

ResearchSpace@Auckland

### **Copyright Statement**

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand). This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage. <u>http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback</u>

### General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library

Thesis Consent Form

# Fiction and the Emotions

# **Grant Tavinor**

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Philosophy, The University of Auckland, 2003

## Abstract

Our participation with works of fiction involves the emotions. Just what this involvement amounts to is a question of great interest. I argue that the literature on the involvement of the emotions in fictive practice has usually made several mistakes. Firstly it has assumed that the emotions are better understood than they actually are. I argue that the theory of emotions common to most of the theories of fiction and the emotion is far from controversial. Revising our conception on what emotions are may allow us to revise our conception of the nature of our emotional involvement in fiction. Second, I argue that two forms of problem are often conflated when philosophers discuss fictional and the emotions. There are semantic and ontological problems, and substantive psychological problems. Often these problems are confused for each other. Distinguishing between the two forms of problem will help to clear up the significant disagreements that exist in the literature. My thesis is broadly naturalised in intent, in the hope that this focus will be productive in explaining the role of the emotions in fictive practice.

# Acknowledgements

I would foremost like to thank my supervisor for thesis Associate Professor Stephen Davies. He was always generous in his criticisms, be they of a philosophical, grammatical, or ornithological nature.

Thanks go also to the Department of Philosophy at Auckland University for providing an atmosphere so conducive to philosophical study.

I would also like to the Foundation for Research, Science, and Technology for their provision of a Bright Futures Scholarship for this research.

Finally I would like to thank the family and friends who were supportive of my study, even when I was particularly cranky.

## Contents

#### **1. THE PARADOX OF FICTION**

- 1.1 Introduction
- 1.2 Solutions to the Paradox

#### 2. THE EMOTIONS

- 2.1 A Theory of the Emotions and the Theory of Fiction
- 2.2 The History and Theory of the Emotions
- 2.3 Eliminating "Emotion"
- 2.4 Approaches to the Emotions
  - i.) Affective Emotions
  - ii.) Borderline Cases: Sexual Arousal, Startle, Laughter
  - iii.) Higher Cognitive and Social Emotions

#### **3. A THEORY OF FICTION**

- 3.1 The Theory of Fiction
- 3.2 Cognition and Pretence
- 3.3 Walton and Make-Believe
- 3.4 Fictive Practice
  - i.) Isomorphic Participation
  - ii.) Representational Participation
- 3.5 Fictional and Factual Idioms
- 3.6 Real and Fictional Actions

#### 4. FICTION AND THE EMOTIONS

- 4.1 Fictional Emotions
- 4.2 Thought Theory and Genuine Emotions
- 4.3 The Usage of Emotions Terms
- 4.4 The Paradox Resolved
- 4.5 A Cognitive Theory of Fiction and the Emotions

#### 5. FICTION AND THE AFFECTIVE EMOTIONS

- 5.1 Affect
- 5.2 Affect and the Imagination
- 5.3 Naïve Affective Reactions
- 5.4 Affect as a Reflexive Prop
- 5.5 Affect, Fiction, and Behaviour

#### 6. FICTION AND THE COGNITIVE AND SOCIAL EMOTIONS

- 6.1 Cognitive Emotions and Fiction
- 6.2 Understanding Fictional Folk
- 6.3 Who Loves Janet Weiss?

#### 7. FICTION NATURALISED

- 7.1 Fictions, Emotion, and Behaviour
- 7.2 The Ubiquity of Fiction

#### 8. CONCLUSIONS: EMOTIONAL PARTICIPATION IN FICTIONS

- 8.1 Representational Participation
- 8.2 Isomorphic Participation: Theoretical and Reflexive Attitudes to Fictions
- 8.3 The Paradox Resolved
- 8.4 Emotional Participation
- 8.5 Representational Participation and Emotion
- 8.6 Isomorphic Participation and Emotion: Theoretical, Affective, and Reflexive Emotional Attitudes
- 8.7 Conclusion: The Heterogeneity of Emotional Participation in Fiction