



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

## ***ResearchSpace@Auckland***

### **Copyright Statement**

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

### **General copyright and disclaimer**

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

**UNDERSTANDING CUSTOMER VALUE:  
AN ACTION RESEARCH-BASED STUDY OF  
CONTEMPORARY MARKETING PRACTICE**

Victoria Janine Little

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements  
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy,  
The University of Auckland, 2004

# The University of Auckland

## Thesis Consent Form

This thesis may be consulted for the purpose of research or private study provided that due acknowledgement is made where appropriate and that the author's permission is obtained before any material from the thesis is published.

I agree that the University of Auckland Library may make a copy of this thesis for supply to the collection of another prescribed library on request from that Library; and

1. I agree that this thesis may be photocopied for supply to any person in accordance with the provisions of Section 56 of the Copyright Act 1994

Or

- ~~2. This thesis may not be photocopied other than to supply a copy for the collection of another prescribed library~~

(Strike out 1 or 2)

Signed:.....

Date:....

## **ABSTRACT**

This thesis provides a rich and thick (Geertz, 1973) understanding of customer value, and the process of customer value creation and delivery. It achieves this through a three-stage multi-method action research based study including survey work, multiple cases, and a single site industrial SME case. The study is grounded in the resource-based view (RBV) of the firm, providing a linkage between the strategic management and marketing disciplines.

The purpose of this research is to support theory development in the area of customer value. A new definition of customer value was developed, recognising the complex, dynamic and multi-dimensional nature of the construct. The definition is supported by a series of empirically based conceptual frameworks, describing the customer value construct and the customer value development process of the firm.

A number of perspectives on customer value-related marketing practice were found. Successive stages of the research identified six approaches to creating and delivering customer value: Traditional Transactional, Transitional or hybrid, Traditional Relational, Network, Systemic and Pluralistic. These approaches are not mutually exclusive. Rather, they characterise various approaches to customer value creation and delivery practiced in various contexts (e.g. for-profit and not-for-profit, consumer and industrial) and at various levels within firms (e.g. senior management, functional and front-line), strongly suggesting a contingency of practice.

The customer value creation and delivery process was conceptualised as a triad, viewed through the lens of making, keeping, and enabling promises (Gronroos, 1996). A fourth dimension, realising promises, was added, encompassing the outputs of the process (i.e. financial and non-financial value for both customer and firm).

Future research should be directed at testing and refining elements of the conceptual frameworks and value postures, offering significant benefits to practicing managers, to management education, and to theoretical understanding.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

They say a thesis is like a journey. This particular journey had a genesis over many years, with many starts, stops and twists along the way. Accordingly, many people contributed to the starting, doing and finishing of it.

To begin, I would like to thank my supervisors, Professors Rod Brodie and Judy Motion, whose scholarship, enthusiasm and love of their disciplines continues to inspire and motivate me. Undertaking a work of this nature would have been impossible without their intellectual breadth and depth, and their generosity of time and energy. I would also like to thank Rod in his capacity of Head of Department in the earlier stages of this research. He created an environment that made it possible for all of us to develop as scholars in our own ways, and has been an extraordinary mentor over many years. His unflagging belief in people, his generosity and his leadership is truly inspirational.

A large vote of thanks is due to all my wonderful colleagues within the Department of Marketing and the University of Auckland Business School. I would particularly like to thank Richard Brookes, who (together with Judy Motion) has been a huge help with teaching and administrative support over the last couple of years when it really counted. Nicole Coviello was also there when it counted – thank you Nicole! To all my colleagues and friends – thank you – I have learned from each and every one of you, and you have all contributed to this study in various ways.

I owe a great debt to Professors David Carson and Audrey Gilmore of the University of Ulster, who looked after me so well in 1998 and made me aware of my research ‘home’. Thanks too to Chad Perry, who waded through my writing and made some very helpful comments; and to the examining committee, who made the process less stressful, and also made many helpful comments. I would also like to thank my international colleagues and friends for what has sadly become increasingly virtual companionship and support over the years: in particular Doctors Aidan O’Driscoll, Susi Geiger, Maria Holmlund-Rytkonen and Mairead Brady. Now we’ve all finally finished!

My grateful thanks also go to the managers and firms who collaborated in this research. I have been privileged to teach and learn from the cream of New Zealand managers over the years, and to have been allowed inside an exceptional business. Thank you to all of the study participants for giving of your time and insights so generously.

Underlying this work is the rock that has steadied me for all of my 40-something years - my parents, Diane and Barry Little. They were unstinting in their support, help with Sarah, and fine Northland hospitality. The Paihia writing retreats got the job done. Family and friends were there when the going got tough – there are not enough words to thank my brother Brad, my sister-in-law Philippa and very special friends Moira Macnab and Michael Curin. And a very special thanks to Peggy ‘Nana’ Spooner, who kept an eye on us all.

Thank you everybody. What’s next?

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   |             |
|---|-------------|
| <b>ABSTRACT</b> .....   | <b>I</b>    |
| <b>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</b> .....  | <b>II</b>   |
| <b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b> .....  | <b>III</b>  |
| <b>LIST OF TABLES</b> .....   | <b>XI</b>   |
| <b>LIST OF FIGURES</b> .....  | <b>XIII</b> |
| <b>I: INTRODUCTION</b> .....  | <b>1</b>    |
| 1.1 CHAPTER OUTLINE.....  | 2           |
| 1.2 BACKGROUND TO THE RESEARCH.....                                     | 2           |
| 1.3 RESEARCH PURPOSE, QUESTIONS & PROPOSITIONS .....                    | 5           |
| 1.4 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .....  | 6           |
| 1.5 THESIS OUTLINE .....  | 8           |
| 1.6 THESIS SCOPE .....  | 9           |
| 1.7 CHAPTER SUMMARY .....   | 10          |
| <b>II: LITERATURE REVIEW</b> .....                                      | <b>11</b>   |
| 2.1 CHAPTER OUTLINE.....  | 11          |
| 2.2 THE RESOURCE BASED VIEW (RBV) OF THE FIRM.....                      | 12          |
| 2.2.1 <i>Evolution of the RBV</i> .....                                 | 12          |
| 2.2.2 <i>Key ideas, conceptual frameworks, &amp; contribution</i> ..... | 13          |
| 2.2.3 <i>Linkages with marketing</i> .....                              | 27          |
| 2.2.4 <i>Summary &amp; conceptual framework</i> .....                   | 40          |
| 2.3 NATURE & SCOPE OF CUSTOMER VALUE .....                              | 42          |
| 2.3.1 <i>Evolution of marketing-related perspectives of value</i> ..... | 42          |
| 2.3.2 <i>Conceptualising customer value</i> .....                       | 48          |
| 2.3.3 <i>Linking customer value &amp; marketing practice</i> .....      | 60          |
| 2.4 CHAPTER SUMMARY .....   | 74          |
| 2.4.1 <i>Research opportunities &amp; propositions</i> .....            | 76          |
| <b>III: METHODOLOGY</b> .....   | <b>79</b>   |
| 3.1 CHAPTER OUTLINE.....  | 79          |
| 3.2 RESEARCH PROBLEM AND INFORMATION REQUIREMENTS .....                 | 80          |
| 3.2.1 <i>Focus of the study</i> .....                                   | 80          |
| 3.2.2 <i>Issues in the research design</i> .....                        | 81          |
| 3.3 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES AND QUESTIONS .....                             | 85          |
| 3.3.1 <i>Research objectives</i> .....                                  | 85          |
| 3.3.2 <i>Research questions &amp; propositions</i> .....                | 86          |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 3.4 RESEARCH DESIGN .....   | 87         |
| 3.4.1 <i>Research paradigm</i> .....                                      | 88         |
| 3.4.2 <i>Theoretical perspectives</i> .....                               | 89         |
| 3.4.3 <i>Research Strategy</i> .....                                      | 99         |
| 3.5 DATA COLLECTION & ANALYSIS PROCEDURES .....                           | 102        |
| 3.5.1 <i>Stage 1 - Survey</i> .....                                       | 102        |
| 3.5.2 <i>Stage 2 - Multiple cases</i> .....                               | 108        |
| 3.5.3 <i>Stage 3 - Single firm case</i> .....                             | 113        |
| 3.5.4 <i>Frameworks for analysis</i> .....                                | 129        |
| 3.5.5 <i>Self-description, awareness of own values, reflexivity</i> ..... | 130        |
| 3.6 QUALITY OF THE RESEARCH .....   | 132        |
| 3.6.1 <i>Quality of process</i> .....                                     | 133        |
| 3.6.2 <i>Quality of output</i> .....                                      | 134        |
| 3.6.3 <i>Research scope &amp; limitations</i> .....                       | 135        |
| 3.7 CHAPTER SUMMARY .....   | 139        |
| <b>IV: RESULTS – STAGE ONE .....</b>                                      | <b>140</b> |
| 4.1 CHAPTER OUTLINE.....  | 140        |
| 4.2 RESEARCH PROPOSITIONS & RESEARCH QUESTIONS .....                      | 140        |
| 4.3 DATA QUALITY .....  | 142        |
| 4.3.1 <i>Missing Values</i> .....   | 142        |
| 4.3.2 <i>Outliers</i> .....   | 143        |
| 4.3.3 <i>Measurement &amp; index computation</i> .....                    | 144        |
| 4.4 FINDINGS .....  | 145        |
| 4.4.1 <i>Respondent &amp; firm profiles</i> .....                         | 145        |
| 4.4.2 <i>Approach to marketing practice</i> .....                         | 148        |
| 4.4.3 <i>Approach to customer value creation &amp; delivery</i> .....     | 152        |
| 4.5 DISCUSSION OF STAGE 1 FINDINGS .....                                  | 157        |
| 4.5.1 <i>Key findings</i> .....   | 157        |
| 4.5.2 <i>Implications for Stage 2</i> .....                               | 159        |
| 4.6 CHAPTER SUMMARY .....   | 160        |
| <b>V: RESULTS – STAGE TWO .....</b>                                       | <b>162</b> |
| 5.1 CHAPTER OUTLINE.....  | 162        |
| 5.2 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES & PROPOSITIONS .....                              | 163        |
| 5.3 FINDINGS .....  | 164        |
| 5.3.1 <i>Description of managers and firms</i> .....                      | 164        |
| 5.3.2 <i>Evidence concerning customer value related processes</i> .....   | 165        |
| 5.4 DISCUSSION OF STAGE 2 FINDINGS .....                                  | 177        |
| 5.4.1 <i>Key findings</i> .....   | 177        |
| 5.4.2 <i>Implications for Stage 3</i> .....                               | 179        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 5.5 CHAPTER SUMMARY .....  | 180        |
| <b>IV (A): RESULTS – STAGE THREE: THE CASE FIRM .....</b>                | <b>181</b> |
| 6A.1 CHAPTER OUTLINE .....   | 183        |
| 6A.2 OVERVIEW OF THE CASE.....   | 183        |
| 6a.2.1 <i>The people</i> .....   | 183        |
| 6a.2.2 <i>The firm</i> .....   | 186        |
| 6A.3 EVOLUTION OF THE FIRM.....  | 190        |
| 6a.3.1 <i>Relative stability - ‘Clear air’ (1979-1987)</i> .....         | 190        |
| 6a.3.2 <i>Rapid change (1988-1994)</i> .....                             | 193        |
| 6a.3.3 <i>Trouble: ‘The five year spiral of death’ (1994-1999)</i> ..... | 194        |
| 6a.3.4 <i>Turbulence &amp; rejuvenation (1999-2003)</i> .....            | 198        |
| 6a.3.5 <i>Epilogue</i> .....   | 206        |
| 6A.4 ATTRIBUTION OF VALUE POSTURE.....                                   | 207        |
| 6A.5 CHAPTER SUMMARY.....  | 209        |
| <b>VI (B): RESULTS – STAGE THREE: CASE RESULTS .....</b>                 | <b>211</b> |
| 6B.1 CHAPTER OUTLINE .....   | 211        |
| 6B.2 OVERVIEW OF THE RESULTS .....                                       | 211        |
| 6B.3 MAKING PROMISES .....   | 213        |
| 6b.3.1 <i>Choice of served markets</i> .....                             | 213        |
| 6b.3.2 <i>Customer selection</i> .....                                   | 215        |
| 6b.3.3 <i>The firm’s value proposition</i> .....                         | 224        |
| 6b.3.4 <i>Customer communication</i> .....                               | 235        |
| 6b.3.5 <i>Summary – Making promises</i> .....                            | 238        |
| 6B.4 KEEPING PROMISES .....  | 240        |
| 6b.4.1 <i>Product/service innovation</i> .....                           | 240        |
| 6b.4.2 <i>Supply chain management/ operations</i> .....                  | 243        |
| 6b.4.3 <i>Customer intimacy</i> .....                                    | 254        |
| 6b.4.4 <i>Summary – Keeping promises</i> .....                           | 258        |
| 6B.5 ENABLING PROMISES .....   | 259        |
| 6b.5.1 <i>Leadership</i> .....   | 261        |
| 6b.5.2 <i>Culture</i> .....  | 264        |
| 6b.5.3 <i>Knowledge</i> .....  | 269        |
| 6b.5.4 <i>Communication</i> .....  | 275        |
| 6b.5.5 <i>People, systems &amp; structure</i> .....                      | 281        |
| 6b.5.6 <i>Summary – Enabling promises</i> .....                          | 288        |
| 6B.6 REALISING PROMISES .....  | 289        |
| 6b.6.1 <i>Customer realised value</i> .....                              | 289        |
| 6b.6.2 <i>Firm realised value</i> .....                                  | 291        |
| 6b.6.3 <i>Summary – Realising Promises</i> .....                         | 297        |



|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 6B.7 DISCUSSION OF STAGE 3 FINDINGS .....                             | 297        |
| 6b.7.1 <i>Promise making</i> .....                                    | 299        |
| 6b.7.2 <i>Promise keeping</i> .....                                   | 302        |
| 6b.7.3 <i>Promise enabling</i> .....                                  | 306        |
| 6b.7.4 <i>Promise realising</i> .....                                 | 307        |
| 6B.8 CHAPTER SUMMARY .....  | 308        |
| 6B.9 CHAPTER CONCLUSION.....  | 312        |
| <b>VII: CONCLUSIONS &amp; IMPLICATIONS .....</b>                      | <b>314</b> |
| 7.1 CHAPTER OUTLINE.....  | 314        |
| 7.2 OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY .....                                       | 314        |
| 7.3 CONCLUSIONS .....   | 316        |
| 7.3.1 <i>Nature of customer value</i> .....                           | 316        |
| 7.3.2 <i>The customer value creation &amp; delivery process</i> ..... | 321        |
| 7.3.3 <i>Reflection on the project</i> .....                          | 326        |
| 7.4 RESEARCH LIMITATIONS.....   | 333        |
| 7.5 CONTRIBUTION TO KNOWLEDGE.....                                    | 334        |
| 7.5.1 <i>Theoretical</i> .....  | 334        |
| 7.5.2 <i>Methodological</i> .....                                     | 338        |
| 7.6 IMPLICATIONS OF THE RESEARCH .....                                | 338        |
| 7.6.1 <i>For future research</i> .....                                | 339        |
| 7.6.2 <i>For marketing practice</i> .....                             | 341        |
| 7.6.3 <i>For management education</i> .....                           | 342        |
| 7.7 CHAPTER & THESIS SUMMARY .....                                    | 343        |
| <b>APPENDICES (A-C).....</b>  | <b>345</b> |
| <b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>   | <b>399</b> |
| <b>GLOSSARY OF TERMS .....</b>  | <b>436</b> |

## LIST OF TABLES

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Table 1.1: Research questions .....  | 5   |
| Table 1.2: Six guiding research propositions .....   | 6   |
| Table 2.1: Stakeholder typology by power, legitimacy & urgency. ....                                 | 22  |
| Table 2.2: The landscape of firm relationships: Six markets model.....                               | 35  |
| Table 2.3: Linkages between marketing tasks and organisational processes.....                        | 38  |
| Table 2.4: Key linkages and distinctions between the RBV and marketing theory .....                  | 39  |
| Table 2.5: A history of perspectives of customer value.....  | 43  |
| Table 2.6: Comparison of traditional and emerging views of value creation and delivery .....         | 46  |
| Table 2.7: A synthesis of the literature: Summary of social system and firm context .....            | 56  |
| Table 2.8: Summary of considerations and attributes in the conceptualisation of customer value ..... | 57  |
| Table 2.9: A new definition of customer value .....  | 58  |
| Table 2.10: Contrasting emphases in the customer satisfaction & customer value paradigms.....        | 61  |
| Table 2.11: Marketing-related dimensions of value: Three value postures .....                        | 65  |
| Table 2.12: Summary of academically and managerial important research opportunities .....            | 76  |
| Table 2.13: Summary of research propositions .....   | 77  |
| Table 3.1: The landscape of action inquiry activities .....  | 91  |
| Table 3.2: Sampling frame, responses & response rate 2001-2002.....                                  | 105 |
| Table 3.3: Summary of classification variables.....  | 108 |
| Table 3.4: Steps in the auditing process .....   | 122 |
| Table 3.5: Key frameworks for analysis Stages 1-3 – summary of versions & usage.....                 | 130 |
| Table 3.6: Criteria for assessing quality of research in this study .....                            | 133 |
| Table 4.1: Research propositions guiding data collection & analysis for Stage 1 of the study .....   | 141 |
| Table 4.2: Summary of assessment of multicollinearity.....   | 144 |
| Table 4.3: Summary of correlation of measurement items to indices .....                              | 145 |
| Table 4.4: Profile of respondents.....   | 146 |
| Table 4.5: Key characteristics of sample firms.....  | 147 |
| Table 4.6: 2 approaches and five styles of marketing.....  | 149 |
| Table 4.7: Index rating by type of marketing practiced.....  | 149 |
| Table 4.8: Approaches to marketing practice - cluster analysis results .....                         | 150 |
| Table 4.9 Firm characteristics by marketing approach.....  | 151 |
| Table 4.10: Intentions of business& marketing activities by approach to marketing practice .....     | 153 |
| Table 4.11: Focus of investment & focus of business activities by approach to marketing practice.... | 154 |
| Table 4.12: Management and leadership of customer value by approach to marketing practice .....      | 155 |
| Table 4.13: Measurement of value oriented activities by approach to marketing practice.....          | 156 |
| Table 5.1: Research propositions guiding data collection & analysis for Stage 2 of the study .....   | 163 |
| Table 5.2: Summary of case firms by manager and firm characteristics .....                           | 164 |
| Table 5.3: Summary of manager attributes .....   | 165 |
| Table 5.4: A value typology: Three marketing-related views of value .....                            | 166 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Table 5.5: Summary of firms and customer value posture ascriptions .....                                | 168 |
| Table 5.6: Evolution of value posture – summary of evidence .....                                       | 170 |
| Table 5.7: Revised value typology: Five marketing-related views of value .....                          | 175 |
| Table 5.8: Rationale for refinements to customer value posture typology .....                           | 176 |
| Table 5.9: Support for research propositions 1-4 derived from Stage 2 of the study .....                | 177 |
| Table 6.1: Organisational members: Position, Role/ Background, Qualifications .....                     | 185 |
| Table 6.2: Explanation of firm’s major markets.....   | 187 |
| Table 6.6: Three levels of customer value.....  | 233 |
| Table 6.7: Issues and challenges in the focal firm’s offer development processes.....                   | 245 |
| Table 6.8: Comparison of styles – Father/ Son.....  | 264 |
| Table 6.9: Attributes of effective organisational communication in the case firm .....                  | 281 |
| Table 6.10: Managerial opinions of logistics IT systems: .....  | 284 |
| Table 6.11: Summary of key attributes enabling customer value.....                                      | 288 |
| Table 6.12: Additional value created through channel strategy change .....                              | 295 |
| Table 6.13: Relationship of 3 levels of value and 3 value-delivering processes in promise keeping ...   | 304 |
| Table 6.14: Relationship of 3 levels of value and 3 value-delivering processes in promise making....    | 305 |
| Table 6.15: Summary of 4 types of customer and 3 types of supplier value .....                          | 310 |
| Table 7.1 Summary of research propositions .....  | 315 |
| Table 7.2: Contributions of the study – propositions, findings, and evidence in the extant literature.. | 336 |
| Table 7.3: Opportunities for future issues based customer value related research .....                  | 339 |

## LIST OF FIGURES

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Figure 2.1: Relationship of core competencies and capabilities to value creating assets and processes | 17  |
| Figure 2.2: Framework for analysis of market-based resources  | 29  |
| Figure 2.3: The RBV and marketing practice  | 40  |
| Figure 2.4: Progression of research focus in value orientation  | 47  |
| Figure 2.5: Customer value hierarchy model  | 51  |
| Figure 2.6: Dimensions of relationship value  | 54  |
| Figure 2.7: Conceptualisation of the customer value co-creation process                               | 59  |
| Figure 2.8: Value emphasis: From quality conformance to customer value                                | 60  |
| Figure 2.9: New service vision  | 72  |
| Figure 2.10: Revised conceptualisation of factors relating to customer value creation and delivery    | 74  |
| Figure 3.1: Four elements of research choice  | 87  |
| Figure 3.2: The spiral of action research   | 99  |
| Figure 3.3: Action research framework   | 100 |
| Figure 3.4: Summary of research strategy  | 101 |
| Figure 3.5: Stage 1 research design and analysis process  | 102 |
| Figure 3.6: Comparison of measurement approaches – reflective and formative                           | 107 |
| Figure 3.7: Stage 2 research design and analysis process  | 109 |
| Figure 3.8: Detail of first action-research based collaborative study                                 | 111 |
| Figure 3.9: Stage 3 research design and analysis process  | 114 |
| Figure 3.10: Scope and nature of entities engaged in the study  | 115 |
| Figure 3.11: Stage 3 - Action research process overview   | 121 |
| Figure 3.12: Modified action research process   | 124 |
| Figure 3.13: Components of data analysis: Flow model  | 126 |
| Figure 4.1: Linkages between value postures and value approaches                                      | 159 |
| Figure 4.2: Enhanced view of linkages between value postures and value approaches                     | 160 |
| Figure 5.1: Type of value created by firm type and stakeholder group                                  | 178 |
| Figure 6.1: Position of the focal firm in the New Zealand electronics supply chain                    | 187 |
| Figure 6.2: Analysis of core competencies & capabilities of the focal firm                            | 189 |
| Figure 6.3: Cable & connector industry structure 1979 to mid-1980's                                   | 192 |
| Figure 6.4: Summary of changes in operating environment 1987-1999                                     | 197 |
| Figure 6.5: Performance outcomes as at 9 Oct 2003   | 206 |
| Figure 6.6: The New Service Vision  | 212 |
| Figure 6.7: Customer intimacy – philosophy  | 216 |
| Figure 6.8: Relationship between brand values and value proposition in focal firm                     | 229 |
| Figure 6.9: New positioning of focal firm   | 229 |
| Figure 6.10: Three levels of customer value   | 231 |
| Figure 6.11: Impact on service delivery by supply chain partners                                      | 251 |
| Figure 6.12: Elements of implementation or enabling strategy and relevant chapter sections            | 260 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Figure 6.13: Predominant themes in culture of focal firm.....                            | 265 |
| Figure 6.14: Knowledge type and derivation .....   | 271 |
| Figure 6.15: The customer value creation and delivery triad .....                        | 298 |
| Figure 6.16: Conceptual framework for promise-making .....                               | 299 |
| Figure 6.17: The order management cycle .....  | 303 |
| Figure 7.1: A new conceptualisation of customer value.....                               | 320 |
| Figure 7.2: Contributions to and benefits from customer-supplier relationship value..... | 325 |