



Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand). This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.
<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library [Thesis Consent Form](#)

**Confronting Barriers to Ecological Information Transfer in
New Zealand's Fisheries Management System: Towards
Developing a Trajectory for Trans-disciplinary Inquiry**

Edwin John Massey

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of
Philosophy in geography

School of Geography and Environmental Science
University of Auckland

September 2005

Abstract

Confronting Barriers to Ecological Information Transfer in New Zealand's Fisheries Management System: Towards Developing a Trajectory for Trans-disciplinary Inquiry

This thesis confronts barriers to ecological information transfer in New Zealand's fisheries management system. The investigation reveals a wider problematic within the governmental institutions of the fisheries milieu. The thesis deploys Callon's (1991) concept of translation to ask new questions regarding the conduct of fisheries science and management, which since the introduction of the Quota Management System in 1986, has been defined through the practices of commercial stakeholder groups. These stakeholders enrol ecological information through a narrowly defined and non-reflexive discourse of sustainable utilisation to serve specific purposes that suit their own needs. The thesis uses imaginaries to illustrate how sustainable utilisation has marginalised those stakeholders with different views on how ecological information could be used in fisheries management decision making. Moreover, the thesis contends that the milieu's hegemonic ontological environment prevents translation by mitigating the potential for dialogue between stakeholder groups.

The thesis engages with a wide range of literature and cuts through established modes of thinking, developing a trans-disciplinary discourse that re-conceptualises the fisheries management problematic in process terms. The thesis demonstrates how trans-disciplinary dialogue that might transcend the current impasses in the New Zealand fisheries milieu will only develop through a network of previously unconnected groups. The thesis proposes a series of policy and behavioural interventions aimed at shifting the existing hierarchies of power and realigning established networks to ensure such dialogue is possible.

Keywords: trans-disciplinary research, translation, network alignment, New Zealand, ecological information transfer, fisheries management.

Table of Contents

Chapter One - An ecosystems-approach to fisheries management: incorporating the social	1
Point of entry: why won't things move?	1
Broadening the scope of the thesis: a trans-disciplinary research focus	2
Multiple origins: a new type of research	3
A contribution to post structural geography: actor network approaches and the sociology of scientific knowledge	3
A heterogeneous definition of power	5
Mapping the knowledge network: a template for the research process	7
Bridging discursive divides	8
The thesis' key arguments	9
Thesis objectives	11
Ecosystems-approaches to fisheries management: what questions in which context?	11
A new set of questions?	13
The role of science and the importance of fisheries in New Zealand	15
The Fisheries Act 1996 and Fisheries 2010: developing a fisheries policy for the future	17
Marine research: a key aspect of fisheries management legislation	18
The changing role of the Ministry of Fisheries	19
The institutions responsible for marine research	20
Science service providers and the wider fisheries management milieu	21
Aspects of method: identifying positionalities	22
My role as researcher: reflexivity at a range of scales	23
Thesis outline	27
Chapter one	27
Chapter two	28
Chapter three	29
Chapter four	29
Chapter five	30
Chapter six	31
Chapter seven	32

Conclusion: assessing the contribution of the research	32
Chapter Two - Building a trans-disciplinary approach for investigating New Zealand's fisheries management	35
Introduction: new directions in fisheries management, interdisciplinary origins trans-disciplinary research	35
Applying the trans-disciplinary research approach	37
Reflexivity at a range of scales: linking theory and method	37
The structure of the literature review	40
New institutional economics: unravelling economic rationality	41
The development of 'natural' theorising	44
The elements of the first nature thesis	46
Developments in positivist science	47
The role of romantic poetry	48
The influence of ecological thinking	49
Ecological protest, bio-centricism and social anthropology	51
Re-assessing first nature: the status of the universal?	52
The production of nature	53
Critiquing the production of nature thesis	54
The role of context: moving the debate forward	55
A relational nature: the network phenomenon and the cultural turn in economic geography	57
Relational analyses of nature and the ecology metaphor: introducing a bio-physical element	58
Actor network theory	59
Formal and informal communication: context dependency, multiple rationalities and trust	60
Critiquing the network approach	62
Post-structural political economy	64
Post structural research: a new orthodoxy in theoretical investigation?	65
Bringing together the theoretical literature: a first step in building a new discourse of inquiry	67
Trans-disciplinary inquiry: process based research with an interventionist agenda	68
The methodological tools of a case study approach	69
Revisiting reflexivity	72
Who to interview: where and why?	74

Conclusion: an expanding theoretical scope for trans-disciplinary investigation in fisheries	78
Chapter Three - Competing discourses: fisheries management debates	81
Introduction: new combinations in the management discourse?	81
The equilibrium paradigm	82
The progressive challenge to the equilibrium paradigm	83
The changing rationale of fisheries science: the ecological challenge to the progressive paradigm	85
The philosophical basis of change	87
Stock assessment models: abstracting the behaviour of fish populations	89
The environmental affects of fishing	91
An ecosystems-approach to management: the only way forward?	94
Marine resource economics, H. Scott Gordon and the economic theory of a common property resource	96
An evolving discourse	99
An epitaph for maximum sustainable yield?	100
Fisheries management strategies: misapplying the tragedy of the commons	102
Preventing the tragedy? Competing modes of regulations in fisheries	104
Rights-based management: ideological construct or the ideal solution?	108
A further misappropriation of the tragedy: rights-based approaches to co-management arrangements?	111
The problem of epistemological difference	116
Fisheries science: informed prediction or a pragmatic response to management requirements?	117
Alternative approaches to guiding management decision making	118
Conclusion: shaping the future form of fisheries management discourse	120
Chapter Four - Re-regulation in New Zealand: the implications for fisheries management and science	125
Introduction: economic social and scientific reform, a new rationale for governing	125
A regulatory history of New Zealand fisheries management	127
Government control of the fishery: clashing ideals of development and conservation	128
A pre-cursor for change? The establishment of the 200-mile Exclusive Economic Zone (EEZ)	130
The 1980s: a fishery in crisis	132

Fisheries Management Plans and output-based control: inconsistent fisheries policy	134
The Quota Management System: sustainability, efficiency equity and ease of administration?	135
Fisheries Management since QMS: assessment and further developments	139
The reintroduction of fisheries plans	140
Environmental governance and fisheries re-regulation	142
Oceans Policy: the 'public good' and the value of scientific research	144
The origins of corporate governance: economic social and scientific reform	145
A history of fisheries science service provision	146
Ideological change: new theories of public management	149
The science reforms: a three phase process	151
Collaborative research: the new norm	154
Corporate governance: cost recovery and the objectivity of marine research	155
Collaborative research: industry sponsored science and scientific objectivity	156
The objectivity/subjectivity dualism in science	158
Conclusion: re-regulation of the state, corporate governance in New Zealand marine management and science service provision	161
Chapter Five - Fisheries science and fisheries management: confused ideals, contention and ambiguities in process	165
Introduction: mapping the fisheries management process	165
The target of investigation: the fisheries science/management milieu	166
The scope of the network	168
The role of the key institutions in New Zealand's fisheries management: SEAFIC, MFISH and NIWA	169
The Seafood Industry Council	170
The Ministry of Fisheries	171
National Institute of Water and Atmospheric Research	175
Information transfer and the policy process: mapping power relations in New Zealand fisheries management	177
The role of key individuals in facilitating information transfer	182
Jonathan Peacey: chief policy analyst, Ministry of Fisheries	183
Kevin Stokes: chief scientist, Seafood Industry Council	186
Daryl Sykes: executive officer, Rock Lobster Industry Council	188
A NIWA scientist: a collage approach	190

Placing the NIWA scientist and science manager	191
Knowledge requirements for marine management: random sampling, uncertain data and a precautionary approach	196
The limits of knowledge: enshrined in legislation	199
Uncertainty in practice: the case of the scampi fishery	200
The wrong point of engagement: ministerial correspondence and conflicting positionalities	206
The environmental consequences of misunderstanding: the questionable state of the SCI2 fishery	209
Scampi management area six: misunderstanding, conflicting intentions and rancour	212
The scampi enquiry: the institutional culture of New Zealand fisheries management called into question	217
New Zealand fisheries management: frustrated people, a frustrating process	219
Cognitive barriers to communication: conflicting aspirations, ego, personality, embarrassment and competition	221
The implications of scientific debate: sowing the seeds of distrust	222
Research as currency: the consultant's dilemma	224
Scientific objectivity and contractual relations: the key source of tension	226
Stakeholder positionality and specific cognitive systems	228
Misunderstanding positionality: a barrier to information transfer	230
Competing expectations: conflicting ideals	234
The unbending will of self made 'men': preventing cooperation in New Zealand's marine management?	237
Conclusions: ideology, ideals, intentions and actions-constituting barriers to information transfer	238
Chapter Six – Ecological information transfer and sustainable utilisation: power relations in the fisheries science/management milieu	243
Introduction: corporate governance and sustainable utilisation imagined conceptions of sustainable fishing?	243
Power relations: defining the practices of knowledge exchange	245
The Fisheries Act 1996: the centrepiece of the management debate	246
Single species stock assessment: the cognitive construct of commercial stakeholders	250
The debate at an impasse: sustainability as governmentality	252
Defiance, inflexibility, deliberate ignorance and despair: the mitigation of alternatives	255

Ecosystems-approaches to fisheries management: a dialogue of knowns and unknowns	258
A clash of values surrounding ecosystems-approaches to management	262
A lack of objectives and conflicting values: procrastination and New Zealand's still born Ocean's Policy	264
Assumption based inquiry: scampi stock assessments	266
The status quo: commercial dominance and the extractive focus of marine management	270
Frustrating sustainable fisheries: fisheries imaginaries, the QMS and sustainable utilisation	271
Building the dominant imaginary through calculative practice	272
Entrenching the imaginary: visual representations of data, indicators and population modelling	274
Incomplete knowledge: the implications for regime change	277
The political and anti-political effects of calculative practice in New Zealand's fisheries management	279
The dominant imaginary: theory, rhetoric and practice	280
Marine resource economics: theorising sustainable fisheries	281
The rhetoric that sustains the QMS	283
Welcomes, websites and working groups: practices informing 'sustainable utilisation'	286
Conferences: preaching to the (un)-converted	287
Advertising the imaginary: sustainable utilisation as a marketing tool	287
Quota setting meetings: <i>a fait accompli</i> ?	288
The environmental affects of fishing: bully tactics, misunderstanding and the threat of litigation	290
New environmental policy: litigation waiting to happen?	291
SEAFIC submissions on draft policy documents	292
The limits of the current order	294
Conclusions: barriers to information transfer towards a trajectory for development	296
Chapter Seven – A trajectory for developing a trans-disciplinary approach to the management of complex marine systems	301
Introduction: possibilities for a trans-disciplinary future?	301
Why things won't move? Where to next for ecological information transfer?	303
(No longer) lost in translation: flexible governance, navigating a path to improved ecological information transfer	304

Governance relationships: the conduct of conduct and a trans-disciplinary management future	307
Fisheries management as people management: re-examining governance as a management strategy	308
Institutional challenges to existing management organisations	311
NIWA's institutional challenges	311
MFISH's institutional challenges	314
SEAFIC's institutional challenges	316
What now what next? Recommendations for attitudinal and institutional change	318
(1) <i>A values stock take</i>	319
(2) <i>A conceptual refocus</i>	320
(3) <i>Replacing sustainable utilisation with a 'well managed' fishery</i>	321
(4) <i>New criteria to deal with uncertainty: reworking section 10 of the Fisheries Act 1996</i>	322
(5) <i>New institutional arrangements: an integrated management committee</i>	322
(6) <i>Management Strategy Evaluation</i>	325
(7) <i>An increased emphasis on collaborative research</i>	326
(8) <i>Broadening the expertise of New Zealand's fisheries management personnel</i>	328
Conclusion: changing stakeholders' expectations of marine management	329
A first step in developing trans-disciplinary inquiry in fisheries	331
Bibliography	337
Cited works	337
Electronic sources	362
Personal communications	362
Glossary of acronyms	364

Table of Figures

Figure 1.0:	New Zealand's Exclusive Economic Zone showing Fisheries Management Areas	16
Figure 3.0:	A schematic representation of trophic interaction	93
Figure 3.1:	Objectives for developing a trajectory for sustainable ecosystems	96
Figure 3.2:	The Gordon-Schaefer model	100
Figure 4.0:	New Zealand's fisheries management regimes 1840-present day	128
Figure 4.1:	Research investment by sector 1968-1982 (\$NZ million 1980)	148
Figure 5.0:	A schematic representation of the quota setting process	178
Figure 5.1:	Quota Management Areas for scampi	202
Figure 5.2:	Total landings, catch limit and catch rate of scampi in SCI2 by fishing year	210
Figure 5.3:	The SCI6A/SCI6B border	213
Figure 5.4:	the assumed progression between ideals, intentions and decision making	239
Figure 5.5:	The actual progression between ideals intentions and decision making	239
Figure 6.0:	Purpose of section 8 of the Fisheries Act 1996	247
Figure 6.1:	Taxonomy of the "sustainability debate"	249
Figure 6.2:	Sustainability as governmentality	253
Figure 6.3:	The known/unknown matrix	260
Figure 6.4:	Sustainable utilisation, the dominant imaginary	281
Figure 7.0:	Current management arrangements: linking profit, representation and control	335
Figure 7.1:	An alternate future under integrated management: Breaking the link between profit, representation and control	335

Acknowledgements

- **Christine Kay Massey:** My mother, for her strength, her resilience, her unconditional love and her support of my education over the last decade;
- **Dr Lauran Edwin Massey:** My father, his academic achievements, teaching ability and communication skills are a constant source of inspiration;
- **Professor Richard Le Heron:** My supervisor, his insight, guidance and professionalism have been an essential part of this research;
- **Aveshni Reddy:** From near and afar, her love, her understanding and support have been impossible to quantify;
- **The late Anne Knox Gillies:** My grandmother, for teaching me that in my education I can set my own limits;
- **Eugene Rees:** A fellow student of fisheries and my erstwhile travel companion, his unflagging energy and willingness to share his insights on fish related matters were of great assistance;
- **Dr Hamish Rennie and Dr Simon Thrush:** My co-supervisors, for the contributions they made to my thesis;
- **Jonathan Peacey and Dr Martin Cryer:** Two key respondents, for their time, feedback, interest and critique;
- **Murray Bruges:** A fellow student of fisheries, for his assistance and willingness to share ideas and material; and
- **The Institute of Aquatic and Atmospheric Sciences:** For three years of vital funding, without which, the research would not have been possible.