



<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz>

ResearchSpace@Auckland

Copyright Statement

The digital copy of this thesis is protected by the Copyright Act 1994 (New Zealand).

This thesis may be consulted by you, provided you comply with the provisions of the Act and the following conditions of use:

- Any use you make of these documents or images must be for research or private study purposes only, and you may not make them available to any other person.
- Authors control the copyright of their thesis. You will recognise the author's right to be identified as the author of this thesis, and due acknowledgement will be made to the author where appropriate.
- You will obtain the author's permission before publishing any material from their thesis.

To request permissions please use the Feedback form on our webpage.

<http://researchspace.auckland.ac.nz/feedback>

General copyright and disclaimer

In addition to the above conditions, authors give their consent for the digital copy of their work to be used subject to the conditions specified on the Library Thesis Consent Form.

**Robert Goodin's Green Theory of Value and the Politics
of Fishing and the Aquatic Environment in New
Zealand**

**An explanation as to how and why fisheries-related policy fails to meet
Goodin's public policy and moral criteria for the maintenance of
natural resources**

by Lance Pickett

**Thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor
of Philosophy in Political Studies, University of Auckland, August 2001**

UNIVERSITY OF ALABAMA
- - BRP 2801
1981

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank, in the first instance, Professor Hugh Laracy, of the History Department, University of Auckland, for suggesting that I take my original idea for a political history of fishing in New Zealand to the Political Studies Department!

Next, I would like to express my undying gratitude to Associate Professor Steve Hoadley of the Political Studies Department, for making me feel welcome and suggesting that I examine policymaking in the fishing arena. My thanks to Professor Barry Gustafson, for recommending an extension of deadline when ill health threatened to terminate the project, and to Doctor Tim Tenbenschel for providing vital supervisory advice during its latter stages. My warmest thanks, too, to Doctor Alan Simpson, Senior Lecturer, Department of Political Science and Public Policy, Pro Dean (Academic Planning) School of Social Sciences, University of Waikato, for his constructive demolition of the original submission.

My heartfelt thanks to the environmental groups, specifically, ECO, Forest & Bird, and Greenpeace. To Cath Wallace, Barry Weeber, and especially Nikki Searancke: thank you a thousand times.

My deepest appreciation for the unstinting assistance of Ms Kahu McClutchie of Treasury in offering unhindered access to files. My thanks to Mr M.F. Beardsell, Manager, MAF Publication Services; to Dr J.L. McKoy, Director MAF Fisheries Research; Mr R.I.K. Hart, Group Director, MAF Fisheries, and to all those personnel of the several other Government agencies who rendered assistance. My most sincere thanks to Ms Rosemary Windelov, Librarian, NZFIB, for, among other things, her unique understanding of the financial constraints within which a superannuitant war pensioner sailor student is forced to operate.

My thanks to those members of the fishing industry who responded to my letters, especially Mr Eric Barratt, former President, NZFIA; Mr Tony Craig, CEO, NZFCF; and Mr Peter Stevens, editor, *Seafood New Zealand*. My especial appreciation to Mr Maurice Ashby, long-serving member of the executive of the NZFCF, who visited me to state the fishers' case in forthright terms. My heartfelt thanks to Mr Bill Kirk, former editor, *New Zealand Fisherman*.

My thanks to the many Parliamentarians with whom I corresponded. All, with one notable exception, behaved graciously.

Finally, yet foremost, my eternal love and appreciation to Annette Maureen Pickett: bursar/critic/driver/secretary/companion/spouse.

Lance Pickett

Devonport

30 April 2000

ABSTRACT

The proposition of this thesis is that, policy and legislation pertaining to natural resources, specifically the fisheries and the aquatic environment of New Zealand, do not meet Robert Goodin's public policy and moral criteria for successful maintenance of such resources in accordance with his green theory of value. This proposition is derived from an assessment indicating a policy tradition in New Zealand resulting in failure to ensure ecological sustainability in accordance with this country's international obligations to biodiversity and futurity. This thesis urges change from the prevailing narrowly economic political agenda to one based upon Robert Goodin's green theory of value. Such a political agenda would be promoted by a third force over and above the traditional parties of the Left and Right, arguably, The Greens: the Green Party of Aotearoa New Zealand.

The argument for change is based upon an analysis of fisheries related policy and legislation in New Zealand to April 2000. The analysis is organised into successive historical periods, beginning with the arrival of the first Polynesians and ending with the outcome of the 1999 general election. These periods include the development of the common property subsistence fishery of the Maori and its commercial open access Pakeha successors, the institution of an export industry involving in turn delicensing, rationalization, privatization, corporatization, and the process of devolution of fisheries management to industry. It is argued the cumulative outcome is impoverishment of natural resources, the capitalization of Nature and the theft of the "people's right of fishery".

Goodin's green theory of value is carefully stated, developed, analyzed, and compared and contrasted with the prevailing economic argument. The validity and desirability of the green theory of value and the political agenda to which it gives rise is established. This political agenda is found similar to that of green parties. The political and social milieu in which The Greens must presently operate is analysed. Current environmental policy in general, and fisheries related policies in particular are analysed

and found incompatible with Goodin's criteria. The outcome of policies and legislation affecting aquatic ecosystems-maintenance is examined in case studies covering major fisheries and the aquatic environment, and found to be generally disastrous. Alternative policies are proffered, based upon a green political agenda arising from a philosophy similar to that explicated in Goodin's green theory of value.

CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgements	i
Abstract	ii
Contents	iv
Illustrations	vi
Abbreviations	viii
Glossary of Terms	xii
Introduction	1

PART ONE

Conception and Exposition

Chapter 1	Toward a Green Political Agenda	12
Chapter 2	The Policy Arena in New Zealand	54
Chapter 3	Environmental Policy in New Zealand	78

PART TWO

History, Experience and Current Fisheries Policy

Chapter 4	The Pre-European Period, The Licensing Era (1866-1961), and The Period of Delicensing and Encouragement (1961-1980)	100
Chapter 5	Retrenchment and Quotas (1980-1990)	135
Chapter 6	The Ascendancy of the Industry (1990-1996)	151
Chapter 7	The Privatization Net Closes: Fisheries Structural Reform and The Fisheries Bill 1994	171
Chapter 8	Policy Pertaining to Fisheries and the Aquatic Environment in the Wake of the Fisheries Act 1996 and into the New Millennium	195

PART THREE

Demonstration of Outcomes:

Five Case Studies

Chapter 9	The Inshore Fishery and the Snapper Saga	254
Chapter 10	The Mid-and-Deepwater Fisheries and the Orange Roughy Story	279
Chapter 11	Marine Protected Areas	314
Chapter 12	Charismatic Mega and Lesser Fauna and Men, or: Cetaceans, Pinnipeds, Seabirds, People and Politics	332
Chapter 13	The Aquatic Environment and Its Biota, Including Three Freshwater Fisheries	372

PART FOUR

Conclusion

Chapter 14	Summary and Conclusion	403
BIBLIOGRAPHY		418

ILLUSTRATIONS

(Sources in brackets)

- | | |
|---|-------------------|
| New Zealand EEZ and Quota Management Areas.
(MfE, <u>The State of New Zealand's Environment</u>) | end paper |
| "Open Seas No More".
(<u>National Geographic</u> , November 1995) | end paper |
| Skull and Crossbones
(Author's illustration) | end paper |
| Cartoon Comment on Financial Institutions and the corporate world.
(<u>TWARO News</u> , No. 35/5/96) | following page 41 |
| Cartoon comment on NZ Treasury Economists.
(Tom Scott, <u>The Evening Post</u> , 27 February 1996) | following p. 64 |
| Lake Ayson and Alfred Hefford.
(R.M. MacDowall, <u>New Zealand Freshwater Fishes</u>) | following p. 106 |
| Cartoon comment on trade in crayfish tails to US.
(Minhinnick, <u>New Zealand Herald</u> , 29 December 1948) | following p. 107 |
| Cartoon comment on Treaty of Waitangi (Fisheries Claims) Settlement Act 1992.
(Tom Scott, <u>Listener</u> , 10 June 1995) | following p. 146 |
| Graph showing decline in Hauraki Gulf/Bay of Plenty snapper populations.
(Ministry of Fisheries, 1997) | following p. 266 |
| Cartoon comment on industry's tendency to blame marine mammals for the world fisheries crisis.
(Adrian Raeside, <u>BBC Wildlife</u>) | following p. 356 |
| Cartoon comment on Sir Tepene O'Regan's bid for customary and commercial harvesting of marine mammals.
(Tom Scott, <u>The Evening Post</u> , 27 June 1993) | following p. 358 |
| The Tarawera River.
(Nicola Topping, <u>New Zealand Herald</u>) | following p. 373 |
| Cartoon comment on the environmental state of the planet.
(Roar Hagen, <u>Environment</u> , 38, 8, October 1996) | following p. 417 |
| Skull and Crossbones | end paper |

(Author's illustration)

"Harvesters of the High Seas".
(National Geographic, November 1995)

end paper

New Zealand EEZ and Quota Management Areas
(MfE, The State of New Zealand's Environment)

end paper

ABBREVIATIONS

AAB	Allocation Appeals Board
ACC	Administrative Committee for Coordination
ACE	Annual Catch Entitlement
ACT	Association of Consumers and Taxpayers
AFMA	Australian Fisheries Management Agency
AGM	Annual General Meeting
ANZUS	Australia, New Zealand and United States Military Alliance
ARA	Auckland Regional Authority
BDC	Biodiversity Convention
BIL	Brierley Investments Ltd
BRT	Business Roundtable
Bo	Virgin Biomass
BOPRC	Bay of Plenty Regional Council
CAFCA	Campaign Against Foreign Control of Aotearoa
CCAMLR	Commission for the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources
CBD	Convention on Biodiversity
CCMAU	Crown Company Monitoring and Audit Unit
CCSBT	Convention for the Conservation of Southern Bluefin Tuna
CE	Chief Executive
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CfE	Commissioner for the Environment. See also PCE
CFP	Common Fisheries Policy
CHH	Carter Holt Harvey
CPUE	Catch per unit of effort
CRI	Crown Research Institute
CSC	Cabinet Strategy Committee
CSD	Commission for Sustainable Development
CSIRO	Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation
CSPFFA	Convention on the South Pacific Forum Fisheries Agency
CSSC	Cabinet State Services Committee
DDT	Dichloro-Diphenyl-Trichloroethane
DoC	Department of Conservation
DoLS	Department of Lands and Survey
DPMC	Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet
DSSC	Deputy State Services Commissioner
ECA	Employment Contracts Act
ECNZ	Electricity Corporation of New Zealand
ECO	Environment and Conservation Organisations of New Zealand
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EFC	Exploratory Fishing Company
ENGO	Environmental Non-Governmental Organisation
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
EU	European Union
FA	Fisheries Authority
FAA	Forests Amendment Act
FAAQ	Fishing against another's quota
F&B	Forest and Bird

FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
FC	Fisheries Council
FFA	Fiordland Fishermen's Association
FFR	Freshwater Fisheries Regulations
FFV	Foreign Fishing Vessel
FIA	Fishing Industry Association
FIB	Fishing Industry Board
FLC	Fiordland Lobster Company
FMA	Fishstock Management Area
FMP	Fishing Management Plan
FoRST	Foundation for Research, Science and Technology
FPP	First Past the Post
FSROC	Fisheries Structural Reform Officials' Committee
FTR	Fisheries Task Force Report
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
G-G	Governor-General
HFMC	Hoki Fishery Management Company
HGMP	Hauraki Gulf Maritime Park
HSNO	Hazardous Substances and New Organisms
ICES	International Council for the Exploration of the Seas
ICFA	International Coalition of Fisheries Associations
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ILRWG	Iwi Legislative Review Working Group
INL	Independent Newspapers Ltd
IOI	International Ocean Institute
ITLOS	International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea
ITQ	Individual Transferable Quota
IWC	International Whaling Commission
JFV	Japanese Fishing Vessel
KRA	Key Result Area
LBMR	Long Bay Marine Reserve
LFA	Leigh Fishermen's Association
LGAA	Local Government Amendment Act
LMR	Leigh Marine Reserve
LOS	Law of the Sea
MAF	Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries
MAFCorp	Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries Administration
MAFFish	Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries, Fisheries Management
MAFQual	Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries Quality Management
MAFTech	Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries Research and Technology
MARPOL	International Marine Pollution Convention
MCY	Maximum Constant Yield
MDC	Marlborough District Council
MEY	Maximum Economic Yield
MFA	Maori Fisheries Act
MFAT	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade
MFC	Maori Fisheries Commission
MfE	Ministry for the Environment
MFish	Ministry of Fisheries

MK	Market Keynesian
MLS	Minimum Landing (or Legal) Size
MMP	Mixed Member Proportional
MMPA	Marine Mammals Protection Act
MoF	Ministry of Forests
MoMD	Ministry of Maori Development
MoRST	Ministry of Research Science and Technology
MP	Member of Parliament
MPA	Marine Protected Area
MRA	Marine Reserves Act
MSA	Maritime Safety Authority
MSY	Maximum Sustainable Yield
MScY	Maximum Social Yield
MTA	Marine Transport Act
MWD	Ministry of Works and Development
NAFMAC	National Fisheries Management Advisory Committee
NBR	National Business Review
NCD	National Development Council; Northland District Council
NFA	National Fisheries Agency
NFC	National Fisheries Council
NFMA	National Fisheries Management Agency
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NIWA	National Institute for Water and Atmospheric Research
NPM	New Public Management
NRLMG	National Rock Lobster Management Group
NSFIWG	Nonfish Species and Fisheries Interactions Working Group
NSFSMG	Northern Snapper Fisheries Strategic Management Group
NWASCO	National Water and Soil Conservation Organisation
NZ	New Zealand
NZAC	New Zealand Aquaculture Federation
NZFIA	New Zealand Fishing Industry Association
NZFCF	New Zealand Federation of Commercial Fishermen
NZFIB	New Zealand Fishing Industry Board
NZFIG	New Zealand Fishing Industry Guild
NZGFC	New Zealand Game Fishing Council
NZMSS	New Zealand Marine Sciences Society
NZRFC	New Zealand Recreational Fishing Council
NZRLC	New Zealand Rock Lobster Industry Council
NZSIB	New Zealand Seafood Industry Board
NZTLA	New Zealand Tuna Longliners Association
NZUA	New Zealand Underwater Associated
OIA	Official Information Act
ORMC	Orange Roughy Management Company
OSC	Officials' Steering Committee
OSP	Optimum Sustainable Population
PC	Privy Council
PCB	Polychlorinated biphenyl
PCE	Parliamentary Commissioner for the Environment. See also CfE
PGs	Progressive Greens
PIM	Pacem in Maribus

PKMR	Poor Knights Marine Reserve
PM	Prime Minister
PMR	Parinihi Marine Reserve
PPC	Primary Production Committee
PWD	Public Works Department
QAA	Quota Appeal Authority
QMS	Quota Management System
RFRWG	Recreational Fishing Rights Working Group
RM	Radical Monetarist
RMA	Resource Management Act
RNZAF	Royal New Zealand Air Force
RNZN	Royal New Zealand Navy
RRC	Regulations Review Committee
RSNZ	Royal Society of New Zealand
SDML	Seaward Defence Motor Launch
SDP	Social Democrat Party
SeaFIC	Seafood Industry Council
SILNA	South Island Landless Natives Act
SMA	Stock Management Area
SOE	State Owned Enterprise
SOP	Scientific Observer Programme/Supplementary Order Paper
SRA	Strategic Result Area
SSB	Sustainable Spawning Biomass
SSC	State Services Commission
STP	Strategic Transition Plan
TAC	Total Allowable Catch
TACC	Total Allowable Commercial Catch
TAG	Tocsins Awareness Group
TCBA	Tutukaka Charter Boat Association
TCE	Transaction-Cost Economics
TK	Traditional Keynesian
TM	Traditional Monetarism
ToW	Treaty of Waitangi
ToWFC	Treaty of Waitangi Fisheries Commission
TPK	Te Puni Kokiri
TLWCL	Timberlands West Coast Ltd
TV	Television
UMA	Urban Maori Authority
UN	United Nations
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCLOS	United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea
US	United States of America
WCED	World Conference on Economic Development
WCWA	West Coast Whitebaiters Association
WDSAC	Whangarei Deep Sea Anglers Club
WFC	Waitangi Fisheries Commission
WT	Waitangi Tribunal
WUM	Wise Use Movement
WWK	Whale Watch Kaikoura
WWF NZ	World Wide Fund for Nature New Zealand