



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the [Library Thesis Consent Form](#) and [Deposit Licence](#).

A Consideration of Homeostatic Regulation of Eating from the Perspective of Maharishi Vedic Science

*Le vrai voyage de la découverte consiste pas en cherchant de nouveaux paysages,
mais en ayant de nouveaux yeux*

*The real voyage of discovery consists not in seeking new landscapes, but in having
new eyes - Marcel Proust*

Hugh David Lovell-Smith

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

The University of Auckland 2009

Acknowledgments

I wish first to extend my thanks to my supervisor Stephen Buetow for his confidence in me from the first, his flexibility in accepting my unexpected changes of course and his robust and rigorous criticism of the text. Without Stephen's help and his deep interest in the history and development of ideas, I could never have embarked upon this project. I also wish to thank my Head of Department, Bruce Arroll for taking time from a crowded schedule to act as interim second supervisor and for his positive and helpful suggestions. My sincere thanks go also to Tim Kenealy, who joined as second supervisor. His agile mind, openness and helpful approach have been most appreciated.

My three years of study were supported financially by a Senior Health Research Scholarship from the University of Auckland and I thank the University for the faith shown in me. To have had the time available to mull over thoughts and follow up ideas free from financial pressure has been a rare opportunity.

Among colleagues whose interest has spurred me on, Mario Ciampolini stands out. I must express my deepest appreciation to him for sharing his knowledge borne of long experience in the field and for his kindly interest and enthusiasm. My special thanks go also to his family and extended family for welcoming me during my time in Italy and France. To Christopher Harshaw I also owe particular thanks for his friendly encouragement and helpful evaluation of the text. I am also indebted to Dr Michael Dillbeck and Dr Walter Moelk for their interest, advice and encouragement from the point of view of Maharishi's Vedic Approach to Health.

While in Paris I was fortunate indeed to meet authorities in the field of eating regulation, and I wish to express my appreciation to Professors John Blundell, Kent Berridge, James Gibbs, Simon Thornton, Didier Chapelot, Hans-Rudolf Berthoud, Michael Hermanussen, Charlotte Erlanson-Albertsson, Ruth Harris and David Levitsky for their interest and encouragement, and also the organisers of the Society for the Study of Ingestive Behaviour for arranging their annual conference in such a way that members could meet in a friendly and informal manner.

I wish also to express my gratitude to the staff at Hillmorton Medical Centre. Jo, Therese, Debbie, Allan and Wendy have been patient and understanding beyond the call of duty. My sincere thanks go also to my business partner Cathy Allison who took the brunt of the administration, and Vinod Singh and Marise Brice who ably tended to my patients in my absence. Without such competent and self-reliant staff and colleagues I could not have completed this thesis.

A project such as this could not be accomplished without exceptionally strong home support. I am forever indebted to my wife Sally for her loving forbearance and for her help as a sounding board and foil to some of my more far-flung ideas. My thanks go also to our three children Cris, Holly and Toby.

Lastly and most importantly I would like to express my enduring gratitude to the late Maharishi Mahesh Yogi, whose unfathomably deep wisdom has been a guiding light to me for almost 40 years and whose insights first inspired me to become interested in how people could be helped to better health, easily and without strain, by regulating their eating.

Abstract

How humans regulate eating and why regulation fails in many people is not well understood. Obesity has reached unprecedented proportions. Diabetes and heart disease are among a range of illnesses associated with excessive caloric intake and poor energy balance.

A theory of food regulation is proposed within a paradigm sufficiently broad to encompass and integrate mind and body. The theory states that homeostatic eating occurs when the pleasure of eating fulfils the desire to eat. It is suggested that absent, unrecognised or misinterpreted eating sensations represent missing key afferent information in homeostatic eating such that eating is not fully pleasurable for some people. Externally oriented attention and recoded perception may account for the non-recognition of key eating sensations.

The theory offers an explanation as to why so-called normal eaters may suffer from disorders ranging from coronary artery disease to autoimmune diseases. The theory predicts that relatively simple means could alleviate many such diseases and suggests how to test this prediction. If upheld, the theory could assist people to maintain their own well being and could help to prevent and treat some of the major scourges of Western society.

Contents

A Consideration of Homeostatic Regulation of Eating from the Perspective of Maharishi Vedic Science	i
Acknowledgments	ii
Abstract	iv
PART 1	xi
Fundamental Considerations	xi
Chapter 1 Introduction	2
1.1 How the writer came to the field	6
1.1.1 The subjective approach	12
1.2 Why this thesis is theoretical	15
1.3 Synopsis: The thesis at a glance	16
Chapter 2 Objective and method	18
2.1 Objective.....	18
2.2 Method.....	18
2.3 Notes on presentation and style	21
Chapter 3 The Mind-Body Problem: In search of a paradigm.....	23
Introduction	23
Definition and discussion of the term paradigm	26
Why not remain within the current paradigm?	28
Does the theory stand or fall on acceptance of the new paradigm?	29
The Problem	29
3.1 Dualistic solutions	33
3.1.1 Interventionalism (Interactionism).....	33
3.1.2 Occasionalism	34
3.1.3 Parallelism	34
3.1.4 Pragmatic Parallelism	35
3.1.5 Dualism assessed	36
3.2 Monism - materialism.....	36
3.2.1 19 th Century materialism.....	37
3.2.2 20 th century materialism in psychology - behaviourism	38
3.2.3 20 th century materialism in philosophy.....	39
3.2.4 Materialism assessed	43
3.3 Monism - idealism	43
3.3.1 17 th century - Berkeley.....	45
3.3.2 Mind-stuff theory.....	46
3.3.3 Introspectionism	47
3.3.4 Idealism assessed	48
3.4 Monism - Dual aspect theory.....	48
3.4.1 17 th Century dual aspect theory	48
3.4.2 19 th Century dual aspect theory	49
3.4.3 20 th Century dual aspect theory	51
3.4.4 21 st Century dual aspect theory.....	52
3.4.5 Quantum physics	59
3.4.6 Dual aspect monism assessed	61
3.4.7 Phenomenology	62
3.4.8 Limits of cognition	64
3.5 Conclusion to Chapter 3	66
Chapter 4 Maharishi Vedic Science, a consciousness based paradigm	67
Introduction	67
4.1 Pure consciousness	68
4.1.1 As simplest state of consciousness	71
4.1.2 Transcending thought	72
4.1.3 Transcendental Meditation compared to other techniques.....	74
4.1.4 The literature on Transcendental Meditation	75
4.2 From the inside out: Implications of MVS	78
4.2.1 Overcoming the combination problem	79
4.2.2 Pleasure integral to the universe	88
4.2.3 The Universe is integrated. The Unified Field Chart.....	89

4.2.4 The mind according to the MVS.....	90
4.2.5 Reality depends upon point of view.....	93
4.3 Unity Consciousness.....	95
4.4 MVS assessed.....	99
4.5 Conclusion to Chapter 4.....	103
Chapter 5 Is food intake regulated?.....	104
Introduction.....	104
5.1 Self-regulation and Homeostasis.....	104
5.1.1 Stability and Adaptability.....	104
5.2 Self regulation - Can't be done.....	107
5.2.1 Argument from set point theory.....	107
5.2.2 Argument from evolutionary theory.....	111
5.3 Self- regulation – sometimes done.....	114
5.4 Self-regulation – can be done.....	117
5.5 Conclusion to Chapter 5.....	118
Chapter 6 A consciousness-based model of self-regulated eating.....	120
Introduction.....	120
6.1 Homeostasis can be expanded to include consciousness (and therefore pleasure).....	120
6.1.1 Information flow among hierarchical control systems.....	121
6.1.2 Purpose and desire in homeostasis.....	123
6.2 When is a system homeostatic?.....	125
6.2.1 Hallmarks of a homeostatic system.....	127
6.3 Pleasure-based homeostasis.....	131
6.3.1 Fundamental nature of desire.....	132
6.3.2 A pleasure-output system of homeostatic food regulation.....	134
6.3.3 Desire best not suppressed.....	135
6.3.4 Fulfillment feeds back on desire.....	140
6.3.5 Homeostatic eating desires are those that are fulfilled by eating.....	141
6.4 Conclusion to Chapter 6.....	143
Chapter 7 Eating in response to stimuli not influenced by intake.....	144
Introduction.....	144
7.1 External stimuli over-ride internal stimuli.....	148
7.1.1 Obesity.....	148
7.1.2 Restraint theory and the boundary model of eating.....	155
7.2 Emotional factors obscure internal prompts.....	158
7.3 The significance of internal prompts is not innate knowledge and must be learnt.....	160
7.3.1 Anorexia nervosa.....	162
7.3.2 Eating in the absence of hunger.....	165
7.4 The significance of internal prompts is innate knowledge but is forgotten during childhood.....	167
7.4.1 Intuitive eating.....	171
7.5 Conclusion to Chapter 7.....	173
PART 2.....	175
The Theory: Externally oriented attention and recoded perception mean that eating is not fully pleasurable for some people. Hence some people eat non-homeostatically.....	175
Chapter 8 What is hunger?.....	176
Introduction.....	176
Hunger vs satiety.....	178
8.1 “Hunger” has been a conflation of sensation and desire.....	179
8.1.1 Sensation and desire in the Vedic context.....	179
8.1.2 Emotions and sensations in historical context.....	180
8.2 “Hunger as sensation” – a historical review.....	193
8.2.1 Subjective reports.....	195
8.2.2 Peripheral or central origin of hunger?.....	201
8.2.3 Lassitude and weakness.....	208
8.2.4 Perception and reporting of hunger.....	210
8.2.5 Questionnaires.....	216
8.2.6 Rating scales: The “black box”.....	223
8.2.7 Limitations of hunger ratings.....	232
8.3 Classification of hunger, satiety and the key eating sensations.....	236

8.3.1 Summary	237
8.3.2 The empty hollow sensation (EHS)	238
8.3.3 The VEHS	242
8.3.4 Timing in homeostasis	243
8.3.5 Indicators of intestinal dysfunction.....	251
8.3.6 Satiety	251
8.3.7 The “rumbling tummy” - borborygmi.....	252
8.3.8 Inanition.....	253
8.3.9 Thirst.....	255
8.4 Conclusion to Chapter 8	257
Chapter 9 Eating desires	259
Introduction	259
9.1 Desire to eat	259
9.1.1 Wanting and liking	261
9.1.2 Palatability	261
9.1.3 Alliesthesia	264
9.1.4 Enhanced eating pleasures during the EHS	267
9.2 An expanded pleasure-based regulatory system	268
9.2.1 Anticipatory and consummatory components to the eating-related desires.....	268
9.2.2 Knowing when to stop.....	270
9.3 Conclusion to Chapter 9	275
Chapter 10 Inner directed attention favours pleasurable (homeostatic) eating.....	277
Introduction	277
10.1 High excitation and low excitation pleasure reviewed	279
10.1.1 Transcendental Meditation and low mental arousal.....	282
10.2 Food craving, “attachment” and addiction.....	283
10.2.1 The excitement treadmill	283
10.2.2 Associative conditioning in overeating	288
10.2.3 Wanting dissociated from liking.....	291
10.2.4 Clarification of desire	295
10.3 Arousal alliesthesia: Low, moderate and high excitation foods.....	300
10.3.1 Low excitation (LE) foods	301
10.3.2 Moderate excitation (ME) foods.....	302
10.3.3 High excitation (HE) foods.....	303
10.3.4 The “cardboard effect”	306
10.3.5 Automatic eating and “overshooting”.....	307
10.4 Relationship to depression and anorexia.....	308
10.5 Conclusion to Chapter 10. Why some people eat in a non-homeostatic manner	310
Chapter 11 Existing evidence that Transcendental Meditation and the EHS support energy balance.....	312
Introduction	312
Transcendental Meditation	312
The EHS meal pattern.....	312
11.1 Ciampolini’s studies	313
11.1.1 Mayer’s glucostatic hypothesis.....	315
11.1.2 Implications of the inside-looking-out approach	320
11.1.3 Metabolic outcome: evidence for improved homeostasis and efficient digestion	322
11.1.4 Is glucose a hunger marker?	325
11.1.5 Subjective symptoms provide best homeostatic feedback	329
11.2 Chapelot, Marmonier et al.	330
11.3 Intuitive eating	332
11.4 Illustrative cases	334
11.4.1 Crohn’s disease	334
11.4.2 Graves’ disease	338
11.5 Conclusion to Chapter 11	340
Chapter 12 Recoded experience vs. “seeing what is there”	342
Introduction	342
12.1 The Vedic “lifespan model”	342
12.1.1 Adverse effects of dominant intellect	347
12.2 Attention, inattentive blindness, premature closure and misattribution.....	349

12.2.1 Recoding	351
12.2.2 Use of the word “see”	352
12.2.3 Illustrative dialogues	352
12.2.4 Inattentional blindness	355
12.2.5 Automaticity	358
12.2.6 Premature closure	359
12.3 Learning how to “see”	360
12.4 Prevalence of impaired awareness of internal eating cues - the continuum hypothesis of eating disorders	362
12.5 Conclusion to Chapter 12	363
Conclusion to Part 2	364
PART 3	365
Implications	365
Chapter 13 Hypotheses and predictions	366
Introduction	366
13.1 The hypotheses	367
13.1.1 That the EHS meal pattern (EHSMP) yields improved measures of homeostatic eating.	367
13.1.2 That the regular practice of Transcendental Meditation yields improved measures of homeostatic eating.	367
13.2 The Predictions and their implications	368
13.2.1 Greater eating pleasure	368
13.2.2 Alleviation of illness and regulation of energy parameters.....	369
13.3 General research implications	376
13.4 Conclusion to Chapter 13	379
Chapter 14 Testing the predictions	381
Introduction	381
14.1 Independent variables	381
14.1.1 Regular practice of Transcendental Meditation	381
14.1.2 The EHSMP	382
14.1.3 The Author’s clinical method	384
14.2 Dependent variables:	394
14.2.1 Eating pleasure.....	394
14.2.2 Health.....	394
14.3 Controls	396
14.4 Conclusion to Chapter 14	396
Chapter 15 Limitations, objections and responses.....	397
Chapter 16 Summary and Conclusion	427
16.1.1 What was already known	427
16.1.2 What had been overlooked	428
16.1.3 What could not be known	428
16.1.4 What this thesis has added	428
16.1.5 Significance to Public Health	429
16.2 Final word.....	429

Table of Charts

Chart 1 Non-homeostatic causes of wanting to eat.....	146
Chart 2 Eating-related sensations and emotions	192
Chart 3 Pleasure, anticipatory and consummatory, associated with the EHS.....	269
Chart 4 Summary of the significance of the hunger-related sensations and emotions.....	276
Chart 5 LE, ME and HE foods in the presence and absence of EHS or low mental arousal	306
Chart 6 Materialistic principles vs. MVS principles.....	403

Table of Figures

Figure 1 Synopsis: The thesis at a glance	17
Figure 2 Shiva's circle of constructivist enquiry	19
Figure 3 Chalmers' theory of consciousness as dualism	53
Figure 4 Chalmers' theory of consciousness as dual aspect theory	54
Figure 5 Chalmers' theory of consciousness as dual aspect theory	58
Figure 6 The "bubble diagram"	73
Figure 7 Samhita, Rishi, Devata and Chandas.....	85
Figure 8 The process of elaboration	86
Figure 9 Consciousness in the process of elaboration	86
Figure 10 The process of simplification	87
Figure 11 Layers of the mind	91
Figure 12 MVS as conforming to idealism	93
Figure 13 MVS as conforming to dual aspect theory	94
Figure 14 Relationship between Samhita "Self" and ego "self".....	98
Figure 15 Homeostatic eating desires are those that are fulfilled by eating	141
Figure 16 Non-homeostatic eating desire is not fulfilled by eating food.....	142
Figure 17 The Boundary Model of Eating.....	156
Figure 18 Boundary Model of Eating showing diet boundary.....	156
Figure 19 Anorexic patient pre-treatment	163
Figure 20 The same anorexic patient after "treatment".....	164
Figure 21 A bulimic patient	164
Figure 22 Information flow in eating regulation	177
Figure 23 Stomach contractions during hunger pangs.....	202
Figure 24 Stimuli to the desire to eat	260
Figure 25 Eating in response to the EHS.....	273
Figure 26 Eating in the absence of the EHS	274
Figure 27 The excitement treadmill	284
Figure 28 Core affect.....	285
Figure 29 Distorting effect of HE food.....	305
Figure 30 Estimation of blood glucose by hunger sensations.....	314
Figure 31 C- reactive protein, Mr B.B.....	337
Figure 32 Thyroid function Mrs JV	339
Figure 33 Levels of the mind in relation to periods of development according to Maharishi's Vedic Science	343

Appendices

Appendix 1 A summary of the main argument of the thesis

Appendix 2 Research Publications on Transcendental Meditation 1970–2009

Appendix 3 A Unified Field Chart for Psychology

List of abbreviations:

ACC	Anterior cingulate cortex
BMI	Body mass index
CR	Conditioned response
CRP	C-reactive protein
CS	Conditioned stimulus
CSS	Comfortable, satisfied sensation
EHS	Empty hollow sensation
EHSMP	Empty hollow sensation meal pattern
ESR	Erythrocyte sedimentation rate
g/dL	Grams per deciliter
GE	Goûter eaters
H. pylori	Helicobacter pylori
HE	High excitation
IH	Initial hunger
IHMP	Initial hunger meal pattern
LE	Low excitation
ME	Medium excitation
mIU/L	Milli international units per litre
mmol/L	Millimoles per litre
MVS	Maharishi Vedic Science
NGE	Non-goûter eaters
NGNSE	Non-goûter non snack eaters
NGSE	Non-goûter snack eaters
pmol/L	Picomoles per litre
STR	Sensitivity to reward
UR	Unconditioned response
US	Unconditioned stimulus
VEHS	Vitiated empty hollow sensation