Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand). This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage. http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form

Erosion-Corrosion of Cr₃C₂-NiCr High Velocity Thermal Spray Coatings

by

Steven James Matthews

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Engineering, The University of Auckland, 2004.

The University of Auckland

Thesis Consent Form

This thesis may be consulted for the purpose of research or private study provided that due acknowledgement is made where appropriate and that the author's permission is obtained before any material from the thesis is published.

I agree that the University of Auckland Library may make a copy of this thesis for supply

to the collection of another prescribed library on request from that Library; and
 I agree that this thesis may be photocopied for supply to any person in accordance with the provisions of Section 56 of the Copyright Act 1994
Or
2. This thesis may not be photocopied other than to supply a copy for the collection of another prescribed library
(Strike out 1 or 2)
Signed:
Date:

Created: 5 July 2001 Last updated: 9 August 2001

Abstract

This thesis investigates the mechanisms of erosion-corrosion of Cr_3C_2 -NiCr thermal spray coatings under high temperature, high erodent velocity, turbine conditions. Erosion-corrosion is a generalised wear phenomenon where the combined effect of each degradation mechanism generates more extensive mass loss than the sum of each mechanism acting independently. Previous research has highlighted several theoretical mechanisms under this generalized process, ranging from the erosion induced breakdown of oxide scales in corrosive environments, through to the development of oxide layers in highly erosive environments. Prior to this current work experimental simulation of these mechanisms has focused on bulk alloy materials with well characterised oxidation responses, under conditions of low temperature, low erodent impact velocity and high erodent flux, conditions which are readily generated within laboratory scale rigs and which tend towards the low impact energy conditions encountered within fluidised bed combustors. Few works have addressed erosion-corrosion under simulated turbine conditions of high temperature, high erodent impact velocity and low erodent flux. While comparative trials have been run under such conditions on a purely mass loss basis, little has been presented regarding the microstructural analysis of such degradation, particularly for materials that rely on the industrially relevant, slow growing oxide scales Cr_2O_3 and Al_2O_3 .

Thermally sprayed Cr_3C_2 -NiCr coatings are routinely applied to combat wear at high temperature due to the high wear resistance imparted by the hard carbide particles and the high temperature oxidation resistant nature of the Cr_2O_3 oxide formed over both phases. However, most published work characterising the erosion-corrosion response of these coatings has been conducted on a comparative basis by contrasting coatings of various composition ratios, deposited by various techniques, with the response of well characterised bulk materials. Little has been presented on the microstructural mechanism of erosion-corrosion of Cr_3C_2 -NiCr coatings, a point highlighted by the limited understanding of the oxidation mechanism of the Cr_3C_2 -phase, the oxidation mechanisms of the combined composite Cr_3C_2 -NiCr and the influence of the coating splat structure on the oxidation response. While the erosion response of thermal spray coatings and bulk cermets is more widely understood, most works have been conducted under milder conditions than used in the current work. In addition previous works have been conducted primarily on assprayed coatings with few works taking into account the effect of heat treatment induced changes in the coating composition and microstructure that occur with extended in-service exposure at elevated temperature.

In addressing the short comings in the current state of knowledge, the aim of this work was to characterise the mechanism of erosion-corrosion of high velocity sprayed Cr₃C₂-NiCr thermal spray coatings under turbine conditions, incorporating the effect of variation in the composition and carbide distribution with inflight degradation, variations in starting powder morphology, heat treatment, erosion conditions and exposure temperature.

75 Cr₃C₂-25(Ni20Cr) coatings were deposited by AerosprayTM HVAF, GMA MicrojetTM HVOF, Stellite Jet KoteTM HVOF and TAFA JP-5000TM HVOF spraying under optimised conditions using agglomerated/sintered and blended powders. The prealloyed powder based coatings, characterised in terms of microhardness, porosity content and phase degradation, were found to exceed the average values of coating quality presented in the literature. The blended powder based coating of this work was comparable with the coating attributes presented in the literature for plasma and HVOF coatings based on this powder morphology. Based on these results the coatings were considered representative of those sprayed industrially and therefore the responses of the samples in this work to oxidation and erosion were considered indicative of the response of industrially applied coatings of this composition in service.

Heat treatment trials were conducted on the AerosprayTM HVAF and MicrojetTM HVOF coatings at 900°C in air and argon for up to 60 days to simulate the compositional and microstructural development of these coatings under elevated temperature conditions in service. In the prealloyed powder based coatings, rapid carbide precipitation occurred within the first two days in both coatings to reach the steady state composition of 75-80vol%. Minimal in-flight carbide dissolution in the HVAF coating led to preferential carbide precipitation on the retained carbide grains. In the MicrojetTM HVOF coatings, which suffered extensive inflight carbide dissolution, carbide precipitation occurred as fine precipitates in the carbide-free zones, forming large sponge-like agglomerates. With extended exposure Ostwald ripening led to coarsening of the individual carbide grain size and widespread agglomeration of the carbide grains into an extensive three dimensional network after 30 days exposure, with minimal development out to 60 days. Compositionally, heat treatment led to a dramatic reduction in the supersaturated matrix phase Cr content, with the steady state Cr composition of the MicrojetTM HVOF coating exceeding that of the AerosprayTM HVAF coating based on XRD analysis. Cr₃C₂ was the only carbide detected with heat treatment. Heat treatment of the blended powder based coating led to sintering of the single phase splats. Diffusion of the carbide elements into the matrix phase splats occurred, allowing fingers and nodules of the carbide to develop into this phase as well as increasing the matrix phase Cr concentration.

Oxidation of Cr_3C_2 by hot stage XRD analysis at 600°C, combined with TGA analysis at 600-850°C, supported the mechanism of stepwise decarburisation prior to Cr_2O_3 formation, presented as one possible mechanism in the literature. Oxidation of the Cr_3C_2 -NiCr coatings over the range 700-850°C was dependent on the starting powder morphology and the extent of dissolved carbide in the matrix phase. Oxidation of the as-sprayed prealloyed powder based coatings was dictated by the matrix phase, the high Cr concentration resulting from carbide dissolution leading to rapid growth of the Cr_2O_3 phase over the oxidising carbide grains. Growth stresses induced by such overgrowth lead to the formation of interfacial voids over the carbide grains at high temperature. Heat treatment reduced the matrix phase Cr concentration, resulting in the coating phases oxidising independently with a reduced magnitude of lateral matrix based scale growth over the carbide phase. In the blended powder based coating, bulbous Ni oxides dominated the scale topography. With extended exposure a continuous Cr_2O_3 scale formed below the faster growing Ni oxides, which enabled lateral growth of the scale over the carbide based Cr_2O_3 scales. Following heat treatment the matrix phase Cr concentration increased, minimising the development of Ni oxides on this phase.

Erosion studies were carried out in a custom built high temperature erosion apparatus. Ambient temperature trials were conducted using Al₂O₃ erodent at velocities of 150m/s. The as-sprayed prealloyed powder based coatings exhibited a brittle impact response, which was accentuated in the MicrojetTM HVOF coating by the increased extent of in-flight carbide dissolution and the splat structure which made this sample more susceptible to brittle erosion mechanisms. Heat treatment of these coatings led to sintering of the splats and a more ductile impact response due to the increased ductility of the matrix phase. The as-sprayed blended powder based coatings exhibited a range of impact responses from brittle erosion of the carbide through to ductile erosion of the matrix based splats. Mass loss was accentuated by the poor intersplat adhesive strength. Heat treatment led to sintering of the splats, resulting in a more microstructural based erosion response.

The two prealloyed powder based coatings generated similar erosion rates under the aggressive conditions, distinctly more erosion resistant than the blended powder based coatings. Heat treatment improved the erosion resistance of all the coatings, however, the duration of heat treatment had a negligible effect on the magnitude of erosive mass loss.

Erosion at 800°C, with an impact velocity of 235m/s, lead to significantly deeper erodent penetration into the coating than noted at ambient temperature. The significant increase in the matrix phase ductility at elevated temperature minimized the impact of carbide dissolution on the matrix impact response in the prealloyed powder based coatings. The primary effect of carbide dissolution was to reduce the carbide concentration, allowing deformation of the matrix to dictate the coating response. Carbide development with heat treatment significantly reduced the ability of the matrix to deform in this manner. The increased matrix phase ductility in the blended powder based coating reduced the concentration of impact energy on the splat boundaries, leading to a more microstructural based erosion response. Heat treatment had a negligible effect on the coating response, given the reduced significance of the splat boundary adhesion.

Erosion at 700°C generated similar erosion responses in the prealloyed powder based coatings to those noted at 800°C, the lower matrix phase ductility reflected in the more brittle response evident as brittle cracking and fracture. The effect of carbide development with heat treatment was not as dramatic as at 800°C due to the reduced matrix phase ductility at this temperature. Erosion of the blended powder based coating at 700°C generated the same spectrum of erosion response as noted at 800°C in both the as-sprayed and heat treated states, with the variation in matrix phase ductility with temperature overshadowed by the heterogeneous coating impact response resulting from the heterogeneous phase distribution.

The steady state erosion rate at 700°C was comparable across all of the coatings in both the as-sprayed and heat treated conditions. At 800°C, heat treatment had a negative impact on the prealloyed powder based coatings, but no definitive effect on the blended powder based coatings. The MicrojetTM HVOF coatings were more erosion resistant than the AerosprayTM HVAF coatings under these conditions. These results pointed to a reduction in the significance of the coating splat structure on the magnitude of erosion, in favour of a more microstructural based response at high temperature.

In both the ambient and elevated temperature trials the coating microhardness values proved to be a poor indicator in predicting the magnitude or relative ranking of the erosion response of the different coatings under these aggressive erosion conditions.

Erosion-corrosion under turbine conditions of high temperature, high erodent velocity and low erodent flux, was simulated by oxidizing samples at 900°C and subjecting them to one second of erosion every 48 hours over a period of 60 days. The degradation testing was assessed in accelerated testing in additional trials by polishing the oxide scale formed at 900°C from the sample surface every 48 hours over the same time period. Under these conditions the coatings formed thick oxide scales that penetrated into the coating. Preferential internal oxidation of the Cr₃C₂ phase occurred in the coating, consuming the grains in the near surface zone through the formation of Cr₂O₃ to a depth dependent upon the test temperature. Oxygen ingress occurred along the carbide-matrix interface and was accentuated in the regions of impact damage surrounding the erodent indentations. Internal oxidation of the carbide phase sealed off the pockets of matrix phase which were eventually consumed by oxidation once they were no longer able to maintain a protective Cr₂O₃ oxide. The extent of internal attack was consistent in the 20, 40 and 60 day samples, suggesting that the internal oxidation front proceeded at a constant rate in front of the erosion front into the coating. The prealloyed powder based coatings were more resistant to such internal degradation relative to the blended powder based coatings, with an internally oxidised zone of 6µm relative to the 10µm thick internally oxidized band in the blended powder based coating. While each erodent impact event may be classified as oxidation affected erosion, the low erodent flux effectively led to a long-term response more accurately described as erosion affected oxidation.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the following people for their assistance in researching this thesis:

- > Dr Margaret Hyland and Dr Bryony James, Department of Chemical and Materials Engineering, The University of Auckland, for their encouragement and guidance in researching and writing this thesis.
- > Dr Tana Levi, Materials Performance Technologies, for her supervision and the project funding provided by Materials Performance Technologies.
- ➤ Dave Holster, Bruce Martin, Alan Swanson and Kevin Gibson at Holster Engineering Co Ltd for their enthusiasm and tremendous support in providing the facilities and guidance to spray the majority of the samples in this work, without which this thesis would not have been possible.
- ➤ Jacques de Reuck and Valma Laurent, Metal Spray Suppliers (NZ) Ltd, for their support and generosity in supplying the powders used in this work, as well as for their ongoing encouragement in researching and promoting thermal spraying in New Zealand.
- The staff of the Research Centre for Surface and Materials Science, The University of Auckland, particularly Yan Jing and Catherine Hobbis for their guidance, patience and support in the preparation and analysis of samples by SEM.
- The technical staff of the Department of Chemical and Materials Engineering, The University of Auckland, in particular Geoff Kirby, Andy Clare, Keith Towl, Bruce Tetly, and Phil Lacey for their ideas and support in the design, construction and commissioning of the high temperature erosion-corrosion apparatus. I would also like to thank Steve Strover, for his extensive assistance and guidance in the field of metallography and sample preparation, and Alec Asadov, for his guidance in the use of XRD.
- > The technical staff of the School of Engineering Workshop, The University of Auckland, especially Peter Selby and Brent Purdy for their outstanding effort in the fabrication of the high temperature erosion-corrosion apparatus.
- > David Stringer and Michael Hodgson for their technical computer support.
- > WOKA GmbH for their donation of powders for use in this investigation.
- ➤ HVOF and Laser Technologies, Australia, and Triple "R" Engineering Ltd, New Zealand, for their donation of HVOF samples for this investigation.
- > The University of Auckland, for the financial support provided through The University of Auckland Post Graduate Scholarship and travel grants through the Post Graduate Research Fund.
- ➤ Most of all I would like to thank my parents for their exceptional support, especially over the duration of this study.

Table of Contents

1	ABSTRACT ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS TABLE OF CONTENTS	iii vii ix
CHAP]	TER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
CHAP ⁷	TER 2 THERMAL SPRAYING – AN INTRODUCTION	5
2.1	Introduction	5
2.2	Thermal Spray Techniques	7
2.2. 2.2.	The state of the s	7 8
2.2.		8
2.3	Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Cemented Carbides	11
2.3. 2.3.		11
	The first of the state of the s	11
2.4 2.4.	Thermal Spraying of Cemented Carbides 1 Introduction	18 18
2.4.	.2 Phase Degradation during High Velocity Thermal Spraying	18
2.5	Summary	23
CHAPT	TER 3 EXPERIMENTAL EQUIPMENT AND ANALYTICAL METHODS	25
3.1	Metallographic Specimen Preparation	25
3.2	Vickers Microhardness Testing	26
3.3	Porosity	26
3.4	Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM)	27
3.4.		27
3.4. 3.4.	• • • • • •	28 28
3.4.		26 29
3.4.	, , , ,	31
3.5	Xray-Diffraction (XRD)	31
3.5.		31
3.5.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	33
3.5. 3.5.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	34 37
3.6	Thermogravimetric Analysis	37
CHAP7	ΓER 4 CHARACTERISATION OF THERMALLY SPRAYED Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr	
COATI		39
4.1	Introduction	39
4.2	Review of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Coating Quality	41

Table of Contents

6.8.5 6.8.6		160 163
6.9 6.9.1 6.9.2 6.9.3	Analysis of the Mass Gain Kinetic Response	167 167 170 177
6.10 6.10 6.10 6.10	.2 Thermogravimetric Analysis – Prealloyed and Blended Powder Based Coatings	180 180 180 182
6.11	Summary	185
СНАРТ	ER 7 EROSION OF CERMET COMPOSITES	187
7.1	Introduction	187
7.2 7.2.1 7.2.2		189 189 191
7.3 7.3.1 7.3.2 7.3.3 7.3.4	Significance of the Hard Phase Content on the Erosion Rate Mechanisms of Erosive Wear of Cermets	193 193 193 195 196
7.4 7.4.1 7.4.2 7.4.3 7.4.4 7.4.5	Mechanisms of Thermal Spray Coating Erosion Erosion of Carbide Based Thermal Spray Coatings Effect of Erosion Test Variables	199 199 199 202 208 209
7.5	Summary	210
СНАРТ	ER 8 EROSION OF Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr THERMAL SPRAY COATINGS	213
8.1	Introduction	213
8.2	Experimental Procedure	215
8.3 8.3.1 8.3.2 8.3.3 8.3.4 8.3.5	Single Impact Erosion Studies – Heat Treated Coatings Steady State Erosion Mass Loss – As-Sprayed Coatings Steady State Erosion Mass Loss – 30 Day Heat Treated Coatings.	219 219 228 233 240 244
8.4 8.4.1 8.4.2 8.4.3 8.4.4 8.4.5 8.4.6 8.4.7 8.4.8 8.4.9	Effect of Temperature on Erosion Rate Experimental Procedure Single Impact Erosion Studies – Prealloyed Powder Based Coating at 700°C Single Impact Erosion Studies – Prealloyed Powder Based Coatings at 800°C Single Impact Studies – Blended Powder Based Coatings at 700°C and 800°C Steady State Erosion Mass Loss – Prealloyed Powder Based Coatings Steady State Erosion Mass Loss – Blended Powder Based Coatings Elevated Temperature Bulk Erosion Analysis	251 251 251 252 254 257 263 266 272 275 277
8.5	Summary	283

CHAF I	ER 9 ERUSION-UAIDATION OF C13C2-NICT THERWIAL SPRAT COATING	<u>s</u> 287
9.1	Introduction	287
9.2		
9.2.1	Classification of Erosion-Oxidation Regimes Oxidation-Affected-Erosion	290 292
9.2.2		294
9.3	Effect of Process Variables on Erosion-Oxidation	297
9.3.1	1	297
9.3.2		298
9.4	Erosion of Oxide Scales Erosion Oxidetion of Thornel Spray Coatings	300
9.5	Erosion-Oxidation of Thermal Spray Coatings	303
9.6	Experimental Procedure	304
9.7	Erosion of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Oxide Scales	307
9.7.1 9.7.2		307 307
9.7.2		311
9.7.4		314
9.7.5		316
9.7.6	Mechanisms of Scale Erosion as a Function of Oxide Morphology Under Turbine Erosion Conditio	ns
		318
9.8	Erosion-Oxidation of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Thermal Spray Coatings Under Turbine Conditions	324
9.8.1		324
9.8.2	Accelerated Erosion-Oxidation Through Repeated Scale Thinning	325
9.8.3	* -	332
9.8.4	* -	
9.8.5	Implications for the Industrial Application of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Coatings Under Turbine Conditions.	341
9.9	Summary	349
CHAPT	ER 10 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	351
10.1	Heat Treatment of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Thermal Spray Coatings	351
10.2	High Temperature Isothermal Oxidation of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Thermal Spray Coatings	353
10.3	Erosion of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Thermal Spray Coatings	355
10.4	Erosion-Oxidation of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Thermal Spray Coatings	358
10.5	Summary of the Erosion-Oxidation Response of Cr ₃ C ₂ -NiCr Coatings as a Function of t	he
Severit	ty of Erosion	360
10.6	Recommendations for Erosion Resistant Gas Turbine Coatings	355
10.6	<u> </u>	324
10.6		325
10.6	3 Optimum Coating Microstructure for Erosion Resistance	332
A DDEAU	NICES	265
APPENI		365
	1: Statistical Design of Experiment Methods and Optimisation of HVAF and HVOF	267
Depositio Appondis		367 403
Appendiz Appendiz		403
Appendiz Appendiz		439
Appendiz Appendiz	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	459

REFERENCES 465