Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand). This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage. http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form
The Wandering Jew as a synecdoche of anti-Jewish construction: A psychoanalytic perspective

Anthony David (Tony) Stroobant

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Doctor of Philosophy in Theology The University of Auckland, 2006
Abstract

The Wandering Jew as a synecdoche of anti-Jewish construction: A psychoanalytic perspective

After around half a century of progress, Jewish-Christian relations seem to have reached a plateau. Among many possible reasons, it appears that good intentions at “official” church levels continue to be subverted by traditional Christian supersessionism, especially as manifest in the “performed” life of the church, and in relation to Jews and Judaism.

The research generates a psychoanalytical understanding of Christian anti-Jewishness complementary to those from other fields, to try to understand more comprehensively its aetiology and why it manifests in such particular ways. The theoretical approach begins with Freud and the British Object Relations school, but includes perspectives from other streams of psychoanalysis, and from contemporary cognitive theory.

Utilising an “applied” psychoanalytic reading of The Wandering Jew as a synecdoche of Christian anti-Jewishness, the research argues that performance of the church’s sacred texts (traditionally interpreted in anti-Jewish ways) connects, via unconscious association, with latent primal fears and anxieties of worshippers. It is this regular, uncritical performance of such texts that keeps a largely unconscious, affect-laden, contemporary anti-Jewishness alive.

Understanding that “bodies” can bear powerful meanings, the research investigates the person of The Wandering Jew as a Christian anti-Jewish construction, and uncovers a number of psychoanalytically significant themes which closely relate to issues of human development. All of this, taken together, helps explain why Christian anti-Jewishness is often so passionately irrational, palpably incarnate, deep-rooted and difficult to educate against.

The research concludes with two theoretical reflections. The first explores whether the idea of the analytic third might help towards a better understanding of the potency of Christian anti-Jewish fantasy. The second is a discussion of whether it is helpful, given anti-Jewishness is no longer generally understood as “psychopathological”, to think instead of Christian anti-Jewish construction as taking place on neurotic islands having cultures of narcissism and paranoia.

The main implication of the research is that the church needs to take responsibility for its own anti-Jewishness which is what, in essence, is currently subverting better Jewish-Christian relations.
The aim of man is to search for the cause and meaning of things  
* Rabbi Moses Isserles-Lazarus (the Rema)

Heaven is the state where we see each other face to face  
* Saint Anthony
Dedication

In memory of Rev Dr J.J. Lewis, late Fellow and Principal of Trinity Methodist Theological College (Auckland) who opened a door for me to a Jewish world I hardly knew existed. Shalom.
Acknowledgements

Thanks to Philip Culbertson and Robert Wicks for their supervision of my research and writing, and to Stephen Appel and Terry Wall for academic advice. Thanks to these, and many others, for personal support and encouragement throughout the project. Thanks also for financial assistance to StudyLink, to the School of Theology, University of Auckland, and to the Travel and Study Committee of the Methodist Church of NZ/Te Haahi Weteriana O Aotearoa.
Contents

Chapter One—Introduction

1.1 Title 1
1.2 Aim of the research 1
1.3 Key research question 1
1.4 Delineating the problem 2
   1.4.1 Have Jewish-Christian relations got “stuck”? 2
   1.4.2 Why might Jewish-Christian relations be stuck? 2
   1.4.3 The church’s orthodoxy versus its orthopraxis 2
   1.4.4 The “Jewish trial of Jesus” 2
   1.4.5 Anti-Jewishness and Christian fantasy 2
   1.4.6 Psychoanalysis as one of many possible hermeneutical lenses 2
   1.4.7 Summary 2
1.5 Excursus on terminology 22
   1.5.1 Anti-Judaism and antisemitism 22
   1.5.2 A caveat 22
   1.5.3 Summary 22
1.6 The current literature 30
   1.6.1 Introduction 30
   1.6.2 Freud, Judaism, Christianity and antisemitism 30
   1.6.3 Post Freud 30
   1.6.4 Summary 30
1.7 Composing myself 41
1.8 Summary conclusion 46

Chapter two—Methodology

2.1 Introduction 49
2.2 Psychoanalysis 50
   2.2.1 Introduction 50
   2.2.2 “Applied” psychoanalysis 50
   2.2.3 Summary 50
2.3 “Telling tales”—why a narratological approach? 56
   2.3.1 Narration and psychoanalysis 56
   2.3.2 Narration and “thick” descriptions 56
   2.3.3 Summary 56
2.4 The legend of The Wandering Jew
  2.4.1 The legend
  2.4.2 Extant interpretations
  2.4.3 Why this legend, in particular?
    2.4.3.1 Focus on a character
    2.4.3.2 A classic anti-Jewish text
    2.4.3.3 A synecdoche of anti-Jewish construction
  2.4.4 Summary

2.5 Engaging psychoanalytically with the legend
  2.5.1 Listening with “evenly suspended attention”
  2.5.2 Identifying psychoanalytically significant themes
  2.5.3 Some theoretical reflections

Chapter three—Making connections
3.1 Introduction
3.2 Methodology
3.3 Listening with “evenly suspended attention”
3.4 The experiment
  3.4.1 Listening to the legend
  3.4.2 Self analysis
  3.4.3 Critical reflection on the analysis
  3.4.4 Interim summary
3.5 Making connections

Chapter four—Some psychoanalytically significant themes
4.1 Introduction
4.2 Methodology
4.3 Constructions in analysis
4.4 Overt themes
  4.4.1 Theme one—Irrationality and Christian anti-Jewishness
    4.4.1.1 Introduction
    4.4.1.2 Irrationality—a psychoanalytic view
    4.4.1.3 Conclusion
  4.4.2 Theme two—Incarnation and Christian anti-Jewishness
    4.4.2.1 Introduction
    4.4.2.2 Aspects of infancy—a psychoanalytic view
    4.4.2.3 Incarnate Christian anti-Jewishness
    4.4.2.4 Conclusion
  4.4.3 Theme three—the homeless wanderer
    4.4.3.1 Introduction
    4.4.3.2 The homeless man—a psychoanalytic perspective
    4.4.3.3 The wanderer—a psychoanalytic perspective
    4.4.3.4 The universal “non-fitting” Jew
    4.4.3.5 Conclusion
4.5 Covert themes
  4.5.1 Theme four—Sexualisation of Christian anti-Jewishness
    4.5.1.1 Introduction
    4.5.1.2 Sex and libido—a psychoanalytic perspective
    4.5.1.3 Conclusion
  4.5.2 Theme five—Ambivalence and Christian anti-Jewishness
    4.5.2.1 Introduction
    4.5.2.2 Ambivalence—a psychoanalytic perspective
    4.5.2.3 Conclusion
  4.5.3 Theme six—Emotion and Christian anti-Jewishness
    4.5.3.1 Introduction
    4.5.3.2 Affect and infancy—a psychoanalytic perspective
    4.5.3.3 Affect, infancy and Christian anti-Jewishness
    4.5.3.4 Conclusion

4.6 Summary conclusions

Chapter five—Theoretical reflections
5.1 Introduction
5.2 Towards a better model of the anti-Jewish, psychically-constructed other
    5.2.1 From projection to projective identification
    5.2.2 Psychoanalytic “holding”
    5.2.3 The analytic third
    5.2.4 Summary conclusion
5.3 Christian anti-Jewishness: neurotic islands of narcissism and paranoia?
    5.3.1 Normal neuroticism
    5.3.2 Neurotic styles
    5.3.3 Narcissism and paranoia
      5.3.3.1 Narcissism
      5.3.3.2 Paranoia
    5.3.4 Anti-Jewishness: neurotic islands in the (worship) life of the church

Chapter six—Summary and conclusions
6.1 Summary of research
6.2 A conclusion from the research
6.3 Possible future research directions
6.4 Possible implications of the research

Reference list