



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the [Library Thesis Consent Form](#) and [Deposit Licence](#).

Note : Masters Theses

The digital copy of a masters thesis is as submitted for examination and contains no corrections. The print copy, usually available in the University Library, may contain corrections made by hand, which have been requested by the supervisor.

**ASSESSING GENDER IN THE CONSTRUCTION OF
SCOTTISH IDENTITY, *c.* 1286–*c.* 1586**

MICHELLE ANN SMITH

**A THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY, THE UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND,
2010.**

Assessing Gender in the Construction of Scottish Identity, *c. 1286-c. 1586*

Abstract

Drawing on insights from gender studies, postcolonial theory, and debates around nation and identity this thesis offers a new reading of selected medieval and sixteenth-century Scottish histories and literature and focuses on the intersection of gender and Scottish identity. Historical and theoretical scholarship has shown that power and identity formation are complicit in the construction of both gender and nation, yet are usually discussed as separate entities. Moreover, theorists of nation argue the concept of ‘nation’ is a modern construct that has no history prior to the late eighteenth century. Therefore, by ignoring the rigid periodisation given to the study of the nation and identity I demonstrate a Scottish identity existed between *c. 1286* and *c. 1586*, one that was underpinned by gender ideologies.

Scottish historians have recently acknowledged the paucity of writings on medieval and early modern Scottish national identity and culture from a gendered perspective. Using gender as a tool of historical analysis uncovers the multiple dimensions that make people and institutions what they are, giving them meaning. People and institutions are informed and guided by relationships of power and a gendered analysis provides a framework where one can examine and understand the cultural and social relationships people had with the religious and political institutions that governed them. This thesis examines foundation myths, kingship, heroes and heroines, and personifications of the land to illuminate the complexities of gender existing in the primary texts. All the chapters question the singularity of a hegemonic masculinity which was perceived as the norm and excluded women, the feminine and ‘other’ men. By challenging traditional power relationships this thesis demonstrates that images and languages of gender helped construct and inform medieval and sixteenth-century Scottish identities. This research will provide a fresh and innovative look at gender and nation, going beyond archival facts and demonstrating that the historical literature exposes changing cultural and ideological definitions of masculinities and femininities.

Dedication

Brian Murray

6 May 1944 - 20 April 2005

This thesis is dedicated to the memory of my Dad, Brian Murray who saw me begin this journey but sadly did not see the end result due to his sudden and unexpected death. The belief he had in me, and that my PhD dream was possible, kept me going during the long hours of researching and writing.

Acknowledgements

I have a huge list of people to thank for the support, advice, and encouragement given to me throughout the last four years. Firstly I want to thank my supervisor, Dr Kim Phillips who suggested this thesis should be written, and whose encouragement and belief in my ability to achieve this goal was unflinching. Secondly, to my co-supervisor, Dr Lindsay Diggelmann for his encouragement and help when I got stuck with Latin translations, and who will probably be glad never to have to read my overly-lengthy drafts ever again! I am eternally grateful to have had the support and friendship of both of you during this whole incredible journey.

To Professor Elizabeth Ewan, University of Guelph, Canada my sincere appreciation and thanks are extended to you for the invaluable advice, chapter drafts, conference papers, and patience with my never-ending questions. To Dr Anke Bernau (Manchester), Dr Jocelyn Wogan-Browne (York), Dr Julia Crick (Exeter), Dr Katie Stevenson (St Andrews), and Dr Nicola Royan (Nottingham) I am extremely grateful to you for your advice, information, conference papers, and chapter drafts. Thank you also to Olive Geddes, Joseph Marshall and their teams at the National Library of Scotland for their help during both my research trips to Edinburgh. My thanks are also extended to the many people who helped me considerably on my visits to the Edinburgh University Library, British Library, National Archives of Scotland, Bodleian Library, and Cambridge University Library. Finally, thank you to the University of Auckland, the department of History, NZ Federation for Graduate Women, Jubilee Trust, Education NZ, and ANZAMEMS for their financial assistance during the course of my research.

To Lisa Hawes: thank you for being a great friend, fellow medievalist, and departmental room-mate. The sharing of ideas, friendship, constructive criticism, and grammatical/stylistic help were invaluable and thank you seems a meagre platitude; just know it is sincerely appreciated.

To Mara Bebich and Elinor Harris: thank you for reading and commenting on lengthy chapter drafts, and for your friendship and support.

To my university friends: Jennie Oakley, Charlotte Burgess, Simon Thode, Kerryn Olsen, Toby Harper, Brent Habgood, Scott Morgan, Mindy and Sukayna Al-Aaraji, Susan Murray (Guelph), Kate Ash (Manchester) and Kylie Murray (Oxford) thank you all for your friendship and support – your encouragement kept me sane!

Thank you also to Professor Barry Reay, Associate-Professor Malcolm Campbell, Dr Jennifer Frost, Barbara, and Nisha from the History Department for your advice, support and understanding, and for the opportunities the department has offered me over the past four years.

To Caroline, Zarah, Kat, Liz, Maria, Polly, Stephen and Annette, Lewis T., Michael and Karen, Gwyn, Christina and Lewis (especially Lewis for all the interesting discussions driving to/from university) thank you for your support, friendship, sanity, and endless encouragement. To all my other friends too numerous to mention – thank you for being so supportive and understanding, especially when I was too busy writing to be social.

To Mum, Darren, Nancy, Carole, and the rest of my family (immediate and extended) thank you for your love, support and understanding during the last four years, and even the feigned interest in what I was working on. Thank you to my Scottish families for their hospitality during my research trips home – especially uncle Iain, aunt Nan, and Andrew who not only made my trips home memorable, who looked after me so well and did not mind traipsing around old palaces, ruined abbeys and libraries.

And finally to my wonderful husband Blair for your love, patience, and support over the past four years. For letting a third party into our marriage, for challenging me and my ideas, for the proof-reading, photocopying, cooking, glasses of wine and cuddles when required, and the running around after me, I will be profoundly and eternally grateful.

Table of Contents

Title Page		
Abstract		ii
Dedication		iii
Acknowledgements		iv
Table of Contents		vi
INTRODUCTION		1
Chapter 1	HAMMERING SCOTLAND: THE FORGING OF MEDIEVAL AND SIXTEENTH-CENTURY SCOTTISH IDENTITY	24
Chapter 2	‘THE WHOLE OF SCOTLAND IS NAMED AFTER THE WOMAN SCOTA’: GENDERING SCOTLAND’S ORIGIN MYTHS	80
Chapter 3	VIRGINS, ADULTERERS, AND USELESS KINGS: GENDERED PERCEPTIONS OF THE SCOTTISH MONARCHY	130
Chapter 4	SUBVERSIVE MEN, MANLY WOMEN AND A HERO IN DRAG: GENDER-BENDING SCOTTISH IDENTITY	187
Chapter 5	‘A WEDOW IN DISTRES’: PERSONIFYING SCOTLAND	229
CONCLUSION		293
Bibliography		298