



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

The Morality of Planning

An Exploration

Gael Louise Ferguson

**A thesis submitted in part fulfilment of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Planning**

The University of Auckland, 1999

Abstract

This thesis explores the contention that planning is a moral activity concerned with the way in which people live in relation to nature or the environment. It suggests that planning is the moral framework by which communities and individuals confront their relationship with nature or the environment. It argues that certain disciplines such as town planning, resource management, environmental ethics, aspects of theology and of art are but isolated and narrowed aspects of a wider activity of planning.

The rationale for embarking on such a discussion of planning relies in part on the observation that when modern planners take a more contemplative approach to their craft, they have often been perplexed about their frequent failure to deliver the good they assumed that planning set out to achieve. It is suggested that this intent to achieve good is inherent to planning and that it is a moral concern. Planning, under this analysis, is part of the wider realm of moral philosophy and decision-making - that is undertaken by all people. Planning extends beyond mere moral discourse to encompass a number of mechanisms that bind individuals and communities to the moral norms they have adopted. These mechanisms, one of which is the key institution of property rights, are also affected by ideas that change over time; they exist in a dynamic interrelationship with both planning discourse (debates about moral structures and norms) and planning codes (norms adopted by individuals and communities as standards for action).

This thesis takes this broad interpretation of planning and considers it in relation to four periods in planning history. In doing so, a number of themes are identified in relation to the role of planners, the decision-making structures of planning and the nature of planning discourse. These themes are considered in relation to the way Maori planning systems have developed in New Zealand since European settlement. They are also considered in terms of whether it is possible to identify certain universal moral rules within planning and whether there are certain tasks that all planners must address.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Mike Pritchard for the years and for his support for exp mainstream of planning enquiry.

I am also very grateful to Anne and four months of writing this thesis. without that space and lack of pressu place has also made the final perio Kate's patience and willingness to been easy.

Errata

- p. 6 line 3 – 'the' unnecessary to text
- p. 14 'way' is misplaced in the text of **moral**
- p. 16 line 3 first use of 'teleological' should read deontological
- p. 30 'their' in quote from Peter Hall should read 'there'
- p. 35 line 23 – humanity miss-spelt
- p. 68 line 14 – insert 'of' after Pohlenz
- p. 85 line 12 – insert 'had' before 'been'
- p. 86 side note insert 'century' after 'twentieth'
- p. 120 footnote 19 missing: Bacon, *The Advancement of Learning* (1605) ed. G.W. Kitchin, London, Dent 1973; R Descartes, (1738) *Discourse on Method, and other writings*, trans. A Wollaston, Harmondsworth, Penguin 1960
- p. 136 last sentence – add 'the environment'.
- p. 150 line 9 – insert 'included' between 'also' and 'natural'
- p. 156 line 8 – read 'of' not 'if'
- p. 158 line 15 – insert 'with' between 'relationship' and 'nature'
- p. 206 line 7 – insert 'for' between 'basis' and 'actions'
- p. 225 line 24 – 'explore' should be 'explored'
- p. 234 line 6 should read 'example' and the first word of the poem should read 'Four'
- p. 235 line 7 – remove 'and' before 'urupa'
- p. 236 line 3 – 'bot' should read 'not'
- p. 239 line 16 – remove taonga, sentence concludes 'guarantee of rights.'
- p. 254 line 12 – replace 'are' with 'is'
- p. 259 quotation from Krieger – replace 'stores' with 'stories'

Table of Contents

	Pages
Introduction	1
Setting the Boundaries	4
Building a New Interpretation	5
Part I The Nature of PLANNING	
New Definitions	9
Part II Peeling the Onion	
From Normative Discourse to Action	13
Normative Codes and Guiding Systems	19
From Moral Discourse to Action	22
Moral Discourse	24
PLANNING Discourse	39
PLANNING Codes	40
Part III Aspects of PLANNING History	
Introduction	51
The Nature and the Purpose of the Gods: Greece and Rome	
Archaic and Classic Greece	59
The Purpose of the Gods: the Hellenistic Period	62
The Moral Life in Nature	65
PLANNING Codes	75
PLANNING Systems	77
The Moral Economy: Medieval England	
Introduction	83
The Christian Tradition	85
Christian PLANNING	93
The PLANNING system: Use Rights and Ownership of Property	106

	Pages
Improvers and Progress: the Sixteenth to the Eighteenth Centuries	
Introduction	115
The Decline of the Concept of Limit: the Sixteenth Century	117
Exegesis and Grace	120
Changes to the Common Property System	122
The Rise of the Improvers	124
Resistance	126
The Natural Law of Progress	130
Alternative Views: Holistic Ideas of Nature	137
The Progress of Humanity: A New Ethic	138
Further Challenges: The Romantics, Captain Swing and the Luddites	140
The Dilemma of the City	149
Reconsidering the Idea of Progress: the Twentieth Century	
Introduction	155
A Changing Explanatory Framework	159
The Value of Nature: Separation, Limit and Intrinsic value	167
The Relationship of Humanity with Nature	181
Living the Moral Life	196
Part IV Aspects of Maori PLANNING	
Introduction	215
The Maori PLANNING Paradigm	217
The PLANNING Framework	221
Post-European Settlement Impacts on Maori PLANNING	225
Part V On PLANNING and Planners	
Introduction	245
On PLANNING	246
On Planners	255
Conclusion	272
Bibliography (including list of illustrations)	

List of Figures

Page

Figure 1	The two main types of planning	4
Figure 2	The different layers of PLANNING	10
Figure 3	General processes of normative decision-making	13
Figure 4	Relationship between explanatory and normative discourse	15
Figure 5	Basic structure of normative discourse	16
Figure 6	Layers of normative discourse	21
Figure 7	Structures of moral discourse to action	23
Figure 8	The interrelationship between three types of normative discourse	26
Figure 9	Disciplines which contribute to PLANNING	31
Figure 10	The PLANNING nexus	32
Figure 11	Hohfeld's matrix of property rights relationships	47
Figure 12	The relationship between explanatory and moral structures	55
Figure 13	Figure 13: Layers of property rights relationships during the medieval period.	110
Figure 14	Contrasts between weak and strong sustainability (after Jacobs).	208
Figure 15	A taxonomy of capital (after Holland)	210
Figure 16	The relationship between the statutory and Maori PLANNING systems.	236
Figure 17	Commonalities and differences between stewardship and the Maori environmental ethic	242
Figure 18	The different kinds of planner	261
Figure 19	Classification of landscape architecture	263
Figure 20	Characteristics of planners: eighth century until the present	266

Elegy in the Clutha Valley

(in memory of Denis Glover)

Something we will never know
the reason for
or the answer to
woke me one January morning
and streamed through the half-open window
and made me feel it was timeless,

and I remembered a day
that will always be long ago
when I was older
and better able
to stride off over the rolling downs
in search of all the best reasons

in the beleaguered world
to do or not to do,
and to be in touch with oneself
wherever heart and mind
had come to agree
on where we should be going

and let us think this
could be so. Then, the world's ill
flew from the shoulder
of the highest hill
around, and thereafter the will
took a bolder part in things

and my heart leapt
to the blind mountain
from which the scree flaked
and water bled all day long
to the downy valley floor
where, in the evening

I took my rod and my heart
to the river's side
and cast and cast
while the water
ran purple and gold
in the quickening dusk,

and the sedges
fleeing the river
were like ash
at my face and throat
and all the world
seemed to be timeless.

Brian Turner

For my mother Mike Ferguson

who taught me to love Central Otago
and the rest of the world I live in

and to love learning.