with topics relating to Li Qiao’s literary work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time span</th>
<th>Number of theses</th>
<th>Degree type of thesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991-1999</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Masters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-2011</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>Masters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: *A Complete Bibliography of Li Qiao’s Literary Works* (2012)

As for academic research associated with Li Qiao’s literary work, table 5.2 shows that there were only two masters theses produced in the years from 1991 to 1999, compared to thirty-four in the succeeding period from 2000 to 2011. Taking their qualitative details into consideration, three observations are worthy of discussion.

First, the cultural canon consists of two major fields: academia and the mainstream literary field. Apparently, when *Wintry Night Trilogy* gained access to the dominant cultural field and was extensively introduced and reviewed among the mainstream literary circles in the early post-martial law period, the attitude of the academia, in particular, the Chinese academic field remained aloof, with the exception of a small amount of individual studies. Such a phenomenon foreshadowed an extreme shortage of resources confronting the academics involved in teaching Taiwan literature, in particular, its exclusion from university course syllabuses.

Second, the first two theses were published in 1991 and 1994, respectively. The first was a thesis at Masters level, *A Study of Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy* (1991, 李喬《寒夜三部曲》研究), by Lai Songhui (賴松輝) of Cheng Kung University; the second was *Roman-Fleuve and Ethnic Identity – A Study Focused on The Trilogy of the Taiwanese People, Wintry Night Trilogy and Lang Taosha* (1994, 大河小說與族群認同—以《台灣人三部曲》、《寒夜三部曲》、《浪淘沙》為焦點的分析), by Wang Shuwen (王淑雯) of Taiwan University. It shows that, during the formative stage of the
institutionalization of Taiwan literature, *Wintry Night Trilogy* was among some of the contemporary literary works attracting domestic postgraduate studies. It also explicitly indicates that novels with a considerable amount of historical reference material had drawn the interest of researchers. As to works without explicit historical references, writers such as Qi Dengsheng (七等生), Ye Shitao and Chen Yinzhen (陳映真) were also noticed. Their literary works were the research subjects of another three masters theses awarded in 1990 by the History and Language Institute of Cheng Kung University.

Finally, the increasing amount of postgraduate research theses relating to Li Qiao’s literary work, from the year 2000 onwards, indicates the extent to which the process of the institutionalization of Taiwan literature was affected by political circumstances. Unlike the situation during the martial law period, when most restrictions were still in full play, the campaign advocated by various social groups and the localization reforms conducted by the Lee Tenghui-led Nationalist government in the late 1990s, as well as by the successive DPP governments in the early years of the 21st century, were significantly meaningful in accelerating the accomplishment of the institutionalization process between 1997 and 2006 which led to the rapid growth of departments of Taiwan literature. Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* and examples of his other works, were, by all accounts, at the centre of academic attention. Among the thirty-four theses published between the years 2000 to 2011, there were five with “Wintry Night Trilogy” included in their titles. This shows that the dynamic content of *Wintry Night Trilogy* had elicited a continuous amount of interest from young scholars. A similar pattern also appeared, as illustrated in Table 5.3, which lists the number of publications between 1993 and 1999 of which the focus was Li Qiao. It is noteworthy that, among the seven publications, two were published by the Municipal Arts Centre of Miaoli County, another two were
collections of research theses presented at academic conferences. Besides which, there were also two books of which “Wintry Night Trilogy” had been included in the title. Clearly, the increased capital was gained entirely from the canonical realm including bureaucratic, academic and economic types of capital.

Table 5.3: Number of publications focused on Li Qiao (1993-1999)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time span</th>
<th>Number of books</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1993-1999</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Local government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-2011</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Local government, literary production agent, academia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: A Complete Bibliography of Li Qiao’s Literary Works (2012)

c. Agents: critics

During the period before and after the lifting of martial law, members of the interpretive community, that had been established in the late 1970s, such as Ye Shitao, Lin Ruiming and Peng Ruijin, were seen as involved in restoration, research and the teaching of Taiwan literature, either in the literary field, or in academia.

If the repair of the ruptures in Taiwan literature of the Japanese period was a priority for the re-constitution of Taiwan literature, the academic field of the 1980s only saw the footsteps of individual exploration, which was in contrast to members of the local literary circles where collaborative efforts had gained considerable momentum. Notably, Lin Ruiming had been playing a crucial role in drafting communications regarding Taiwan literature between members of the local literary circles and members of the academia, since the mid 1970s. During the second half of the 1970s, Lin Ruiming was
one of the very few academic graduates who were engaged in the literary study of the Japanese colonial period. Although political sensitivity prevented him from doing an MA thesis related to the Taiwanese New Literature movement, his enthusiasm for Taiwan literature still drove him to extend his graduate studies. He spent a year living with Yang Kui (1906 - 1985) and eventually published Yang’s biography, *A Portrait of Yang Kui* (楊逵畫像), in 1978. This was also a time when Li Qiao was committed to the writing of the *Wintry Night Trilogy*. In 1979, Lin Ruiming also engaged in a collaborative compilation of *The Complete Works of Taiwanese Literature before the Retrocession* (光復前台灣文學全集), edited by Ye Shitao and Zhong Zhaozheng.

Lin Ruiming commenced his research on Lai He (1894 - 1943) in the early 1980s, and, ten years later, this proved to be fruitful. The two hundred thousand word tome *Taiwan Literature and the Spirit of the Times – Lai He: A Research Anthology* (台灣文學與時代精神—賴和研究論集), has since been considered as the first influential study on a single literary figure from Taiwan, drawing the attention of international scholarship.

In the local literary field, Ye Shitao and Peng Ruijin successively engaged in writing the history of Taiwan. Ye Shitao presented *An Outline History of Taiwan Literature* (台灣文學史綱) in 1987, which covered the time span from the second half of the 17th century to the 1980s. With the objective of “explaining how Taiwan’s literature has developed its strong wish for autonomy throughout the flow of history,

---

145 Very few others, such as Lin Zaijue (林載爵) who published “Two Types of Spirit in Taiwan Literature: A Comparison of Yang Kui and Zhong Lihe” (台灣文學的兩種精神:楊逵與鍾理和之比較) in *ChunWai Literary Quarterly* (中外文學), (December issue, 1973).
146 The publisher was Bijiashan (筆架山) Publishing, the author Lin Fan (林梵) is the penname of Lin Ruiming.
and how its unique characteristics were moulded,”*Ye’s discussion clearly echoed the assertions of the localization movement at the time, and for the first time, the history of Taiwan’s literature was narrated from the perspective of Taiwan.* For Peng Ruijin, it was after the lifting of the martial law when many constraints were removed, that he committed to the writing of *Forty Years of the Taiwanese New Literature Movement*, in which he conveyed a stronger and more vivid Taiwanese perspective.

During the time when the history of Taiwan literature was being sought after, Ye Shitao was a novelist, literary critic, translator, and primary school teacher; Li Ruiming was a lecturer at the Department of History in Cheng Kung University and Peng Ruijin was a literary critic and high school teacher. As Chih Yuwen observes, although criticisms regarding the quality of the academic referencing were valid, the questions raised revealed the reality of the shortage of professional literary historians due to the prolonged absence of Taiwan literature in academia.* In other words, during the time before and after the lifting of martial law, the non-canonical cultural field was a substantial place where the theoretical discourse and the history of Taiwan literature were re-constructed and narrated. More significantly, it was at a time before Taiwan literature gained access to the canonical sphere of academia that the historical and theoretical forms of capital relating to Taiwan literature were established and accumulated.

Although the academic canon failed to represent Taiwanese literature, which had served as the symbolic capital of the Taiwanese people in the 1980s, there emerged a glimmer of hope in the canonical field. Individual scholars with a foreign language and

---

150 Ibid., p. 61.
literature background, notably Qi Bangyuan from Taiwan University and David Wang from Columbia University, showed interest during the second half of the 1980s in introducing or interpreting Li Qiao’s literary works, even though the trilogy was not their initial focus. Qi Bangyuan introduced Li Qiao’s literature of the 1960s, whilst David Wang discussed four contemporary writers, including Li Qiao, in a paper entitled “Male Writers who Look for Heroines” (尋找女主角的男作家). Both reviews were published in mainstream literary publications, the former in Wenhsun (文訊, No. 13, 1984), the latter in Chung Wai Literary Quarterly (No. 10, Volume 14, 1986). A further development is discussed in Section 4.3.

d. Symbolic and material capital

According to Table 5.4, the scope of the symbolic capital acquired by Li Qiao was significantly enlarged over the time period between 1981 and 2002. During the 1980s, before the lifting of martial law in late 1987, the symbolic forms of the cultural capital that Li Qiao gained were; ‘lecturing’, ‘making speeches’ and ‘acceptance of interviews. These literary activities were either conducted by a local literary production agent, or else by overseas pro-Taiwan groups. In comparison, the symbolic forms of cultural capital increased dramatically in the post martial law period. In particular, it was after Taiwan literature was established as an independent academic discipline in 1997 that various forms of symbolic cultural capital were acquired. In the arena of popular culture, they included participating and producing TV programmes; in the field of academia, they included, lecturing in university courses related to Taiwan literature.

In addition, Li Qiao also gained access to the bureaucratic form of cultural capital; this was achieved due to the fact that, in 1997 he had been recruited as a board member of the Cultural and Arts foundation under the Executive Yuan and, moreover, in the year
2000, he had been appointed as an advisor for National Policy by the newly elected president Chen Shuibian (陳水扁).

Table 5.4: Symbolic capital acquired by Li Qiao (1981-2002)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lectured at local literary camp (1983-1989)</td>
<td>Outstanding Hakka Award for Social Science achievements (台美基金會, 1995)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University lecturer/professor (Tamsui College, 1997)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Board member of Cultural and Arts foundation (Executive Yuan, 1997)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contribution to TV episode (Public TV, 1998)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Producer of TV programme (2000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Award for Contribution to Taiwan Literature (2000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Taiwan Public TV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Week of Li Qiao (李喬週, National Normal University, 1996)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: *A Complete Bibliography of Li Qiao’s Literary Works* (2012)

As for the material form of capital, Table 5.5 shows a similar pattern to Table 5.4. During the period from 1981 to 1987, the material form of capital that *Wintry Night Trilogy* acquired included books, bookstores, review papers, symposiums held by native literary circles and research or review papers on Li Qiao’s work by foreign scholars from Japan and the USA. In comparison with the earlier period, the developments from 1988 onwards proved to be colourful and prolific as the trilogy gained access to the
canonical fields as well as to the arena of popular culture. The increased material forms of cultural capital included acceptance by public libraries, academic research, mainstream cultural productions, popular culture, abridged Chinese versions, foreign language translations in English and Japanese, local government publications and academic conferences/symposiums.

Table 5.5: Material capital acquired by Wintry Night Trilogy (1981-2002)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supplementary pages of Newspapers</td>
<td>Bookstores</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bentu literary magazine</td>
<td>Libraries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bookstores</td>
<td>Academic research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literary Awards</td>
<td>Mainstream newspapers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reviews from local literary circles</td>
<td>Mainstream literary productions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reviews from foreign scholars from</td>
<td>Popular culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan and the USA.</td>
<td>English translation (2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chinese concise version (2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local governmental publications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adapted to TV series (2002, 2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University academic conferences/symposiums</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: A Complete Bibliography of Li Qiao’s Literary Works (2012)

4.3. Transcending the centre/periphery opposition: Qi Bangyuan

The cultural practice of Qi Bangyuan (Chi Pang-yuan, 齊邦媛, 1924- ) in the post martial law period bears considerable resemblance to that of Lin Haiyin (1918-2001) in the 1960s. Indeed, they had several characteristics in common in terms of their professional practice. Qi Bangyuan is a mainlander whose background is similar to that
of many of her contemporaries whose parents were among the mass exodus of
mainlanders in the aftermath of the Chinese Civil War, followed by the retreat to
Taiwan of the defeated Nationalist government in 1949. Lin Haiyin, however, was the
daughter of a Holo father and a Hakka mother, and her unique experience included
being born in Japan, being brought up in Beijing and having graduated from the Beijing
Journalism College, and in addition, being married to a Beijing native, He Fan (何凡,
1910-2002) who was also a writer within the mainstream literary field.

Despite their different ethnic backgrounds, both of them grew up in China and
had mainland educational experiences. During the postwar period, both of them
occupied advantageous positions in the patronage system in Taiwan. Lin Haiyin’s
unique background and her Beijing experience allowed her to step into the mainstream
literary arena and take the role of chief editor of the literary supplement page of the
United Daily between 1951 and 1963. Qi Bangyuan held jobs successively or
simultaneously as a professor in the Department of Foreign languages and Literature at
Chung Hsing University (1958-1972), National Taiwan University (1970-1988), and as
a supervisor of the National Institute for Compilation and Translation (國立編譯館,

Although being situated in privileged positions, either in the government
educational sector, academia, or in the mainstream literary arena, they each adopted a
liberal attitude in dealing with Taiwanese native writers and their literary works. As
such, I argue that Qi Bangyuan, resembled Lin Haiyin; they were significant figures
from the canonical cultural field who played a leading role in transcending the
centre/periphery opposition. The following discussion consists of two approaches: Qi
Bangyuan’s attachment to Taiwan literature and her response to Li Qiao and the Wintry
Night Trilogy.
a. Qi Bangyuan’s attachment to Taiwan literature

In 1972, Qi Bangyuan took the post of the head of Humanities and Sociology at the National Institute for Compilation and Translation and engaged in an English translation project for Taiwan literature. This resulted in the publishing of, An Anthology of Contemporary Chinese Literature, Taiwan: 1949-1974 by the University of Washington in Seattle in 1975. It contains a selection of the modern poetry, essays and short stories initially published in Taiwan between 1969 and 1974. Native writers whose work is included in the anthology are, Huang Chunming, Lin Huaimin (林懷民) and Shi Shuqing (施叔青).\(^{151}\)

During the five-year period (1971-1976) whilst working at the institute, Qi Bangyuan also served as head of the textbook compilation team and engaged in selecting articles for the Junior High School Chinese curriculum. During the 1970s, when the Ministry of Education was still dominated by conservative forces, Qi Bangyuan unconventionally promoted the reform of the Chinese curriculum whereby she attempted to remove articles possessing strong political references whilst including some contemporary Taiwanese literature, such as Huang Chunming’s short story "Fish" (魚) into the school curriculum (1972).

Qi Bangyuan recalled that her first impression of Li Qiao was through reading his short story “Mengpo Soup” (孟婆湯) which was selected for the 1968 annual collection of short stories by the Erya (爾雅) publishing company.\(^{152}\) In addition to getting to know Taiwanese writers through reading their work, it was also in the 1970s, when she

---

was lecturing for a compulsory postgraduate course “Senior English”, which was designed for students from the History and Chinese Graduate School at the National Taiwan University, that she made the acquaintance of many students who were studying either Chinese or History at postgraduate level at that time. Interestingly, many of them, for example, Chen Fanming, Lin Ruiming, Chen Wanyi and Lu Xingchang, were, later (in the 1990s), coincidently engaged in the study of Taiwanese literature as well as being involved in advocating for the institutionalization of Taiwanese literature. The subtle teacher-student relationship proved to be enduring and this also exemplified a habitus relating to Taiwanese literature that was possibly infectious due to its enthusiasm.

It was also during this period that Qi Bangyuan was involved in the translation project for “Modern Chinese Literature from Taiwan”. She explained the situation later as follows:

In 1972, as I engaged with the translation project, purchasing, reading, selecting and translating books became a mission in addition to my other job as a university teacher. During those years from 1970 to 1985, since China was undergoing the campaign of the Cultural Revolution, Taiwan’s literary works were considered by Western scholars as significant exemplars of Sinology.¹⁵³

b. Qi Bangyuan, Li Qiao and Wintry Night Trilogy

Qi Bangyuan appeared to be one of the first few academic scholars with a Mainland background who paid attention to Taiwanese writers in the first half of the

¹⁵³ Ibid., p. 4.
1980s. She admitted later that it was after reading the *Wintry Night Trilogy* that she saw clearly the true nature of Taiwan for the first time. In 1984, she presented a paper discussing the literary works of the 1960s, including Li Qiao’s earlier works. Further, in the spring of 1985 she was invited to be a visiting professor at the Free University of Berlin (Freie Universität Berlin), and was appointed to teach a course on “Taiwan Literature”. The *Wintry Night Trilogy* was among the various course materials that Qi provided for students. She recalled the experience as follows:

I tried to translate several parts of the trilogy into English, and handed out the copies to my students. To my surprise, they appeared to be deeply touched by the story and asked questions one after another. From the questioning of those German students, I re-examined the question how concern for humanity can be inspired by literature. The stories depicted in *Wintry Night Trilogy* are meaningful in the representation of humanity and, among various memories associated with the suffering of human life, the trilogy conveyed the author’s concern in a unique way.\(^{154}\)

At that time, Qi Bangyuan decided to immediately make every effort to promote the English translation of the *Wintry Night Trilogy* and expected that this would push forward further translations into other languages. In 1994, Professor David Wang from Columbia University was commissioned by the Chiang Ching-Kuo Foundation for Culture and Education to take charge of the translation plan for “Modern Chinese Literature from Taiwan”. David Wang was also an advisor to Columbia University Press, and he then co-operated with Qi Bangyuan and proposed that the first stage of the

---

\(^{154}\) Ibid., p. 5.
translation project would form ten volumes, of which *Wintry Night Trilogy* became the sixth book. In consideration of realistic factors such as readers’ limitations in regard to Taiwan’s history, marketing and the convenience of translators, Qi suggested shortening the original text length in the English translation, and therefore the resulting translation turned out to be an abridged version of the book of approximately 300 thousand words.

In 2001, Qi Bangyuan endorsed the significance of *Wintry Night Trilogy*, from the perspective of readers’ reception, both among the population of Taiwan, and overseas. First, with regard to English speaking readers, she commented as follows:

I felt very excited about the publication of the English translation because finally we have a volume which can speak out clearly at great length, depicting the fate of the Taiwanese people who were under Japanese rule for fifty years. In the past, only short stories were included in works of Taiwan literature translated into English.\(^{155}\)

Indeed, as Li Qiao’s close friend and writer, Zheng Qingwen (鄭清文, Cheng Ch’ing-wen) remarked, “She might not be the first person to promote the translation of Taiwanese works into English, but she is the best and the most competent, […]. Without her efforts, the world might have had to wait for another one or two decades to learn about Taiwanese literature.”\(^{156}\) Qi Bangyuan has contributed substantially to expanding the international presence of Taiwanese literature.

As for domestic readers, in the Preface of the abridged version of the trilogy, *Mother of the Earth* (大地之母), Qi Bangyuan is categorical about the significance and

\(^{155}\) Ibid., p. 4.

influence of *Wintry Night Trilogy* since its publication in 1980; she argued that *Wintry Night Trilogy* is a novel where the characters and events are narrated based more on historical facts than on fictional elements. It is a representative work for Li Qiao, and more significantly, it can be read from any perspective, during any period of time, using any language and under any ideology. It is therefore, under any circumstances, a politically correct literary masterpiece.\(^{157}\)

In terms of her view on the politically correct nature of the trilogy, Qi Bangyuan exemplifies two characters in the trilogy: Qiumei (邱梅) and Masuda (増田). She argues that the arrangement of these two characters has added weight to the trilogy.\(^{158}\) The former is a Chinese mainlander who shows his sincerity by integrating into the Taiwanese community; the latter is a Japanese soldier of better character than those who are Taiwanese collaborators. Qi Bangyuan further comments that their stories have expanded the scope of the narrative and demonstrated Li Qiao’s broadminded perspective and compassion.\(^ {159}\)

In terms of national identity, Qi Bangyuan’s memoir *The Great-Flowing River* (巨流河) published in 2014 is a salient example.\(^ {160}\) Obviously, nostalgia for her native land, China, spontaneously overflows between the lines. Nevertheless, at the same time, one can also detect her open-hearted attachment to Taiwan. In many aspects of her life, Qi Bangyuan found the evolving habitus of Taiwan literature to be absorbing over time, and treated Chinese literature and Taiwanese literature with equal deference.

It is also worthy of note that, apart from her involvement in English translation, during the period from 1978 to 2005, Qi Bangyuan was also actively engaged in

\(^{157}\) Qi Bangyuan. “Has the Trout Returned Home? --From *Wintry Night* to *The Mother of the Earth*.“ (鱒魚還鄉了嗎？-- 從《寒夜》到《大地之母》). in Li Qiao. *The Mother of the Earth* 《大地之母》. p. 4

\(^{158}\) Ibid., pp. 3-4.

\(^{159}\) Ibid., p. 4.

presenting reviews of Li Qiao’s literature.

Table 5.6: Distribution of reviews of Li Qiao’s literature by critics who were also active in the process of the institutionalization of Taiwan literature (1967-2005).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comprehensive review</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ye Shitao</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lin Ruiming</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peng Ruijin</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qi Bangyuan</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Trilogy focused</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peng Ruijin</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qi Bangyuan</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: *A Complete Bibliography of Li Qiao’s Literary Works* (2012)

When, in the 1980s, Li Qiao engaged in transforming his criticism of the issue of the weakness of the Taiwanese people in the trilogy to the presentation of a series of discourses in regard to Taiwanese cultural nationalism, Qi Bangyuan was one of very few academic critics who showed any interest in reviewing Li Qiao’s literature written in the postwar period before martial law was lifted in 1987. During the period from 1988 to 1996, Qi Bangyuan presented three written commentaries. Two of them focused on the trilogy: “Human Dignity and No Mercy from the Universe – Reading Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*” (人性尊嚴與天地不仁—李喬「寒夜三部曲」, 1989) and “A Letter Home to the Land – Reading Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*” (寫給土地的家書—讀李喬「寒夜三部曲」1989). The third was “Voice of the Time” (時代的聲音, 1990) in which four writers, Wu Zhuoliu, Zhong Zhaozhen, Li Qiao and Chen Yingzhen, were discussed.
Further, during the period from 1997 to 2005, Qi Bangyuan was equally as active as the veteran critic Peng Ruijin, who was a member of the native literary circle, presenting another three written commentaries on the *Wintry Night Trilogy*. In the meantime, she was also committed to organizing the translation of the trilogy into English. Overall, the publication of the English translation version in 2001 was, in many ways, more evidence for acknowledging the energy and academic enthusiasm and contribution that Qi Bangyuan had brought to the promotion of Taiwanese literature in the international community.

For Qi Bangyuan, Taiwan literature is a natural “happening”, including “literary works by writers whose families have lived in Taiwan for many generations”, and also “nostalgic works by Mainlander writers who retreated to Taiwan after the KMT’s defeat in the Chinese civil war.”¹⁶¹ Unlike many other cultural agents with a Chinese mainland background, who maintained an aloof attitude, her great concern for the development of Taiwan literature has made her deserving of the titles, “The mother of Taiwan Literature” and “a bosom friend of Taiwan literature”.

In conclusion, starting from the time it was serialized and circulated in the minor literary field, Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* proved to be influential in the development of Taiwan literature. The reception history of the novel is the epitome of the institutionalization of Taiwan literature. In other words, the institutionalization centred on the trilogy was similar to that centred on Taiwan literature.

The analysis in this chapter has demonstrated that, during the early postwar period, Taiwan’s literary field encountered a top-down process of deterritorialization in which Mandarin and vernacular Chinese acted as the deterritorializing languages. In the face

of a rigid cultural policy in which a high coefficient of deterritorialization was effectively taking place, Taiwan literature had to be re-constructed within a major language. The deterritorialization campaign was then rapidly followed by a process of re-territorialization aiming to consolidate the sino-centric ideology of the ruling class. The approach to conformity of the native writers was either active or passive, and Li Qiao’s earlier writing was no exception.

My analysis also explains the development of the interpretive communities of the Wintry Night Trilogy and their reading strategy over the period from the mid 1970s to the post martial law era. It has demonstrated the way in which the interpretive assumptions were sustained and enriched in a chain of reactions over time. In the late 1970s, the formative interpretive community broke away from the discourse of suffering and reached a consensus reading assumption in which “recounting the history of Taiwan” was highlighted.

The socio-political change in Taiwan over the first half of the 1980s led to the growth of the minor literary circles. In essence, the reception history of Wintry Night Trilogy, during the period before and after the lifting of martial law, was in line with the development of Taiwan literature’s acquisition of a position in the canonical field. The lifting of martial law guaranteed the Wintry Night Trilogy a place which was closer to the canonical centre. Later developments show that during the phased process of the institutionalization of Taiwan literature between 1997 and 2006, Li Qiao’s Wintry Night Trilogy and his other works were under consideration; they were also among some of the contemporary literary works becoming popular in the area of domestic postgraduate studies.

The transformation ultimately resulted in a dual syllabus for graduate schools: Chinese literature and Taiwanese literature, namely, the co-existence of two canons of
literature and theory. In regard to *Wintry Night Trilogy*, as Li Qiao commented, “the novel belonged to me then, but now it has separated from its author and become an ‘independent public asset’ of the Taiwanese people.”162

---

Chapter Six

Epilogue

This study of Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* has been undertaken based on two interrelated assumptions: first, that *Wintry Night Trilogy* is fundamentally related to the construction of Taiwanese nationalism; second, that literary research on the trilogy can provide possible explanations as to when the cultural discourse of Taiwanese nationalism has emerged and how it did so. Drawing on interrelated theoretical approaches: intertextuality, post-colonial theory, multilingualism, and reader response criticism, this thesis has explored the role that Li Qiao and *Wintry Night Trilogy* have played in the transitional period (1975 to the early 21st century) which has defined contemporary Taiwan. It also examines how Li Qiao dealt with the aesthetic representation of the suppressed history of Taiwan in the trilogy.

My literary and cultural analysis has demonstrated that *Wintry Night Trilogy* was a key part of the establishment of a discourse in which both Taiwan’s past and an imaginary Taiwan nation were simultaneously being sought. That cultural discourse involves three temporal contexts: the narrated time or story time (1884-1945), the narrating time when Li Qiao was engaged in writing the trilogy (1975-1980) and the time when the trilogy was being read by the public (1977- present). In terms of the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism, my analysis has shown that *Wintry Night Trilogy* was involved in important ways in building elements of Taiwanese nationalist consciousness, which were likely to further establish a unifying force for the nation of Taiwan. These elements of people’s consciousness include: constructing the common
identity of being Taiwanese, constructing a shared history and constructing a common Taiwanese culture.

In terms of the ethnic elements supporting Taiwanese nationalism, starting from an inherited family/clan consciousness and developing land consciousness, Li Qiao gradually constituted in the novel a sense of multi-ethnic cultural identity. The construction of the common identity of being Taiwanese is not built on a similar phenotype in people, but, rather on people’s similarity of disposition and their shared attachment to their native land, Taiwan. In addition, in Li Qiao’s narrative, the self consciousness of these people is initially engendered through understanding the difference between “us” and “them”. In particular, the realization of the characters in the saga is built on their ability to distinguish between “sameness” and “difference” in the context of human/human or human/nature interactions. As such, Taiwanese consciousness gradually comes into being. For example, apart from many Taiwanese people, those who are included in the category of “us” are Atayal tribespeople and the Japanese officer Masuda, while those excluded include exploitative Landlord Ye Atian and Taiwanese collaborators.

As for “constructing a shared history”, Li Qiao’s recovery and narration of the hidden history of Taiwan depended on his appropriation of various historical sources and on how the past can be narratively represented. Li Qiao's novel includes a variety of historical materials: police records under Japanese rule, the land archive housed in the Economic Research Unit of the Bank of Taiwan, and oral history from Li Qiao’s father Li Mufang, the descendants of certain historical figures, and living witnesses of Taiwan’s immediate history. A fuller narrative of Taiwan’s past was represented through various textual strategies: post-colonial, intertextual, and multilingual. Through
inter textual operations, the information gathered by Li Qiao enriched the narrative and established an alternative historical discourse based on native views. The signifier of “land” acts as the core of the trilogy and the spatial and narrating reference point for Li Qiao’s nostalgic affinity is “Taiwan” rather than “mainland China”.

Although set during the time of Japan’s colonial rule, the narrative is focused more on the spirit of anti-exploitation and anti-oppression than on being anti-Japanese. At times, Li Qiao combined what he had learned from the historical archive with other texts but without citing or naming those other texts. The meta-textual aspects of the novel reflect how historical and fictional accounts can be mixed and reframed in a narrative to present a Taiwan-centred perspective. The historical archive History of the Taiwan Governor’s Police Records provides major source material for Part Two of the trilogy, Deserted Village. Li Qiao’s use of the police records illustrates his attempt to use the novel to establish a historical discourse through which the suppressed or non-dominant history of Taiwan could become better known.

Sometimes Li Qiao recounted events by glossing, through narrator and character evaluations; instances include occasions when the historical source seemed to be too politically sensitive or less relevant to the plot. The glossed text was inscribed as marginal notes or at the end of a chapter. Many of these supplements relate to the untold history of Taiwan during the Japanese period, and reveal Li Qiao’s attempt to fill this historical gap with supplemental narratives. The new data encourages readers to reread and reengage with Taiwan’s past in ways which are different from what they have been taught through the Taiwan education system.

My analysis has also explored the reception history of Wintry Night Trilogy, in particular, the emergence of interpretive communities and their reading strategies which
confirm the novel’s role in retrieving the hidden history of Taiwan. As we have seen, in the early 1980s, the native interpretive community broke away from the discourse of suffering and reached a consensus reading assumption in which “re-counting the history of Taiwan” was emphasized. My discussion also shows that in terms of the acquisition of cultural capital, the development of readers’ reception of the *Wintry Night Trilogy* during the period before and after the lifting of martial law was in line with the more general development of Taiwan literature’s pursuit of a position in the canonical field. With the lifting of martial law, *Wintry Night Trilogy* began to be read as a more canonically central work. Subsequent developments indicate that during the gradual institutionalization of Taiwan literature between 1989 and 2006, Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* along with his other works were among some of the contemporary Taiwan literary works attracting the most attention and praise from domestic and overseas readers.

In terms of “constructing a common Taiwanese culture”, Li Qiao's trilogy brings together and juxtaposes the many cultures of Taiwan: Han Holo, Han Hakka, Han Chinese, indigenous customs and Japanese colonial modernity. However, the concept of multi-culturalism is not accepted without question in the novel. Through the main character Mingji, the only person in Fanzai Wood who had received a higher education, Li Qiao expressed own views against superstition; in doing so, Mingji and the novel recognize some of the positive cultural effects of Japanese colonial modernity. But at the same time, Mingji still upholds traditional family values, such as worshipping the spirits of ancestors, the Earth God and the Righteous Lords. Other indirect allusions regarding the positive effects of Japanese colonial modernity include the characters’ participation in activities of cultural enlightenment and social movements.
Most importantly, throughout the narration of the trilogy narration, Li Qiao developed a critical discourse calling for the awakening of the Taiwanese people and urging them to rid themselves of their weak character. The narrative is critical of the local collaborators, who also act as oppressors on behalf of the ruling regime. The narrative is also critical in its continuous call for Taiwanese people to examine their submissive character.

The multicultural hybridization in Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* often takes on linguistic form. Li Qiao’s multi-lingual practices of code-switching in the novel characterize different ethnic groups in various social contexts and provide insight into his representation of Taiwaneseness beyond a Chinese-centred ethnicity. Li Qiao’s use of code-switching reflects the multilingual reality of Taiwanese living under Japanese rule as well as during the post-war period. Since Japanese and Mandarin Chinese were the dominant languages, during the Japanese and Nationalist periods respectively, the two ruling languages become metonyms for broader social and political contexts.

In many parts of the trilogy, the dominant position of the Japanese language in the narrated context and the dominant position of Mandarin Chinese in the narrating context are undermined by code-switching in the representation and by glossing discourse in the narration. At the same time, the mixing of languages in the novel, the interplay between those languages and the re-ordering of the languages highlight in the narrative characteristics of Taiwaneseness. Through the use of parenthetic glossing, Li Qiao explicitly revealed his attempt to restore the vernacular languages that had been suppressed in post-war Taiwan, in particular, the Hakka language, the native language of Li Qiao and the main characters of *Wintry Night Trilogy*. 
This research has found that as a representation of the complexity of
Taiwaneseness Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* both deploys and uncovers a “third
space” for cultural identity and heterogeneity, as outlined by Homi Bhabha. For
example, Li Qiao’s historical narrative weakens the inherited Chineseness of the
historical nationalist figure, Luo Fuxing, through several indirect means, such as
Dengmei’s innocent talk with Uncle Amei and her disagreement with Ahan’s
participation in the anti-Japanese activities led by Luo Fuxing. However, in other
situations where Taiwanese nationalist sentiment is evident, the narrative adopts a more
restrained approach and thus highlights Chinese national sentiment so as to balance the
ideological implications. In other words, Taiwaneseness is central in the narrative and
point of view but not the only narrative ideology represented positively.

The narrative employs a series of metonyms for Taiwaneseness. Native
multilingualism is one. Another is the “Taiwan shirt” which involves various characters
from different generations, such as Zheng Minglu, Liu Ahan and Guo Fanzhi, the
daughter of Guo Qiuyang who is the leader of Miaoli branch of the Taiwanese Cultural
Association. The various references in the narrative to “Taiwan shirt” are connected to
the characters’ and the narrator’s recognition of the positive influence of modernity and
of the awakening of feminist consciousness. The third spaces created by Li Qiao’s
narrative thus play a significant role in articulating hybrid identities through the
narrative and diegetically in the ways individual characters articulate Taiwanese identity
within Japanese dominance or during the ambiguous transitional era.

Indeed, Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy* shows, and as Fanon and Bhabha and
others have argued, that complicity and resistance always co-exist in a fluctuating
relationship between the colonizer and the colonized, where some colonized subjects are
complicit, while others are resistant, and still others are more hybrid. As a result of this hybridity as represented in the narrative, the clear-cut authority of colonial domination is disrupted and new border lines are likely to be drawn.

Li Qiao’s narrative regarding the identity of the “Takasago volunteers” and headhunting is a particularly salient example of such colonial hybridity. The volunteers’ national identity is determined by their position as soldiers and as Japanese imperial subjects. At the same time, they regain the honour of being real Atayal warriors. Through their headhunting-like practices, the Takasago Volunteers enter the colonial centre but also situate themselves in an ambivalent situation, an ambivalence which the narration foregrounds. Consequently, the ambivalent third space, in which the Takasago volunteers enacted and confirmed both their cultural and national identities, challenges the dominant discourse of the Nationalist rule in the narrating and reading contexts. In the context of the story, the Takasago Volunteers resemble mimic men, as suggested by Bhabha, yet the effect of that mimicry is to destablise the ideals of the Japanese ruling regime and military masculinity. The narration explicitly contrasts the tentative Japanese officers, hesitant before committing embarrassed acts of hara-kiri, with the fearless Taiwanese Takasago Volunteers performing courageous suicide attacks that recall the samurai spirit of “true Japanese”.

In summary, my narrative, cultural, and historical analysis has demonstrated that the narrative of the *Wintry Night Trilogy* provides a solution in regard to the controversy over how Taiwanese nationalism has emerged and the role of the arts in the formation of that consciousness. This thesis specifically argues that Li Qiao’s representation of the "third space” is an important part of the history of that emergent consciousness.
This analysis has provided a supplement to Hsiau A-chin’s argument about when and how the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism emerged.\(^1\) Indeed as Hsiau A-chin suggests, there were seeds of various kinds of identity in the late 1970s, not merely those that had resulted in the development of Taiwanese nationalism in the 1980s.\(^2\) However, my argument is that the value of the representation of “the third space” is self-evident, as manifested in Li Qiao’s *Wintry Night Trilogy*. No matter what the subsequent trend is, it is meaningless to determine the value of the third space represented in the second half of the 1970s on the basis of the subsequent developments of those seedlings in the 1980s.

For nearly three decades, from the mid-1970s to the turn of the 21st century, many in Taiwan have engaged in dismantling the cultural and institutional forces that maintained the Chinese-centric ruling apparatus, and they include individual writers and artists, scholars, local literary circles and indigenous social groups. As a writer, Li Qiao started this dismantling before most others. In writing *Wintry Night Trilogy*, he attempted to uncover the suppressed aspects of Taiwan’s history and to represent the multicultural contexts of Taiwaneseness. As a writer of historical fiction, he exposed the upper bounds of the censorship tolerance of the KMT by employing various narrating strategies and intertextualities and thus created a dynamic aesthetic representation with deep political and cultural reverberations.

It is certainly possible that the constant co-existence of fear and desire that Li Qiao felt in the 1970s urged him to provide readers with a unique narrating strategy in the *Wintry Night Trilogy*, one which was recognized as a literary work encompassing

---


\(^2\) Ibid., pp. 378-381
both valuable historical accounts and captivating aesthetic representation. The later loosening of political constraints in Taiwan has allowed Li Qiao to adopt even more explicit writing strategies in his subsequent work, such as the historical novel *The Injustice in 1947* (1995). Tsai Jialing (蔡佳玲) has explained the difference between the two works:

Both the *Wintry Night Trilogy* (1981) and *The Injustice in 1947* (1995) are novels based on Taiwanese history. Although the aesthetic presentation of *The Injustice in 1947* is not as mature as that of the *Wintry Night Trilogy*, readers felt a more direct impact in regard to historical truth from the narration of *The Injustice in 1947* than from the *Wintry Night Trilogy*.³

As previous chapters have shown, circumstances in Taiwan during the second part of the 1970s were harsh yet promising. In response, Li Qiao developed a post-colonial critical discourse where he articulated the essence of Taiwaneseness through aesthetic representation. With Lee Tenghui’s localization reforms (1988-2000) and a specific change in cultural policy by the DPP Government (2000-2008), the general cultural fear has lessened, but the desire for counter hegemonic voices still exists. Li Qiao has continued writing novels in the form of political allegory, including *The Ring of the Curse* (咒之環, 2010) and *Gulliver’s Long Stay in Taiwan* (格理弗 Long Stay 台灣, 2010).

Interestingly, Li Qiao’s post-colonial narrative approach in which the actions of the Takasago Volunteers function as a key signifier relating to the maintenance and destabilization of the dominant discourse in both narrated time and narrating time has been replicated in other forms of Taiwanese cultural creation in recent years. A salient example is the trilogy of albums produced by the heavy metal band, CHTHONIC (閃靈). The albums, *Seediq Bale* (賽德克巴萊, 2005), *Mirror of Retribution* (十殿, 2009) and *Takasago Army* (高砂軍, 2011), specifically include Takasago values and heritage in the songs and confirm Taiwanese identity through indigeneity, which of course the band’s name invokes. The leading singer of Chthonic, Freddy Lim (林昶佐), discussed the band’s album, *Takasago Army*, in a videoed statement made prior to the album’s official release in 2011:

*Seediq Bale* is about defending oneself, *Takasago Army* is about rediscovering oneself, and *Mirror of Retribution* is about sacrificing oneself. Although there is a link to all three stories, the mind sets of the main characters are very different. […] When we make such responses to the international media, we are always asked why we emphasize self-identity so much. […] I think all Taiwanese have the answer to this question. Because, for the past several hundred years, outsiders have come to tell us who we are, then we have been forced to change ourselves.

---

4 Formed in 1995 in Taipei, the group often incorporates traditional Taiwanese beliefs, aboriginal customs and Taiwan’s history under Japanese rule into their works.

5 Freddy Lim (1976-), with long hair and tattoos, is the lead singer of the Taiwanese metal band CHTHONIC. He stormed to a victory in the elections held on January 16, 2016, and was elected to the government as a legislator. The singer defeated veteran legislator Lin Yu-fang of the KMT by more than 6,000 votes in the 5th electoral district of Taipei.
For us this is an issue. For Americans, Japanese, or other nationalities, this may be a non-issue, but it is a major issue for the Taiwanese people.6

As the band’s bassist/backing vocalist Doris Yeh (葉湘怡) states: “[...] the background revolves around WWII, and we want to reveal the spirit of finding your own dignity through the most difficult and dangerous mission on the battle ground. The closer you come to death, the more you know who you are.”7 What the Chthonic band explicitly delivered in 2011 through the song Takasago Army corresponds very closely to the third space signification of the Takasago volunteers depicted in the Wintry Night Trilogy. In some respects, the popular culture representation has changed from delivery by indirect means to delivery by explicit means.

Li Qiao’s keen insight into the cultural aspects of Taiwanese nationalism in the 1970s and the hybridity of Taiwaneseness he proposed in the narrative of the Wintry Night Trilogy have proved to be farsighted. However the Chinese-centred hegemonic power remains strong and continues to obstruct the local nationalist development. With DPP candidate Tsai Ing-Wen’s (蔡英文) victory in the presidential race held in January 2016, coupled with her party’s legislative majority, Taiwan’s democracy is marching towards a new milestone. But, on the other hand, since Taiwan’s international status remains uncertain under the PRC’s “One China” policy and its strong top-down Chinese cultural hegemonic discourse, the development of the cultural discourse of Taiwanese nationalism continues to be presented with new challenges. Writers and artists will need


to continue to represent and rethink the hybrid third spaces of postcolonialism in order to strengthen an independent Taiwan consciousness.
Bibliography


-----.* “Culture’s In-Between”, in Hall, S. Gay, P. (eds.) Questions of Cultural Identity*.
SAGE, 1996, pp. 53-60.


----- “A Discussion on Taiwanese Historical Novels: Rethinking the Research History, Epistemology and Methodology” (台灣歷史小說研究芻議：關於研究史、認識論與方法論的反思), in A collection of The Saga of Taiwan Literature: History, Land and New Cultural in the Sixth International Symposium on Taiwanese Culture (台灣文學的大河：歷史、土地與新文化第六屆台灣文化國際學術研討會論文集). Taipei: National Taiwan Normal University, 2009, pp. 10-50.


----- “Qu zhimin de wenhua yanjiu” (去殖民的文化研究), in Taiwan: A Radical Quarterly in Social Studies (台灣社會研究季刊). No. 21, January, 1996. pp. 73-139.


Chen, Wanyi (陳萬益). “The Image and Implication of Mother in the Wintry Night
Trilogy” (母親的形象與象徵—寒夜三部曲初探), in Li Ruiteng (李瑞騰). (ed.) 
A Comprehensive Anthology of Contemporary Chinese Literature in Taiwan, 

Chin, Xiaoyi (秦孝儀). (ed.) National Revolution and Taiwan (國民革命與台灣).
Taipei: Modern China, 1980.

Ching, Leo T.S. (荊子馨). Becoming Japanese: Colonial Taiwan and the Politics of

Chih, Yuwen (池育文). De-colonization in Taiwan: the Case of the
Institutionalization of Taiwan Literature. MA thesis. Auckland: University of
Auckland, 2008.

Chiou, C. L. “Taiwan’s Evolving Nationalism”, in Liew, L. H. & Wang, S. (eds.)
Nationalism, Democracy and National Integration in China. London & New York:


Chung, H. “Kristevan (Mis) Understandings: Writing in the Feminine”, in Hockx, M 
& Smits, I. (eds.) Reading East Asia writing – The limits of literary theory.

Deleuze G & Guattari F. “What is Minor Literature?” in Richter, D. H. Narrative

Eagleton, T. Literary Theory: An Introduction. 2nd edition. Minneapolis: The
University of Minnesota Press. 1996.

Eusen, Jorn. “Memory, History and the Quest for the Future”, in Cajani, Luigi. (ed.)
History Teaching, Identities and Citizenship. Stoke on Trent & Sterling: Trentham


Feng, Jianzhang (馮建彰). “Taiwan xiandaixing de weijing zhiye” (台灣現代性的未


Harrison, Mark. “Writing Taiwan’s Nationhood: Language, Politics, History”, in Shih,


-----. “Auntie Ajen” (阿壬嫂這個)，in *Taiwan Wenyi* (台灣文藝). No. 90, pp. 82-90. 1965


-----. “My Experience of Writing Novels Based on Historical Resources” (「歷史素材小說」寫作經驗談), in **Wenhsun** (文訊), No. 246, April, 2006, pp.54-56.


Lin, Chia-lung. (林佳龍) “The Political Formation of Taiwanese Nationalism”, in


-----. *A Historical Examination of Taiwan Literature* (台灣文學的歷史考察). Taipei: Yunchen Wenhua, 1996.


-----. *Literary Classics and Cultural Identity* (文學經典與文化認同). Taipei: Jiuge


----- (ed.) A Complete Bibliography of Research Source Material of Contemporary


Ying, Fenghuang (應鳳凰). “Ye Shitao’s Taiwanese Consciousness and Literary Discourse” (葉石濤的台灣意識與文學論述), in *Wenxue Taiwan* (文學台灣). No.


Interview with cultural theorist Homi Bhabha by W.J.T. Mitchell. *Artforum* v.33, n.7


2013.


Fanon, F. “On National Cultural” (1967). Pdf. available in:


https://books.google.co.nz/books?id=3gNaLF4CC0QC&pg=PA155&lpg=PA155&dq=negation+Fanon+depends+for+its+stability&source=bl&ots=Qs4V6kT5j_&sig=NK7-VtzEEk08qOGH1mPU96VQGPI&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwjPhL6J2ZbLAhUHmZQKHQzLCp0Q6AEIIDAB#v=onepage&q=negation%20Fanon%20depends%20for%20its%20stability&f=false

“Frantz Fanon - Psychopathology of Colonization”, available in:

http://faculty.uncfsu.edu/hlheem/07-f-460-Franz%20Fanon.htm


“Frantz Fanon - Psychopathology of Colonization”, available in:

http://faculty.uncfsu.edu/hlheem/07-f-460-Franz%20Fanon.htm.

“Pres. Ma unveils Luo Fuxing’s statue”, available:

