

## RESEARCHSPACE@AUCKLAND

### http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz

#### ResearchSpace@Auckland

#### **Copyright Statement**

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage. <a href="http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback">http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback</a>

## General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

Remembering the Past, Thinking of the Present: Historic Commemorations in New Zealand and Northern Ireland, 1940–1990

Helen Alexandra Robinson

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctorate of Philosophy, the University of Auckland, 2009.

#### **Abstract**

This thesis analyses and compares two historic commemorations in Northern Ireland with two in New Zealand, in the period from 1940 to 1990. These commemorations are the Twelfth of July and Remembrance Sunday in Northern Ireland, and Waitangi Day and Anzac Day in New Zealand.

Examination of these commemorations has revealed several patterns. In the commemorations studied in this thesis, levels of public adherence generally depended on the extent to which the values that the commemoration symbolised were seen as threatened or highly needed. The commemorations which reaffirmed compelling values tended to enjoy higher levels of public support than those expressing values which were seen as either unnecessary or unthreatened. In both countries, historic commemorations were capable of uniting communities behind core values. However, in cases where there was no general agreement on what those values were or what they meant, commemorations frequently became sites of division and conflict. All four commemorations were regularly used by organisers and participants to express views on contemporary political and social issues and, on several occasions in both countries, different groups battled for the control of particular commemorations. In both countries, increased levels of social conflict often led to the increased use of the past as a rhetorical device.

The main conclusion to be drawn from this study is that these historic commemorations derived more of their meaning from their contemporary context than from the historical events which they commemorated. In particular, how the public viewed and understood the values symbolised and reaffirmed by the commemorations strongly affected their levels of support. People were most likely to observe the commemorations when they were seen as symbolising values which were widely adhered to and seen as threatened or urgently needed. The historic commemorations examined in this thesis were often strongly affected by contemporary events which were seen as relating, positively or negatively, to the values which the commemorations embodied.

### Acknowledgements

This thesis could not have been started, let alone completed, without the help of many people. My supervisors Malcolm Campbell, James Belich and Aroha Harris provided invaluable guidance, especially Malcolm who was, in practice, my sole supervisor for the first half of 2008. The University of Auckland granted me a PhD. scholarship and other funding which enabled me to dedicate myself full-time to the thesis, and spend six months living in Belfast. The university's Department of History provided me with an office, computer, photocopying and printing, and internet connection. Various people within the department helped me in a range of ways, especially Barbara Batt, Caroline Daley and Tiopira McDowell.

I was able to undertake productive research in four different cities thanks to the helpful staff at various libraries and archives in Auckland, Wellington, Belfast and London. In particular, various librarians at Queen's University Belfast kindly bent rules concerning what materials Associate Members were allowed to access, and a Eugene O'Sullivan Theological Library librarian went above and beyond the call of duty to track down copies of the *New Zealand Tablet* in Auckland. The Ulster Society was also enormously helpful.

My stay in Belfast was made instructive and enjoyable by a huge range of friendly locals, Protestant and Catholic, who answered my questions and generally gave me insight into their communities. In particular I would like to thank Mary Clarke, Elaine Doyle and Stephen McCormick, all of whom made me welcome and helped me understand their country. Mary also rescued me when I realised that I had got the date of Remembrance Sunday 1971 wrong and consequently left Belfast with no coverage of that particularly significant event.

My husband Douglas Jones provided me with support, distraction and insight, and was enthusiastic about temporarily moving to one of the colder, stranger parts of the United Kingdom.

# Table of contents

| List of abbreviations                               |   | ix  |
|---|---|-----|
| Introduction  |   | 1   |
| Chapter One:  | Commemorating the Boyne, 1690-1968                | 17  |
| Chapter Two:  | Commemorating the Treaty, 1840-1967               | 52  |
| Chapter Three:                                      | War Commemorations in Northern Ireland, to 1966   | 84  |
| Chapter Four:                                       | War Commemorations in New Zealand, to 1966        | 118 |
| Chapter Five:                                       | The Twelfth, 1969-1990                            | 151 |
| Chapter Six:  | Waitangi Day, 1968-1990                           | 184 |
| Chapter Seven:                                      | War commemorations in Northern Ireland, 1967-1990 | 220 |
| Chapter Eight:                                      | Anzac Day, 1967-1990                              | 250 |
| Conclusion  |   | 278 |
| Bibliography  |   | 283 |
| Glossary of Maori words and Irish and British terms |   | 313 |

#### List of abbreviations

### Organisations, titles etc

AIA Anglo-Irish Agreement

CESA Catholic Ex-Servicemen's Association

CGM County Grand Master

CND Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament

DUP Democratic Unionist Party

EEC European Economic Community
IOO Independent Orange Order
IRA Irish Republican Army
LOL Loyal Orange Lodge

MWWL Maori Women's Welfare League

NIO Northern Ireland Office

NZUSA New Zealand University Students' Association

PD People's Democracy

PRONI Public Record Office of Northern Ireland

PYM Progressive Youth Movement

RSA Returned Services Association, originally Returned Soldiers'

Association, later Returned and Services' Association

SDLP Social Democratic and Labour Party
TD Teachta Dala (Member of Parliament)

TVNZ Television New Zealand
UDA Ulster Defence Association
UDR Ulster Defence Regiment
UFF Ulster Freedom Fighters
UUP Ulster Unionist Party

UUUC United Ulster Unionist Committee

UVF Ulster Volunteer Force WAC Waitangi Action Committee

#### **Publications**

AH Te Ao Hou

BT Belfast Telegraph
BN Belfast News Letter
DST Dominion Sunday Times
EG Education Gazette

EP Evening Post
IN Irish News

KM Te Kaunihera Maori

LN Loyalist News

MOOHR Maori Organisation on Human Rights
NA Northern Advocate [New Zealand]

NBR National Business Review

NIPD Northern Ireland Parliamentary Debates

NISPD Northern Ireland Senate Parliamentary Debates

NZCN New Zealand Centennial News

NZH New Zealand Herald

NZJH New Zealand Journal of History

NZL New Zealand Listener

NZMR New Zealand Monthly Review

NZPD New Zealand Parliamentary Debates

NZWW New Zealand Woman's Weekly

ODT Otago Daily Times
OS Orange Standard
PT Protestant Telegraph
TC Tyrone Constitution

TT Treaty Times

UKNIWM United Kingdom National Inventory of War Memorials

WACN Waitangi Action Committee Newsletter